Experience ethics
The development of sustainable experience designs
Hansen, Kenneth

Publication date:
2012

Citation for published version (APA):
Experience ethics - the development of sustainable experience design


Kenneth Hansen, phd.

The idea of using experience economy and experience design as a tool for economic development is often a central part of regional and local development strategies. A limit for this strategy is however, visible when looking at the formation of national parks as experience designs. The paper discusses ethical themes in the formation of such designs using examples from Denmark and Brazil. The thesis being that experience economy and experience design used for economic development come with certain market problems with serious ethical implications, and that these can be accounted for in a focus on experience ethics. The paper gives an illustrative example of this and ends with a call for additional contributions exploring the integration of philosophical ethics in the theoretical descriptions of key issues in the discussion of experience economy and experience design in the future.

Keywords: experience, experience economy, experience design, experience ethics, sustainable experience ethics.

The paper is based on: 1: visits to the Thy National park, conversations with locals and talk with students from a master program in experience management in Thy, who work with experience economy and aim to develop the area. 2: four visits to the area of the “Gandarela” between 2010 and 2012. The field work include 5 explorative trips into the area (to the cities of Caeté, Nova Lima, Morro Vermelho, Rio Acima, and the monastery of Garaça), talks with informants and two audio recorded interviews with representatives from the Gandarela “movement” (see later). The most important links used are reprinted in the references.

Introduction:
The research of experience economy has now reached a mature state. Since the very start of the discussion of the phenomena (Schulze 1992, Pine & Gilmore 1999) a wide array of contributions have been made. In Denmark this is represented in a large diversity of reports and case studies, and a collection of anthologies and books. The dominating themes in these contributions have, it seems, been founded in the concept of “pleasure” and related to how to understand, develop and market pleasure as an experience commodity or part of a traditional commodity in the primary or secondary experience sector1. Basically the psychological idea is that a human being is always in a process towards homeostasis, either from an over-exited or under-exited level. Homeostasis is thought of as well-being, a regulatory state that the organism is, emotionally, centered around (Apter 1989, Sørensen 2007, Jantzen 2011). The move towards well-being brings pleasure and this pleasure is an experience that can be sold (e.g. as arousals in the cinema or relaxations on vacations). Recently this fundamentally neurobiological approach to experiences has been supplemented with the concept of “meaning” (Boswijk et al 2008, Hansen 2011). This represents an interactionist approach with a stronger focus on the intersubjective and social part of the experience. The use of the concept of meaning together with the concept of experience makes a new emerging theme evident: the theme of ethics (Hansen 2007, 2010).

1 Erhvervs- og Byggestyrelsen og Center for Kultur- og Oplevelsesøkonomi 2011.
The case: National nature parks
The industrialization of the global economy with the widespread exploitation of natural resources would seem to have made it more and more relevant to develop “free zones” where the population can encounter the “real” nature and where animals and plants can have a kind of sanctuary. Today there already exist several thousands national parks worldwide and 580 of these have been declared Biosphere reserves by United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) forming the fundament for an overall scientifically based struggle for biodiversity, sustainability and the general improvement of the relationship between people and their environment. The oldest National Park is Yellowstone National Park in the US, which opened in 1872, today it is a Biophere reserve also.

In Denmark the first National Park was opened in Greenland in 1974, becoming a Biosphere reserve in 1976. Situated in north-east Greenland, this biosphere reserve is the largest biosphere reserve in the world, covering 97,200,000 hectares. There is no permanent settlement in the biosphere reserve, since most of the area is inland ice and the rest is a composite fjord landscape. A more modest and very different park was however, opened in the mainland of Denmark in 2008. This first national nature park in Denmark proper is named Thy National Park and is situated in the north of Jutland. The motives behind the creation of this new national park seem to be manifold, from idealistic ideas of nature protection to more pragmatic ambitions of regional economic development, e.i. by attracting nature tourists, outdoor enthusiasts, families that wants to teach their children about “nature” etc. As such a national nature park as this can be described less as a sanctuary biosphere and more as an experience design, a form that is made for the purpose of giving somebody an experience. If this is the case then the question of meaning immediately arises: what kind of experience? Why this? For whom? The answer to such questions (and posing them) is an integrated part of the design process since meaning is grounded in intentions and motives. How are we to understand such a process of formation? And what are the most important issues to resolve in, what could be named, “the experience governance”? To answers these questions, this paper compare the formation of the national park in Thy with the formation of national park in Brazil. The thesis being that the experience design formation is a consequence of a complex interplay of market mechanisms and contesting intentionalities. And if this interplay is not properly ethically understood the result could be either meaningless and/or disastrous.

The research idea
In Denmark proper the concept of a national park is relatively new (Wilhjelmudvalget 2001) and the idea might seem paradoxical. Denmark proper is an area that has developed its nature almost to the limit. According to the Danish Ministry of Food, Agriculture and Fisheries 60,5% of all available land in Denmark is utilized as farm land. The Danish landscape is thus broadly speaking a cultural landscape (our neighbors in Iceland ironically calls it “a garden”). The area where the new national park has been opened is, in fact, a cultural landscape too, it has been cultivated for centuries. The park is thus more a reconstruction than a preservation. For example, a small village is situated within the boundaries, with supermarkets and a small power plant, the coast line has been strengthened with plants, dikes and dunes and the inland has been modeled with lakes.

---

2 The term "National Park"is , it should be added, in fact not mentioned in this report which is normally cited as the fundament for the establishment of such parks. The report talks about “national nature areas” and how to protect them. After the release of the report the word “park” however, began to flourish. A problem, often mentioned, is the difference that the term indicates, between the protected nature inside and the rest of the country outside. Which then, it is feared by environmental organizations, can be ignored by politicians.
moor areas, plantations and connecting paved roads. This makes the park, indeed, a strange “natural” form. We can imagine a person experiencing the park: from stories, paintings and restored natural forms: bushes, trees, dunes, flowers, animals etc. the experiencer has to imagine the “original” nature. An imaginary world kept alive in people’s minds. Facilitating this world we find the traditional physical elements in the design: pathways, signposts, information folders, roads, lunch areas etc. Using this the person will develop an advanced conversation, either in his head and/or with his fellow visitors that will produce the form of the park. Hence the park becomes a designed construct, an experience space that people can enter and leave intentionally (Hansen 2011). Such a phenomenological description reveals that forming the experience design of this natural park is, indeed, a complicated and contested issue. In Denmark it is however, widely accepted that this is the condition of the design. The romantic notion of nature and about going back to it is widely treated with pragmatic irony. An irony that makes the intentionalities involved more explicit and thus, paradoxically, contribute to the coherence and integrity of the design. To see more clearly then, what ethically is at stake when developing an experience design like this, we can turn to another, more classic, similar example, where lines are drawn more clearly. Such an example can be found in Brazil.

**Gandarela National Park**

Outside the city of Belo Horizonte, the capital of Minas Gerais in mid-eastern Brazil, is a landscape dominated by a mix of historical villages, beautiful churches and monasteries, extraordinary nature reserves and mining corporations. The interplay between mining, nature and people has a long tradition since mining of e.g. of gold, diamond and other precious minerals and stones, has been carried out for centuries, perhaps most clearly symbolized by the historical village of Ouro Preto, named after the black covered gold that was found here three hundred years ago. Today this situation continues as the area is part of what is know as the iron quadrangle, a large area with a large amount of iron ores. The city of Ouro Preto is, today, more a less a museum city while the largest city now is Belo Horizonte, consisting of approximately 3.5 million inhabitants. The city is growing and people are spreading outwards, filling up the smaller cities nearby. The landscape is dotted with summerhouses and the many new members of the Brazilian middle class enjoy to ride their cars to small getaways in the weekends or at the yearly carnival. In this landscape we find the idea of a new national park, The Gandarela.

![Gandarela Area](image1.jpg)

*Fig 1: The Gandarela area is a beautiful landscape filled with lush green mountains, atlantic rain forest and a large amount of small idyllic waterfalls.*

The Gandarela National Park has been proposed by a group of people opposing the iron mining operations by the Brazilian corporation Vale. Vale has required the rights for mining
widely in the area and has elaborated plans of a 7 square kilometer Iron mine, named Apollo. An iron mine of this size will eventually look like this:

Fig 2: Pictures from nearby villages of Itabira and Timbopeba showing iron mines which have been emptied and abandoned.

Vale is a huge mining corporation with an annual profit of around 20 billion dollars\(^3\). It is thought to be the world’s largest iron mining company and the second largest mining corporation in the world. Vale is involved in numerous projects all over the world and in many of the Brazilian states. Its actions are highly controversial and receive much coverage in both the national and the international press. Most recently with the spectacular dam project in the Amazonas “The Belo Monte Dam” which is planned to flood an area of 668 km\(^2\) of which 400 km\(^2\) is rainforest, and force, it is said, 20,000 people to be moved\(^4\). Vale, who is involved in many dam projects, is to use the hydroelectric power in their mining operations thereby reducing the costs. The opposition to Vales plans in Gandarela are organized in an “opposition movement”. As their main strategy they have proposed the establishment of a national park. The proposal has been advanced politically by the Chico Mendes Institute for Biodiversity Conservation (ICMBio), an agency of the federal government, and is going through an approval process of two ministry before a presidential decree. If the area is turned into a National Park, tourism is the only activity permitted and with various restrictions. The park would include an area of 38,200 hectares.

\(^3\) The main source here is the Vale official annual financial report available from Vale’s website (www.vale.br).

\(^4\) This is according to “Amazon watch” an independent nonprofit organization founded in 1996 with a mission to “protect the rainforest and advance the rights of indigenous peoples in the Amazon Basin”.
Fig 3: The proposed national park is situated in the middle of the iron ore reserves. The iron mine, named “Apollo” has its main center near the village of Morro Vermelho and will expand downwards taking up 7 square kilometers. A volume that will change the landscape radically. The Vale corporation owns concessions to continue the mining with new mines inside the proposed park. The sanctuary of Caraça is a romantic catholic monastery already protected by preservation laws, the sanctuary of Serra de Pedade is a catholic church on top of a mountain also protected and the city of Ouro Preto is an important cultural heritage site, also preserved by law. Preservations are normally carried out be the federal government. Several other mining corporations are active in the area. (Map by the opposition movement, see links section).

Process theory tells us that a form like this is an emergent phenomenon (Stacey 2001). Thus Vale not only move for a permission to mine without and before an establishment of a park, they have also proposed an alternative, much smaller, boundary of such a park should it be decided to make it. The form of the park is thus a result of stakeholder dialogues over many years and will, presumably, take on a final form eventually (Freeman 1984). This final physical form is thus a reification of a process with many interests, motives and struggles. To account for this I perform a pragmatic process analysis rooted in a theory of experience design (see below). But first some point can be drawn from a preliminary economic analysis.

Economic analysis
The rules of the market are constraints to the formation process of the park, so are the rules of the political process. Business ethics however, tells us that these rules are not enough to account for the parameters of the solution space. Values are involved too. Thus an economic analysis can be divided into three rule domains:
**Rule domain** | **Form**       | **Code** | **Parameter** |
---|---|---|---|
Market | Supply and demand | Profit | Competition |
Politics | Legislation | Law | Compliance |
Ethics | Value | Moral | Fairness |

*Fig. 4: A schematics of the analytic domains involved in the economic analysis.*

**1: The market domain**

The act of a company like Vale is of course problematic. From a strictly utilitarian point of view however, it could be said to be in interest of the majority of Brazilians that economic value is created through the utilization of the basic commodities of the country (Mills 1995). Since Vale in fact owns the land and sells product thereby producing profit it contributes to the economic development of the country. Vale employs thousands of people all over the country, people with kids, mortgages and shopping desires. This logic is classic and it depends on the forces of a free market economy where the company as a unit of contracts operates with the objective goal of creating profit, and in doing so, create values for the good of all of the society (Friedman 1970, Koch 2005). In this neoclassical economic light the task of governance is not to interfere (too much) and to makes sure that normal market rules are followed by every one. This can include checking for compliance with work restrictions, environmental laws, and general laws of fairness in competition on the market. Such a point a view will, however not be able to account for two market problems. The first is the cost of *experience destruction*, the second the cost of the lack of *experience innovation*. Both are cost that are not, it would seem, represented in the final price on the market.

The term experience destruction here designates the basic idea that the damage imposed on society by a company like Vale working in a traditional economic paradigm is not accounted for in the analysis of the value production. This problem is of course obvious when we look at the basic business concept: mining. The profit obtained by mining iron does not include the actual cost of destructing the natural reserves. Vale does not, it can be argued, pay a proper prize for the raw commodities in its value chain. This is comparable to the problem of CO2 pollution, where the polluter can be said not to pay for the space it fills out in the global available pollution space. Hence a carbon tax is currently being discussed (e.g. Assadourian 2012). When we move to describe value production as embedded within an emerging experience economy the discrepancy becomes worse. If a company like Vale gets its profit from utilizing the power of the Amazon river and the minerals of the landscape around Belo Horizonte the experiential destruction is mind blowing. The damage to the experience industry can hardly be over estimated. Obviously to destroy the area will destroy any business trying to harvest this experience resource. It doesn't help much to clean up after the destruction: For example: Vale has developed a practice of planting eucalyptus threes near residential areas, there by covering up the loss of vegetation. However, eucalyptus is not a local tree species, and it disrupts the water flow since it stores the water thereby hindering other species to grow. Thus, the result is a monoculture in a man made landscape. The creation of a strange garden.

This kind of economic value creation is thus fundamental a one way strategy. When the iron has been mined and shipped to China - as is the procedure today - the process can not be reversed. The iron can not be collected from the Chinese stores, shipped back the other way and be put into the ground. When a mountain is torred down, an area digged up and processed, this landscape is for-ever changed. And even though some kind of restoration could be possible in the future it is a tiresome and expensive process, and it
will newer change the fact that the landscape now is infested with intentionality. If this process is carried out to the end, a national park in such an area will eventually be an ironic one. The Gandarela will be turned into Thy. This will, in a paradoxical move, however strengthen the experience design, since the accountable differences and the added reflections will tend to stabilize the experience space (signs of this is visible in Thy where the national park is becoming a dominating brand). But this, surely can not be a legal or acceptable goal in the first place.

From a economic point of view we can also see that the simple commodity production and the experience production actually rests on different conditions. In a capitalist mode of production the capitalist owns the instruments of production and the resources being exploited. The relation of factors in the production mode is often displayed in the classic equation: \( V = s + v + c \), where the value of a commodity equals the surplus value plus the variable capital plus the constant capital. Using the same equation to describe an emerging experience sector however, does not give much meaning. Most agents would most likely be small or medium sized entities consisting of friends, relatives or a couple of co-workers. Here the goal is to cover the basic expenses in the production in order to continue in business. The explicit goal is thus not profit, and the variable capital (e.g. the labour force) can not be exploited (see Højrup 2002, pp. 233-241). The mining corporation Vale, in contrast, invests heavily in constant capital, it actually owns the land of the mine, and estimate the investment in 102 vehicles, to approximate $ 270 million. The total budget for the mining operation is set to total 4 billion $. The production of surplus value with this composition of capital rest highly on the market price of the basic product. It will not be possible to lower the cost of the labour force - since mining today require highly skilled people - and it will not be possible to lower the cost of the instrument of production. In fact this cost will only be higher since it is expected that with the new mine Vale will need to build a new railway track supplementing the track it already owns (the only railway track from Minas Gerais to the coast). Further, the price of competent mining workers will surely rise due to external factors and the price of meeting environmental concerns will rise too.

2: The political domain
Factors like these are politically set and are increasingly affected by the growing demands of the new middle class of Brazil and pressure from the international community. Theories of sociological and economical institutionalism has brought attention to how such pressure can lead to the use of values in the governance of a corporation (cf. Powel & DiMaggio 1991). A sign of this is visible also in this case as Vale has initiated a series of CSR-activities. Most of these have their origin in a high profiled fund “The Fundacao Vale” which donate money for music schools, concerts and sports events. The latest initiative is the promise to donate of a replica of the Shakespeare theatre “The Globe” which is to be build in the vicinity of the Gandarela area. This is organized through “Institute of Gandarela”. The theatre is to be build on a piece of land which Vale lends out for 20 years.

---

5 The relationship between extraction of key metals and economic development is fundamentally problematic. Recently it has been suggested to separate the consumption of resources from human well-being, this is called “decoupling” (UNEP 2011). Experience economy would seem very suited to form the basis of such a decoupling with its focus on the immaterial experience instead of the material product.
The donations seem to be targeted towards the innovation of new cultural activities and new ventures in the experience economy. But since the value behind it stems from a traditional production mode - which is reproduced and legitimized - with the market problems just mentioned, it could be said to do the opposite, it hinders development. This is further enhanced by the effect of another market problem: the problem of getting the proper surplus effect of innovation activities. The development of an alternative to the mining, i.e. experience businesses related to a national nature park can be viewed as a strategy of radical innovation, since only very few businesses exists already (thus for example only one tour operator offers to take tourists in to area from Rio Acima, and no easy available descriptions of the experience options can be found of the net). But radical innovation is difficult and risky. The market does not necessarily reward such innovation directly. It can be expensive and the result can disappear or be taken over by competitors. The problem is, then that the innovation of viable experience businesses can be hampered by Vale’s CSR-activities and that could, in fact, be the motive. Vale would seem to have very little interest in developing an alternative to the economic models of it's business, and very much an interest in creating a free path for itself. When mining in the Apollo mine is exhausted Vale will move on following the iron ores. This means the company will work its way into and through the Gandarela area. Leaving behind a totally changes area. The contradiction of the two strategic goals are evident in most of the CSR-activities, giving them a strange aura of hypocrisy and a constant risk of being revealed (Morsing 2001). This is hardly a well formed branding strategy for the company, and it can be of no surprise that Vale was voted the worlds worst company of 2011 on a public vote on the internet (Public Eye Award 2011).

The ethical domain
Vale’s strategy for corporate social responsibility seem primarily to be a strategy of prophylactic philanthropy. It is a cost to ease the critical voices. The result of the strategy is visible in Belo Horizonte as a set of initiatives. The most visible in december 2011 was a
temporary exhibition on the central exhibition square of the city which “celebrates the
culture of Minas Gerais”. The exhibition is part of a broader program of funding where
various projects, exhibitions, music events, community project are supported.

Fig: 6: Celebrating the culture of Minas Gerais. The exhibition donated by Vale fills the
space of a major building on the central museum square of Belo Horizonte. Inside, the
visitor can, among other things, experience a gigantic talking indian head with a
presentation of indigenous people’s stories on an equally big hand. On the way out the
visitor can admire a collection of Vale minerals. The text reads: "Vale is a company which
care much about working responsible with mineral resources. The various kinds of
minerals are essential for your life. Yes, Vale is present in your daily life. Vale is in the bike
you love so much. Vale is in the glasses on your nose, which allow you to see. Vale is in
the CD with your favorite music. Vale is in the mirror, in the TV, in the stove and in the
plane”.

The discrepancy between these CSR-activities and the mining plans are evident. The Vale
corporation actually makes a CSR-report available on the net where it deals explicitly with
the concept of sustainability. But is seem quite clear that most activities amount to noting
more than window dressing, green washing and counter strategy. It has been
recommended to use CSR-activities as tools for innovation and market positioning (Porter
& Kramer 2003), but the CSR of Vale does not even seem to follow in this (ethically some
what problematic) line. Instead it seems to be a political cost accounted for in the
production. Vale is operating following official laws and regulations, and spends efforts on
reporting this publicly. But as should be clear by now constantly depict a fundamental
problem of legitimacy. In the world of late modernism a company is said, theoretically, to
exist as an institution in a web of relations and considerations (e.g. Holmstrøm 2010).
Such an account can be called neo-institutional (Mik-Meyer & Villadsen 2007) and depicts
the organization as both an open and a closed system, constantly reproducing its own
identity in communication with stakeholders (Rendtorff 2006). A communication which
constantly reproduces the values of the company. To understand this and work with it
amounts to a reflexive strategy of public relation, and the quality of the reflection can be
said to represent the business ethics of the organization, e.i. its ethical competence
(Rendtorff 2005). Vale is hence, clearly struggling with the concept of ethics, otherwise
there would have been no sustainability report on the net to download. But the meager
state of this performance creates a lot of problems, for Vale and for the community. It also,
of course, effects the experience design of the national park.
Experience design analysis
Returning to the initial comparing of Thy National Park and the Gandarela National Park we now can see more clearly how ethical considerations effect the formation process: The two national parks have of course, different physical structures. They are situated in different countries and have different form and size. But the experience design of them share some important features. The basic design elements can be depicted in this model:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Focus</th>
<th>Media</th>
<th>Form</th>
<th>Parametre</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intention</td>
<td>Meaning</td>
<td>Difference</td>
<td>Motivation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motives</td>
<td>Attitudes</td>
<td>Rule</td>
<td>Accountability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feelings</td>
<td>Emotions</td>
<td>Value</td>
<td>Appropriate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethics</td>
<td>Interactions</td>
<td>Experience</td>
<td>Balance</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fig. 7: Experience design. The basic concepts ordered in a schema. (see also Hansen 2011, s. 116).

The model represents a process of formation with a starting place, the intention, and a design goal: the experience. The intention comes with underlying difference, a motive, which can be accounted for by focusing on it. This is a process which leads to the creation of rules for behavior. The most accountable rules survives⁶. Since this essentially is a social process the media could be said to be attitudes. Attitudes are traditionally seen as weak rule structures: with this attitude I have this tendency to act in this way. This is in close connection to motivation: I need both a proper attitude and be motivated in order to actually do some thing. In the process various emotions appear unconsciously in the subjects, emotions which leads to the use of conscious feelings (Damasio 2003) and the creation of values (Joas 2000). Values which can be defined as individually felt compulsion to chose some need, act or norm over another (Stacey & Griffin 2005, pp. 6). Without proper motivation the process would quickly run out of meaning, if even started at all in the first place, and without an ongoing balancing of media and form - e.g. of the emotions and values involved (focusing on feelings) or of the semantic content of the interactions in relation to the experience goal (focusing on ethics) - in would also quickly stop.

The focus points of intention, motive, feelings and ethics becomes the guidelines for the experience design process. Through these focus it is possible to ask constructive questions like: 1: Is the initial difference motivating enough? 2: Are the rules accountable enough? 3: are the values appropriate? 4: And does the balance function? Does it in fact represent a satisfactory balance of intentions, motives and feeling? Is it ethically considered fair (see later). The balance also contain the most basic design criteria: it should make sense.

Ad 1: for both parks it is highly motivating to participate in saving the planet. The difference between the cultivated and the natural comes with an implicit intention: to mark the natural. In this marking we cross from cultivated to natural and from here we constantly address the difference asking whether this is really natural or falls outside the boundary. Thus the difference create a kind of game (e.i. the experience) where we constantly discuss what is allowed inside the game with a reference to the initial difference.

Ad 2: This discussion constantly refers to the boundary as rules. Where is the boundary and

---

⁶ Accountability was originally developed as a part of ethnomethodology by Harold Garfinkel (Garfinkel 1967). Here it is used as parameter for a social form. This is inspired by the work of Paul Dorish in the area of human computer interaction (HCI) and interaction design (Dourish 2001).
how should the basic rules be followed. In both cases a visitor will not find a line on the ground marking the Park. The rules of a national park are accountable as international legislation and conventions, national laws of nature preservation and common sense rules of how to make sense of a national park. For example a guest in a national park meeting a group of car driving hunters can refer to the laws of the park, but it is also possible to address the common sense problem of driving and hunting in a nature preserve.

Ad 3: Accountable rules leaves room for the reflexive use of them. This is the requirement for using external values reflexively. The external values can in this case, be said to be the biological norms of sustainability. If the use of these norms becomes to dominating however, it will not be possible to be in the area at all. Neither the Thy national park or the proposed Gandarela park however, seem to have the kind of biological vulnerability necessary to make such a demand, and it would thus not make sense to restrict access completely. Both cases then share a problem of sustainability. In the Thy case a pragmatic approach can render the concept of the park meaningless - what is the point of calling the area a natural park if people live in there with villages, cars, power plants and summer surfing contests on the beach? - and in the Gandarela case an idealistic approach can do the same - e.i. what is the point of having a natural park that nobody can experience? The value of sustainability must thus be appropriated in the context.

Ad 4: The balance between stakeholder interests and feelings is represented in the coherence of the design. In the Thy case it makes sense to have a natural park, the locals can have undisturbed nature experience and the experience industry can have a new branding tool. Other stakeholders can be happy too, since for example, a natural park could (presumably) attract new migration to the area, create more turnover in the local shops and create new jobs in service sector. In the Gandarela case a balance is only visible as an imagined compromise: since the Apollo mine not directly touches the proposed Gandarela Nature Park, then maybe they could coexists? The dominating stakeholders are however not set on a compromise: the Vale corporation seems to be aiming for as much profit as possible and the opposition seems to aim for as much protected land as possible. In this clash much ethics is left behind. The metaphor used be locals is “a war”. But clearly, Vale can not raise its profit endlessly since that would mean it conquered the planet (an aggressive theme which is observable in it's corporate videos), and the opposition can not reclaim the planet to mother nature. After all a lot of people live here and need employment, food and homes to raise families in. Thus Vale needs to develop a responsible way of doing its mining operation, it needs to learn to limits itself and it needs to learn how to understand and interact with it’s stakeholders. The opposition needs to understand the inherent problem of idealistic environmentalism. The economic conditions that allows for the environmentalism are, in fact, a part of the process. To imply other wise does not make sense. To reach an experience design then that does make sense, all stakeholders must contribute to a pragmatic and ethical process. Such an pragmatic process ethics means a constant clarification, or clearing, of motives and values in interactions (Mead 2005).

Experience ethics

With this outline we can now give the analysis of the experience design a final form that include reflections of experience ethics:

7 Called “Cold Hawii”: http://www.worldcup.coldhawaii.eu/
Fig 8: The experience design of the two national parks can be described with this schema of reflective experience ethics.

**Level 1:** The two parks each have a border that can be crossed. Clearly there is a difference between being outside or inside the parks. The crossing is a mental operation which creates the form. Without the difference there would be no park experience and without the crossing experience there would be no difference. The difference is experienced. The border contain the meaning of the design: why is it there? The difference is set with an intention and it comes with a motive. The intention is to create the experience of a park and the motive is to create development. In Thy regional economic development and in Minas Gerais development in nature protection.

**Level 2:** The border is regulated by law. All actions relating to the park can be evaluated according to a collection of laws, regulations and conventions. Actions can be judged illegal and punishment can be distributed. This is legitimized and enforced by a national and international political system.

**Level 3:** The regulation is further regulated by moral rules. The creation of the park experience must be in compliance with laws and regulations but should also reflect the common good for most people. This can be regarded as a combination of duty ethics and utility ethics, where the first represents ethical reflections referring to universal principles for human action and the second refer to ethical reflections about how to reach most utility for most people. But actions can be abiding by law, adding to the overall distribution of utility but still be considered unfair morally. It may be allowed to own and destroy a beautiful waterfall or some rain forest for the benefit of the nation but most people nearby will surely feel it very unfair. The concept of fairness extends the duty ethical part of the basic economical description and can include two fairness principles suggested by the philosopher John Rawls: All agents are to be treated equal and all unequal treatment can only be allowed if they are to the benefit of the weakest in society (Rawls 1971). Why should a big corporation be allowed to destroy the common good just to make a profit for its owners? Or: Why should valuable resources be left unused in the ground when it could be used for something good? The Brazilian economy is still considered a developing one so maybe it can be accepted to exploit nature values for a time? Compared to developed countries this does seem to be the road to prosperity. The creation of the park experience will reflect such, implicit or explicit, evaluations of fairness. In order to carry such an analysis trough however, it is necessary to include a reflexive level more.
Fig 9: In the Thy case the Danish government recently decided to establish a national test center for huge offshore wind mills in close connection to the national park. This could impact the development of the new experience businesses currently under way in the area, since the mills are 250 meters high and visible in the landscape. The area is perfect for developing windmills, it's open and very windy, and is not considered valuable as farm land. The test center is actively supported by the Danish government who seeks to strengthen the competitiveness of the Danish windmill sector. Is it then, fair to hinder the establishment of the wind mill test center to avoid decoherence of the National park experience?  

This visualization show the view to the windmill test center from the coast some 20 kilometers north of the Thy National Park. The projected 9 mills will each be 250 meters high. The visualization include imagined test center cranes. (Visualization by National Association for Better Environment: http://www.nationaltestcenter.dk).

Level 4: The experience design of the parks are directed towards lasting human development. This designates ethical considerations rooted in virtue ethics (Aristoteles 2000) where virtue signify mans striving to do his or hers best for the public good. It is the quest for the good life for and with the other in just institutions (Sololomon 1992), where good is understood as the commonly accepted fundament for good actions. But virtue should not be a egoistic endeavor becoming an pleasure based experience. In the search for a good life agents should not replace social meaning with the pleasant feeling of being virtuous. (For example by giving away all your families possessions in order to feel virtuous). Virtue is directed towards “the mean relative to us, this being determined by principle, that is, as the prudent man would determine is” (Aristoteles 1977, as cited in Højrup 2002, pp. 118). Excess is not virtuous. The goal is sustainability, the stability of the state and community, not virtue in itself (Højrup op cit pp. 119). Understood like this virtue ethics comes in contact with the concept of duty. You help your fellow man because you are virtuous and because it is your duty. A duty which can be represented in universal principles (for example human rights). Only after this can utility ethics be used to secure the best possible outcome for most people. All three ethical reflections then, has to be exercised. The concept of sustainability further, places special importance on the praxis of the person, understood as a lifeform (Højrup 118), this means a special focus on concrete

---

8 Decoherence here designates the tendency of an experience space to collapse, for example by interference of external contextual elements (see also Hansen 2011, pp. 46).
situations, and that decisions have to be made using practical reason and judgement rooted in praxis. (See also Rendtorff 2009, pp 89-103) 

Sustainability is a central term or value in this process. Since the publication in 1987 of the so called “Brundtland report”: “Our Common Future: Sustainable Development in International Politics” (World Commission 1987), this concept have been at the core of ethical considerations now covering the whole of the living world. The concept today represents a combination of human and not-human parts of philosophical ethics and sets principles for our responsibility for all living creatures and future generations. Sustainability means an integration of considerations for the well being of people, caring for the planet and a pragmatic eye for economic profit (Elkington 1997). The concept of a sustainable experience design thus indicates that economy, ecology and social conditions is seen as an integrated part of the design process in a pragmatic, constructive and meaningful way.

This finally, clarifies the problem of fairness in the Gandarela case. With the basic principle of sustainable experience design we can see that a fair and sustainable solution in the Gandarela could be to establish the National Park, to allow mining in a smaller scale and in a (preferable hidden) sustainable way and to develop an array of sustainable social activities (embedded experience designs) in the area for the citizens of nearby Belo Horizonte. All this with the use of experts of sustainability and experience design processes who must use their ethical judgment on a daily basis.

A similar solution is not possible in the case of the Thy National Park. The mills can not be made smaller. But though it could be said to affect the integrity of the experience space of the National Park, such an affect can be accepted. For a while. This amounts to a comprise, for the sake of sustainability.

Concluding remark and perspective
By making an analysis of the basic elements of a experience design using what I have called experience ethics we can, as I have shown, uncover and clarify important issues in the experience design process. Such reflections would seem very helpful in the management of experiences and experience designs. The inclusion of ethics in management is often implied in the concept of leadership and this term could be applied here too. Hence we can talk of experience leadership when the management of the development process include experience ethical reflections, judgments and actions. The development and management of experiences should include ethics. After all, business ethics often is an important part of economic analysis and performance today. It should be so in the case of experiences.

KH, Copenhagen 2012.

---

9 The philosophical backdrop of these assertions are lengthly and include contributions from many authors throughout the history of moral philosophy and philosophical ethics. Introductions can for example be found in Jacobs 2002 or Husted 2009. A comprehensive treatment of the philosophical fundament of business ethics can be found in Rendtorff (2010)
References


København: Museum Tusculanums Forlag.


Campus.


Links:


Website for the fight for The Gandarela National Park: http://aguasdogandarela.org/profile/

The Vale Corporation: http://www.vale.com.br/

The Vale Foundation: http://www.fundacaovale.org/


Amazon Watch: Website for the fight against the Belo Monte dam in Amazonas: http://amazonwatch.org/work/belo-monte-dam

National Association for Better Environment: http://www.nationalttestcenter.dk