Unskilled Work and Learner Identity
Understanding unskilled work as a certain condition for perceiving oneself as an educable subject
Kondrup, Sissel

Published in:
Changing Configurations of Adult Education in Transitional Times

Publication date:
2014

DocumentVersion
Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Citation for published version (APA):

General rights
Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

• Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
• You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain.
• You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal.

Take down policy
If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact rucforsk@ruc.dk providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Download date: 19. Oct. 2019
Changing Configurations of Adult Education in Transitional Times
Conference Proceedings
Changing Configurations of Adult Education in Transitional Times – Conference Proceedings

This volume is the result of collective work and is protected by International and German Laws.

Volume editors:
Bernd Käpplinger (Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin)
Nina Lichte (Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin)
Erik Haberzeth (Technische Universität Chemnitz)
Claudia Kulmus (Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin)

Picture credits (cover): Claus Käpplinger

ISBN: 978-3-86004-297-7

Berlin

© 2014 all rights reserved

Note: The papers included in this volume are those whose abstracts had been peer reviewed by the Conference Scientific Committee. The content and the opinions expressed in the papers, and/or the writing style, represent the contributing authors.
CONTENTS

Introduction ............................................................................................................................... 7
Bernd Käpplinger & Nina Lichte & Erik Haberzeth & Claudia Kulmus

Transitions around and within ESREA ..................................................................................... 9
Henning Salling Olesen

Welcome Address at the ESREA Triennial Research Conference 2013 in Berlin ................. 11
Bernd Käpplinger

I. Learning of adults ................................................................................................................ 13

Non-traditional adult students in Higher Education: the development of Plurilingual Repertoires ......................................................................................................................... 14
Susana Ambrósio & Maria Helena Araújo e Sá & Ana Raquel Simões

Voice, interaction and transformation: identifying transformation in the diverse meanings and contexts of the language of biographical learning interviews ........................................... 29
Rob Evans

University and lifelong learning. A research on “non traditional stories” and learning identities. ............................................................................................................................ 44
Andrea Galimberti

Graduating at older age - what are the expected, surprising and unwanted outcomes? .... 63
Ulpukka Isopahkala-Bouret

Learning by volunteer computing, thinking and gaming: What and how are volunteers learning by participating in Virtual Citizen Science? ......................................................... 73
Laure Kloetzer & Daniel Schneider & Charlene Jennett & Ioanna iacovides & Alexandra Eveleigh & Anna Cox & Margaret Gold

Unskilled Work and Learner Identity – Understanding unskilled work as a certain condition for perceiving oneself as an educable subject ......................................................... 93
Sissel Kondrup

Engaging Universities and Adult Education: The Paulo Freire Chair at the University of Seville ........................................................................................................................... 107
Emilio Lucio-Villegas

Testing as Reflecting? Preliminary findings from a study involving personality testing in CVET ........................................................................................................................................... 119
Henriette Lundgren

Issues of recognition and participation in changing times: the inclusion of refugees in higher education in the UK. .............................................................................................. 135
Linda Morrice

Writing & University internship: an educational path ........................................................ 144
Loredana Perla & Viviana Vinci

Agency and future life trajectories in accounts of Access to Higher Education students in England ........................................................................................................................ 156
Anna Piela & Hugh Busher & Nalita James & Anna-Marie Palmer

Functional Illiterates and their Confidantes: A new Approach to the Question of Non-Participation in Adult Education ................................................................. 168
Wibke Riekmann & Klaus Buddeberg

Inclusion and exclusion in continuing education for adults: the case of young people with a low level of education in Spain .............................................................. 183
Francesca Salvá-Mut & Elena Quintana-Murci & Danielle Desmarais
II. Knowledge and competences

Recognition of prior learning: valuing learning through transitions for individual and collective purposes? ................................................................. 201
Fátima Antunes & Paula Guimarães

Pedagogy versus Medicine: a training and narrative care project in medical-healthcare contexts ................................................................. 213
Micaela Castiglioni

The learning process of health - impacts of the configuration of the workplace health promotion ........................................................................ 223
Sylvana Dietel

The role of intrinsic training motivation for self-perceived work ability and working past retirement age .......................................................... 229
Paula Thieme & Michael Brusch & Victoria Büssch

III. Professional action

Quality in continuing education: Which aspects matter from the participant’s point of view? ........................................................................... 245
Kirsten Aust & Stefanie Hartz & Bernhard Schmidt-Hertha

Adult Education and Transformative Learning ................................................................. 257
Elmira Bancheva & Maria Ivanova & Alexander Pojarliev

Adult Transitions in transitional times: configurations and implications for Adult Education ....................................................................... 274
Chiara Biasin

Blended Counselling: Advising Prospective Students with Vocational Qualifications on Their Way to University ........................................................................ 287
Stefanie Brunner & Stefanie Kretschmer & Olaf Zawacki-Richter

Knowledge Transfer in Career Guidance - Empirical and Theoretical Research Findings ................................................................................... 300
Clinton Enoch

Successful outcomes in Vocational Education and Training Courses and Mathematics: How Pedagogy and Expectations Influence Achievement ................................................................. 307
Bronwyn Ewing & Grace Sarra & Tom Cooper & Chris Matthews & Glen Fairfoot

Profession and context: training teachers in a systemic, co-operative and auto/biographic view ........................................................................ 328
Laura Formenti

How Internet Based Participatory Culture Can Be Co-opted To Develop Teachers’ Technological Skills ................................................................. 343
Filippo Gilardi & James Reid

What are the Factors that Affect the Training of Adult Employees in the Universities of Mid-Egypt on ICT ................................................................. 355
Mohamed H. Hendy

Workers’ training using the e-learning methodology through entrepreneurs confedrations in spain ........................................................................ 370
Rafael M. Hernández-Carrera

New Configurations of Guidance and Counselling – From Support for Individual Decisions to a Governance Tool? ................................................................. 388
Bernd Käpplinger
Reconstructing Professional Identity in Transition of Working Life .................................. 404
Helena Koskinen

New Challenges for Teaching and Learning in German University Education ............ 417
Ines Langemeyer & Ines Rohrdantz-Herrmann

Training managers: a case study of a French corporate university .............................. 437
Simon Mallard & Jerome Eneau

A new professional occupation in adult's education: the RVC Professional ............... 449
Catarina Paulos

Work motivation and employee motivation methods in managerial work ................. 460
Anna Piirainen

The peer groups bridging the disciplines and social contexts in higher education ....... 473
Arja Piirainen

From social educators imaginary to social educators training: lessons learned in a grundtving partnershi project ................................................................. 485
Flavia Virgilio

IV. Institutionalization..................................................................................................... 496

To Value Adult Education – Organisational learning, Adult Learning, and the Third Sector ............................................................ 497
Henning Pätzold

Sociocultural community development as a strategy for adult education: the conceptions and practices of its practitioners ........................................ 506
Ana Maria Simões

V. System and policies ................................................................................................. 520

Changing configurations in the governance of adult education in Europe: discussion of some effects of the Lisbon Strategy in Portugal ........................................ 521
Rosanna Barros

Adult education and community development in the city: Critical geography meets critical pedagogy ......................................................... 537
Christine Durant & Behrang Foroughi

Unveiling of new Development Perspectives on Migration Critical research as an approach for discovering latent future possibilities .................. 549
Malte Ebner von Eschenbach

Education Decisions of Employed Persons: The Influence of Adult Education Vouchers ............................................................................. 564
Erik Haberzeth & Claudia Kulmus

Emancipation instead of discipline ........................................................................... 572
Anja Heikkinen

We make the road by walking – collective knowledge building and action ............. 583
Lars Holmstrand & Gunilla Härnsten

Adult Learning through Participation in the Economic (and Political) Environment .... 596
Martin Kopecký

Invisible colleges in adult education in Portugal: contribution mapping .................. 604
Ricardo R. Monginho

The Rise and Fall of Research on the History of Adult Education in Contemporary Hungary: Trends and Issues of Historical Research Work from 1993 to 2013 ............................ 617
Balázs Németh
The Limits and Divisions of Adult and Continuing Education in 20th Century Modern Europe. Historical and Political Dimensions and Patterns ......................................................... 633
Balázs Németh

Violence Interrogates adult education today. A radical and critical reflection ............. 642
Maria Grazia Riva

About the changes and challenges of adult education in Poland in the years 1989-2013 .................................................................................................................................. 654
Hanna Solarczyk-Szwec & Anna Matusiak & Agata Szwech

Authors .................................................................................................................................. 663
INTRODUCTION

Bernd Käpplinger & Nina Lichte & Erik Haberzeth & Claudia Kulmus

This book assembles almost 50 papers from the 7th Triennial European Research Conference of the European Society for Research on the Education of Adults (ESREA), which was held from the 4th to the 7th of September 2013 at Humboldt-University in Berlin. The title of the conference was “Changing Configurations of Adult Education in Transitional Times”. Many authors within this volume refer to this title and the thematic outline within the call for papers. Furthermore, conferences are also a general “seismograph” that show the issues currently dealt with in a research community and also the terms that are employed frequently at one specific point of time. When performing a simple, quantitative tag count with all the papers within this volume, the resulting image is the following:

Graph: The 50 most frequently used words within the papers of ESREA 2013 in Berlin

It becomes apparent that “adult learning” is almost as frequently used as “adult education” by the scientific community. The “research” focus of the conference is obvious and that “universities” play a pivotal role within adult education research. Other descriptive terms of adult education like “personal”, “practice”, “process”, “professional”, “change”, “individual”, “group”, “community” or “activities” are also often displayed. A third layer demonstrates other important terms and concepts for adult education as a scientific field like “reflection”, “transformative”, “situation”, “context”, “responsibility”, “institutions”, “organizations”, “people” or “perspective”. Of course, such a quantitative tag count offers only a first vague glimpse of the papers’ content. We invite the readers to become more familiar with the authors’ views and arguments when reading the papers and understanding how they use and deal with these terms and concepts.
We have been thinking and even struggling a lot how to assemble the papers within this anthology. One option would have been to assemble them just by alphabetical order of the authors. A second option would have been to arrange them along the chronological order of presentation within the conference. A third option would have been to use the headings of the workshops in which the papers were presented. We cannot present here the many pros and cons of each option and our intensive discussion on it. Finally, we decided to use the following content-oriented typology to sort the papers:

1. Learning of adults
2. Knowledge and competences
3. Professional action
4. Institutionalization
5. System and policies

This typology\(^1\) was developed within the German adult education research community in the year 2000. The objective was on the one hand to systematize existing research on adult education and on the other hand to identify further need for research. The typology has widely been used and referred to and has contributed to structure the field of research in adult education in Germany.

Other content-oriented typologies could also have been used.\(^2\) We decided for this rather condensed typology. Nonetheless, a number of papers were disputed when sorting and could still be moved from one section to another with well-founded reasons. Overall, we hope that this content-based typology helps our readers to navigate within this relatively large volume. Even when considering that in this book only approximately one third of all papers is represented, it gives a good impression of the intellectual and cultural diversity and richness of ESREA.

We want to say thank you to all contributors and we wish you an inspiring reading of the book.

---


ESREA’s triennial conference in Berlin in September 2013 was its 7th “big conference” since its foundation a bit more than 20 years ago. The term big refers to the fact that in all these years smaller conferences and meetings of thematic research networks have been regarded the main form of activity. But every three years many of us meet in these “big conferences”, and they have actually more and more been able to live up to their mission of bringing many researchers together across specialties, research traditions and home countries. The Berlin conference appears to be one of the strongest conferences until now.

At the same time ESREA’s membership has been steadily increasing in the last few years, there are now 12 active research network, and there is a high level of activity – and as far as I have the chance to follow it: activity on a high level of quality as well as a high level of engagement.

ESREA and the connected research area it organizes is also in a fragile transitional situation. From the beginning the mission of ESREA was to create a space for professionalizing research in its own right – a need which was felt very much in the process where international relations were developing in general, and within our field, particularly driven by a policy of connecting practitioners across Europe. ESREA’s first generations were mostly people who have their roots in some of the traditional organisations and cultures of adult education: Citizenship, popular education, social and political NGOs, access course provision. In so far as we needed to be ourselves, to have space for developing the theoretical and methodological dimensions of research it was for almost all rooted in a life history of adult education practice.

In the meantime adult learning has experienced an immense growth in volume and not least in forms of provision and participation. From being a cultural and relatively “free” space it has become the focus of political and economic interest, resources are big but also the fight about the souls – literally. Economic rationales of competence development and competitiveness are inferred on adults’ learning as a lifelong duty instead of a social right.

This has of course transformed the research area: The topics are new, the contexts and learning arenas are many and different, and the politics of the field has to be re-conceptualized. It is not evident that those orientations that we brought personally from the old traditional adult education practice apply to this situation. And unlike the first generations of ESREA members it is also not a truism that researchers do have such a background for their engagement. So if some might have had a nice organic image of a discipline growing up around a field of practice, may be accompanied by the establishing of a proper profession of adult educators it is now obvious that this image does not cover the situation – and may be it is not even a suitable inspiration.

There is a lot of work to be done spelling out themes, approaches and frames of reference for research in adult learning. At the same time many influences from many research areas of social and human science have been adopted and applied within adult education research - and the flow keeps coming with new people with new backgrounds. Not all have been
equally well digested. But there is a potentially very rich development in these cross fertilizations.

In the organisation of ESREA we have addressed these challenges in particularly two ways:

By prioritizing the participation of young researchers in ESREA activities - by inviting, encouraging, and by providing bursaries for participation in network meetings, by awarding a prize for best papers from PhD-students (see contributions Bengtsson, Theriault, Turunen, Galimberti) and not least by organizing pre-conferences and other specific events for PhD-students – this has been the case both by this triennial conference and the previous one in 2010 in Linköping. This formal and informal effort to involve young scholars in a definition process will go on.

The other one is by prioritizing a publication activity which helps to shape a “community public sphere. The largest new step has been the foundation of RELA which was launched as an independent academic journal in the autumn 2010. To make a journal is a huge task, but it seems we are beyond the risk of cradle death – the journal has a steady flow of submissions, it is becoming indexed and cited, and not least is the number of visitors online quite high. The publication of books based in ESREA activities continues and is supported financially by ESREA, and lately a new contract with Sense publishers enables the publication of books in the form of papers and e-books at the same time.

There is one more challenge that has arrived during ESREAs lifetime: The globalization of social and cultural exchange. Mostly this is a blessing. But it also leads to a more monolingualistic academic world. ESREA has always had a mission of covering the multiplicity of European culture, and we have always faced severe language barriers. The language barriers have not become higher, rather the opposite, more and more (young) academics are more or less able to work in lingua Franca English (the English which belongs to nobody or to all of us). But paradoxically this can also lead to neglecting and forgetting the thinking and knowledge traditions established in all the other languages – and not least, of course, the other big languages. This is not the evil deed of any one, it is a self-reinforcing centripetal dynamic which goes into reading, publishing, referencing etc – as already pointed out by Staffan Larsson in the very first issue of RELA

For this reason I was particularly happy that this triennial conference could take place in Berlin. Not only because of the many fascinating aspects of Berlin as a city and as a historical site in European history, but also because it gives us the hope for increased German participation in ESREA in the future, bringing stronger in the richness of German thinking and research. The language issue will be handled as good as can be – but I think it is one of the major intellectual challenges of our time to secure that the globalization is not becoming a story of forgetting, but one of recognition of difference and learning from each other.
WELCOME ADDRESS AT THE ESREA TRIENNIAL RESEARCH CONFERENCE 2013 IN BERLIN

Bernd Käpplinger (head of the local organizing committee)

“Berlin ist nicht, Berlin wird immer nur”

“Berlin is not, Berlin will ever only be in becoming”

You can discover the true meaning of this quote by the philosopher and twice emigrant Ernst Bloch when walking and driving around this city. Even when going out of this building you can see its present relevance when looking at the different construction sites. Not to forget our infamous unfinished new airport…

An ongoing coming of age seems to be also a characteristic feature of adult education. In the sense of the goal to research and to support the learning from early adulthood until old age. Or - as they say in the Anglophone world - “from cradle to grave”. But beyond this lifelong perspective also in the sense that adult education itself is still under construction and even sometimes under deconstruction and severe financial constraints. This is especially valid when considering the present crisis. The prominence of lifelong learning on political and economical agendas has not led to a secure institutionalization of adult education in many respects. The challenges have been even increased since much more actors and researchers are interested in the learning of adults than some decades earlier on. Some economists research what are the returns (and non-returns) of adults’ learning. Some psychologists research how to measure competencies. Some neuro-scientists research how learning happens in the brain. Is adult education perhaps lost in the transition to lifelong learning (see forthcoming keynote Katarina Popovic)? What are the very own contributions of adult education to the increasing interest in the learning of adults?

Can adult education still support present-day movements, which we can observe presently in so many parts of the world (see forthcoming keynote Peter Mayo)? Can adult education raise awareness for people to become emancipated citizens, students, workers; and what are the contradictory effects? (see forthcoming keynote by Danny Wildemeersch) What are the enabling and limiting meanings of experience (as Wiltrud Gieseke outlined in her inaugural lecture at Humboldt-University)? Learning takes of course continuously place when working, when travelling, when living - even without educators and guides. But it is a far too simple assumption to think that lifelong learning could be fostered just by informal learning. This would even increase the gap between well-educated people in jobs with many learning opportunities and people with less favorable possibilities and resources.

Adult education has one core element. This humanistic and democratic core element is the learning individual in her or his own respect and in her or his diverse personal and societal context. Learning out of the perspective of the learner, which can also mean to resist against the seemingly obligation to learn. Fields of learning can be vocational training, cultural education or health education - just to mention some relevant fields. Much more fields have to be added of course. We want to support people to cope with their present situation. By teaching, by programme planning and by guidance. Thus, adult education is often at first
sight not very exciting or prestigious, but it is dealing with the different daily problems of people at work, at home or within their communities. It is connected to democratic values.

And adult education should additionally also go beyond the present situations. To discover wider horizons beyond the milieus, the cultures, the nations in which we were born into. To take a second or third chance for learning. To break out of boring daily routines at work or at home. To discover the transformational and emancipatory potential of knowledge for learners. This variety and diversity makes adult education exciting once you’ve got into it. The programme of this triennial ESREA research conference with more than 130 papers from 33 countries gives a vivid impression of the wide range of themes, of target groups, of methods and of approaches used in adult education and the research on it. I’m happy that we have such a broad range of participating countries. And even though the triennial ESREA is an European research conference, I’m happy that so many people from oversee are participating. Although we can also see that globalisation does not mean that all parts of the world are participating on equal terms.

I would like to thank very much the ESREA steering committee to give this conference to Humboldt-University. I would like to thank my university and my department for providing the infrastructure needed for this conference mostly free of extra costs. And I would like to thank my team (foremost Erik Haberzeth, Claudia Kulmus, Nina Lichte and Annika Gruhlke) for organizing this conference.

Ernst Bloch’s most famous book was THE PRINCIPLE OF HOPE, in which he re-configured different existing thoughts in new ways. I hope adult education is still moving and it has also in future an important share to contribute to researching and supporting lifelong learning. In a genuine own way and not only imitating other research disciplines. But being part of movements is not enough from my point of view. We have to be visible and we need continuously institutions, programmes and professionals which are experts in supporting the different forms of the learning of adults. Especially in times of crises! I am very hopeful at least when looking at your stimulating contributions. Thank you for contributing to this conference so many interesting papers - and soon contributing interesting presentations!

I wish us an intellectually and emotionally stimulating conference!
I. LEARNING OF ADULTS
NON-TRADITIONAL ADULT STUDENTS IN HIGHER EDUCATION: THE DEVELOPMENT OF PLURILINGUAL REPERTOIRES

Ambrósio, Susana
UIINFOC | Integrated Unit for Continuing Education
CIDTFF | Research Centre Didactics and Technology in Education of Trainers
University of Aveiro
Portugal

Araújo e Sá, Maria Helena
CIDTFF | Research Centre Didactics and Technology in Education of Trainers
University of Aveiro
Portugal

Simões, Ana Raquel
CIDTFF | Research Centre Didactics and Technology in Education of Trainers
University of Aveiro
Portugal

INTRODUCTION

The study presented herein is part of a more comprehensive project which is being carried out at the University of Aveiro called ‘Plurilingual repertoires in a lifelong learning process: a case study with the non-traditional adult students in the University of Aveiro’.1

The aim of this study is, on one hand, to understand the representations of non-traditional adult students (NTAS) regarding the benefits of lifelong learning (LLL) through language learning, emphasising the importance of developing their plurilingual repertoire. On the other hand, the study intends to understand NTAS’ perceptions of how Higher Education (HE) contributes (or can contribute) to the development of their plurilingual repertoires.

In order to achieve these goals, the data obtained from an online questionnaire filled in by 195 NTAS (40.2%, N=485) were analysed. This analysis allowed us to characterize a sample of NTAS and know their representations of LLL, particularly language learning, and their perspective on how attending HE contributes to their LLL process.

In the first part of the paper, the theoretical framework which supports the study is presented, specifically the benefits of LLL (Section 1). Then, the pivotal role played by HE in supporting LLL and NTAS in the Portuguese context are presented in Section 2. And, finally, the plurilingual repertoires as indexical biographies are presented in Section 3. In the second part of this paper, the empirical study is presented and discussed (Section 4).

Another purpose of this study is to emphasize the development of plurilingual repertoires as a continuum process in the lives of individuals, especially as NTAS. We also intend to highlight the importance of NTAS’ representations regarding LLL, and how NTAS perceive

1 Study funded by the Foundation for Science and Technology as part of the PhD project of Susana Ambrósio (SFRH / BD / 47533 / 2008) under the scientific direction of Maria Helena Araújo e Sá and Ana Raquel Simões, currently being developed at CIDTFF - Research Centre ‘Didactics and Technology in Education of Trainers’/ http://www.ua.pt/cidtff
HE as an opportunity to develop their plurilingual repertoires, stressing the pivotal role played by HE in supporting LLL.

1. LIFELONG LEARNING: A NEW SOCIAL NORM OR REAL BENEFITS IN REAL LIFE?

Since 1996 - the European Year of Lifelong Learning - several official documents, studies and research have been released. They focus on European LLL strategies which underline the importance and the urgency to engage all European citizens in LLL activities. Although the discussion concerning those strategies or even the actual reason behind European LLL policies are not the aim of this study, it is clear that these policies turned LLL into a widely used expression in our days. Therefore, societies gradually accepted LLL as one of their norms, meaning that there had been a significantly increased offer of adult education. Nonetheless, the number of individuals participating in adult education activities appears to be far from ideal.

After all these years, questions remain: is LLL really important to individuals? Are there real benefits of LLL according to the individuals’ perceptions? At what level? In order to answer these questions, individuals must be heard.

Moreover, individuals and their perceptions should be considered when defining LLL, instead of what the labour and economic markets may gain from education. In 1996, Longworth and Davies defined LLL as

the development of human potential through a continuously supportive process which stimulates and empowers individuals to acquire all the knowledge, values, skills and understanding they will require throughout their lifetimes and to apply them with confidence, creativity and enjoyment in all routes, circumstances, and environments. (p.22).

This definition of LLL remains valid after seven years. It stresses that all individuals can develop their potential through a shared process. Longworth and Davies’ definition also says that individuals have (or could have if properly stimulated) their own opinions regarding their needs and wills during their lives in what education is concerned. Furthermore, this definition of LLL is not linked to a specific context and/or to words representing specific goals for LLL, like labour market, employability or demands of social and economic changes (e.g. European Commission, 2000: Memorandum on Lifelong Learning). Instead, LLL is associated with ‘all routes, circumstances, and environments.’ which represents all the contexts – personal, professional and educational – of the individuals’ lives, in which LLL may bring benefits. According to Manninen (2010), the benefits of the learning process include

i. the development of skills and competences, such as practical and, internationalisation skills (including the knowledge of foreign languages), ICT skills, general knowledge, self-expression and creativity;
ii. direct benefits, such as the joy of learning, updating skills, new networks and job hunting and
iii. further benefits, such as mental and physical well-being, quality of life, well-being in the workplace, and participation in the community. Manninen (2010) also linked additional benefits to the learning process such as self-confidence, wider social
circles and professional networks, motivation, learning skills, sharing expertise and motivating others to learn.

Learning also appears to have a positive influence on societal cohesion and active citizenship, since they promote trust, tolerance, civic co-operation (Feinstein, Budge, Vorhaus & Duckworth, 2008; OCDE, 2007; Preston, 2004).

According to another study, the psycho-social qualities, such as self-esteem, self-efficacy, sense of identity and purpose may function as mediators between learning and health, since learning may promote psycho-social qualities which appear to improve well-being, mental health and the ability to manage change and adversity (Hammond, 2004). The European project BELL - Benefits of Lifelong Learning, which had its inception in 2011, highlights the benefits of participating in continuous education in three levels:

i. individual's personal aspects which are key to learning: locus of control and self-efficacy/self-confidence;
ii. personal environment with a complex and ever-changing society - tolerance, sense of purpose in life, civic competences, shifts/changes in educational experience, mental well-being and
iii. change in social domains that can be observed in: civic and social engagement, work-related benefits/employability, family, physical health/health behaviour, social networks, trust in others and in decision-makers (Kil, Motschilnig & Thöne-Geyer, 2012). According to the data, adult education observes and develops the prerequisites for learning. Also, adult education allows people to participate and become involved in a democratic society, and it promotes social inclusion (idem, ibidem).

According to the 2003 Eurobarometer survey (18 227 interviews in 15 countries; average number of interviewees per country: 1000), individuals consider LLL a key part of their lives, since nine out of ten Europeans consider lifelong learning important, mainly due to social and economic reasons, such as employability, personal development, active citizenship and social cohesion (CEDEFOP, 2003). Regarding the knowledge and the skills individuals think they need, traditional basic skills (reading/writing, arithmetic and general knowledge) are the top 'very useful' skills. Over 90% think these are very useful both at a personal and professional levels.

Regarding the development of their plurilingual repertoires, individuals stated that they have contact with foreign languages in different contexts, such as on a personal (44%) and professional level (60%). However, individuals underline the importance of contacting with foreign languages on a professional level; in another words, a greater development of their plurilingual repertoire, especially for communicating with people from different countries and to manage human resources.

With regard to the contexts in which individuals develop plurilingual repertoires, the majority of the individuals consider informal settings as the best learning context, although they also mentioned the use of local libraries/learning resource centres (31.6%), and school, college or university (16.8%).
This survey also shows that individuals highlight the personal and social benefit of learning, since 81% report having gained at least one personal or social benefit from learning, and 54% at least one work-related benefit. 37% of individuals stated only personal or social benefits against the 10% who mentioned work-related advantages only. 1% of interviewees think they have hardly benefited at all. The five most popular benefits for these individuals are:

i. improved work efficiency;
ii. personal satisfaction;
iii. general knowledge;
iv. new acquaintances and v. certification (CEDEFOP, 2003).

These studies and data, similar to the study presented herein, focus on the benefits of learning (improved self-confidence and greater self-awareness) and on the social benefits of learning (social cohesion, efficient networks, improved public health and an increased civic participation), rather than financial benefits and the development of personal capital (e.g. CEDEFOP, 2013).

Returning to the key questioned of this first section –‘Lifelong learning: a new social norm or real benefits in real life? - it is clear that there are real benefits in real life, since LLL seems to strengthen the development of key skills and resources, and therefore plurilingual repertoires. LLL also encourages social cohesion and provides the possibility of involvement in the community.

It is evident that adult learners and adult education/continuing education have particular importance in the continuum of LLL. Higher Education (HE) institutions play a key role in this continuum as we will discuss in the following section.

2. THE ROLE OF HIGHER EDUCATION IN LIFELONG LEARNING

We have witnessed many great changes in HE and increasing awareness regarding new challenges and demands since the signing of the Declaration of Bologna in 1999. In view of the Bologna reports, there is a clear intention for promoting Lifelong Learning, as a cornerstone of the HE European Area and one of the main vectors in HE reconfiguration (EUA, 2008; Prague Communiqué, 2001). It is understood, therefore, that ‘In the lifelong learning scenario, a university would need to reassess completely its objectives and priorities, particularly its entry requirements, its method of working and its assessment and qualifications structures.’ (Longworth & Davies, 1996, p.15). HE can also contribute to personal development and to the improvement of family and community life (Archer, Hutchings, & Ross, 2003; Fragoso, 2008).

In this sense, universities should respond to new lifelong educational and training needs, clearly appealing to its social responsibility. Thus, the mission of HE institutions should entail the promotion of LLL, namely language learning, since they are asked to contribute to ‘the European integration and the necessity of maintaining linguistic and cultural diversity in Europe’ (European Language Council, 2001: 3) by becoming multilingual spaces, promoting plurilingualism as a value and a competence (Beacco & Byram, 2007; Pinto, 2012).
In this sense, ‘the challenge of lifelong learning for universities is to view lifelong learning as an opportunity to expand their activities in all fields and to understand, and respond positively to, the very different needs of their new customers (Longworth & Davies, 1996, p. 15). This means that HE institutions should be accessible to all (Bergen Communiqué, 2005), create more flexible learning pathways, and recognize previously acquired learning, either in formal or informal contexts (Leuven Communiqué, 2009; London Communiqué, 2007). Thus, HE institutions should be prepared for new demands and challenges, such as receiving new pupils with different features from their traditional students, namely NTAS, and be able to contribute to the development of their plurilingual repertoire (Beacco, 2009; Pinto & Araujo e Sá, 2013).

2.1 NON-TRADITIONAL ADULT STUDENTS

Since the presence of NTAS in HE is an ever-increasing reality in European universities, various authors and studies have focused on these students, thus providing us with an international perspective (Field, Merrill, & West, 2012; Johnson & Merrill, 2004; Lynch, Chickering, & Schlossberg, 1989; RANLHE, 2011), and subsequently a national one2 (Amorim, Azevedo, & Coimbra, 2010, 2011; Batista, 2009; Correia & Mesquita, 2006; Gonçalves et al., 2011; ). Both perspectives emphasise the characteristics which these NTAS have in common: Adult students are considered non-traditional due to several factors influencing their participation in the educational process. Since they play multiple roles and have several responsibilities, their role as students is very often cast aside. According to various authors, adult students are mainly defined by:

i. age – the majority of the students range from 18 to 21 years old, whereas adult students are over 23/25 years of age;

ii. attending formal education – adult students were outside formal education for a while and have no university experience, and are usually the first family generation to go to university;

iii. professional experience – adult students have greater work experience than traditional students (with little or none), and are usually working class, either working full or part-time;

iv. their attitude as students – adult students are more concerned with the application of knowledge; they are more determined and committed, since attending HE is motivated by the desire of pursuing a career or update knowledge for professional progression (Correia & Mesquita, 2006; Johnson & Merrill, 2004; Lynch, Chickering, & Schlossberg, 1989).

In 2006, Portuguese special HE access and admission criteria were created for candidates over 23 years old who do not have qualifications traditionally required for accessing that level

---

2 Currently, the research project “Non-traditional students in Higher Education: research to steer institutional change” (PTDC/IVC-PJC/4886/2012), funded by the Foundation for Science and Technology, is being carried out by the Universities of Algarve and Aveiro, Portugal. This research project focuses on non-traditional students in both universities and its outmost important aim is to foster institutional change in several dimensions, underlining the important role of HE in promoting social development. The research project, which will analyse the transitions lived by Non-traditional students, is organized in four research lines: i. students over 23; ii. students with special educational needs; iii. students from African countries of Portuguese official language and iv. students from Technological Specialization Programme.
of education. However, NTAS possess the knowledge and the necessary competences acquired during their personal, professional and social pathways and contexts, allowing them to assess their eligibility to attend university (Law-Decree No. 64 of 2006) based in their LLL process.

It is in this LLL process that NTAS lived plurilingual experiences in different contexts and therefore have different degrees of interaction with languages. These plurilingual experiences are embodied in their plurilingual repertoires (Blommaert & Backus, 2012) mirroring the diverse interactions individuals have with languages throughout life in various contexts. Therefore, enrolling in HE may be perceived as another plurilingual experience which contributes (or could contribute) to the development of individuals’ plurilingual repertoire.

3. PLURILINGUAL REPETOIRE DEVELOPMENT: A LIFELONG LEARNING PROCESS

As stated above, it is within their pathways that NTAS have more or fewer plurilingual experiences as a result of their LLL process, complying with the idea that ‘it is impossible to predict the practical and personal communicative needs people may have after leaving education and training.’ (Mackiewicz, 1998, p. 4). This plural language learning process is embodied in the plurilingual repertoire, which is developed in a continuum process that occurs throughout life in a variety of contexts and through the contact with several people, continuously remodeled according to a variety of circumstances (Andrade et al., 2003; Beacco, 2008; Coste, Moore, & Zarate, 2009; Vigner, 2008)

The plurilingual repertoire is influenced by the plurality and unpredictability of an individual’s pathway (Blommaert & Backus, 2012), acquiring new elements which transform or complete pre-existing ones from various contexts, in view of the necessary adaptations to professional, geographical or family displacements, but also to the personal evolution of interests (Blommaert & Rampton, 2011; Lüdi, 2004). In this sense, plurilingual repertoires are seen as ‘truncated repertoires’ since ‘no one knows all of a language' (Blommaert, 2010, p. 103). They are based on the principle whereby each one is able to learn languages according to the emerging needs throughout life, either due to personal/affective, professional or cultural reasons, or simply because it is the individual’s wish, resisting the hegemony of a single language (Beacco, 2008; Semal-Lebleu, 2006). Developing a plurilingual repertoire is a very personal process since different individuals have different experiences and interactions with language, meaning that 'language learning is actually a process that each individual perceives and processes in different ways’ (Franceschini, 2005, p. 121). Thus, plurilingual repertoire is the result of biographically organized complex resources which reflect the rhythms of the individuals’ lives (Blommaert & Backus, 2012), closely linked to life history and biographical trajectories (Thamin & Simon, 2010). Plurilingual repertoire, therefore, are understood as ‘indexical biographies' (Blommaert & Backus, 2012) since they embody the plural linguistic and cultural experiences lived by individuals, which manage several languages on a personal, educative or professional contexts (Castellotti & Moore, 2006; Thamin & Simon, 2010). In this sense, the development of the plurilingual repertoire, shaped by plural contacts and interactions with languages, is perceived as an important LLL process whereby communicating in foreign languages is one of the key competences for lifelong learning (European Commission, 2007).
These plural contacts and interactions occur, as mentioned above, in different degrees and contexts. One of these contexts is HE, which plays a major role in the development of plurilingual repertoires. It allows individuals to contact with foreign languages, whether through foreign students, literature or specific software. In this sense, ‘Les universités ont surtout la responsabilité de continuer le développement des compétences linguistiques de tous les étudiants’ (Beacco, 2009, p. 9). This happens in different degrees since HE institutions can offer individuals plural contacts and interactions with languages which can contribute to the development of NTAS plurilingual repertoires.

4. THE STUDY: RESULTS PRESENTATION AND DISCUSSION

As stated above, this study aims to understand NTAS’ representations regarding
i. LLL benefits in different domains of life;
ii. importance of the development of plurilingual repertoire and
iii. how HE contributes (or can contribute) to the development of NTAS’ plurilingual repertoires.

The main methodological design has two phases: the first refers to the questionnaire, and the second is related to biographical interviews. In this paper, phase one is considered.

An online questionnaire was designed to be filled in by all the NTAS attending the University of Aveiro between the academic years of 2006/2007 and 2010/2011. Before sending the questionnaire, it was undertaken a pre-test with seven other NTAS who were not included in the study, which required adjustments and changes to the structure of the questionnaire.

The final version comprised a total of 18 questions, some included sub-items, but the majority were closed questions. It was divided into three parts:
iv. General characterization (age, gender, nationality, qualifications, current job, and course attended);
v. Lifelong Learning (mother tongue; foreign languages learned in formal and informal contexts and duration, proficiency level (now and then), foreign languages learned at the moment or to be learned in the future and motive, contact with foreign languages and in which contexts, importance of lifelong language learning, how many and which languages are considered important and why, representations of the importance of some languages in comparison with others and why, and the role of languages in society);
vi. Higher Education degree and languages (the importance of foreign languages in HE, foreign languages and their importance in the syllabus, influence of foreign language proficiency on academic success in HE).

It is important to emphasize that the second and third parts of the questionnaire refer to NTAS language biographies, which provide an initial approach to their plurilingual repertoires.

According to the UA Integrated Unit for Continued Education there were 485 NTAS with an active status attending several degrees at the UA during the aforementioned academic years. The questionnaire was sent by email to 485 NTAS, and 195 NTAS (40.2% of the total number) filled it in. This number is probably due to the fact that a large number of NTAS do
not use the UA institutional email and prefer their personal emails, or to their reluctance to participate in the study since it covers personal issues.

Therefore, from the initial 485 NTAS, the number decreased to 195 after the questionnaire application, which then became the sample of this study. Data collected were analysed through use of the software SPSS - Statistical Package for the Social Sciences, version 18.

The sample is comprised mostly of men (52.8%), with individuals aged between 23 and 66 years old, although most men were between 26 and 40 (69.8%). The majority is Portuguese, except for two Brazilian students. With regards to attendance, the three courses with more NTAS are Public Administration (n = 18), Languages and Business Relations (n = 16) and Technology of Information (n = 14). Most individuals were attending the first year (42.1%).

4.1 NTAS’ REPRESENTATIONS REGARDING LIFELONG LEARNING BENEFITS IN DIFFERENT DOMAINS OF LIFE

One of the questions was about the NTAS’ representations of the benefits of LLL in different domains of life, namely in promoting citizenship, equal opportunities and social cohesion, improving quality of life and developing self-esteem and empowerment. LLL can also contribute to professional development, that is to say in the acquisition of new competences, developing pre-acquired competences and adaptation skills, career progression, increasing employment rates and encouraging re-training. NTAS were asked to give their opinions regarding the benefits of LLL, choosing from ‘Strongly Disagree’ to ‘Strongly Agree’ (see Figure 1).

![Figure 1. Lifelong Learning benefits in different domains of life](image)

As shown in Figure 1, the main benefits of LLL identified by NTAS were: acquiring new skills (n = 192, 98.5%), improving pre-acquired skills (n = 190, 97.4 %), and developing adaptation skills (n = 188, 96.4%). The results suggest that NTAS associate more LLL to professional benefits and less to personal development, thus revealing a more instrumental perspective of LLL.
4.2 THE IMPORTANCE OF THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE PLURILINGUAL REPertoire

NTAS were also asked if they considered language learning important, with three possible answers: ‘yes’, ‘no’ or ‘no opinion’. The great majority of NTAS answered ‘yes’ (n = 184, 94.4%). Subsequently, they were asked to justify their answers, and five categories of analysis based on these answers were created. The categories focused on the importance of language learning concerning:

i. professional needs;
ii. personal development;
iii. globalisation;
iv. cultural enrichment, and v. opportunities for improving communication. 5.2% of NTAS have no opinion (n = 10), and one NTAS does not think it is important to learn languages throughout life (0.5%), although without explaining why.

The five categories are presented below (Table 1), with the number of occurrences in the justifications given by NTAS, and examples of answer:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Number of occurrences</th>
<th>Examples</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Professional reasons</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>&quot;These days we have to be versatile and know a bit of everything so that we can easily adjust to any opportunity that arises.&quot; NTAS25; &quot;(...) [speaking about foreign languages] it translates into added-value in terms of work skills.&quot; NTAS142; &quot;In order to work in a multinational company, it is crucial to know how to communicate clearly.&quot; NTAS145.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal development</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>&quot;Because it enriches us! And it makes me feel good!&quot; NTAS14; &quot;Because learning is good and because it is an added-value to ourselves&quot; NTAS108; &quot;Learning languages enables a major &quot;openness&quot; to life and to the world (...)&quot; NTAS183.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Globalization</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>&quot;In a global world, speaking several languages can make a difference between winning and losing.&quot; NTAS17; &quot;Mainly because it's our &quot;business card&quot; in the interaction as a global citizen&quot; NTAS25; &quot;It is essential to communicate in several languages due to globalization&quot; NTAS26.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural enrichment</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>&quot;It allow us to access new cultures, and the learning itself improves our ability to better understand the contact with people of other nationalities who speak foreign languages.&quot; NTAS6; &quot;To better understand different cultures, thus making us more tolerant and less ignorant.&quot; NTAS185; &quot;Knowing other languages enables us to get to know new cultures and opens new horizons, always&quot; NTAS194.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunities to improve communi-</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>Because it's very important to be able to communicate. Communication is essential in life, it is what allows us to be social as human beings, it is something that brings us together.&quot; NTAS91; &quot;In an open borderless Europe, it becomes increasingly necessary to speak other languages in order to communicate effectively with people from other countries, other languages and other cultures.&quot; NTAS136.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As stated above, the great majority of individuals believes that language learning is important [94.4% (n = 184)], mainly due to professional needs, personal development and globalization. It appears that language learning, as part of the individuals' lifelong learning process, is seen, as LLL in general, as an important professional quality. NTAS consider that language learning is also important for their cultural and communicational background, which departs from a more instrumental view of LLL.

From this perspective of language learning, 68.2% of NTAS (n = 133) stated that they want to learn languages and/or improve their language skills in the future for professional reasons, personal interest in learning new languages and cultures, globalization, and requirements set by HE. These results emphasise the importance of language learning, an unavoidable part of LLL.

4.3 REPRESENTATIONS REGARDING THE MAIN CONTRIBUTIONS OF HE IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE PLURILINGUAL REPERTOIRE

When asked if HE contributes to the development of plurilingual repertoires, 71.8% of NTAS (n = 140) answered affirmatively, regardless of their language skills. NTAS were asked, in an open question, to specify in which situations had they contacted with languages in HE, in other words, in which situations had HE contributed to the development of their plurilingual repertoires. The following categories were created to analyse the answers and identify the situations in which individuals contacted with foreign languages:

i. researching bibliography;
ii. communicating with teachers and foreign students;
iii. academic writing
iv. researching on the internet and using specific software. The four categories of analysis created according to the answers given by NTAS and the number of occurrences in the answers given by NTAS (see Table 2) are as follows:
Table 2. Contributions of HE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Number of occurrences</th>
<th>Examples</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bibliographical research</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>&quot;(...) Scientific communication... and most manuals are in English.&quot; NTAS8; &quot;Reading textbooks and scientific papers in English (...).&quot; NTAS23; &quot;Because it makes me think (positively) about research, and search for good bibliography in the correct language (standard language).&quot; NTAS29; &quot;(...) Some assignments, technical books or other documents, and research methods may be in languages other than our mother tongue and we need translate in order to understand its content; this improves our language skills, it develops them.&quot; NTAS81.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communicating with teachers and foreign students</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>&quot;(...) Contacting with teachers and students of other nationalities (...).&quot; NTAS20; &quot;(...) Teachers use it [English] (...) in most of the classes.&quot; NTAS59; &quot;To meet Erasmus people if we want to communicate we need to understand each other.&quot; NTAS91; &quot;Communicating with foreign students&quot; NTAS154.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic writing</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>&quot;The fact that we are constantly writing assignments, it forces us to somehow develop our language skills, both written and spoken.&quot; NTAS4; &quot;Because we go to several conferences with foreign teachers, and we have a lot of foreign bibliography.&quot; NTAS188; &quot;In the research field we deal with, information is usually found in a variety of languages, which we need to understand.&quot; NTAS99.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Researching on the Internet and using specific software</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>&quot;(...) although the degree does not include language courses in the curricula, [HE] we work with English software, we do internet research as well in computer programming.&quot; NTAS114.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The great majority of NTAS mentioned bibliography research as one of the greatest contributions of HE to the development of their plurilingual repertoire, followed by the contact with teachers and foreign students, many of them participating in the Erasmus program. The results show that, according to NTAS, HE contributes to the development of plurilingual repertoires, which presents HE as another stage in their LLL process.

4.4 RESULT SYNTHESIS

LLL is viewed by the great majority of NTAS from a very positive perspective. They highlighted its benefits in the acquisition of new skills (n = 192), the improvement of pre-acquired skills (n = 190), the promotion of adaptation skills (n = 188), the development of self-esteem, and a greater sense of responsibility for their own life (n = 175). Also, the majority of NTAS (n = 184) believe it is important to learn languages, particularly due to business reasons (n = 61), personal development (n = 59) and globalization (n = 35), assuming that language learning is a dynamic process influenced by their lives and experiences. According to 140 NTAS (71.8%) HE contributes to the development of their plurilingual repertoire, via the contacts and interactions with foreign languages, mainly literature in foreign languages (n = 80), especially English.
FINAL CONSIDERATIONS

Given that the development of plurilingual repertoires is an activity for life, developed and remodelled in accordance with the circumstances of life and shaped by the plurality and unpredictability of the individuals’ pathways (Andrade et al., 2003; Beacco & Byram, 2007; Mackiewiczv, 1998), it is important to understand how individuals, namely NTAS, perceive LLL, particularly the development of plurilingual repertoires. Understanding language learning as a life process, echoed in the personal and social trajectories of individuals (Coste et al., 2009; Semal-Lebleu, 2006), highlights the importance of understanding how plurilingual repertoires develop.

According to this study, NTAS recognize the importance of LLL and the role of HE in the development of their plurilingual repertoires. However, we should also question whether HE institutions themselves are creating multilingual spaces which can truly contribute to the development of the plurilingual repertoires of NTAS or, instead, they are promoting mostly one language, in this case English.

Since HE institutions are privileged spaces for constructing knowledge and think LLL as a cornerstone, it is vital to encourage them to promote plurilingualism, as a value and a competence. In view of this, it is also important to ascertain whether HE institutions are effectively considering this new reality as a challenge or designing coherent and systematic strategies which support the diversity brought by new pupils, such as NTAS.

In this sense, this study aims to contribute to the field of adult education, namely NTAS.

REFERENCES


VOICE, INTERACTION AND TRANSFORMATION: IDENTIFYING TRANSFORMATION IN THE DIVERSE MEANINGS AND CONTEXTS OF THE LANGUAGE OF BIOGRAPHICAL LEARNING INTERVIEWS

Evans, Rob
Otto-von-Guericke-University Magdeburg
Germany

The qualitative research interview engages with individual and group experience of social reality and observes, questions and records the testimony of the actors themselves in sites of social interaction chosen for the collection of data and its subsequent analysis. The relationship between social actors who are involved in processes of transition and transformation in very different social, professional, personal contexts and the researcher has been central to the discussion of research methods and research aims throughout the various methodological "turns" of the last decades. That relationship can be both reflexive and participatory, and can spur change itself as well as demanding that we think about the nature of transformation and transition in learning. This is particularly true, as many of us have experienced, of interview-based research, particularly when the interview serves as a catalyst for narratives of change.

Research interview respondents participating in diverse life worlds provide insight in unstructured discursive interviews into the significance of critical change processes for their individual and collective learning. In so doing they can be heard building own discourses of learning, in which resistance to the master discourses of the institution/the company/the 'host' society, is laid down in the interdiscursive layering of interaction with (a) the own told narrative, (b) with the researcher agenda and (c) in the all-important dialogue with those significant others whose voices and narratives give expression to the complexity and transacted meanings of individual and group learning contexts.

In my research, I make use of narratives from different research undertakings to demonstrate how in-depth interviewing, sensitive to language resources, their use in the co-construction of meaning and of new learning spaces themselves, help to follow how learning and identity formation can be told. I argue that language-sensitive research can help us to see how ethnicity, gender and age exert their influence in transition processes through new learning spaces and how they influence and shape learning in work/study/life situations of the individual (see, for example, Evans 2004, 2008, 2013).

The learning experiences this paper discusses stem therefore from the biographical narrative of a young adult recounting moments of educational transformation and, of rupture with former educational experience. Her talk encompasses both experience of learning and its absence, inclusion and exclusion. Aspects of this view of the learning experience that I address through the interview extracts include subjective experiences of learning and the construction of own discourses of knowledge and self, change and experience of diversity through the acquisition of professional, institutional or 'cultural' identities, and the gendering of new learning processes.

This approach to biography research, and to qualitative interview-based research more generally, wishes to listen closely to the workings of transition in the subjective, shared
experience related in biographical narratives. This attention to the detail and the richness of the language of change is followed through close analysis of change in the micro levels of talk. Language resources, their use in the co-construction of meaning and of the learning space itself, help to follow how transition/transformation in learning can be told.

1. FOCUS AND RATIONALE OF THE RESEARCH

The adult learner's talk I shall be looking at here forms part of a case study carried out at a German University, in which I interviewed a small cohort of near-finalist students of Business Administration some years ago (Evans 2004). The transcripts of the unstructured depth interviews were combined to form an interview corpus capable of analysis with the aid of standard text analysis (TACT, MonoConc) and qualitative data analysis software (see Fielding 2001a, Fielding 2001b, Kelle 2000, 2004). The language of the interview examined here ('Marie') is German. Extracts are given both in the original German and in English translation. Analysis of the talk, however, refers solely to the German transcript data.

The investigation is understood as an example of computer-aided qualitative research in which I adopt a broadly ethnomethodological approach. The interview transcripts - individually and as parts of a language corpus - are analysed using a mixture of conversation analysis (CA); institutional discourse(s) analysis and biographical-narrative analysis. Combining a narrative and biographical approach to interview transcription data with detailed analysis of linguistic phenomena, the coherence of learners' discourse practices in relation to their experiences of learning environments can be seen and their deployment of a range of discourses as a significant characteristic of their negotiation of the intricacies of asymmetrical (institutional) talk can be heard in their talk. In fact, interview talk, organised as discontinuous yet consistently robust biographical narratives of experience, creates shared and contested frames of discourse within which in-process theorizing of the learning process is developed in narrativized and 'biographized' chunks of 'learning discourse'.

Among the most significant characteristics of much of the biographical work done in talk is the employment of significant others' voices and 'other-own' voices - here described as 'embedded speech' and understood to function as a 'plausibility device' - in the service of self-expression and the production of own discourse as "open theorizing". I argue that by deploying others' voices in talk, multiple contexts of experience are tapped into and plausibility and agency are added to individuals' alternative discourses of learning.

2. BIOGRAPHY RESEARCH, INTERACTION, LIFE STORIES, SELF

Learners' perspectives, skirting and adapting to institutional discourses or challenging the dominant ways of talk of the university/workplace/organisation/family etc., can be picked up in their own biographical narratives. Marotzki, for example, finds biographical research useful because it brings empirical analysis to the phenomena of learning and education and then both of these are analysed within the context of the life-history, connecting up in this fashion with the concept of the constitution of the subject (Marotzki 1991: 182). The 'narrative' interview is used in this context as an interactive instrument for the collection of self-related data. Marotzki defines the employment and the advantages of the narrative interview and the data it generates thus:
"The real advantage of narrative interviews in the generation of data is that data are produced from which ... it is possible to see how the informant has processed events he (sic) - in whatever form - was involved in. Biographization is the name of the process through and in which the informant brings some kind of order in the interview situation to what is told, according to place, time, connections in the sequence of events, motives, conditions, causes and effects, etc." (Marotzki 1991: 184)

The medium of the narrative interview, most notably developed as an analytical tool in the work of Fritz Schütze (Schütze 1976, 1977, 1981, 1994, 1995), is accorded a special connecting function, so that if the telling represents a retelling in dialectical relation to the structured interview narration, then, as Marotzki remarks: "A related experience is accordingly a related and meaningful experience" (Marotzki 1991: 189-192).

Deborah Schiffrin (Schiffrin 1996) arrives at a similar position to Marotzki: 'self' is created and recreated in the interaction of talk. The life stories in which self and identity are produced in a 'story-world' are "a pervasive form of text through which we construct, interpret, and share experience" (Schiffrin 1996: 167). An important process underlying the sorts of texts she is interested in here links up with the central role of re-telling in Marotzki's view of 'biographization', namely "verbalization". Schiffrin claims that verbalization represents: "the way we symbolize, transform, and displace a stretch of experience from our past ... into linguistically represented episodes, events, processes, and states." (Schiffrin 1996: 168).

This process of verbalization of stretches of experience into a linguistic representation recognisable as an oral history or oral autobiography, is a process of creation of coherence in an individual's life story, according to Charlotte Linde (Linde 1993). "In order to exist in the social world" she maintains," ... an individual needs to have a coherent, acceptable, and constantly revised life story" (Linde 1993: 3). Such a life story is created "by interweaving many linguistic and social levels" and serves to express our sense of self and as a means of communicating our sense of self to others and negotiating 'group membership' (Linde 1993: 219). Grounded as it is in "large scale systems of social understandings" (219), Linde stresses nevertheless the element of process and change inherent in the oral life history: "As a linguistic unit, the life story is a rather odd unit: it is temporally discontinuous; and at any given telling of one of its component parts, it is incomplete" (Linde 1993: 25).

3. A RANGE OF DISCOURSES, EMBEDDING OF SPEECH

Ambiguity, however, and incompleteness characterise the biographical narrative. Linde points out how other peoples' stories (related in reported speech, embedded and 'layered' in the telling) become 'own' stories through a process of appropriation or conversion (Linde 1993: 35). The discontinuous and unfinished state of the oral narrative is embodied therefore in the discourse employed by the autobiographical narrator. Here Goffman's concept of 'embedding' will be used to describe this aspect of the speaker's 'self'. The words we speak, he points out, "are often not our own, at least our current 'own'" for "although who speaks is..."
situationally circumscribed, in whose name words are spoken is certainly not" (Goffman 1981: 3). Thus embedding makes it possible to 'enact' numerous voices over space and time within the interactive frame of the oral narrative and narrative interview (Goffman 1981: 4). Indeed, for the development of 'own' discourses within an emergent learning biography, the 'converted' and 'enacted' words of others or a non-current 'self' - what I call here 'embedded speech' - are an important device for contextualization of talk and serve as a 'plausibility device' to ground its discoursal validity.

Discourse use is always simultaneously constitutive of social identities, social relations and systems of knowledge and belief, or, viewed as a "discursive 'event' (i.e. any instance of discourse) is seen as being simultaneously a piece of text, an instance of discursive practice, and an instance of social practice" (Fairclough 1992: 4). Norman Fairclough's text/interaction/context framework (Fairclough 1989: 25) - which he sets alongside a corresponding hierarchical order of discourse: actual discourses/types of discourse/orders of discourse (Fairclough 1989: 29) - serves as the basic scaffolding for my own approach to the interview data generated in the research interviews I have carried out. At the level of the interview itself - the 90 or more minutes of 'talk' - the context is acutely interactive, and encompasses the physical setting and the joint accomplishment of understanding in interactive talk. At a further remove, the interview is embedded in a wider interactive context, including the institutional character of the research interview and its organization, 'longer' sequences of interaction between researcher and respondents (involving questions of access, academic discourses of learning and teaching) and, put simply, the 'long sequences' of experience narrated in the interview and which have evaluative and interpretive significance within the interactive construction of understanding, i.e. Fairclough's stages of interpretation and explanation, in which the cognitive processes of participants and "relationships between transitory social events ... and more durable social structures" are developed - (Fairclough 1989: 26-27). Finally, we have the context of social discourses, the social context in which the participants and the institutions involved interpret their roles and positions.

4. COMMUNICATIVE CONTEXTS

Studying and learning experiences as a set of ongoing experiences lived through over time and perceived as part of an ongoing 'life story' (Linde 1993) are jointly explored by myself and my respondents in research interviews. This means that the context of the interview and the data resulting from it are to some extent the only means of access to the other, wider contexts operating on and conditioning the interview interaction, yet experienced only through the language (and metalinguistic means) of the immediate interaction. Given that this is an acceptable description of the interview process, it is hardly surprising that definitions of context, the status of 'data' and the relevance of analytical methods may be contested. Stated briefly, the research interview here is in fact understood as "accessing various stories or narratives through which people describe their world" (Silverman 2000: 122). This approach sees the data as evidence of the joint generation by interviewer and interviewees of "plausible accounts of the world" (Silverman 2000: 123).
5. ‘MARIE’: CONSTRUCTING A LEARNING BIOGRAPHY

In taking a closer look at the biographic narrative work developed by Marie in her talk, the following aspects play a central role in the analytical approach adopted here:

- evidence of identity construction through 'biographization', including the building of an academic identity as part of a life-story;
- the workings of interdiscursivity as evidence of the employment and deployment of discourses of learning;
- the evidence of knowledge claims and knowledge acquisition

The learning biography is founded on 'temporal sequentiality'. This means that a biographical context is constructed interactively which provides the open theorizing of the student with a grounded structure, characterised by its references to temporal and ideational stages in each student's educational 'course'. Narrative, created in the talk, itself creates a context and grounding for the discontinuous talk that continues to work on the explication and theorizing the student respondent performs.

In my corpus, the narratives/accounts/stories told in interaction all have the following basic characteristics:

- they represent longer turns or 'chunks' of talk, stretching usually over a number of turns (or speaker-changes)
- they are sequentially warranted by the previous talk and usually serve to ground open theorizing
- they represent a holding of the floor (i.e. the talk is attended to by others) over a number of turns during which time the floor is accepted
- the talk is recipient-oriented and it is warrantably tellable
- it is sequentially generated by a request to perform it

Further, there is the question of structuredness. The types of structures established in the work of Labov (Labov 1999) include a range of the following:

- the 'abstract' – which usually presents an initial summary of the whole story (Labov 1999: 227)
- the 'orientation' – in which time, place, persons, and their activity in the narrative may be identified. However, although the orientation-phase may be organised fairly compactly at the start of the narrative, individual elements of the orientation (e.g. indexical features) may be found placed at "strategic points later on" (Labov 1999: 229)
- 'complication' – in which the events unfolding in the narrative are positioned strategically
- 'evaluation' – this Labov describes as "the means used by the narrator to indicate the point of the narrative" (Labov 1999: 231). Clearly this is connected very closely to the general 'reportability' or 'tellability' (Sacks 1992: 12) of the narrative, and may be connected interactively with challenges and repair (Labov 1999: 231).
• 'result' or 'resolution' – answering the question "how did it end?"

• the 'coda' - to signal the finish of a narrative, the coda can be used. Codas may have the "property of bridging the gap between the moment of time at the end of the narrative proper and the present" (Labov 1999: 230). It is therefore of enormous importance as a marker of transition between discoursal contexts which emerge and merge during talk. Labov also points out how the coda may be used strategically within contested talk as a "disjunctive" device. In this function – one of many examples is to be found in the first Extract (1) indicated as → 9 – the coda closes the sequence of complicating actions in the narrative, and as such makes further questioning about the sequence of events redundant or impossible. Further questions are forestalled, and the narrative (and the narrative-oriented discourse) is closed off (Labov 1999: 230).

Alheit makes use of a similar structure in his approach to educational biographies (Alheit 1989). He uses the 'preamble' in the place of the abstract, and characterises the intermediate sections of a skilfully related biographical narrative - the 'complication' and 'evaluative' sections in Labov's terms - as being heavily indexicalised with time sequences, explanations, definitions, to show it is a narrative and not an argumentative structure (Alheit 1989: 128). An emphasis on the structuring of biographical knowledge/"Strukturbildung biographischen Wissens" (Alheit 1989: 124) is perhaps the most interesting feature of this branch of German life history and biographical research. Following Alheit here, we can further distinguish between the layers present and working through the learning biographies my respondents produce: thus over and above the autobiographical content of narrated experience, elements of 'tradition-building', i.e. the elaboration of 'set-pieces' or established narrative frames which are of strategic value in establishing membership and identity, can be found, and more diffuse still, the collection and employment of a common-sense reserve of 'higher level knowledge'/'höherprädikatives Wissens", of "everyday 'theories' and judgements relevant to the 'life-world'" of the individual ("alltags- und lebensweltrelevanten 'Theorien' und Einschätzungen") which influence behaviour when they are 'institutionalised' and become coded in the canon of possible narrative structures presenting and offering themselves in a given collective context (Alheit 1989: 139).

In the deployment of these different levels of knowledge and experience in the learning biography, respondents commonly make use of further complicating structures. Labov's 'complication', 'evaluation', 'resolution' are paralleled in biography research by 'background development' ('Hintergrundkonstruktion'), 'distancing', and rhetorical methods of narration to highlight the 'professionality' (i.e. authority) of the narrative content (Alheit 1989: 128-134). Similar analytical divisions in the narrative 'template' of life story research are 'description', 'narration' and 'argumentation' (Miller 2000: 134).

6. DISCONTINUITY OF NARRATIVES

The narratives regularly reproduce elements of this structure, but not always. In fact, the narratives are characterised by discontinuity. This is occasioned by the nature of the interaction in interviews. Jefferson and Lee call this (in relation to 'troubles talk' and 'advice giving') 'asynchrony' and 'contamination', which is heard when the recipient is not, or not equally, aligned to the direction the talk is overtly designed to go in (Jefferson and Lee 1992). In fact, talk in interaction is rarely, if ever, entirely unambiguous concerning what at any
moment is occurring. A narrative may become a statement, the recipient's non-alignment to a
description may likely bring about a new alignment, and so on.

Hoerning also stresses the incompleteness of individual biographies: biographic experiences,
she points out, are "bound up at all times to a specific context"2 and that new experience is
worked and reworked into the former life story: “Biographic experiences and the biographic
knowledge that arises from them are in this view not merely the laying down of a stratum of
things experienced but also the continuous re-working of all that is experienced“3 (Hoerning

The learning biographies of my respondents were not elicited as (extensive) life histories. The
interview format is not a near-monologue, as Miller expects interviews employed in the
collection of detailed life-histories to be, or only rarely (Miller 2000: 92, see also Schütze
1976). Thus, the biographies narrated across the encounter are discontinuous speech acts
with all the signs of being, not elicited biographies, but biographized talk, temporally
sequential and interdiscursively constructed learning biographies.

7. 'AUTOBIOGRAPHICAL REFLEXION' AND IDENTITY: LIFE-STORY WORK:

Central elements in the life story are connectedness, aim, and some kind of climax. The use
of 'staging' devices (direct and indirect speech, mimesis, caricature, affective marking of lexis
and special discourse particles) in the unfolding of the directed narrative is discussed by
Susanne Günthner in particular connection with the creation of bonds of solidarity between
conversation participants (Günthner 1997: 189-190). While their significance for an analysis
of the play of discourses in students' speech will be considered again below, the 'narrative
detailing' that Günthner adduces as an important rhetorical element in stimulating others'
involve ment (Günthner 1997: 211) is apparent in the dramatic sequencing of numerous
coherent life-story narratives in the data. A necessarily small number of formative
experiences in the education career of Marie will serve below as illustrations.

The exchange in Extract 1 will be commented on here as a constitutive part of the learning
biography Marie develops in the course of her interview. This short narrative passage, with
the story of Marie's personal development as a result of a period of study abroad, contains
elements of most of the features of narrative talk set out above. In this, as in all the remaining
extracts of this paper, in the column to the right of the extract line numbers the
structuredness of Marie's talk is indicated using Labov's terms. Below the heading for the
extract, the abbreviations for Labov's structure are given in square brackets. In the next
column to the right, significant evidence of the construction of discourses, biographization
processes in talk, epistemic discourse and knowledge claims as well as rhetorical-prosodic
markers is indicated by numbered arrows (e.g. → 5).

For the extracts that follow, the markers used to indicate modality, embedded speech, etc.
are:

2 ["Biographische Erfahrungen sind lebensgeschichtlich an einen Kontext gebunden").]
3 ["Biographische Erfahrungen und das daraus entstandene biographische Wissen ist nach dieser
Vorstellung also nicht nur die Ablagerung des Erfahrenen, sondern die fortlauende Überarbeitung
des Erfahrenen ...")]
Marie: Narrative: self development (SPAIN I)

Extract 1

Lin
1. M : ja was soll ich sagen was ich
2. an der Uni gewaehlt habe? hehehe
3. R : zum Beispiel
4. (0.5)
5. Ab M: uhm das ist ja witzig weil heute
6. Or \rightarrow 1 "denke ich ueber die Sachen ganz
7. anders nach"° seit ich in Spanien
8. Ev \rightarrow 2 war? hat mir ja irgendwie die
9. Augen geoeffnet
10. R : ja wieso?
12. Or \rightarrow 3 war frueher sehr eingeschuechtert
13. sehr verschuechtert von dem
14. \rightarrow 4 Bildungssystem uhm=
15. R: schon in der Schule? oder {erst
16. uhm
17. Or M: in)der Schule ja auch schon uhm
18. Co und dann und dann ja auch hier an
19. der Uni uhm immer diese
20. \rightarrow 5 Anforderungen
21. unterdurchschnittliche
22. Studienzeit
23. ueberdurchschnittliche Leistungen
24. Co und wenn man das alles nicht
25. hatte und nicht Sprachen schon
26. perfekt sprach uhm also ich hab
27. Re \rightarrow 6 immer gedacht ich waere mehr so
28. unter dem Nivhheau hehehe
29. R: ja?
30. Re M: oder ich hatte gar nicht die
31. Moeglichkeit einen Super-Job zu
32. yeah what should I say what I
33. chose at the uni? hehehe
34. for example
35. uhm that's funny because I
36. think differently about these
37. things today since I was in
38. Spain? it sort of opened my
39. eyes
40. yeah how?
41. ?=because: .hh I I think I used
42. to be pretty scared very shy
43. because of the education system
44. uhm=
45. already when you were at
46. school? or {only uhm
47. in) school yeah then too uhm
48. and then and then here too at
49. the uni uhm always these
50. demands below average studying
51. time above average performance
52. and if you didnt manage that
53. and didnt already speak loads
54. of languages perfectly uhm well
55. I always thought that I was
56. more sort of below averhhage
57. hehehe
58. yeah?
59. or I didn't have the
Marie 'abstracts' the narrative she is required to produce at line 5 with the – for her – characteristic hedging mitigation that what she is about to tell is 'witzig'/'funny'. This may plausibly be taken as a predictable precautionary face-saving device. What is later developed as a serious epistemic discourse (→ 9) is first sketched in as a potentially funny anecdote. As such, it may also be read as an example of that 'staging' of joint discourse mentioned above. Understood in this way, the use of humour and casualness of tone would be an affective marker, a 'defusing' device and a bid for agreement at the start of a turn.

The heavy indexicality (ich/seit ich/in Spanien war – l/since l/was in Spain) of the first 'orientation' at line 6 serves, too, to embed a strong claim to knowledge and self-development and is a prime example of biographization. In other words, crucial life events (CLEs) are framed narratively in a structured, sequential fashion to produce a discrete, recognizable biographical narrative, however brief or discontinuous it may be. Further instances of orientation (lines 12 and 17) provide in the same fashion indexical framing and temporal sequencing to the progress of Marie's narrative. 'Complicating action' (11, 18, 24, 33) is hearable where the narrative descends into greater contextual detail and sequential complexity, employing adverbs of time (und dann und dann/and then and then), conditional clauses (und wenn man/and if you) and conjunctions of causality (weil/because). The rhetorical-prosodic function of such contextualization is evident here in the self-repair at line 18 as Marie hesitates before in fact drawing parallels between negative school experience and experience at the university. Likewise prosodically charged is the complicating action at 33 where the table-rapping (→ 7), following on from a significant pause suggesting that Marie needs a moment to consider the cost to her self-image of continuing her discourse (begun at → 5), is bundled together with the final of three 'resolutions' (at 27, 30, 34) and an important use of a membership category device (→ 8 'crème de la crème'). The coda (36) is fused with an enormously effective piece of 'internal' embedded speech (→ 9). In effect, the authority of Marie's own voice concludes the short narrative and provides the only authoritative interpretation admitted. The contrast here is underlined (a) to the hesitations and insecurities of the contested knowledge claim at → 4, 5, 6, (b) to the 'technologized' jargon of the institution at → 5, to the negative membership category of the 'elite' she is not part of at → 6 and → 8.

The work Marie is doing here combines in an intricate way the discourse functions of the learning biography. Identity and self are proposed within a biographized framework and discourses of knowledge and learning are accounted for by reference to events in the life world of the student. Further, the student's discourses are contextualized through association with membership categories (the privileged versus those whose eyes have been opened by experience) which themselves are grounded in the significant speech of self and others. Finally, the strength of out-of-frame speech lies in its intensely affective, personalized prosodic and rhetorical features. Marie's coda: "du kannst alles / machen / was du willst / du kriegst doch alles / was du willst" (you can do anything you want to you can get whatever you want) is an example of the extremely sensitive (co-) selection of words that Sacks refers to in
connection with the 'poetics' of talk design. Designing talk for and with the audience, he argues, involves the employment of co-selected "sound sequences" in specific talk environments (Sacks 1992: 321, see also Tannen 2007 on repetition). The selection of individual words partially on the basis of sound co-ordination is a sign of just how locally constructed a piece of talk can be (Sacks 1992: 321). In Marie's case, the repetition (4 times "du", twice each for "alles" and "willst") and alliteration ('k's and 'dark 'a's) and the unchallengeability of the direct speech, show this example of the plausibility device for generating a common sense theory to be custom-made for the interactive environment in which it is used.

Marie: NARRATIVE: (SPAIN II)
Extract 2

[Ab = 'abstract', Or = 'orientation', Co = 'complication', Ev = 'evaluation', Re = 'resolution', 'coda']

1  R: ja was ist passiert in Spanien? so what happened in Spain?
2  M: =ich weiss nich uhm: (3.0) (das I don't know uhm (3.0) (I
3  Ab 1 meine) habe ich meine Ein?stellung think that) I changed my point
4  geaendert also bin jetzt of view? now I'm more self-
5  selbstbewusster und (.u h m es ist confident and (.u h m it's
6  Ev  → 2 schwer zu erklären (4.0) uhm: man difficult to explain (4.0) uhm
7  Or  kommt erstmal allein in einem you have to cope alone with
8  Co  anderen Land zurecht ich sprach die things in a foreign country I
9  Sprache so gut wie garnicht und und was in explained and was forced to
10  sprechen und es war zum Beispiel to speak and it was for example
11  Ev  egal ob man einen Fehler macht oder unimportant whether you made a
12  Co  nicht man wurde ermunert <ESP>mach mistake or not you were
13  → 3 doch einfach sprich doch einfach encouraged <ESP>go on just
14  Or  die Leute waren sehr sehr talk everyone was very very
15  Co  freundlich und so fing es dann an friendly and so it started like
16  und dann bin ich jetzt auf den that and then I got the idea to
17  Trichter gekommen noch Französisch learn French and to go to
18  zu lernen und nach England zu gehen England one time because when
19  Co  mal weil wenn man einmal spricht you begin to speak uhm (1.0)
20  Ev  uhm (1.0) es ist nicht so wie in it's not like in Germany I
21  Deutschland da hab ich da mal noticed i- in English for
22  gemacht i in Englisch zum Beispiel example uhm: it was best not to
23  uhm: am besten keinen Fehler machen make any mistake you were
24  Co  man wurde dann sofort korrigiert corrected straightaway not
25  und nicht ermunert und so (.u h m i)
corrected and so (.u h m I just
26  ich nachher einfach nicht mehr didn't speak anymore afterwards
27  coda  gesprochen]

29  R: wo? where?
30  Or  M: zum Beispiel in der Schule? so at school for example? that's
31  → 5 zum Beispiel in der Schule? so how it seems to me that's how
32  kommt mir vor so kommt's mir noch it seems to me in Latin seemed
33  in Latein vor kam mir so in to me in Spanish uhm (.u h m it
34  Spanisch vor uhm (.u h m es war nicht wasn't no encouragement but
35  Spanisch vor uhm (.u h m es war nicht
36  man macht es richtig oder man either you you di it right or
37  hielt sich seinen Muh:nd hehehh so you kept your mouth shut
38  Res → 6 kams mir auch vor _ hehehh it seemed to me like that_
39  (2.0)
40  R: {uhm}
41  M: =man) hat im grunde keinen Spass =you) had no fun basically no

38
In Extract 2 we have essentially a single effort on Marie's part to account for the transformation that has taken place in her life and studies as a result of spending a year abroad. The main body of this short narrative unit is contained in lines 2-28. Lines 30-37 and 39-43 represent two separately elicited resolutions. The structure of this piece of talk is clearly that of a story-like narrative and not that of a straight account or relation of facts, nor is it an argument or set of ideas. Following Alheit here, I see the mix of complicating events, evaluation and the attempt to lead up to a result or coda as evidence of the narrative work being done to Marie's biography (Alheit 1989). Marie 'preambles' her narrative with a recipient-oriented abstract that defines at the outset the importance of the story she is about to tell (lines 3.5). There is abundant evidence here, too, of M's reluctance to embark on this narrative (→ 2, → 5), and she seems to attempt to back out of the necessity to indulge in open theorizing at R's behest more than once (see line 2 'ich weiss nich uhm'/'I don't know uhm'; line 6 a pause of 4 seconds after 'ist schwer zu erklaren'/it's difficult to explain').

The narrative itself, however, is clearly structured. Indexical information and backgroundering (Marie herself, Spain, the people, being in a foreign country, not speaking a word of the language) are skillfully introduced in successive waves of complication (lines 8, 16, 20, 25). Marie evaluates her experience in a series of almost circular accounts, developing a narrative of change (3-5), through encouragement and learning (13-20), and back through discouragement in the past to her present interpretation of the significance of the whole set of learning experiences (32-35, 39-41).

The narrative documents a change in Marie's self-esteem and state of knowledge. The change that Spain brought to her sense of self is set at the opening of this narrative (→ 1). Once the urge to relinquish the topic is overcome (→ 2), Marie embellishes her biographical narrative with strongly affective language and steps out of frame to re-propose the moment in which she was introduced to an alternative method of learning (→ 3). Once again it is embedded speech which accounts for the significance of what Marie has to say here. The heavy indexical backgrounding allows her to transport the learning context and its positive attributes into the heart of her narrative, and thereby into the institutional context of this interview. This learning discourse is warranted by the piling up of indexical detail and by the strong re-formulation of the central problem – lack of encouragement in the past – once again at → 4 as a mirror-image of the 'set piece' (Alheit 1989: 139) enhanced at → 2 by the speech of those who gave her support. Marie fends off the potentially threatening first position question coming from the interviewer (28) and his dubious reaction at 38 with a prosodically significant selection of sounds that establish an almost unassailable sense of narrative coherence (→ 6). Framed in this litany of seeming ('so kommts mir vor', 'so kommts mir noch … vor', 'kam mir so … vor', so kam mir auch vor'), we have once again the theme of lack of encouragement, which Marie re-proposes a last time at → 7 as a dichotomy between 'fun'/'pleasure' and 'duty'.

41 → 7 gehabt oder keine Freude es war wie pleasure it was like a duty (.)
42 Res ne Pflicht (.) nicht so hmm was not like hmm what's the reason
43 steckt denn da hinter? auhm: for it? auhm:
8. 'MICRO-NARRATIVES AND 'WOODEN HORSES'

The part of Marie's 'Spain' narrative discussed above is a good example of how within the interview talk, discourses of learning are embedded in interdiscursive sequences which can be described as 'micro-narratives'. These discrete narrative units – themselves embedded within longer sequences of narration or suspended within brief turn-exchanges – act as interactive 'wooden horses' which transport own discourse into the stream of discourse upheld by the institutional context or forming the context in which the interview is experienced. In addition, Marie's Spain experience is a striking instance of the crisis-like phases of transition which are a central element of the narrative interview and biographical life-course research (Miller 2000: 27). The discourse Marie develops here contrasts her previous state with a transition to a thoroughly new phase in her learning characterised by increased self-confidence and ability. This example of 'biographical work' illustrates how individuals "construct and reconstruct their self-view" in response to a changing environment (Miller 2000: 156). Doing this type of work enables students like Marie to structure their experiences reflexively, and by so doing to "practically orient themselves, while dealing with events ongoingly as they go through life" (Fischer-Rosenthal 1995 cited in Miller 2000: 157).

Other qualitative research into the varying difficulties experienced by students from working-class and academic backgrounds on entry into university provides interesting parallels to learners' biographies in my corpus of interviews. Thus, Haas (Haas 1999) finds that students from non-academic backgrounds pass through a significant 'self-crisis' ("Ich-Krise") which nevertheless contains considerable potential for individual growth in adversity (Haas 1999: 225, 234). In fact, as Haas points out, women students from non-academic households studying in male-dominated faculties – and Marie fits this description closely – are doubly beset by the difficulties of the academic discourses of the new learning environment as well as by its gender structures (Haas 1999: 164-165). A response to this difficult phase of adaptation can be "an explicitly formulated desire for 'movement', ... for 'things foreign', 'difference' and for uncertainty or non-routine things …" (Haas 1999: 234). Marie's stay in Spain and her learning experiences there are conceivably examples of such a 'move'.

I have tried to show the structuredness of Marie's biographical narratives and of their remarkable coherence. Within the framework of recognisable stories with robust narrative elements, significant life experiences are developed as learning discourses and/or discourses of knowledge and self. Own discourse practices are consistently grounded in interdiscursive talk which draws upon the interaction of the micro-context (the interview) and re-proposes knowledge claims and student theorizing in reference to other, competing macro-contexts (family background, school, university, work). The ethnographic data concerning study abroad and its place in students' academic careers produced in these extracts - and in many more too numerous to draw upon here (Evans 2004)– echo the results of the work of other researchers (Haas 1999, Krüger and Marotzki 1995). The narrative interview, then, is a vehicle for the 'biographization' of experience - a bringing of 'order' to events. Order is established in the narrative process itself, during and through which meaning is constructed and allocated to sections of personal life experience. This 'biographization' of a life is by definition a communicated (re-)telling and the telling renders it meaningful (Alheit 2006, Marotzki 1991: 189-192). The 'verbalization' of self in the telling (Schiffrin 1996: 168) is meaningful yet unfinished, incomplete. Linde, too, underlines two

4 "[..] zu einer explizit formulierten Lust auf 'Bewegung', ... auf das 'Fremde', das 'Andere' und auf Unsicherheit bzw. Nichtfestgefahrenheit führt."
central characteristics of the life story: coherence and incompleteness (Linde 1993: 25). This tension, this 'in-process' experience is apparent also in Marie's narratives.

9. BY WAY OF A CONCLUSION

In this paper, a close examination of the discourse work being performed in the life story indicates that it is very much a product of interdiscursivity. The movements between different currents of experience enacted in this 'discourse work' makes extensive use of layering of voice(s) in the co-construction of meaning.

Whether turned to in order to carry forward discourses of empowerment by drawing on resources of experience from different (extra-interview) contexts of interaction, or whether conversationalized speech is employed to establish shared institutional understandings (represented very strongly by learners whose talk could not be included here), the extended resources of layered discourse function as a 'plausibility device' through which talk is grounded in the speech of others and open theories of learning and self are worked up and convincingly accounted for.

These narratives draw on many and varied resources in an open-ended and necessarily incomplete way to create shared and contested frames of discourse, organized as biographical narratives of experience. Much as stories get told, as Sacks has suggested (Sacks 1992: 12) because they are tell-able and re-tell-able, so the everyday theorizing involved in accounting for events and opinions is developed in narrativized and 'biographized' chunks of talk.

The extraordinary richness of the biographical narratives produced in the interaction of the interview are the source and resource of the construction of a whole series of discursive identities and discourse practices. Marie elaborates experience (as do all those other learners whose data could not be used for this paper) into a working, in-process discursive self. The voices voiced and heard are 'owned' voices, various changing socially constructed 'selves' (see Ivanic 1997). A strong reason for taking this viewpoint is that a dominant impression communicated through the language data of the interviews is of change and of passage from earlier states of being and doing. If indeed I am right in hearing this in these students' talk, then this sense of passage must be understood as being intrinsically bound up with respondents' production of learning discourses. The destination of this 'passage' or change' is certainly not mapped out ahead. Learning discourse, and learning to reflect on that 'learnt' discourse can be overheard here as evidence of the difficult work – hard interpersonal work at times – involved in negotiating identities across multiple contexts.

REFERENCES


Schütze, Fritz (1977): Die Technik des narrativen Interviews in Interaktionsfeldstudien - dargestellt an einem Projekt zur Erforschung von kommunalen Machtstrukturen (= Arbeitsberichte und Forschungsmaterialien 1). Bielefeld: Universität Bielefeld Fakultät für Soziologie


ABSTRACT

According to European recommendations and European educational policies, universities should be able to promote and support lifelong learning. Over time the academic world has changed its relation with society through the transformation of its functions or missions. Universities, after the transformation from elite niches to “mass higher education” places are now taking a new challenge: the extension of their population in a lifelong direction. The presence of “mature” students therefore should not be an exception or an eccentricity, but it can be explained with the evolution of institutional missions. Nevertheless, this category still remains outside from the “academic tribes and territories” and it is recurrent in research studies concerning the so-called “non-traditional students”, defined as under-represented students in higher education and whose participation is constrained by structural factors. These students are considered at risk in terms of access, retention, active participation, academic success, and social integration.

The question of my research project places itself in this context and concerns those students enrolling at university through non-linear trajectories or with personal backgrounds that do not consider the academic path as a “natural outcome”. What do these students look for and what do they find at university? What does it represent for them? What effects on the idea of self that the student develops in relation with the academic world?

Different research studies in the field of adult education and of the sociology of education show how adult students develop forms of multilevel identity inside universities. Many of these studies use the biographical or auto-biographical methods since their potential to grasp the point of view of the participants. For my research I considered it useful and interesting to choose the auto-biographical methods exactly because of their potentiality to give voice to the insiders. At the same time I wanted to emphasize the pedagogical, relational and reflexive dimension of these methods and therefore I chose the form of the auto/biographical workshop. The workshops involved about 30 adult students and were based on estethical, metaphorical and reflexive processes. The narrative materials produced during the workshops were analyzed through a plurality of sensitising concepts able to enlighten in different ways the experience of lifelong learning in a university context. The final step of the research was a co-operative inquiry with a team of researcher/students that previously experienced the biographical workshops. The co-operative inquiry focused more deeply on the experience at university, generating a shared and participatory hermeneutic circle and resulted in a project addressed to the institution.
1. LIFELONG AND LIFEWIDE LEARNING AS “KEY FACTORS” FOR THE KNOWLEDGE ECONOMY.

What does learning mean? What meanings can this question take on for those adults who decide to re-enter in adult education, enrolling at university?

It seems that lifelong learning has become an integral part of the discourses concerning both the educational and the sociopolitical fields: in the new millennium the international organizations that influence the policies in the EU member countries are all in its favor, even though lifelong learning can have different interpretations (see Hager, 2006).

On the other hand these new discourses/new rhetorics cannot but confirm a global trend to live lives “in transition”: life itself requires a willingness to always learn. In a social space characterized by high unpredictability, by a growing number of connections on the global scale and by the development of more and more liquid forms of social ties and identities (Bauman, 2005) individuals need flexible and dynamic knowledge that can interact in wider contexts.

As the reflexive modernisation theory (Beck, 1992; Giddens, 1998) points put, the knowledge developed through basic education, as well as inherited from traditions, is not enough in itself and cannot be valid long enough. Therefore it seems natural to witness the development of a population of “lifelong learning subjects” (Dumazadier, 1995).

In an “age of supercomplexity” (Barnett, 2000) educational systems have to face new questions and new ideas about the relationship with knowledge which implies calling into question the traditional distinctions between formal, non-formal and informal learning (see Eraut, 2000). Personal knowledge and transversal skills become more and more important than the myth of “educational qualifications”. Therefore, besides being lifelong, the new way of learning is lifewide: it crosses and connects the contexts of living and studying, which are traditionally considered as distinct.

What do these epochal changes mean from the point of view of the subjects and of the institutions? What consequences, what adaptations, what stories do they involve?

Since 90es the political agendas of the main western international organizations (EU, UN, OECD) have been enlighting the lifelong learning as a key factor for the development of a more productive and efficient workforce and social cohesion. So “effort and resources are being devoted to promoting the idea of lifelong learning as a solution to society’s current ills” (Field, 2006 :1)

Nevertheless many critical voices raises. Social cohesion is not a granted result because new forms of social exclusion, based on differences between rich and poor in “grey capital”, are possible.

The OECD's Centre for Educational Research and Innovation stated it starkly:

"In today's 'knowledge economies' and 'learning societies', knowledge, skills and learning have come to be recognised as fundamental for participation by individuals in modern life, as well as the hallmarks of dynamic economic units and thriving social communities [...] For
those who are excluded from this process, however, or who chose not to participate, the generalisation of lifelong learning may only have the effect of increasing their isolation from the world of 'knowledge-rich'." (OECD, 1997 quoted in Field, 2006)

Other scholars alert about the risk of new institutional forms of control through the colonization of informal learning (Hager & Hallyday, 2007) and new forms of self-discipline (Andersson & Fejes, 2005) based on the risk of dropping out from the knowledge market.

2. UNIVERSITY AND ADULT EDUCATION. THE TIMES THEY’RE A CHANGIN’?

The challenges posed by lifelong and lifewide learning affect the whole education system and particularly university. Over time the academic world has changed its relation with society through the transformation of its functions or missions (Scott, 2006). Its two main missions, teaching and researching, are rooted in the pre-modern era, before the birth of nation states.

Today the new activities demanded to university by the knowledge economy are gathered under the term third stream or third task, which implies innovations both in terms of organization and of education curricula. Education curricula in particular are structured according to the new individuals they address, who approach or re-approach their studies as adults, leading universities to create lifelong learning programs (Boulton & Lucas, 2008).

Furthermore the university of the future will face more and more the difficulty of committing itself solely to the “formal” knowledge, given the tendency towards the informal and non-formal dimensions of learning that comes from politics and the market. There are growing demands to develop in the students “transversal skills” and life skills, besides the more common specialized skills and knowledge related to the academic discipline.

Universities, after the transformation from élite niches to “mass higher education” places (Trow, 1999), are now taking a new challenge: the extension of the their population in a lifelong direction.

The presence of “mature” students in universities therefore should not be an exception or an eccentricity, but it can be explained with the evolution of the educational missions. Nevertheless many studies show how this category still remains outside from the “academic tribes and territories” (Becker, 1989).

The question of my research project places itself in this context and concerns those students enrolling at university after a “non-traditional” path, or with personal backgrounds that do not consider the academic path as a “natural outcome”. What do these students look for and what do they find at university? What does it represent for them? What meanings and learnings does this meeting create and what effects does it have on the idea of self that the student develops in relation with the academic world?

In the specific literature I found a wide range of research studies concerning the so-called “non-traditional students”, defined as “under-represented students in higher education and whose participation is constrained by structural factors” (RAHNLE, 2011). This category is so wide that it includes, for example, students whose families of origin did not have any
academic experience, students coming from low-income families, adult students who work and students with disabilities.

These students are considered at risk in terms of access, retention, active participation, academic success, and social integration.

I focused in particular on the students whose family had not been to university before (first generation entrants) and on adult students that start their educational path during or after a working period. These two categories represent two interesting points of view on the topic of lifelong and lifewide learning. In addition to the greater difficulties they face in overcoming the barriers to the access to higher education, they also have to take on one more challenge: that of composing different worlds and finding a synthesis that is satisfactory for their changing identity.

These students, more than others, may face a cultural clash coming to and learning in higher education and they have to make a creative move to mix aspects of their previous life in order not to always play the role of the “fish out of water” (Bourdieu, 1984). For example they have to connect their social networks with new links originated by their inclusion in the academic world. The same problem of integration occurs in regard to the social roles that the student holds: the status of university student is seen by the society – but especially by the institution – as not compatible with other roles that are as important – if not more important – for the subject (e.g. the role of parent or worker). The challenge is to integrate identities that are not only different, but constructed as opposites (student vs. worker, or adult, or parent...); the social feedback in the proximal system (generally negative) to their learning choice; the way they dealt with previous experiences in education and in higher education (Alheit, 1995). In a systemic view this polarization in opposite concepts can represent a problem because of the risk to structure stories on dilemmas with no way out (Keeney, 1983). In these cases a situation of “floating” may occur. Floating is “a deep feeling of being paralyzed by events or experiences that a person cannot cope psychologically, emotionally and socially” (Bron, 2010); a difficult situation that, nevertheless, when recognised through self-reflection, could trigger a process of learning.

Different research studies in the field of adult education and of the sociology of education show how adult students develop forms of multilevel identity (Kasworm, 2010) inside universities. This identity is on the one hand based on their individual biographies, motivations, present roles in life and expectations, and on the other hand co-constructed in relation to the ethos and actions of university (also depending on the type of university they enroll or the subject of study) but also in relation to the influence of the institution perceived on their own personal world:

“This interest in integration led us in turn to explore what promotes or limits the construction of a learner identity among non-traditional adult students. Such an identity is itself part of the integration process which enables people to become effective learners and which promotes or inhibits completion of HE.” (Field, Merrill & West, 2011: 2)

3. THE RESEARCH THEORETICAL FRAME.

“Qualitative research is a situated activity that locates the observer in the world. It consists of
a set of interpretive, material-practices that make the world visible." (Denzin & Lincoln, 2003: 3)

The act of qualitative research needs to be placed in a theoretical frame; in fact the world can be made visible in different ways, depending on the different assumptions we chose.

My theoretical background is based on systemic approach (Bateson, 1972; von Foerster, 1981), constructivism (Varela, 1993), social constructionism (Gergen, 1999) and the theory of complexity (Morin, 1995).

These perspectives are based on a relational ontology: the world is conceived as a multi-level net of relations and not as a mere collection of separate entities. What becomes important is the “pattern which connects” objects, subjects or stories and not only their individual qualities.

Knowledge itself from a re-presentation of the world become a process of interaction and relation.

This epistemological stance has effects both on the method and object of the research.

A) RESEARCH METHOD.

This research is based on biographical methods for two main reasons:

- Biographical research is interested in “how people actively 'learn' their world, and their place in it, as well as how this may be challenged “ (Merrill & West, 2009: 4);

- Biographical research is highly compatible with other approaches to analyse the life course. Significant episodes of learning often happen at turning points “Biographical approaches thus allow for researchers to explore the meanings and importance that people attach to particular changes in their lives, including those that have to do with transitions between life stages, which we probably expect to go through at some time as we grow older, and those that involve significant and often unexpected challenges to someone's status and role. Both force us to ask who we are, and who we should relate and how, requiring us to reconsider more or less explicitly our capacity for learning from and for our lives” (Field, Gallagher & Ingram, 2009).

If we wish to understand learning as a fundamental and pervasive human activity, then we need to see it as integral to people's lives and the stories they tell about their lives. For example the drop out issue can be addressed in terms of: what the decision to quit university means in the life of these students? “In some cases dropping-out may be the start of a new transition and stage in their biography, while in others it may indicate a difficult set-back in what they see as an evolving learning career.” (Field, Merrill & Morgan-Klein, 2010: 2)

Stories are “patterns which connect” (Bateson, 1972): they connect different life spheres, contexts and times, but also the teller with his/her audience. So biographical research have to deal with these integration processes:
“If biographical research is found in challenging spaces and can question dominant ideologies, it also transgresses overly rigid academic boundaries. Biographies, in their nature, appear to evoke an interdisciplinarity spirit, partly because lives transcend academy” (Merrill & West 2009: 54)

According to my epistemological perspectives, auto/biographical work follows some general premises:

- “self-construction” as a systemic, conversational, and compositional process;
- multiple levels beyond the individual level of construction (the “agent”): relationships and contexts, where individual actions and meanings can be seen as effects of interactions;
- stories and meanings are not only subjective. They are developed in a context with its own possibilities and constraints. Different contexts create different narrations.

The term auto/biography, with the slash, seems to fit these ideas. It was coined to draw attention to the complex interrelations of the construction of one's own life and that of another person (Merrill & West, 2009). I take it in systemic and constructivist terms.

**B) RESEARCH OBJECT: LEARNING PROCESSES OF NON-TRADITIONAL STUDENTS AT UNIVERSITY.**

Connections between learning and identity, learning experiences and transformative processes are at the heart of my research questions.

First of all, I examined the premises in terms of “learning” underlying lifewide and lifelong learning policies using the epistemological lenses of systemics, constructivism and social constructionism. Lifelong learning is re-defined as a complex process, crossed at the same time by the dimensions of openness and closedness, stability and change, integration of the new and coherence-seeking. This ecology of ideas offers the possibility to describe learning in a different way from the most widespread metaphor of knowledge as a “tangible asset” to be collected and capitalized (Neave, 1992)

A metaphor, in fact, offers always a partial truth: from one side it enlightens possible versions and uses of the world; on the other side it conceals other possible ways of understanding, perceiving and acting (Lakoff, 1980). So if we consider knowledge or skills as objects we can collect them but we lost their roots in the relational contexts. On the contrary, if we consider them as relational processes new issues rise. Action and its features of unpredictability and irreversibility (Arendt, 1958) takes the scene, as well as the problem of recognition (Ricouer, 1994).

This idea of partial truth is also a cornerstone in complexity theories (Morin, 1995).

The double description (Bateson, 1979) revealed useful to create a more complex map of the research object. As a consequence it becomes possible to go beyond the form of intentionality that Bateson calls conscious purpose. This, taken as a guide of the learning
processes, would lead to a merely instrumental and functionalist form of one of the most complex and mysterious characteristics of the human life.

4. THE RESEARCH DESIGN: AUTO/BIOGRAPHICAL WORKSHOPS AND CO-OPERATIVE INQUIRY

I articulated the research on two different contexts which produced different kind of processes and results: the auto/biographical workshops and a co-operative inquiry.

A. AUTO/BIOGRAPHICAL WORKSHOPS: FROM LABELS TO STORIES. A GRUNDTVIG LLP PROJECT.

Many of the research studies on “non traditional students” use the biographical or autobiographical methods thanks to their attitude to grasp the participants point of view. Usually the students’ experiences are collected through one or more narrative interviews.

I considered useful and interesting to choose the autobiographical methods, exactly because of their potentiality to give voice to the insiders and to highlight a whole world of meanings. At the same time I wanted to emphasize the pedagogical, relational and participatory dimension of these methods and therefore I chose the form of the autobiographical workshop. With this kind of methodology the research project had a double value: while the workshop represented a chance for reflection and potential learning for the participants (and for the conductors, who are themselves non-traditional students), its outcome – in terms of stories – represented a corpus of data suitable for analysis and interpretations.

The Grundtvig LLP project “European Biographies - Biographical approaches in Adult Education” which started in July 2009 and ended in July 2011 represented the methodological frame within which I planned and structured the autobiographical work (Dominicè, 2000; West et al., 2007) with “non-traditional students”.

The general aim of the project was “to enrich and improve methods of biographical work with adults, and to make biographical approaches better known in European adult education institutions, as a powerful integrative and experience-based pedagogical tools for reaching and integrating socially marginalized persons into society” (quoted from the brochure). Each partner institution¹ (from Austria, Germany, Italy, Poland, and Turkey) realized pilot projects introducing new biographical approaches into their work. The results were gathered in a common handbook and cd in English.

As a partner of the project, under the direction of prof. Laura Formenti, the Bicocca University team chose to address non traditional students, who are defined in literature as under-represented, and whose participation in higher education is constrained by structural factors.

¹ The partner institutions were:
- Università degli studi di Milano Bicocca
- Ile- Berlin Institute for Lifelong Learning in Europe
- Ibika Institute for Biographical and Cultural Research (Goettingen, Germany)
- University of Innsbruck
- eFKa Women's Foundation (Poland)
- Kusadasi Public Education Center (Turkey)
The basic idea was to gather learning stories from students who appear not to fit the usual institutional expectations, for example adult students who decided to re-enter higher education after (or during) a work period, or students who had changed faculties.

Aware of the danger of reducing people to the status of deficit in relation to the university, the attention was focused on resources, coping strategies, retention. Retention is not well defined and focused in current studies (Longden, 2002); recent work in the UK (Yorke & Longden, 2008) appears to favour a greater emphasis on student “success” which is all together a wider and more positive focus and avoids unduly pointing up student academic and cultural deficits.

Biographical methods revealed useful to interrogate these aspects, in fact:

- Biographies may cast a light on “resilience factors”, by focusing the experience of those students who are non-traditional, and nonetheless do not abandon; they could tell what they experienced and how they managed to take the challenge of being “invisible” for the university;

- Biographic narration is a way to offer space for students to become more active; students at risk can better understand their experience by telling it, becoming reflexive and active in relation to it, finding new strategies for adaptation or for claiming space. And maybe they can avoid drop out, but we must also say that drop out is not necessarily a “problem” in the biographic view (Quinn et al., 2005).

Auto/biographical workshops were designed and managed by a team of “researchers/students”, who were invited to experiment with auto/biographical methods through personal exploration, to reflect on their implications, specifically in terms of ethics. The workshops, articulated in three meetings, three hours each promoted writing and sharing, in small groups, personal narrations that were meant to:

- give voice to individual learning stories within the university;
- highlight differences and connections between the participants' experiences;
- develop meaning and understanding through dialogue;
- foster reflexive processes, and possibly deliberate actions.

Each workshop was designed in a different way but each followed the same process framework: the “spiral of knowledge”, where four phases are cyclically re-activated (Formenti, 2009):

- embodied experience (or memory of it);
- aesthetic representation (by objects, autobiographical writing, telling, reading aloud etc.);
- intelligent understanding (reflection, discussion, self positioning with others);
- deliberate action (consequences and new project, the start of a new cycle).

The workshop narrative proposals aim to create “cognitive displacements” in order to favour sensemaking processes:
“Explicit efforts at sensemaking tend to occur when the current state of the world is perceived to be different from the expected state of the world, or when there is no obvious way to engage the world” (Weick et al. 2005: 409)

Overall 50 students participated in the workshops. Their texts were shared and, with the author’s consent, published online in a website (https://sites.google.com/site/storiedellabicocca), specifically created to make them visible to other students and members of the institution.

B. CO-OPERATIVE INQUIRY. A REFLEXIVE STANCE ON THE WHOLE RESEARCH PROCESS.

After the narrative workshops I started to analyse the students' narratives and I felt the lack of an intersubjective reflection over them. So I decided to engage some participants in order to reflect together upon the experience at university, its representations, the theories developed by the participants and the consequences on education, generating a shared and participatory hermeneutic circle. I based this phase on the co-operative inquiry paradigm:

“Co-operative inquiry involves two or more people researching a topic through their own experience of it, using a series of cycles in which they move between this experience and reflecting together on it” (Heron, 1996: 1)

The co-operative inquiry is based on key features (Heron & Reason, 1997, 2008):

- research is conducted with people rather than on people. All the subjects are fully involved as co-researchers in all research decisions both on content (what we research) and method (the ways we use to explore it);

- There is intentional interplay between reflection and making sense on the one hand, and experience and action on the other;

- the co-researchers engage themselves in the actions they have agreed and observe and record the process and outcomes of their own and each other’s action and experience;

- the full range of human capacities and sensibilities is available as an instrument of inquiry.

The group of co-researchers decided to explore learning identity and university environment (with its possibilities and constraints) drawing on personal life experience as well as on the experience developed through their participation to the project “Storie della Bicocca”. In each meeting a topic was decided and interrogated through questions able to trigger self-reflexive writings.

The following are some of the questions that drove the exploration.

- When had I the feeling that university was eager to meet me?
- When did I feel that university was a place useful for me?
• When did the university allow me to dream?
• When did I transform the university from an “unplace” to my own place (did this happened at all)? How and what did I feel/see (or I didn't see/feel) before and after this transformation?
• When did I feel recognized as an adult, with my own and proper learning interests?

The co-operative inquiry produced as a result a new project based on participant's experiences and reflections. The project aims to create workshops where students may explore and reflect upon their learning project, developing connections between their life and university experience. The project could become part a of the university strategies to foster retention: “pedagogic strategies that draw on relevant experiences, and relate them to academic knowledge, are likely to enhance integration and promote completion” (Field, Merrill & West 2011: 9)

5. CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK TO ANALYZE STORIES ABOUT STUDENTS AND UNIVERSITY IN RELATION.

“Some theoretical perspective underpin all research, as theory and method are intertwined and inter-related: we cannot make sense of the world without having ideas of how the world works or of what it is to be human. We cannot interpret the detail generated in our research without having some framework to piece together, however provisionally, the fragments of stories to enable them to find a place in the world.” (Merrill & West 2009: 57)

During the analysis of data I chose to employ a small number of sensitising concepts which are intended to offer “a generale sense of reference and guidance” (Field, Merrill & West 2012)

I decided to structure my sensitising concepts in couples, considering them as two polarities of a continuum. The two terms are considered complementary, not opposites (Keeney, 1983). The idea was to create “open concepts” (Morin 1980): concepts able to connect ideas and open semantic spaces, not intended to define discrete qualities.

In the analysis I decided to enlighten two dimensions:

• **A: The self descriptions, the descriptions of experiences at university and of learning processes.** These dimensions are mapped through the following couples of concepts:
  1. Structure/agency;
  2. Real/imagined social capital;

• **B: Descriptions of the university.** This dimension is mapped through the following couple of concepts:
  - political/symbolical space.
A. THE SELF DESCRIPTIONS, THE DESCRIPTIONS OF EXPERIENCES AT UNIVERSITY AND OF LEARNING PROCESSES.

1. Structure/agency.

Structure and agency are mutual influencing factors. Individual agency is shaped by the constraints of structural factors the individual experiences (family culture, class, gender etc). The agent experiences these constraints in a subjective way, developing meanings and ways to act them out in different ways.

This couple of concepts stress the importance of students' background (cultural, economic, social capital) as well as how they can dynamically exploit the human and symbolic capital of the university.

Bourdieu’s notion of “habitus” is a way of exploring the social and cultural worlds of non-traditional students. Habitus is the “great deal of everyday life is conducted on the basis of shared values, norms and routines that are largely taken for granted” (Bourdieu, 1984: 169-73); it depends on people's social, cultural and economic backgrounds.

A perspective based on this idea is able to show how the assumption of the institution and the students interact and generate a plurality of results. For example, if the student and institution assumptions are “similar” (that means similarity in expectations, language, visions of the world), probably they will not generate misunderstandings or clash of different frames; the student career will probably meet the institutions previsions (fish in the water). On the other hand, when the student habitus is “unorthodox” (fish out of water), it's possible to find obstacles in the learning career and the risk of dropping out raises.

“In the case of university students from non-traditional backgrounds, there is likely to be a mis-match between the student's cultural capital and the taken for granted cultural capital of the dominant group within the university. Our expectations was that this mis-match and the way is handled by the actors concerned, would be an important factor in explaining retention” (Field, Merrill & West, 2011: 5)

Examples:

Daniela, mature student, is forced to re-enter in higher education by structural factors concerning her workplace:

And for the second time we get to our expiry date. Like mozzarella itself, we are not desirable anymore. New call for tenders with a little surprise: the coordinator must have a degree in educational sciences. The fever to level the diploma of the school for educators and the degree explodes. Will that be enough? Not any answer from whom in charge. You can't always risk, therefore I'll enroll at the Bicocca university and will graduate by the end of the next mandate and then we'll see if you are still able to make me feel like shit.

Daniela, during the university experience, become aware of the possibility to transform the constraint into a new desire:
It’s unbelievable, that’s what I needed to justify a desire. It was necessary that it was a duty, history repeats itself, if it’s only for pleasure it has no validity.

Because it is not valid to say “I like too much studying, I want to enroll at the university because I would be happy”. Not after wasting mommy and dad’s money some more than 10 years ago, when I left literature, not after failing.

When you have these burdens to reckon with, you forget when in your youth you spent hours and hours on books without even realize that it was dinner time. But the pleasure of learning resists any cancellation, it just makes itself comfortable, finds a corner and waits.

Luca, mature student, tells the way in which the choice to enrol at university allows him to become an agent:

I risked to spend a life without direction.
Enrolling at university was a turn in my life, it made me happier and this is the fundamental thing.

[…] The reasons are connected to a change in myself and in the world surrounding me. I don’t know what the future will bring but until now this choice means self-esteem.

I feel more relaxed and I’m happy because I overcame a big obstacle. The wall was starting the learning path, the obstacle was beginning to taste life again. The journey started with a lot of difficulties but the first exam had an unforgettable taste: the taste of victory!

2. Real /Imagined social capital

Social capital is a multidisciplinary concept that represents all the benefits coming from social connections. Social capital and lifelong learning are intertwined with one another: there is, in general, a mutual beneficial relationship between these two concepts, but it is not a simple one, depending, in fact, on a range of other elements (Field, 2008). For example, when the network producing social capital is based on very close and strong links (bonding social capital), the space for reflexive learning seems to decrease. In general, social connections help to generate trust between people, and thereby foster the exchange of information and ideas. However “the interplay between networks and learning is not simply part of the process by which skills and techniques are shared, and information is passed around. It is also an active part of the process of making sense of the world, by talking about feelings in complex and apparently contradictory ways” (Field, 2005: 128)

Quinn (2010) adds further reflections to the debate. She gives to the notion of social capital a new dimension: the networks that give benefits are not only “social”, but also symbolic and imagined.

“Symbolic networks may be the networks of those we know who are given a symbolic function, imagined networks may be with those we don’t know personally, or who may not even exist, but with whom we can imagine desired connections. These networks provide resources of power and resistance and appear to be more useful for survival than formalized support networks are.” (Quinn 2010: 23)

Structural factors remain important, but there is here another level of interest: how are these factors played in everyday negotiations? Which are the creative solutions found to face them?
“(…) universities facilitate the production of imagined social capital by opening up the strange and the unfamiliar to be reframed and reused by students in new symbolic networks. Is this ‘making strange’, then, the distinctive role of the university within lifelong learning?” (Quinn, 2005: 15)

Examples:

Daniela, mature students, stresses the desire to make real connections between university and workplace:

“Today I’m even more convinced that my experience shapes me as a person in the first place and then as a professional, because it is made of encounters and experiences. I don’t know whether I’m learning to do a certain job, I don’t even know how I will be living a year from now. What I do know is that I’m dedicating my mind and heart in a very personal way where deadlines are in the background, creating space for new ideas and challenges. I don’t know whether I’ll manage to graduate or not but I’ll take the many things that I have learned in my workplace.”

Anna’s narration about her motives to be a student starts from a sense of emptiness associated with inadequacy.

“I felt empty inside… like something left over… in the meantime the years passed, the children grew up, and this empty space got bigger and bigger; and it produced a sense of inadequacy. I wanted to escape from home and doing something different…”

She was inspired by a very special imagined social capital.

“I also needed money, so I accepted any occasion to work… saleswoman, clerk, attendant in a hospital: psychiatric department. The contact with craziness pushed me to begin a new vocational process, searching for “the human world”. I wanted to know why we move in a certain direction. Do we make our own decisions? I was 45!!! I didn’t know, and actually I don’t know by now, where the road is leading but I enjoy it. I left my job at the hospital, stopped cleaning bedpans and vomit, but I miss those foolish men and women. Because I found the courage to start over thanks to them. I took my life in my hands and I gave it a new direction, with new colours and a lot of poetry.”

Anna uses her imagined social capital when she is asked to find meaning for her choice of study at the university. The metaphors she uses express the way she embodies this meaning, in a very deep way.

“I had a reverent fear of university, like something beautiful but I was unfit for, and then I was infected by craziness!”

“Foolish idea… my idea”

Recognition become a fundamental issue when we start to consider skills and learning as relational processes. Learning identities in transformation implies the dimension of self and mutual recognition. This double aspect of recognition is enlightened in the studies of Paul Ricoeur:

“To put it briefly, the dynamic that guides my investigation consists in a reversal, on the very level of the grammar, of the verb to recognize from its use in the active voice to its use in the passive voice: I actively recognize things, persons, myself; I ask, even demand, to be recognized by others” (Ricoeur, 1994: x)

The necessity of being recognized by others in our identity can produce a series of different effects. For example Honneth (1995) is interested in the struggle for recognition, Ricoeur in the possibility of gratitude:

“It is not my genuine identity that demands to be recognized? And if, happily, this happens does not my gratitude go to those who in one way or another have, in recognizing me, recognized my identity?” (Ricoeur, 1994: xi)

Examples:

Carla is a mature student that left an employment in a bank to study educational sciences. The roots of this turning point are located in the maternity experience:

Becoming parent was the most fascinating and at the same time hard event in my life. I needed help and it was not easy to find someone really helpful, only experts with “receipts” that didn’t fit with my needs.
I would like to transform grief in a creative act

Carla tells us how unexpected was this her new learner identity in a dialogue with herself (the Actual Carla is “talking” with the Past Carla in one activity of the autobiographical workshops)

ActualCarla: I would like to say that you enrolled at university! You can’t believe it right? But you asked and obtained a time off work, you took a first level degree and now you’re studying for the second level degree!
PastCarla: Are you sure???
ActualCarla: Yes, and now you don’t work anymore at the bank! You left that job for good two years ago
PastCarla: Beautiful! And all these things happened in eight years? I can’t believe that!
ActualCarla: Yes, everything is true!
PastCarla: I’m very happy of this new version of me!

Annamaria, mature student, tells her satisfaction for the feedbacks coming from her family and friends:

“What a satisfaction in taking a glance at the library and see all those books! All the things I learned. They changed me. I’m no more the same person of two years ago. My husband too says that I’m a different person: I’m more reflexive and more critical (sometimes too much!).

57
Even my friends, my relatives, everybody says that now I'm a better Anna and this fact is a joy for me.

Luca, mature student, tells his discomfort in receiving a social feedback inconsistent with his own learner identity:

I was at work talking with clients on my beautiful holiday in the United States when Gaia, one of my colleagues, asked me: “So, Luca, now you are a music-therapist. What are you going to do in the future?”.

No hesitation in my answer: “I’m going to the university”.
Imagine my colleague look and her reaction: “What?!? But you are old!!! Are you going to live forever with your parents???”

B: DESCRIPTIONS OF THE UNIVERSITY.

- political/symbolical space.

In defining a “political space” I assumed the perspective offered by Hannah Arendt.

According to Arendt (1958) the two central features of action are freedom and plurality. By freedom she means the capacity to begin, to start something new, to do the unexpected, with which all human beings are endowed by virtue of being born. Without the presence and acknowledgement of others, action would cease to be a meaningful activity. Action, to the extent that it requires appearing in public, making oneself known through words and deeds can only exist in a context defined by plurality.

Plurality is a condition granted by a “space of appearance”:

“where I appear to others as others appear to me, where men exist not merely like other living or inanimate things, but to make their appearance explicitly” (Arendt, 1958: 198)

Such public space of appearance can be always recreated anew wherever individuals gather together politically. However, since it is a creation of action, this space of appearance is highly fragile and exists only when actualized through the performance of deeds or utterance of words.

Many narratives represented university as a “symbolic space”, a protective place, a shelter form the “real world”. In this separated place it becomes possible to dream and imagine a different identity and a different future. This focus reminded me the studies of Gaston Bachelard and, in particular, his idea of house:

“I should say: the house shelters day-dreaming, the house protects the dreamer, the house allows one to dream in peace.” (Bachelard, 1957: 44)

Examples.

Veronica, mature student, is looking for an acknowledgement of her skills. This desire seems takes an accomplishment only through the contact with the university:
Year after year I remained Veronica, counselor, but without a degree. This is an important point in my personal and professional life. I felt not up to others. Before going to the university I couldn't see my skills, even if other people acknowledged them.

Rosanna, mature student, describe university as a “mental space” useful to trigger imagination:

Coming back to university meant maintaining a “mental space”. A space for rêverie, for imagination. A space that give meaning to everyday life. It's about maintaining a clear view on the world, on thoughts coming from other human beings. In order not to become old in the soul.

6. CONCLUSIONS

I structured the research results on a plurality of dimensions able, in my view, to enlighten the experience of lifelong learning in the university context in a complex way. These processes go beyond a mere instrumental view: the students are constantly dealing with structural factors, relations, identity issues and imagination. University itself is often represented as a place endowed with a plurality of meanings and expectations. These aspects could be useful to consider in institutional strategies to foster retention.

Biographicity has been defined as the process through which we “...redesign again and again, from scratch, the contours of our life within the specific context in which we (have to) spend it, and that we experience these as 'shapeable' and 'designeable' (Alheit & Dausien, 2007: 66). I think that this concept could represent a bridge between all the dimensions mentioned. A constraint can become a possibility along autobiographical processes and vice versa personal choices could become constraints over time. In this sense autobiographical work could represent a resource able to connect students with the possibility to contact and re-shape their learning story.

REFERENCES

Boulton, G., Lucas C (2008), What are universities for? Leuven: LERU
Field, J., Merrill, B. Morgan-Klein, N. (2010), Researching Higher Education Access, Retention and Drop-out through a European Biographical approach: exploring similarities and differences within a research team.


Longden B. (2002) Retention Rates- renewed interest but whose interest is being served *Research Papers in Education*, 17 (1). 3-29


Quinn, J. (2005) Belonging in a learning community: the re-imagined university and imagined social capital in *Studies in the Education of Adults*, 37 (1) 4-17


GRADUATING AT OLDER AGE - WHAT ARE THE EXPECTED, SURPRISING AND UNWANTED OUTCOMES?

Isopahkala-Bouret, Ulpukka
University of Helsinki
Finland

The purpose of my current research project 1 “Ageing and expertise - Narrative inquiry into the experiences of older adults who acquire master’s degrees in their fifties” (9/2011 – 8/2014) is to investigate in-depth why experienced professionals enrol in degree-oriented university programs in mid-life, and what kinds of benefits the new master’s degree brings to their remaining careers. There have been earlier studies on access, motives, study experiences, and outcomes of adult learning in the context of higher education. There have been also recent studies on ageing at work and on learning of older workers. However, most of these studies have not focused exclusively on ageing and the interface between education and working life as this study does (see however Davey 2002; Jamieson 2007).

Human capital theory, that informs current education policy, assumes that the primary motivation for individuals to attend higher education is the enhancement of their economic and social status (van der Merwe 2010). Individuals invest time, money and effort in their studies and acquire different types of ‘capital’ from it (cf. Swain and Hammond 2013; Jamieson et al. 2009; Schuller et al. 2002), including:

- human capital (knowledge and skills gained through education, a degree/qualification),
- social capital (resources gained through networks, connections, and close relationships with other members of society), and
- personal/identity capital (self-esteem, attitudes, aspirations, and dispositions affecting identity).

The concept of ‘capital’ can be useful when analysing the outcomes of higher education. However, it is debatable how far individuals make calculations about returns when they decide to attend higher education studies (Schuller et al. 2004). Moreover, the rhetoric of ‘capital’ does not translate directly into the everyday experiences of all graduates. All degrees do not bring the same returns and all graduates are not considered as having the same status in the labour market (Kivinen and Ahola 1999; Isopahkala-Bouret, in review). Social differences such as gender, ethnicity, social background and age further contribute to differences in perceived outcomes (Brennan et al. 2000).

Prior studies have shown that older students cite employment related reasons for studies less frequently than younger students (Jamieson 2007; Brennan et al. 2000). However, work-related reasons still dominate in higher education studies of those older students who simultaneously participate in working life (Davey 2002). Most older students who attend universities are employed, and most of those who are employed are senior or middle-ranking professionals or managers (e.g. Jamieson 2007; Davey 2002). Those who are 50-60 years olds have the highest incomes compared to younger mature students (Jamieson 2007; Brennan et al., 2000). Therefore, the most commonly reported employment-related benefit of

---

1 The project is funded by Academy of Finland.
higher education is not increased income, but an improvement in the current work situation or job satisfaction (Jamieson 2007).

Particularly those older students who are doing Master’s studies believe that a new degree will have a positive effect on their future career (Davey 2002). Master’s degree experiences are highly beneficial as a learning experience, as professional development, and as a leadership experience for students and graduates of all ages (Conrad et al. 1998). The purpose of this study is to provide an in-depth investigation of the kinds of outcomes a newly completed Master’s degree brings to experienced professionals. The specific target group of the study is graduates who completed their university studies in their fifties and who have not yet reached retirement age. The research questions are defined as follows:

- What are the expected outcomes of Master’s studies for older graduates?
- What are the surprising and unwanted outcomes?

Most prior studies have only focused on the benefits of higher education and have not reported the disadvantages, even if some studies have also enquired about negative consequences (Bennion et al. 2011). According to Creech et al. (2010) university studies produced some negative effects on the private life of students aged 50+, including having insufficient time for socializing and their family and friends not understanding why they had committed so much time to their studies. These negative impacts lasted as long as the studies lasted. However, even in Creech et al.’s study the focus was not on potential negative impacts following graduation.

THE EMPIRICAL STUDY

The study is based on 14 interviews with older graduates from two different research-oriented universities in Finland. The interviewees were recruited by using the student registers of the universities and by contacting the potential interviewees by email or post. Two of the interviewees were men and the remainder were women. This gender difference reflects the usual gender divide among older university graduates. The age range of the interviewees was 54 – 62 at the time of interviews, and they had graduated one to five years earlier. Nine interviewees had acquired a Master’s degree (M.Sc.) in Business and five had acquired a Master’s degree in social sciences (MSSc). Ten interviewees had first university degrees acquired in the 1970’s or early 1980’s and the remaining four had completed prior university degrees as adult graduates in the 21st century. All interviewees had been employed in professional or managerial positions in the public or private sector. At the time of interviews, one was self-employed, one was fully retired and one was in part-time retirement.

The interviews were conducted during the winter 2012/2013. The interviews included accounts of the participants’ prior educational and professional histories, of study motivation, and the outcomes experienced from having gained a Master’s degree in mid-life. The interviews lasted approximately 60 to 90 minutes. They took place at the university or the interviewee’s workplace, with the exception of one interview that was conducted by phone. All the interviews were tape-recorded and the research assistant wrote word-to-word transcripts based on these tape-recordings. The transcripts also included non-verbal expressions, such as pauses, repetition, laughter and sighs. The interviews were conducted in Finnish, and the quotations used in this article were translated in English.
At the beginning of the data analysis process, all the major outcomes that older graduates mentioned during the interviews were inductively coded. The analysis continued by classifying these outcomes according to the typology created by Swain & Hammond (2013).

- Professional outcomes = those that affect professional life by acquiring specific skills
- Economic outcomes = those that affect employment and finances
- Personal outcomes = those that affect a person’s identity and their personal life
- Social outcomes = those that affect wider networks, such as relationships and participation in various professional bodies

During the course of the interviews, the major outcomes of the Master’s degree were usually described by the interviewees telling personal stories about what happened after graduation. Those extended narratives signified how the interviewees interpreted study outcomes in relation to their age and expectations. Therefore, at the second phase of analysis, a unique way to analyse both the content and form of ‘outcome-narratives’ was developed. The purpose of such narrative analysis was to see how people in the flow of discourse imposed order on their experiences and made sense of important events (Riessman 2008). The narratives revealed great variety in the experiences of older graduates. Moreover, narrative analysis provided a way to think beyond the data, to examine how the accounts were culturally constructed and how they included cultural conventions and norms (Coffey and Atkinson 1996).

**THE FINDINGS**

All the interviewees talked about their study experiences in a very positive manner. It had been a ‘privilege’ and ‘pleasure’ to study in mid-life. Studying and learning itself had an intrinsic value to these graduates, despite any other outcomes of education, and studying in higher education was the fulfilment of a long-term ambition for many of them (cf., Jamieson 2007). This is in line with the idea that ‘education for its own sake’ is important for adult students; i.e. they prioritise the process of studying rather than outcomes and instrumental goal orientation (Reay 2003).

Moreover, older graduates reported the same types of outcome found in previous studies on the outcomes of studying part-time (Swain and Hammond, 2013; Jamieson et al. 2010; Brennan et al. 2000), Master’s studies (Conrad, Duren & Hawort 1998) and, particularly, studying at an older age (Creech et al., 2010; Jamieson 2007; Davey 2002). These included both economic and professional, and social and personal outcomes. In the following section, first the expected and obvious benefits of Master’s studies will be reported. These included new employment contracts, increased self-confidence, and higher social status. After that surprising and unexpected outcomes of graduation will be presented. The participants’ increased educational level in middle age was a way to challenge ageist stereotypes; however, it also intensified workplace tensions, inter-personal conflicts and competition for status and power.

**ECONOMIC AND PROFESSIONAL BENEFITS**

Half of the interviewees stated that important economic benefits resulted from their Master’s studies. Those who had experienced employment instability, and whose study motivation had
thus been to gain permanent employment or career progress, reported the highest economic gains. Their Master’s degree had allowed them to change job or gain new responsibilities or a permanent contract (instead of a temporary contract) for the position that they had already occupied. Additionally, two had changed jobs during their studies, and it seems probable that their approaching graduation helped them to get their new, managerial-level jobs.

I couldn’t ever have this place without that degree, I think. (...) It was a proof that - even if I’m at that age – I’m still able to accomplish such a big thing. And they (the employers) can assume that: ‘She knows IT skills relatively well and that kind of thing’. (Mary, 56)

One crucial reason why I got into this post was the fact that I had done a Master’s thesis and graduated with a Master’s degree. It showed the kind of (...), when you study and get a Master’s degree at an older age. It shows, you know, that kind of initiative and (a sigh) ability. So that’s why they selected me. (Paula, 61)

Those who did find a new job after graduation explicitly stated that graduation at the age of fifty carried a special significance. The new degree was a kind of a proof against ageist stereotypes, which assume that old people do not know information technology and are no longer proactive or creativity. Those who did not change jobs but, instead, were offered a permanent contract (i.e. all of those who became qualified social workers) also made age-related justifications. They noticed that with the right kind of degree they could have good employment even if they were over 50. They also stated that ‘at that age’ employment stability, and the financial security that it brings along, was even more important than it had been at a younger age:

(The new degree) gave me that feeling of security. That I can apply for official positions – even at this age. It’s important. I didn’t consider it that important when I was younger. I’ve been in permanent, official positions and in good work places (and I have left). When you are younger, you don’t have to think about it (whether you will find a new job or not). Now I realize that it’s very important for me, at this stage (of my life), to have a permanent job. (…) This new degree made that possible immediately (...). And my salary (laughs), my salary comes now regularly, and I don’t have to worry about it. Of course that brings me security. (Emma, 56)

Those who did not experience any direct economic benefits from their Master’s studies reported that the most important outcomes of studying were professional: updating professional knowledge, learning new theories, developing a new perspective on things, etc. A Master’s degree has been found to be a powerful professional experience for the majority of adult students, as they actively practice their profession through engaging in teaching and learning experiences on and off campus and connect theory with practice (Conrad et al. 1998). In this study, nearly all the participants wrote their Master’s thesis on a topic related to their own job or to their wider work context. Professional outcomes were mostly emphasized by people who had already had satisfying, permanent, graduate-level jobs before applying to the Master’s programme.

Before I started these studies, I had a kind of a feeling that I knew awfully much about an amazing number of things, that I was a very wide-ranging person. But my kind of exact specialty, in a way, was not that in-depth anymore. (…) I started to feel that I was now at too generic a level, you know; I didn’t know anything in-depth anymore, in a way. And therefore it
gave me that (motivation) to do the entire programme in (subject X). Now at least I know who has researched that subject and who have been the ‘gurus’ (laughs) throughout these years. (Pia, 62)

PERSONAL AND SOCIAL BENEFITS

Personal outcomes were, in most cases, described in relation to ‘professional identity’, i.e. how the person sees his or her role in work settings. Only one women mentioned personal benefits that were not at all related to her work or professional identity. She had studied languages as part of her business degree, and as a result had been able to meet new people, form an intimate relationship, and spend holidays abroad. For the other interviewees, the most widely mentioned personal benefit was increased confidence: the feeling of certainty while performing work duties (cf. Isopahkala-Bouret 2005). Such confidence was integral to their sense of professional identity.

(Has this graduation changed you as a person?) It is good (laughs) to know who you are, like, professionally. (...) It changes and shapes your identity. So that it is now something, part… part of me. It is a very different thing to say that ‘I’m a social worker and graduated from (this good) university’ than (to say): ‘Okay. I’m kind of doing this job, but I don’t have any qualifications.’ I’m certain now that I have those (qualifications) that are required, what the law requires. So I know that I’m qualified. It brings confidence to my way of working, to my competence. (Helen, 55)

Confidence is understood in popular literature as stemming from good self-esteem. It is commonly related to letting oneself be less fearful, spontaneous, and natural. A confident person feels powerful and comfortable. However, in this study confidence was not understood in individualistic terms, but as a context-related and social phenomenon (Isopahkala-Bouret 2005). Professional confidence results from social recognition. People need constant acknowledgement and appreciation from others – colleagues, supervisors, customers, etc. – of the work they are doing. In this case, it was important that others recognized that the participants were experts and had the most legitimate and up-to-date knowledge (cf. Isopahkala-Bouret 2005). Such recognition brings social status and the potential to influence other people’s thinking and behaviour (Fiske 2010). So confidence is closely bound up with professional status.

The interviewees stated that the social outcomes of their Master’s studies were mostly restricted to professional status, i.e. to the respect accorded them by society and their working community (Fiske 2010). Having high-level educational credentials creates expectations that affect inter-personal relationships and convey social status (Fiske 2010). This rise in status is not the same thing as a formal promotion, and it does not necessarily lead to direct power over resources. In this study, it was more to do with informal relationships, professional networks and memberships of different boards and committees. It was a question of having the legitimacy to state an expert opinion and have expert authority. However, such status was not a natural outcome of a Master’s degree. Instead, there were on-going power negotiations between different actors on who had the right to express opinions and who had the right to say how things should be understood. Nevertheless, many interviewees stated that after graduation, they could better express and defend their opinions, and that others listened to them differently.
Well, nothing really (changed) in a way (after I graduated and got my degree).
Except that (p). I’ve noticed at least that (p).
The things that I’m saying now have more weight in this management board. (…)
I dare more to speak up, if I have something to say in our meetings.
Because, if I think backwards, when I didn’t have this degree,
I participated in these management meetings from time to time,
but I was a secretary then.
(…)
Now I’m a more equal member than before in that (management) group.
I also feel that I have more, more to give to this (p), this business of ours… (Anna, 54)

THE SURPRISING AND UNWANTED OUTCOMES

For those who had experienced career stagnation or who had been dissatisfied with their job for some other reason prior to their new degree, the plan was to change job after graduation. They wanted to gain a qualification which would open doors to interesting positions. However, surprisingly, not everybody wanted to realize that goal once they had received their degree. One mentioned that there had not been any positions interesting enough to apply for and that she would keep on looking. Two others said that their own organization had proposed such interesting challenges that they had stopped looking for alternatives from outside. A further two people said that they could not find the motivation to change work community one more time because they thought that their knowledge was most valuable in their current workplaces. Reasons for leaving or staying were related to the social recognition that these people had experienced before and after graduation as well as their age-expectations, i.e. what they felt was the right thing to do at their age.

As was shown in the previous section, one of the most common outcomes that people expected from graduating with a Master’s degree was an increase in professional recognition and status. Nevertheless, there were some interviewees who were surprised to discover that their colleagues did not always react positively to their educational achievements. Some participants were also shunned and rejected by their working communities, some experienced the direct or indirect envy of others and some said that their supervisor felt they had become a threat now that they held a similar (or higher) qualification.

You know, if there’s a subordinate who does some further studies and who already has a high-level of education and a lot of work experience, it’s not only a positive thing.
Instead it’s, in a way, a threat, as well.
(…)
Really, (graduation) didn’t bring that kind of (positive response…).
I can’t now really tell you details of these situations.
But (p), but it even arouses a little bit of envy. (…)
It’s not the kind of a thing that (people) really (celebrate) with open arms:
“It’s so lovely that you’re so competent!”
(…)
Human jealousy appears.
And for instance, maybe your supervisor isn’t even aware that you represent a small threat to him,
because you have more education than him. (Emma, 56)

Emma had had the full support of her supervisor and colleagues as long as she was studying. People were encouraging; lifelong learning was a positive thing. However, as soon as she graduated, attitudes changed. Emma’s boss did not recognize her new competencies; she saw no changes in her job responsibilities and no progress in her career. On the contrary, her boss felt at risk because Emma was now qualified to apply for a position similar to his. Colleagues (especially those who did not have the same level of qualifications) felt envious because Emma now had something more than they had.

Emma was not the only one who had experienced negative reactions from colleagues. Some colleagues had even tried to openly play down or ignore the new graduate’s academic knowledge. One woman in particular, who had a prior vocational diploma, and who acquired both her Bachelor’s and Master’s degree in mid-life, experienced rejection from her former colleagues. After graduation she moved away from her previous, practical duties and began working in close collaboration with her manager in such matters as quality assurance. Her former colleagues expressed more or less directly that she was not ‘one of us’ anymore because she had climbed the social hierarchy (cf. Moore 2003; Reay 2003). Most interpersonal tensions were not as directly related to class conflict; rather, they focused on competition over professional authority. One woman even had to leave her workplace after graduation because some colleagues openly criticised her Master’s thesis and thus questioned her newly acquired professional expertise.

The conflict situations that the older graduates described were conceptualized from their own subjective vantage point: they expected to achieve recognized status after graduation and enjoy the other benefits that a new degree is commonly thought to provide. However, these conflicts were not only about particular interpersonal tensions. They were also highly illustrative of the broader framework of conditions that generate frustrations among older graduates. The way that the work community reacted to the new status of these older employees as highly-qualified workers was revealing much about existing work hierarchies and the conflict between different occupational groups.

Graduating with a Master’s degree at the age of fifty intensified the positional competition for prestige and power (Brown et al. 2003). A new Master’s degree gave a relative advantage in comparison with those without a similar degree. These older graduates were already highly experienced, and now they also had advanced academic credentials. Consequently, they were potentially competing for positions higher up the hierarchy. People assigned to the upper levels of hierarchies enjoy improved status: they receive more respect, recognition and importance (Fiske 2010). The increased status of these older graduates went against the self-interest of those people whose status and power was diminished as a consequence. That is why older graduates faced social conflicts and were forced to re-negotiate their social potions and their relationships with former colleagues and upper management.
DISCUSSION

This study revealed the kinds of outcome a newly acquired Master’s degree produces for adults who graduate in their fifties. First, there were several benefits. A Master’s degree helped older graduates to obtain greater responsibility inside and outside their own organization. Furthermore, Master’s degree studies were a powerful professional experience in terms of updating professional knowledge, learning new theories and developing new perspectives. They also reported an increase in personal confidence and social status as a major outcome of their Master’s degree.

In a culture were university degrees, and especially Master’s degrees, are highly appreciated, like Finland’s, a degree is taken as proof of one’s expertise. It provides legitimacy for positions in social hierarchies at work and elsewhere. This high level qualification brings confidence because it is commonly accepted as a qualification that symbolizes all the attributes of good professionals (Baker 2011; Brown 2001). It is expected to bring a better position in relation to less-qualified colleagues and to open doors to better jobs in the labour market and a higher status inside organizational hierarchies (Brown, Hesketh & Williams 2003). Education defines how organizational status and resources are allocated to different groups of people (Baker 2011). Most importantly, those who are less qualified should not question the authority of those with a Master’s level qualification.

All the positive outcomes that the interviewees of this study reported seemed obvious; they were what one could expect to follow after graduation. However, these positive outcomes did not appear automatically and they were not realized to the same extent for everyone. It was surprising to learn more about the age-related dynamics of graduation. Those who were able to move to new responsibilities after the graduation said that having a recognized degree in one’s fifties helped to negotiate against age-stereotyping and increase ‘employability’ (Brown, Hesketh & Williams 2003). Master’s studies in mid-life may also protect individuals from being subject to unfavourable ageism in recruitment situations (cf. Imi 2010).

Finally, not all the outcomes were positive, as there were also some less obvious effects of graduation. As the new degree potentially increased the social and professional status of these older employees, they faced new kinds of conflicts at work. Competition at work moved one level higher, and the older graduates needed to negotiate their position and re-establish their relationships with upper management and former colleagues. However, it should be borne in mind that even if some people experienced some surprising and negative outcomes, they also experienced other very beneficial outcomes from their studies. Moreover, studying itself was experienced as a very satisfying and enjoyable activity.

Age is integral to the experiences of older graduates. The outcomes of a higher education degree are interpreted through normative age-constructions: what is necessary, expected and allowed for people at the age of 50+. Graduation did not impact on the employment and professional status of older graduates in the same way that it does for younger graduates, as many already had relatively high social status, good employment and well-established social relations prior to their graduation. Age was seen both as a marker of prestige and seniority and also a limiting factor in terms of the choices available (Isopahkala-Bouret 2013). A master’s degree did not provide the same opportunities and ‘returns’ for everybody. Age, understood as a social difference, brought its own complexity to the analysis of the outcomes of education.
REFERENCES


Isopahkala-Bouret, U. (2013). Exploring the meaning of age for professional women who acquire master’s degrees in their late forties and fifties, Educational Gerontology, 39, 5, s. 285-297.


LEARNING BY VOLUNTEER COMPUTING, THINKING AND GAMING: WHAT AND HOW ARE VOLUNTEERS LEARNING BY PARTICIPATING IN VIRTUAL CITIZEN SCIENCE?

Kloetzer, Laure
Geneva University
Switzerland

Schneider, Daniel
Geneva University
Switzerland

Jennett, Charlene
University College London
Great Britain

Iacovides, Ioanna
University College London
Great Britain

Eveleigh, Alexandra
University College London
Great Britain

Cox, Anna
University College London
Great Britain

Gold, Margaret
The Mobile Collective
Great Britain

ABSTRACT

Citizen Science (CS) refers to a form of research collaboration that engages volunteers without formal scientific training in contributing to empirical scientific projects. Virtual Citizen Science (VCS) projects engage participants in online tasks. VCS has demonstrated its usefulness for research, however little is known about its learning potential for volunteers. This paper reports on research exploring the learning outcomes and processes in VCS. In order to identify different kinds of learning, 32 exploratory interviews of volunteers were conducted in three different VCS projects. We found six main learning outcomes related to different participants’ activities in the project. Volunteers learn on four dimensions that are directly related to the scope of the VCS project: they learn at the task/game level, acquire pattern recognition skills, on-topic content knowledge, and improve their scientific literacy. Thanks to indirect opportunities of VCS projects, volunteers learn on two additional dimensions: off topic knowledge and skills, and personal development. Activities through which volunteers learn can be categorized in two levels: at a micro (task/game) level that is direct participation to the task, and at a macro level, i.e. use of project documentation, personal research on the Internet, and practicing specific roles in project communities. Both types are influenced by interactions with others in chat or forums. Most learning happens to
be informal, unstructured and social. Volunteers do not only learn from others by interacting with scientists and their peers, but also by working for others: they gain knowledge, new status and skills by acting as active participants, moderators, editors, translators, community managers, etc. in a project community. This research highlights these informal and social aspects in adult learning and science education and also stresses the importance for learning through the indirect opportunities provided by the project: the main one being the opportunity to participate and progress in a project community, according to one's tastes and skills.

"Much of what people know about science is learned informally"¹

Citizen science refers to a form of research collaboration that engages volunteers in contributing to empirical scientific projects. This participation can take several forms including: volunteer computing, volunteer sensing (data collection), volunteer thinking (data analysis and interpretation), participatory action research (Grey, 2009, Haklay, 2013).

The majority of citizen science projects that have emerged over the last decade are “virtual”, i.e. engage participants in online tasks. Most of these projects either ask participants to help perform tasks that computers cannot do or for which “many eyes” are needed. Some of the most successful projects operate on a massive scale and rely on tens of thousands of participants, e.g. the 18 projects of the Zooniverse coalition attract over 800,000 participants. Some Citizen Science projects have been remarkably successful in advancing scientific knowledge. As one metric of scientific success, Dickinson et al. (2010) estimate that over 1000 peer-reviewed publications and technical reports have been produced using data from just eight large-scale projects (quoted by Shirk et al., 2012). While the main goal of such projects is “helping science”, project initiators also aim to interest participants in their research and either implicitly or explicitly expect participants to learn something about the subject matter or research methods. However, so far little is known about what exactly people learn and how they learn in such projects. The aim of this research is to conduct a preliminary study of the different types of learning that occur within virtual citizen science projects.

1. VIRTUAL CITIZEN SCIENCE AS A LEARNING TOOL?

Public participation in scientific research has become increasingly popular, thanks to technological and social changes (Haklay, 2013). Virtual Citizen Science (VCS) – as opposed to “classic citizen science” – is a unique form of computer-mediated interaction, where members of the public collaborate with professional scientists to conduct scientific research (Reed et al. 2012). There are a wide variety of VCS projects, all with their own research questions and tasks. Volunteers participate because they are intrinsically motivated (Rotman et al., 2012) to contribute to a scientific project by an interest in the topic, e.g. astronomy², protein-folding³, brain-mapping⁴, theoretical physics⁵, volunteer computing⁶. It is commonly

Stardust@home. http://stardustathome.ssl.berkeley.edu/
³ Foldit. http://fold.it/portal/
⁴ Eyewire. https://eyewire.org/
⁵ Test4Theory. http://lhcatchome2.cern.ch/test4theory/
⁶ BOINC. http://boinc.berkeley.edu/
thought that VCS projects also result in participants learning through observation and engagement about the subject of research and experiencing the process of scientific investigation. This learning could occur both informally (intentional informal learning or incidental learning), and formally whenever scientists provide formal teaching to train volunteers. However, as of yet, only a handful of studies have investigated learning in VCS.

**LEARNING IN CITIZEN SCIENCE**

While the contribution of volunteers to scientific data collection and analysis has been well documented, there is still limited research on how participation in Citizen Science projects may affect learning: "The growth in citizen science programs over the past two decades suggests that we need to evaluate their effectiveness in meeting educational goals" (Crall et al., 2012). When available, results on learning focus on effects of participation on scientific literacy (Bonney et al., 2009; Cronje et al., 2011; Crall et al., 2012; Price & Lee, 2013) and on content-knowledge (Jordan et al., 2011). Some projects also advocate changes in everyday behaviour (Jordan et al., 2011). A lot of these studies (except Price & Lee’s study) deal with conservation projects, i.e. traditional citizen science as opposed to VCS.

A look at their results shows that the effects of participation on scientific literacy are difficult to assess: "In our study, participant knowledge of the nature of science and science-process skills did not change, despite explicit instruction" (Jordan et al., 2011). Trumbull et al. (2000) found no effect on scientific literacy with quantitative measures, however, qualitative analyses of 750 letters revealed that 80% showed evidence of some scientific inquiry among participants. Crall et al. (2012) also found no changes in science literacy or overall attitudes between tests administered just before and after a one-day training program, matching results from other studies. However, they found improvements in science literacy and knowledge using context-specific measures and in self-reported intentions to engage in pro-environmental activities. Cronje et al. (2011) also assessed the effect of invasive species monitoring training on the scientific literacy of citizen volunteers thanks to contextual multi-item instruments and they were able to demonstrate significant increases in the scientific literacy of citizen scientists. The authors conclude that "there remains little published evidence that citizen science experiences can improve the scientific literacy of participants", maybe due of the lack of specific evaluation tools, which would be able to detect the very specific learning at stake (p.136).

There is another promising focus for learning that relates to social involvement within VCS communities. Price and Lee (2013) report how volunteers’ attitudes towards science and epistemological beliefs about the nature of science changed after six months of participation in an astronomy VCS project called Citizen Sky. Analysis of pre- and post-test data of 333 volunteers who participated for at least six months in the project reveals a positive change in scientific attitudes. Correlating these data with the participation paths of the subjects in the project, the researchers conclude that improvement in scientific literacy is related to participation in the social components of the program but not to amount of contributed data.

Gains in content knowledge may be easier to detect (Brossard et al., 2005). Jordan et al. (2011) report 24% knowledge increase of invasive plants, but simultaneously state that participation was insufficient (too short) to increase understanding of how scientific research is conducted. Participants reported increased ability to recognize invasive plants and
increased awareness of invasive plants’ effects on the environment, but this translated little into behaviour regarding invasive plants.

**SUPPORTING LEARNING AND CREATIVITY IN THE CITIZEN CYBERLAB7 PROJECT**

The Citizen Cyberlab project (2012) aims to investigate learning and creativity in VCS, then implement the most effective design elements in future projects and evaluate their effectiveness. In this contribution we try to gain insights on what participants can learn and on how they learn within a set of contrasted VCS projects. We are interested in capturing all forms of learning, e.g., formal learning related to task achievement, informal learning about the research field, and incidental learning about various topics. The outcome of this qualitative exploratory research will be presented as initial typology of learning that can inspire both citizen science project design and further investigations.

**2. METHODOLOGY AND DATA COLLECTED**

Exploratory interviews on usage, motivation, learning, creativity and sociability in VCS projects were combined with online observations in projects and forums to understand what kind of learning processes, if any, were occurring. 32 semi-structured exploratory interviews with participants in different types of VCS projects (volunteer computing, volunteer thinking and volunteer gaming) were conducted from December, 2012 to June, 2013. Three main projects were selected on the basis of their diversity, as they provided different kinds of tasks associated with various levels of volunteers’ participation:

- volunteer computing activities, by analyzing volunteer involvement into the BOINC world of projects (http://boinc.berkeley.edu/), in which volunteers are asked to give free computing power for distributed calculations for scientific projects;
- volunteer thinking, by analyzing volunteer involvement into Old Weather (http://www.oldweather.org/), a transcription project from multiple partners including the The Met Office (the UK’s National Weather Service), the UK and US National Archives, and the National Maritime Museum in London, in which volunteers are asked to transcribe logbooks from Royal Navy and US ships from a hundred years ago in order to investigate climate change;
- volunteer gaming, by analyzing Eyewire (http://eyewire.org/), a scientific "game to map the brain", provided by the Department of Brain and Cognitive Sciences at MIT, in which volunteers are colouring puzzles to map the 3D structure and connections of neurons in the retina of mice.

This paper will present the results from the thematic analysis (Braun & Clarke, 2006) of our exploratory interviews. This work entailed the following steps: full transcription of the interviews, anonymization of the transcripts, analysis of the transcripts using iterative reading and coding categories, comparison of our analyses in a 2 day data analysis workshop, and finally presentation and discussion of the preliminary findings with the Citizen CyberLab partners in a 2 hour interactive workshop.

---

7 http://citizencyberlab.eu/
3. RESULTS

The results demonstrate the variety of learning outcomes and learning paths in VCS, as well as the prevalence of unexpected and incidental learning effects.

LEARNING HAPPENS IN VCS

Most participants report experiencing learning effects due to their participation in VCS projects. These learning effects were often surprising for the volunteers. Some participants consider learning as an interesting but unexpected by-product of their contribution to science. For instance, when asked "Was learning initially an objective for you in the project?", one participant answers: "A little bit, initially. I suppose I thought I might learn something, but I learned an awful lot more than I thought I would. I think my initial objective was, you know, this looks like something good to do, to help people find out about the climate, but then the more I got into it, the more I got into it [laughter]". The motivation patterns of volunteers are out of the scope of this paper and will be dealt with in further work. However, our study so far strongly confirms that interest (defined as personal curiosity for science or for some specific scientific and social topics and desire to support science) is a key reason for involvement in VCS projects.

Some participants do engage in VCS projects with the explicit desire to learn and discover new things: "Absolutely, learning is part of it. Every scientific project has a purpose and I like to find out what the purpose is." Here learning appears to be at first related to curiosity, the wish to explore new things and new scientific domains. Discovering the purpose of a project by taking part offers an interesting intellectual challenge. Novelty and "coolness" of the projects are important motivational drivers. This initial expectation for learning opportunities is also related to another driver of the motivation of participants: the wish to use their free time in a productive way and not to waste it. This expectation is true at the collective level (contributing to a scientific project, efficiently and directly helping scientists) and at a personal level (pursuing at the best level their personal interests, learning, being part of an interesting, nice and prestigious community).

Learning happens also beyond the scope of initial discovery. Another participant reports: "Absolutely, understanding it and then just being able to participate in it and then to learn from it, and just doing something I enjoy, made it even better". For this participant, learning happens as a result of “doing” and extends the enjoyment of participation. They enjoy learning in a fun way. This enjoyment effect is reported by many participants: "(as for me), I’ve learned lots and lots about different aspects of science or different sciences"; "(as for the society), I think people can really learn things in a fun way". Another participant says: "It’s an easier way to learn things than do a course. Maybe you have a small part of it, but you pick things up on the way. I think that’s also interesting for people to say well I tried the project and I didn’t know much about it but now I’m very interested and I’m learning more and more about it."

Lastly, some participants report observing learning outcomes for themselves although they didn’t consider learning as a primary goal. One participant says: "Um learning was not a priority for me. It happens but I don’t do it for that purpose." Another answers: "No it was not one of the reasons, I didn’t realise what the opportunities would be when I joined. But it is
something that has happened as a result of taking part". Another one reports: "It sure has become a learning experience. I think I just got into it a first because I'm fascinated with weather, it sounded kind of cool. Then I started playing around with it and I got hooked." This is particularly interesting for the study of informal learning, as it relates to unintentional learning in informal environments, a topic which requires additional naturalistic research.

So, learning happens, be it expected or not, as a product of participation in VCS projects. Is it possible to define more precisely what kind of learning happens in this context, and how? In our analyses, we identified six types of learning outcomes, which are related to different activities in which volunteers may engage online (see Fig 1):

With respect to "how they learn" we can distinguish between task related or "micro" learning (what participants learn when they engage in observing, classifying, solve puzzles, etc.) and off-task or "macro" learning, i.e. when participants engage in online forums, look up information on the Internet, study project documentation or augment the citizen science environment. Interacting with others can happen in both contexts and seems to boost learning. The distinction between micro and macro levels of involvement has been made in gaming research, where the term "macro-involvement" refers to player's general motivations for engaging with games" and the term "micro-involvement" refers to "the moment by moment instance of game play" (Calleja, 2007). Iacovides (2012) presents the Gaming Involvement and Informal Learning model, that distinguishes between how and what people learn through micro and macro level gaming. This conceptual distinction also exists within the
game design community, in which the term "metagaming" refers to an important set of player's creative and collective activities in the game universe, outside of the game itself (Elias et al., 2012).

In the context of VCS, learning at the micro level mostly refers to learning the interface, e.g. participants will be able to solve increasingly difficult tasks. In addition they also develop pattern recognition capacities, i.e. become experts in "seeing" a structure in Eyewire. Learning at the macro level leads to all sort of learning that we can roughly divide into four kinds: learning about the respective science domain, about how research is conducted (the scientific process), and more surprisingly, various sorts of off-topic learning as well as in terms of personal development. We shall illustrate and discuss these categories in more detail below.

SIX TYPES OF LEARNING OUTCOMES

(1) Task-Game mechanics

Our observations on the online forums and analyses of interviews suggest that participants firstly learn task/game mechanics, including the commands of the interface, the rules and concepts of the game.

For example, in the Eyewire project, people discover step by step the terms, concepts and rules of the game. Thanks to the videos presenting the project, online tutorials and training sequences, they learn the interface, the buttons to click and commands to activate to perform the task, rotate the 3D view, colour and unicolor the 2D view, erase if sections have been coloured by mistake, etc. (see Fig 2 for a summary of Eyewire's basic commands).

They also learn about the rules of the game, especially the credit system (how points are calculated), how this credit system relates to their performance, how they can use these results as a feedback tool, to improve themselves.

They also learn specific concepts instantiated in the game. For example, they learn what "cubes" or what "trailblazing" means, a term used in Eyewire to refer to the first player exploring a new cube.

By requesting help in trying to solve technical problems, participants may be actively in touch for the first time with the players' community behind. Learning at the project mechanics level distinguishes between newcomers and experienced players. The Frequently Asked Questions are typically answering uncertainties occurring at this level and disappearing with simple gaming experience. Learning can be observed at this level by the transformation of novices, who ask frequently asked questions, to more expert players, able to answer these questions.
Figure 2: help summary for 3D and 2D controls in Eyewire

(2) Pattern Recognition

A subset of Citizen Science projects ask volunteers to analyse data, like pictures, soundtracks or texts, in order to classify them by identifying recurring patterns defined by the research team. In these kinds of projects, participants develop step-by-step pattern recognition skills. By looking repeatedly at the same kind of data, with clear analysis instructions, volunteers get a sense of what is meaningful in these data, normal/abnormal, and develop tacit expectations. As a participant states in her interview: "Now I can see". A participant in the Old Weather project explained that "transcribing, you get a feeling of what is possible": one develops expectations on how the weather could reasonably evolve in a given part of the world based on previous occurrences and temporal successions in logbooks. These expectations help the volunteers to get the meaning of difficult words, written with difficult-to-read handwriting or very pale ink. "Guessing" correctly is part of the transcribing process in that case, and knowledge of specific terms as well as expectations on what should normally follow help do the job confidently.

The similarity of this learning by repeated exposure to data and progressive building of pattern recognition skills, with some recommendations of experienced researchers to younger colleagues to "look" carefully and repeatedly at their data, may come to mind. In these cases, the very mechanisms of the project, which require volunteers to look repeatedly at similar data, put them in the position of developing these pattern recognition skills usually found in experts (Larkin et al., 1980). But they are limited to specific kinds of data - such as retina slices prepared with a specific method (Eyewire), or weather reports (Old Weather).

(3) On topic learning

On topic learning refers to content knowledge related to the scientific topic of the VCS project. Provided that the project mechanics integrate real scientific methods and concepts, participants may learn these by simply playing the game or performing the task - i.e., at the
micro level. However, this topical learning mostly happens at the macro level, through an additional involvement of the participant beyond the task or game itself. In particular, participants search for various topics on the Internet. Internet search may be driven by problems arising at the task/play level, but it is most generally found when volunteers engage in side-activities in the project community, which complement the task/game itself: for example controlling data quality, discussing with others in forums, updating community forums, or translating project news.

Searching the Internet to solve the problems one encounters when performing the task is a common pattern of volunteers’ activities. Internet searching is initiated either by curiosity based for example on keywords or names learnt doing the task, or by problem-solving. A participant in Eyewire reports having researched the Internet to find typical forms of Ganglion or Starbust Amacrine cells, in order to make better decisions when confronted to difficult choices in the game. He was actively looking for pictures in order to increase his recognition skills and take informed decisions in the game. In this additional Internet search process, participants learn a lot about topics which are directly related to the scientific focus of the project. For example, in Old Weather participants learn about geography of old times or specific historical events. A participant says for example: "now I’m doing a ship that has just, as of last night, has finished blockading Cuba. Eventually it’s supposed to go back up towards the North Pole. Sometimes you look at these things and say, 'What the heck is going on?' and then you start googling 'What was going on in Havana in 1888', why am I here? [laughter]".

Participants in Old Weather explained how they search on the Internet to find the correct spelling of old places: "When I’m transcribing, I often do try to look up the geographical type things to make sure I have them spelt correctly, but editing process is much more detailed because you want to make sure you’ve got it absolutely right. A lot of the geographical names have changed completely, from the first World War ‘til now, obviously some of the countries have changed their names and that sort of thing but we’re trying to pin down exactly what it is and get the first names right both in terms of what they were at the time and how they are now. So I’ve learned an awful lot about geography that I didn’t know before". Learning here appears to be driven by difficulty (the difficulty of spelling names correctly) and the wish to "get it absolutely right". Therefore, engagement in a community, in which the output of one’s work will be used, is a major motivation for learning: volunteers want to do things right, not only for themselves, but also because their work is a valuable scientific contribution to a community of peers.

Some volunteers may have specific roles in the project, or in the participants' community. In the Boinc world, communities of volunteers have been built on the initiative of Citizen Scientists, on a local, usually linguistic, basis. Describing the social dynamics in these communities is out of the scope of this paper. However, these organizations offer specific roles and responsibilities to distinguished members: administrators take the responsibility of running the community at a technical level and taking fundamental decisions; moderators take the responsibility to moderate, clean and tidy the forums, as well as to initiate discussions and support newcomers; some volunteers update specific sections or projects, going on the Internet to find the latest information and translating them into their mother language to share them with the community; others read, summarize or translate research reports, news and papers. So doing, they may learn about protein folding, malaria or physics respectively in the Rosetta@home, FightMalaria@home and LHC@home projects. *Being in
charge" therefore appears to be a nice way to increase learning, as one performs additional work for the benefits of the whole community.

Content knowledge resulted not just from participating at the micro level (contributing to the task, playing the game), but from how the task motivated the participants to find out more about different related topics through interacting with others and consulting external resources such as the Internet or books. The project provides not only a context and the motivation (solving the task) to do so, but also basic "tools" like keywords, concepts or references, which serve as entry doors into the topic. One participant observes: "you can tell they read the book because of their involvement in the project and not the other way around". Experience at the micro-level may provide the incentives for actively seeking more structured knowledge beyond the requirements of the project.

(4) Scientific literacy

Participants often describe potential learning through Citizen Science projects, especially at the collective, social level, in terms of increasing their scientific literacy. This scientific literacy is first linked to a general scientific culture: it is about better understanding what science does and how scientists work, which research questions they formulate nowadays and how they try to answer them. Talking about his experience in volunteer computing, one participant says: "If the researchers give feedback to the volunteers on what they do, try to explain what they do, I think all this can improve the global scientific culture. Show citizens that science is useful. When they watch TV, they constantly hear about scientific catastrophes. These projects enable us to go beyond this vision of catastrophe science." This participant adds: "It transforms the short term vision. Experimenting Citizen Science projects, people understand that science takes more time and may have different goals. Science is not only a financial statement at the end of the semester or year. There is a long term vision." Direct experience of scientific data and analyses may enable a large number of people to transform their views on science to incorporate some of its specific realities:

- Science takes time e.g: "That's really something I've learned, not that I thought it was instantaneous, but that science can take really a long time".
- Failures are considered normal risks and contribute to exploration. Participants understand this through long-term participation, when they read research news and see how the project is involving to meet its goals.
- Science involves the use of rigorous procedures and controlled protocols. Awareness of these methodological requests appeared in a group of forum participants in Eyewire, following the suggestion to add comparison tools, which would enable them, in delicate cases, to compare their choices to those of other players, in order to ensure better quality of their responses. The research team did not want to implement such tools, arguing that they needed independent results. These discussions initiate the players to important scientific concepts, like data quality control or independent measures. The process of science may be further illustrated to volunteers when they become associated with scientific publications (or when researchers report about the process of writing their scientific publications). They discover for example the process of peer-review and revisions, and realize how long it takes to bring a paper to publication.
Participants also report that VCS projects offer opportunities for them to extend their scientific knowledge, as we will be discuss in the section on personal development below: "Scientifically, it helped me discover new aspects of science, especially with space or medicine projects." These effects can be appreciated for example, by the accessibility of popular scientific publications to volunteers: "I truly opened myself a lot. Today when I come to read a scientific magazine, it is very nice to understand all the text without having to check half of the words !".

(5) Off topic knowledge and skills

Off topic learning refers to content knowledge or procedural skills exceeding the scope of the VCS project in several ways. Participants may develop knowledge and skills, which are not related to the topic under study, but still related to the indirect requests of the task or to the opportunities offered by the project.

Off topic skills reported in this research include:

- specific skills, tightly linked to the characteristics of the VCS project. In Old Weather, participants improve their handwriting reading skills due to the need to transcribe old maritime logbooks: "And as time goes on, I ended up enjoying the ones with challenging handwriting. You get an eye for the pattern of squiggles. I couldn't have started with difficult ones, but I can do them now, and I enjoy them most." In volunteer computing, volunteers may improve their understanding of GPUs and Virtual Machines.
- general skills, reported in all three analysed projects. The two main skills mentioned in our research are related to (a) communication skills and (b) computer and web literacy.

This section will focus on these general skills as they may be partly transferable. For example, one of the participants in the volunteer computing projects is considering changing job, from postman to HTML developer, thanks to all the practical things he has been learning animating his volunteer computing community for years: "Step by step I learned how to post links and the whole HTML language, which I know quite well now, without taking courses. The other members helped me a lot. We help each other, sometimes we discover things together. We created a sandbox to practice, where we have been trying to design tabs. We have been learning the writing codes all together."

(5a) Improving one’s communication skills

Communication skills here refer to:

- learning English for participants who are not native English speakers: progress in English is linked to the fact that almost all projects online are designed in English. For non-English speakers, this is an important barrier, which prevents them from participating to the project. However, for some participants who speak English well enough to be able to participate, the project provides opportunities for improvement both through reading English documents and through interactions with the project community. Moreover, language barriers of their peers may even provide incentives for translating critical pieces of documentation on the project, tutorials, questions, or
news. One participant explains that he got better thanks to this translation activity: "Being able to help translating texts enables to better understand". Another one states: "I did improve a lot in the last 5 years!" Volunteers improve their English and get more confident in their communication skills in English. Commenting on being a translator in the Boinc community, a participant remembers his beginning: "I told myself I can't do it, I didn't dare trying".

- **online communication skills:** volunteers learn how to use the discussion tools provided by the projects. The most common are discussion forums, usually moderated at least partially by expert volunteers, and chats. Volunteers get a chance through peer-guidance to learn the right way to ask questions, write answers, initiate and contribute discussions. A participant told us: "I had never used a chat before". VCS projects provide here structured ways to get familiar with communication tools which are widely present on the Internet. Some projects also offer Wikis, which may help people learn how to contribute to wikis, but no such case was reported in our interviews.

- **community management skills:** the biggest VCS projects sponsor volunteer-driven communities. Volunteers therefore get the opportunities to get their hands on the management of a community, which they could normally not have created by their own. This community deals with a real-life scientific project and frequently involves hundreds of participants from very diverse professional backgrounds and age ranges (from students to retired people). Community management activities observed in our data involves, among others: keeping people involved, organizing events and sometimes internal and external competition, taking decisions, operating technical platforms, creating and animating teams, managing “flaming”, organizing the yearly life of the community.

(5b) **Computer and web literacy**

Some volunteers report gaining knowledge and skills in the field of computer or web literacy. Let's consider the Web Literacy Standards as defined by the open source Mozilla’s community (see Fig 3):
Volunteers in almost all projects receive incentives and gain opportunities to learn at the *Exploring level: Navigating the Internet*, by intense Internet critical search practices (therefore improving their skills on the Search, Navigation and Credibility dimensions).

Volunteers in charge of updating project or community content on the web may get also some *Building skills*, especially in Composing for the web, HTML programming, CSS (Cascading Style Sheets) and Design and Accessibility.

Volunteers participating in online communities or collaborative content creation, or managing online communities, may also gain education on the *Participating on the Web* level, especially on the sharing and collaborating and community participation dimensions.

Volunteer computing projects have a specific educational impact for a small set of highly engaged volunteers on computer literacy. In principle, this kind of VCS only requests volunteers to download a software, which will then be run on their computer. However, many technical problems may arise, versions of the software get regularly updated according to the latest computer innovations, volunteers try to monitor and optimize what is happening on their computers, and they may face security or computing power issues. All these difficulties provide learning opportunities: "*Lots of people are reluctant to install on their computer some software that is running automatically. One is not very active at the beginning. At least this was my worry. I checked others’ experiences on the forums, if some had had problems with it afterwards. I was a real beginner regarding my knowledge of computers. I had to get started on the computer domain... Thanks to this system, I learnt how to use my computer correctly*".
Novices and experts seem to learn equally if they actively investigate the field: "It motivates me to watch technology innovations. For example when the GPUs arrived on the market... I have always been fond of computers, but then one has other priorities in life and can't follow all these incredible changes... Volunteer computing helps me to stay up-to-date on the main computing evolutions".

(6) Personal development

Some volunteers in VCS report important outcomes at a personal level, gathered here under the label "personal development". It includes:

- increasing one's self-confidence based on successful performance in the project tasks and additional tasks (like translations for the community),
- expanding one's interests, by discovering new topics of interests relative to science or to the community activities,
- extending one's social network,
- assuming new roles in a science-based community,
- doing creative works.

(6a) Self-confidence

The main output of participation to VCS may be the positive experience to contribute efficiently to a real scientific project. Volunteers experience their contribution as being valuable and also gain self-efficacy which in turn positively affects learning (Bandura, 1977). This contrasts to the usual understanding of science as an elitist, closed world.

This positive experience outsells other learning outcomes. A participant in Old Weather reports: "I think to me the main learning is personal in terms of trying things out by doing it. So I've certainly learned more about Internet searching than I would otherwise have known. I now have an enormous stored geographic knowledge and place names from 100 years ago. And we have discussed this in the forum about what are we going to do with this obscure geographic knowledge of light houses on the northern and naval terminology which is no longer used [laughter] and so on. There must be some way we can pull this knowledge in the future [laughter]. You never know but...it's just I learned a whole world I didn't know existed and it's rather a shame that it looks like they're not going to put online the, that's it's unlikely that they're going to get the log books from WWII because that would've been fascinating". This quote sketches a virtuous circle: improving one's knowledge and skills by doing the task and sharing these in a community of peers help increase self-confidence, therefore ability to perform the task and wish to share.

The community supports the development of confidence and identity. Learning includes a meta dimension, it is about becoming competent in a field and knowing one is competent in a field, which often happens through the discovery that one is now able to help others. Here we have a virtuous circle again: the community helps one become more competent, which will finally enable him or her to help newcomers in the community, therefore becoming conscious of one's learning and more self-confident in both performing the task and assuming new roles in the community. A participant in volunteer computing reports: "I don't want to run us down but we might suffer a bit from exclusion because of our passion... Science... It is not easy to
share. Especially for novices. We are not expert. We are eager to know, but we don't have the training for it. These Boinc projects help us get this knowledge. (...) And then we try to make things accessible on the forum for a 10 years-old kid. I thought if my daughter comes and visits this forum, she should get the essence of it without having to ask what does this mean Daddy or asking her teacher!"

(6b) Expanding one's interests

Participation to VCS is frequently reported as a way to "open one's mind": "Um, it opens up your world and your mind. It allows you to be able to get different perspectives on something you may not have understood or known about before, or even things in your everyday life, it can open up in a new way where you can see it differently. It takes you on different paths, gives you new adventures to do in your everyday life that otherwise you may not have even considered doing".

On a scientific level, volunteers, who engage in VCS because they are interested in a specific topic, usually expand their initial interests in the process: "For me, it has given me a new interest, that I wouldn't have otherwise have had". One says: "You would have talk to me about protein folding ten years ago, I would have told you what is this silly thing?" One participant adds: "I was passionate by science since I was a small boy. But I had not the means to do it".

This increased scientific engagement may open doors to new, unexpected activities, which further strengthen the involvement of volunteers in the approach: "I've learned lots and lots about different aspects of science or different sciences. Going to a couple times a year to London or Oxford to meet people (...), being interviewed [laughter] (...) that's really funny and I never thought I'd be doing this and getting to be a co-author in a scientific paper, well I never dreamed I would be a part of that".

(6c) Extending one's social network

To the question "Would you say that some people on the forum are friends?", the most engaged volunteers generally answered "yes", "almost", "to some extent", "at least online friends": "Almost. They are in the process of becoming friends. I have been here for only two years, but there are people here I would like to meet, and I am sure we would become friends. In the forum, in the admin zone, I talk like I would talk to friends, and they do the same." Friendship is a by-product of active involvement at the meta level, of shared responsibilities in community activities. Volunteers with close links come to communicate not only publicly or semi-publicly via the project communication tools (forum or chat), but also in private via a variety of one-to-one media: phone, video conference, instant messaging, or email.

Sometimes, groups of people who are active online decide to meet "in real life", usually for special, public or private, events. A large scientific society meeting may serve as a meeting point: volunteers will join and held a parallel social track, for example meet in a pub to socialize around the project. A subgroup may also organize a private meeting on a specific topic (for example, Open Source Development). The most common experience in such cases is a feeling of excitement and relief: excitement (and sometimes a bit of fear) in the perspective of meeting these online friends at last, and relief, as they experience the same
familiarity and ease of relations in-person as in their online interactions. Online pseudonyms are used equally with real names in such meetings.

(6d) Assuming new roles in a science-based community

We have been highlighting the critical role of communities, and community communication tools like forums, in the learning potential of VCS. To some extent (with the restriction however that they are not professional arenas), VCS projects can be compared to communities of practice (Lave & Wenger, 1991), in which participants gain knowledge, as well as they experience a change in their professional identity, by participating step-by-step in a community of shared interests. The most commonly available roles to take include:

- Roles related to community management in the forum: updating the forum, translating news, project presentations, tutorials and reports, organizing content (editing), sharing the latest information, answering to questions, initiating discussions, commenting, moderating exchanges, animating teams, recruiting for special roles, organizing internal and external challenges...
- Roles related to the quality control of the data: editing, informing on quality issues, sharing experience and training volunteers, etc.
- Roles related to the continuous improvement of the project: suggesting improvements and participating in their development, programming (modding), creating tutorials, etc.

(6e) Opportunities for creative work

Creativity will not be dealt with in this paper and we will just mention here that creative works performed in the context of VCS provide opportunities for learning as well as for identity changes. A few examples include:

- programming software which automatically detect and answers Frequently Asked Questions in the chat to improve the gaming experience in the Eyewire project,
- designing TShirts, logos and badges for the community,
- or collaboratively creating research presentations and tutorials to promote the project: "Three members created documents to present Boinc in schools and universities. They have been documenting all the critics that we face: security risks, increased computer wear-off, etc. These topics are regularly discussed in the forum, and we begin to have a lot of material to answer them."

A provisional summary typology of learning outcomes

From the interview data we can abduct six large categories of learning outcomes.

Type 1 (project mechanics) and type 2 (pattern recognition) are closely related to the task. Their acquisition is required in the context of the project to ensure good performance. Type 3 (on topic learning) and type 4 (scientific literacy) are on topic, but not necessary to get the task done. Their acquisition may be encouraged in the context of the project but they are usually acquired by additional involvement into the project community. Type 5 (off topic skills) and type 6 (personal development) cover a wide range of skills that are not related to a
specific citizen science field. They are unexpected outputs of heavy involvement in the projects.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>examples</th>
<th>formal (required)</th>
<th>informal/incidental (encouraged)</th>
<th>informal/incidental (individual)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. project mechanics</td>
<td></td>
<td>xxx</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. pattern recognition</td>
<td></td>
<td>xx</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. on topic extra learning</td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td>xx</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. scientific literacy</td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td>xx</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. off topic skills</td>
<td>languages, communication, community management skills, ICT literacy</td>
<td>xx</td>
<td>xxx</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. personal development</td>
<td>self-confidence, new interests, networking</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>xxx</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1: A provisional typology of learning

4. DISCUSSION

The importance of informal and incidental learning

We documented six types of learning outcomes. Most learning is unstructured, either informal or incidental (not planned and not perceived as learning). "Picking things up" seems to be the way knowledge is spread in VCS. Participants seem to accumulate "small pieces", "small things", "the practical part of my curriculum"...

Comparing the three projects we also found that observed learning outcomes do not appear to be related to the complexity of the tasks. They appear to be mostly related to the engagement of volunteers in the social aspects of the project, i.e. the life of the community. For instance, an interviewed participant in the BOINC project preferred volunteer computing to volunteer thinking or gaming since the computer works on its own and he could dedicate his time to other more creative tasks, such as using time to monitor his computer/ investigate research projects/ read news and papers/ answer messages / support newcomers/ initiate discussions / organize challenges, in relationship to the community. As his time is limited, he would not like to reduce these dimensions to spend more time doing "active" contributions to volunteer thinking projects. We may have to rethink the postulate that participants' learning is increasing along the line of the "volunteer computing, sensing, thinking, extreme citizen science" scale.

Connecting learning outcomes and interaction with other volunteers

Let's recall that our initial results show that most learning in VCS is inherently social and informal and thus corroborate results from Price and Lee (2013). Some of the most spectacular occurrences concern various forms of personal development.
Firstly, learning may happen through direct exchanges with scientists in forums and chats or thanks to communication of the scientists addressed to the volunteers (blog posts, videos, wikis, papers, feedback on results). A second important type of social learning concerns direct or indirect exchange with peers: through direct exchanges in a personal network, through collaboration on problem-solving in team work, through efforts to achieve a better performance that is evaluated and publicized by the system, and through creative participant built add-ons to the existing systems (programming or community management). A third important type concerns extraneous challenges and roles of the VCS project that create opportunities for learning. For example, French-speaking participants in the Boinc community engage into heavy translation jobs for their peers since most projects presentations, tutorials and results are in English. Similarly, difficulties to make the software work on participant’s computers strengthen community links. Changes in participation status open new opportunities for activity on all these levels, therefore new opportunities for learning. Here people are not only learning FROM others, by interacting with them in forums and chat, asking and answering questions, comparing results... but also FOR others: by assuming responsibilities in a community, which are a strong driver for sustained and highly-qualitative participation.

Discussing identity changes, when a happy few group of volunteers assume intermediary positions in between the large group of contributors and the scientific team, is out-of-scope of this paper. However, we can postulate that the existence of this kind of group contributes a lot to the success of a project. Further work will investigate and present the relationship between engagement in community and motivation, sociability and identity.

5. CONCLUSION

This exploratory research highlights learning dimensions in VCS that were not previously identified in a systematic way. It found a wide range of mostly informal learning outcomes, opportunities and mechanisms. A lot of learning seems to be “diffused” and unstructured, i.e. participants learn many “unplanned small things”, picking them up from their engagement in VCS tasks or communities. However, these “small things” combined can lead to substantial learning in the dimensions of task/game mechanics, pattern recognition, on-topic or off-topic learning, scientific literacy or personal development. This research also highlights the critical role of communities in learning: volunteers learn by interacting with others, but also by assuming specific social roles. The social dimension is a motivational driver for sustained participation. It provides as well developmental opportunities for a small set of volunteers. VCS projects therefore offer both direct and indirect opportunities: Volunteers contributing to the project may acquire knowledge and skills related to the scope of the scientific project, and have the possibility to assume roles in communities that they would not have been able to create themselves. From a practical point of view, this typology supports a structured approach for learning-centered design of VCS. In particular, supporting learning in VCS environments requires paying close attention both to the design of the project itself and to these indirect mostly community-related opportunities.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The authors would like to acknowledge two students from University College London, who conducted some of the interviews as part of their Psychology undergraduate project work: Kathleen Mathieu and Zoya Ajani, as well as the research teams and volunteers from the Eyewire, Old Weather and Boinc projects (Alliance Francophone and Team China).

Laure Kloetzer, Daniel Schneider, Charlene Jennett, Anna Cox and Margaret Gold are all supported by the EU project Citizen Cyberlab (Grant No 317705). Citizen Cyberlab. http://citizencyberlab.eu/

REFERENCES


UNSKILLED WORK AND LEARNER IDENTITY
– UNDERSTANDING UNSKILLED WORK AS A CERTAIN CONDITION FOR PERCEIVING ONESELF AS AN EDUCABLE SUBJECT

Kondrup, Sissel
Roskilde University
Denmark

ABSTRACT

The paper examines how unskilled work forms conditions for meeting the obligation to position oneself as an educable subject and engage in formal learning activities. Sensitivity to peoples' work-life-experiences is necessary to understand their orientation toward different learning activities. The main argument is that participation research must abandon the notion of motivation as an individual attribute and apply a dialectic concept of learner identity acknowledging work-life as a pivotal space for learning and formation of identity. I outline how a work-life-historical approach combining a critical theoretical approach inspired by Salling-Olesen’s and Archer’s concepts of identity and concerns can contribute to an understanding of the relationship between work and learner identity.

Through narrative work-life interviews I examine how engagement in unskilled work in small and medium sized Danish enterprises causes a multitude of different and ambiguous immediate experiences and concerns pivotal for the workers’ learner identities.

INTRODUCTION

Lifelong learning has become a cornerstone of the welfare policies in the Scandinavian countries e.g. education, labour market and social policy. It is a widespread political consensus, that education and learning are means to ensure both individual and societal welfare and prosperity in a time with increased international competition and where the Washington consensus has outdated a range of traditional economic tools to regulate the national labour markets and employment rates (Desjardins, 2009).

In Denmark the promotion of lifelong learning is embraced by both the government and their social partners (Jørgensen & Warring, 2004). Education and training is a central theme in the labour market agreements (Due et al., 2004), and in 2007 the government formulated a national strategy for lifelong learning and qualifications for all, as a part of the ratification of the Lisbon declaration. The increased significance of education is also reflected in a change in the Danish labour market model: the praised model of Flexicurity is changing to a model of mobication. The first defines a labour market model combining flexibility and income security; the state provides income security during unemployment in order to make workers accept low job security and hereby promote the flexibility of labour. The other model combines job mobility and education; employees should obtain employment security by developing qualifications demanded by the labour market enabling them to move between jobs when demand for labour changes. In this model education becomes the means to generate a dynamic labour market and obtain employment (Andersen & Pedersen, 2010).
It has become a political objective to ensure lifelong learning and training for all, and the discourse forming the policies on lifelong learning positions everybody as educable subjects obliged to position themselves as lifelong learners and engage in different kinds of formal learning activities (Fejes, 2006, Biesta, 2006, Brine, 2006). When lifelong learning is defined as the primary means to obtain and sustain individual and societal welfare and prosperity, those not participating are becoming a risk group in a double sense: they risk being marginalised or excluded from the labour market and they become a societal risk for the development of a competitive knowledge economy (Brine, 2006).

Even though education and training are defined as the key to employability and hereby to societal inclusion in a realm where wage labour is crucial for individual and societal reproduction and recognition, currently lifelong learning is contributing to social stratification (Field, 2006). The distribution of learning possibilities both when it comes to formal, non-formal and informal learning is characterized by a Matthew effect, where the chance to participate is increased by the level of previous formal learning. It is well documented that the chances of participation in formal adult education and training is dependent on the long arm of the family, the long arm of the job and the long arm of the welfare system (Desjardins et al., 2006, Desjardins & Rubenson, 2009b), and also the chances for engaging in non-formal and informal learning activities depends on peoples position in the labour market (Desjardins et al., 2006, Illeris et al., 2004). In Denmark these tendencies have been documented by the research group providing the foundation for the tripartite committee on Adult Vocational Education formed in 2004 (Trepartsudvalget, 2006). The same cross-national tendencies are documented in international research on the distribution of Adult Education and Training i.e. in the International Adult Literacy Survey (IALS), The Adult Literacy and Life skills Survey (ALLS) and Eurobarometer on lifelong learning (Belangér & Tuijnman, 1997, Desjardins et al., 2006, Boeren et al., 2010).

PARTICIPATION IN LIFELONG LEARNING – A RESEARCH FIELD

The political interest in promoting lifelong learning is closely intertwined with an increased research interest in examining the distribution of vocational education and training and explaining different patterns of participation (Desjardins & Rubenson, 2009a), especially why groups most at risk – people working in unskilled and low skilled jobs - tend to be least likely to participate in different learning activities (Bélanger & Tuijnman, 1997, Boeren et al., 2010, Desjardins et al., 2006, Rubenson, 2011).

Several different traditions can be identified within research on participation in adult education (Rubenson, 2011). One tradition builds on the ambition of developing heuristic models in order to understand participation as an interaction between specific subjects and their context. Two of the significant contributions within this tradition, prevalent in current research, are Cross’s Chain-response-model and Rubenson’s Expectancy-valence-model (e.g. Boeren et al., 2010, Hefler, 2010, Rubenson & Salling-Olesen, 2007). Both illustrate that people’s motivation and attitudes towards adult education are situated and that participation is a result of an interaction between individuals and their specific context (Rubenson, 2011). But even though they emphasise the situated conditions for developing attitudes, forming motivation and for participating in adult education they tend to overlook how people’s self-perception and their current situation are situated in a broader societal context (Rubenson & Salling-Olesen, 2007).
Another tradition is preoccupied with how participation and non-participation can be understood from the perspective of different target groups. The arguments forming this tradition posit that orientations toward adult education and training must be researched as an element in specific life-histories or biographies, where certain habitual dispositions (Paldanius, 2002, Hodkinson & Hodkinson, 2004), significant learning activities (Antikainen, 2005) and changing value contexts (Lynch, 2008) constitute how people perceive adult education.

While pointing to the necessity of understanding participation as a result of the interaction between the specific subjects and their situation and to the importance of understanding the meaning of education from the perspective of the target-group, neither of the referred contributions has explicitly addressed how work and especially unskilled work pose specific conditions for the formation, maintenance or transformation of a learner identity. Furthermore, the approaches tend to overlook the ambiguity and potential conflicts in people’s experiences and in their actual situation and the implications for their perceived needs and opportunities to engage in different learning activities.

Through an analysis of the concept of motivation applied in research on adult education, the Swedish social scientist Helene Ahl (2006) reveals a tendency to a) formulate the problem of non-participation as a question of lack of motivation, b) to define motivation as an individual attribute and to 3) apply a concept of motivation originally developed to discipline workers, increase productivity and prevent labour resistance. This way of conceptualising non-participation has certain problematic implications. When non-participation is formulated as a result of lack of motivation, it insinuates that the opposite – participation – is a mere result of motivated action and thus tends to exclude the structural factors influencing participation rates e.g. welfare state regimes (Desjardins & Rubenson, 2009b) and the supply of adult education (Boeren et al., 2010). Further, by defining motivation as an individual attribute, lack of motivation may be resolved by individual approaches or techniques e.g. therapy. When defining non-participation as a consequence of lack-of-motivation and at the same time individualising motivation the individual becomes both the reason for and the answer to the problem of non-participation in adult education. Thus the responsibility for a well-functioning society is placed on the individual instead of the societal institutions and structures (Ahl, 2006).

It is crucial to abandon this individual notion of motivation. People’s orientation towards different learning activities or their motivation cannot be understood as individual attributes. Instead it must be perceived as a result of a dialectic process where specific subjects are engaged in certain historical, social and material (work) practices conditioning the identity process.

In the following paragraphs I will unfold a concept of learner identity enabling researchers to understand the meaning of lifelong learning, from the perspective of the target groups and how this is constituted by specific social and historical (work) life experiences. My ambition has been to develop an approach sensitive to the ambiguities in everyday work-life.
WORK-LIFE AS THE CONTEXT FOR FORMING A LEARNER IDENTITY

To comprehend the relation between work-life experiences and orientation towards different kinds of learning activities, it is crucial to apply a dialectic concept of learner identity. A concept enabling researchers in the field of work and learning, lifelong learning, and participation research to examine how peoples' perception of learning activities are situated in and conditioned by specific work-life experiences, and thus by a specific historical, social, and material work-life.

The significance of work or labour as central sociological categories when wanting to understand identity or subjectivity has been contested in late- or post-modern social science, arguing that sub-cultures or lifestyles are more adequate categories (Nielsen et al., 1994). But this conclusion is too hasty. In a globalised capitalist society wage labour is the generalised form of societal production and reproduction, and thus the means to societal inclusion (Nielsen et al., 1994). Wage labour takes up a great deal of most people’s time and it forms the context for substantial social interaction, practical involvement and learning processes (Lave & Wenger, 1991, Billett, 2008, 2006).

Work is one of the essential activities in which the work capacity as well as the general capacities of the individual is produced, enhanced and developed. Each of the subjectively meaningful experiences in work comprises aspect of threat, aspects of consolidation, and aspects of learning. The identity process comprehends them all (Salling Olesen & Weber 2001, p.47).

Work life experiences thus influence how people perceive themselves, their situation, and also their capacity to act both individually and collectively.

Research on participation in adult education and training reveals how ‘the long arm of the job’ has significant influence on people’s chances to participate in learning activities both in formal settings and at the job (Desjardins et al., 2006, Jørgensen & Waring 2002, Illeris et al., 2004). This implies that different kinds of work afford different kinds of learning trajectories and set different context for the identity process (Archer 2000) or the formation of subjectivity (Salling Olesen & Weber, 2001). Therefore, work or labour has to re-enter the vocabulary and the theoretical framework whilst examining identity, not least learner identity. Work has to be conceptualised, not just as an empty signifier open for negation but as historical and material social practices. People are physically, practically, and socially engaged in jobs with specific content and organisation conditioning their performance and causing certain immediate experiences, concerns and forming specific spaces for learning.

LEARNER IDENTITY

In order to examine how unskilled work forms specific conditions for workers to meet the obligation to position themselves as educable subjects and engage in lifelong learning (Fejes, 2006), it is necessary to develop a framework able to capture the relation between work-life experiences and how workers perceive their needs and possibilities to engage in different learning activities: their learner identity.

My initial inspiration for applying the concept learner identity comes from Antikainen (2005).
Antikainen uses the concept to examine the changing meaning of education and learning in Finland in the post-World-War II era. He has developed a concept of learner identity inspired by social interactionism and examines where significant learning experiences occur and what significant others influence these experiences. Like many other researchers preoccupied with education Antikainen pays only limited attention to the specific work-life of his informants, and his concept is neither sensitive to the practical and physical engagement in work nor to the ambiguity in everyday-life. In order to comprehend the relation between the engagement in work-life and the formation, maintenance, or transformation of a learner identity, I have found it necessary to apply a theoretical framework sensitive to the relation between work and identity (Kondrup, 2012). I have included two different perspectives explicitly preoccupied with the relation between work and identity in my attempt to develop a concept of learner identity sensitive to the subject’s engagement in a specific work-life. They both define the identity process as dialectic and as on-going throughout life. The first perspective is a life-historical approach rooted in critical theory (Salling-Olesen 2002, 2007). The second perspective is Archer’s (2000, 2003) critical realistic approach and her concepts of concerns, modus vivendi and personal identity.

IDENTITY PROCESSES AND EXPERIENCE

According to the life-history approach the formation, maintenance or transformation of identity or subjectivity must be conceptualised as an on-going experience-process. It is crucial to underline that the concept of experience differs from the everyday notion, which in this tradition is captured in the concept of immediate experience. Experience is a phenomenon with three modalities, relatively independent but mediated through each other; immediate experience, life (historical) experience, and objectified experience (cultural knowledge) (Salling-Olesen, 2007).

Identity is neither static nor essential, but an on-going result of a dialectic process, where the subject is continuously engaged in certain practices in specific social and historical situations giving rise to certain immediate experiences. Through this engagement the subject builds consciousness and internalises a certain version of the cultural knowledge (e.g. language, concepts, beliefs, techniques, and norms).

We take our concept of the subject from the tradition of critical theory (the Frankfurt School). As opposed to liberal thinking (which holds a hegemonic position, including in most social science) the critical theory focus on the production of human subjectivity through socialisation, in which a specific version of cultural and social experience is embodied, becoming a complex of conscious and unconscious predictions for subjective action and later experience. Avoiding the dichotomy of liberal theory between the free subject in a social, constraining environment we assume on the contrary that subjectivity is something that must continuously be learned socially (Salling Olesen, 2002, p. 15).

Therefore, the subject is per se both historical and social (Salling-Olesen 2002). In order to understand a certain identity, how the subjects perceive themselves, their situation and their possibilities to act, it is necessary to apply an approach sensitive to the specific process of experience constituting the formation of identity.
IDENTITY AND CONCERNS

According to Archer identity is developed in a dialectic process through people’s on-going engagement in the three orders of reality: the natural, the practical, and the social order. The differentiated reality entails that engagement gives rise to natural (bodily), practical (performative), and social emotions and concerns. The human embodiment confers concerns about physical well-being. The performative concerns are unavoidable due to the necessary engagement in practical activities in the world of material culture (Archer, 2000).

[N]ecessary work is the lot of homo faber. Performative concerns are unavoidably part of our inevitable practical engagement with the world of material culture. The precise objects of performative concerns are historically, cross-culturally and socially varied, but the import of our competence in dealing with the practical realm is universal (Archer, 2000, p. 198).

The social concerns are linked to the social judgement of approval or disapproval. According to Archer our most important social concern is the self-worth vested in different projects: “It is because we have invested ourselves in these social projects that we are susceptible to emotionality in relation to society’s normative evaluation of our performance in those roles” (Archer, 2003, p.16).

The presence of simultaneously diverse - and potential conflicting - concerns force people to form a modus vivendi and prioritise their ultimate concerns through inner conversation. The personal way of prioritising these concerns is what gives people their personal identity (Archer, 2000, p. 221). But Archer emphasises that the situation in which people find themselves and develop their modus vivendi are not of their own making. On the contrary humans are born into a socially structured and stratified society, where different groups have different possibilities and find themselves in different situations giving rise to different concerns that need to be taken into account.

COMBINING THE TWO PERSPECTIVES

The resemblance between the two perspectives on the relation between work and identity are a) their claim of humanism, b) their ambition to bring the subject to the forefront of social science, and 3) insisting on the identity process as a dialectical process that emphasises the significance of the historical, social, and material context. This being said, there are substantial differences (Kondrup, 2012). This paper is not the time and place for a substantial account of the discrepancies between the two approaches. I will briefly mention one of the most crucial ones in order to clarify my concept of learner identity and then outline how I have combined concepts from the two perspectives.

One of the main differences is the perception of the social nature of human consciousness and reflexivity. Archer argues that humans cannot be reduced to society’s being. Due to our ability to be reflexive (one of people’s emergent properties), we can reflect on and change societal structures and culture. Reflexivity is, according to Archer, possible through an ongoing inner conversation.

The critical theoretical approach agrees that humans cannot be reduced to trägers (carriers)
of societal structures. Humans have needs and potentials, both depending on certain conditions in order to be realised, but there is no pre-social or non-social spaces for (private) reflections on these needs or potentials. On the contrary, our only way to acknowledge how societal (historical and social) structures are conditioning human life is through social learning (Salling Olesen, 2006). According to the life-historical approach the perception of the situation and thus reflections about immediate experiences and concerns are mediated by consciousness, and consciousness is established through socialisation. According to this approach subjectivity is developed as a part of the socialisation process. Perception and reflexivity is always mediated through life-historical experiences - conscious as well as unconscious - and the version of the cultural knowledge internalised through socialisation.

I define learner identity as people’s perceived needs and possibility to engage in different learning activities in order to comply with their concerns in the given situation. It is formed, maintained, or transformed in an on-going (work-life) experience-process constituted through engagement in a specific historical and social (work-) life. Learner identity must be analysed as a dialectic phenomenon, established, maintained, and transformed by subjects continuously and actively engaged in specific situations causing immediate experiences and specific concerns. The perception of these experiences and of the opportunity to meet them will be mediated by previous life-historical experiences (conscious or unconscious and potentially ambivalent) and the cultural knowledge internalised through socialisation.

Archer’s concepts of the differentiated reality can discern the concept of immediate experience, by emphasising how involvement in specific situations always implies natural, practical, and social engagement. Therefore we as researchers must be aware of people’s natural, practical, and social concerns when trying to understand how they conduct their life.

EXAMINING LEARNER IDENTITY THROUGH EMPIRICAL STUDIES

In order to capture the complexity and ambiguity in everyday work-life presenting the immediate context for the identity process, it is necessary to apply a method sensitive to how people perceive their everyday life, their concerns and their opportunities to handle these concerns, based on their life-historical experiences. To understand how the learner identity is formed by specific work-life experiences it is necessary to examine how workers perceive participation in different kinds of learning activities as a means to deal with their specific concerns.

In order to examine how unskilled work-life poses certain conditions for the establishment of learner identity I have conducted a qualitative study based on work-life history interviews. 23 workers employed in unskilled jobs in 6 different small and medium-sized private companies have told their work-life stories. These stories describe a) their work trajectory: how they entered the labour market and what kind of jobs and tasks they have undertaken, b) their learning trajectories: how they have learned to perform their tasks and what kind of learning activities they have participated in during their work-life, c) the story of the development in their current job and how the demand for qualifications and their opportunity to apply different skills has changed, and finally d) their expected future work-life.

I have conducted extensive narrative and thematic analysis of three of the work-life stories in order to examine how the learner identities are conditioned by specific work-life experiences.
The analysis examines how the engagement in unskilled work causes a multitude of natural, practical and social concerns; how the workers perceive their possibilities to handle these concerns, what they define as their primary concerns and how they perceive their need and opportunity to engage in different learning activities – formal, informal and non-formal – in order to deal with these concerns.

**UNSKILLED WORK-LIVES: DIVERSE WORK AND LEARNING TRAJECTORIES**

The work-life stories reveal very different work trajectories. Some informants have many, others have few different jobs during their career, but a majority have been through or tried to change their trade at least once during their adult life. They also have very different learning trajectories. Some have been skilled in other trades before ending up in unskilled jobs, and some have been working as unskilled workers their entire work-life. All of them have participated in formal education during their work-life, primarily to obtain statutory certificates (driving a forklift, ISO), but also literacy training e.g. IT or reading and writing. The latter often took place in periods of decline in production where training was used to avoid redundancy.

**CONCERNS IN UNSKILLED WORK**

The work-life stories reveal that engagement in an unskilled work-life causes diverse and sometimes conflicting concerns, some of which seem impossible to remedy in the current situation.

The most prevalent natural concern expressed in the work-life-stories is the concern of physical disabilities. It is a widespread experience that physical degeneration is a risk caused by work as a consequence of heavy manual labour, shift working and a combination of hard manual work and ageing. It was a common story that workers have to handle the concern about physical strain by developing individual and sometimes collective strategies.

The work-life stories revealed different kinds of practical or performative concerns; a concern about the quality of the work, the quality in the work, and a concern about being able to apply knowledge and skills in the job. The performative concerns are closely intertwined, they emphasise different dimensions of the practical engagement in work and how practical engagement is substantial for the subjective meaning of work. Quality of work relates to the concern about the use-value of the product of their work. This concern is evident in stories about the satisfaction connected with seeing the products taken into use, and in the stories about the necessity of performing a good job in order to contribute to something useful and satisfy/not cause troubles for the consumer. It is a general story that it is important to see the result of one's work thus the subjective meaning of work is closely connected to contributing to something useful for somebody else. The concern of the quality of the work is closely related to a concern about how their individual performance affects and contributes to the production process as a whole. Quality in work concerns the performance of a good job as well as being good at the tasks. This is evident in stories about the satisfaction and pride that comes from obtaining experience enabling them to perform well. It is also evident in stories about the necessity to know more about the production process than the formal job description prescribes in order to keep the production running and to be able to fix unexpected problems. Finally the opportunity to use skills and knowledge in the job is a
common practical concern. This is evident in the stories about the experience of loss when
the work changes and the opportunity to utilise one’s knowledge and skills decreases.

These practical concerns appear in different variations in all the work-life stories. This reveals
that the workers are definitely not indifferent toward their own performance. On the contrary,
both their performance, the opportunity to perform, and the outcome of this performance are
significant to the subjective meaning of work.

The work-life stories also revealed a multitude of social concerns: maintaining employment,
obtaining waged labour, getting recognition from superiors, having good relations with ones
colleagues, and that there is more to life than just work. The importance of maintaining employment is evident in stories about periods of unemployment, and about how frustrating it is to stay at home ‘not doing anything’. Equally, it is evident in stories about the necessity to adjust and compromise in order to maintain employment. These stories reveal that employment has a value in itself, and is considered a useful activity in opposition to housework. Another concern is about economic security and the need to obtain employment in order to pay the mortgage. The third concern is about getting recognition from superiors. This concern is expressed both in positive and negative stories e.g. stories about the pride and satisfaction gained from getting credit when performing a god job, and stories about the frustration caused when their efforts and struggles to keep production running despite worn down production machinery and understaffing are not appreciated or ignored. The fourth concern is about having good relations with colleagues. It is emphasised how having a good time with colleagues partly can make up for an otherwise unsatisfactory work-life; how helping out less experienced colleagues contributes to the subjective meaning of work, and how frustrating it is to work in a work-place where people oppose each other, and where opportunities for social interaction are restricted. The last concern found in the work-life stories is the concern about there being more to life than work. This concern is evident in the stories about how exhaustion caused by work and shift work limits the opportunities to engage in leisure activities both sports, political activities, and night classes.

LEARNING AS A MEANS TO COMPLY WITH CONCERNS

It is evident in the interviews that learning – acquiring new knowledge and skills – is pivotal to handle the concerns experienced in the unskilled work-life.

In order to cope with the natural concern of physical degeneration caused by straining work it is necessary to learn how to protect the body and avoid unnecessary strain. This is accomplished by developing routines, getting a feeling for the machines and adjusting to their pace and by learning how to share the burdens. Sometimes it is not enough to adjust in order to avoid strain, and change of job or even trade is mentioned as a means to deal with the concern for physical degeneration caused by straining work. This implies a demand for learning e.g. to interact with new colleagues, behave in new company cultures and undertake new tasks.

Learning is also essential in order to cope with the practical concerns. Quality in and of the work entails gaining knowledge of how their specific tasks contribute to and form part of the total production-process as well as the end product. For instance by drawing on knowledge gained from being a consumer/user of similar products. Furthermore, the informants tell that
it is necessary to learn to solve problems outside their formal job description in order to keep production running, but also because it increases the subjective value of the work. *The more you can do on your own, without having to wait for the smith to fix it, the more interesting it gets*. It is common in the work-life-stories that the opportunity to use knowledge and skills in the work, both in the performance of the job and in peer-to-peer training of less experienced colleagues, is essential to the subjective meaning of work. And it is presented as a loss when changes in the content or organisation of work limit their opportunity to apply their knowledge and skills.

Learning is also claimed to be a key factor in order to deal with social concerns. It is necessary to learn to perform new tasks and take on new assignments in order to obtain employment and thus obtain paid labour. Learning is also essential for being careful and skilful and thus to accomplish acknowledgement for the work.

When examining what kind of learning the informants consider most valuable in order to comply with their concerns, they all express that the most valuable knowledge and skills come from gaining experience. Primarily knowledge and skills gained through informal and non-formal learning are applied in their everyday work. And they all express very limited opportunities to apply theoretical or formal qualifications at work. It is a general story that the opportunities to utilise more or new formal qualifications are blurred, ambivalent or even non-existing. The informants argue that the opportunities for job-development in their current workplace that will lead to the use of more formal skills, are very restricted if not absent. Additionally, they describe a lack of or restricted opportunities to put to use some of the formal skills they already possess.

On qualifying for a new job or for the future demand for labour, the informants express a great deal of uncertainty. They question alternative job-openings due to the financial crisis and the high degree of unemployment. At the same time they express an uncertainty on the future demand for labour. The uncertainty is enhanced by changing and contradictory statements from employers’ organisations, and politicians about the demand for labour.

Regarding formal learning the informants also tell a story about conflicts between short and long term interests. The reduction in labour, which has been a general tendency in all the companies, implies that there are only enough employees left to keep the production running. Absence due to participation in education implies a risk of decrease in - if not a stop of – production and it thus jeopardizes their current employment. So even though formal learning can be a mean to meet the future demand for qualified labour, participation in formal education implies a risk of losing the current job. Thus they experience an inconsistency between their formal rights (given by labour market agreements) and the actual opportunity to participate in formal learning activities.

The perceived lack of alternative employment and the uncertain future demand for labour indicates that maintenance of and adaptation to their current job seems to be the most likely way to stay employed.

The analysis illuminates that unskilled work-life causes a multitude of different and sometimes contradictory concerns, why it becomes necessary to compromise and prioritise the (temporary) ultimate concern. Maintaining employment is the ultimate concern in all the stories. The work-life-stories all express the experience that it is crucial to be flexible and
adjust in order to maintain employment e.g. by changing job or trade when the demand for labour changes, and by adjusting to changes at the workplace. The absence of alternative jobs makes the orientation toward the current job and its requirement the most meaningful strategy in order to obtain employment.

They also express the experience that it is necessary to subordinate, adjust and even compromise other concerns in order to obtain employment, and that the necessity to compromise concerns implies significant subjective costs.

Despite the prevalent story of individual responsibility to be flexible and adapt, the informants experience a limited control over their own employability, both in the current job and in the future labour-market. Flexibility, adjustment and learning are perceived as prerequisites but not guarantees for maintaining employment. Thus the stories reveal that uncertainty, ambiguity, and ambivalence are experienced as unavoidable conditions in the unskilled work-life why it is necessary to learn to cope with uncertainty and ambivalence.

CONCLUSION

The study reveals how the workers experience continuous learning as a necessity and how their learner identity is characterised by an orientation towards the indispensability of knowledge and skills. The workers thus comply with the rationale in the discourse on lifelong learning: on-going learning is a necessity in order to be employable e.g. learning to undertake new tasks, handle new machines, and work with new colleagues, change workplace and even trade when demand for labour changes.

Their learner identity is characterized by a primarily instrumental orientation towards participation in different learning activities. Skills and knowledge must be practicable in their work-life in order to be considered meaningful. But this is not the same as an indifferent orientation towards learning. The work-life stories show how the opportunity to gain and apply knowledge and skills is relevant to the subjective meaning of work and thus contributes to a meaningful work-life. But it also reveals how the perceived need and opportunity for formal skills through education are restricted or absent in their current situation. The need and opportunity to apply formal skills in their current job is restricted by the specific content and organisation of work. Similarly, the perceived opportunity to qualify for alternative employment is restricted by uncertainty about the future demand for labour and by the situation in their current workplace.

The analysis shows how learner identities are conditioned by specific concerns, previous experience, perceptions of the current situation, and expectations for the future. The immediate experience of being able to apply experience, skills and knowledge while conducting work is essential to the learner identity. Equally important is the experience of what kinds of learning activities contribute to practicable knowledge and skills and enabling them to meet their natural/bodily, practical/performative and social concerns. It thus reveals how the content and organisation of work, their work-life historical experiences and their expectations of the development in the current workplace and the local and regional labour market plays a significant role for the learner identity.

The paper demonstrates how the application of a dialectic concept of learner identity formed,
maintained, or transformed through involvement in a specific work-life can widen our understanding of unskilled work as a condition for engaging in lifelong learning. By being sensitive to the concerns in the unskilled work-life and how workers perceive their opportunities to cope with these concerns, it can widen our understanding of how and why workers in unskilled jobs ascribe formal learning activities with certain meanings in their specific situations. Analysing the learner-identity-process as an on-going dialectical process thus reveals how the specific content and organisation of work is significant for how workers perceive their need and opportunity to engage in different learning activities. The study accentuates that future research should pay greater attention to how the organisation of the labour market and specific jobs afford different groups different opportunities for forming a learner identity and positioning themselves as educable subjects as demanded by the policies of lifelong learning.

REFERENCES


Andersen, Søren Kaj & Ove Kaj Pedersen (2010) De nordiske landes konkurrencedygtighed - fra flexicurity til mobication FAOS Forskningsnotat No. 107, Københavns Universitet


Desjardins, R. & K. Rubenson (2009a) (red.) Research of vs. Research for Education Policy – In an Era of Transnational Policy-making, Saarbrücken: Verlag Dr. Müller


Salling Olesen, H. (2002). Experience, language and subjectivity in life history approaches – biography research as a bridge between the humanities and the social sciences? Paper No. 14, Life History Project, Roskilde University

Livslang opkvalificering og uddannelse for alle på arbejdsmarkedet – rapport fra Trepartsudvalget, Bind 2 Kortlægning og analyser.

Finansministeriet
INTRODUCTION

Nowadays, we are witnessing important changes in the field of adult education and learning. Adult education seems to navigate between the pressures of the market, focused on competences, and the people’s desire of an education for a better life. The key word in the first case seems to be competitiveness, and in the second one well-being and citizenship. In this scenario we could ask what is the Universities’ role regarding adult education and learning? How can universities engage with adult learners to improve their expertise and their lives thinking more in well-being and citizenship rather than competitiveness? In this paper I try to present and reflect on the co-creation of knowledge as a path for this engagement. Some key points will become relevant: What is the nature of knowledge? Who are the owners of knowledge? Which ways can be used to create knowledge? How can knowledge be disseminated? As Gramsci states referring to culture:

> To create a new culture doesn’t only mean making original discoveries but it also - and specially - means disseminating critical truths already discovered, socializing them... and making them available in support of actions and elements of coordination of both the intellectual and moral order (1976, p. 14, my own translation).

Adult education - in some approaches - is an attempt for creating and disseminating culture and knowledge. It tries to build alternative knowledge that becomes useful for people’s daily life as Gramsci affirm. This is the really useful knowledge (Crowther, 2006).

In this paper, I am going to present briefly the theoretical framework, and then some methodological aspects based on participatory research and others deriving from the freirean approach, mainly the notion of dialogue. This methodology has been used during my time as head of the Paulo Freire Chair at the University of Seville. I will present some experiences and its outcomes. Finally, some conclusions stressing the work done as an alternative in the crossroads of adult education in transitional times.

THE ROLE OF UNIVERSITIES

Looking at the tradition, universities seem to have always taught communities. It is the dominant discourse when debating the relationships between universities and communities. This is derived from an approach based on Humboldt’s thought. Some notes derived from this approach are: the development of PhD as training for research; the promotion of the principle of ‘subject specialisation’ over the principle of the ‘unity of knowledge’: and the
promotion of the role of critical thinking in higher education above that of aesthetic or moral sensibility (in Millican and Hart, 2009). Now it seems that we need to rethink the role of the university, and this role is related, in some ways, to the request from community.

In terms of community it presents a challenge to universities to be of and not just in the community; not simply to engage in "knowledge transfer" but to establish a dialogue across the boundary between the university and its community which is open-ended, fluid and experimental (Watson, cited in Millican & Hart, 2009, p. 3).

Some white papers are interesting for reflecting on the diverse roles of universities. The document ‘The role of the Universities in the Europe of knowledge’ argues that one of the main goals of the European universities is “to establish closer co-operation between universities and enterprises to ensure better dissemination and exploitation of new knowledge in the economy and society at large” (COM, 2003, p. 3). It also points four interdependent elements towards the building of a knowledge society: the production of knowledge, through scientific research; its transmission through education and training; its dissemination through information; and its use in technological innovation. Plus, the most important links between both should be done with companies and enterprises in order “to develop effective and close co-operation between universities and industry” (COM, 2003, p. 7).

On the other hand, the document states that one of the functions of the university, among others, is to “become a forum of reflection on knowledge, as well of debate and dialogue between scientists and people” (p. 9).

In its ‘World Conference in Higher Education’ in 1998, the UNESCO defined missions and functions of the university such as: to educate for citizenship and for active participation in society, advance, create and disseminate knowledge and “provide, as part of its service to the community, relevant expertise to assist societies in cultural, social and economic development” (1998, p. 4). These activities are aimed to eliminate poverty, intolerance, violence, and illiteracy from an interdisciplinary and trans-disciplinary approach.

In the 2009 ‘World Conference on Higher Education’ the UNESCO defined the Social Responsibility of Higher Education,

Higher Education has the social responsibility to advance our understanding of multifaceted issues, which involve social, economic, scientific and cultural dimensions and our ability to respond to them (UNESCO, 2009, p. 2).

This key concept on social responsibility is very important. The university, as public service, should focus on the community. The knowledge production has to be a useful knowledge for people and for community to promote well-being and to deepen democracy and citizenship.

Spanish university regulations include as one of the roles of Higher Education Institutions the transference of knowledge to society to support culture, quality of life and economic developments (Ministerio de Educación, 2001). Subsequent with this statement, the University of Seville defines as one of its main goals:
The creation, development, transfer, dissemination and review of science, technology, art and culture, to promote a general view of knowledge and its transfer to society (University of Seville, 2008, art. 3).

One of the most interesting - and new - initiatives in this field is the UNESCO Chair in 'Community Based Research and Social Responsibility in Higher Education'. In its document proposal we can read:

Universities can no longer continue to stand aloof and disconnected but, rather, must create opportunities and become spaces of encounter where students and communities of the 21st century can learn together to become more active, engaged citizens in the creation of knowledge for a more just and sustainable world. How higher education institutions can better tap into existing knowledge, encourage the co-creation of new knowledge through participatory processes of enquiry and investigation, and use the findings to challenge and find new solutions to social and environmental problems is the contribution the work outlined in this proposal will make (Proposal for a UNESCO Chair, 2011).

DIVERSE KNOWLEDGE

Hall (2011) points out the existence of two dominant institutional trends: the knowledge access movement and the emergence - or re-emergence - of new discourses and practices engaging scholars and universities to work in cooperation with people in communities. He states:

The strongest tendency in both these knowledge democracy development is to see, as central value, the dissemination and impact of scholarly, academic, scientific or expert knowledge (Hall, 2011, p. 14).

I think that these two approaches mentioned above are not the only way to engage universities to communities. It can be imagined, beyond the transfer, the collective building of knowledge, based on other sources of knowledge, such as social movements, tradition, and others. There are very rich and diverse sources where different and alternative knowledge is both created and developed (Santos 2009). This creation of knowledge is occurring in the communities where people live. As Toulmin (1977) notes, we can only understand our concepts if we try to understand the socio-cultural process through which they are being developed inside specific communities. Toulmin (1977) also adds that we are continuously sharing these concepts with other people.

As Gaventa & Cornwall state:

The emphasis is more upon the ways in which production of knowledge shapes consciousness of the agenda in first place, and participation in knowledge production becomes a method for building greater awareness and more authentic self-consciousness of one's issues and capacities for action (2011, p. 71).

The first question in this way is asking about what constitutes knowledge, who defines it, who owns it, etc.
Sousa (2009) differentiates among an abyssal thought and post-abyssal thought. The main difference seems to be in the visibility or non-visibility of the knowledge. According to Sousa (2009) the distinction is based on the existence of an invisible line that differentiates between the things that I can know or the things that don’t make sense that I know. Quijano (2009) derives it from a colonial structure and, in this sense, he stresses the importance of the difference between peripheral and central countries drawn by Wallerstein (1984). Abyssal thought, according to Sousa (see Sousa, 2009; Arriscado, 2009) characterize the modern view of scientific knowledge, only a type of knowledge could be consider as truth - a scientific truth.

Post-abyssal thought is called as ecology of knowledge. It is related to a different approach including the diversity of traditional, indigenous knowledge. According to Sousa,

> The ecology of knowledge doesn’t conceive knowledge in abstract, but as practices of knowledge that they made possible or prevent specific actions in the real world... life experiences of the oppressed are intelligible to them because of an epistemology of the consequences. In their world [the world of the oppressed] consequences always are before causes (Santos, 2009, pp. 50-51, my own translation).

The understanding of the world, in a Freirean way, is a collective experience linked with the environment where the process of creating knowledge takes place. Thus, knowledge emerges from the grassroots, means a collective work of interpretation and become Participatory Research to transform the nearest real world.

As Demo (1986) states, the criteria for evaluating knowledge is related to the utility of the knowledge to improve people’s daily life. In a radical view, this is - according to the author - the scientific knowledge.

> The shift of knowledge in something that can be an object of private property, separated from who has produced it, transported, bought and sold,... is, in fact, a form of obscurantist elimination of both knowledge and experiences, in the name of its own rationality and its subordination to a specific epistemological characteristics associates to modern science (Arriscado, 2009, p. 235, my own translation).

One of the major tasks that are necessary to make in the process of co-creating knowledge is to rescue traditional knowledge. At the same time that we are fighting to preserve environmental diversity, we must preserve the diversity of knowledge, starting for the so-called traditional knowledge.

According to Wynberg, Schroeder and Chennells (2009) traditional knowledge is usually shared and collective by contrast to scientific knowledge usually monopolistic and individualistic. Thinking in terms of traditional knowledge it is “important to be aware of the cultural and symbolic, as well as economic, value of a commodity” (Wynberg, Schroeder & Chennells, 2009, p. 7).

Traditional knowledge could be defined as:

> Traditional and tradition-based literary, artistic or scientific works; performances; inventions; scientific discoveries; designs; marks, names and symbols; undisclosed
information; and all other traditional and tradition-based innovations and creations resulting from intellectual activity in the industrial, scientific, literary or artistic fields (World Intellectual Property Organization, in Schroeder, 2009, p. 37).

It is a knowledge developed,

from experience gained over the centuries and adapted to the local culture ... traditional knowledge is transmitted orally from generation to generation. It tends to be collectively owned and takes the form of stories, songs, folklore, proverbs, cultural values, beliefs, rituals, community laws, local languages, and agricultural practices (Convention of Biological Diversity, in Schroeder, 2009, p. 36).

A final issue is related to who is the owner of the knowledge. Some authors consider that knowledge is a common heritage to the humankind. For that, the Convention of Biological diversity

have agreed that access to traditional knowledge must be subject to formal prior informed consent and if such consent is forthcoming, benefits arising from its exploitation must be shared equitably. Today traditional knowledge is therefore removed from the common heritage of humankind, as is the case with plants, animals and micro-organisms (Schroeder, 2009, p. 15).

Deriving from this approach, knowledge is a common good and we have to find a balance between the preservation of traditional knowledge and its commercial applications to industry and consumption.

METHODOLOGICAL FRAMEWORK: DIALOGUE AND PARTICIPATORY RESEARCH

In discussing the links between Popular Education and the creation of knowledge, Souza (1990) suggests that we should seek to answer the following questions: What is the creation of knowledge? What is its utility? Why to produce knowledge? How to generate knowledge in a different direction? I will try to provide answers to these questions by starting from Freire’s concepts and then connecting my reasoning to Participatory Research.

One of the focal points of Freire’s concepts is dialogue. Dialogue means multiple voices and multiple directions. In this multiple dialogue, knowledge is edified at the same time that dialogue takes place. It is not possible to discuss the transference of knowledge when using dialogue; on the contrary, we can only talk about construction.

As Park (2001) states,

Dialogue, in particular, looms large as an important methodological link among the activities pursued because of its existential significance for human life. More than a technical means to an end, it is an expression of the human condition that impels people to come together (p. 81).

This cannot be understood as a simple methodology. Dialogue is the core of both Freire’s philosophy and methodology. Dialogue guarantees communication and establishes education as a cooperative process characterised by social interactions between people in
which new knowledge is created joining and sharing the knowledge that people have. Dialogue, as an educational journey, considers people as social human beings and not as recipients. Dialogue is, in this sense, the starting point to edify a liberating education.

According to Freire (1970), teaching and learning are the two steps in the process of creating knowledge: the teacher is a learner and the learner becomes teacher. Freire stresses that doing a collaborative work means to include community members to ground the work in people's daily lives. This is represented in Freire's terms by the generative themes that emerge in the process of codification/decoding. Dialogue from generative themes lead people to reflect and transform their reality— their community, their village—in the process called conscientização².

The process by which people are stimulated and encouraged to explore their reality and their awareness of it, so that their understanding of both reality and their own consciousness is deepened, and they begin to engage in praxis (Kirkwood & Kirkwood, 2011, p. 172, italics in the original).

This process of dialogue that becomes conscientização is made through the double process of codification and decoding. When codifying and decoding people undertake a collective work based on both cooperation and experience. In this process people’s knowledge emerges, creating a new one on the surrounding reality.

Connections between the freirean dialogue and Participatory Research have been pointed out by Park (2001):

Dialogue occupies a central position as inquiry in pursuing the three objectives of participatory research, and the knowledge associated with them, by making it possible for participants to create a social space in which they can share experiences and information, create common meanings and forge concerted actions together (p. 81).

I would like to stress two aspects regarding Participatory Research. The first is the 'participatory ethos' (Hall 2001, p. 173). Differences between Participatory Research and other methodologies are based on the fundamental role that participation plays. Participation guarantees that the dialogue will come from the vivencia (Fals, 2001). Participation is a strategic element that could aid in avoiding some of the historical links between academic knowledge and power.

The second aspect is related to the construction of knowledge. Orefice (1987) studied an experience in southern Italy, near Napoli, where people were researching their environment. The process involved individuals from social movements in the district and scholars from the University in a continuous process of dialogue and knowledge exchange. It is crucial that two different kinds of knowledge - popular knowledge based on the daily experience and academic knowledge - can reach a mutual understanding that prevents knowledge from colonizing the other in the process of co-creation.

Collecting several works, Regeer and Bunders (2008) differentiate between mode 0, mode 1 and mode 2 to create knowledge. These authors link each mode with the relation between

---

² I have decided to use the original word in portuguese, without translation.
science and society and also with the type of knowledge produced. *Mode 0* produces a mono-disciplinary knowledge with emphasis on sciences and in a clear division between knowledge and people. *Mode 1* means a co-operation between science and society that reached to a Mono- multi- and interdisciplinary knowledge. *Mode 2* is based also on experiential knowledge and practice “and science both actively seek the best way to structure and manage complex change processes” (Regeer & Bunders, 2008, p. 12). Co-production of knowledge correspond “with the idea that not only is scientific knowledge relevant for the resolution of persistent social problems, but that social knowledge or experiential knowledge is also important” (Regeer & Bunders, 2008, p. 14).

The authors characterized mode 2 by the following elements:

1. The method is related to the perspective of knowledge co-creation through participation in societal practices as the communities of practices.

2. Mode 2 is more focused on the process and the different networks where knowledge is produced than in the content of the knowledge.

3. The cycle of producing knowledge in mode 2 is held by different steps of observation, reflection, planning and actions in a pattern similar to Action-Research spiral (Lewin, 1946).

4. “In mode 2, actors are not regarded as people who speak on behalf of others or in support of a particular interest, but as individuals who speak from their own knowledge and experience” (Regeer & Bunders, 2008, p. 16).

The key word here is a transdisciplinary approach, meaning “total integration of concepts, methods and axioms” (Apostel, cited in Regeer & Bunders, 2008, p. 37).

Transdisciplinary is the recognition that science cannot undertake the societal problems alone: it is necessary to introduce different views - people from communities, for instance - and this leads to the co-creation of knowledge. Finally, it is important to introduce training and expertise in the relationships of those professionals working with community members. Skills as mediation could be essential in these processes.

**THE PAULO FREIRE CHAIR AT THE UNIVERSITY OF SEVILLE**

The Chair started to work at the end of 2008. The major goals of the Chair were defined - in 2008 - as the following: to make connections between the academic world and social movements, and to generate transference of both experience and knowledge in a way that creates reciprocal enrichment. This last goal has shifted from transference to co-creation of knowledge.

During these almost five years diverse works were made by the Chair. Some were related to a literacy campaign in Nicaragua including the translation of teaching material, the training of university students going to Nicaragua, among other activities. The Chair has elaborated teaching material devoted to adult education; it has an electronic resource centre; it has also published two books and organized diverse keynote series. I think that in these last activities
we can find the most associated works to adult education and co-creation of knowledge. The Chair has organized the keynote series as a dialogue amongst people - not necessarily between university teacher and people in communities - for reflecting and co-creating knowledge. Focussing in two different keynote series:

How did I read Paulo Freire?
This keynote series tried to organize an open debate about Freire, reading Freire from two different lenses: the usefulness - or not - of his works at present time, and how Freire’s thought can be applied to specific contexts and situations. In short: how some people have read each book and how the book is related to a specific reality. Keynotes were given from May 2009 to June 2010 and, in general, took place outside the University in neighbourhoods in the city of Seville, in villages near the city and in close collaboration with local social movements. To explain how dialogue works in this activity, I am going to explain two different activities. One is related to food security and other to environmental issues.

All keynotes talks were organised in four steps: (1) an individual gives her/his personal vision of the book, trying to connect it with both the specific place we were in and the concrete theme that we wanted to debate: food security environmental issues, teacher training, multicultural issues and others, (2) other people - such as practitioners, members of social movements in the community, and others - presented the main problems connecting the issue to the place, (3) anybody in the room could add something from their own experience, and (4) people from the table responded to questions, clarify meanings, etc. It seems that making connections between the issues handled and the book enable people to create solidarity in the time. In two cases, keynotes were finished with a theatrical performance of their own plays by people from the community.

The book Pedagogy of the City was addressed to environmental problems in a village near Seville called ‘El Viso del Alcor’. The main speech within the book was made by a councillor of the village, and it was related to the danger created by the building of a new railway route. After this speech, other people talked about the specific situations of a community orchard that could allow people to recover their agricultural roots. This is a very important matter because the villages surrounding Seville are losing its definition as countryside and changing to dormitory towns. Then an adult education teacher spoke about his work introducing environmental issues at the school. After the common dialogue, a group of women performed a play. During the following year a seminar on environmental issues took place and a group of adult learners kept working on it in the adult education school.

The book Extension or Conscientização was related to food security. The book was read by a woman who was working in organic farming, and other research programmes regarding food security. After the first reading of the book, two other individuals gave a speech. The first speaker stressed the importance of maintaining traditional agriculture and rejecting transgenic seeds. Next, a teacher from Nicaragua talked on the importance of connecting literacy to agricultural development in the context of Nicaragua. Then, dialogue was opened. In this case it was very important the notion that the ecology of knowledge is linked to the context in which knowledge is created. In Nicaragua the utmost important issue is how to link literacy and production to raise people daily life, while protecting the environment. On the contrary, when people from Spain explain their own situation the major topic are environmental issues. This event was also focused on cooperation issues. In the same line that I stressed before, the keynote speech was useful to understand that international
cooperation is more related to hearing people in the place where cooperation takes place, than only to have the good will for helping people.

**Facts of love and militancy**

It was a keynote series devoted to popular education experiences. I stress an activity in a village called ‘Coria del Rio’, near Seville. It is a village with long and strong tradition on both shipbuilding and fishing activities. To this activity I connected with people from the Adult Learning Project (ALP) to share a specific programme called *Currach Project*. Currach is a traditional Irish boat that people from the ALP recover to the project for joining the Union Canal in Edinburgh. As Reeves states,

the “boat making and communication” project was thus conceived as a way of engaging with young men in a collective productive activity which would produce an object they could take pride in, and use for recreation on the union canal. From the shared experiencing participants would have a story to tell, and something to “write home about”. Anecdotal and common sense evidence tells us that young men who see themselves as educational failures are very unlikely to voluntarily engage in a learning process without a clearly defined purpose. Thus the initial emphasis of the invitation was to come together and make a boat and with the opportunity to improve literacy skills (Reeves, 2011, p.13).

The structure of this speech was similar to the previous but the sequence of speeches was altered. The ‘keynote speaker’ closed and not opened the session. This allowed people to deal with different issues related to the main theme: rivers and popular education. People told about the dredging of the Guadalquivir River, the pollution, the abandon of fishing activities and shipbuilding, etc. At the end people created knowledge sharing and confronting different experiences and realities. This new knowledge is related to the possibilities to produce an alternative understanding against dominant tendencies - in this case to recover the river as a traditional place linked with people’s daily life. These processes also create solidarity in the space.

**CONCLUSIONS**

Adult education is lost into a labyrinth. On the one hand, it is lost on the debate between adult education and the practices of lifelong learning. Some authors (e.g. English & Mayo, 2011; Olesen, 1989) pay attention to two different elements of this labyrinth. First, the shift from a public provision of education to a notion of learning as an individual responsibility. Individuals have to take control of their own process of learning and the public policies reinforce these tendencies.

The individualistic notion of self-directive learning lends itself to a discourse that allows the state to abdicate its responsibilities in providing the quality education to wish every citizen is entitled in a democratic society and shift them entirely onto the learners or large entities such a non-governmental organisations (English & Mayo, 2011, p. 12).

The second element is related to the change from an adult education focused on people to lifelong learning policies focused on the labour market. Historically, adult education has been
an attempt for answering the desires of common people for a better education. This is the
tradition of the adult education. Now lifelong learning policies and practices seem to forget
this and focus on a specific issue, that is, the labour market.

In this situation what is the role of initiatives as the Paulo Freire Chair to define adult
education and learning? I am going to reflect in two different directions. First, the role of
universities regarding adult education. Secondly, the possibilities that creating knowledge
opens for rethinking adult education today.

In Spain there is not the tradition of universities acting as adult education institutions. The
notion of ‘Non Traditional Students’ in its various senses is no longer considered at large. The
University of Seville could provide an example: the university has a specific instrument to
teach adult people, mainly addressed to third age individuals, called Experience Classroom.
But this is totally apart from the regular teaching activities. Usually, adult people do not attend
regular courses at level of undergraduates or master students. Activities are organized
specifically for adults, without an official degree. Almost all activities are done in partnerships
with city halls in villages and little cities and they are mostly related to leisure than to a
specific degree. In this sense, the work made by the Paulo Freire Chair used a similar
scheme with two important differences: first, every partnership were, usually, CSO and other
social movement in each place; second the Chair has always stressed that the most
important element is the people in their own context and not the expert coming from the
university. In this sense, I think that these activities, as the diverse keynote series, are near to
a freirean way of producing knowledge by dialogue. As English and Mayo state, this occurs
“through an interactive process in which the matter at issue becomes an object of co-
investigation by the educator and learners... [encouraging for a] epistemological curiosity”
(2011, p. 14, italics in the original).

My second point is regarding the co-creation of knowledge as a possibility to rethink adult
education in these times of change. In some ways, the work we have done is close to
methodologies as Participatory Research. Relations between power and knowledge have
been emphasized by authors as Gaventa and Cornwall. Basically, the major argument is that
Participatory Research recognizes that “knowledge is socially constructed and embedded”
(Gaventa & Cornwall, 2001, p. 74). For that, Participatory Research “Involves a whole range
of powerless groups of people - the exploited, the poor, the oppressed, the marginal” (Hall,

On the other hand, one of the characteristics of Participatory Research is the reconstruction
of both history and community life (Fals, 1986). This happened in every event by the stories
told by individuals, the actions that people try to improve, the raise of a new - or old and
sleeping - awareness.

In the activities made by the Chair, the most important issue is the attempt to make
connections between different types of knowledge, but stressing the knowledge coming from
people’s experience. This means to recover people’s experience and to re-build it as an
important part of the processes of learning and teaching. This also enables people to reflect
and criticize their own traditional knowledge, (Williams, 1986; Crowther & Lucio-Villegas,
2012). I think that people can do it in the encounter with the others and with their own reality.
From this point could emerge - or re-emerge - an adult education focus on people and on
their surrounding reality that also include the productive system, the world of work and the ancient desire to become a citizen.

REFERENCES


Proposal for a UNESCO Chair in Community Based Research and Social Responsibility in Higher Education.


TESTING AS REFLECTING? PRELIMINARY FINDINGS FROM A STUDY INVOLVING PERSONALITY TESTING IN CVET

Lundgren, Henriette
University of Hamburg
Germany

ABSTRACT

Within continuing vocational education and training, personality tests are increasingly used in workplace learning workshops. But what does personality testing have to do with learning? This study focuses on the test taker’s perspective and it explores what happens when personality testing is used in workplace learning. The material presented in this paper includes workshop observations and semi-structured interviews that were conducted and transcribed in 2012. For the analysis of my findings, I look through the lens of Mezirow’s (1991) transformative learning theory as a high level theory in adult education, with a specific focus on “critical reflection”. My preliminary results show that personality testing triggers reflection on self and others, even if “critical reflection” leading to “transformation” is less present. I also find that “testing as reflecting” is an emotional process. Lastly, I conclude that personality tests can be seen as a tool for self-validation.

INTRODUCTION

According to an ethnographic field study, personality tests are increasingly used for learning and development in continuing vocational education and training (CVET) (Lundgren, 2012). But what does personality testing have to do with learning? And given its increasing use for “learning and development”, what should adult educators focus on in their workplace learning research? One interesting aspect might be the impact that personality testing has on those involved. Do people feel pigeonholed as they are “labeled” as a certain personality type? And what do they experience when receiving their personality test feedback? Do they discuss their feedback with others, and if so, what impact does the sharing have on their own learning process? Put more broadly, what happens when personality testing is used in CVET?

There are different ways of approaching these research questions. One could, for example, place the object “personality testing” in the foreground and situate this study in the field of personality psychology. Questions on the psychometric test qualities, such as validity and reliability could hence be the focal point of the investigation. Another approach would be to focus on the test takers and explore the emotional and cognitive learning processes that were triggered by the workplace training course they participated in. Questions around subjective experience, personal accounts and the individual’s reflective thinking would hence move to the foreground. In this research study, I will go with this latter approach, focusing on the test taker’s reflection process.

Many authors have theorised about reflection. When looking at adult education theory, Dewey’s (1933) “reflective thinking” comes into mind, along with Schön’s (1983) “reflection-in-action”, Boud et al’s (1985) “six elements of the reflective process” and Mezirow
& Associate’s “critical reflection” (1991). Especially in adult education, reflection as a practice of learning and development seems to be a subject widely researched and deeply discussed. Often the aim is to clarify the ambiguity regarding the concept of reflection, what triggers it and what are the outcomes (see e.g. Reynolds & Vince (2004) on “Organizing Reflection”). It will not come as a surprise that defining, ordering and confirming “reflection” within adult education is not an easy task.

For the purpose of this study that forms part of my doctoral research, I chose to focus on the combination of the reflection process that is triggered by personality testing and the test taker’s perspective in a workplace learning setting. More specifically, I was interested in exploring the following two questions:

1. How can we best describe the test taker’s emotional and cognitive learning process that takes place in the situation of personality testing?

2. Can we speak of (transformative) learning?

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

This study builds on Mezirow’s transformative learning theory—or TLT as it is sometimes referred to—, a theoretical framework that was first labelled in the late 1970s and more fully developed by various authors in the 1990s and 2000s (Brookfield, 2000; Cranton, 2006; Mezirow, 1990, 1991, 1998; Taylor & Cranton, 2012). TLT emphasizes personal growth, and therefore focuses on the individual as the unit of analysis, especially in the “cognitive rational approach” – which is one of the approaches that have evolved in TLT (Fisher-Yoshida, Geller, & Schapiro, 2009; Stevens-Long, Schapiro, & McClintock, 2012). As TLT was developed with a focus on describing perspective transformations of and specifically for adult learners, this theoretical framework seems a suitable framework for my study.

A central concept within TLT is the critical reflection of assumptions, which can be defined as “a critique of a premise upon which the learner has defined a problem” (Mezirow, 1998, p. 186). So the learner realises that something is problematic, and hence she or he engages in an act of critical thinking trying to re-evaluate underlying assumptions.

Numerous authors have empirically researched “critical reflection” in various adult education settings (Bell, Kelton, McDonagh, Mladenovic, & Morrison, 2011; Cranton & Carusetta, 2004; Kember et al., 1999; Kitchenham, 2006; Kitchenham & Chasteauneuf, 2009; Kreber, 2005; Liimatainen, Poskiparta, Karhila, & Sjögren, 2001; Wallman, Lindblad, Hall, Lundmark, & Ring, 2008). Some of these studies focus on reflection as an outcome and others emphasise reflection as a process. In a recent conference paper “On Critical Reflection”, I attempted to analyse different approaches to functionalising levels of reflection in empirical TLT research (Lundgren, 2013). I also discussed different qualities that an integrative model could have for future research. Building on my conclusions from that paper, I suggest devising a model on levels of reflection that would:

1. Allow for thematic embedding (Kreber, 2005), i.e. there are categories, for example domains of knowledge or content themes built into the model
(2) Depict distinct reflection categories that are grained to the right level; e.g. Kember et al. (2000; 2008) use the four categories of habitual action, understanding, reflection and critical reflection.

In line with these two qualities, I came up with a rough framework that combines reflection themes with levels of reflection in an integrated way (see Table 1).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reflection themes</th>
<th>Levels of reflection</th>
<th>Habitual Action, i.e. “Automatic response with little conscious thought about […]”</th>
<th>Understanding, i.e. Makes use of existing knowledge to explain […]</th>
<th>Reflection, i.e. Re-interpretation of […] as part of workshop experience</th>
<th>Critical Reflection, i.e. Evidence of change in perspective over a fundamental belief on […]</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[Theme 1]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[Theme 2]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[Theme 3]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[…]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1: Theoretical framework combining themes with levels of reflection

Levels of reflection in the horizontal header across the table stand for the “depth” that reflective or non-reflective thinking takes place. According to most authors, critical reflection encompasses “evidence of a change in perspective over a fundamental belief of the understanding of a key concept or phenomenon” (Kember et al., 2008, p. 379), and is therefore seen as the “ultimate” level of reflection. The scale then slides to the left via reflection, understanding and habitual action. Reflection themes in the vertical column to the left of the table represent the context specific topics that are being reflected on (Kreber, 2005). These differ by learner and learning event, and one aim of this preliminary study is to fill the framework with themes that are relevant to personality testing in CVET.

METHODOLOGY

APPROACH

To study the impact of personality testing on test takers in CVET, I chose a qualitative research design that included workshop observations and semi-structured interviews. Workshop observations, during which I was taking field notes and photographs, allowed me to dive into the setting and context in which the learning event took place. Gaining an idea of the setting, the facilitator, the workshop dynamics as well as the personality test employed were important for me as a researcher in order to be able to engage in deeper interview conversation with test takers. It also helped building trust with the organisation and its members.
WORKSHOP DESIGN

In a typical set-up, workshops using personality testing consist of three basic steps (see Figure 1).

![Figure 1: Use of personality testing in CVET (Source: Own pictures)](image)

Step 1: Completing the online questionnaire
Step 2: Reading the individual profile booklet
Step 3: Doing exercises based on own and team profile

Before the actual workshop, the participants complete an online questionnaire. Upon entering the workshop room, they receive their individual profile booklets. Most workshop designs allow some time for reading of the profile booklet. During the workshop, the facilitator explains the underlying personality model used in the test construction and participants are asked to engage in exercises that revolve around their own profile as well as their team profile. Of course the exact timing, duration and content of these three steps vary, but the general sequence of steps 1, 2 and 3 remains the same.

DATA COLLECTION AND PARTICIPANTS

In total, 13 interviews were conducted with participants of different workshops, using different personality tests and being held in different organisational settings. The material presented in this paper includes six semi-structured interviews that were conducted and transcribed in the first wave of interviews in 2012 (see Table 2). A second wave of interviews was concluded in 2013 with test takers who took part in a workplace learning workshop in a Higher Education setting. All of these second wave interviewees were non-academic employees of a research-intensive university in the UK. The plan is to add these interviews to the empirical material of this study next.
Three females and three males were interviewed in the first wave, each of whom voluntarily signed up to take part in the study. The average age was 44 years with five out of the six respondents stating their age on the interview form. Three interviews were conducted in English and three in German. The interviews varied in length; the shortest lasted only 18 minutes and the longest lasted almost twice as long, i.e. 35 minutes. The interviewing mode varied: the first three were conducted face to face with me travelling to the respondent’s workplace and the later three were conducted via telephone or in one instance via Skype.

Where possible, photographs from the workshop were used to stimulate recall. At least two photographs were shown in each of the interviews depicting scenes of the exercises that were conducted during the personality test feedback session. The intention of showing the photographs was to stimulate recall of the workshop experience during the interview (Fielding & Thomas, 2001). All interviews were audio recorded and fully transcribed into verbatim transcripts in their original language. Interview quotes were translated from German into English for the purpose of this paper. The names used in this paper are pseudonyms, and other names, places and employers have been anonymised.

**SAMPLING**

In terms of sampling method, Betty and Jane were selected using convenience sampling to test the interview guide and to gather first experience in the research setting. Convenience sampling means that I as the researcher had professionally interacted with Betty and Jane before and hence I could easily ask them for an interview. As the personality testing lay way
in the past for Betty (in the 1980s) and for Jane (in the early 2000s), I did not get to observe the actual workshop setting and hence no photographs were used in these two interviews. The remaining four interviews were sampled over a period of five months using a more theoretical sampling approach. Here the aim was to maximise the variation of characteristics, e.g. gender, age, professional experience. All four interviews with Thomas, Peter, Veronique and Kai were conducted in one and the same organisational context, i.e. a large multinational company. They were asked to participate in my study after they had taken part in a workplace training course in October/November 2010 in Germany (Thomas, Peter and Kai) and in the Netherlands (Veronique). I was familiar with the setting as I had been part of team of facilitators for that specific workshop.

**DATA ANALYSIS APPROACHES**

Two approaches were used for data analysis. First, the interview transcripts were coded using a Grounded Theory approach (Corbin & Strauss, 2007) in order to devise reflection themes and group them into categories. The interview transcripts were first "open-coded" (Strauss, 1987) in an exploratory way in order to tailor the theoretical model as described in Table 1 to my specific research subject and setting.

Next, qualitative content analysis according to Mayring (2000, 2007) was used to explore and deepen these open codes further. Qualitative content analysis according to Mayring describes a more rule-based approach with defined steps in the analysis, such as paraphrasing, generalisation and reduction of interview quotes, which I applied in my analysis.

This combined approach was chosen to allow building on theoretical categories and existing empirical research in the area of transformative learning theory—i.e. levels of reflection—while permitting me at the same time to develop new meaning structures in the specific context of personality test use in workplace training. The data analysis was done with the help of ATLAS.ti.

**FINDINGS**

As an outcome of my data analysis, findings could be grouped into three broad categories: "Reflection on self", "Reflection on others" and "Further reflections".

**REFLECTING ON SELF**

Betty might have felt *before* travelling to London for an assessment centre where she applied for a banking job in the 1980s at the age of twenty-six that the job would not be for her. Even without taking a series of personality and other psychometric tests she knew that her true passion lay somewhere else. More than twenty years later, Betty reflects in a lucid and detailed way on her younger self and what she thought when receiving her test feedback:
And I thought: "Well I'm not going to get this job" and actually I don't care about this job anyway. I only wanted to go to London, so I said: "Really I want to be a writer!" (Betty, paragraph 51)

Retrospectively, the situation seemed clear for Betty: she had different professional ambitions and applying for a banking job felt out of place. However, as Betty’s report continued it became obvious that her determination “to be a writer” was the laborious outcome of a longer reflection process where career alternatives had been considered and family had been consulted. Looking back, Betty—now an academic and a published author—could report on her own journey and the testing instance that gave Betty the support and some sort of validation in a rather calm manner.

Reflecting on self can, however, be a very emotional process with both positive and negative feelings involved. Jane, for instance, felt that she had to retire (early) from her position as deputy head of personnel services after reported dysfunction in her team made staying in work unbearable. So she left. The situation had peaked in a workplace coaching session where a personality test was used. The coaching was intended to bring the team closer together but it seemed to have done just the opposite. Jane reported undergoing different stages as part of her reflection process, including revisiting her own personal values, her preferred way of working and also her helplessness to solve the problem:

What I realised was that […] MBTI [Myers-Briggs Type Indicator, a personality test] was telling me that I’d probably never really get to the bottom of it and it was time to move on. (Jane, paragraph 91)

Jane furthermore understood that the work situation was causing her health problems and that she could not let the situation continue. So she went through an emotional journey where she reported to have been “quite upset and anxious” (paragraph 55). The way that a personality test was used during her team coaching made the difference between her and her colleagues so obvious that she could now perfectly understand why she did not fit there. Looking back and reviewing her personal reflection process about eight years after she quit her job was still an emotional journey for her. At the end of the journey, Jane re-oriented herself to become a coach and professional development adviser, and she perceived the final outcome as a strengthening one:

I think it made me feel stronger. In many ways because there was an explanation for this difference, if not an explanation for all the behaviour. There was some sort of explanation for that difference. (Jane, paragraph 199)

When personality tests are not part of a one-on-one feedback session—as in the case of Betty—or a small team coaching session (Jane’s case) but when they are administered as part of CVET or a workplace learning workshop with a larger group of colleagues present, then this can be perceived as emotional stress for the test taker. Veronique is an information technician from the Netherlands who lived in France at the time of the interview. She had been part of such a workplace training course where test feedback was share with colleagues through exercises and discussions. Veronique reports back on her emotional journey during the workshop:
In the beginning I was getting a little bit nervous [...] it’s quite stressing to get your personality out like this before other persons. (Veronique, paragraph 27)

Veronique finds it emotionally stressful to share her profile with her colleagues through exercises but she also believes that understanding self is a good thing. For herself, Veronique has known since she was a school child that she was more sensitive and more aware of people than others. She talked about reading books about her “special gift” and had completed other personality questionnaires with the help of a psychologist friend. Although Veronique also clearly felt the difference between her and her colleagues during the workshop, she did not perceive the difference as a threat: “When I read the profile it reminds me of who I am” (Veronique, paragraph 95). During Veronique’s reflection process she took the workshop and following discussions with colleagues as a reminder of her own personal preference, and saw apparent difference as an opportunity: to learn more about self and others.

In a similar way, Kai, a manager working in a multinational company, appreciated the opportunity to reflect on self and then to share this with his colleagues:

I like it [...] I find it interesting that this is being offered [...] an opportunity to, in the end, to work on yourself. And then to reflect. So, I find it positive. I find it an exciting matter. And then also to give the courage to the people to share [the personality test feedback] with each other. (Kai, paragraph 151, translated from German)

Kai perceived the opportunity to work on his self-reflection was seen as an “exciting matter” that was – as he described it – made possible by this long-time employer who gave “the courage” to the people to share their profiles. From his accounts it seems as if he thought about it in a positive way during the workshop and as if he still perceived it as a positive thing looking back two years afterwards. In the interview Kai said that he personally did not find sharing test feedback with others problematic; he tried “to be himself” throughout the process.

While the stories of Betty, Jane, Veronique and Kai are all different in many ways, they each show that reflecting on self is a very personal process, which can be emotionally engaging and stressful, especially when there was an underlying difficult workplace situation. Differences are highlighted through personality feedback, and often these differences are not new to the test takers; they are only expressed and made visible in a different way. As a consequence of reflecting on self, some interviewees reported a changed course of action, for example Jane leaving her job or Betty deciding to become a writer. But to what extent are these actions influenced by the personality tests? Can test outcomes be so powerful to change the course of action? And can we speak of “transformation”, or rather an alignment of actions and fundamental beliefs?

REFLECTING ON OTHERS

Where do people stand in relation to each other? This is a question that Thomas, a younger colleague of Kai and team leader in the same multinational company, reflected on extensively during our interview. Thomas repeatedly elaborated on one exercise where colleagues were
asked to get up and form a line that would show their score on each of the test’s preference dimensions:

\[
\text{I found it fascinating to see who stood in my immediate proximity […] and who stood further away. And then to realise for myself “OK, where do I stand?” and where do I find friends […] This was good and I still have that picture in front of my eyes […] who stood where during the course.} \quad \text{(Thomas, paragraphs 10 and 12, translated from German)}
\]

It seems that Thomas found this “mapping exercise” useful as part of his reflection process on others as it helped him to get a more bodily understanding of proximity and distance in terms of work preferences. Interestingly, Thomas refers to a picture “in front of my eyes” that he could still recall nearly two years after the actual workshop (and this was before I showed him an actual picture during the interview as a recall prompt). Also Peter, who took part in the same workshop as Thomas and Kai, noted how this visual and bodily exercises helped his reflection process: “The most impressive I found was when […] we stood up in a line” (Peter, paragraph 31). Visualisation was perceived as enlightening by some and sobering by others. Veronique experienced it like this:

\[
\ldots \text{and that was surprising for me that the person on the opposite [side of the line] - I saw them and I thought “Yeah, now I know why we don’t understand each other”} \quad \text{(Veronique, paragraph 15)}
\]

So visualisation helped reflecting on colleagues’ preferences: comparing, contrasting and finding communalities or significant differences. Jane, who had already suffered from workplace distress before joining the team coaching session, also experienced the visualisation in a sobering or even daunting way: “The outcome was that the other two were completely the opposite of me” (Jane, paragraph 43). Being able to describe likes and opposites or similarities and differences is another aspect that evolved from the interviews. Jane elaborates on “the opposites” using technical language that came from her personality profile booklet:

\[
\text{[My] second letter is “N” so big picture intuitive stuff big picture. Certainly the boss I know is definitely “S” and I think the other deputy was “S” as well so they are very nit-picky over details about everything.} \quad \text{(Jane, paragraph 43)}
\]

What can be observed is that the language used here is different from everyday language used for describing people. The technical usage of terms such as “I am N” and “he is S” seems bewildering. What do these letters stand for? And what is the meaning associated? Is this a way of “labelling” people? What is interesting is that test takers seem to learn and adopt this language, as also other interviewees referred to technical profile terms as part of their reflection process, e.g. “I had a colleague […] and for sure he was Blue” (Veronique, paragraph 187). It should be noted, however, that the technical language used by the test takers did not always correspond to how the facilitator made use of it, or how it was described in reference material. For example, where Veronique pointed out that her colleague must have been “Blue”, another person would have described the same colleague as a “Controller-Inspector”. Although the language used was not always correct in a technical sense, it reflected nevertheless the test takers’ perception on terminology and meaning making of the experience. In a sense, one could say that test takers developed a new way of
expressing themselves, a new way of communicating, possibly comparable to a form of “literacy” on self and others.

Different interview partners used the term “aha-moment” signalling that they had come to realise something during the workshop exercises that they were not consciously aware of beforehand:

[…] when we were in the room and when we looked around how people were structured. That was a sort of aha-moment. At first I learned something new about some of my colleagues. […] Above all about colleagues who I knew a bit better already. It gave me a new perspective on this person. (Kai, paragraph 15, translated from German)

What surprised me about Kai’s account was that he had an “aha-moment” about colleagues whom he knew a bit better already. So, for him, the reflection outcome was not most surprising for people whom he was little familiar with, but those whom he had known and worked with for a longer period of time. Kai elaborated specifically on one female colleague with whom he interacts in his everyday work. He had perceived this colleague to be a very approachable person, but he did not think that she would display such a high extrovert preference as part of the workshop exercise. Realising this he stated again: “[…] this was a sort of aha-moment for me” (Kai, paragraph 71). The question arises whether the personality test and workplace discussion really added to understanding colleagues at work and their behaviour, or did it just introduce new “jargon” and the “scientification” of interpersonal relations?

Summing up, accounts from the interviews have shown how reflection on others is different from reflection on self: bodily and visual workshop elements deepened the learning experience and specific language was used to describe similarities and differences. Again, positive and negative emotions accompanied the learning process; “aha-moments” were more frequent when reflecting on others.

FURTHER REFLECTIONS

Reflecting on self and reflecting on others were two broad reflection categories that came out of the coding and data analysis. However, other reflection themes surfaced in my research study, and I would like to report back on three of them in this paper:

- Situational context
- The power of validation
- Pigeonholing

Situational context. Personality profiles can be biased. One reason could have been social desirability or other biases such as personal, cultural or organisational. It seems logical that what the personality profile indicated as an output, strongly related to and correlates with how the test taker completed the online questionnaire. Kai, one of the managers, highlighted this potential bias by describing his inner conflict:
When I saw the [personality profile] result there was a part where I would say that I excluded my creative preference a little bit during the questionnaire. I was torn between different situations at work. (Kai, paragraph 99, translated from German)

So while completing the questionnaire at work, Kai had different work scenarios or situations in mind and in each situation he would have responded differently. Hence the situational context played a role in Kai’s case when completing the questionnaire as much as situational context and the interpretation thereof alters human behaviour in general. Kai reminded me of an important fact that is often reduced to these two words: “it depends”, and a social psychologist might possibly agree that human behaviour depends on the individual’s interpretation of the situational context. Also other interviewees mentioned this situational component or context playing a role in conjunction with personality testing, and it would be interesting to explore this aspect further.

The power of validation. Personality tests can confirm preference and validate difference. I base this statement on accounts of all interviewees who reported enthusiastically about the validity of their profile: “Yes, that’s me! That’s me.” (Thomas, paragraph 4) or “I suppose it made me feel validated in some way that I was – you know – I was like this for a reason or this is how I liked to be” (Jane, paragraph 203). Kai compared the profile to “holding up a mirror” that reflects who you are and Betty appreciated that her desire to be a writer was not dismissed but actually supported as part of the feedback process. Peter’s account on the topic of receiving confirmation and feeling validated was the most elaborate one:

This [personality profile] is a good reflection on self. It’s not about coming out as a totally different person […] it is more about receiving a confirmation that your self-assessment or self-concept is correct. So, this probably validates you a bit that you are ok in who you think you are. (Peter, paragraph 75, translated from German)

It is interesting to note how concepts, such as “confirmation” and “validation” are used by test takers in this context. Validation of self-assessment here receives the connotation of external endorsement, although in another interview it was described as “holding up a mirror” to iterate Kai’s words. Is feeling validated an outcome of reflection, or is it a feature of personality tests? Also this theme of testing as validating deserves further attention.

Pigeonholing. Personality testing enables stereotyping or pigeonholing, i.e. the process that attempts to judge people based on a small number of characteristics or traits. This is, at least, the common belief. I made a point of asking about pigeonholing during the interviews. None of the six interview partners reported back on personality testing supporting stereotyping or pigeonholing in their perception. Peter, for example, acknowledged that pigeonholing does happen in the workplace. However, he felt that personality testing and discussing personality profiles in a workplace learning environment can actually help break down the walls of stereotyped thinking:

I think I got away from this kind of pigeonholing and also from labelling him as “Schnacker” [Northern German for “gabbler”]. I would rather now say, okay, if I need someone who has the skills of a sales person or someone who knows how to act politically correct then I would get him or her on board. So that is going away from pigeonholing and towards understanding where the know-how of a person and his strengths lie (Peter, paragraph 129, translated from German)
In this test taker’s experience, personality testing was seen as a tool to un-stereotype. Or should I rather read it as a more utilitarian approach that Peter adopted after the workshop of how to better “make use” of his colleagues for his own purposes? Other test takers might see this aspect differently and it would be of interest to find an interview partner who is willing to express divergent views on the topic of pigeonholing in this context.

Situational context, the power of validation and the questions around pigeonholing were all further aspects that came up in my research interviews. Each of these additional themes seemed to play a role in the test takers’ cognitive and emotional experience. It is, however, not clear how they are linked to the reflection process: are they an outcome, a mediator or a driver? In my analysis and discuss I will try to give some answers to these questions.

ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION

TESTING AS REFLECTING

Personality testing triggers reflections, where levels of reflection slide from habitual action to understanding to reflection to critical reflection or in between these categories. Was “critical reflection”—the highest category of reflective thinking according to TLT—dominant in each of the interviews? The answer is: probably no. Did each of the interviewed test takers engage actively in reflecting on self and others? Probably yes. From the selection of empirical studies that I had analysed on levels of reflection (see Lundgren, 2013), only one study depicted high levels of critical reflection as an outcome (Liimatainen et al., 2001). Two other studies were seen as displaying moderate levels of critical reflection (Chirema, 2007; Kitchenham, 2006) and three could be placed in the low category of observed critical reflection (Bell et al., 2011; Kreber, 2005; Wallman et al., 2008). So it does not come as a surprise that “critical reflection”, i.e. change in perspective over a fundamental belief was also less present in my study.

I believe, however, that the encounter with a personality test in a workplace setting was meaningful in one way or another for each participant in this study. Whether Kai’s realisation that he had different situational approaches to work depending on the context, Jane’s newly developed form of “literacy” to converse about self and others or Thomas’ observations on proximity and distance between colleagues – each of the interviewees became more aware of a skill they had or acquired something new. This shows one more time that reflection, as an outcome in adult learning, is maybe less likely in comparison to reflection as a process. As could be shown in the findings, the accumulation of reflection in combination with individual experience and dialogue did lead to some learning, even if it would not be classified as “transformative” according to Mezirow’s TLT.

TESTING AS EMOTIONAL JOURNEY

Reflecting on self and others is not solely a journey of mind or intellect; it is – as my preliminary findings have shown – above all an emotional journey. Emotions such as discomfort, anxiousness, stress and surprise were expressed in the accounts presented here. As Dirkx (2008) writes in his article on the meaning and role of emotions: “Perhaps the
most common expression of strong emotions in adult learning occurs around areas of conflict, in which there may be profound disagreement of values or interest” (p. 9). In Betty’s case – the now academic and writer who reflected on her assessment centre experience where she was denied the job as a banker – professional and personal interests seem to have been at stake. For Jane, who suffered through dysfunction at work until leaving for early retirement, a strong disagreement of values such as integrity and respect among colleagues might have been the case. Profound difference between Veronique’s preferred way of doing things and the mostly analytical demands at work could have led to discomfort. All of these three women went through a difficult period or encountered a biographical disruption. The remaining three interviewees who did not describe their personality test as emotionally engaging—notably all male test takers—had also been rather stable in terms of their employment history (to the extent that this was mentioned during the interviews). Personality testing might have visualised or maybe even accelerated some of the negative emotions for some participants; however, I wonder to what extent it would have caused real disruptions.

From each interview it became clear that a few layers came together in those workshops: personal experiences at work with colleagues, an instrument that encouraged re-thinking and reflecting and a conversation about all this with colleagues and the workshop facilitator. As Taylor and Cranton (2013) explain: “It is experience, particularly prior experience […] that is the primary medium of transformation, and it is the revision of the meaning of experience that is the essence of learning” (p. 35). If you think of a mid-aged person’s professional and life experience – 44 years was the average age in this study – and then compare the accumulation of these prior experiences to the instance of receiving a personality test feedback in a workshop setting, then a “transformative” result seems less likely. What can, however, be summarised about personality testing in CVET is that the tests have the ability to act as a mirror or as a magnifying glass. Difference was visually depicted in the workshop “line-up” exercise and emotions were magnified when discussing and comparing with colleagues. In a sense, one could conclude that when experience involves emotions the revision of the meaning of experience becomes more likely.

**TESTING AS VALIDATING**

Other than mirroring and magnifying, personality testing also had the reported effect of confirming preference and validating self-assessment. The value that was attributed to this kind of validation was at times astonishing. Kai, for example, expressed that the test gave him a new perspective on this person and Jane refers to it as giving her an explanation for the difference between her colleagues and her. One possible explanation is that validating is part of the “normal” reflection process that leads to learning. Transformative learning builds on John Dewey’s work on reflective thinking, where Dewey writes: “Reflection means validity testing” (as cited in Mezirow, 1991, p. 101). In Dewey’s definition, reflection can be seen as a means to problem solving where different perspectives and possible outcomes are compared before coming to a conclusion. In line with Dewey’s statement, personality testing could be seen as a tool that helps the test taker in the activity of problem solving, e.g. to question certain prior beliefs or to review presuppositions. In that way, Thomas found the test reassuring, Peter realised his colleague’s potential and Betty could validate her career choice. So testing could be seen as (an additional) validating tool, where evidence is gathered and facts are compared to decide whether assumptions can be revised or perspectives can be changed.
LIMITATIONS AND CONCLUSION

This study had a number of limitations. Firstly, the small number of interviewees (n=6) from a variety of linguistic, cultural and national backgrounds could only give some first insights into the test takers’ emotional and cognitive learning process that takes place in the situation of personality testing. Secondly, the sampling was partially done by approaching people with whom I had already worked (“convenience sample”). This might have biased the findings in a way, as all of the interviewees were happy to talk about their (mostly) positive experience with personality testing in CVET. Also, I varied the interview modes (face to face, telephone, Skype), which could be seen as problematic, and the timing of the interviews in relation to the personality testing event also varied; in some cases it had been far in the past and some interviewees voiced that recall of the exact workshop situation was not always possible. As a consequence, I hope to reduce these limitations by adding seven more interviews from the second data collection wave. The hope is to get a more complete picture and to stabilise some of the variations.

Choosing a theoretical framework that is founded on humanist and pragmatist assumptions and often portrays itself as “inherently good” (Taylor & Cranton, 2013, p. 38), TLT itself as a frame of reference could be seen as another possible limitation to my study. Newman (2012) for example criticises the theory by stating that transformative learning is nothing more than the outcome of “good teaching” and Brookfield (2000) views the phrase “transformative” as overused to a point that it has no more meaning. So complementing my analysis with an alternative learning theory might be a possible way to make up for this limitation.

To conclude, little adult education research that looks at the effects of personality testing in CVET can be found, despite a growing number of personality tests being used in workplace learning settings. This study has offered some insights and reflections on the test taker’s perspective that will hopefully lead to more research interest and a fuller conceptualisation in this area of workplace learning.

REFERENCES


ISSUES OF RECOGNITION AND PARTICIPATION IN CHANGING TIMES: THE INCLUSION OF REFUGEES IN HIGHER EDUCATION IN THE UK.

Morrice, Linda
University of Sussex
United Kingdom

ABSTRACT

Higher Education has become an increasingly diverse and globalised system in which the binaries between ‘traditional’ and ‘non-traditional’ students, exclusion and inclusion have less resonance and analytical purchase. Drawing on longitudinal, empirical research with a group of refugees in higher education, this paper will argue that higher education can be marked simultaneously by belonging and recognition, deficit and exclusion. Complex differences and inequalities remain hidden and unspoken, raising new questions and challenges for pedagogy and for equal participation of students.

INTRODUCTION

Widening education participation and social inclusion have been central concerns in lifelong and higher education (HE) policy in the UK for more than a decade. Underpinning the shift to an expanded, mass higher education system are arguments not only for the need for a highly skilled and globally competitive work force, but also concerns for greater equity and social justice. Policy discourses have recognised the way that poverty, social exclusion and lack of education opportunity combine to reinforce and reproduce patterns of social disadvantage. This commitment to wider participation and equality has been underpinned by investment of resources to improve access and provide better support for student groups deemed to be under-represented. At the same time universities are competing to recruit high fee paying overseas students with individual universities developing policies and initiatives to recruit and support increasing numbers of students from outside of the EU.

With the expansion of HE and the impact of globalisation HE has become characterised by ever increasing diversity: students in HE, whether they are classified as ‘home’ students or ‘overseas’ students, no longer come from discrete places or fairly homogeneous groups. In response to the broader range of HE students there has been a questioning of the usefulness of terms such as ‘under-represented’ and ‘non-traditional’ student in widening participation discourses (Gorard et al., 2006; Watson, 2006). Firstly, because such binary terminology suggests a deficit model whereby such students require additional and separate provision to rectify perceived weaknesses. Secondly because it implies that there is still such a thing as a ‘traditional’ student, whereas there are multiple variables (age, gender, class, family and cultural background, location etc.) which intersect and change over time making simplistic formulations about the experiences of particular groups in HE difficult, if not impossible.
This paper is concerned with refugee students, a group who are not recognised in either widening participation or international discourses, policies or practices. Neither UCAS\(^1\) or HESA\(^2\) collect data relating to migrant background, and as they are not recognised as a social group, performance indicators are not set or monitored and they do not attract targeted educational funding or specialist support. As a consequence little is known about refugees' presence in, or absence from HE, or their experiences once in HE.

For refugees who come to the UK with high levels of human capital, higher education in the UK is one of the key ways that they can re-establish their lives and begin to re-build their professional identities. Once refugee status is confirmed by the UK Home Office, refugees can participate in educational opportunities on the same basis as their British counterparts. For the purposes of higher education they are treated as home students; they pay home student fees and can apply for student loans. However, despite in many ways appearing to have settled into the privileged and sought after position of UK student, the experience of being a refugee continues to play a significant role in their lives, and higher education is a complex experience which enables multiple, sometimes conflicted subject positions. There is no convenient single narrative of what it means to be a refugee in HE, instead the experience can be marked simultaneously by both belonging and recognition, deficit and exclusion.

This paper juxtaposes case studies of four refugees in HE to draw out the diversity and commonalities in experience, and how pre- and post-migratory experiences shape the encounter with higher education. Nancy Fraser’s conception of social justice as parity of participation is drawn upon to illuminate how the multidimensional differences that are associated with refugee students are played out. I will argue that refugees are included in what Fraser refers to as a marginalised or subordinate way and that cultural misrecognition impedes their participation as ‘full partners in social interaction’ (Fraser, 2007). The paper serves as a reminder against over-generalising or universalising the needs of particular groups of students and highlights the importance of individual biography in order to begin to understand the experience in higher education. Despite the radically changing nature of HE brought about by globalisation it underlines the continuing relevance of pedagogies which enable the recognition and valuing of individual biography and what Freire called ‘local’ or ‘partial’ knowledge as a fundamental building block for engagement in learning (Freire, 1992).

**THE RE-LOCATION OF HABITUS AND CAPITAL**

In conceptualising the experience of refugees I have drawn on the work of Bourdieu, and in particular his concepts of field, capital and *habitus* (Bourdieu, 1977, Bourdieu and Wacquant, 1992, Bourdieu, 2004). Taken together these provide a useful conceptual framework for understanding how the knowledge and experiences of refugees’ past lives becomes negated and disqualified; it also sheds light on some of the experiences once in a new and different social space. In Bourdieu’s framework the various forms of capital – cultural, social and economic – are resources which individuals can draw upon to secure advantage in particular fields. Crucially, in order for the various forms of capital to have value they have to exist in a

---

1 University Central Admissions System is the organisation through which applications are processed for entry to higher education in the UK

2 Higher Education Statistics Agency is the central source for the collection and dissemination of statistics about publicly funded UK higher education
field in which they are recognised and can be employed. Only when cultural and social capital has been recognised as legitimate can it be converted into symbolic capital which brings with it symbolic power. The refugees in this study have all come from social backgrounds where education and academic achievement are highly regarded and they have high aspirations. Their *habitus* – the embodied dispositions, expressed through ways of speaking, gesturing, standing, thinking and feeling - and the cultural and social capital acquired, have enabled them to move quite smoothly through education and into professional positions in their country of origin. Bourdieu argues that when an individual encounters a new and unfamiliar field, *habitus* is transformed (Bourdieu, 1990). *Habitus* is permeable and constantly being restructured by the social world.

The case studies illuminate how some forms of capital gained in their past life are recognized as capital in the field of higher education while others remain unacknowledged. The experience of higher education in part reflects the extent of recognition of capital and the adherence between *habitus* and the field of higher education. One aspect of the experience which was common to all was the way the refugee *habitus* impacted and shaped how they managed the significant emotional and financial pressures they experienced in HE. I suggest this emotional dimension of *habitus* is significant when considering the experiences of refugees. The refugee *habitus* is indelibly marked by the experience of forced migration and by the hostile policy and public discourses in which refugees in the UK are situated. Feelings of shame and embarrassment around the refugee identity, coupled with loss of professional status and habituated respect, mark the experience of transition to the UK and become incorporated into the *habitus* (Morrice, 2011).

The participants in this research were identified from a university based course which was specifically designed and developed to support refugees with higher level and professional qualifications to access either HE or employment commensurate with their existing qualifications (Morrice, 2005). The four participants, two women and two men, were selected because they were successful in securing a place in HE, and all attended university between 2006 and 2010. They came from three different national backgrounds, Iran, Iraq and Zimbabwe, and all came from different professional backgrounds. Semi-structured interviews were conducted every six to nine months with the aim of exploring their experiences and perspectives as they moved through their degree courses.

**PATRICIA: CAPITALISING ON EDUCATIONAL CAPITAL AND THE SIGNIFICANCE OF DOXA**

Patricia was brought up in Zimbabwe where the education system was based on the English colonial system and the language of instruction was English. Both her parents were teachers and Patricia trained and worked as a primary school teacher for eleven years before fleeing to the UK, leaving her husband and three young children in Zimbabwe. For the first three years in the UK Patricia worked in care homes, and it was the perceived racism and low expectations of her as a Black African that made her decide to return to HE to study and qualify as a mental health nurse. Patricia described herself as ‘an academic’; she had come to the UK with a strong learner identity and sense of her academic abilities. Similarities between the two educational systems in terms of the learning culture and expectations, and the absence of a language barrier smoothied her transition to learning in the UK. Her experience of higher education was similar to her formal learning experiences in Zimbabwe,
and she was able to confidently draw upon the knowledge, experience and practices she had accumulated, and apply them to the UK. She had a clear understanding of the personal tutor role and the importance of asking for help if needed; in fact personal tutors and support staff ‘...want you to use them because at the end of the day you might fail that essay...’ and make more work for them. What Bourdieu terms doxa describes the immediate adherence or ‘taken for granted’ sense between a habitus and the field to which it is attuned (1977, p.164).

Despite dealing with the separation from her children and working full-time to support herself and her family in Zimbabwe, Patricia’s experience of being a refugee was not disclosed with other students. It was not ‘something that you just lay on the table and say ‘oh I’m an asylum seeker, I’ve got problems at home’. For Patricia the formal learning in HE was marked by a sense of belonging, it provided a way of transforming a racialised identity and proving her abilities and self-worth. However, the painful separation from family members and the need to send remittances were markers of her refugee background and remained hidden distinctions and sources of exclusion.

FARIDEH: STRUGGLES FOR RECOGNITION AND BELONGING

Farideh had been brought up and educated in Iran. In line with expectations of middle class Iranian families she progressed through high school and into university where she studied nutritional science. After working for eight years as a nutritionalist in a children's hospital Farideh fled to the UK. After several years she enrolled on a pharmacy course. In contrast to Patricia, Farideh came from a very different education system and had to negotiate different learning styles and expectations. Entering university was a confusing and disturbing experience as she struggled to decipher the unfamiliar academic writing conventions, the learning styles, technicalities of referencing and the expectations of tutors regarding academic assignments. She made mistakes with her written work and found it difficult to follow and participate with classroom discussions. Her essays were returned because they did not conform to the academic expectations. Yet, because she was classified as a home student for fee purposes she was unable to locate or access the support services available to international students who might experience similar difficulties.

Farideh did not question her tutors and was reluctant to approach them for help, but she was critical of the expectations the system placed on students and the lack of clarity and transparency about those expectations:

Some lecturers give you a lot and you have to find a little. And some give you a little and you have to find a lot, but I still don’t know which one is what. I have to learn how to pick up what I need. They don’t really help.

She struggled with what Lillis (2001) refers to an ‘institutional practice of mystery’: the literacy practices are not made explicit and yet these practices represent particular ways of knowing and being which ‘privileges the discursive routines of particular social groups whilst dismissing those of people who, culturally and communally, have access to and engage in a range of other practices’ (Lillis 2001, p.39). Farideh was recognised, and recognised herself, as not having much cultural value: institutional mechanisms had fixed the value of her capital and inculcated a belief in that value to the extent to which she was unable to occupy the
social space with any degree of entitlement or belonging. Her story is narrated from a position of difference, exclusion and deficit. She was constantly aware that she didn’t have the ‘right’ knowledge and this was experienced as feeling out of place, and a constant doubt and insecurity about her ability to succeed.

To compound this, Farideh had not established meaningful relationships during her time as a student which might have provided a source of peer support. Alongside studying full time she was working full time to support herself. She had very little opportunity to establish friendships, and being a student was an isolating and lonely experience. Her cultural *habitus* distanced and differentiated her from other students. There was no sense of shared everyday practices with other students as, for example, she didn’t go to bars or drink alcohol. There was no sign of ease or belonging which comes from occupying a social space with others who have a similar *habitus* and none of the social support structures available to international students.

**SAVALAN: TRANSNATIONAL RELATIONSHIPS, FINANCIAL AND EMOTIONAL LABOUR**

Savalan had his own computer business in Iran. His parents had five daughters before finally having a son. His narrative draws attention to the significance of transnational relationships with family members left behind, and the complexities involved in trying to reconcile different aspects of identity. Before starting an undergraduate degree in international business, he took an Access to HE course which provided a solid foundation for the academic expectations of university. The practical experience, ideas and understanding that he had built up through running his own business also gave him confidence; he was able to make links with some of the theoretical ideas and in many ways he felt he had an edge on some of his younger peers.

Although the academic side of university life was not too difficult and he enjoyed being a student, the emotional and financial dimensions were acute. He was working for a security company in the evenings, and waiting on tables during the day time to support himself and his family back in Iran. He describes the difference between himself and some of his fellow students:

> For them it is a different story. They phone daddy or mummy and they give them money. In my turn my mummy or daddy phones me, and they ask me for money, so it's slightly different!

As the only son it was his role to make the decisions and support his parents financially; he felt this responsibility for his family as 'a lot of pressure'. When his two younger sisters started at university he took on financial responsibility for them, which made it increasingly difficult to combine study and work. Coupled with anxieties about his family in Iran and his ability to provide for them, were concerns about his vulnerable status in the UK. Savalan was one of the first refugees to be given only temporary status to remain in the UK, rather than permanent residency (Home Office, 2005). In the third year of his degree his leave to remain expired and he had to apply to remain in the UK; fear of being deported became a constant worry overshadowing his life.
Despite these tremendous financial and emotional pressures, Savalan felt unable to share his struggles with his fellow students or his tutors. To do so would have exposed his status as a refugee in the UK.

Everything they [the media] say about refugees is bad...I am a refugee but I have got respect for myself, I don't want to be down in front of people....it is embarrassing really.

For Savalan, life in higher education involved managing and reconciling different aspects of his transnational identity. Accruing cultural capital was fairly straightforward and he could build on the professional and practical capital he had developed through his business in Iran. His *habitus* was marked by his Iranian culture and the expectations placed upon the only son and brother, and latterly since becoming a refugee, by his vulnerable status as a temporary sojourner.

**ALAN: TRAUMA, BELONGING AND BOUNDARIES OF BELONGING**

Alan, an Iranian Kurd, had worked as a civil engineer before coming to the UK. He arrived in the UK in a box under a lorry and describes his flight from Iran as being without warning and unexpected. His migration narrative foregrounds the horror of sudden flight and his fear at finding himself in an unfamiliar environment, without family or friends, in which he could not begin to imagine a future. His first few years in the UK were spent trying to come to terms with the trauma of his flight into exile and undergoing medical treatment for his mental health.

Alan gained a place on a Masters programme to study civil engineering. Like Savalan he was studying for a degree which was linked to his career before he came to the UK, and he was able to draw upon the calculations and the methods he had used in Iran. In both of these cases the ability to draw upon their experiences and cultural capital was a significant factor in easing their transition through the structures and expectations of higher education. Part way through his MSc mental health issues intervened and Alan had to switch from full-time to part-time study mode in order to ‘sort things out’. Despite these ongoing difficulties he gained enormous confidence and sense of belonging from being a student.

I really enjoy the feeling of being a student again! ...like to be there all the time. It’s a nice feeling. It's a nice environment...Everyone is coming for a reason to get the knowledge, to get the qualifications, to know more about things …

Being a student at university represented more than a means to a qualification. It gave him a positive identity, that of being a full time student, and had significance on a personal and emotional level. It gave him a sense of agency and meaning at a time when forced migration had led to the disintegration of any biographical certainties he may have felt as a young person in Iran. It gave him a sense of personal agency and meaning at a time when forced migration had led to the disintegration of any biographical certainties he may have felt as a young person in Iran. Giddens (1991) describes how late modernity constantly precipitates crises of self, but at the same time also creates opportunities for individuals to construct their own meanings and biographies, what he refers to as the ‘reflexive project of the self’. Similarly, in his biographical study of adults in higher education, West (1996) describes how
education can be an emotional and intellectual resource in helping participants move beyond the fragments of their past lives.

Higher Education is potentially a space in which to manage and transcend feelings of marginalisation, meaninglessness and inauthenticity in interaction with others; in which it is possible … to compose a new life, a different story and a more cohesive self. (1996, p. 10)

Despite this, hidden distinctions marked him out from his fellow students. Like the other three case studies, Alan was having to work to support himself financially. While the formal, taught aspect of being a university student had a levelling effect: ‘everyone is the same so it’s fine’, the broader experience of being a student was marked by differences in habitus and differentials in financial resources and in motivations. He felt some of his fellow students had come to university ‘just for the fun and not for studying’; they had parties and went out most nights. It was a life style that he couldn’t afford to be part of and couldn’t disclose it to his peers. Underlying his story is the anguish which can underlie and impact upon the process of transition and reorientation to life in exile.

The narratives of Patricia, Alan and Savalan emphasise the alternative positive identities provided by being a student. However, like Farideh, they did not have the sense of ease and ‘fish in water’ quality that characterises the interactions of students with similar habitus. They had very different understandings and expectations of family and of the economic realities in which they lived; this constrained and shaped their experiences at students and generated distinction.

DISCUSSION

Each participant was from a habitus which brought particular dispositions, and which framed expectations and behaviours in the new social space. Accessing higher education was a strategy which enabled them to accrue tradeable capital which had value in the UK employment market and had the potential to enable them to re-establish professional identities and regain their social status. The kinds of learner identity which could be constructed and the ease with which educational success could be achieved largely depended on the extent to which their existing capital could be deployed, and the degree of adherence between their habitus and the field of higher education. This was illuminated in Patricia’s case: the colonial education system of Zimbabwe had not only equipped her with the English language skills which even in Zimbabwe were recognised as being an advantageous capital, but also the ‘essayist literacy practices’ required for success in the UK higher education system (Lillis, 2001). In higher education she was able to operate with security and confidence which having the right kind of knowledge and capital instils. She had a sense of entitlement and belonging to social space which enabled her to effectively trade up through education into symbolic capital and educational reward. For the others, whose capitals were not as mobile and were not accepted, access to higher education meant not only improving and developing their English language skills, but also adapting to the new and unfamiliar expectations of the field. Farideh was acutely aware that her forms of capital were judged to have little value. Her cultural habitus as an Iranian woman placed her in a subordinate position because it marked her out as a student of inferior quality in the UK system, unprepared for the expectations of higher education. She experienced higher
education as anxiety, insecurity and feeling out of place. Denied opportunities for capital transformation and trading, the transition and the construction of a confident learner identity was more difficult and her subject position was marked by deficit exclusion. For Savalan and Alan the transition was smoother as both were able to draw upon their previous experiences and the knowledge they had accumulated and use it in their new identity as student: their cultural capital was perceived as legitimate and tradeable and academically they had a sense of belonging and recognition. However, their refugee habitus generated distinction and exclusion. For Savalan this distinction centred around managing the financial and emotional aspects of transnational relationships and his insecure status. For Alan it centred around managing the trauma of forced migration, although for Alan in particular, HE was an important source of recognition and belonging, despite the differences from his fellow students.

What I have termed the refugee habitus is shaped by the negativity in both public and policy discourses towards asylum issues; this has ensured that the refugee/asylum identity is one which is generally disparaged and from which it is difficult to generate a sense of self respect and dignity. Consequently, for refugees in higher education it can remain the 'elephant in the room', imposing a deep shadow on their lives, their decision making and their ability to engage with higher education, and yet it remains unacknowledged and unrecognised in policy and practice. Being a refugee worked as a marker of habitus, generating distinction and boundaries from other students and from belonging. However, this experience has to be seen in the context of global and social inequalities and poverty. The habitus is also shaped by the material realities of forced migration and globalisation which mean that refugees are often supporting themselves and family members in the country they have come from. The financial and emotional burden is acute and yet it is lived as a private, hidden matter.

Fraser's (2007) conception of social justice as parity of participation illuminates how the multidimensional differences that are associated with refugee students are played out. Although refugee students are not deliberately excluded from participating in academic life and social interaction, the diverse learning, social and emotional aspects of refugees lives are not made visible in policy discourse; instead refugees are included in what Fraser refers to as a marginalised or subordinate way (Fraser, 2007). The social status of refugee is not recognised in HE policy and this cultural misrecognition impedes their participation as ‘full partners in social interaction’. (Fraser 2007, p. 315) A starting point towards greater social justice for refugees would be the removal of institutional barriers to participation, such as ensuring the academic and social support structures provided for international students were also available to refugee students. Coupled with this, pedagogical practices which draw on a Freirean understanding that knowledge is a product of socio-cultural conditioning and the ‘partial’ or ‘local’ knowledge which students bring with them, in the case of refugee students their cultural capital, forms the foundation from which other knowledge can be built (Freire, 1992).

CONCLUSION

The four case studies sketched here have highlighted the importance of individual biography and past experiences in order to begin to understand the experience of refugees in higher education. They highlight the diversity of refugee experience and are a reminder against universalising the needs of refugee subjects or over-generalising experience with notions of trauma or victimhood. Instead, agency and complex identity work are revealed in each
narrative. Bourdieu’s framework of *habitus*, capitals and field has enabled the conceptualisation of refugees in higher education not as being in deficit, but as being located in a field which fails to recognise or legitimate existing capital. I have suggested that there is an important emotional and ethical dimension to *habitus* which gives greater analytical purchase to identity formation and provides scope for conscious deliberation of subjects. However, the subjective experiences of refugees in HE are inextricably linked to the wider political and economic framework and the objective social reality of global inequality. The political responses to migration and globalisation are framed through policy and public discourses about citizenship and asylum which are driven by an imperative to restrict the movement of certain migrants and curtail entitlement to citizenship. Higher Education is not shielded from, or immune to these political imperatives: we see them played out in HE through economic discourses which compete for and welcome some migrants (international students paying overseas fees) as desirable and worthy subjects of support and attention, while ignoring and rendering invisible less desirable migrants: refugees.

**REFERENCES**


The research aims to define learning methodologies and tools for students so that the latter may master the complex skills required by the work environment. The education experience carried out by University of Bari is here presented: a research on internships was carried out in order to find out all the activities achieved by students. Writing activities were chosen as one of the most effective tools in order to promote reflexion-related activities, as it is considered the most influencing way to acquire relevance from experience. If internships are part of university learning methodologies which flow into the "working culture", then training for documentary writing is a way to raise students with reflexion-related methodologies. An educational path in which internships and documentary writing are combined will also be outlined. A possible educational methodology for writing training in postgraduate environments will be traced.

1. UNIVERSITY INTERNSHIP AS A RESEARCH TEACHING SUBJECT

Since its introduction in the Italian University System, internships (Tirocinio) have become the key points of adult education (Galliani, 2001; Marzi, Salerni, Sposetti, Storchi, 2007).

Internships are officially part of the Italian educational university courses of study by Law no. 341, November 19, 1990. Pursuant to Law no. 196, June 24, 1997 and Framework Act (Legge Quadro) no. 845, December 21, 1978 on professional education, internships represent an integrated tool with due regard for obligations and mutual liberties between offerors, trainees and enterprises: it is a way to connect individuals, aims, purposes and knowledge from different contexts, reconciling supply and demand in the world of work. Internships do not represent a business collaboration and there is no wage or reimbursement given to trainees: nevertheless, from students’ point of view, it represents the first and true occasion to be aware of real working conditions and environments, thus proving their competences learnt during specialized courses (which are really hard to be proved in classroom) (Baldacci, 2010). This is a preliminary environment in which new and different roles coming from professional education can be met: tutors, mentors, supervisors represent educational and institutional figures which are really detached from academic settings; they are asked to integrate theoretical frameworks and practical knowledge without giving rise to technical approaches but alternating observational and active stages.

Notwithstanding its salient role, university internships have not been defined from a terminological and theoretical point of view, also because their regulation is recent. Sometimes it is confused with other similar forms such as training or apprenticeship. Internships are part of a framework based on active training and learning-by-doing.
methodologies in which a central role is played by being part of a context considering social-cultural values (contextual learning) and practicing expertise (extra-contextual learning). Experience acquired during internships involves students' personal engagement within the working context; on the other hand, it involves analysis and evaluation processes on practice which prove to be useful for students of Educational Sciences.

Many studies dealing with internship-related achievable models and supervising activities carried out by universities are proof of the importance given to internships, considered an opportunity to learn from practice. In Italy there is a relevant amount of examples concerning scientific domains and interpretive categories that have reintroduced Dewey's perspective of learning by doing as well as learning seen as Communities of Practice (Wenger, 2006). The pragmatic model, which implies internships to be a central issue in terms of reflective actions and which generates practical and productive knowledge, has become a theoretical reference point when dealing with internships. Previous studies by D. A. Schön, 1993; M. Eraut, 2001; J. Mezirow, 2003; B. Rogoff, 1984, have confirmed this perspective throughout time thus clarifying, even from different viewpoints, all the different inconsistencies that mark a difference between formal education (University) and informal, internship-related learning scenarios (Perla, Vinci, 2012).

University internships should be endorsed as pre-placement entities: here, students "trigger" intellectual actions as a synthesis of practical knowledge, stratification of expertise and institutional techniques: these actions are not much "educated" in formal teaching contexts. During internship programs, students have the chance to learn meaningful systems, implicit norms and routines which are typical of working environments: these aims are getting more important in High Quality Training Programs throughout Europe. Many scholars (Schön 2006; Wenger 2006, Scaratti, Kaneklin, Bruno 2006; Sarchielli 1990; Alastra, Kaneklin, Scaratti 2012; Bertagna 2011, Fabbri and Rossi 2008) confirm that internships gave a great contribution to the achievement of professional paths for university students.

During internships, students experience a "testing ground", redefine their cognitive schemes, validate their knowledge, compare their skills with unprecedented situations, explore some personal traits such as initiative, risk-taking proneness, self-confidence, planning, autonomy; this experience is useful to assess a possible gap between the acquired knowledge and the expected knowledge needed in professional contexts. Through internships students can acquire experience, being aware of their own competences. Supervisors play an important role in fostering professional subjects: they manage ongoing experience, allow students to establish connections with ex-ante acquired knowledge, foster resilience and coping abilities.

Assessing internships requires the so called everyday cognition methodology (Rogoff, 1984) which can go deep into work culture and understand learning schemes which classroom cannot convey. By embracing a practice-based methodology, research in education tries to assess these new paths and contexts. As for this research is concerned, some preliminary questions had to be asked. For instance: what does a university student think of his/her internship? What does he/she learn during this experience? How is knowledge between experts and trainees conveyed? Can internships transmit all the complex skills required by the work environment (action planning, problem finding, problem posing, decision making)? Universities are asked to define learning methodologies and tools for students so that the latter may master these skills.
2. RESEARCH-TRAINING ON DOCUMENTARY WRITING OF INTERNSHIP-RELATED ACTIVITIES

2.1 REASONS FOR THIS CHOICE

Thanks to an initiative coordinated by Prof. Loredana Perla, representative of the internship program (Tirocinio) activated by the Faculty of Educational Sciences, University of Bari since the academic year 2010-2011, a course based on research & training on Internship-related University Teaching (Didattica universitaria del Tirocinio) has been spurred. The program has two main aims:

a) detecting internship-related experiences among students of the Faculty of Educational Sciences;

b) assessing the effectiveness of an alternative to the traditional material produced by students in order to report their experience at the end of their internship. This writing alternative is called La memoria del Tirocinio (Internship Recollection) and asks of students a twofold commitment: on the one hand, they should meditate on their experience, on the other they should be able to describe this experience. The hypothesis at the base of this research was that a "narrative log" of one's experience may enhance students' experience by explicating all the events that otherwise, in traditional reports, would ever be included. This research aimed at testing with trainees the possibility to create a narrative, documentary writing for professional environments, in order to verify if this methodology may enhance practice-based learning processes even for any possibility emerging after internships. Traditional internship-related reports are often considered functional acts, a bureaucratic duty and a simple account of tasks one has carried out; in this new perspective, instead, writing for internships allows time and space for a more detailed "story". The methodology chosen aimed at giving the opportunity to write one's experience during an internship by writing, working through its productive potential, as it may unleash personal traits of internship students.

The choice of documentary writing to train university students towards the so called "working culture" (and in this sense internships are the first place to carry out this form of training) comes from the idea that writing is an essential tool to train university students as well as adult workers (Perla, 2012b). Writing is an educational tool; it helps students having a critical-reflective approach on the activities they carry out; by writing, students are aware of their experienced events, they provide a tangible collection of events, so that they can cope with future critical situations. Learning to report internships by writing may represent a way to learn a better alternative to face (with more meditation, more awareness, more criticism, more self-control) the complex domain of work-related situations. If internships are part of university learning methodologies which flow into the so called "working culture", then training for documentary writing is a way to raise students with meditative-related methodologies, the latter being of paramount importance for the working environment. Providing documentary evidence of training methodologies and practical knowledge - and internships represent one of the most important examples - is never easy to achieve or to carry out, as it is difficult to explain all the implicit elements that are part of one's experience (Perla, 2010) but also because knowledge during internships is progressively built during communicational interaction between tutors, (school, community, business) mentors and students.
Writing gradually trains students towards critical and meditative analyses of the activities he/she is doing; he/she absorbs processes and products day by day; he/she settles into an environment in which, as a trainee, lives with fears, as he/she is not able to interpret it immediately. By writing students put their experienced reality apart; they can label every experience so that they can face, manage, understand them in the future.

Documentary writing, meant as a complementary tool for internships, has a fundamental educational value, as it allows information coming from contexts to be rationalized; processes can be arranged into suitable discourse-related schemes, and there is a continuous interchange among different actors within (tutor, supervisors) and outside (mentors, employers) universities.

Some possible internship-related writing objects are:
1) Students approaching professional settings
2) The organisational context
3) Supervision reporting
4) Internship project
5) Project monitoring and self-assessment
6) Practice-related knowledge

2.2 AIMS, METHODOLOGIES AND RESEARCH INSTRUMENTS

This research-training, based on collaboration and participation, joins practical people and theoretical researchers, and aims at strengthening partnerships between Universities and local territory/ies, and it is fruitful only if it is useful (Perla, 2010). It also aims at establishing a local theory that implies the adoption of a collaborative status of research, even referring to one or more methodological frameworks used as reference in order to guide research cognitive processes and the choice of appropriate tools. Methodological background in research on Writing and Internship included: empirical phenomenology (Mortari, 2007, 2010; Perla 2010, 2011, 2012b); Self-study of Teacher Education Practice (Loughran & Northfield 1996); narrative inquire (Clandinin & Connelly, 2000).

Research & training aimed at:

a) reading-interpreting internships of pedagogical courses seen from students' direct point of view and analysed in terms of language contents, descriptions and narration;

b) favouring documentary writing skills in students-trainees in order to make internship-related activities worth;

c) drawing from a corpus analysis the distinctive features of writing-related activities carried out by trainees;

d) creating a documentary archive of internship-related processes and products of pedagogical courses, in order to support recorded history and to preserve its memory.

The whole project consisted of different stages.

During the first stage a questionnaire to a representative sample of students of the Faculty of Educational Sciences has been handed; these students had already experienced an internship program, so the questionnaire aimed at exploring their status and detecting possible flaws in order to enhance internship-related education activities. 124 students took
part in the project. Probably due to some limitations in the methodology used, the questionnaire could not identify relevant, narrative-based contents, thus making them "unvoiced". This is why a research&training program was implemented, in which an in-depth analysis of the quality of experience (seen from students' perspectives) and the related implicit traits had to emerge.

Before involving students in documentary writing activities, the research team identified the central issues dealing with research&training; some preliminary, collaborative sessions with students/trainees were organised together with the designated administrative unit of the Faculty. By asking students expectations and ideas, during these meetings the team has decided to set up training sessions on the identification of primary aims, in order to find peculiarities in university internships. Six preparatory meetings were organised: here, three members of the research group met students/trainees (groups of 5/7 people).

During the first two meetings some specific workshops were organised: the main activities were autobiographical writing and dilemma-based cased sessions (Perla, 2010) and brainstorming sessions in which students tell their expectations about their internship; two additional meetings aimed at explaining training contents.

The last meeting was organised in order to outline the essential traits of the research&training (Scrittura e Tirocinio) program and to clarify the role of each student in this project. These meetings were useful in order to "ratify" a sort of agreement between two entities, that is the "research group" and the "students group". Students were explained that this project aimed at discovering narrative research about learning processes involved in tasks for young adults (represented by internships) in order to get, in turn, trainers of young adults.

The last stage of this program was to provide groups with the appropriate writing tool, La memoria del Tirocinio, by explaining them the specific aims of this research&training program:

a) make sure that students/trainees' point of view can emerge by means of autobiographical writing sessions in which their training experience was outlined;

b) validate a documentary writing tool which could be useful to identify explicit and implicit experiences of these training sessions for internships;

c) highlight some possible critical issues so that the whole program could be enhanced;

b) detect qualitative traits of internship-related experience told by students, in order to be aware of these issues (by identifying a specific knowledge of internship activities seen from the "key players" of this activity) and to enhance training (writing activities can be useful in order to create a complementary, educational framework).

The documentary writing tool, La memoria del Tirocinio, followed students throughout the whole internship experience, and it is made of five sections: bio-documentary, planning, narration, evaluation, self-assessment, epistolary. The first two sections ask the trainee to assess his/her activities carefully and in detail, including the whole organizational context in every aspect. The remaining two sections pertain to writing activities dealing with the narration of internship. Here, trainees write their activities as a daily log, thus allowing a qualitative reporting of the whole experience. The final section has been added later in the organisation of the project; therefore, it is not included in this analysis because there is no enough data to
provide objective assessment. Nevertheless, this section includes relevant writings between tutors and mentors in which students are also included; there are also feedbacks sent by trainees to tutors in which they assess their experience and point out any possible enhancement that can be done.

2.3 WRITING ANALYSIS

The whole corpus of documentary writing (divided into two sections: writing on the spot and meditative writing) was analysed by means of qualitative and phenomenological analysis (Qda technique according to Moustakas, 1994 also known as "structural analysis") aimed at highlighting some interpretive categories dealing with internship from the trainees' point of view.

Structural analysis is a QDA (Qualitative Data Analysis) technique which can be applied to descriptions, narrations and autobiographical representation of given phenomena (in this case, internship as a narrated experience by trainees). Its aim is to "represent the experiential core" (Moustakas, 1994).

Similar to GT (Grounded Theory), this methodology considers recursive data analysis in order to verify if the research process yields a faithful representation of a given phenomenon. This means that interpretive descriptions have been checked and verified with students, too, so that they could confirm data to be reliable after the interpretation process carried out by the research team.

The analysis followed Moustakas' stages:

1) Reviewing the Transcript: writings have been read and summarized.
2) Horizontalising the Data: identification and listing of relevant statements towards the analysed phenomenon; these statements have been labelled as "meaningful descriptive units". This stage has been defined "horizontalisation" because it allows the creation of a horizon of meaning(s) by the different writers; this represents the hardest stage in the whole process of analysis, as readers-researchers have to assess and select relevant contents.
3) Finding Themes: after all the meaningful descriptive units have been selected, data is revised in order to avoid redundancies. Meaningful descriptive units are gathered into common fields or "clusters of meaning", so that data is gathered into specific categories.
4) Developing Textural Descriptions: at this stage there is a rough listing of the different categories emerging from internships. This stage, defined as textural, was carried out on both documentary writing types (writing on the spot and meditative writing) in order to grasp qualitative descriptions.
5) Exercising Imaginative Variation and Developing Structural Descriptions: during this stage some possible meanings were interpreted in order to be aware of the essential themes and contexts that could be representative of the described experiences. A structural description of experience is therefore created: unlike textural description, based on the representation itself, this technique focuses on how a given phenomenon is experienced. In other words, the dynamics underlying the experience, representative themes and qualities like feelings and thoughts aroused by the experience are described (Moustakas, 1994, p. 135).
6) Creating Composite Descriptions: this is a creative, synthetic description that includes all previous stages.

7) Synthesizing the Meanings and Essences of the Phenomenon: considering all the elements arisen from the previous stages, the research team could draft a general description in which the "essential, non-varied framework" dealing with internships is outlined, together with its essential qualities (distinctive traits).

3. SOME RESEARCH-RELATED DATA

What may be inferred from students' writing activities?

First of all, a really high expectation level in terms of personal growth: trainees, during their internship, have stated that they want to assess their ability to feel able to cope with "the impact in a professional setting" and its related issues. Another relevant category in terms of expectations dealt with the notion of learning from experience (Mortari, 2003), the latter being a manifestation of a certain abstract degree found in university courses, which can be found in some professional contexts, too. Dealing with professional environments, in fact, creates an undeniable gap between training theory and practice (Vanderlinde, Van Braak, 2010).

One of the most relevant themes emerged from the analysis of documentary writing samples dealt with the reception of trainees carried out by institutions. The majority of students has stated they had a positive reception from the hosting institution: therefore, the preliminary impact on their experience was generally positive. Critical issues emerge when it comes to the relationship with mentors. In detail, students stated they could not have frequent relationships with them neither in a preliminary stage nor during their experience. There is a continuous reference to contrasting feelings and moods: some were negative, as communication within the institution was not always clear and functional to the tasks trainees carried out; some were positive, as some students stated that their internship experience represented an educational experience, notwithstanding its difficulty. Another relevant consideration involved the relationship between trainees and their mentors; the latter proved to influence quality assessment of the whole project according to students' point of view. This relationship, mostly described as demanding, hard, complicated, stimulating, educational strictly depends on the specific, personal and professional profile of a mentor. Personal traits and professional behaviours are considered the most critical elements which could have an influence on the final assessment of the internship experience. Communication with institutional personnel is highly influenced by unvoiced descriptions which have compromised trainees' activities: this is confirmed by the fact that descriptions are not detailed and there is a continuous narration of disagreements about specific tasks trainees were given. Notwithstanding all the barriers in terms of communication, students have stated that the most relevant skills they acquired during internships dealt with planning (courses, Master's Degrees, classes, events), communicative expertise, problem management, social-relational skills; nevertheless, it has to be underlined that these statements are not generally described in detail. This aspect is an issue to ponder: detailed activities deal with public communication skills, while on the contrary descriptions of personal competences in the perspective of a future trainer of adults is less frequent.

Another critical issue emerging from the analysis involves internship modalities: these range from shadowing mentors to a more involving role in the fulfillment of practical task. Activities
like data-entry and "simple" observation of activities managed by mentors or personnel are also described. There are also bureaucratic or secretary-like descriptions: these tasks involved simple activities such as photocopying, telephone answering and welcoming activities. Students have rarely stated they have acquired new skills from their mentors' professional activities; one third of their descriptions explains that mentors are not able to share their practical knowledge. This confirmed that some relational dynamics cannot be established, such as the so called legitimate peripheral participation (LLP, Wenger, 2006). In this perspective, mentors have no minor role. This is why from the analysis of documentary writing samples description is here not easy, even blocked. As for the description of tasks, there are many details about contextual environments on an example-based basis: this informal feature may be analysed by means of additional tools. From the descriptions an environment not always positive may be inferred; routine activities and tasks are often described, thus limiting trainees' motivations.

Writing-on-the-spot descriptions resulted in a non-positive scenario.

Meditative writing sessions, instead, because of their "detached" nature in terms of time, softened the impact of negative statements which can be commonly found in on-the-spot descriptions. A general, positive feedback was given to La memoria del Tirocinio, because it allowed the internship experience to be re-elaborated: students found learning by thinking as important as learning by doing. These writing sessions also allowed the activation of meta-cognitive processes: in this way, enhanced awareness of internship-related aspects may be seen. Action results, action possibilities, experience assessment are more often described in meditative narrations than in on-the-spot descriptions (Schön, 1993). The description of the different tasks is full of details. Many students appreciated their mentor's educational backing (whereas on-the-spot narrations were full of critical opinions): this leads to an active fruition of experiences, thus fostering shared meditative situations (Perrenoud, 1998; Donnay & Charlier, 1997).

In brief, there is a need for permanent training so that students may be included in communicative practices involving tutors and university mentors; writing skills should be fostered in terms of meditation and language competence. University internships, in this sense, are not always formally expressed. There are many positive samples described by students: nonetheless, some insufficient descriptions are present, too. The working environment is not always a good environment: trainees are sometimes left by themselves, and all they could do is to observe other people or carrying out worthless activities. The same situation can be observed in the relationship with university supervisors or tutors: these relationships should join trainees and adults "in a development of potentialities which otherwise could not be conveyed" (Bondioli, Ferrari, 2006, p. 18) but sometimes they are perceived as a "fugitive experience" (quoting one actual description).

In this case, internships become a paradox: even though it is an institutional activity, it goes through "gloomy" procedures.

In conclusion, the representation of internships coming from the collected data is a complex one, though it is heterogeneous depending on the specific context. Generally speaking, though, it is really far from students' expectations.

Quality may be enhanced if professional settings and Universities create an internship-based
integrated system, a model which is theorised but not performed. This system should join Universities and local institutions: in our local situation, this connection hardly exists.

A preliminary meeting point involves testing professional training curricular schemes in which internships are of fundamental importance and meant as a junction tool of practical knowledge. Universities and local institutions should work together, looking for new internship-oriented educational models: in this sense, university courses should be revised (internships may be carried out during the first year, and the total amount of internship hours may increase). This means that theory (University) and praxis (internships in local institutions) should intertwine (a possible reference is represented by courses offered by the Faculty of Educational Sciences, Galliani, 2001). This also means that these models should be based on meditation, performativity, research&training proneness. These concepts may "launch" students into professional environments, as they can gain experience in this particular connection between Universities and enterprises.

Another issue deals with the enhancement of educational practices for students/trainees. This implies education activities in order to improve writing skills, but the problem of communication between tutors and mentors is of primary concern. This issue clearly emerged from the analysis of data: these two figures are hardly connected. Educational communication is fragmented; there is no trace of agreed activities between university tutors and professional mentors. The process of educational backing of trainees is still a subject matter of discussion.

4. TRAINING FOR UNIVERSITY INTERNSHIP BY MEANS OF DOCUMENTARY WRITING ACTIVITIES

This section outlines a possible methodology for university trainees.

This scheme involves writing-related educational knowledge, so that Universities may educate trainees properly.

Writing for internships means to achieve some operational aims: some proposals taken from the collected data was also added, thus approaching empowerment methodologies which are typical of autobiographical education (Demetrio, 2008, p. 267). This project aims at fostering the potential of each trainee in terms of writing skills: writing his/her own experience also means to enhance his/her cognitive and meta-cognitive competence, and this is an essential proficiency for university students.

First recommendation: writing to be aware of oneself in professional settings. Writing during internships means to describe one's experience, but this implies a preparatory, self-analytical and scientific effort. This means that trainees should face this challenge in order to make themselves ready to enter the world of work. Students should look into themselves, looking for their subjectivity or their inner being, as stated in philosophy by Kierkegaard (Derrida, 2002, p. 137). Therefore, in the light of some retrieved data, it would be useful to let students/trainees write about their inner subjectivity in connection with their beliefs and unvoiced fears. In this way, this kind of writing activities have a "secret enjoyment" (Derrida, Ferraris, 1997), or some implicit notions (Perla, 2010) that approach students to professional environments. It is undoubted that this may represent an influence on them. This is why
writing activities may be a useful tool (Cifali, André, 2007, p. 139-146; Perla, 2010, p. 135-182)

**Second recommendation: writing to participate.** Documentary writing for internships foresees a *free description*; nevertheless, since it is an institutional document, it should also be representative, meaningful, clear. Trainees should describe their experience in terms of what was representative for them (such as people, contexts, professional activities; personal feeling, preconceptions, prejudices should be avoided); everything is remembered triggers dynamics of participation.

**Third recommendation: writing internship-related knowledge.** Trainees have emotional peculiarities on a daily basis. Describing what they *feel* means to learn how to separate critical issues, unvoiced discomforts, difficulties experienced in professional environments, but it also includes every positive feeling concerning their experience and competences. This is why they should share these feelings by describing them.

**Fourth recommendation: writing to understand the public-private continuum.** "Mixed writing" in which internship-related experiences and private descriptions are combined should be encouraged. Private life and profession are perceived as separate entities (only few students combined these two fields): functions and roles are clearly distinct. Writing is useful so that students can understand the connection there is between public and private life, as in both domains one’s *ego* is genuinely represented. Writing activities let trainees understand that even professional settings are places in which personal potential may be developed. A profession makes one’s ego come true: it conveys social integration and happiness, provided that the professional choice is contemplated and committed. Internship in this sense may be really useful in order to understand if this choice is the right one or if it is the case to think about another field. Documentary writing activities let students/trainees get to know with the public dimension, as it implies a sense of responsibility. Describing work-related activities means *to narrate* as an ethical exercise. Writing is a way to convey frank statements.

**Fifth recommendation: writing for internships means starting a new professional history.** Internships represent a bridge towards the world of work: it is a place in which young people enter a new community.

In this sense, narrative writing activities gives voice to details, specific traits, connections that are typical of a particular moment of one’s existence. Self-knowledge is pulled alongside knowledge of the *new* arising from professional environments. Writing for internships is like writing another personal itinerary: a *history of an internship*.

Summing up, documentary writing activities for internships may become an ideal, epistemic "place" in which specific knowledge is produced: this may prepare students/trainees to the so called "working culture", and Universities should re-consider this notion in order to train students properly.
REFERENCES


AGENCY AND FUTURE LIFE TRAJECTORIES IN ACCOUNTS OF ACCESS TO HIGHER EDUCATION STUDENTS IN ENGLAND

Piela, Anna
University of Leicester
United Kingdom

Bushor, Hugh
University of Leicester
United Kingdom

James, Nalita
University of Leicester
United Kingdom

Palmer, Anna-Marie
University of Leicester
United Kingdom

ABSTRACT

This paper investigates experiences of Access to Higher Education Diploma students in England in order to better understand ways in which they enact their agency as learners and conceive their future professional trajectories against the current UK policy backgrounds. Using repeated focus groups with 60 students aged 19-54 from seven Further Education Colleges and surveys we generate and analyse the data thematically. Whilst some research suggests that Access students' motivation to undertake further studies is inherently utilitarian in its focus on finding a better paid job, we argue, drawing from Foucault's concept of 'technologies of the self' that enrolling on Access is often a part of a broader project of self-betterment and self-definition.

INTRODUCTION

Across Europe, Higher Education (HE) institutions are being transformed by policy interventions to create mass HE that would satisfy the need of European economies for high-skilled labour (Field et al., 2010) in a global market. Part of the means of achieving this transformation of HE is thought to be by widening participation in it. However, widening participation is a contested notion linked in part to social justice and equality of opportunity and in part to strengthening economic prosperity both for individuals and nationally (Burke, 2007). These are now emerging in discussions on the nature of citizenship and of higher education (Zgaga, 2009).

In England and Wales an important element of the widening participation agenda is the Access to HE courses, which currently recruit about 40,000 adults a year (Quality Assurance Agency, 2012a). These courses were originally established in the 1970s in England and Wales for those ‘excluded, delayed or otherwise deterred by a need to qualify for (university) entry in more conventional ways’ (Parry, 1996, p. 11) in an attempt to redress the balance of
Access to HE courses are designed to assist adult learners (aged 19 years or older) with progression to university by equipping them with the subject knowledge and generic skills. They lead to a diploma that is awarded by regional award validating authorities (AVAs) which are regulated by the Quality Assurance Agency (QAA) on behalf of central government in England and Wales. The courses are usually provided by Further Education (FE) Colleges which are institutions that deliver Level 3 education (A-level courses as well as Access to HE diplomas).

However, recently, widening participation in England and Wales has been redefined as ‘fair access’ to HE through the development of particular admissions practices by HE institutions (Department of Business, Innovation and Skills, 2012), rather than as free access to HE for those people from marginalised social groups who were traditionally under-represented in HE. Since 2012, central government has encouraged Access to HE course providers to target younger people to strengthen the national economy and lessen the impact of high youth unemployment. From 2012/13, changes to the FE funding system for students (DBIS, 2010) mean that young adults aged 19-24 years undertaking their first full level 2 or level 3 qualification (equivalent to ‘A’ level in England) will be fully funded. From 2013/14 older (mature) students aged 24 years or over undertaking level 3 or higher qualifications there will only be government backed loans (DBIS, 2010; 7) unless they choose to pay in full in advance for level 3 courses such as Access to HE courses. This considerable shift in national policy is likely to put off mature students from applying for Access to HE courses as these people are often in financially straitened circumstances because of family commitments and/or modest wages.

The aim of this paper is to consider changing perceptions of self, happening in the course of progression through the Access course. These considerations are framed by Foucault’s notion of ‘technologies of the self’ and in particular, narratives as techniques of constructing, regulating, and caring for one’s self – as knower, learner, and moral agent (Golden, 1996, p. 383). Foucault’s conceptualisations are helpful in explaining certain patterns emergent in the data whereby students’ self-perception improves dramatically in a period shorter than a year.

TECHNOLOGIES OF THE SELF

The article draws from Foucault’s concept of ‘technologies of the self’. Foucault developed this notion relatively late in his work, and it is noticeably different from his earlier ideas of the self underpinned by ‘technology of domination and power’ (Foucault, 1988a) that granted relatively little agency to subjects constricted by various systems of representation. Foucault was interested in developing a framework for analysing the self without prioritising power or desire, as in Marxism and Freudian psychoanalysis respectively (Besley 2005). He developed his ideas using examples from the antique and early Christian periods, as it was his aim to historicise questions of ontology instead of looking for an ‘essence’ of human self or technology as was in the case of Heidegger. Instead, Foucault created an understanding of a subject who is constituted by technology, power, and discourse, rather than one that simply dominates others through the application of these tools.
Foucault developed the notion of four interlinked technologies (here, denoting ways of revealing the truth): of production, sign systems, power, and self (Besley, 2005). A large proportion of his work was focused on identifying mechanisms between the technology of power (based to a large extent on the triad power – knowledge – discourse), but Foucault himself admitted that those deliberations underestimated the importance of agency of the self, and rectified that omission by redeveloping the notion of power in order to conceptualise agency as self-regulation.

Foucault’s later notion of the self is that of a continual reconstitution and deconstruction, whilst a subject is self-determining and capable of challenging and resisting the structures of domination in modern society’ (McNay 1992, p. 4, emphasis mine). Technologies of the self are fundamental in the process. Foucault defined them as techniques that ‘[…] permit individuals to effect by their own means or with the help of others a certain number of operations on their own bodies and souls, thoughts, conduct, and way of being, so as to transform I themselves in order to attain a certain state of happiness, purity, wisdom, perfection, or immortality’ (1988a, p. 18).

A related notion of ‘ascetic practice of self-formation’ link into this conceptual structure, as ascetic denotes here an ‘exercise of self upon the self by which one attempts to develop and transform oneself, and to attain a certain mode of being’ (Foucault, 1997, p. 282). Once again the contrast between the essentialist notions of the self and Foucauldian proposition of the self as being constantly reforged becomes clear. The ultimate aim of such reforging is the independent achievement of an ethical self whereby an individual is a ‘moral agent of his/her own actions’ (Golden, 1996, p. 383). Such achievement is dependent upon the possession of ‘knowledge of oneself’ – ‘the truth concerning what one is, what one does, and what one is capable of doing’ (Foucault, 1988b, p. 68).

Narratives are proposed by Foucault as one kind of technologies of the self, useful in the process of readjustment of the self. In Golden’s words, narrative is useful in education ‘for the construction, regulation and care of selves (as knowers, as learners, and as moral agents)’ (Golden, 1996, p. 383). People come to understand the world, and their place in it through narratives, or storylines. Stories of Access students discussed in later parts of this article follow specific storylines/patterns of transformation, and demonstrate several aspects of ‘identity work’.

**METHODOLOGY**

The study was carried out in seven Further Education (FE) Colleges in the East Midlands of England in 2012-2013. It investigated the perspectives of Access course students, on their past and present learning experiences, the transformation of their self perceptions as learners during the Access to HE courses, and the impact on their learning of the relationships they developed with their tutors and fellow students in the socio-economic contexts of their lives.

It adopted a social constructivist perspective (Lave & Wenger, 1991) and applied a linked case study design (Miles & Huberman, 1994). In each case, all Access course students in each college were invited to participate and asked for their informed consent. They were also asked to complete two questionnaires (an entry and an exit one). The focus group sample
The qualitative data from the interviews was audio-recorded, transcribed and analysed manually using NVivo to achieve a form of thematic analysis. Such an analysis takes account of participants own constructs of themselves and their contexts which then facilitates the interpretation of the data (Miller & Glassner, 1997). The participants were then presented with the transcripts and given an opportunity to comment on them. The quantitative data from the questionnaires was analysed with simple descriptive statistics while the qualitative data in the questionnaires was scrutinized to generate numeric codes that would help to illustrate trends and patterns within the cohort of the study.

NARRATIVES AND THEMES

The findings presented here of students' perspectives of their experiences fall into four themes: reasons for taking the Access course, sacrifices made to study on Access, and future imagined trajectories.

REASONS FOR TAKING THE ACCESS COURSE

Access students enrol on the course for a myriad of reasons and it would be impossible to identify a anything that such motivations share except perhaps a deteriorated economic context of the job market and low wages. The financial risk experienced in previous employment probably underpinned the motivation to enter an arrangement that ultimately held the potential to improve the financial situation of the participant (despite being also fraught with a different set of risks, as noted by Waller (2002)). However, the reason for the enrolment was never given as straightforward financial problems – students tended to talk about updating old qualifications (which due to their age and character potentially prevented them from seeking a new position), as in the case of this student:

Now in my thirties I find that my qualification is out-of-date and that’s why I’m returning to education. (Student at College 3)

Sometimes, there was a pronounced contrast between students current or recent positions (the unsatisfactory ‘present’) and what they anticipated would be their professional opportunities upon graduation from University (the brighter ‘future’). In this sense, the future, imagined selves play an important role in enrolling on Access. One student said: ‘…now I’ve got more of a career aspiration…’, indicating that Access is a means to an end: having a career, instead of just having a job.

Importantly however, it is not just the job/career opportunities that are seen to improve with a new qualification: the entire self is seen as being improved, and this is expressed by often used phrases ‘to better myself’ or to ‘do better’ as in the case of two students:
So I cut all my hours down at work to come and do this course really so I could just better myself, get a better job, enjoy it. (Student at College 7)

I was unhappy in my current job and I wanted to sort of do better than I was doing before. (Student at College 7)

In both extracts the concept of bettering the self is bound with a more enjoyable, satisfactory job. Importantly, neither student referred to a ‘better-paid’ job; similarly to Waller’s (2002) research, the job satisfaction was clearly much more important than earning potential.

Participants often appear disillusioned with their current or recent situation and sometimes they are struck by the realisation that they are dissatisfied upon having a life-changing experience, such as illness or a relationship breakup. The yearning for a job that is something more than (to use a term that is repeated often in the narratives) a ‘dead-end’ job is often a part of a deeper desire to improve one’s circumstances that is bound with an ability to identify and take advantage of various opportunities.

I’ve been working in customer service for a long, long, long time. Figured maybe there must be more to this, more to work and do something that I feel has more value than just serving people. (Student at College 2)

when I spent that time in hospital when I was recuperating if you like after various operations, you kind of look at yourself and think, ‘You really need to take that opportunity to do what you need to do when you can do it’. (Student at College 7)

In our sample, there was little evidence that family members were against the participant committing to a year in college and following that, three years at university, as Waller (2002) and Reay (2001, 2002 & 2003) indicated in their studies of Access students’ experiences. In contrast, students felt that family members not only supported them in their decision, but provided inspiration to study and ‘better themselves’. The example below also demonstrates that one’s identity as a learner and as a spouse/parent are not separate, but complement each other.

I’ve always wanted to go to university. Never really had the confidence to think that I would ever be able to until I sort of met my husband. And now I’ve had my little boy, I want to set him a good example. (Student at College 7)

Other students also emphasised other aspects of their future imagined professions than strictly monetary. For example, women (who constitute almost 75% of the Access population in England) who go into ‘caring’ professions such as nursing and midwifery often indicate that their decision to enrol on Access was influenced by the need to help others and to be altruistic (Waller 2002). As in Reay’s study (2003), the wish to study was linked to a desire to make a contribution to society. Below, the first excerpt illustrates the motivation of a woman in her thirties who experienced post-natal depression and received a great deal of support from her midwife; the second one is from a narrative of an ex-social worker who wanted to be a paramedic:
my midwife really, really helped me [after the birth of my baby] and I thought that if I could ever help anybody like that, it would mean so much to me and that’s what spurred me on (Student at College 3)

I work with people that have got physical and mental disabilities already, I had an incident where I had to go to hospital with one of our tenants and on the way to the hospital we came across an accident that had happened and there was no other emergency services there apart from our ambulance. And from them on it was just like, ‘I want to be a paramedic. I want to go into nursing.’ That just sort of gave me the kick and I started looking around and seeing what I could do and came across the Access course. (Student at College 6)

These narratives reveal the gendered positioning of the speakers: it is a socially acceptable thing for females to want to help others, be nurturing and caring, and it positions them in a more favourable light than leaving the family in order to lay foundations for a professional career. Here caring for the self is linked to caring for others (Golden, 1996).

As Waller (2002) notes, altruistic motivations are not recognised by policy that focuses on students improving their qualifications in order to earn more money. Many students in our sample were already in employment and although many expressed dissatisfaction with it, they did not indicate that while employed, they were in a difficult position. Despite the label of ‘disadvantaged’ students (a label generally resented by Access students who are nevertheless referred to in these terms by policy makers), they said in interviews that their roles included, for example, an estate agent, bank clerk, shop assistant, which allow a reasonably affluent lifestyle. One participant from College 7 who later got accepted on a Criminology university course, said:

My last job was working for the IPCC, the Independent Police Complaints Commission, and I was basically doing a role where it was good money. It was very good money but a lot of the things I was going, I was basically being an unpaid solicitor. I was doing a lot of work towards that but didn’t have the title.

The described role offered a range of advantages, it was based at a prestigious institution, was well paid, and mentally stimulating. However, the participant felt that two things it lacked was recognition of her skills and a clear progression path. In that sense, she had career aspirations that could not be met by her role, and she made the decision to leave it (despite the financial security it offered) and enter much more precarious circumstances of being an Access student.

Despite the very varied range of motivations to start the Access course, students’ narratives describing their reasoning related to coming back to institution-based education share two things: they are in stark contrast to government’s discourse of inclusion of ‘deprived’ citizens in a competitive knowledge economy that forms a basis for a neoliberal educational project whereby students enter commercialised educational systems (and become commodities themselves), and they indicate very intricate and profound ‘identity work’, as students identify their positions and related deficiencies (lack of confidence; unhappiness; outdated qualifications; lack of job satisfaction), and then verbalise a need for improvement. In other words, returning to education is not about better pay; it’s about re-forging oneself, and the study on Access is itself nothing short of a ‘technology of the self’. Although the government’s
discourse presents desirable positions offered by Access – those of neoliberal subjects facing the risks of educating individually, yet bearing the responsibility for the national economy collectively, students construct alternative desirable positions, those based, in Foucault’s words, on ‘enjoyment of the self’ (Foucault, 1988b, p. 68) in the knowledge that one is fulfilling one’s potential instead of wasting it in unsatisfactory occupations. This is not a straightforward process; hard decisions have to be made to give up sources of income, however unstimulating and unpromising, and students have to return to an educational institution which, although different from primary and middle school, may bear unpleasant associations with earlier education (which for many Access students was a traumatic experience). Overcoming these obstacles is part of what Foucault describes as ‘exercises, practical tasks, various activities’ (1988b, p. 50) that are the basis for the regulation of the self.

**SACRIFICES MADE TO STUDY ON ACCESS**

Whilst financial gain (as a result of more ‘professional’ employment) is not the aim for many Access students, it is important to note that enrolment on Access often means a deterioration in students’ financial situation due to partial or full surrender of employment due to time constraints, and in some cases, course fees as well as additional costs such as childcare and travel.

I suppose life isn’t all about money at the end of the day isn’t it, but you’ve took a complete drop in your wages. Like people have gone from working full-time to either not working at all or cutting their hours right down. (Student at College 7)

Some participants openly admit that they would not be able to cope financially without the support of their partners. This respondent explains the harsh financial reality of being a mature student:

I’ve had to drop down to twenty-five hours but I was working thirty-five hours a week. So I’ve lost approximately three hundred and fifty pounds a month on my wages, which is hard. I’ve got a house to pay for and a car to pay for and other bills. So it is hard, but I know that I’ve got a supportive partner who is helping me as well. He’s picked up hours at work. We do help each other out and I know that at the end of this course I am going to be able to benefit from that. (Student at College 3)

The fact that she has a supportive partner means that she is not reliant on state financial help. The couple negotiate the risk of decreased wages together. So compared to a participant from another college who was on her own, she was in a slightly better position. The next excerpt comes from a single female student:

I had no money at all last year and [my tutor] noticed I wasn’t eating when I was at college and so she sorted me like a food card which I’ll still be getting this year so that I can get lunch or anything like that. Any money that I did have I was having to spend on bus fare to get here. So she managed to sort out a bus pass so that I can get here. Things like that. (Student at College 4)
Very varied circumstances of students may lead to very different levels of financial support. Factors like age (19-24) and already possessed qualifications (not higher than Level 3) may qualify students for free study; the income level and number of children may qualify the student for additional financial grants either from the state or the college. In the focus group at College 5 students recognised this differentiation/inequity and debated thus:

*Speaker 1:* I think people are here to learn. They want to learn. They obviously want to better their lives. I understand that we have tuition fees at university or whatever, but this year course nationally should be free for anyone who wants to do it.

*Speaker 2:* Yeah because it only means that those people, people like us, will probably be going on to get better jobs, earning more.

*Speaker 1:* Better jobs to make the economy better.

*Speaker 3:* Yeah. Exactly.

*Speaker 4:* Free education is not giving people benefits. It’s like we want to better our careers so that we can be better people.

The concept of ‘bettering’ – improving lives, careers, and selves is central to this discussion. Students recognise that there is an expectation of the state that they are flexible and adjust to the changing economy by acquiring new skills. They criticise the fact that some of them are required to pay for the Access programme, because they see it as advantageous to everyone: themselves and ‘the economy’. In this discussion the policy discourse about individual responsibility for economy competitiveness (BIS, 2010) is critiqued on the basis that the state will benefit from better educated citizens who will contribute to the economy, therefore it should support their efforts.

Students position themselves as rational; the distinction between free education and benefits is important as they separate themselves from the negative discursive subject position of a benefit claimant (often pictured by the mass media in and policymakers in stereotypical and negative ways, as demonstrated by Garthwaite (2011)) and instead take up positions of people who are upwardly mobile and willing to actively support the economy growth through having successful careers, thus constructing them as supportive of government’s objectives. This is an interesting example of how student resist being positioned within a specific narrative, or a storyline.

The financial burden of study (where many students have to work part-time) is just one of the pressures on the students. They often use the phrase ‘spread myself too thinly’ to express the sensation of not having enough time to devote to different spheres of life. In the first extract the student’s somewhat dramatic statement is an interesting counterpoint to claims made by many students in the next section about ‘finding who they really are’. An identity struggle like the one described below is linked to a difficulty related to losing the sense of belonging (Reay, 2001).

*Sometimes I lose myself. I feel like I’m losing my personality just because of these essays... you’re doing all that but you can’t spread yourself any thinner enough to be there for your friends.* (Student at College 2)

In the second extract we see that the pressures of study create a situation where a student feels a lack of freedom, but at the same time understands this is a result of their own choice,
and therefore, their own responsibility. A similar sense of inner conflict is experienced by many students we interviewed.

Like I know it shouldn’t matter because I’ve chosen to do the course, but you still want a bit of freedom. And I feel like I don’t see any of my friends. I don’t go out anymore. Which is fine because it’s the choice I’ve made to come here, but I think sometimes you just... (Student at College 7)

Regulation of the self through, among others, readjustment of daily routine is necessary in the wider project of identity work. A student has to reconstitute themselves through education, and experiences a loss of interactions that formed the basis of the ‘old self’.

**FUTURE IMAGINED TRAJECTORIES**

At this point in their Access course (December-January) the students still did not have a crystallised idea of what their future will be. However, they construct a strong contrast between the ‘past’ and ‘future’. The past is associated with negative experiences such as ‘wasting their life’ as mentioned in the next extract, followed by narratives of personal growth during the Access year to very positive imagined future trajectories and opportunities.

*Speaker 1:* We’ve all got that little sparkle like that if we don’t do it, we’re just wasting our life like again. I think because we’ve all like learnt from our past experiences and we’ve grown as individuals and we know where our end goal is going to be basically and if we don’t do this, we can’t achieve that finish line.

*Speaker 2:* It’s like a second chance. (Students at College 2)

It is notable how this student talks of the old, ‘pre-Access’. The phrase ‘wasting life’ indicates a rather negative perception. Coupled with ‘learnt from our past experiences’ and ‘second chance’ it suggests a narrative of a thorough, positive internal transformation, almost as in the narrative of a converted sinner; this story seems to be framed by the neoliberal discourse that assesses an individual’s value based on their capacity for their economic contribution and wealth generation. The participant positions themselves as someone on a mission, with a very clear objective, which could be either completing the Access course, getting into university, completing it, or establishing a successful career. This binary between previous, wasted life and future life full of opportunity and personal growth suggests that studying on Access can definitely be construed as a technology of the self.

The ‘finding oneself’ narrative, evident in the next two extracts, has been also identified by Reay (2002) who sees it as problematic especially since it collides with the narratives of authenticity. She writes: ‘In the twenty-first century growing numbers of the working classes are caught up in education either as escape, as a project for maximizing and fulfilling the self or a complicated mixture of the two’ (Reay 2001, p. 336). For students in our study the ‘true self’ is the self that is a vehicle to self-realisation which in turn is constructed as an outcome of successful Access completion. Access helps students move their goalposts and test themselves against them – this has very profound effects on their self-perception.

*Speaker 1:* So in Access, yeah it’s really helped me to find out who I am and I can be what I want because it’s the choice that I’ve made and that choice will take me to my
destination. So it's just a matter of taking your dream and be what you want to be and your confidence. Speaker 2: I feel quite moved by that because that's how I feel but I couldn't have said that better myself. You do. You find out who you are. (Students at College 2)

But I think we're quite focused on what we want to do, where we want to go and what… We know what we want to do. We're not just, you know, gone through the motions of gone to university… We've got our own path. We know where we're going. We know what we're going to do with it and know how to apply it. (Student at College 7)

The last of these extracts illustrates another viewpoint which is also based on a binary between the old and future life:

For me like it's probably a bigger focus to get to university rather than… Because I'm not sure in terms of a career what I want yet, but I'm quite looking forward to going to university and kind of… I want to kind of move away from [city name] and kind of get to know a new city and different people and kind of carry on learning what I'm enjoying learning. So it's quite a big… I want to get the whole. (Student at College 5)

Here, the student does not talk of finding themselves, but instead appears rather vague about their professional goal. Rather, the focus is on getting 'the whole [experience]' of being a university student. Often Access students narrate a feeling of 'being left behind' by their peers who start university, whilst they remain, perhaps take up jobs or start families. They are sometimes encouraged to return to education by their peers who occasionally visit home but are plagued by feelings of low self-worth and lack of self-confidence. They wish to move into a desirable position of a university student but are often prevented from doing so by their socioeconomic circumstances that underscore the sense of wasting their life. For this student, the university is symbolic of a new life (not just education) as it entails a new location and new social circles. This is important, as identity and self, in the context of education and others contexts, are socially constituted.

CONCLUSIONS

Foucault’s work challenges the concept of the self as ‘core’ and ‘true’. Instead, it argues for a fluid, shifting identity that is actively constructed in relation to the social context. Therefore, it would be too bold a statement to say that the interviewed students ‘abandon’ their old identities through replacing them with new ones.

Instead, we posit that through Access study they are able to draw from more registers and repositories than before, and have a wider choice in constructing their selves through temporarily selecting and rejecting some subject positions (learner, student, employee, parent, spouse, friend) and contexts (such as home, work, school, public space), even if, as the last quote demonstrates, the student has only a relatively vague idea of the desired change.

Understanding how Access learners position themselves through their interactions with others and with educational systems gives important insights into Access students’ motivations, the barriers to learning they encounter and the support they need (Askham,
2008). The paper demonstrates the significance and importance that Access students place on their courses as sites of transition between their current position (present identities), and their future position (identity trajectories).

However, as the data discussed above indicates, Access courses are sites of tension, conflict, and negotiation of meanings for individuals who are situated within them. The positive imagined trajectories and narratives of a reconstituted, improved, or discovered self contrast with negative constructions of the past life that is often framed by expressions such as ‘dead-end jobs’, ‘wasted life’, and ‘being left behind’. The data also reveals that the regulation of the self that underpins this transition entails sometimes painful acts of giving up income and social bonds in which the old self was grounded.

It is an important finding that student refrain from constructing their Access experience in economic terms that form the basis of governmental discourse on Access. Alternative stories and possibilities are presented, whereby self, and the way it is constructed, regulated, and cared for, takes the central position.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The findings presented in this paper are a part of a project funded by AIM Awards and British Academy.

REFERENCES


Waller, R. (2002). ‘Everybody gets one or two chances in life, this is my second!’: Risk and the construction of (mature) students' biographies. *Auto/Biography*, 10.


FUNCTIONAL ILLITERATES AND THEIR CONFIDANTES: 
A NEW APPROACH TO THE QUESTION OF NON-PARTICIPATION IN ADULT EDUCATION

Riekmann, Wibke
Universität Hamburg
Germany

Buddeberg, Klaus
Universität Hamburg
Germany

ABSTRACT

At the end of the UN Literacy Decade literacy has reached stronger public and scientific
attention. Several European studies on functional illiteracy offered striking results (France
2012: 7%, England 2011: 16%, Germany 2011: 14.5%). Studies inform us that the clichés of
functional illiterate people do not fit reality. In the working place and in their private life,
people affected often have strong networks of support.

Despite recognizing the crucial role of networks for continuing education, research rarely
focuses on those people and on their role in the learning process. The study introduced here
shifts its focus from the functional illiterates to their supporters. As the project is at an early
stage, in this paper we will concentrate on the development of our research questions
instead of presenting own empirical results. We will hence focus on two crucial topics of the
study: nonparticipation in adult basic education and networks of support.

INTRODUCTION

As long as literacy programs continue to publicize a homogeneous image of inadequate,
dependent illiterate adults, we will continue to attract only a small number of potential
program participants. Fingeret, 1983, p. 142

In 2012 the EU High-Level-Group of Experts on Literacy stated:

An estimated 20 % of adults lack the literacy skills they need to function fully in a
modern society. An estimated 73 million European adults lack qualifications above
upper secondary school level, many because their poor literacy makes educational

Several international and national surveys support this view while they also show differences
between the European countries as well as between different studies. For instance IALS
quantified in 1994 the ratio of those on level one on 21.8 percent for the UK. The Skills for
Life Survey showed that about 16.2 percent of the adult population can be found are located
on the Entry Levels in 2003 and about 15.9 percent in 2011 (Department for Business, 2011,
p. 5). According to the IVQ-survey in France in 2004, 9 percent of the adult population, who
had attended school in France were functionally illiterate (ANLCI, 2005, p. 3); this proportion
decreased to 7 percent in 2011 (ANLCI, 2012, p. 5). According to ALL in Switzerland, about 16 percent of adults lack fundamental literacy skills (Notter & Erlach, 2006, p. 6). For Germany IALS depicted about 14.4 percent of adults on level one (OECD & Statistics Canada, 2000, p. 136). This ratio was confirmed by the leo. – Level-One Survey in 2011.

The results of these surveys evoked several major questions, such as:

1) How can this high ratio of functional illiteracy be explained? What are the reasons for functional illiteracy in Europe?
2) How do functional illiterates manage their everyday life?
3) How can the people in question be reached and addressed to at least inform them about their possibilities to improve their skills?

How to reach people with low levels of formal education poses a core problem for adult education (von Hippel & Tippelt, 2009). To gather information about functional illiteracy so far only functional illiterates themselves or staff working at education centers has been interviewed or surveyed. As a result those not participating in classes of adult basic education (ABE) have remained invisible for research and public attention. Social networks of functional illiterates have not yet been in the focus of research, although it is well-known that they play a major role in lifelong learning.

The research study ‘Functional Illiterates and their Confidantes’ will focus on these networks of support by shifting the perspective. Its focus lies on the persons of trust of functional illiterates – their confidantes – i.e. on those people who help and assist functional illiterates in their daily life. From this perspective the three questions above can be re-stated as follows:

1) What do the confidantes know or think about the reasons for functional illiteracy?
2) How do they help them in their daily life? What does this support mean to them concerning the time needed for support or possible emotional conflicts?
3) Which different groups of confidantes can be identified and can these groups support adult education programs in addressing functional illiterates?

As the project still is in a very early stage the major part of this paper presents the state of research on nonparticipation in ABE and on networks of support.

STATE OF RESEARCH

NONPARTICIPATION IN ADULT EDUCATION

In general most scholars state that educational systems tend to be quite selective (McGivney, 1993, pp. 12-14). This is also true for the German system of adult education. Adults with higher school diplomas and those in highly skilled jobs are far more likely to participate in adult education than those with low or no school degrees as well as those who are unemployed (Bremer, 2007, p. 16). This is even more true for those with low literacy skills (Bilger, 2012, p. 261).

In Germany, the figure of about 7.5 million functional illiterates forms a sharp contrast to only about 20,000 participants in ABE-classes each year; this is less than 0.3% of the population.
affected (Rosenbladt, 2011). While comparing the large number of functional illiterates with the small number of participants, major questions have to be answered, such as: how can people be reached, addressed and informed more effectively and what are the reasons for nonparticipation?

Bremer (2007) critically discusses the fact that low literacy in general is approached from a perspective of deficit and that lifelong learning is being looked at from a strong normative point of view. He states that in reality the concept of lifelong learning is based on living conditions and life situations which are not equal and valid for everyone. There might be strong reasons against participation. Bolder (2008, p. 29) describes these reasons as being embedded in a subjective logic or a subjective rationality of the people in question.

But what are these reasons for nonparticipation? The discussion about nonparticipation is not a new one. In the early 1980s, Cross pointed out that barriers to participate in ABE can be ‘divided into situational, institutional, and dispositional factors’ (1981, pp. 97-100). This distinction is useful to differentiate reasons for nonparticipation more precisely (see table 1) although these three factors for nonparticipation have been criticized for being ‘oversimplified’ (McGivney, 1993, p. 17).

In the early 90s McGivney (1993) reviewed the literature on participation and nonparticipation starting from the 1970s until the 1990s. Beder (1990) also summarizes reasons for nonparticipation in ABE from several studies from the United States from the 1970s and 1980s. A study run in Ohio by Boggs, Buss and Yarnell in 1978 identified the aspects of ‘being too old’, ‘being too busy’, ‘being not interested/seeing no necessity’, ‘poor health’ and ‘family responsibilities’1. In 1981 Kreitlow, Glustrom and Martin ran a study in Wisconsin, adding as new aspects ‘having to work’, and ‘poor past experience in school’. Fingeret in 1983 highlighted the aspect of ‘missing information’. And in 1988 Hayes identified the aspects of ‘low self-confidence’, ‘social disapproval’, ‘situational barriers’, ‘negative attitude to classes’ and ‘low personal priority’. Through his own empirical research Beder confirmed most of these reasons mentioned above and identified four main factors for nonparticipation. These factors are: ‘low perception of need’, ‘perceived effort’, ‘dislike for school’ and ‘situational barriers’ (1990, p. 214).

These findings also apply to the situation in Germany. In 1994 the Commission of Experts on Funding Lifelong Learning published its final report summing up a number of reasons for nonparticipation in adult education in general and not exclusively looking at adult basic education. Among other findings, they highlighted ‘financial barriers’, ‘barriers related to the workload of employed women, especially those who have children’, ‘seeing no necessity’, ‘no adequate offering’, and ‘reasons related to family or partnership’ as possible reasons for nonparticipation (Expertenkommission Finanzierung Lebenslangen Lernens, 2004, pp. 91–94).

Bremer links the aspect of participation and nonparticipation to milieu affiliation. He emphasizes the aspects of ‘uncertainty’, ‘low self-confidence’, ‘negative experience made in school’, and ‘no apparent benefit’ especially in the case of low skilled and unskilled

---

1 The results of the studies of Boggs, Buss and Yarnell, of Kreitlow, Glustrow and Martin, of Fingeret and of Hayes are quoted from Beder, 1990, pp. 208-209.
employees (Bremer 2007, p. 111). Tippelt et al. (2004, p. 56) also discuss participation in adult education from the perspective of social milieus. As reasons for nonparticipation they highlight the 'lack of information' about adult education options.

The first national survey on low literacy in Germany – the leo. – Level-One survey – was conducted as an add-on survey to the Adult Education Survey (AES) (Bilger et al., 2012). The combination of the AES-questionnaire on participation in adult education and the skills assessment of the leo.-survey provided information on the participation in adult education by the level of literacy skills. Bilger (2012, p. 269) refers to the fact that people with lower levels of formal education do not participate as much in adult education as other groups. Focusing on the functional illiterates she shows that their participation is even lower. As reasons for nonparticipation among functional illiterates she emphasizes four main aspects: ‘people in question do not want to learn again like in school’, ‘they do not see it worthwhile going back to learn because of age’, they mention a ‘poor state of health’ and they declare that they ‘do not have any confidence in their own skills’ to cope with the tasks of learning.

To summarize, the findings discussed above show that there is a wide range of reasons for nonparticipation in adult education in general and more particularly in adult basic education. These reasons obviously do not differ a lot in an international comparison and they do not tend to change over time.

---

2 The leo. – Level-One Survey showed that some 57 percent of the functional illiterates are employed but that a big proportion of those work in unskilled positions. This makes the leo.-Survey compatible to Bremer’s results (Grotlüschen 2012).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cross (1981)</th>
<th>situational barriers</th>
<th>institutional barriers</th>
<th>dispositional barriers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Boggs et al. (1978)</td>
<td>- family responsibilities</td>
<td></td>
<td>- being too old</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- being too busy</td>
<td></td>
<td>- not being interested</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- poor health state</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kreitlow et al. (1981)</td>
<td>- having to work</td>
<td></td>
<td>- poor past experience in school</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fingeret (1983)</td>
<td>- lack of information</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hayes (1988)</td>
<td>- situational barriers</td>
<td>- low self-confidence</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- social disapproval</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- negative attitude to classes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- low personal priority</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beder (1990)</td>
<td>- situational barriers</td>
<td>- low perception of need</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- dislike for school</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- perceived effort</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expert Commission (2004)</td>
<td>- financial barriers</td>
<td>- no adequate offering</td>
<td>- seeing no necessity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- barriers related to workload</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- reasons related to family or partnership</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tippelt et al. (2004)</td>
<td>- lack of information</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bremer (2007)</td>
<td></td>
<td>- low self-confidence</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- uncertainty</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- negative experience made in school</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- no apparent benefit</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bilger (2012)</td>
<td></td>
<td>- do not want to learn like in school</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- it is not worthwhile to learn again because of age</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- poor state of health</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- no confidence in their own skills to learn</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Let us now respond to the second major question resulting from large numbers of functional illiterates on the one hand and very low rates of participation on the other hand: How can people in question be informed more effectively? Accepting that there are strong reasons for nonparticipation but at the same time being aware that missing information plays a role for nonparticipation (Beder, 1990, p. 209; Tippelt et al., 2004, p. 56) we should at least be sure that functional illiterates are well enough informed about the offering of ABE-classes to make a decision of whether to participate or not.

As a reaction to high rates of illiteracy in several countries, national strategies have been implemented to improve adult literacy. In England, the Skills for Life strategy was launched in 2001. Recently, fighting illiteracy was declared ‘grande cause nationale 2013’ in France. Germany started a national strategy in 2011. Part of the German national strategy includes research and practice in workplace oriented ABE, a scheme also followed in other countries, such as Norway (Gutthu & Bekkevold, 2009, p. 26).

In our research study described in this paper, we follow a broader approach: ‘Functional Illiterates and their Confidantes’ shifts the focus from the functional illiterates themselves to their confidantes – persons of trust – within their networks. These networks of support in general go beyond the sphere of workplaces as confidantes can also be found in families, circles of friends or within leisure clubs and community associations. One outstanding question is whether the confidantes can be reached to disseminate information about ABE options and— in cases of low self-confidence of the illiterate adult—encourage them to participate.

NETWORKS

The ability or inability to read and write is not responsible for the circumstances of poverty, crime, poor housing and ill health (…) Fingeret, 1983, p. 141

It is a widespread common belief, that the majority of functional illiterates have a network of support or persons of trust respectively to deal with written language in their daily life. Although the importance of support networks is frequently stated in adult education research, very little studies concerning the support networks of functional illiterates can actually be found.

For Germany, Döbert and Hubertus state that every person with insufficient literal skills has one person of trust, who knows about the problem and who takes over tasks of reading and writing. The authors specify that this person of trust might be the spouse, a friend or a relative. In this relationship functional illiterates often feel dependent on the partner to whom they delegate the writing tasks (Döbert & Hubertus, 2000, p. 70). The German study AlphaPanel touches, amongst other things, on the theme of the supporters. One question asked was who is informed about the reading and writing problem and who is asked for help.
Table 2: Dealing with reading and writing difficulties in the social environment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>My difficulties with reading and writing</th>
<th>Who knows about it %</th>
<th>Who is asked for help %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Parents</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other family members</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friends, Acquaintance</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partner</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colleagues at work</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Superiors at work</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care givers</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neighbors</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Course instructor</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Course participants</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nobody</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sum (multiple answers possible)</td>
<td>215</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Bilger & Rosenbladt, 2011, p. 23, own translation, n=332

When asked who knows about their poor reading and writing skills, interviewees in the first place mentioned parents or family members, as well as friends. Neighbors on the other hand are not informed regularly and hence they do not form such an important part of the network of the functional illiterates (Bilger & Rosenbladt, 2011, p. 23). When asked who they ask for support, the interviewees in the first place mentioned course instructors, followed by partners and children.

We have to take into account that this study was conducted in Germany and that its results might only count for Germany. Who participates in the networks of functional illiterates might vary strongly from country to country and depending on cultural background.

A study from the US shows that even the individual networks differ, although the people live in the same area and have the same cultural background. Fingeret already pointed out in 1983, that ‘one of the challenges adult basic educators face today is the need to understand illiterate adults in their social world.’ (1983, p. 133).

Individuals create social networks that are characterized by reciprocal exchange; networks offer access to most of the resources individuals require, so that it is unnecessary to develop every skill personally. (ibid, p. 134)

Some of the networks are quite reciprocal. That means it would be unjustified to describe the individuals as dependent. But Fingeret also finds individuals that are more engaged in asymmetric relationships; these could be described as more dependent. She defines the positions of the individuals as a continuum between the ‘cosmopolitans’ at the one end of the scale and the ‘locals’ at the other end of the scale. The ‘cosmopolitans’ are illiterate adults ‘who work in public roles, pass as literate daily, and are comfortable with the demands and institutions of the larger society’ (ibid, p. 138). The ‘locals’ are described as follows:

These adults often live in some ethnic or class-related subculture. Social networks primarily are composed of kin, but many include co-workers and friends. Generally,
local adults are not geographically mobile, which reinforces close-knit networks in which all of the members know each other (ibid, p. 139).

Fingeret concludes that educators should know about and become involved in the networks of illiterates, in order to understand that learning to read and write has a major effect on the relationships in their networks and will change the social role which individuals play in their networks.

In addition to Fingeret’s quite unique study, different European national studies of the last years give some hints in terms of the role of networks. The very extensive background questionnaire of the IVQ study in France examines in detail if people need support in daily activities like shopping, reading a map or a letter, looking for work or using a vending machine. Moreover it examines who is the person of support (spouse or child, friend, relative, other persons).³

The Scottish Survey of Adult Literacies found that the need for assistance for daily activities (‘Reading information from government departments, businesses or other institutions’ or ‘Filling out forms such as applications or bank deposit slips’) depends on skills levels (St. Clair et al., 2010, p. 36 and p. 85), leaving the question unanswered of who is the person of trust.

Despite this first focus of looking at the importance of these networks for everyday situations, networks could also help to bridge the distance between adult illiterates and the system of adult education. If we look at the reasons for functional illiterates to take part in a literacy course, we also find some references in the studies.

The Skills for Life Survey shows that participation in adult basic education partly depends on information and motivation given by people of trust. Of all respondents who had attended a basic skills course in the last three years (n=466), about 16 percent had heard about basic skills courses from friends or family, 30% had heard about courses from employers and 29% from college or university (Williams, 2003, p. 203). This finding supports the importance of research and programs in workplace oriented basic education; such programs have started in different countries, Germany being one of them. It also supports the importance of research on social networks.

The authors of the British study ‘Progression. Moving on in life and learning’ examine networks of support. They conclude that ‘the combination of effective support in the learning environment with strong support in social networks is key to helping people sustain their learning and to progress’ (Hodge et al., 2010, p. 6). This study also states the significance of networks of support but examines these networks from the perspective of learners rather than their persons of trust.

Summing up, networks of functional illiterates and their role for the learning process move more and more into the focus of research. The role and importance of networks can be investigated with the theory of social capital. The French structuralist Pierre Bourdieu shows the meaning of social capital as an individual resource (Bourdieu 1983). Social capital exists in all relationships of people. But Bourdieu only focuses on the relationships that are positive

³ Unfortunately we couldn’t find any published results for this so far.
for people; social capital – in his point of view – is always something that could be used for
own interests. In contrast to Bourdieu, Robert Putnam differentiates between ‘bridging’ and
‘bonding’ social capital. In this case he does not refer to Bourdieu, but to Hanifan, who coined
the term ‘social capital’ already in 1916 (see Putnam, 2001, pp. 16f.). Bridging capital brings
together different people; bonding capital tends to form a homogenous group:

Bonding social capital brings together people who are like one another in important
respects (ethnicity, age, gender, social class, and so on), whereas bridging social
capital refers to social networks that bring together people who are unlike one
another. This is an important distinction, because the external effects of bridging
networks are likely to be positive, while bonding networks (limited within particular
social niches) are at greater risk of producing negative externalities. This is not to say
that bonding groups are necessarily bad; indeed, evidence suggests that most of us
get our social support from bonding rather than bridging social ties (ibid, p. 11).

Quite compatible to the idea of bridging and bonding networks is Granovetters research on
the kinds of relationships that are important for successful job search. In his publication ‘The
strength of weak ties’ Granovetter describes the relevance of loose ties in the search for
information. He points out that via loose ties people get more information, because it is more
likely that people have different information sources, if they do not see each other regularly.
Often these different sources of information could be used for a successful job search (see
Granovetter, 1973; Avenarius, 2009). Therefore a network that is homogenous could be
negative for the career compared to a network that is built from groups who are not
connected with each other (see also Hennig & Kohl, 2011, p. 63). The probability of having a
heterogeneous network however increases with a higher societal position.

Examining the process of learning, it seems to be a promising start to look at the role of
confidants because they might serve as a link to other networks. If the confidant can provide
connections to authorities, schools, the adult education system, companies and doctors, he
or she can provide ‘bridging capital’ for the functional illiterates. If he or she is the member of
the same network, only bonding capital can be provided and this will give fewer links to new
resources.

To illustrate networks, some graphics exist drawn by the learners themselves as part of a
study by Hodge et al (Figures 1 and 2). This shows the normal focus of ego-network
research (2010, pp. 93ff.)
In our study we want to shift the point of view from the ego-centered version (left part of Figure 3) to the standpoint of the confidant and their view of the functional illiterates and the learning process (right part of Figure 3).
MAIN RESEARCH QUESTIONS

Following the new focus of research, the study ‘Functional Illiterates and their Confidantes’ has the following main research questions:

- Who are the confidantes and what kind of relationship do they have with the functional illiterates?
- Is it possible to characterize different types of confidantes? How could these different types be addressed?
- What kind of support do confidantes give to functional illiterates and why do they adopt this role?
- How do they feel about their role and at what point does the role of a confidante become a burden?
- Which (positive or negative) role do they play for the learning process of the functional illiterate people?

METHODS

Actors in educational policy are looking for answers in the reachability of functional illiterates. In order to explore the role of confidantes on a broader empirical base, a quantitative study should be carried out. As we know too little about the topic of confidantes, a qualitative study has to be done before in order to develop a suitable questionnaire.

DATA COLLECTION – QUALITATIVE STUDY

International and national surveys on literacy show that functional illiteracy is not a niche phenomenon but touches subgroups within entire societies. The topic however still tends to be a highly tabooed subject. Due to this premise the decision was to run individual interviews.
Based on the Grounded Theory, we started with interviews of a quite homogenous group, unemployed people, working in so-called ‘One-Euro-Jobs’. These are work opportunities for unemployed people. After that we shifted to a group of confidants who have a relationship to the functional illiterates on a private base, like friends and family. And we were also looking for interview-partners with a more professional relationship to the functional illiterates, also teachers, employers, social workers and doctors. 23 interviews have been conducted and there will be some more at the end of the study. Most of the interviews were done face to face (20) with three interviews via the phone.

**DATA EVALUATION – QUALITATIVE STUDY**

We will follow the Grounded Theory ideas of data analysis, giving a preference to the systematic approach of Corbin and Strauss (2008). The objective of the analysis will be to examine types of confidential knowledge. This means we are looking for concepts and categories in the interview material with the intent to bind them together with our theoretical knowledge.

The aim of developing categories and at least types is to construct homogeneity for one type and to develop a range of heterogeneity among the types (see Kluge, 2000). The central idea that will be followed is the scientific-theoretical and pragmatic approach to evaluate theories empirically and to consolidate empirical observations to theoretical conclusions (Dewey, 1989; Dewey, 2002).

**DEVELOPMENT OF THE QUANTITATIVE STUDY**

Once we identified the main categories, concepts and types we start to develop the questionnaire for the representative quantitative study in a major German city (n=1,000). The representative study will provide information concerning the quantity of different types of confidantes and the distribution of the types within the population. On this empirical base we hope to contribute to the question of reachability. Furthermore we will know more about the taboo not being able to read and write and how this taboo is being maintained.

**CONCLUSIONS**

At this stage of the research we cannot draw any conclusions from the empirical material. However, the deeper we go into the theoretical discussion we find more and more hints about the role of networks and the role of supporters for functional illiterates. This supports us with our view that our research questions are relevant for Adult Basic Education.

At the end of the project we might also contribute to the theoretical discussion of literacy competencies. Once we realize that not every skill has to be developed by the individuals themselves but that some skills could be ‘outsourced’ to others, then we could start discussing competencies in a broader way. Hence the view of literacy development would go beyond the competence of the individual to read and write. Literacy in this point of view is a construct and a social practice in the community that is being ‘co-created’ where networks play a crucial role (see Zeuner & Pabst, 2011).
It is important to shift from a conception of literacy located in individuals to examine ways in which people in groups utilise literacy (Barton & Hamilton, 1998, p. 12).

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The authors would like to thank Maria Mamaeva for her assistance in conducting various interviews. She also spent hours of time on transcribing a major part of the interviews and contributed by sharing her excellent knowledge of this material in discussions with the authors. The authors would also thank Kirsten Vittali and Nina Müller for her transcriptions of several interviews.

REFERENCES


Bilger, Frauke; Rosenbladt, Bernhard von (2011): AlphaPanel: Studie zur Lebenssituation bei Teilnehmenden an Grundbildungskursen. Überblick über die Ergebnisse aus Panelwelle 3 (AP 9), unpublished manuscript.


Hodge, Rachel; Barton, David; Pearce, Linda (2010): Progression. Moving on in life and learning.


INCLUSION AND EXCLUSION IN CONTINUING EDUCATION FOR ADULTS: THE CASE OF YOUNG PEOPLE WITH A LOW LEVEL OF EDUCATION IN SPAIN

Salvà-Mut, Francesca
University of the Balearic Islands
Spain

Quintana-Murci, Elena
University of the Balearic Islands
Spain

Desmarais, Danielle
University of the Balearic Islands
Spain

ABSTRACT

In this paper we analyse, from a biographical perspective, youth participation in education and training, aged between 26 and 28 years, who have no qualifications or at most have a qualification corresponding to the secondary education graduate certificate (ISCED 0-2), during the 10 years elapsed between the end of compulsory education (2000) and the time of the interview (2010). As regards their personal life stories, we cover a broad period which includes different stages in the transition into adulthood, stages which take place in a historical context in which we have moved from a time characterised by ease of access to employment among youth with a low educational level to another time in which youth unemployment levels affect over half of the workforce aged 16 to 24 and in which public policies supporting training and social and professional insertion of young people with a low educational level have been reduced.

THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVES

The problems arising from the high number of young people with a low level of education (ISCED 2 level or lower) in Spain are considered to be a major issue in the political and media discourse of our country. The main indicators reveal the disadvantage of Spain within the framework of the European Union: with an early school leaving rate of 26.5% (Ministry of Education, Culture and Sports, 2013a); a youth unemployment rate in the 20-24 year age group of 51.68% (data from the Labour Force Survey for the first quarter of 2013); and 18.5% of young people aged 15 to 24 who are not in education, employment or training (NEET) (Economic and Social Council, 2013). The fact of not having a job and also that of not having a job or being in training are two situations that are found to a far greater extent among young people with a low level of education (Economic and Social Council, 2013, Ministry of Education, Culture and Sports, 2013b).

Youth transition’s into adulthood in general and, particularly, as far as the transition from education into employment is concerned, has undergone significant transformations due to recent social, economic and demographic changes. Despite differences between countries due, among other factors, to the characteristics of national and regional job markets and the
structures of education systems, there is a general consensus in the literature concerning this issue as regards the characteristics of transitions in contemporary job markets. They are the following:

- Lengthening of the transition due to the characteristics of the job market and generalised lengthening of schooling (Furlong & Cartmel, 2006; Wallace & Kovatcheva, 1998; Casal, 1999; Bradley & Devadason, 2008).
- Complexity: transitions have ceased to be linear, and involve comings and goings between several situations of employment and education (Casal, 1999; Settersten, Furstenberg & Rumbaut, 2005; Machado, 2007; INJUVE, 2008).
- Precariousness: youth transition processes are marked by the flexibilisation and casualisation of jobs and salaries (Bradley & Van Hoof, 2005) and young people are more vulnerable to job loss, worse working conditions (part-time jobs, non-formal economy, low salaries) and ruptures (Casal, 1999; Macdonald, 1994; Fenton & Dermott, 2006).
- Individualisation: there are many different shapes and they are articulated in an individualised way based on the interaction of many factors (Settersten, Furstenberg & Rumbaut, 2005; Jones, 1995, 2002). Yet structural factors - such as social class, gender or ethnicity (Bradley & Van Hoof, 2005; Fenton, Dermott, 2006) - and institutional ones - such as the social and labour policies in each country (Settersten, Furstenberg & Rumbaut, 2005; Quintini & Martin, 2006) - continue to have a fundamental weight.

These changes are found in the context of societies in transformation and in the dialectic relationship therein. The social, political, economic and demographic transformations are many, as are the concepts coined to name them, understand them and explain them. In all cases, what stands out is: the focal role of science and technology and, hence, of knowledge; changes in all the fields of personal and professional life, as part and parcel of contemporary life stories (employment changes, family situations, moving home,…); and a growing social dualisation, which is especially harmful to people with greater educational deficits, and which is made manifest in a particularly virulent way in the current economic crisis.

In this context, the level of education plays a much more central role than in the past, and upper secondary qualifications have become the minimum level required for successful entry into the job market, and the basis of subsequent participation in further education (OECD 2005, 2010). In studies concerning the youth transition into adulthood, the disadvantageous situation of those with a low educational level is clearly documented as regards successfully developing the many complex tasks required by this ever lengthier period of life.

Since the transition into adulthood is measured in terms of taking on more independent roles, the fact that the transition time is becoming longer makes it a period of development which for some offers opportunities to explore different situations, to develop skills and to have enough support to do it, whereas those who do not have these chances become even more vulnerable (Berzin, 2010). In the same line of argument, Cote, 2006, quoted in Berzin, 2010, maintains that from the time transition from school to employment has become longer; those who have higher levels of education increase their advantages over those who cannot attain these educational levels.
Although it is hugely complex to understand such a dynamic period on the basis of internationally comparable indicators, a recent study by the OECD (2010) provides relevant data regarding the characteristics of young people’s participation in employment and, particularly those who have the greatest difficulties. This and other recent research studies conducted on youth pathways from education into employment (Berzin, 2010; Hango & Broucker, 2007; Kuehn, Pergamit, Macomber & Vericker, 2009; Quintini & Manfredi, 2009; Walther & o., 2002) clearly reflect not only the youth with a low educational level disadvantages in their process of transition into adulthood, but also the impact of the characteristics of education and training systems on these pathways and the need to develop transition policies that will promote positive transitions.

Along these lines, we highlight the contradictions between the discourse of the knowledge society, transformations in the field of employment (Livingstone, 2010), and education and training policies and practices that largely act as a filter (Arrow, 1973, Spence, 1974, Stiglitz, 1975).

The education role in the transition pathways into adulthood of these young people is not very well known for several reasons. Among these, the low participation of people with a low educational level in the different education options available to adults. In fact, a low level of education in basic education is considered the most significant predictor in relation to a low participation in education in adulthood (Belanger, 2011). Along the same lines, research into early school leaving considers the difficulties involved as regards later access to education to be one of the most harmful effects of this dropout (Dale, 2010). In fact, the concept of NEET (young people not in education or training) was coined in reference to youth with a low educational level who were neither furthering their education nor in employment. In Spain, it became popular first of all through a television programme in which a stigmatising view of young NEETs predominated, as if this fact depended fundamentally on their own free will. The impact of the economic crisis and the dissemination of the results of research into the issue have led to a more accurate, fairer view, the highlight of which is a recent publication by the Institute for Youth with the enlightening title of “Dismantling NEET. A youth stereotype in times of crisis” (Navarrete, dir., 2011).

In a recent study based on the ETEFIL survey 2005 (Transition, Education, Training and Labour Insertion survey for young people under 25 years old), a follow-up of the young people who had finished compulsory secondary education (CSE) in 2000-2001 was carried out during 2001-2005. The results of this research, conducted in a representative sample for Spain of 3,012 young people who dropped out of CSE with no qualifications, show that in this group, which represents 34% of all young people who finished CSE in the year of reference, only 31% resume education (21% obtain the secondary education graduate certificate (SEGC); 2% are in continuing secondary education for adults (ASE) and 8% are doing non-formal vocational training (García, Casal, Merino, Sánchez, 2013).

The adoption of a biographical perspective is a leading heuristic element, to approach the exclusion and inclusion mechanisms in education and training operating in the Spanish context for this type of population, and to provide elements for the construction of a more inclusive education and training system.
We analyse the elements of educational inclusion and exclusion based on a review of the literature concerning participation in continuing adult education (Bélanger, 2011), highlighting the following key aspects:

- A conception of the demand for education and training as a result of a dialectic relationship between the demands of a society or of an organization and the aspirations and experiences of the persons involved. In this sense we consider especially relevant the idea that the demand for training is a social construct in which prior learning experiences have an enormous influence and in which mediation policies are fundamental:
  “People’s demand for acquiring new capacities for action in order to be able to pilot important shifts in their lives is constructed through accumulation of prior learning experiences, either positive or negative. Hence the paramount importance of policies supporting ‘expression and mediation of learning demand’” (p. 86).

- Rubenson’s valence-expectancy theory (Rubenson, 1977 quoted in Bélanger, 2011), according to which the decision to participate in continuing adult education depends on their appraisal as to the relevance or value of the educational activity and on the perception of being able to do the activity successfully.

- The typology of obstacles to participation, which differentiates between institutional obstacles (characteristics of the educational offer, lack of guidance services); situational ones (linked to personal and labour situations which result in a lack of time or money, a low basic level of education); and dispositional ones (self-concept concerning their own learning ability which results in a low level of confidence, lack of projects, irrelevance or uselessness training feeling).

METHODS AND SAMPLE

Given the object of the study characteristics, we favour a qualitative or interpretative methodology based on the biographical method and with an ethno-sociological perspective (Bertaux, 1997). The study of the pathways was approached using a retrospective longitudinal methodology (Casal, Merino, García, 2011) focused on the pathways followed during the approximately 10 years elapsed between the finalisation of compulsory education (2000) and the interview (2010).

The procedure to design, conduct and analyse the content of the biographical interviews was carried out using the contributions of Desmarais (2009) and the experience accumulated by the team in previous research studies.

The field work took place in an urban setting. The sample is made up of 18 people, born in 1983 or 1984, living in neighbourhoods with different degrees of vulnerability in the city of Palma de Mallorca (Balearic Islands, Spain). It is stratified according to gender (9 women and 9 men) and level of education (9 with no qualifications and 9 with the lower secondary education certificate). Access to the sample was obtained from different sources of information due to the obstacles to gain access to young people with the required characteristics, as well as the difficulty that, once contacted, they would want to participate in the research.
MAIN FINDINGS

The pathways followed during the 10 years elapsed between the end of compulsory education and the time of the interview can be classified in three types according to the central activity during this period:

1. Centrality of employment: this is the characteristic of the pathways followed by the nine men in the sample and by five women.
2. Centrality of domestic and care work: this is the characteristic of the pathways followed by three women.
3. Different centralities (employment and education): this is the characteristic of one woman pathway.

In the context of these different centralities, we find very heterogeneous education and training pathways. The two extremes are represented by two men with a pathway centrality of employment and by the woman with a pathway with different centralities. The two first ones have done no educational activity of any kind in a formal or non-formal setting since they dropped out of basic education (one with the SEGC and the other with no qualifications). The opposite case is that of a woman who most of the time has been doing some sort of education in a formal or non-formal setting.

The analysis is conducted based on two complementary approaches. First of all, we focus on participation in formal (FE) and non-formal education (NFE), with special emphasis on the FE that is carried out in the framework of continuing adult education (AE). Secondly, we analyse the importance of education and training in the young people’s trajectory, as well as the main goal thereof in the period studied.

If we consider the group as a whole, we observe that the most common situation is for them to have participated in formal education (11 out of 18) and also for them to have done some sort of non-formal education activity (14 out of 18). Half of them have participated in both types of education.

This first approach leads us to establish the following typology:
1. Have not done any activity of formal or non-formal education (2/18): Javier, Tolo.
2. Have participated in formal and non-formal education (9/18): Pepi, José, Julia, Lidia, Raquel, Manuel, Julián, Tomeu, Margalida.
3. Have participated only in formal education (2/18): María, Pilar.
4. Have participated only in non-formal education (5/18): Charly, Diana, Valeria, Martí, Juanan.
Participation in formal education takes place as a continuation of post-compulsory secondary schooling once the SEGC qualification has been obtained (Pepi, José, Julia, Pilar, Lidia, Raquel, María) or through Secondary Education for Adults (ASE) (Manuel, Julián, Tomeu, Margalida).

The group that has the SEGC qualification is characterised by attempting to continue their studies in post-compulsory education without any rupture between attaining the SEGC qualification and doing post-compulsory secondary studies; whereas in the group that finishes CSE without the SEGC, there is a long rupture in time before they attempt to resume their studies and the return is produced to a lesser extent than the continuation of studies in the SEGC group.

Once the SEGC qualification is obtained, the choice of most of the young people is to continue their basic education (8/9). This education - except for one case in which participation is in an employment and training programme for young people - is in formal education (7/9), normally in intermediate level vocational training (IVET) (6/9) and, to a lesser extent, in the baccalaureate (1/9). This choice is made with no interruption between the end of CSE and the onset of the next educational activity, except in one case in which, between this moment and beginning an IVET there is a whole school year during which a situation of unemployment or inactivity occurs.

In all cases, education is abandoned before obtaining the qualification. Dropout occurs at different times, the extremes of which are one girl who leaves 3 months after starting the course and another girl who leaves when she only has two subjects left and the work placement in an IVET. Among the main reasons, the most outstanding are a lack of meaning to what they are doing ("I wasn’t well advised", "it didn’t motivate me", …); difficulties related to academics (repetition, failed subjects,…), and to relationships in the centre ("I was repeating and was with younger kids and my friends were leaving to study away from home", "I didn’t get on with the tutor",…); the influence of friends ("my friends told me I had to earn money like them"); wanting to do other things incompatible with studying; ease in finding a
job (in a family business or elsewhere) and the low value placed on qualifications in relation to possible employment options. Overall, the disorientation of the young people and lack of support services for their academic perseverance stands out.

There is no case in which post-compulsory secondary studies were not begun as a continuation of CSE or which were not done after a year’s break, and which afterwards entrance exams for higher education have been started, are being prepared or have been prepared.

Some of the young people who dropped out of post-compulsory education have made subsequent attempts with different degrees of success. In the group that abandoned an IVET, the following situations occur: one case of starting the social baccalaureate and then dropping out; one case in which two of the IVET subjects are being retaken; and another in which the access course to higher level vocational training (HVET) is being prepared.

The young woman who dropped out of baccalaureate passed the Spanish National Open University (UNED) entrance exam and since October 2009 has been studying Pedagogy at that university.

Out of the group of young people without the SEGC qualification, four have made some attempt at obtaining that qualification by doing ASE. This is the case of Manuel, Julián, Tomeu and Margalida. The first three started their participation in ASE 9 or 10 years after dropping out of CSE with no qualification. This participation is linked with a situation of unemployment.

Manuel and Julián are doing ASE at the time of the interview. It is the first time they have attempted to do so and, in both cases, this fact is associated to the fact of being unemployed and to the need to find a job.

Manuel began ASE in October 2010, taking subjects he had failed in the 1st and 2nd year of CSE, in order to continue then with 3rd and 4th. He says he is really motivated and wants to study in order to find a job and be able to become emancipated. The fact of resuming his studies is associated to a new period of his life marked by having overcome his addiction to drugs. Manuel was fired from a tenure job due to this addiction and underwent treatment.

Julián began ASE in October 2009, doing the 4th year and expects to finish in the coming months. He says he is satisfied with his academic performance and with the centre he is attending and is experiencing feelings of frustration at not having finished his studies. He aims to continue studying.

Tomeu began ASE in March 2009. He finishes 2nd CSE and changes centre in 3rd because he has problems with a teacher. In September 2009 he enroils in the 3rd year in another Adult Education Centre but drops out. He manifests certain dissatisfaction in relation to his attempts at studying ASE as he drops out just as he did CSE. He wants to get the SE graduate certificate to be able to gain access to an IVET in mechanics but he is finding it hard to pass. 9 years have gone by between dropping out of CSE and enrolling in ASE.

The case of Margalida reveals some differential elements. First of all she never started CSE and dropped out of school at 13 for reasons she says she can’t explain, but that appear to be
related to the fact that her mother (employee) was going to have a baby, and family tolerance towards dropping out of school. Her dedication to looking after the brother that was about to be born lent legitimacy to her decision. After three years looking after her brother she enrolled in an Adult Education Centre where she studied for 9 months to sit the external candidate exam for the School Leaving Certificate. She attended class and things were going well for her but when she went to register for the exam she was told she couldn't sit it as she wasn’t 18 years old. Margalida meets her husband and has a daughter at 17, whereby she resumes her dedication to housework and bringing up a family. The next attempt is made in 2009, in the context of her attempts at studying and obtaining an income due to the loss of her source of income from her partner, who is sent to prison. At this time she can’t even start her studies as she can’t afford to pay for the books and since a grant for books was incompatible with support from the Minimum Insertion Income (RMI) which she was receiving.

As can be seen, participation in ASE is always produced in situations of unemployment or inactivity and the main motivation is the idea that it will make it easier to gain access to employment or to intermediate level vocational training. Ambitions to study can clash with a low self-concept in relation to chances of success and with institutional obstacles related to the characteristics and organization of AE in Spain (age of access, lack of guidance services and of support to perseverance, …) and, more generally, with the weakness of our welfare system (few resources, incompatibilities in economic aid, lack of the 0 to 3 year-old network,…).

Even though participation in NFE is the majority in the two groups, it is found to a greater extent among young people without the SEGC (8/9) than in the SEGC (6/9). In most cases it fulfils the function of preparation related to a certain profession or group of professions (6/14) or in response to an urgent need for social and labour insertion after an event that has brought about a rupture in the itinerary of the subject (5/14). In other cases (2/4), periods of education appear as something more erratic and without continuity.

An analysis of the education and training pathways leads us to differentiate four types of situations depending on the importance of education and training and on their ultimate goal.

On a basic level we analyse the importance of education, in the sense of whether it makes certain sense and/or has coherence in relation to the overall situation of the young person. From this perspective, we can distinguish two groups. First of all, a group of 13 young people whose education and training pathway appears with certain sense and coherence. A second group, made up of 5 subjects, is characterised by the little or non-importance of education.

A subsequent level of analysis focuses on the goal of education, differentiating between education aimed above all at improving vocational training (in a broad sense that includes basic and specific training addressed mainly at improving job opportunities) and the ones whose main goal is social and labour insertion.
GROUP 1. IMPORTANCE OF EDUCATION AND TRAINING WHOSE MAIN GOAL IS SOCIAL AND LABOUR INSERTION.

This is the case of Manuel, Margalida, Valeria, Martí, Diana. In this group, the main education goal is social and labour insertion after a change that affects all the areas of their personal pathway and which involves a rupture or bifurcation in relation to their previous situation.

In the case of Manuel, the onset of his participation in education takes place in January 2008, when he was 23, doing a horticulture course as part of the process of rehabilitation from his addiction to drugs. In this same process, an intensive course for activity coordinator enables him to participate in neighbourhood activities. Finalisation of his rehabilitation process coincides with the first years of the crisis and he manages to get two very short-term jobs one month each, thanks to the support of the rehabilitation project and the leisure club in his neighbourhood, which act as clear elements of integration along with his family and his partner. Having reached 26 he begins ASE, as described in the above section.

Margalida and Valeria illustrate the situation of two women with children, who have lost their customary source of income due to the entry into prison of their respective partners. In both cases they take part in a socio-labour education and insertion project for single women with
dependents, where several support and training services are offered such as assistant cook and cleaner, which include work placement and job prospects in a network of collaborating companies. They both value this experience very positively for different reasons: network of friendships, improvement of social skills, guidance and support, training and work placement, access to employment… Although they both consider themselves good students during their compulsory schooling and consider getting the SEGC qualification, and also the training they are doing in the project relevant, they perceive great difficulties to continuing their education for different reasons: economic, lack of time, lack of confidence in their ability to succeed.

Martí and Diana are two first generation immigrants, from Sub-Saharan Africa. They were both educated in the Spanish language as a mechanism of integration into the host society. Martí arrived in Mallorca in March 2005 and after a few months, when he was 21, began a Spanish course for adults in a public centre, for approximately a year and a half. Some of this time was also spent working. He has had no other education as he doesn’t have time and prioritises working.

Diana moved to Mallorca in 2003 to live with her husband, who she was married to in an arranged marriage agreed on by her family when she was 17. She did a free Spanish course for a year and a half through which she was admitted into the same project as Valeria and Margalida thanks to the mediation of the person in charge of the course, to whom she had indicated her interest in cooking. In summer 2008 she began an assistant cook training course which she interrupted due to her second pregnancy, but which she resumed in summer 2009 and which enabled her to do the work placement in a cafeteria-restaurant. In the meantime, from social services, they helped her pay for her son's childcare for four months. In 2010 she is doing a cookery course and wants to study to learn how to read and write. She does not have the support of her family, neither does she have any friends, only the help of the professionals in the programmes and resources in which she has participated and her willpower to be economically independent in order to be able to get divorced.

The five young people that make up this group take part in education at a time of redirecting their pathway after a rupture; in fact, education plays an important role in all the cases of this redirecting process. In this participation the main trigger is external pressure (Margalida, Valeria, Manuel) or the belief in the usefulness of the education (Martí, Diana). Nevertheless, and as their life stories reflect, both elements are interrelated. The fact that the triggering factor is one or the other does not detract from the interaction between them both. Thus, for instance, even though Margalida, Valeria and Manuel begin their education due to external pressure, they consider it is useful for them. Conversely, the decision of Martí and Diana also arises from the demands of their environment, as without knowing the language of the host place they won’t be able to integrate. In Diana’s case we must add that education is her only possible way towards autonomy.

As regards the obstacles that hinder educational inclusion, the situational ones stand out: lack of time and money, self-perception of difficulties for success, need for employment… Among the institutional obstacles, it is worth noting that in all cases participation took place through an offer specifically aimed at people with a certain profile. In all cases participation takes place within the framework of public policies to support socio-labour insertion of people with special difficulties and activities in which tertiary sector organizations play a central role. The relationship of helping and accompanying throughout the whole process is particularly noteworthy, as is the networking between different organizations.
Concerning the follow-up of the situation conducted in 2013 (around two years after the biographical interview) the suppression of the project for socio-labour training and insertion for single women with dependents must be pointed out, within the context of cutbacks in public policies.

GROUP 2. IMPORTANCE OF EDUCATION AND TRAINING WHOSE GOAL IS VOCATIONAL TRAINING

This is the case of Charly, Raquel, José, Tomeu, Lidia, Julia, Pepi, Julián. Although due to the size of this text, we cannot analyse all the situations, we would like to illustrate some aspects we consider key to understanding inclusions and exclusions in education. In order to perform this approach we focus on two cases we consider are a success as regards the relevance of the education in the context of the young person’s pathway considered as a whole, and on one with an as yet unclear outcome and in which the impact of the economic crisis has a clear relevance.

The two cases we consider a success as regards the relevance of the education in the context of the young person’s pathway considered as a whole are the cases of Pepi and Charly. They have both made a purposeful commitment to education with the belief that it will be useful for their personal project, and this commitment has already had clearly positive results in the 10 years studied. They serve to illustrate two highly differentiated cases that enable us to analyse the elements of inclusion and exclusion.

**Pepi** follows a pathway focused on employment and studies and very marked by the desire to combine both activities. She considers herself a good student in compulsory education and obtained the SEGC qualification with no delay, without repeating a year. She enrolled in the social baccalaureate because she didn’t know what to do, or what branch to study, and dropped out when she was repeating 2nd baccalaureate for the third time. Subsequently, she had a few months of inactivity, after which she began a period focused on employment, only interrupted by a 4 month period without work. Her work activity took place practically exclusively in the travel agency sector, until she began to work for an internet advertising agency in order to have working conditions that allow her to combine studies and work. She wants to work with children and to get out of the world of “offices” and, therefore, since 2008 she has carried out several educational activities for this purpose. Now she is studying Pedagogy at the UNED.

She is emancipated and lives in a flat she shares with friends.

As we can see, Pepi’s pathway is a pathway of subjective and objective success helped by the characteristics of the job market, her own initiative and family support. Pepi is sure that education will enable her to have a job she likes and is able to manage the different events in her life with this goal. Although in a certain period of her life, the institutional obstacles are insurmountable for her (dropping out of baccalaureate), after several job experiences she makes the decision to continue her studies. With this goal in mind, she uses the option of the university entrance exam for over 25s and enrolls in a distance learning degree. Thereby she can keep up and strengthen her process of autonomy and combine work and studies.
The case of Charly has a common point with the above in his clear, determined commitment to specific education that will enable him to practice the profession he desires, after an exploratory period in which he has several jobs; as well as the success of his commitment to education in the context of his pathway. In this case it is worth noting the way he overcame institutional obstacles (inadequacy of the standardised education available, the reason why he himself organises a system that will allow him to train as a tattooist by combining training in the workplace with a specific training course,) and dispositional ones (exchanging services as a way of financing his education).

Charly dropped out of school in 4th CSE. Although until then his schooling showed no apparent difficulties, at that time he behaved badly, played truant and had to repeat a year. In 2001, immediately after dropping out of CSE, he did a six month course in administration and accounting and afterwards began to work as a construction worker in his father’s company. After three and a half years doing this job, he was unemployed for a period lasting between three and four months. Subsequently, he worked as a fish delivery man for approximately a year and a half, until January 2007. But Charly has his own career project: to be a tattooist, which begins to materialise after he turns 23.

During a two-year period (2007 and 2008) a friend teaches him to tattoo in exchange for his work as a builder in his friend’s tattoo parlour at the same time as he takes a two-year long amateur drawing course. At this time he has economic difficulties because he isn’t earning and doing the building is very demanding.

Charly chooses a career that is coherent with his social and cultural environment and in which he tries to unite his skills, his interests and his personal and professional expectations. Identifying himself with the profession of a tattooist enables him to develop professionally in an activity he likes, which he can do without having to take on the role of either employee or employer, with which he can obtain economic autonomy and which keeps him linked to the culture that is characteristic of the profession, which has a lot of elements in common with his personal experiences and cultural practices.

He lives in his parents’ home, where he works in the informal economy, and is not thinking about becoming independent until he has greater stability.

Lidia has made a clear commitment to education but the results are still uncertain. The current crisis has a very clear impact on her.

Lidia has a pathway characterised by the predominance of periods of unemployment and by her indecision in professional terms. Although she has a school life story with only one repetition of the 1st year of Basic General Education (EGB) and she considers herself a good student in compulsory education, she does not finish an IVET in commerce and marketing. She didn’t like it and had problems with the tutor, which led her to find a job “doing whatever”. She had a difficult transition into employment and during the first four years only worked on two occasions for one month at a time, a period in which she did some training courses for unemployed people. Afterwards she has some periods of employment, with the last one finishing in May 2009.
Her labour and training pathway is erratic until she makes a clear professional training choice: to do an HVET in early childhood education. With this aim in mind she is preparing the entrance exam at an adult education centre (CEPA). She wants to become emancipated and to be economically self-sufficient, working in a kindergarten.

GROUP 3. EDUCATIONAL ACTIVITIES LACKING CONTINUITY AND/OR ERRATIC

This is the case of Juanan, María and Pilar. Juanan and María, despite being unemployed, do not contemplate education as a strategy to improve their job opportunities. In the case of Juanan what stands out is the little value he places on education and his zero intention of studying despite the fact that from August 2008 to December 2010 he has worked only two periods one month long each time. He lives in his parents' home and seems to have some economic income, the origin of which he does not explain, but it means he can afford certain consumer goods. In María’s case, economic need is what stands out most (emancipated with a dependent child) and the impossibility of studying for economic reasons and time. In both cases, since 2001 (when they were 18 years old) education has not been part of their pathway.

Pilar has a job in a family business and, although she didn’t want to work in it and, at some time, she thought of continuing her education in order to have other professional options, her stint in post-compulsory education was very short.

In none of the three cases do we see any environmental pressure with respect to education due to the characteristics of the education-employment transition model and the unskilled job offer before the crisis.

GROUP 4. THEY HAVE NOT DONE ANY EDUCATIONAL ACTIVITY

This is the case of Tolo and Javier, two young men with a very strong centrality on employment during the period under study. They have both grown up in a large single parent family, they are emancipated with their partner and do not have any children, they have grown up in a neighbourhood with very high vulnerability, and arrived in Mallorca when they were very young, having been born in another region in Spain.

In both cases a model of emancipation typical of their class and gender is reproduced. In Tolo’s case, the immediate transition from education into employment stands out, along with the fact of keeping the same job for the whole 10 year period studied. In Javier’s pathway, periods of employment and unemployment are combined, with his ability to cope with adversity and the support of his immediate environment standing out.

CONCLUSIONS

The study with a biographical approach of the education and training pathways followed during the 10 years after finishing compulsory secondary education by young people with a low level of education allows us to document the characteristics of these itineraries and to
establish different typologies, as well as to analyse the main educational inclusion and exclusion factors in AE.

In relation to the characteristics and typology of the pathways, what stands out is their heterogeneity as well as the fact that most of the young people in the sample participate in educational activities, in the context of their basic education (mainly the group that after obtaining the qualification of SEGC continue in post-compulsory secondary education) or in AE (mainly young people with the qualification of SEGC who do NFE activities and young people with no qualifications who do FE and NFE activities).

We have been able to document different levels of importance of education and training as well as different goals thereof. Education and training can be seen to play an important role (meaning and coherence in the young person’s pathway considered as a whole) in 13 of the 18 young people in the sample. In this group, the goal may be mainly vocational training or social and labour insertion after a change that affects all the spheres of the person and which implies a rupture or bifurcation in relation to the earlier situation.

As regards factors of educational inclusion, the dialectic relationship between environmental demands and the aspirations and experiences of the people involved are documented and seen to be determinant in the demand for AE. Concerning environmental demands, the demand for education has increased due to the impact of the crisis. Nevertheless, this increase in external demand contrasts with the rise in obstacles to participation derived from the cutbacks applied in public policies that especially affect more vulnerable groups.

Regarding exclusion factors, numerous obstacles have been documented that hinder participation in AE. Among the institutional type barriers stand out the ones characteristic of AE in Spain which, far from constituting an integrated system, is made up of different types of initiatives with a poor or insufficient relationship between each other. These offers are little or not at all adapted to the needs of young people with a low level of education, except for the ones that are specifically for groups in situations of greatest social vulnerability. In the case of ASE, access is not allowed until 18, except in certain conditions, and there are no support services or transition modules when, as we have been able to appreciate, a return to education through ASE usually takes place after a long period outside the education system. The essential role of mediation for inclusion in AE of people with a low level of education stands out, mainly when situations of rupture are produced which makes them redirect their situation. One of the most serious problems we find is that this type of offers figure among the ones that are suffering the greatest budgetary cutbacks, to the point that the labour training and insertion project in which three of the young people with no qualifications were participating has been suppressed due to a lack of public funding.

Concerning situational factors, the influence of the school life story is clearly documented, as well as economic difficulties and time available to be able to devote to education. These factors are compounded, in some of the cases, by the socio-economic characteristics of the current and source families as well as by intra-family relationships. On the other hand, in others - despite the fact that we are talking mainly about people whose immediate environment does not have many economic resources - relationships with the family, partner and/or friends entail a more or less explicit support to education options.
In relation to dispositional factors, what stands out in some of the young people for whom education has not been important during the period studied is the perception that it is of no use in relation to access to employment. Nevertheless, in most cases, education is valued positively and the greatest obstacle lies in insecurity concerning their own ability for educational success, closely related to an education offer whose demands have too much in common with a school experience that the whole group has lived through with different types of difficulties.

ENDNOTES

1 It is part of the project “Trajectories from secondary education into employment: a biographical perspective” (EDU2009-13312), funded under the National Plan R+D+I (Ministry of Economy and Competitiveness. Government of Spain).

2 The University of the Balearic Islands Education and Citizenship Research Group is considered a Competitive Group and is sponsored by part of the Autonomous Community of the Balearic Islands, through the Directorate General for Research, Technological Development and Innovation of the Ministry of Innovation, Interior and Justice and co-financed by FEDER funds.

3 Level of education is indicated with the type of letter: the names of the group with the SEGC are in italics and the group without this qualification is not.

4 Qualification corresponding to the previous system and already phased out during the period studied.

REFERENCES


II. KNOWLEDGE AND COMPETENCES
RECOGNITION OF PRIOR LEARNING: VALUING LEARNING THROUGH TRANSITIONS FOR INDIVIDUAL AND COLLECTIVE PURPOSES?

Antunes, Fátima
University of Minho
Portugal

Guimarães, Paula,
University of Lisbon
Portugal

ABSTRACT

Since 1999 a new adult education and training policy (Barros, 2011) has been under development in Portugal. Recognition of prior learning has been the most attended form of provision. Within recognition of prior learning, biography reflects somehow a reflexive project (Giddens, 1992; Field, 2000; Hake, 2006) and constitutes a reflexive/constructive process of adult education and training.

It is assumed that the (transition) biographical itineraries are constituted in the interaction of: (i) the subject (families and social categories) options and strategies; and ii) the institutional opportunities (formed in the education/training and employment systems) and the emerging constraints and resources of the existence conditions (Casal, 2003). Based on a set of empirical research, in this article this perspective enables the questioning of blockages and opportunities that the subjects are confronted with when building their itineraries configured by the involvement in processes of lifelong learning.

1. LEARNING THROUGH TRANSITIONS: THEORETICAL APPROACH

Several authors have maintained that changes have become an essential dimension of contemporary societies, increasingly characterised by risk and marked by de-traditionalization (among others, Giddens, 1992; Beck, 1992). Others have argued that the subjects experience change in several ways: some subjects are the object of registered transformations and, in that sense, they adapt themselves to the changes they endure; others are the authors of change, modifying the way they regard the situations in which there were transformations and/or interfering in the social contexts they belong to. In either case, the change experienced by the social actors is translated in transitions understood as transformation processes experienced by the subjects that, concerning education and learning, are accompanied by the acquisition and/or development of new know-how and skills (Field, 2012). Following this line of thought in the liquid modernity framework (Bauman, 2007), the subjects are increasingly confronted with changes (that involve transitions and) that compel them to make choices. These choices, due to their frequency and contexts with which they are related, result in the responsibility of those who make them. In this case, one can see the individualisation of social relations standing out, as well as the growing societalization of biographical trajectories. Both the choices made and the responsibility for the subjects’ options lead to the acquisition of knowledge and skills conducive to reflexivity. In this context, the subjects use the knowledge that they have in order to adapt, to reflect and
to question the existing social structures, as well as to negotiate ways to transform the social environment they belong to. Thus, (formal and non-formal) education, as well as lifelong learning undergone in very diverse contexts, favour transitions in which the subjects adapt to the new conditions and they themselves transform these conditions. It is in this context that the role of education and learning in the adjustment and promotion of change gains relevance, not only in terms of social, cultural, political and civic contexts but also work contexts. In this context, some trends have pointed to the biographical expression and resolution of system blockages, contradictions, paradoxes and dilemmas (Giddens, 1992; Beck, 1992), given that the choices made are not always carried out in a straightforward and peaceful way.

On matters concerning specifically the relations between education and employment as well as the construction of transition itineraries, Casal argues that the transition to employment

(...) is affected by individual decisions that are strongly influenced by social determinants: the social and economic conditions of the family environment, (...) the lifestyles of membership, the person’s social personality, the territorial context and its opportunities, etc. (Casal, 2003, p. 181).

So, the study of these relations comprises two aspects, the biographical and the social one, which are highlighted in this text. Through the biographical dimension it is possible to know and to understand the subjects’ life itineraries(1), namely their social standing within groups and families at a given time. The social dimension favours the identification and the interpretation of the subjects’ (upward or downward) social mobility itineraries, thus referring to social (in)equality and social segmentation indicators. Additionally in this text it is assumed that the biographical itineraries are constituted in the interaction of: (i) the subject (families and social categories) options and strategies; ii) the institutional opportunities (formed in the education/training and employment systems) and (iii) the emerging constraints and resources of the existence conditions (Casal, 2003). Based on a set of empirical research (Antunes, 2004 and Lima & Guimarães, 2012) the theoretical perspective referred before enabled the questioning of blockages and opportunities that the subjects are confronted with when building their itineraries configured by the involvement in processes of lifelong learning. Consequently, biographical learning accounts can be critical tools as they can reveal some connections between individualisation of biographies and learning and de-politicising reflexivity and agency (Biesta & Tedder, 2008, p. 6).

2. METHODOLOGICAL PATH FOLLOWED

After 1999, a new adult education and training policy (Barros, 2011) was developed in Portugal up until 2011 when it was abandoned. Recognition of prior learning (Reconhecimento, Validação e Certificação de Competências – RVCC in Portuguese) was the most attended form of provision. Within recognition of prior learning, the writing of a portfolio takes biography as a reflexive project (Giddens, 1992; Field, 2000; Hake, 2006) and constitutes a reflexive/constructive process of adult education and training.

This paper follows a qualitative research approach. The empirical data analysed are derived from two semi-structured interviews(2) (McMillan & Schumacher, 2010, pp. 342-365) centred on the biography of subjects who have completed recognition of prior learning, as well as, in
the case of one of the subjects surveyed, on a portfolio\(^{(3)}\) presented in the course of this process concerning what involved the transitions identified and the learning resulting thereof.

For the purpose of this communication, we selected data concerning two subjects: João (itinerary A) and Olinda (itinerary B)\(^{(4)}\). These subjects were selected considering the following criteria: a) they were over-25-year-old adults who had (one of them) completed recognition of prior learning equivalent to the 9\(^{\text{th}}\) grade of school education and (the other) the recognition of prior learning equivalent to the 12\(^{\text{th}}\) grade of school education; and b) they were adults who presented biographies in which the transitions associated to life changes and learning processes were evident. Both interviews were analysed based on content analysis. The first procedure consisted of sorting the chronological order of the reported biographical events, followed by a preliminary exploration from an external categories grid derived from the theoretical frame of reference.

Thus, this paper aims to answer the following questions:

- What blockages/constraints and opportunities were the subjects confronted with when building their itineraries?
- How was lifelong learning involved in such process, namely what learning was developed therein and what were the meanings given by the subjects to learning?

3. ITINERARIES ANALYSED: TRANSITIONS AND LEARNING

3.1. DROPPING OUT OF SCHOOL AND GETTING BACK TO SCHOOL: WORK COMES FIRST?

João was born in 1974. Concerning his living conditions, João came from a popular social background since his parents were tenant farmers in a semi-urban parish of Cidade Antiqua county\(^{(5)}\) in Northern Portugal. He was married, two under-age children, completed recognition of prior learning (equivalent to the 9\(^{\text{th}}\) grade of school education) in 2012. This individual inserted several institutional opportunities in his biography, through which he was able to develop diversified knowledge from which resulted several transitions. The first institutional opportunity he indicated was the school he attended between the ages of 7 and 13 years old. As a result, he completed the 6\(^{\text{th}}\) grade in 1987 and then left school at a time when the legislation already determined nine years of mandatory schooling\(^{(6)}\). This interviewee explained his school dropout due to financial constraints: “(…) I was forced to leave school because of my parents’ financial situation” (João P.). And he added that:

I saw my colleagues going into their pockets and getting twenty, thirty Escudos and I had nothing. Zero. I thought I had to find a way out. Since my parents did not have financial means, I started working (João’s I).

Another factor that probably contributed to this dropout was his description of the primary school as being a pleasant place, with which João identified himself, whereas the lower secondary education took place in an institution in Cidade Antiqua that was described in a more dramatic way:
(...) I attended primary school. From this school I went on to the Centre School to attend preparatory education, the 5th and 6th grades. But it was a bit scary because one comes from the village to the city centre, to something completely new. I had two buses to catch by myself. I had to fend for myself and I managed. I completed the 6th grade (João’s I).

Concerning professional options, João started working in 1988, when he was 14 years old, in civil construction as an apprentice construction worker. In fact, this seems to have been another case marked by important social determinants of Northern Portugal, namely child labour. Indeed, in the last two decades of the past century, child labour became a common fixture in Cidade Antígua’s region, particularly in the construction sector, in which several companies recruited low educated and low skilled workers (see Sarmento et al., 2000).

The option for working in construction ended up conditioning João’s career path. With the exception of a brief incursion into heavy trucking between 1996 and 1998, he has always worked in this economic activity. So, further on, João worked as a second class mason, then he was a construction measurer, which was the professional category he held when he was interviewed for this research.

It was in a professional context, still as an apprentice mason, that João acknowledged having developed some important know-how for his life, specially “the rules of the game” in labour and the rules of a “working culture”. In this regard, he said that:

I learned to respect my co-workers, to respect labour timetables and how to talk to your superiors. I understood that I had to adjust my language to the different recipients. My job was to carry mortar and bricks to the most skilled masons (João’s P).

This learning led him to establish himself as “a competent worker”, respected by his co-workers and by his boss. In this respect, he stressed the responsibility of his job and the importance that “work well done” had in his line of work, particularly for the colleagues that worked with him:

And now, as a construction measurer, what have you learned of significance?
I learned that we have to learn every day. This is a job with many challenges, there is nothing equivalent. Each measurement is a challenge. The responsibility. One mistake in one point is enough to ruin everything. (...) You have to respect what is on the paper. Now, they, in the company, they do it like this: if I make a writing mistake, or if I transcribe something incorrectly on the computer, they cut through that note. If they follow the drawing in the construction and it turns out badly, it is not their fault. It is mine, because I identified things incorrectly. (João’s I).

Interestingly, it was work, particularly the growing schooling and skill demands in the access to other jobs linked to civil construction that convinced João of the importance of “going back to school”. In this regard, he wrote in his portfolio “Now I want to do training for machine operators (Certificate of Professional Competence) because I need it for professional reasons, for which I need the 9th grade from school” (João’s P).

At the same time, some friends talked to him about the importance of “not being frozen in time”. In this regard he said:
I was practically pushed into this (the recognition of prior learning) by the Parish Secretaries. They told me that, with my knowledge and the professional life I had, it was good for me to do this (…). I was led into this by others and I have only good things to say about them, because they pushed me into doing a good thing (João’s I).

In 2011 João benefited again from an education institutional opportunity attending recognition of prior learning. This opportunity came up as an “individual challenge” as it translated into the “fulfilling of the dream” of obtaining a school degree. However, the recognition of prior learning also had a family feature. Since then, João has been helping his children doing their homework in some subjects, something he had always felt incapable of doing. Additionally, he was helped (and encouraged) by his eldest son in the writing of the portfolio, especially when he faced difficulties using the computer and processing the writing of the biography. It was with these individual and family dimensions that João raised the possibility of being able, in the future, “to give another life” to his family. This possibility was, according to the subject surveyed, deeply associated to the promise (Canário & Alves, 2004) that comes with a diploma, leading João to admit that new professional opportunities could come up because of the certificate he had obtained. Along these lines, recognition of prior learning opened up new (and more promising) perspectives of a professional future (social and personal).

3.2. GIVING UP AND COMING BACK (AND GIVING UP) ON SCHOOL: FAMILY AND WORK FIRST?

Olinda is a 44-year-old small textile entrepreneur who completed recognition of prior learning (equivalent to the 12th grade of school education) in July 2012. She went to school in 1974 and she completed basic education (9th grade) as an adult and the 10th grade (secondary education) in recurrent education (second-chance education – evening classes – directed at adults). Her story can be regarded as a kind of first-hand testimony on education’s (and adult education’s) winding ways in the Portuguese democracy. Her school path as a child was interrupted after completing preparatory school, which was the mandatory schooling in 1980, which is very similar to that of many other parents of the students who attend school nowadays. In 2004, 61% of the Portuguese between 25 and 64 years old had qualifications at the preparatory education level or lower (Santos & Dias, 2007, p. 13); according to more recent data, in 2011, more than half the population (58,03%) in Olinda’s age group (35-44 years old), would have attended school up to the 9th grade(7).

Olinda was born in the late 1960’s (1968), as the youngest of 14 siblings, and her parents had completed the 4th grade. Her mother was a seamstress and her father owned a small factory, then he emigrated and finally he was an administrative clerk in a tannery. In her report, bearing in mind the issues and components proposed by Casal (2003) to analyse the transition biographical itineraries, what stands out are the family’s hard and precarious living conditions, the material and institutional weakness of the right to education and the strength of the options that she took along the way. The living conditions marked her childhood and her route; work, under multiple guises, was a reality that modeled her life as much as she chose it and adapted it. At the age of 12 she completed the 6th grade and decided to quit studying. She did it because continuing at school would entail two things: that her mother would become a “labour slave”, taking care of the whole family alone and that she herself would have to keep enduring the hard effort of going to school on foot and by public transport, coupled with the housework after arriving home from school. This double penalty
led her to give up (temporarily) a successful school path and to go against her sister’s (by then already a teacher) pressure. School left her with generally positive memories, together with the remembrance of the painful effort of walking for half an hour to go to school and another half hour to go back home, followed by the housework duties:

I couldn’t do it and I am almost sure that my brothers could not truly live that school period either because we knew that the time we spent in school was our resting time. We knew that after school we had a long walk to do and when we arrived, we would have lunch and then we would have work ahead of us (…) This made us not to value school much, but even so, it was a terrible chagrin for me to stop studying (Olinda’s I).

When she was 17, after staying home for five years working for the family, she had her first job, working in the office of a construction company, leaving a year later to work in the office of a textile company where one of her brothers worked. At this second job, she highlighted that

It was wonderful to work there with my brother, I learned many things (…) working with all sorts of documents, checks, drafts, drafts renewals, consignment notes, invoices, I learned every kind of office work, so I was busy. This was what I wanted: learning, working, and being busy (Olinda’s I).

She also worked in this company for about a year, until she got a job in another one of the same sector, which she described as follows:

Besides, I was fascinated by cutting, hand work, holding the molds, marking, stretching the mesh and the cutting it with the machine, that really fascinated me. And so it was, I started going to the cutting section in the afternoon and I learned a lot (Olinda’s I).

Again she stayed there for about a year, during which she learned cutting and modeling and established the contacts that enabled her to start thinking of setting up her own business. That is what she did before turning 20, in the late 1980’s (1988). She worked hard and on her own for about a year:

It was hard to start with, because we only worked several times through the night, it was complicated… (…) Yes, alone with a table and a cutting machine. The suppliers would bring me the cloth, the material, the molds I made them myself, so I invented the model and made the mold (Olinda’s I).

Afterwards Olinda hired three workers and, during the 1990’s, she consolidated and expanded the company: there were already 14 workers and almost a quarter of a century and two thirds of her life later, she resumed her studies. She attended recurrent education and completed within a year the lower secondary education (school’s 9th grade) and then, the following year, she completed the 10th grade of secondary education:

Yes, it was a very positive [experience], because my son was starting primary school and I felt the need to go back to school so that I could help him, because many years had gone since I left school (…) I said to myself: “No, I am going to do it, I am going to try” and I did it. (…) After the 10th grade I said to myself: “Now it is enough, I cannot do it anymore”. My children were growing up and demanding more from me, demanding
more attention at school... And I said: “Now, it is all for my children”. And my dream was over. Meanwhile, the opportunity to do the 12\textsuperscript{th} grade came up through recognition of prior learning and off I went to enroll... (Olinda’s I).

Around 2008, a new contract to supply a big retail chain, El Corte Inglés, led her to change the manufacturing process and she attended the Industrial Modeling Course at a textile industry training centre after 20 years of working experience.

I thought about it twice, because my children were still small and I could only take this course in the evening, after work. It was complicated, a 400 hours intensive course, twice a week. I left my children with my brother and my sister in law, because they were too young and my husband would be disoriented; on these two days I would leave them there and set off to Vilar do Castelo\textsuperscript{(h)} to attend the course. It was from 7 p.m. to 11 p.m. It was complicated because I worked, I had two small kids, the course and then the housework to do (Olinda’s I).

Later, Olinda decided to implement the automation of the cutting process and she attended the required training to keep on performing the most important work in her company –marks to cut the mesh (marcadas in Portuguese).

In 2009 she started recognition of prior learning equivalent to the 12\textsuperscript{th} grade of school education. She also attended all complementary training sessions required inherent to the process, but she did not organise the Learning Reflexive Portfolio (an essential document within recognition of prior learning to get the school education certificate). When, in the beginning of 2012, an adult educator contacted Olinda to inform her that the Adult Education Centre (where she had already started writing the portfolio) was due to be closed down and that she should draw up the necessary paperwork in order to conclude the recognition of prior learning, she decided to get on with it:

At the time I was actually loaded with work at the company, but I came to the training sessions all the same and I did it enthusiastically. Afterwards I had to focus on the company, I had to change the cutting system and I just had to stop: the priority now is the company (...). Yes, I was contacted in January, but it was only in April that I thought: “Well, if this is finishing in July, I have to get on with it. It’s got to be!” And that is when I really started. I did the same I had done when I was in the 10\textsuperscript{th} grade: at night I put my children to sleep, went down to the kitchen, where I organise my stuff, and I started working on the computer and writing. April and May were months of hard struggle, because getting to face the jury\textsuperscript{(9)} did not depend solely on me anymore, but on whether the trainers would have time to read my portfolio (Olinda’s I).

4. UNDER DISCUSSION: ADULT EDUCATION, TRANSITIONS AND CHANGES IN CONTINUITY - FROM OPTIONS TO REFLEXIVITY

Unlike previous surveys (Antunes, 2011; Vieira, 2012), data discussed in this paper referred to the recent involvement by adults in formal education and learning, that was not linked to a vital situation of transition, threat and risk, or to problematic or crisis social contexts (Liz et al., 2009; Lima & Guimarães, 2012). That is to say that in the cases analysed, education and learning were associated with disruptions and transitions in the lives and reports of the...
subjects, in contradictory ways. For instance, giving up school was premature for both (by their own decision as they argued) associated to social and family constraints and opened up transition processes from infancy to adulthood with the assumption of adult life dimensions and responsibilities and the adult status – at work in one case, within the family in the other. However, the reports presented allow to try some answers to the questions that have guided this paper: what blockages/constraints and opportunities were the subjects confronted with when building their itineraries? How was lifelong learning involved in such process, namely what learning was developed and what were the meanings given by subjects to learning? The data collected suggest that the biographies of these subjects are part of a particularly relevant time in Portuguese History, a period of transition from a strongly rural society, influenced by the New State’s (the authoritarian regime known as Estado Novo in Portuguese) social and economic policies to a society integrated in the European Union, in which globalisation and economic and social transformation are evident. Actually, Stoer and Araújo published in 1992 a research book with the suggestive title School and Learning to Labour, that seeks to enlighten precisely these Portuguese realities of semi-rural communities within which there coexisted families mono-active in agriculture with multi-active semi-proletariat families, for whom the work of every member in the family unit was fundamental for their survival and whose children could perform several hours of weekly labour besides school (Stoer & Araújo, 1992, pp. 88-96). This true anthology of transition in the 1980s and 1990s in certain regions of Portugal – as the ones where João and Olinda lived and still live – ‘speaks’, through the chapters’ titles, of the reality in which these subjects lived and learned in their childhood: Education in the semi-periphery context; Learning to labour in semi-rural Portugal; Human and social basic rights and the democratic school.

On the other hand, João and Olinda spelled out their professional contexts as places and sources of non formal and informal learning, as an existential condition in what referred to the centrality of learning in social relations (Field, 2000); their jobs were also the detonators/motivators of the search for formal and non formal education and professional training felt as a structural need in what concerned learning as a precondition for reflexive participation in social changes (Hake, 2006). The industrial modeling course and the training sessions on industrial cutting were, for Olinda, a necessity resulting from the development of the structural conditions of her professional project that implied changing the production process. However, whilst for João education and learning strongly (but not exclusively) presented themselves as a structural need generated by the social and vital requisites and risks brought about by economic and technological dynamics, for Olinda the involvement in adult education to achieve higher schooling was anchored in a personal fulfilling and development project with strong family roots: “to keep the flame of an old dream of returning to school and now to help” her son too.

For João and Olinda, returning to school was a personal option with precise objectives, without parting with the previous path and integrated in their respective life projects. As had happened in previous moments in their lives these pathways and “educational processes are not only based on individual decisions, but moreover embedded in a socially pre-structured realm of possibilities” suggesting “specific interrelationships between individuality and sociality” (Hof & Fischer, 2010, p. 47). That decision represented, however, not only an important moment, but also the opening up of a new phase in the subjects’ lives. The change and the presence of new elements in their individual lives, both during and after the involvement in formal education and learning processes, are features that the reports revealed. It is possible, however, to formulate a designation of change in continuity for these
paths given that, in either case, their life paths maintained some of the anchors of their meaning and direction, such as the professional activity, the family nucleus and dynamic, or other routine social relations. And this is the continuity component. What changed then? Temporarily, during the education process, these adults experienced new activities that required the reorganisation of daily life:

So, I completed the lower secondary education in one year. During that time I travelled every morning to Cidade Antíqua, so you can imagine how much I had to work at night. Because, it worked this way, the hours that I lost in the morning, lost is just a way of saying, I mean the time I was absent from the company, had to be compensated for later. (...) Everything exactly the same and I had two small children at the time, but concerning them I did everything for them not to realize it. In the company I worked until late ... at 5 a.m. I would go to the factory, did what I had to do, came back home, had a shower, prepared the kids for school and then I would set off to Cidade Antíqua. All this for a year, on and on (...). But I crammed, crammed and crammed all night. I did as follows: put my children to sleep early, around 9.30 a.m. I would take them up. I lay down with them, they would fall asleep and I would go on studying (Olinda’s I).

In February and March we came here an average of four times a week. It was a bit demanding, other weeks it was three times, or twice, occasionally once. I came around 7.00 p.m. and stayed until 10.00 p.m. (...) Leave the company at 6.00 p.m., go home, have a shower and go out again, sometimes it was hard (João’s I).

They went through different experiences in their institutional relationship with school, with knowledge and with the student's previous experience; other power/knowledge social relations were outlined, but also with the institutions, with the access possibilities and the capability to benefit from the relationship with them. In this process, the reports suggested that there could have been re-interpretations of the social relations and the limitations they placed on the subjects’ expectations and life projects. In that sense, when the educational system, as a social mechanism allocation (Hake, 2006), favours the adults’ access to new schooling levels and appeals to them to focus on this goal, it can, at least for some people, foster discontinuities in the influence of ingrained social control models that drive interpretations of reality that are compatible with each and everyone’s adjustment to their probable place in the social structure. It is in this point that the widening range of individual options and the education aspirations may have found sustainability. Reflexivity as a propensity for examining and changing practices in the light of new information generating distinctive interpretations of the world (Giddens, 1992) can thus be reinforced:

I am thinking about finishing the 9th grade; next year, if all goes well, I shall move to the 12th grade and I am going to try to apply for a place on the engineering course (João’s I).

Then I thought that in order to help [my son] I had to go back to school, I wanted to help him, I did something I liked and deserved. “After so many years of slave work, I deserve to do something for myself I am going to give myself a present”. And then I understood that what I wanted was to study again, so I decided to complete the lower secondary education. It was a present I offered myself. I said to myself: “No, I am going to do it, I am going to try” and I did it. (...) In the future.... my ambition is to attend university (...) No, I have that ambition since I was a kid, the ambition of one day
graduating I would like to fulfill it, although my priority now is my children, whom I am
supporting (...) Yes, I have already told my son: “I will end up going to college with you”
and he said “Ok mother, I would like that”. (...) The goal is to keep on, to keep on
studying and when they are more independent I will go on studying... I shall do it gladly
as I did the 9th grade and I shall say this: “I work so much I deserve a present”. I’d
rather give myself the present of continuous studying than to take some holidays
(Olinda’s I).

Meanwhile, the reports showed the subjects’ visions of their paths, in which stood out the
feeling of a certain autonomy and control over the direction taken and its consequences.
These were biographical reports of education and learning construed with a strong sense of
self-responsibility for the options taken in the framework of conditions and constraints clearly
spelled out but not questioned and of opportunities also identified and appropriated by the
subjects in their own terms and particular conditions.

In that sense, one would say that the reports bore witness, not only to the subjects’ individual
biographical paths, their particular individual and social circumstances, but also to a view
focused on confrontation and interaction, individually considered, with the circumstances and
the social contexts, even in the presence of collective omnipresent realities such as family,
be it biological or foster, or social-professional contexts. One can then ask in what way does
the involvement of these adults in education processes widen their capacity to participate,
influence and act on their life contexts and the groups and communities they belonged to. If,
for these adults their ability to engage in an individual action, to mobilise resources and to
access to and benefit from institutional life opportunities was widened, there does not seem
to be any reference concerning involvement in organized and collective actions as members
of any of several communities available to them, be they professional, local, or others.
Therefore, we must try to understand, following the questioning suggested by Lash (1997),
how can one discuss these adults’ involvement in education when we consider the
construction of the collective (institutional) and social reflexivity? In other words, what are the
structural and biographical conditions that constitute the winners and the losers of reflexivity?

ENDNOTES

(1) By itinerary, Casal means a biographical mode of acquisition of position and of social
stratification. For this reason, an itinerary is the outcome of the institutional opportunities
accorded the subjects along their lives, of the biographical options made by the individuals
themselves on the basis of their frameworks of references, of their interests and problems, as
well as the social conditions. Given the complexity of the itineraries’ analysis, Casal argues
that these aspects must be taken into account and understood in the interconnection
established between them (Casal, 2003, p. 180).
(2) Excerpts from interviews identified by I.
(3) Excerpts from portfolio identified by P.
(4) Fictional names.
(5) Fictional designation.
(6) Outside the school institution, João indicated that, as a child, he attended catechesis and
made the First Holy Communion, he did the compulsory military service for four months in
1992 and got his driver’s license in 1995 in a driving school.
Accordingly, less than half, 41.97%, would have completed at least the secondary education (Conselho Nacional de Educação, 2013, p. 33). In fact, in 1991, more than 10 years after Olinda interrupted her studies at the age of 12, more than 20% of children between 10 and 11 years old, did not attend school (Azevedo, 2013, p. 38).

The recognition of prior learning process involved (as the last step to get the school certification) the learners’ presentation of their portfolio to a jury including several adult educators.

Those “specific interrelationships” are referred by some researchers through the expression formations of lifelong learning (in German Bildungsgestalten) (Hof & Fischer, 2010, p. 47).

REFERENCES


ABSTRACT

I have attempted, in this contribution, to explore the possibility of a reciprocally beneficial dialogue between pedagogical/educational and medical/clinical knowledge. Starting from this epistemological premise, I propose a critical examination of the problems surrounding the cognitive, methodological and procedural paradigms underlying most training projects aimed at healthcare professionals, doctors, nurses and so on, who operate excessively, at least in the Italian context, according to an instrumental and technical logic. This also brings into play adult education. In this perspective the proposal advanced here is for training that adopts the paradigm of narrativity and narration, in an auto-reflexive and autobiographical sense, in order to provide clinical care professionals with writing skills that they can, in their turn, propose to their patients. All this within the interpretative channel of existentialist-phenomenology and narrativist constructivism: two conceptual and methodological/practical outlooks that are duly attentive to individuals’ representations and experiences.

PAPER

Is a dialogue between pedagogy and medicine possible? (Bertolini, 1994). If it is, what are its aims and who is it to benefit? The patient, the medical/healthcare professional, the relationship one hopes may develop between them? Or even the organization within which the projected care intervention is to take place? Can adult education and its interrelated question of training aimed at adults – in this case, healthcare professionals – legitimately remain on the sidelines of theoretical speculation, of field research and of experimentation with alternative/innovative procedures in this context? Or is it, rather, called into play at these three levels? What attitude towards the training of professionals, and consequently towards healthcare, might seem most coherent and pertinent within a perceptual horizon embracing pedagogical/educational knowledge and skills and medical/clinical knowledge and skills?

These are just some the questions this paper intends to raise, advancing the proposal for narrative/auto-reflexive/(auto)biographical orientation (Castiglioni, 2013 a; Zannini, 2008), centred on stories of doctor/patient care (Bert, 2007; Castiglioni, 2013 a, et al.,) within a wider epistemological and operative framework, such as that of narrative medicine, to be redirected, in its turn, under the perspective of Medical Humanities (Bert, 2007; Charon, 2007; Masini, 2005; Moja, Vegni, 2000; Zannini, 2008).

We may start from the first question and adopt the viewpoint of Piero Bertolini – the major representative of the phenomenological approach on the panorama of Italian pedagogy. As early as the 1990s, Bertolini had examined the idea that the confrontation between pedagogy and medicine, as sciences placing the human being and the various situations involving it at the centre of their attention, is inevitably and significantly necessary. Such situations include
pain, suffering and illness. Care, as in our own case, clearly plays a significant role (Bertolini, 1994, p.55). The extent and educative significance of the doctor and the various medical/healthcare operators does not seem anomalous, therefore, given that the operative concept of therapeutic education finds increasing legitimization in medical and clinical practice. This in spite of the fact that, more often than not – at least as regards the Italian situation – the question seems not to have been sufficiently and qualitatively asked: what do we really and realistically mean by therapeutic education? What semantic assumption does the term “education” involve? Paradoxically, rather than being assumed pedagogically, as we might reasonably expect, since it belongs to the proprium of pedagogy, it risks being associated with an exclusively medical, or at times psychological, language. Thus the pedagogic/educational outlook in and towards medicine does not constitute, we may say, the normality of medical knowledge and action. As a consequence, when therapeutic education is referred to, the impression is given of improvised projects and operations, excessively dependant upon specific, critical, transitory or even degenerative clinical conditions or situations. Yet, while it cannot be denied that therapeutic education is more helpful with some pathologies than others, it is also true that, even in these same situations, it risks becoming reduced excessively to the informative/prescriptive dimension. In this way it loses its ability to show how a comforting and reassuring, and therefore significant, relational container can be constructed. By locating the medical/prescriptive information within this container, it can acquire a meaning, not only from the doctor’s point of view, which is not in doubt, but from that of the patient, who needs to comprehend and absorb this communication, not just take in the words. The word-pairing information-reception needs to be flanked by the word-pairing comprehension-signification (Bertolini, 1994, p.55), exactly as is claimed by the phenomenological perspective and the narrativist constructivism which is guiding our reflections in this paper.

In this sense, Bertolini states:

“That there can or even should be a significant meeting between two sciences, or even only between two branches of wisdom, which deal from opposing points of view with man and his way of ‘being in the world’, need not surprise us. Reality, in fact, is always highly complex and strongly unitary, and is for this very reason open to investigation and inquiry on account of the many ‘unities of sense’ with which it is interpreted, ‘read’, or even ‘constituted’ inter-subjectively (…)’ (1994, p.55).

Hence, continuing the author’s thought, the impossibility for any science, including that of medicine, to propose itself as exclusively absolute and definitive, bearing in mind, above all, that it has to come to terms with daily existence, with dimensions such as the experience of illness, care, assistance, etc., which by the nature of their specific and contextual problems and emotions, distance themselves from an interpretative lens that is only, or excessively, technical or biomedical. Medicine and doctors do not deal with the illness in exclusively biomedical terms but have of necessity to face up to the question of the illness, as the patient and his/her family represent it and experience it in the singular and specific context of their environment and their lives (Bert, 2007; Charon, 2007; Good, 2006). The “object” with which the doctors, nurses and so on are working is something complex that needs to be approached and understood in a similarly detailed, complex and multi-disciplinary manner (Bertolini, 1994, p.65). Bert underlines strongly how the patient can recover from even a serious illness, a tumour for example, without necessarily recovering at the same time from
the illness-problem. This, we might add, is a problem for him or her, and the doctor cannot assume responsibility for it during the therapeutic programme (Bert, 2007, p.37).

We will deal below with this “assumption of responsibility” in an educational and (self-) training perspective for both doctor and patient. This will be part of a specific and alternative training project for professionals, of a constructivist matrix. If this matrix is authentically faithful to its humanistic origins it cannot avoid dealing with adult education as scientific and profoundly generative/transformative knowledge, oriented, among its many manifestations and finalities, at constructing formative devices with the purpose of improving and raising critical awareness of the professional identity of those operating in healthcare establishments, an identity not only and always centred on professionalizing and managing the operator’s professional role. We might add, with pertinence to this epistemological and methodological option, that the “hospital”, where the doctor, nurse and so on spend much of their time, and for long periods of their lives, is par excellence “the place that brings us face to face with the pain and death of others and induces personal reflections and conclusions. Healthcare professionals are explicitly called upon to show their “humanity” (…)” (Parrello and Osorio Guzmán, 2009, p.290). This does not simply mean being a good, kind, sociable or human doctor (Bert, 2007), though obviously we all hope to find these qualities in a doctor. Rather, it requires them to put technique momentarily on one side and re-turn within themselves, as man or woman, as healthcare professional, to re-discover “the time I was a patient”, “the time I received care”, “the time I experienced pain personally or as a family member”, “the time I was waiting outside the hospital ward (Bert, 2007; Castiglioni, 2013; Charon, 2007; Zannini, 2008), etc. This may generate a cycle whereby a closer approach to the self can facilitate a closer approach to the patient and a closer approach to the patient can facilitate a closer approach to the self (Virzi e Signorelli, 2007). The relationship the doctor develops with the patient becomes central to the care and attention imparted, according to an approach to care – followed here – that recovers its deeper existential dimension (Iori, 2007; Mortari, 2006; Palmieri, 2008). The care, moreover, is made to structure around the paradigm of narrativity and narration (Masini, 2005) which, as we shall see later, are not necessarily synonymous. Hence the centrality of the care relationship as meeting and confrontation, at least between two stories, that of the doctor and that of the patient, each with its own experiences and meanings (Bert, 2007; Zannini, 2008), which must be able to find a point of inter-section, where the suffix inter, as we know very well, makes a far from casual reference to the term relation. It is therefore only within a relation which, as such, is something phenomenologically and dynamically incarnate, that a process can be co-constructed, that an inter-section of meanings – in this case, between doctor and patient – can take place.

Once again, what is being questioned is the paradigm of medicine within which the key-word – as Bertolini reminds us – is not only “healing”, but also “meaning” (1994, p.19). For this reason the doctor not only possesses knowledge and technical skills which today, fortunately, are also highly refined:

“(…) but must be able, not only to understand the meaning the illness assumes for the patient and the perspective of his/her healing, but also to ‘work’ on those meanings. He/she must know how to share or reject them, exploit them or minimize them, but always in an understanding manner and with that attitude of maximum openness that derives from genuine respect for the person".
This brings into play, in the writer’s opinion, pedagogical knowledge and, even more specifically, adult education and a possible and desirable reciprocal collaboration between Departments of Medicine and Departments of Educational Science, at least as regards the current Italian situation, where these entities remain fairly separate. This in the perspective – we might say, according to the Bruner method – of a cycle of “loans” of knowledge and viewpoints, where medical knowledge may stimulate pedagogic-educational knowledge to inhabit, increasingly realistically, the places of clinical care, moving between limitations and genuine opportunities. While, conversely, pedagogic knowledge may stimulate medical/clinical knowledge to recover its matrix of knowledge from the “human” face. Which means reconsidering the education of future generations of doctors, nurses, etc., as well as of serving professionals. This is a question involving both medicine and the adult education sector of pedagogy.

On this matter, Ignazio Marino writes:

“No university course (…) teaches what you feel when you become part of the medical or surgical staff of a hospital. You learn at your own expense, at the sick person’s expense, facing daily people who are ill, who often have their days counted or who are undergoing incredible suffering. Nor does anyone teach you how to relate to the patients’ family members who ask for news but above all for certainties, even when there is practically nothing certain to tell them. In other words, doctors are not prepared and equipped to deal with patients’ physical and psychological suffering, and this is probably one of the reasons why relations between doctors and relatives, and at times even between doctors and patients, are so complex. Maybe it is this incapacity, this limit, that inclines doctors to detach themselves emotively from human situations, rather than excessive self-defence or indifference” (2005, p.24).

In view of the premises of this paper, it is to be hoped that adult education, in universities as well as in other training institutes – entities that unfortunately remain substantially separated in Italy – might introduce:

“within the range of its theoretical investigations and research – to a much greater degree than at present – the central relationship between medical knowledge and clinical action. It should conceive the latter as covering care and (self-)training and (self-)educational processes regarding adult individuals. It should include this central relationship in a project which – involving as it does (self-)training, (self-)education, care of oneself and others – would undoubtedly be broad, complex and problematic. A project that would nevertheless be of vital importance – both for “those receiving care” and “those providing it” – insofar as it takes upon itself, reflexively and operatively, the experience of a sick man or woman as an experience of profound existential meaning, and as a possible condition – with legitimate and comprehensible emotive flutterings – for (self-)learning, greater awareness of the self, of one’s own resources, fragility or limits. A possible condition, too, for inner consolidation and evolutionary reinforcement, where clinical conditions and the progress of the illness provide the practical opportunities for this wholly individual, subjective and profoundly intimate pathway/process” (Castiglioni, 2013, b, p.10)

The dimensions and orientations outlined so far may constitute the salient points around which to structure a proposal for narrative, auto-reflexive and autobiographical education for healthcare professionals within the wider perspective of Medical Humanities, of which Narrative Medicine is a part.
What are the Medical Humanities? More than just a body of disciplines, or even more than just a series of “innovative” practices and tools for professionals use, the Medical Humanities constitute something profoundly more complex, and in some ways more difficult. They coincide, in fact, with a knowing assumption by the provider of medical-clinical-type care that translates into an inescapable certainty that care – understood existentially – is necessarily and inevitably given within and by means of that relationship (Palmieri, 2000). The care is undoubtedly of a medical/therapeutic nature but it is equally the relationship the doctor is able to build with the single, specific patient. A relationship that is more or less clinically demanding, more or less emotionally problematic. The care is also the quality of the relationship – as stated by Palmieri (2000) – and as such it is, above all, a mental choice by the professional (Bert, 2007, p.15) which reveals, we may even say, what sort of operator he/she really is inside. Certainly he/she will reveal ambivalences, contradictions and critical aspects that can be eliminated and need always to be contextualized. Medical Humanities, therefore, are inspired by the theoretical and methodological/procedural principle proper to Narrative Medicine, also known as bio-psycho-social medicine, which is differentiated from traditional, or bio-medical, medicine in that it puts the doctor/patient relationship, and not just the pure biological-medical data, at the centre of its attention (Moja e Vegni, 2000).

The doctor or narrative operator, as we have defined him in previous papers (Castiglioni, 2013, a), makes his own, therefore, the paradigm of narrativity (Masini, p.11), as style and inner posture, explicated in the care relationship and subsequently – even in the presence of certain essential variables belonging to a number of levels, as we shall see briefly below – assists the patient in producing a narration, or story, about himself/herself, about his/her illness, about the therapeutic project, and so on (Bert, 2007). De facto, the doctor supports the patient in producing points of view, representations, emotions, experiences, concerning what is happening, concerning this event/illness that may prove a sort of watershed in the lives of each one of us: the “before” and the “after”. An “after” that almost certainly, but not necessarily and always, involves loss and involution. All this is aligned with Bruner’s constructivist teachings but also with the phenomenology which, as we have already had the opportunity to note, constitutes our conceptual scenario of reference.

In order to do this the doctor and the professional must have experimented upon themselves, during their training, what it means to narrate, to narrate oneself, to put into words, orally or in writing, one’s professional and healthcare practice, to record one’s personal memory of the “care received”. Within the educational projectuality, advanced herein, of a narrative/auto-reflexive/autobiographical type.

There is much to be gained, in my opinion, from similarly-oriented training. For lack of space I summarize the arguments only partially (those interested are referred, in particular, to Bert, 2007, Castiglioni 2013 and Zannini, 2008). I wish to make it clear at once that writing is the favoured tool, according to the orientation of the Demetrio research group, of which the writer is part. Here, then, are the principal points:

- leading the doctor towards a writing practice that is not technical/scientific, that of anamnesis, of diagnosis, of the clinical case, to which he/she has obviously been accustomed since his/her university years (Bert, 2007; Good, 2006); a writing practice that is always comprehensible and, while fully professional as regards clinical practice and care, takes into account emotions, questions, doubts, reconsiderations, shifts and changes of focus, reflections as to what the patient and/or his/her family members
may be thinking and experiencing, but also as to what the doctor, generally disinclined to face up to his/her personal emotions, is thinking and feeling. A writing practice that produces relational awareness and, for the relationship with the patient, sentimental awareness (Iori, 2007). For the sentiments chiefly known and elaborated, this will result in reciprocal sharing of experiences, those of the doctor and those attributed to the patient, albeit in dubitative form since, as Bruner reminds us (1992), narration always moves within the range of probabilities, of the “maybe yes” and the “maybe no”;

− carefully considered use of the word “medical”, which not infrequently gives rise to fears, anxieties, worries or even panic (Bert, 2007). If the word is needed for written communication, it should be critically assessed, refined, explained and defined so that it can convey to the patient a thought that is more narratively open, precise, coherent, pertinent and attentive towards his/her needs, desires and expectations. It is here, on this page of professional writing, that the doctor should ask himself how this “uncomfortable”, emotionally taxing word would be best used as part of a relational dialogue with the patient, for the word “medical”, if narratively prefigured and consolidated, can help the patient to view it more positively and accept it with less difficulty;

− opportune reflection on the word most used, or, conversely, that which is least used, to narrate that specific patient, the uniqueness of the relationship established with him/her. This means an ability to reflect on the image the professional has of the patient and of the relationship between himself/herself and the patient;

− familiarization with tools of the narrative type that can help to redimension the existential gap, or autobiographical gap (Charon, 2007), between the doctor and the patient: for example, the parallel file used by Rita Charon (2007), which gathers the patient’s viewpoints and experiences relating to his/her illness, the emotions involved, information on the context where he/she lives and works, his/her auto-reflexive diary, etc.;

− development of narrative sensibility and sensitive listening;

− bridge-building between one’s own world and that of the patient (Bert, 2007, p.63);

− strengthening of imaginative propensity and skill, or rather, as Martha Nussbaum has defined it, albeit in relation to another reflexive area, that of narrative imagination, “the ability to be an intelligent reader of other people’s stories, that is to say the capacity to put yourself in another person’s shoes” (2011, p.111) “after first putting yourself in your own shoes”, as Tramma reminds us (2003, p.27).

These dimensions were taken into consideration when planning the educational programme intended by the writer for medial/healthcare volunteers and professionals of the Associazione di Volontariato Oncologico Triangolo of Lugano (Dr. M. Varini and Dr. O. Varini) and the Clinica S. Anna of Lugano (Dr. M. Varini). The programme began in 2008 and has a duration of five years.

At this point, we need to decide what may be the advantage or effectiveness of the practice of writing with the patient, specifying the pathologies for which it is used and which are discussed in the literature, such as tumours, degenerative diseases such as ALS, AIDS, chronic diseases such as diabetes, psychosomatic or depressive symptomatologies, minor or frequent as the consequence of a major physical disease, to
cite just a few of the most-reported cases (Charon, 2007; Bert, 2008; Solano, 2007; Zannini, 2008).

Before examining, even briefly, the repercussions of the exercise of writing by the patient, we need to remember that, like all the tools available to us in relation to help and support, the practice needs to be carefully and sensitively contextualized. We must ask ourselves, therefore:

- what type of familiarity the patient has with writing;
- which autobiographical themes it is preferable to deal with and, consequently, which writing exercises it is best to propose, delay or even avoid (Pepe, 2007);
- who is the best person to conduct a writing laboratory (a volunteer? a nurse? an expert in autobiographical methodology?) (Castiglioni, 2013 a; Zannini, 2008);
- in which phase of the disease or the therapy it is preferable to propose a space for writing,

bearing in mind that we are dealing with major pathologies and with therapies that may be invasive (Castiglioni, 2013);

- where should the writing device be placed. In the hospital? In a neutral space? As part of home assistance? (Castiglioni, 2013).

All this implies particular care in forming the group of patients to whom the writing project and conduction of the laboratory is to be addressed (Castiglioni, 2013; Zannini, 2008).

But why we should propose writing to the patient, always within the perspective of an agreed proposal and never in the absence of minimal interest, motivation or curiosity on the part of the patient? I believe the reasons are numerous. Let us consider at least a few (Castiglioni, 2013):

- the opportunity to exploit a space and time for oneself, well sheltered from the external (as well as internal) dis-orientation to which the patient is exposed, and for a time that may be far from short if the disease and the therapy are demanding. The patient may need/wish to have be surrounded by silence, restorative silence, that will allow him/her to re-discover himself/herself, at least a little;
- the opportunity to re-observe oneself, since one can find one’s own reflection in a story/image of oneself, felt from within, which may provide a sense of re-composition where the disease can generate a breaking-down, a dis-integration, even a loss of the self;
- the opportunity to experiment a generative and lenitive shifting of thought, starting with the act of writing, its opening words and – “while I write” – a shifting also of the experience of the disease and its care;
- the opportunity to exploit a sort of pathway/path with which to record and conserve emotions, including positive ones, steps ahead, re-conquests, a sort of emotive diary of one’s personal story of illness and therapy;
- the opportunity to give oneself an anchorage, a place where one can even put a full stop followed by new paragraph, we re-commence, starting right there;
the opportunity to give oneself, simply, a commitment/project for the day, maybe shared with others experiencing the same situation;

These, for example, were the aims of the writing laboratory activated by two volunteers of the Associazione Triangolo of Lugano after experimenting with the writer – as mentioned above – a training programme of about five years on autobiographical methodology, also involving doctors, a psycho-oncologist, a nurse and a social assistant of the Clinica S. Anna, also in Lugano. This was a writing workshop, still operating, aimed at a small group, homogenous by age and stage of disease, of the association’s tumour patients, for whom the proposal met with their wishes.

Now that we are reaching the final part of our reflections, we would like to describe, if only partially, the results, or repercussions, of this proposal with professionals and patients. It needs to be emphasized that this represents, in Italy, an entirely initial and limited training project involving care and research. Limited, among other things, by the number of experiences activated and monitored, by the temporal dimension and by its fragmentation on the national territory. Even the writer’s experience, which took place, as already mentioned, in Italian-speaking Switzerland, allows us to advance no more than the positive response to the training by those professionals – not all of them – who were able to experiment the practice of writing with the patient or patients, after experimenting it upon themselves; in a couple of cases they added system and methodological rigour to what they were doing. This led, about two years ago, to the setting up of a writing workshop – to which we have already briefly referred – aimed at a small group of tumour patients and coordinated by two volunteers of the Associazione di Volontariato Oncologico Triangolo of Lugano. Begun in an exploratory manner, this has now reached its fifth edition. Patients' reactions are certainly positive. They experienced this writing space also as a space for projectuality within their daily lives where they could “share time together”, as well as a life-experience, the disease, which brought them together, but on which the two volunteers did not dwell in what may be called an a priori manner.

We should also bear in mind that it is not easy to assess the results of a methodology that deals with subtle and wide-ranging dimensions of the “human being”. For scientific rigour, therefore, we refer to the studies of Bert (2008), Charon (2007) and Solano (2007), which emphasize that the benefits are physical as well as emotive.

We may conclude by adding that in the Italian context, in alignment with the findings of the literature of the sector, the narrative/autobiographical outlook in the education of medical/healthcare professionals and the use of the practice of writing with patients, where it is used at all, is limited to the areas of oncological diseases (Istituto Europeo di Oncologia of Milan; Ospedale S. Gerardo of Monza; Ospedale di Aviano, to mention a few), of diabetology types 1 and 2 (Marina Trento-Torino), home assistance to SLA patients (AnnaMaria Emolumento-Fondazione Maddalena Grassi-Milano) and terminal diseases.

We would like to close by describing an inter-university research project, of which the writer is scientific manager, to be set up by the University of Milano-Bicocca. Beginning in September 2013, its first exploratory phase, of a qualitative type, will aim to examine the real possibilities, already present or foreseeable, in medical/healthcare and care
institutes, for narrative medicine and narrative/autobiographical care practices. At the same time the project will examine what is meant by “narrative paradigm” in help and care relationships, given that narration embraces all these practices in the healthcare context. This research programme also proposes to activate focus groups aimed at Department of Medicine tutors to sound out the margins, greater or lesser, for a collaboration with Departments of Educational Science for a possible inclusion of laboratory modules concerning the science and practice of narration in traditional curriculums. This with a view to possible collaboration in organizing post-graduate programmes such as Masters or Finishing Courses.

Starting from this investigation we will attempt to understand, in a second phase, which are the hospital situations, and in the presence of which variables, where writing devices might be set up aimed at patients, and in particular oncological, terminal, degenerative or chronic patients.

**Notes:**

- The author illustrates her point by breaking down the Italian words in a way that is impossible to translate. “Incontro” [meeting] is divided into “in-contro” [in-against], “confronto” [confrontation] is divided into “con-fronto” [with-front] – translator’s note.

**BIBLIOGRAPHY**

P.M. Bellini, *Scrivere di sé*, Ibis-Como, Pavia, 2000


D. Demetrio, *La scrittura clinica, consulenza autobiografica e fragilità esistenziali*, Raffaello Cortina, Milan, 2008


M. Castiglioni, “Le pratiche di scrittura e il contesto medico-sanitario”, in D. Demetrio, *Educare è narrare. Le teorie, le pratiche, la cura* (with writings by E. Biffi, M. Castiglioni, E. Mancino), Mimesis, Edizioni, Milan, 2013, a


L. Formenti, La formazione autobiografica, Guerini e Associati, Milan, 1998


B.J. Good, Narrare la malattia. Lo sguardo antropologico sul rapporto medico-paziente, Einaudi, Turin, 2006

V. Iori, “Scrittura e sentimenti nelle professioni di cura”, in D. Demetrio (edited by), Per una pedagogia e una didattica della scrittura, Unicopli, Milan, 2007

L. Iori, “Una procedura inserita in un contesto: effetti di variazioni nelle istruzioni e nei tempi”, in L. Solano (edited by), Scrivere per pensare. La ritrascrizione dell’esperienza tra promozione della salute e ricerca, Franco Angeli, Milan, 2007

V. Masini, Medicina narrativa, Comunicazione empatica ed interazione dinamica nella relazione medico-paziente, Franco Angeli, Milan, 2005

E.A. Moja, E. Vegni, La visita medica centrata sul paziente, Raffaello Cortina, Milan, 2000

L. Mortari, La pratica dell’aver cura, Bruno Mondadori, Milan, 2006

M.C. Nussbaum, Non per profitto. Perché le democrazie hanno bisogno della cultura umanistica, Il Mulino, Bologna, 2011

C. Palmieri, La cura educativa. Riflessioni ed esperienze tra le pieghe dell’educare, Franco Angeli, Milan, 2000

J.W. Pennebaker, Scrivi cosa ti dice il cuore. Autoriflessione e crescita personale attraverso la scrittura, Erickson, Trento, 2004

L. Pepe, “Una procedura inserita in un contesto: effetti di variazioni nelle istruzioni e nei tempi”, in L. Solano (edited by), Scrivere per pensare. La ritrascrizione dell’esperienza tra promozione della salute e ricerca, Franco Angeli, Milan, 2007

A. Smorti, Il pensiero narrativo. Costruzione di storie e sviluppo della conoscenza sociale, Giunti, Florence, 2004


G. Starace, Il racconto della vita. Psicoanalisi e autobiografia, Feltrinelli, Milan, 2004


A. Virzì, M.S. Signorelli, Medicina e narrativa, Franco Angeli, Milan, 2007

L. Zannini, Medical humanities e medicina narrativa. Nuove prospettive nella formazione dei professionisti della cura, Raffaello Cortina, Milan, 2008
1. INTRODUCTION

In the educational research the question is which educational processes for lifelong learning beside specific vocational and technical qualification, respectively advanced training, may act beneficially and promote development in such uncertain times subjectively rated as uncertain and which operate emotionally resource strengthening. Here the importance of emotional learning has been recognized. Adult education research focused in recent years with profound emotional based handicaps of education and development in form of learn-resistant persons, (Häcker, 1999), who were approached for example with concepts of emotional learning through self-reflexivity (Arnold, 2003). What is missing is a reference to key content such as body, movement and emotions. This means possible ways of obtaining for example, pro-developing emotional self-reflexivity. To fill this gap, we need empirical research on effects of exemplary courses that integrate this dimension of education (body movement, emotion) to be able to meet development related conclusions.

2. RESEARCH CONCERNS

The thesis of the present research is that body-related health education causes emotional strengthening of resources and thus by means of emotion perception, -expression and -play beside health and stabilization informative, emancipatory and/or creative potentials can be developed which are important for daily and professional activities - even in new and unknown situations.

For a long time such offers concerning body-related health education, used by 80% women were ridiculed "only" as women's education and reduced to their stereotyped assumed communication needs and body awareness (cf. Venth, 2001, 2006). This view is based partly in the still traditional separation of feeling/emotion and intellect, of supposed social unimportance and importance of physical emotional vs. cognitive acquisition of knowledge. Dispassion or the mastery of emotions is seen even today in many contexts as a professional property in working life. (compare Arnold, 2003) However, we know that learning and development are intertwined with those accompanying (promoting or inhibiting) emotions. Emotions are physical and provide the motivation system of man (Izard, 1999). They have "a development and learning history, a particular environmental reference, a more or less stable anchoring in the personality, relationships with self-image and identity, visual external effects, such as in certain performances or certain abnormalities and disorders, emotions are closely connected with all the other processes within the experiences and actions of a person. (Ulich, 1989, p. 17) Neurobiological and emotion-psychological research of the 90s brought about a slow change in attitudes with respect to human emotions, because it was proved that cognitive processes (learning, decisions, etc.) are associated with emotion and linked (Damasio, 2000; Roth, 2001). The knowledge about the functions of emotions has far-
reaching consequences for many scientific disciplines, including pedagogy. Because emotions are associated with:

→ self and world knowledge (cf. Ulich, 1989)
→ memory and memory processes (cf. Roth, 2001),
→ decision-making (Damasio, 2000),
→ health and disease (Bauer, 2004).

Discontinuous employment histories (Preißer, 2002) becoming increasingly standard these days and the need for establishing changing relationships more frequently require a differentiated emotion in order to make new choices over and over (even without prior experience) and to tolerate uncertainty (Gieseke, 2007). The purely cognitive information provided is often not sufficient for orientation. Here the individual remains with nobody to help and his (emotional in memory and thus physically stored) experiences. Of these requirements men and women are equally affected. Since formation processes and further development of emotional schemes (Ulich, Volland & Kienbaum, 1999) in adulthood are possible (Saarni, 2002), the presently investigated education offers are also attractive for men who are still poorly represented. The strong female demand for body-related offerings of health education in adult education (e. g. adult education centers) is surviving from the 80s until today, and refers to the educational needs that are interwoven with the ego, with body and gender role (Hess, 2002). There is a further need for orientation for the ego and caused by the ego and change of consciousness, change of behavior, maintaining physical functioning as well as new perceptual and experience ability (see Bättner, 1998, p 30).

3. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

Emotional resource requirements occur, for example, in cases of emotional stress or illness, because emotions show up due to di- stress limits in relation with attention, reaction, memory functions, concentration, etc. (Roth, 2001). Emotional stress can support mental, but also physical illnesses (Bauer, 2004). Negative experiences are saved as somatic markers (Damasio, 2000) in the body. Each story is an individual body disease history. In the case of certain emotion linkings and a certain intensity, it is possible that emotions become initiators for learning and educational education (Schäffter, 1997; Otto, 2005). They can be as well experienced, developed and processed off-therapy in educational institutions, since adults here still are able and willing to launch changing processes by concentrating on the own body, on the own emotions.

Health problems and desperate situations result from lack of recognition, particularly concerning women from a lack of professional, social or private relationships, respectively acceptance. This can be noticeable somatically conscious or unconscious as well as in a roundabout way (Gieseke, 1997; Hess, 2001). Emotional processes are physical processes and are based on every single individual previous experience that is stored in the limbic system of the brain (Roth, 2001). Emotional socialization (Ulich, Volland & Kienbaum, 1999) and gender socialization (Meuser, 2004; Keddi, 2004) let men and women develop partly different strategies to perceive, develop and regulate their emotions (Friedl Meier, 1999). The existing homosocial spaces offer emotional open rooms as well as spaces for gender specific self-insurances (Meuser, 2001) or ways of physically allowed contact between them. Athletic exercise has been shown its positive results and to value the individual decision for it. At the
same time specific educational and reflexive body-oriented health education program offers
can develop beside short-term results also long-term stabilizing and enlightening effects.

4. METHODICAL DESIGN

A corresponding study of long-term emotional resource-related effects of such education
participations required the design of an appropriate qualitative research design and therefore
the effectiveness research: Biographic-narrative interviews were combined with group
discussions in longitudinal section shape. Previous engagements with effects of educational
processes are mostly based on testing the learning objective or measuring of success based
on specific conceptions of learning outputs (Gnahs, 2007), what might be supported in those
studies, but is more difficult in the open problem-oriented offerings of body-oriented health
education and had to be amplified. Body-oriented health education includes courses of
relaxation, yoga, back-exercises, some dance, biodanza, movement theater, etc. They differ
from sports because they are not related to competitive disciplines, are not subject to rules,
measurable criteria such as weight, length, gates, speed, grades are not of importance
(Holzapfel, 1995). The motivation is self-referential individual and without competition.

The object-adapted choice of methods integrated the gender perspective in such a way that
according to these biographical case studies, intensive interviews etc. reflect rather feminine
needs and abilities (Becker- Schmidt & Bilden, 1995), because a female participation of over
80% was to be expected, whereas men preferred quantitative methods. The method of group
discussion was brought in as an extension, where then the participating men could also be
found, because these discussions differed from the private sphere and depth dimension of
the first method. However, because of the little control test, generalizable gender specific
characteristics cannot be formulated but there can only appear small trends.

5. SOME SELECTED RESULTS

Emotional resources that here are built on the participation and/or expanded, appear in their
significance for individual health behavior to go as skills beyond the construct of emotional
stability of health psychology, because it is not only (but also) dealing with the ability of
function and standards of adaptability to norms and social expectations, but also with
potentials for an individual open development in the form of emancipation and the ability to
deal with criticism.

► Criticism and decision-making are possible through physical and emotional work and
intensive study. " ... If you are of course more occupied with yourself and busy with yourself,
then one cannot get so much influenced, I think, right? If you yourself come close to your
own feelings and your own will, and what is important to you and it once more points out
this...kind of...kind of feeling of freedom, right? So also to feel free in your own body and
then getting hold in the society ... and there ... yes, and to develop there a stronger
sensibility. When do I get controlled and when someone is crossing my border and there ...
there ... to develop a stronger sensibility." (woman)

" ... But actually I thought, ok, I just go there, have fun and a good time, right? But somehow
everything turned out to be differently, I’d have never thought so. But I think it is just fine that I
have found a way for myself to deal with my fears and now very soon also with my wishes. I wonder if those wishes are really my wishes?” (man)

- Body-related educational processes also constitute gender specific role-related potential awareness and education processes. "... So, when I go there, I would say to myself, I will always get more individual, right? So I look more and more what I actually want, and what does my body tell me and what kind of feeling do I have, without letting me talk into feelings by other people. And then maybe I get a feeling for my being a woman, right? (...) Relationship to my body as a woman (...)” (woman) “I consciously realized for the first time, (the…) the first time the hands of a man. Touched a man fully aware.” (man)

- Emotion work on movement and expression is evident as the rediscovery of senseability. It also allows further new horizons of experience.

"Much drilled and instilled, I think. So that one should not do so in daily life that one (...) that is striking ... because you always attract attention. You do not always want to attract attention and some people don’t want attract attention at all. And then, eh, one moves within a certain frame and just never gets out of it any more. So now when you then play physical theater, then yes you have to back out (...). Otherwise nothing moves on if you don’t come up with some expressiveness. But in the everyday life that is even more reduced." (woman). "Well, you can also just express all the emotions, so actually everything (...) also it's not so easy, it is necessary, you must practice it. (...) "you get somehow a better feeling for your body and maybe a feeling for the own feelings (expressive)." (man)

- Increase in self-awareness presents itself as a health resource to identify and break routines in order to stay healthy. "... Today is again Biodanza, then I look once more down into myself and I think, aha, like uh ... what exactly is going on with you, how are you today. And I don’t ... do it that way every day. And for me that is just a kind of hook or some kind of help just to break out of my routine to have a possibility to reflect about things. So... just to see, how I feel and to pay attention to what my body is telling me and not to ignore it and therefore stay healthy longer." (woman)

"(...) And yes at first I always assumed that I would let energy out and yes and this proximity, I mean the inner closeness, which we have now - well I call it now my child ... this inner well-being and this feeling and perception ... I’ve realized this only right at the end of the first course." (man)

All women as well as men feel resource requirements in privacy and occupation. Of men, the active participation of its participation are made increasingly verbally propagated concerning small successes, as to the women their view is more focused on the process level and its embedding.

Emotional resources play a central role in the profession. Especially occupational health studies point to the relationship between the decrease of social work relationships and the increase of psychosomatic disorders. Workplace health promotion should pay more attention to this aspect and could integrate offers from the general adult education into their offer.
REFERENCES:


227


THE ROLE OF INTRINSIC TRAINING MOTIVATION FOR SELF-PERCEIVED WORK ABILITY AND WORKING PAST RETIREMENT AGE

Thieme, Paula
Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin
Germany

Brusch, Michael
Hochschule Anhalt
Germany

Büsch, Victoria
SRH Hochschule Berlin
Germany

ABSTRACT

The ageing population phenomenon is due to decreasing birth rates and increased life expectancy during the last decades (Börsch-Supan & Wilke, 2009). As Germany relies on a pay-as-you-go pension system, regular retirement age will be increased stepwise to 67. Using data from the “Survey on continuing in employment in pensionable age”, this paper empirically investigates whether intrinsic motivation for continuous training (measured as intrinsic training motivation) has relevance for work ability and employment after reaching retirement age within the framework of social stratification. Results show significant positive correlations between intrinsic motivation for continuous training and self-assessed work ability and also post-retirement age employment. Differentiated for selected respondent groups the level of education has a significant influence. This effect was stronger than any differences with regard to gender, weekly working hours or employment contract duration. Results imply that external conditions only partly explain older individuals’ work ability or inclination to work past retirement age.

1. INTRODUCTION

Due to low fertility and a continuously increasing life expectancy in Germany the population is ageing as well as shrinking. It is foreseeable that the percentage of older people (65+) will increase from around 20% in 2010 to 28% in 2030 (Statistisches Bundesamt, 2009). At the same time, the absolute number of people of working age will decline from 49.6 million in the year 2010 to 43.5 million in 2030 (OECD, 2008). Since these changes will have consequences for the economy and social security system the German government decided to develop strategies to compensate these effects. Especially the pension system, organized as a pay-as-you-go system, needed reforms. Hence, in 2008 it was decided that from the year 2012 on the retirement age will be raised stepwise from 65 to 67. Furthermore the German government put into action the first demographic strategy called “every age counts” with six fields of action. One of these fields is “Keeping workers motivated, skilled and healthy” (Federal Ministry of the Interior, 2012). This accompanies the paradigm shift from widespread pre-retirement regulations to a prolonged working life. As a consequence, it is important to understand if individuals of the age of 55+ would be willing and able to continue working even beyond retirement age. This paper tries to give insights to the role of training
motivation for self-perceived work ability and the wish to work past retirement age. Retirement is a process that starts long before the actual act takes place. It is rooted in environmental factors, such as job characteristics or marital life and personal factors such as physical well-being, financial and skills status (Beehr, 1986). It can be shown that continuous training helps to keep people employable (e.g. Kenny et al., 2007; Staudinger/Heidemeier, 2009) and that upon reaching retirement age, individuals are still in rather good health with years of active time to spend (Tesch-Römer et al., 2006). The paper is structured as follows: First a general description of continuous training in Germany is given, second the role of socio-demographic factors for participation in vocational training is briefly summarized, in the third part the motivational factors for participating are described (in general, by gender and age), fourthly the outcome of training is shortly described followed by a short section of work ability. Thereafter the dataset is described and results of the statistical analysis are presented. The paper ends with a short conclusion.

2. CONTINUOUS TRAINING IN GERMANY

Continuous training is a rather vague term, standing in for various forms of education, training and learning during adulthood that individuals pursue out of personal interest and/or vocational necessity (comp. the German adult education survey, Bilger & von Rosenbladt, 2012). For survey purposes a classification between vocational training or in-service-training (taking place during paid working hours), individual job-related training (individually initiated and job-motivated) and job-unrelated training (mostly out of private interest) has been made. The German Institute for Adult Education uses the German Education Council’s definition of further education coined in 1970 (Deutscher Bildungsrat, 1970): the “continuation or resumption of organized learning after the completion of a first phase of education of various durations" and proposes that apart from other-directed and organized learning, self-organized learning has become an increasingly important form of learning that needs to be added to this definition (Bretschneider, 2007).

This addition marks the development of a cultural change that has taken place during the last decades: individuals are expected to become increasingly active on their own behalf, displaying the ability to self-organize themselves as an indicator of their competences (i.e. up-to-date knowledge and know-how) while qualifications once acquired during secondary and tertiary education continue to lose importance. This shift is due to changing work demands in Germany that require individuals to be able and willing to regularly acquire new knowledge and skills to find solutions to often changing problems rather than do routine task-solving (Dienel & Willke, 2004). This perspective on an individual’s self-development is also sometimes referred to as the imperative of “lifelong learning”, or self-directed learning (Garrison, 1997) which is one precondition for an individual to achieve and retain “employability” on the labour markets (Europäische Kommission, 1995). Thus, an individual’s affinity towards further training has become a point of interest in current job interviews and is perceived as an important factor in holding a job (Studiengemeinschaft-Darmstadt, 2012).
3. PARTICIPATION IN CONTINUOUS TRAINING

Continuous training research is often linked to the question of inequalities in participation. Analyses against the backdrop of social stratification seek to understand “who gets what and why” (Alexander, 2001), with different treatments according to sociological perspective employed. The concept of social stratification involves the ‘classification of people into groups based on shared socio-economic conditions’ (Barker, 2003) and the development of a hierarchy between these groups giving some more access to resources than others. Although the reality and the beliefs about this hierarchy are passed on between generations, it is changeable (Macionis & Gerber, 2010). Past research has identified numerous group-related incidents of inequality in training participation, e.g. gender- or age-related. Thus, this analysis also looks into the possible moderating role of several socio-demographic variables, such as age, gender, contract duration or weekly working hours.

In the following, a brief overview on the types of training taken and the status of training participation in Germany according to socio-demographic factors shall be given. Differences in training participation can be observed for, e.g. education, employment and employment-related factors, gender and age (Bilger & von Rosenbladt, 2012) and will be outlined in this section.

The 2012 national trend monitor on further training by the German Ministry of education and research showed 49% of Germans (25.1 million German individuals between 18 and 64 years) had partaken in training in 2012, the highest participation rate since 1979. These trainings were mostly induced by the employer, directly job-related and took place on average twice a year (Bilger & von Rosenbladt, 2012). Individually motivated training activities (either out of personal interest but usually also job-related interest) remained stable and made for about 40% of all trainings. All in all, 81% of trainings were directly job-related, and 83% were taken by working individuals.

3.1 AGE

With regard to age, Bilger & von Rosenbladt (2012) found individuals aged 55-64 to be the age group with the least training participation; nevertheless the level of participation has been increasing since 2007. Results suggest a curve with a peak (between 18-24 year olds and 45-49 year olds there is an increase from 49 to 54%, between those aged 50-54 and those aged 60-64 there is a decrease from 49 to 32%). Nevertheless, in the age group of 60 to 64 year olds there has been a strong growth in participation from 18% in 2007 to 32% in 2012. This effect is even stronger if one only looks at employed persons (also Görlitz & Tamm, 2012). If one corrects for employment situation, there is virtually no difference between age groups any longer (Wilkens & Leber, 2003; Bilger & von Rosenbladt, 2012). Still, as Iller (2008) points out, the overall low number of older workers’ participation should be analysed, especially as almost half of HR Managers still have a negative attitude towards vocational training for older workers (Brinkmann, 2007) and largely fail to encourage them to take part in vocational training.
3.2 GENDER

In case of gender, there is a strong difference between men and women of the age group of 50+ in training participation with regard to different industries (Huber, 2008). In the service sector the odds of women having training is quite higher than in production. Both sexes get less training as they age, especially if employed in small-sized firms (100-199 employees). Generally, women fare best in medium-sized firms (299-400 employees) while men fare best in larger firms (500-1999 employees) in terms of being offered training-on-the-job opportunities. If one corrects for employment situation and working hours, women train as much as men or even slightly more in case of full employment (Bilger & von Rosenbladt, 2012).

3.3 INCOME

The higher the gross income or the position in a company the more likely individuals partake in trainings, both effects being only applicable to training-on-the-job. Job-related training outside of the company seems to be of equal interest to both the highest and lowest income groups (Bilger & von Rosenbladt, 2012).

3.4 EDUCATION AND SKILL LEVEL

Education is a major factor for predicting participating in training: the group with the highest (school) education are twice as likely to partake in all forms of continuous training than that with the lowest degree of education (Bilger & von Rosenbladt, 2012). Nevertheless, using linked employer-employee data, job complexity and level of tasks were found to be better predictors of training participation than education, with manual routine tasks resulting in the lowest level of participation (Görlitz & Tamm, 2012). Just as Wittpoth (2009), Görlitz and Tamm argue that lower participation of routine workers might be due to those groups preferring learning by doing and learning in informal settings to formal training sessions which might be more fitting to non-routine task-solvers. A positive relationship of skills and participation is also documented by Pischke (2001) in his analysis of German panel data from years 1986-1989. Also, the higher the professional level, the more likely the participation in vocational training (Bilger & von Rosenbladt, 2012).

3.5 EMPLOYMENT CONTRACT AND WORKING HOURS

Having a fixed-term contract or a part-time job has a significantly detrimental effect on being offered vocational training opportunities (Wilkens & Leber, 2003). This was also confirmed by Bilger and von Rosenbladt (2012), where full-time employed individuals had more vocational training than part-time employees (49% versus 39%). In 2012, individuals with fixed-term contracts were slightly less likely to have vocational training (46%) than employees with permanent contracts (51%) though the effect was vice versa for individually sought out (but job-related) training, possibly mirroring personal efforts to increase employability in an unstable work situation. Workers were least likely to go into training (38%), while public servants were by far the most likely (81%) and employees (61%) and self-employed individuals (52%) ranging in the middle.
3.6 OTHER FACTORS

Though other studies show similar findings (Kuwan & Thebis, 2004), participation in vocational training or lack thereof cannot be exclusively explained by socio-demographic factors that are the basis of milieu-centered approaches in training participation research (Wittpoth, 2009). Participation might also depend on factors often left out of analyses such as informal obligation, social pressure, legal, union or company regulations that come along with a particular status, level of degree or education, which then make trainings more likely. Furthermore, contents and outcome of trainings are usually not analysed, but training is seen as a positive end in itself, so that lower participation is generally perceived negatively and in need of improvement. Arguably, non-participation can be found in all socio-demographic groups, implying that people have different ways to adequately handle their work and life environments, with classical classroom-based vocational training being only one possible way and, e.g. learning by doing another alternative (Göriltz & Tamm, 2012). However, representative studies did provide evidence for a positive effect of training on, e.g. job satisfaction and even negative effect if training was not offered (Huber, 2008).

4. CONTINUOUS TRAINING: THE ROLE OF MOTIVATION

Contrary to extrinsic motivation, which has an instrumental function, intrinsically motivated action is not triggered by external sources of motivation such as, e.g. peer pressure, obligation or rewards – intrinsically motivated individuals tend to act out of joy or interest related to the subject (Krapp & Ryan, 2002). Training motivation has been shown to be not exclusively contingent on external, e.g. organisational factors (e.g. organisation size, structure or leadership style) but also on internal factors (Mathieu & Martineau, 1997, Colquitt et. al, 2000) such as achievement motivation (Mathieu et al., 1993) or job-related personal variables such as job involvement, organizational and career commitment as well as career planning (Colquitt et al., 2000). Additionally, perceived self-efficacy and valence have been shown to have a strong effect on training motivation (Van Erde & Thierry, 1996).

A representative German study by TNS Emnid in 2009 shows more than half (60%) of all participants of all age groups to be interested in vocational training, with interest decreasing according to age (Berg et al., 2010). For individuals 50 years or older, the most important reason for not participating in training is lack of obligation (Huber, 2008), implying, possibly, a lack of intrinsic motivation. It seems that older age-groups (50+) are less interested in training, this was also observed by Schröder and Gilberg (2005). A similar Danish study also noticed the lack of motivation felt by older workers with regard to continuous training on the job, advising listening more closely to older workers’ actual needs and offering training in a familiar environment (Hansen & Nielsen, 2006). Older workers seem to have less motivation for further education than younger workers, possibly experiencing diminishing learning skills, which negatively affect learning motivation and self-efficacy (Dworschak et al., 2006). In accordance with Berg et al., expecting a poor pay-off for training ‘(…) may also contribute to higher lack of interest in training among workers with decreased work ability, because these workers have an increased risk for premature departure from working life and are, therefore, less inclined to invest in their professional career’ (Berg et al., 2010, p. 582).
5. CONTINUOUS TRAINING: OUTCOMES

As wages might not rise in accordance with accomplished trainings, especially in the case of older workers (Lang, 2012), non-monetary rewards such as promotion prospects, job security or other cognitive or emotional gains from training might be at least as important in motivating training. Increased feeling of job security as a result of training was found for older employees while monetary rewards seem more likely for younger employees – possibly due to the fact that younger employees often attend career-oriented trainings while older workers attend trainings helping to deal with new job requirements. Thus, differences in training rewards and expectations by age might be explained by different training purposes age-groups are exposed to (Lang, 2012).

Using job satisfaction as a measure to cover both monetary as well as non-monetary rewards of the training participation decision, Burgard and Görlitz showed training participation to be significantly positively correlated to job satisfaction for males – but not for females, controlling for several socio-demographic, job and firm characteristics. Furthermore, training characteristics such as career-orientation only boost job satisfaction for men and not for women (Burgard & Görlitz, 2011).

Intrinsic motivation for learning strongly influences learning outcomes (Schiefele & Schreyer, 1994). As participants' motivation to learn is 'influenced by beliefs concerning effort-performance and performance-outcome relationships, career/job attitudes, and reactions to skill needs assessment' (Noe, 1986, p. 743), participants with similar abilities will probably be more successful at acquiring knowledge and skills and be able to change behaviour and use that knowledge in their work with greater effectiveness if they are intrinsically motivated to train and learn (Noe, 1986).

Education science has brought forth various theories on self-directed learning and learning motivation, focussing on goal- and content-related conditions as well as interest-related aspects of learning. Within the latter, person-object-theory focuses on an individual's interest that is directed towards a certain subject, motivating the person to learn more about it and gain relevant skills and abilities (Krapp, 2005). With this interest comes a positive emotional association, further reinforcing the learning process. Similarly, self-determination theory hypothesizes that intrinsic or extrinsic motivation lead to different outcomes in terms of quality of emotional experience as well as differing quality of knowledge acquired. However, being very interested in learning something does not necessarily mean that one assumes to be skilled at it (Krapp & Ryan, 2002). In this broader context of this paper however, it is expected that an individual who is intrinsically motivated to learn or train does attribute himself or herself a higher degree of general work ability.

6. WORK ABILITY

Apart from an individual’s willingness to learn and train and the actual participation in trainings or their outcome, work ability is a necessary precondition to work well and for as long as possible. ‘Work ability’ seeks to measure ‘How good is the worker at present, in the near future, and how able is he or she to do his or her work with respect to the work demands, health and mental resources’ (Ilmarinen et al., 2005, p.3).
Work ability as measured in the Work Ability Index (WAI) developed by Ilmarinen et al. (2005) is influenced by four domains: (1) work demands and the environment, (2) work organisation and work community, (3) support for health and functional capacity, and (4) the maintenance of professional capacity (Tuomi et al., 2001). As workers need both physical as well as mental abilities that match job demands to perform their tasks successfully, the term “work ability” also depicts a balance between job requirements and individual characteristics, such as health, knowledge, skills or motivation (Berg et al., 2010). It has been debated whether WAI is one or two dimensional, new studies seem to support the latter notion, with an “ill-health-related factor” as one dimension and “subjectively estimated work ability and resources” as the second dimension (Martus et al., 2010), both being negatively correlated.

On average, within a group and with individuals ageing, the Work Ability Index was shown to be declining with age (Ilmarinen et al., 2005) though with decreasing stability. On an individual level, this effect is due to different personal biographies, health, training level or individual coping strategies employed to counter age effects. In addition to this, there is the effect of the different organisations on workers throughout their occupational biographies (Dworschak et al., 2006). In Ilmarinen’s study, in the oldest group aged 55-64, health and functional capacities as well as work factors influence work ability most. Competences, values and attitudes play a lesser role that further decreases with age.

Hardly any significant gender differences with regard to work ability were found. There seems to be a difference between individuals working physically as opposed to cognitive workers, with the latter enjoying higher work ability (Tuomi et al., 2001).

Follow-up studies (von Bonsdorff et al., 2010) have found that lower work ability predicts earlier retirement, between ages of 55 and 65 (Sell, 2009) and the reverse (Hopsu et al., 2005), higher scores of work ability leading to prolonged working life (Salonen et al., 2003). Slow deterioration of health in the years prior to retirement seems to be the main reason in deciding to retire early as Berg et al. (2010) could also confirm in focus groups, job-related physical and psychosocial stress being of lesser importance.

Striving to improve individuals’ work ability, the focus tends to be on organizational factors; effects of work demands and environment, health management or the development of professional competence (Tuomi et al., 2001). There is much less research on individual characteristics that influence work ability directly or indirectly, such as intrinsic motivation to learn or the wish to be employed after reaching retirement age and their possible role as moderators for the effectiveness of organisational or political efforts.

7. STAYING BEYOND PENSION ELIGIBILITY

First studies indicate that upon reaching retirement age, individuals are still in rather good health with years of active time to spend (Tesch-Römer et al., 2006). Actual retirement is less an event than a process that starts long before the actual act takes place. It is rooted in environmental factors, such as job characteristics or marital life and personal factors such as physical well-being, financial and skills status (Beehr, 1986; Shacklock et al., 2009).

Analysing the effects of specific measures for older employees (SMOE) on employment duration of workers aged 40 and above, a recent German longitudinal study indicated a
positive effect of mixed-age work teams for employment duration and a negative effect of part-time work offers. Training and special age-friendly work equipment did not seem to have any effect on prolonging working life (Boockmann et al., 2013). Physical hazard at work and hard or monotonous labour were detrimental to prolonged working life, as was stress and bad health. Wishing to stay longer at work was closely linked to the wish to pass on knowledge and experience to younger workers. Those who see themselves working past retirement age also cite fun at work as a main reason and that it helps them to stay fit. They feel strongly connected to their workplace and tend to feel too young to retire. Interestingly, with increasing income, willingness to work past retirement age actually decreases. It would seem likely that a person with a high intrinsic motivation to learn would also feel compelled to stay longer in employment as it may provide them with new experiences and knowledge which can also be passed on to younger workers. This effect is expected to be stronger for part-time workers and workers with fixed-term contracts as their income is lower or less stable. As women make up the majority of part-time workers (Kümmerling et al., 2008) their gender will be more affected by this effect.

8. EMPIRICAL INVESTIGATION

Finding and analysing factors which contribute to early or late retirement was the key motivation of the “Survey on continuing in employment in pensionable age” (Büscher et al., 2010) that provides the data for this analysis. Commissioned in 2008 by the Federal Institute for Population Research and motivated by the German pension reform, the survey questioned (via computer assisted telephone interviews) 1,500 dependent employees (i.e. workers and civil servants) aged between 55 and 65 in Germany. The sample is not representative for the older population in German as can be seen in, e.g. the overrepresentation of higher income classes for both sexes. 75% of respondents were under 60 years old and 44.4% were female. Most respondents work in small (10-49 employees) or medium (50-249) enterprises (each almost 25%). With regard to industry, most worked in the educational, social or health sector (25%), following by manufacturing industry (22%) and other services (22%).

8.1 OVERVIEW ABOUT THE EMPIRICAL INVESTIGATION

The survey generally concluded there is high propensity for working beyond pension eligibility, attributed to 47.3% of respondents claiming they could well or rather well envision working past retirement age, while 33.6% could not and 19.2% could rather not. Nevertheless, most respondents favour earlier retirement around 60 years while seeing the realistic entry into their retirement at around 65 years. Currently, pensionable age is raised, so the full pension is only available if the current pensionable age of 67 years is reached, otherwise deductions are made. Old age pension provided by the state is the usual old age provision for dependent workers in Germany and is paid out by the German Pension Insurance (Deutsche Rentenversicherung).

The sample consists of blue-collar workers (24.5%), white-collar workers (63.5%) and civil servants (12.0%). Due to different influences with respect to health and ability to work (i.e. blue-collar workers vs. the other groups) and with respect to old age provision systems (i.e.
civil servants vs. the other groups) the following analyses focus on white-collar workers only. This means, a sample of 953 employees will be used.

As shown in previous sections, learning motivation plays a vital part in predicting the degree of willingness to take part in continuous training. In our survey related to the continuing in employment in pensionable age we used the following items to measure intrinsic training motivation: "Continually learning new things is very important in my life", "I shall always strive to continually train", "I would very much like to know why things are the way they are" and "I like to attend continuous training classes" rated on a 5 point scale (with 1="strongly agree" to 5="strongly disagree"). To ensure data reliability the third item will not be considered for data analysis whereby an acceptable Cronbach's α (roundabout 0.7) is achieved for the intrinsic training motivation.

Our survey data directly measures self-assessed work ability among dependent workers. Therefore, the current work ability with regard to work is measured, as well as work ability five years ago and predicted work ability five years from now. All three items used again a 5 point scale (with 1="very high" to 5="very low") and achieved a Cronbach's α of 0.628. Self-assessed work ability was found to decline with age. It is expected that, controlling for health factors, intrinsic motivation to learn is positively related to self-assessed work ability.

8.2 RESULTS OF THE EMPIRICAL INVESTIGATION

In Table 1, the main results regarding the willingness to prolong working life, work ability, and intrinsic training motivation are given as mean values (standard deviation; “std. dev.”). Here, the analyses are separated for different respondent groups and are enhanced through a test of significance for the most important intrinsic training motivation (with a t-test in case of two group levels and an F-test in case of more than two group levels).

In general, intrinsic training motivation is quite high (with an overall mean of about 1.8) – in contrast to a moderate work ability (about 2.2) and willingness to prolong working (about 2.5). In addition, heterogeneity for the intrinsic training motivation is quite low (standard deviation much lower than for the willingness to prolong working life).

Analysing different groups of respondents, full time employees with a fixed-term contract and graduates of universities or of universities of applied sciences have the highest intrinsic training motivation. However, only the difference for the differentiation with respect to the vocational training is relevant from a statistical point of view (p<.001).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Trait</th>
<th>Work ability</th>
<th>Willingness to prolong working life</th>
<th>Intrinsic training motivation</th>
<th>Parameter</th>
<th>n</th>
<th>Mean (std. dev.)</th>
<th>Mean (std. dev.)</th>
<th>Mean (std. dev.)</th>
<th>t- or F-value (significance)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total sample</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>953</td>
<td>2.204 (0.572)</td>
<td>2.532 (1.188)</td>
<td>1.803 (0.854)</td>
<td>–</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Men</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>411</td>
<td>2.131 (0.551)</td>
<td>2.471 (1.228)</td>
<td>1.797 (0.819)</td>
<td>-0.173 (0.863)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>542</td>
<td>2.259 (0.581)</td>
<td>2.578 (1.155)</td>
<td>1.807 (0.880)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full time</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>689</td>
<td>2.132 (0.568)</td>
<td>2.533 (1.200)</td>
<td>1.771 (0.846)</td>
<td>-1.037 (0.300)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part time</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>208</td>
<td>2.360 (0.541)</td>
<td>2.585 (1.146)</td>
<td>1.841 (0.845)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fixed-term contract</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>54</td>
<td>2.225 (0.615)</td>
<td>2.038 (1.188)</td>
<td>1.704 (0.833)</td>
<td>-0.869 (0.385)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Permanent contract</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>898</td>
<td>2.202 (0.570)</td>
<td>2.561 (1.183)</td>
<td>1.808 (0.855)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No vocational graduation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>17</td>
<td>2.294 (0.539)</td>
<td>2.188 (1.167)</td>
<td>2.098 (1.110)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apprenticeship or similar</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>444</td>
<td>2.247 (0.579)</td>
<td>2.590 (1.199)</td>
<td>1.919 (0.929)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Master craftsmen/technicians or similar</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>195</td>
<td>2.189 (0.539)</td>
<td>2.521 (1.167)</td>
<td>1.720 (0.761)</td>
<td>5.127 (0.000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduates of universities or of universities of applied sciences</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>286</td>
<td>2.141 (0.586)</td>
<td>2.488 (1.192)</td>
<td>1.660 (0.747)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other graduation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>11</td>
<td>2.212 (0.402)</td>
<td>2.091 (0.944)</td>
<td>1.848 (0.780)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Table 1. Main results differentiated for selected respondent groups*

In a next step, the relationship between intrinsic training motivation and the other two traits are analysed (Table 2).
Confirming previous research (Boockmann et al., 2013), the actual number of trainings taking seems to have no effect on the desire to work past retirement age, as can be seen in Table 3.

Considering this data, a detailed analysis for men seems to be reasonable. Here, the analyses of the relationships of intrinsic training motivation with work ability leads to a Pearson correlation of 0.309 (p<.01) and of intrinsic training motivation with the willingness to prolong working life to a Spearman correlation of 0.169 (p<.05). But further analyses, e.g. linear regression analyses, showed no relevant relationships (i.e. very low r² values).

All in all, results show the meaning of continuous training to be low for the willingness to prolong working life. However, without continuous training it can be assumed that the ability
to prolong working life is low. Hence, for the teaching of content for older employees new methods should be developed. The “survey on continuing in employment in pensionable age” shows already that the distance to the learning site leads to a lower training motivation. Also, gerontological studies (Lehr, 2000) show that learning content should be application-oriented. Finally, it seems important that there is a continuous learning experience. Thus, our study shows that with higher educational level the importance of continuous training increases. Hence, we suppose that the stronger the culture of life-accompanying learning is set up for the purpose of managing the aging process and not age, the higher the ability as well as the willingness to prolong working life.

9. CONCLUSION

Focussing on employees aged 55-65, results show significant positive correlations between intrinsic motivation for continuous training and self-assessed work ability, with the strongest effect for men, followed by individuals with university degrees. Also, significant positive correlations are found between intrinsic motivation for continuous training and propensity for post-retirement age employment, with the strongest effect also for men, but, interestingly, not for the university-educated group. This effect was stronger than any differences with regard to gender, level of education, weekly working hours or employment contract duration for the three analyzed constructs of work ability, intrinsic motivation for continuous training and propensity for post-retirement age employment. Results imply that external conditions only partly influence an older individual’s work ability or inclination to work past the official retirement age. Individual factors such as an intrinsic inclination to learn or train are a stronger influence than, e.g. the actual number of trainings taken. Management and trainers would be well advised to strengthen especially older employees’ intrinsic training motivation by, e.g. boosting their feeling of self-efficacy and valence and thus possibly training motivation – not just in trainings but also generally at work.

REFERENCES


III. PROFESSIONAL ACTION
QUALITY IN CONTINUING EDUCATION: WHICH ASPECTS MATTER FROM THE PARTICIPANT’S POINT OF VIEW?

Aust, Kirsten
Technische Universität Braunschweig
Germany

Hartz, Stefanie
Technische Universität Braunschweig
Germany

Schmidt-Hertha, Bernhard
Technische Universität Braunschweig
Germany

1. INTRODUCTION

Aspects of quality in continuing education have always been discussed with regard to different reference points: teaching-learning interaction, the organization and society (Hartz & Meisel, 2011). Meanwhile quality management as a formal as well as an informal process plays a central role in organizations offering continuing education. Efforts to implement or improve formal quality management in this field actually become more important in the ongoing, intensifying discussion about lifelong learning: The more popular lifelong learning becomes in political agendas in Europe, the more new actors and institutions are engaging in continuing education and in pertinent discussions about continuing education. On the one hand this entails a broader choice of continuing education courses. On the other hand offering those courses is now attractive also for organizations without long-time and/or expert experience. Thus, to control the quality of offers in the field of continuing education is even more important if a beneficial outcome is desired. Therefore politics, e.g. in parts of Germany, have decided to prescribe the implementation of a quality management system for organizations which want to offer courses fully or partly paid for by the state. In the segment of continuing education courses for self-financing learners or (commercial) enterprises the importance of quality management models increases, but for different reasons: In this segment, quality management systems and their certification are often used for consumer advertising which also becomes more important due to the increasing number of organizations offering courses. Those strategical reasons along with a rising awareness of quality development has led to an increasing number of implemented quality management systems in organizations of continuing education during the last years.

Although quality management on the whole is widely used, there are different types of quality management models (QMM) that can be implemented in continuing education organizations: On the one hand quality management concepts are adapted from industrial production such as the ISO 9000 or the EFQM model. On the other hand there are models specifically developed for the unique requirements of continuing education such as the "Lernerorientierte Qualitätstestierung in der Weiterbildung" (LQW). "Quality" is interpreted differently in these models - not least due to the fact that both the definition of pedagogical quality as well as its examination are difficult (Harvey & Green, 2000). This problem of definition - together with the QMM’s focus on the organization – may lead to the fact that an implemented quality management model does not necessarily determine a better teaching-learning interaction.
(Hartz, 2011). However, this should normally be the focus of continuing education. In addition to the reasons intrinsic in the quality models themselves there is also another component that influences the quality of the teaching-learning interaction but cannot be regulated by QMM: the learner.

Although there are studies which indicate that several characteristics in the person of the learner influence the teaching-learning interaction, it is still unclear what specific factors in the learner are important for the educational process and its results, especially in combination with organizational conditions. These questions will be discussed in the present paper. Therefore different analyses will be presented which bring into focus the learner’s perception of the teaching-learning interaction. Factors influencing the learner’s satisfaction, the learning success and the transfer in practice were surveyed in an empirical study. The presented analyses are part of a larger research project that surveyed potentially influencing factors on the quality of continuing education in a multistage study (Töpper, 2012). The results triggered a discussion about opportunities as well as problems of the learner’s role for quality and quality management, particularly with regard to the concept of lifelong learning.

2. THEORETICAL BACKGROUND

Models of quality in continuing education have been developed since the 1970s. Originally those models defined only two components: input-quality and output-quality. Arnold (1994) added a third component: throughput-quality. In his model, the input-quality summarizes all those factors that are already relevant before the start of the course, e. g. the planning and the design. The throughput-quality includes all aspects that become important during the course, such as teachers’ professionalism, their teaching skills as well as the available infrastructure. The output-quality refers to all factors that are central after the completion of the course, e. g. the usefulness of the certificate, the satisfaction of the learners, and their personality development (Arnold, 1994). Based on his input-throughput-output model Arnold (1999) defines four types of success, which constitute the quality of continuing education: the success of learner’s satisfaction, the learning success, the success of transfer in practice, and the success of legitimation.

According to the Arnold model, three of the four types of success - learner’s satisfaction, learning success, and transfer - are located on the part of the learner. However, these types of success are not only influenced by several elements of the course of continuing education in general or the teaching-learning interaction in particular but also by the learners themselves. Personal characteristics, previous experiences, expectations and goals as well as their subjective perceptions of various elements of the learning-teaching-situation are important parameters for the quality of continuing education. Those individual requirements of the learners demand different contents, didactical and organizational arrangements to ensure a good fit between the learner and the attended course. A good match should finally lead to better learner satisfaction, learning success, and success of transfer. Despite the attempt to gain an optimal fit, there are factors in the person of the learner that may prohibit or at least reduce the learner’s satisfaction or the learning success.

In the respective literature there is evidence for several factors located on the part of the learner which may determine the success of continuing education, for instance because they entail different needs or goals. Nameable factors might be age (Schmidt, 2009; Tippelt et al.,
2009) and gender (Stürzer, 2005; Faulstich-Wieland, 2009; Nuissl, 2009) as well as the individual (educational) biographies and the life situations of the participants (Strobel, Schmidt-Hertha & Gnahn, 2011). Additionally, the learner’s perception of various aspects of the course should influence the evaluation of the quality - especially with regard to the factor "learner satisfaction".

Although there are studies that examine some of these factors located in the person of the learner, there is still a desideratum regarding the questions of whether there are other factors in the person of the learner or in his/her perception of the learning situation (potentially also in combination and interaction with organizational conditions) which have an impact on the facets of quality of continuing education based on Arnold. These questions will be discussed in the presented study.

3. METHODOICAL DESIGN

The data and results presented here are part of a larger research project (Töpper, 2012), which was funded by the German Federal Ministry of Education and Research (BMBF). The aim was to examine the influence and the impact of quality management systems and evaluations on the quality of continuing education.

The design of the study included three different phases using various methods:
- First phase: Identify potential influencing factors from existing studies/literature
- Second phase: Verify and assess the identified factors with the aid of experts (academics and practitioners in the field of continuing education)
- Third phase: Verify the influencing factors in a field study

In the first phase the aim was to identify all factors which could potentially have an influence on the quality of continuing education. This was done by literature research but also by analyzing quality management models and results of existing studies on continuing education. The result of this phase was a list of 51 factors which were potentially important for the quality of continuing education.

In the second phase the potentially influencing factors were to be verified and assessed. For that purpose people from organizations offering continuing education were asked to weigh the list of potentially influencing factors by means of an online-questionnaire. However, even more important in this phase was an interview study with 28 experts from the field of continuing education and auditors of quality management models in organizations of continuing education. For these interviews a special field manual had been developed to enable science-based analyses. The interviewees first were asked to describe which factors, in their opinion, influence the quality of continuing education. After this the experts were asked to name the potential influencing factors identified in the preliminary studies. The interviews had been transliterated and analyzed by means of qualitative content analysis.

The second phase resulted in a set of factors which potentially influence the quality of continuing education. These factors can be allocated to different categories: firstly to the level of teaching-learning interaction and within this level to the teachers and to the learners, secondly to the level of the provider and thirdly to a more global level that included aspects such as the costs of continuing education and its use for the prospective job market.
In the third phase the results of the previous phases were verified in a field study. To this end, providers and teachers of 35 courses of continuing education were asked to participate in the study. To obtain comparable results, only courses of the topic of interaction knowledge (Schrader, 2003) such as conflict management, project management, communication, and presentation were chosen.

All trainers, learners and providers of the surveyed courses filled in questionnaires before their course started. Teachers and learners also answered the questionnaires straight after the end of the course. The learners were also asked to fill in another short questionnaire three months after the end of the course to measure the transfer.

In the following section of the paper the analyses and results from the field study are presented which focus on the learner as a (co-)producer of quality.

4. RESULTS

In the field study, 35 courses of further education from the field of interaction knowledge were investigated. To determine the potentially influencing factors in the field study, the participants were asked to fill in paper & pencil questionnaires at the beginning of the course (N = 295) and immediately after the course (N = 264). Three months after the course, the learners were again asked to participate in a survey, this time online (N = 142). In addition to the factors with potential influence concerning the learners, three out of the four facets of quality based on Arnold (1999) were collated in the learners' questionnaires: the success of learner satisfaction, the learning success, and the success of transfer in practice. These three facets form the dependent variables in the subsequent analyses and are constituted as follows:

**Learner satisfaction**
The learners' satisfaction is measured according to how satisfied the participants are immediately after the training, i.e. whether they think the course has been worth attending. Therefore four items were inquired into and combined to produce the scale "satisfaction", which has proven reliability (Cronbach's alpha = .82).

**Transfer**
The success of transfer in practice means that what participants have learned in theory can actually be applied in their (working) lives. In the present study the success of transfer was measured by means of three questions asked three months after the end of the course. The three items were combined, so now they constitute the scale "transfer success" (Cronbach's alpha = .75).

**Learning success**
The learning success refers to the increase in the participants' knowledge. Although all the courses included in the study came from the same thematic field of interaction knowledge, the individual courses differed in their contents. Due to that fact it was not possible to measure an improvement of knowledge by means of standardized performance tests but

---

1. The fourth facet – the success of legitimation – could not be measured in the study.
only the self-assessment of the participants. For this purpose they were asked at the beginning of the course to rate their current knowledge and skills related to the course content, they were then asked again immediately after the last lesson and three months after the course. For the rating a scale of 1 = little to 10 = excellent was provided. The difference between the participants’ estimates at the beginning of the course and immediately after it ended represents the "short-term learning success". The difference between the measurement at the beginning of the course and three months after the course shows the "long-term learning success". And finally the difference between the measurement immediately after and three months after the course determines the "memory-or-forgetting effect". Hence, these three types of success were inserted into several regression models\(^2\) as dependent variables to examine whether they were influenced by various factors located in the person of the learner.

4.1 RESULTS FROM THE FIRST TIME POINT OF MEASUREMENT

In a first regression model an analysis was made as to whether certain personal circumstances and perceptions of the participants, which had already existed prior to the course, would have an impact on the learners’ satisfaction, the learning success and the transfer into practice. Therefore this model included “the voluntary participation in the course”, “the perceived quality of the prior information”, “the personal interest in the topic of the course” as well as “the self-estimated previous knowledge of the participants” as independent variables\(^3\).

\(^2\) Due to the design of the study and the resulting number of participants it has not been possible to include all participants’ attributes in one single regression model.

\(^3\) If not marked otherwise, all attributes were surveyed with one item only. This was always the case whenever the attribute could be described with one explicit contextual statement. More complex attributes were measured with multiple items which were then combined to scales. This is declared accordingly.
Table 1. Relation between personal circumstances of the participants on the one hand and the dependant variables satisfaction, transfer and self-assessed learning success on the other hand (regression)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Influencing factor</th>
<th>Satisfaction</th>
<th>Transfer in practice</th>
<th>Learning success short-term</th>
<th>Learning success long-term</th>
<th>Learning success memor/forget</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Beta</td>
<td>SE</td>
<td>Beta</td>
<td>SE</td>
<td>Beta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voluntary participation</td>
<td>.11*</td>
<td>.05</td>
<td>.14</td>
<td>.11</td>
<td>.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality of the prior information</td>
<td>.08</td>
<td>.04</td>
<td>.09</td>
<td>.09</td>
<td>-.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal interest</td>
<td>.16**</td>
<td>.05</td>
<td>.02</td>
<td>.12</td>
<td>.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Previous knowledge</td>
<td>-.10*</td>
<td>.04</td>
<td>.16*</td>
<td>.08</td>
<td>-.87***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corr. $R^2$</td>
<td>.12</td>
<td>.03</td>
<td>.14</td>
<td>.07</td>
<td>.07</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes: * $p < .05$, ** $p < .01$, *** $p < .001$

Regression analyses (table 1) show positive effects of the voluntary participation (beta = .11) and a higher interest in the topic of the course (beta = .16) on the learners’ satisfaction. Both factors are related to the motivation of the participants which therefore has an influence on the participants’ satisfaction and seems to be a critical parameter. Furthermore regressions show a negative effect of a higher previous knowledge on the satisfaction (beta = -.10) as well as on the self-estimated short-term (beta = -.87) and long-term (beta = -.73) learning success. These results indicate that courses of continuing education – at least those surveyed in the present study – are too simple for learners who have previous knowledge. That results in lower satisfaction and to a smaller self-estimated increase in knowledge because no or insufficient new learning content is taught. This last effect surprisingly inverts when there is success of transfer into practice: There is a positive effect of previous knowledge on how the participants estimate their learning success three months after the course (beta = .16). Thus, participants with previous knowledge are more able to use the contents of the course in their working lives.

Another positive effect could be found regarding the memory-or-forgetting-effect: Interestingly, participants who thought that they had received sufficient information before the beginning of the course note a higher increase in knowledge three months after the course (beta = .50).

Of all factors included in these analyses, only the information given before the course could be influenced by the organization. This might be an aspect which could be included in quality management models and thus could be a useful approach to improve the quality of continuing education. The other three factors in contrast are personal characteristics of the participants that cannot be influenced directly, i.e. neither by the organization or the trainer in...
the teaching-learning interaction nor by an implemented quality management model. Regarding the percentage of explained variance for the participants' satisfaction (corr. \( R^2 = .12 \)) and the short-term learning success (corr. \( R^2 = .14 \)), it becomes apparent that the person of the learner – represented by various individual aspects – is an important factor for the quality of continuing education. This is an interesting fact especially against the background that evaluations of continuing education courses very often measure the participants' satisfaction. However, this satisfaction is determined to a considerable extend by characteristics of the participants, on which there is no influence during the course itself.

4.2 RESULTS FROM THE SECOND TIME POINT OF MEASUREMENT

In the next step potentially influencing factors were to be analyzed which are related directly to the \textit{realization} of the course. These factors have been surveyed immediately after the end of the course by means of the learners' questionnaires. The factors included in the next regression model concern aspects of two types. Firstly, those aspects concerning the participants' perception of the fit between the content of the course and the needs of the participants such as "the connectivity of the imparted knowledge to the previous knowledge of the participants", "the teaching of new knowledge", and "an appropriate level of difficulty" (measured using one item each). Secondly, those aspects concerning organizational features which could improve the process of learning such as "the use of up-to-date, adequate teaching material" (scale with 4 items, Cronbach's alpha = .84), "a customer-friendly orientation of the organization and/or the trainer" (scale with 3 items, Cronbach's alpha = .85), and "organizational conditions" (e.g. the room setup; scale with 3 items, Cronbach's alpha = .82).
Table 2. Relation between several aspects of the imparted knowledge and organizational conditions on the one hand and satisfaction and self-assessed learning success on the other hand (regression)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Influencing factor</th>
<th>Satisfaction</th>
<th>Learning success short-term</th>
<th>Learning success long-term</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Beta</td>
<td>SE</td>
<td>Beta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Connectivity to the previous knowledge</td>
<td>.10**</td>
<td>.04</td>
<td>-.37*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teaching of new knowledge</td>
<td>.12***</td>
<td>.03</td>
<td>.53***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate level of difficulty</td>
<td>.11*</td>
<td>.05</td>
<td>.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Up-to-date, adequate teaching material</td>
<td>.32***</td>
<td>.06</td>
<td>.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customer-friendly orientation</td>
<td>.16*</td>
<td>.07</td>
<td>.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organizational conditions</td>
<td>-.00</td>
<td>.06</td>
<td>.10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Corr. R²: .34, .09, .11

Notes: * p < .05, ** p < .01, *** p < .001

The results of the regression models (table 2) again show effects preferential to the participants’ satisfaction. It is positively affected by the factors "connectivity of the imparted knowledge to the previous knowledge of the participants" (beta = .10), teaching of new knowledge (beta = .12), and an appropriate level of difficulty (beta = .11). These three results maintain the assumption from the first measurement time point, i.e. that an optimal fit between the level of difficulty and the participants’ pre-conditions and needs is an essential factor for the participants’ satisfaction. Moreover, the results point out options for the trainer and the organization to react to the unchangeable conditions of the participants that had had an effect in the first regression model, e.g. the trainer could adjust the imparted knowledge to the previous knowledge of the learners. In addition, it seems – at least in parts – possible to regulate these factors through quality management models, for example the regulation of processes which test the previous knowledge and then initiate a modification of the teaching content, or adequate personnel selection and professional training.

In addition, the factors “up-to-date, adequate teaching material” (beta = .32) and “customer-friendly orientation of the organization and/or the trainer” (beta = .16) have positive effects on the participants’ satisfaction. Again there seems to be a chance for the organization – possibly in parts via an implemented quality management model – to influence the satisfaction of the learner e.g. by ensuring that the teaching material is of high quality, and by reacting politely and obligingly to the learners’ requests and needs. The regression model shows a high percentage of explained variance (corr. R² = .34), which underlines the impact of these influencing factors, and it illustrates how important the learner’s perception of several elements of the course is for his/her satisfaction.
However, analyses do not only show the effects on the participants’ satisfaction but also on the short-term and long-term learning success. Therefore an optimal fit between the previous knowledge and the skills of the learner on the one hand and the contents taught in the course on the other hand seems to be important as well. This is indicated by the result that “the teaching of new knowledge” has a positive effect on the short-term learning success (beta = .53) as well as on the long-term learning success (beta = .78). That is consequential insofar as only new content can broaden a learner’s knowledge. In contrast, the negative effect of “the connectivity of the imparted knowledge to the previous knowledge of the participants” on the short-term learning success (beta = -.37) has been surprising. A potential explanation might be the way in which learning success had been surveyed in the study: by means of the participants’ self-estimation. Thus, it seems possible that the participants first had the impression that they did not learn anything new if the imparted knowledge is too similar to the previous knowledge.

A third block of potentially influencing factors included those aspects that were related directly to the teaching-learning-situation and could be influenced immediately by the trainer: “a well-structured format of the course”, “the use of different teaching and working methods”, “the clarification of the topics’ relevance for the (professional) practice” (5 items, Cronbach’s alpha = .74), “the inclusion and activation of the participants in the course” (6 items, Cronbach’s alpha = .71), “the teaching of learning strategies”, and “the procedure of evaluations whose results then were used in the further course”.

Table 3. Relation between several aspects of the teaching-learning situation and evaluations on the one hand and satisfaction and transfer success on the other hand (regression)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Influencing factor</th>
<th>Satisfaction</th>
<th>Transfer in practice</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Beta</td>
<td>SE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Well-structured format of the course</td>
<td>.04</td>
<td>.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variety in methods</td>
<td>.04</td>
<td>.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clarification of the relevance for practice</td>
<td>.35***</td>
<td>.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inclusion/activation of the participants</td>
<td>.42***</td>
<td>.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teaching of learning strategies</td>
<td>-.02</td>
<td>.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluations and the use of the results</td>
<td>.09*</td>
<td>.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Corr. R²</strong></td>
<td>.40</td>
<td>.13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes: * p < .05, ** p < .01, *** p < .001

The results of the regressions (table 3) again show effects particularly on the participants’ satisfaction. Positive effects could be found concerning the clarification of the topics’ relevance for practice (beta = .35), the inclusion and activation of the participants (beta =
.42), and evaluations and the use of their results (beta = .09). Other effects of factors in this model appeared on the self-assessed success of transfer into practice. Both the teaching of practical relevance (beta = .43) and the teaching of learning strategies (beta = .18) had a positive effect.

All factors in the last model could be influenced by the trainer. Thus, the trainer has the opportunity to directly regulate the satisfaction of the participants and their success of transfer into practice. Again there is a chance for quality management models to improve the quality of continuing education courses if the trainers are respected, included, and guided accordingly.

5. DISCUSSION

A central result of the analyses is the fact that most of the significant factors have an influence on the satisfaction of the participants and only in few cases on the learning success or on the transfer into practice. It cannot be ruled out that this is in part an effect of the type of measurement of learning success in the study. The self-assessment may have affected the results. However, the results lead to the general discussion of which type of success is (more) important in continuing education and should be the focus of quality management: the learning success and the transfer or the satisfaction of the participants? From a pedagogical point of view – and also from an economical perspective of employers paying for their employees' continuing education –, the learning success and the transfer in practice are of prime interest. However, this is not necessarily related to the participants' satisfaction. As is known, learning is connected with exertion (Holzkamp, 1993) what could often impede a feeling of satisfaction. However, on the other hand, a lot of organizations of continuing education are dependent on satisfied learners because only those participants recommend the scope of courses offered to other interested learners. This becomes even more relevant against the background of an increasingly intensive discussion about lifelong learning and the resulting fact that a rising number of organizations offer courses and therefore court new clients. To be attractive it could be tempting for organizations of continuing education to stake too much on satisfaction rather than on learning success. This conflict between pedagogical interests and economic needs of the organization of continuing education has to be approached sensitively. However, in both cases success, i.e. learning and transfer success as well as the success of learner’s satisfaction, profit by ensuring an optimal fit between the content of the course and the needs of the learner.

In view of the question as to which meaning the results have for quality management models, first of all it has to be stated that neither the organization nor the trainer nor quality management models can directly influence a part of the quality of continuing education courses: factors which lie in the person of the learner him/herself – such as voluntary participation, motivation or previous knowledge – can only be affected and changed by the learner. For the teacher or the organization it is only possible to react to those factors. At this point the limits of quality management models become clear. But there are chances and possibilities, too. First of all it seems to be expedient to prescribe that the learners – who are the central point in the offers in the field of continuing education – are involved in the quality process. However, this has not worked until now, not even in quality management models like LQW whose explicit interest is a higher learner-orientation (Hartz, 2011).
Another, perhaps more promising starting point for quality management models could be to intensify the involvement of the trainers in the process of quality management. As the results have shown, the trainer and the participant's perception of several trainer skills are important for learning success as well as for the satisfaction of the participants. However, most of the trainers in continuing education are still independent contractors not involved in any processes of the organization at all. The systematic and continuous professionalization of trainers as well as the competence-oriented selection of new trainers might be possible approaches of quality improvement that could be anchored in quality management models.

Although studies from different European countries already revealed and emphasized the importance of the trainers' professionalization for the quality of continuing education courses (von Hippel & Tippelt, 2010; European Association for Education of Adults [EAEA], 2006), there is still an ongoing discussion about the responsibility for further education of trainers. However, organizations of continuing education could regulate the quality of their trainers only by establishing several criteria a trainer has to meet if he is going to be employed, if at all. But as long as most of the trainers are independent contractors, who often work for several organizations at the same time, and furthermore organizations of continuing education are not mandatorily responsible for their trainers’ continuing education nor do they have authority over it, the organizations are unlikely to include the trainers in their quality management - even more because professionalization and quality management generally seem to focus on different logics: the development of people versus the development of an organization and its processes (Egetenmeyer & Käpplinger, 2011, p. 22). As a consequence, the influencing factor “trainer” will probably not be improved. Thus, political regulation to implement a quality management model is useless on that score as long as providers do not take responsibility for the further qualification of their trainers. To improve continuing education – especially in times of an increasing significance of lifelong learning – a discussion about an expansion of quality management models and further factors to be included, for example the development of trainer competencies, seems necessary.

REFERENCES


ADULT EDUCATION AND TRANSFORMATIVE LEARNING

Bancheva, Elmira,
New Bulgarian University
Bulgaria

Ivanova, Maria
New Bulgarian University
Bulgaria

Pojarliev, Alexander
New Bulgarian University
Bulgaria

ABSTRACT

Rethinking and revising leadership development requires a review of existing curricula in terms of its objectives, content and quite different approaches to teaching, learning and assessment so that lifelong learning skills are fostered. These include skills for creative and critical thinking, collaboration and cooperation, conflict management, decision-making, problem-solving. Applying adult learning principles and creating conditions that foster transformative learning are essential in the design and delivery of leadership development programs. This paper explores a neglected area of research in Bulgaria concerning the application of transformative learning in the area of leadership development in higher education. On the basis of literature review and study run at the School of Management, New Bulgarian University we try to create learning environment stimulating the processes of critical reflection and the processes of re/constructing knowledge based on life experiences of our adult students.

INTRODUCTION

We live in an increasingly turbulent, complex world. The more flavored our instruments, theories and technologies, the less we seem to understand and to be able to predict. The world is uncertain and, says Nassim Taleb, non-linear (2007). By using averages and linear proxies of phenomena to forecast the future, we are immortalizing an illusion of stability, of ease of understanding, which are in fact roughly false and risky.

How to adapt to such an environment? What kind of skills, mental models or multiple intelligence we have to develop in order to be able to cope with the uncertainty and fragility. Changes in society and the unknown future challenges and technologies facing adult learners emphasise the importance of authentic learning.

According to Pink ‘in the Conceptual Age, what we need . . . is a whole new mind’- one that incorporates both right brain and left brain directed aptitudes (2005, p. 51). Where the left brain is ‘sequential, logical, and analytical,’ the right brain is ‘nonlinear, intuitive, and holistic.’
But how to create such a new mind? What kind of pedagogy and techniques we can use especially for leadership development in Higher education? Can transformational leadership be trained and learned?

Several scholars in the area of adult learning have advocated that reflecting on one’s lived experience is essential to the learning process and often results in attitudinal and behavioural change (Argyris & Schon, 1978; Cranton, 1994; Kolb, 1984; Mezirow, 1991). Transformative learning concerns education of the ‘whole person’ and focuses on the development of insight as much as knowledge (Mezirow, 1991). It requires examination of personal experience and draws inspiration and guidance from many quarters, including social sciences, philosophy, religious traditions, and the arts.

From the discussion of the ladder of inference, it was obvious for the School of Management (SM), New Bulgarian University (NBU) that we have to create an environment that is completely dedicated to a new, more modern view of adult education. In the last two years on the basis of research we began using transformative learning in our programs. The results gave us the justification that our adult learners (practicing managers) will need to develop skills to analyse and respond to authentic situations through inquiry, imagination and innovation.

**ADULT EDUCATION AND TRANSFORMATIVE LEARNING THEORY. THE TRANSFORMATIVE LEARNING THEORY AS A COMPLEX PROCESS**

Transformational Learning was popularized by Peter Senge in The Fifth Discipline (1990). It was theorized and practiced by Mezirow, Argyris, Schein, Schon, and others since the early 50’s. Chris Argyris defines learning as effective action, when we detect and correct error. ‘We know what we know, he says, when we can produce what we claim we know’ (1994, p. 3). He characterizes incremental learning as single-loop where the learner corrects mismatches between intentions and outcomes within an existing framework (worldview) by changing an action. Transformational learning, on the other hand, is double-loop. In double-loop learning the learner reflects on her actions, seeks feedback, causing a change in her worldview and actions.

Transformational learning is a cluster of methodologies meant to lead not just to adaptive (Senge, 1990) or ‘ informational' learning (Kegan, 2000) where the learner adds to his knowledge about something (what we know), but to a kind of learning where the learner’s knowledge of self changes and his new understanding changes the way in which the learner learns (how we know).

Jack Mezirow, the father of transformative learning theory states, ‘transformative learning for emancipation education is the business of all adult education (1990, p. 357).’ This psychological approach to adult learning developed by Mezirow in 1978 inspired many and focuses on deep changes in how adults see themselves and their world (Mezirow, 2000). Mezirow defines transformative learning as: ‘The process by which we transform our taken-for-granted frames of reference (meaning perspectives, habits of mind, mind-sets) to make them more inclusive, discriminating, open, emotionally capable of change, and reflective so that they may generate beliefs and opinions that will prove more true or justified to guide actions’ (Mezirow, 2000, p. 7).
Mezirow suggests a 10-step process for transformative learning (Mezirow, 2000):

1. Experience a disorienting dilemma
2. Undergo self-examination
3. Conduct a deep assessment of personal role assumptions and alienation created by new roles
4. Share and analyze personal discontent and similar experiences with others
5. Explore options for new ways of acting
6. Build competence and self-confidence in new roles
7. Plan a course of action
8. Acquire knowledge and skills for action
9. Try new roles and assess feedback
10. Reintegrate into society with a new perspective

Reviewing the literature we could find a large number of studies conducted mainly in the United States that attempt to explore different aspects of transformative learning. The Table 1 below illustrates how transformative learning is seen by most authors.

Table 1. Transformative learning described by different authors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Transformative learning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jarvis (1992)</td>
<td>Reflective learning can lead to transformation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brookfield (2000)</td>
<td>‘Education is centrally concerned with the development of a critically aware frame of mind, not with the uncritical assimilation of previously defined skills or bodies of knowledge’ (p. 17).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O’Sullivan (2002)</td>
<td>It is a process of being sensitised to an awareness of others: ‘We move from having a perspective to being able to move into many perspectives … to seeing through their presuppositions to awareness’ (p.170).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goleman et al. (2002)</td>
<td>Assert that ‘self-awareness means having a deep understanding of one’s emotions, as well as one’s strengths and limitations and one’s values and motives’ (p. 40).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tisdell (2003)</td>
<td>People need to be inspired and have their affective, spiritual and physical selves involved in order for emancipatory education around challenging systems of structural oppression to happen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clark &amp; Wilson (1991)</td>
<td>In transformational learning point out that meaning is context dependent. It is shaped by language and culture. Rationality is value laden and one cannot get consensus in perspective transformation.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Transformative learning is a complex process that happens at both the intellectual and subliminal level. It is reasonable to recognize that transformative learning transcends the mind and spirit beyond the pragmatics of everyday life: Such a shift involves our understanding of ourselves and our selflocations; our relationships with other humans and with the natural world; our visions of alternative approaches to living and being.

**FACTORS THAT PROMOTE TRANSFORMATIVE LEARNING**

According to many authors, one of the best ways to promote transformative learning for adult learners is to providing them with learning experiences such as direct, personally engaging and stimulating reflections upon their experiences. Critical thinking is the process of examining assumptions that underlie beliefs, values, and ways of understanding. Critical thinking is the core of transformative learning and provides the majority of the strategies for facilitating transformative learning.

King (2005), in the development of the Learning Activities Survey instrument, concluded that there are practical strategies for promoting transformative learning when presented with an emphasis on being critically reflective. These included case studies, collaborative learning, collaborative writing, critical incidents, discussions, interviews, student presentations, journals, and research papers.

Brookfield (2000) also suggests that autobiographies, critical incidents, and collaborative problem solving are some of the factors to facilitate transformative learning.

Dialogue is another critical component of creating transformative learning opportunities among adult learners in higher education. Mezirow (1997a) explained that in the course of the adult learner’s journey to seek values and assumptions, they begin to examine those habits of mind as they engage in discourse with one another. According to Brookfield (1986), there is a need for educators to create conducive physical environment and an all-inclusive classroom that can reduce attitude of fear. The classroom-learning environment should be supportive to help one’s values and assumptions. This will encourage the adult learner to use critical thinking skills to question assumptions and authority in order to enhance the relationship between teacher and student. This could be achieved through collaborative group work, problem-based learning, online courses, and project-based learning.

Another way to promote transformative learning is the mentoring. According to Bloom (1995) and Daloz (1986), mentoring is the means of providing psychological, emotional, and technical assistance to the learner when needed. Daloz (1986) explained that mentoring makes room for the learner or mentee to create new ways of asking questions about the learning process and the environment. Mentoring also helps adult learners deal with human relations that help them eventually in their learning transformations.
The table 2 below illustrates some of the practical strategies for promoting transformative learning.

**Table 2. Practical strategies for promoting transformative learning**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Practical strategies for promoting transformative learning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cranton (1994)</td>
<td>These strategies include the use of questioning, constructing conscious-raising experiences, experiential learning models in the classroom, critical incidents, and journaling. The strategies serve as a measure to make adult learners challenge previously unexamined values, beliefs, and assumptions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saavedra (1995)</td>
<td>Explained that placing teachers at the center of their own learning in a critically reflective and social group setting contributed to transformation. This could be achieved through collaborative group work, problem-based learning, online courses, and project-based learning.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daloz (1999)</td>
<td>Lists criteria of support for students to include (a) listening (actively engaging with the student’s world and attempting to experience it from the inside); (b) providing structure (close personal attention, clear expectations, specific assignments, short and achievable tasks, and predigested materials . . . are important); (c) expressing positive expectations (having positive expectations of students is one of the most important aspects of effective advising); (d) serving as advocate (mentors are often seen as powerful allies on the journey; they intercede with the powers, translate arcane runes).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>King (1999); Taylor (1998)</td>
<td>These include critical thinking skills, personal self-reflection, classroom discussions and dialogues, and mentoring. International graduate-level learners will one way or the other experience transformative learning in association with their education and out of school related activities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pohland and Bova (2000); Macleod et al. (2003); Mallory (2003); Mallory (2003); Feinstein (2004); King (2004)</td>
<td>One of the best ways to promote transformative learning for adult learners is to providing them with learning experiences such as direct, personally engaging and stimulating reflections upon their experiences.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mezirow (2003)</td>
<td>Asserts that dialogue is a discourse involving the assessment of beliefs, feelings, and values. It is also the medium for critical reflection to be put into action by which the learner’s experience is reflected.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chimera (2006); Kichenham (2006); Ziegler, Paulus, &amp; Woodside (2006)</td>
<td>Contend that personal selfreflection can be promoted among adult learners when educators rely on instructional aids such as writing online and in reflective journals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brookfield &amp; Preskill (2005)</td>
<td>Point out that there should be dynamic critical discussion in order to incorporate probing meaning, questioning assumptions, and supporting learners all at the same time.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Burke (2006) Writing in an intensive format also strengthens the reflective experience with creation of artifacts in the mind. It requires learners to externalize their reflective experience, taking discussion away from the affective or psychological domains and forces some form of reconciliation with the material, resulting in an inherently perspective activity.

Cranton (2006a) Disclosed that discourse in the form of dialogue is central to the transformative process. Educators need to engage in conversation with others in order to better consider alternative perspectives and to determine their validity.

Cranton (2006b) Outlines the following criteria to be used in an adult learning setting when the educator wants to engage in dialogue - find provocative ways to stimulate dialogue from different perspectives, controversial statements, and readings from contradictory points of view, or structured group activities that lead people to see.

ADULT LEARNING THEORY & LEADERSHIP DEVELOPMENT

An example of how adult learning theory aligns with leadership development may be found in the work of Jay Conger. In his book Learning to Lead, Conger (1992) outlines four types of leadership training. Based on his qualitative research, leadership development programs fall into four categories: personal growth, conceptual understanding, feedback and skill building. Personal growth programs are ‘based, generally, on the assumption that leaders are individuals who are deeply in touch with their personal dreams and talents and who will act to fulfill them’ (Conger, 1992, p. 45-46). Essentially, the purpose of these programs is to increase self-awareness and emphasize self-exploration.

The second category is conceptual understanding which primarily focuses on theories of leadership. Leadership development through feedback is the third category. Feedback instruments such as for example 360-degree instruments are utilized in the majority of leadership development programs. These are used in an effort to help individuals locate areas for improvement. Conger’s final category is skill building. According to Conger, this is the most common method utilized in leadership development training and has grown increasingly difficult to teach as our thinking about leadership has progressed.

Merriam and Caffarella suggest that ‘learning is a personal process…the context of adult life and the social context shape what an adult needs and wants to learn and, to a somewhat lesser extent, when and where learning takes place’ (1999, p. 1). A leadership development program that incorporates the thinking of behaviorists, cognitivists, social learning theorists and developmentalists will not only involve learners at a higher level, it will help architects of leadership development programming design and implement interventions and environments more conducive to learning and to create interventions and learning opportunities that are truly transformative in nature.

An important concept from the adult learning literature is transfer of learning which is a crucial issue of leadership development often left unplanned. Caffarella defines transfer of learning as ‘the effective application by program participants of what they learned as a result
of attending an education or training program’ (2002, p. 204). On balance, if the education does not result in perspective transformation, learning, or change in behavior, it could be argued that the investment was a poor one.

Brooks (2004) in her recent edition of Advances in Developing Human Resources claims that transformative learning is a viable theory and research approach for developing human resources. She asserts that transformative learning provides a basis for developing people, so that a change in level of conscious awareness occurs and is appropriate in a variety of contexts, such as managing across national boundaries and learning to be part of a diverse workforce, dealing with complexity, motivating others.

With increasing recognition of complexity, leaders play ever increasing importance in creating environments and cultures where it can be recognized that a single right answer no longer exists; where people feel valued for their talents and who they are; where others are freely and fully engaged toward a common and higher purpose, and where creativity flourishes and spirit is free. An organizational survival depends on managers and leaders who don’t simply ask, how we do this, but asks ‘why we are doing this?’ and ‘are we doing the right things?’

Research on leadership shows that sense of self and authentic connections to others, forms a cornerstone for 21st century leadership (Bass, 1985; Bennis, 1985; Posner, 1995).

Brown and Posner (2001) explored the relationship of transformative learning and transformational leadership and concluded that leadership development programs and approaches need to reach leaders at a personal and emotional level, triggering critical self-reflection, and providing support for meaning making including creating learning and leadership mindsets, and for experimentation.

**REFLECTION ON THE THEORY OF TRANSFORMATIVE LEARNING IN EUROPE**

The literature review shows that reflection on the theory of transformative learning has not been so far an issue of central scientific concern in Europe. Kokkos (2010) in his study found that among the 126 papers that have been published from 2003 to 2009 in the Journal of Transformative Education, only 6 are written by Europeans. Also, from the 339 papers that are available on the Internet from the International Conferences on Transformative Learning only 11 are written by Europeans.

The comparison of those data with Taylor’s review (2007) on 40 papers – mainly written by American authors, shows that European writers focus more on activities of community development that take place in other continents, but mainly on theoretical research while the American authors were concerned with higher education and professional development and with the analysis of the nature and the components of transformative learning, as well as the processes of its application and the methods that reinforce the process of perspective transformation. In contrast the European writers focus only slightly on the research of the very nature of transformative learning and also there is just only few others which refer to the methods that reinforce transformative learning processes.
WHAT IS THE SITUATION IN BULGARIA?

In Bulgaria transformative learning theory is not so popular in the field of adult education and especially in the field of leadership development. There are a limited number of authors whose work on transformative learning has been published in books or journals, and there is not a vivid engagement of the adult educators’ community in transformative learning in the context of higher education. Furthermore, the higher education in our society overwhelmingly fragments knowledge into disciplines and the prevailing design of education finds its roots in rationalism, a doctrine that knowledge is derived from an ‘evidence-based,’ ‘rigorous’ and ‘scientific’ understanding of the world (Lambkin, 1998), which ideally leads to objectivity, certainty, universality and predictability (Phelan, 2004).

Rethinking and revising leadership education requires a review of existing curricula in terms of its objectives and content to develop transdisciplinary approach and also requires quite different approaches to teaching, learning and assessment so that lifelong learning skills are fostered. These include skills for creative and critical thinking, collaboration and cooperation, conflict management, decision-making, problem-solving.

PUTTING THE TRANSFORMATIVE LEARNING THEORY INTO THE PRACTICE OF SCHOOL OF MANAGEMENT (SM), NEW BULGARIAN UNIVERSITY (NBU)

What follows on the basis of discussion is the application of transformative learning theory into our practice and the key question is whether it is possible to structure an experience that is transformative for our students.

The goal of any business school should be to produce graduates who enter the workforce able to make key strategic decisions and initiate change within their industries. By encouraging students to fully understand self-thought and resultant behaviours, transformative learning helps build more authentic leaders for the future. Today’s complex global environment calls for leaders to be agile decision makers, to engage in critical self-reflection with action, and to partner with those who are different in significant ways. These capabilities and skills are the core qualities of transformative learning.

In order to answer to the question we run a research about the leadership style and behavior in general and how it applies specifically to students in a leadership development program in higher education. We address the following questions: What are the leadership style profiles of adult students (practicing managers); how do the female students differ from male students (gender differences)? (Bancheva, E. & Ivanova, M. 2012)

The accessible sample consisted of adult students, practicing managers (N = 120) who taught in SM, NBU. The participants were 80 (66.7 %) women and 40 (33.3 %) men, and their average age was thirty five years. 51 % of the participants had between 1- 5 years of work experience for current employer, 36 % had six to ten years of work experience, 7 % had 11 - 15 years, and 7 % had between 16 – 20 years.
THE RESEARCH OF SM, NBU
LEADERSHIP STYLES OF ADULT STUDENTS AT THE SM, NBU

We use the Multifactor Leadership Questionnaire (MLQ), designed by Bass and Avolio (1995). The MLQ Short Form determines three leadership styles: transformational, transactional, and laissezfaire by assessing seven different behaviors, including four transformational (idealized influence, inspirational motivation, intellectual stimulation, and individualized consideration), two transactional (Contingent reward and Management by exception), and one non transactional behavior (Laissez-faire).

FINDINGS

This study concluded that management education students are more transformational in their preferred leadership style in contrast to transactional and laissezfaire styles (Fig.1). Specifically, our study found that students were engaging in transformational leadership behaviors fairly often, were engaging in transactional leadership behaviors sometimes, and were engaging in laissez-faire behaviors once in a while. While recognizing that transformational and transactional leadership styles complement each other (Bass, 1997), research has shown that transformational leadership behavior is correlated with preferred organizational outcomes such as employee and follower motivation, performance, and satisfaction; persuasive abilities; and the ability to adapt in changing times (Bass, 1998). As such, an implication of this study is that the transformational leadership style preferred by our students might be advantageous when confronted with issues in the business school environment especially with the changes in SM educational policy and the curricula design.

Figure 1. Leadership Style Scores – total

Transformational scores were very high for the pool of respondents: 57.65 percent had high scores, and another 38.84 percent had moderated scores. Transactional behaviors were also high for the population, with 52.59 percent of respondents having high scores and another 44.56 percent having moderate scores. Laissez-faire style was moderately low across the population – 16.57 percent had low scores and 68.01 percent having moderate scores.
The second objective sought to determine if the preferred leadership style and leadership factors of students differed on gender. The data show strong leadership profile differences among female and male students. Figure 2 illustrates the findings and shows that women scored significantly higher than men in two of the four areas – inspirational motivation and idealized influence and lower than the men in the other two of the four areas – intellectual stimulation and individualized consideration.

**Figure 2. Transformational leadership style by gender**

These findings suggest that the female students, more than the male students, (1) manifested attributes that motivated their followers to feel respect and pride because of their association with them, (2) showed optimism and excitement about future goals.

The largest of these differences in the male direction was on the individualized consideration scale, and the intellectual stimulation. Avolio and Bass (2004) describe this type of leader as being skillful at helping others to think about old problems in new ways; having the ability to conceptualize and articulate a group vision; and are likely to exhibit intellectual stimulation through critical thinking, questioning the status quo, and in articulating a creative approach to accomplishing the organization's mission.

Comparing men and women on transactional and laissez-faire style, (fig. 3) it's obvious that men exceeded women on the transactional scales of management-by-exception (49.40 % high scores – male students, 31.80% - female students) and contingent reward (77.27 % high scores – male students, 51.90% - female students) and on laissez-faire leadership (18.18 % high scores – male students, 10.13% - female students).
These findings suggest that male managers, more than female managers, (1) paid attention to their followers’ problems and mistakes, (2) waited until problems became severe before attempting to solve them, and (3) were absent and uninvolved at critical times.

Parallel with this study we run another study asking the business (Bancheva, E. & Ivanova, M., 2009) what type of learning environment, structures and processes or what type of methodology we can use in order to nourish a transformative learning process that foster creativity and innovation in leadership development. Interviews and a questionnaire were carried out with 45 practicing leaders (adult students) at the SM, NBU who have experience and work in different companies in Bulgaria.

The results of the survey provide some insights about ‘what does being creative mean as a leader?’ The responses included: ‘it involves imagination and taking risks’, working with often conflicting interests, to generating new ideas’, ‘thinking out of the boxes’, etc. Concerning the question ‘what pedagogy and curriculum we have to use?’ most of the adult students are very comfortable with unconventional ways of thinking and doing: ‘we’re talking about the ability to solve problems that are complex, that don’t have immediately apparent solutions. We need a learning environment that nurture our differences and help us in terms of team and collaboration’ (Bancheva et al., 2009, p.3). Some illustrations indicating the perceptions of respondents of stimulating leadership’ creativity and innovations: ‘the program has to involve some form of reflection, opportunities to participate in role plays, questions that encourage us to think of different possibilities based on our own experience…’

**APPLYING THE IDEAS OF TRANSFORMATIVE LEARNING THEORY AND FROM THE RESEARCH IN THE LEADERSHIP DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMS AT SM, NBU**

The science and empirical research formed the basis of SM leadership developmental programs. The main building blocks - transformative learning (Mezirow, 1997), experiential learning theory (Kolb, 1998) and coaching became the fundament for answering the key question ‘what might a model for this type of leadership development look like?’
The program combines individual & group coaching, education on the theory and practice of leadership and collaborative techniques, where participants gain the advantage of a wide range of experience of other participants. It is designed as a significant program that runs for 2 years, and is addressing the needs of adult students – practicing managers, using the technology of blended learning.

The program also places emphasis on individuals understanding themselves as much as understanding the theory and practice of leadership. We use tools and methods to assist with process, such as ‘Benchmarks’ and 360 degree leadership assessment and development model.

The real value of the program is that it goes beyond the ‘what’ of leadership to look in detail about the ‘how’ of leadership (style, qualities and behaviours) and the ‘how’ of leadership development (processes, approaches, methods) in order to deliver on this complex agenda.

Below we show samples of different activities grouped according to the requirements of the key conditions of transformative learning (Pojarliev, A. & Yalkalay, Y., 2010; Pojarliev, A. 2011).

1. Activating events revealing the restrictions of existing knowledge. A major group of activities designed to serve as activators are organised as a 5-day introductory seminar. The seminar introduces the first three modules simultaneously and creates an intensive experience by outlining new ideas, initiating processes of self-assessment and self-evaluation, reflection; it employs methods and techniques for self knowledge and creating productive relationships. Some activities and games are aimed at stimulating team work in a competitive environment, by creating conditions of experiencing and reflection on success or failure of a group.

2. Creating opportunities for gaining awareness of the present set of mind/assumptions. The activities in this area include asking probing questions which help assess the accumulated experience and the consequences of a certain way of perceiving, thinking and behaviour. The presentation of new information is followed by structured questions included in the study materials. The aim is to learn to distinguish restrictive assumptions which pose obstacles to trying out new things, acting in a different way or seeing the world from a different perspective. Awareness of such assumptions is raised with the help of activities for individual work and descriptive assignments, analysis and assessment of the current state of the individual, as well as of the organisational level.

- Stimulating critical reflection and self-reflection. The aim of reflection is to break the existing frameworks and to overcome their restrictions.
- Reflection on the performance of group activities. With the help of structured questionnaires, the participants describe what has happened in the course of the teamwork, their own thoughts and feelings, assessments and conclusions, ideas for alternative approaches and what they have learned from the experience;
- Creating visions and aims for development as a result from the reflection on the current state;
- Reflection on behavioural experiments and successful or unsuccessful changes involving restricting assumptions.
A significant component facilitating the process of reflection is documenting the process of reflection and recording evidence of developed competences. This can happen, for example, through keeping a diary which documents key moments in the learning processes, points of conflict, unresolved questions, 'a-ha moments' etc. While the diary is a desirable activity, the portfolio of the products of activities is a must in the learning process. It can be realised through the use of modern information technologies, a special attachment to the portfolio, which facilitate the collecting, organising and sharing the evidence of competence.

3. **Encouraging critical dialogue with peers.** This group of activities includes:
   - group discussions and teamwork. A crucial focus in the programme are the skills for working at a distance with the help of IT technology and the use of a wide range of instruments on Web 2.0. The participants complete a series of tasks which involve an exchange of information and communication at a distance. It can be synchronous, requiring, for instance, holding a virtual discussion and recording it, as well as asynchronous discussion in a forum, working with Wikies etc.
   - pair work - having a coaching dialogue with a colleague meant to help with his short-term aims for development. The coaching dialogue upgrades the concrete experience in the work which can be described or demonstrated in detail by the participant. These areas of reflection are like the steps on a ladder which the coach and the participant are climbing up and down in the course of the conversation. While talking to each other, the participants develop key communicative skills from the point of view of the two parties in the dialogue.

4. **Creating opportunities to try out and apply new perspectives.** The activities in this group include:
   - playing the role of the consultant and proposing suggestions and recommendations for development, both in individual and organisational aspect. The issues have to be approached with multiple perspectives and varying outcomes discussed;
   - compiling a 2-year development plan from given elements leading to alternative ways of thinking concerning the participants' individual development;
   - working out a new approach - planning and implementing a behavioural experiment, sharing it and the outcomes with the help of a colleague in the form of a simulation of a coaching dialogue.

**CONCLUSIONS**

We found that leading participants through these programs leads them to experience their situations in different and transformative ways. The transformation manifests in that the participants no longer view themselves in the same way they did prior to the designed learning process. They begin to recognize that their way of perceiving and interpreting the world around them cannot be taken for granted, and that others may not see the world in the same way. Based on our experiences and the testimonials of participants this process is exciting and transforming.

‘I never saw myself as one before, and this program opened my eyes to the possibilities that I could be taking advantage of with my new found confidence in myself and my abilities as a leader’.
'I feel as if having this experience has helped me transform my personality in that, I know how to assert myself in order to get others to cooperate and work together in order to ensure efficiency is maintained.'

'I know that I want to be someone that others can come to when they need help in a situation'. 'These leadership programs have really helped me grow as a person. It has given me a far greater sense of responsibility and confidence. I thought it would be a good way to get out of my comfort zone …. I went from not even being sure of my own work, to guiding a group of peers confidently in creating a productive work'.

People participating in higher level business education want to improve their skills in areas like critical-analytical thinking and problem-solving, emotional intelligence levels, communication approaches, conflict resolution, team leadership, transition and performance management. To enable change to occur and to help participants implement new ideas, we have to incorporate new ways of thinking and experimenting with new behaviours into program design and delivery.

REFERENCES


ADULT TRANSITIONS IN TRANSITIONAL TIMES: CONFIGURATIONS AND IMPLICATIONS FOR ADULT EDUCATION

Biasin, Chiara
University of Padua
Italy

INTRODUCTION

Speaking of transitions as they relate to the adult seems particularly pertinent and significant in a moment of social and economic crisis like Western society is currently experiencing. In this scenario, where everything changes rapidly and often unpredictably, adulthood can no longer be interpreted in terms of a definitive maturity and stability. Today, adulthood is characterized as a period of transition in an epoch of transitions.

The purpose of this paper is to put in evidence the theme of transitions from two closely intertwined points of view: first, transitions as related to adult education; second, transitions concerning the role of the adult. On one hand we will show how the concept of transition allows a re-reading of the mission and vision of a discipline that needs redefining in the light of new interpretative dimensions emerging from the complexity of the present. On the other hand we will focus attention on the fact that educational proposals concerning adults must look at transitions as structural elements that characterize the life course, profoundly affecting dimensions of identity and belonging.

This paper will answer the following questions: what is a transition? Why do transitions represent the ultimate test of contemporary adult education? In what way can transitions be opportunities for educating adults? This paper is based on the hypothesis that transition constitutes one key concept in reinterpreting the conditions and possibilities of adult education through reviewing its assumptions and contents. The concept of transition is presented under specific multidisciplinary points of view: as a conceptual category, as a pattern and as a construct. Using literature from the field, there follows an in-depth analysis of two of the main theoretical and applicative models used in studying transition in its educational implications. Finally, transition will be put under the light as an educational challenge for the adult and for the discipline that takes care of his education. We argue that coaching into and through transitions can help adults cope with crises and ruptures on their life path rethinking transitions as opportunities for new educational-existential beginnings.

ADULT EDUCATION AS A DISCIPLINE IN TRANSITION

Transitions are not rare or extraordinary events, but structural components of a continuous process of re-configuration that characterizes today's post-modern society. These transitions, increasingly unexpected and complex, relate to the contexts of life, of work, of adult relationships - modifying self-identity constructs, redefining social ties, and altering the trajectory of lives. Transition covers all periods of life, but adulthood in particular is an age of transitions in which the transitory becomes dominant.
Today, the adult going through transition is forced to be flexible, to oscillate between moments of equilibrium and situations of crisis, called to a constant, intense activity of adjustment in all intimate and collective dimensions; these expose him to fragility, discontinuity, vulnerability. Threatened by the risk of getting lost in the change, attracted by the many possibilities of escape and irresponsibility, the adult is put to the test by transitions which become an interpretative, descriptive element essential to the life course and to adult identity itself.

Transition and flexibility offer an adult the promise of future development, the hope that learning is always possible, and brings to light the need to respond to challenges in a socio-cultural and economic context that is in perennial mutation. The “fully functional” adult (mentioned by Carl Rogers) becomes a sort of development ideal to strive for, a constant developmental task, a goal that always moves and changes, and cannot be achieved. Within a global and extended scenario, in which choices and decisions are multiplied to the point that they must remain inconclusive and always open, transition forces the fixing of benchmarks for transforming uncertainty and mobility into educational categories useful in supporting paths of growth and adult learning (Biasin, 2012).

Transitions are the test of the adult, and also of the discipline dealing with his/her education. This is evident when the explosion of Lifelong Learning coincides with the implosion of Adult Education as a disciplinary knowledge characterized by theoretical models and practices not always well systematized or coordinated amongst themselves (Finger & Asun, 2000, p.3). Both the mission and the vision of Adult Education are today put into crisis in their traditional task which was the humanization of the fordist model of industrial development through an educational proposition addressed to the adult trying to link the world of work with the social structure, integrating the professional and the collective dimensions through a dedicated education.

In the face of a worldwide crisis that touches the foundations of global society, the task of Adult Education, having lost theoretical validity and socio-historical justification, should be reviewed. In liquid modernity, some dimensions of adult education have diminished while others appear renewed; the area of self-care, along with human resource development and on-going professional training, has emerged while the critical and democratic tradition (trendy until some decades ago in politics and values) is orienting towards an adaption to the structure “fit-to-market” of postmodern capitalism (Finger & Asun, 2000). The concept of transition serves, therefore, as an indicator by which to map the boundaries of Adult Education as a discipline into the gap between the aims of the present and the mission/vision of the past.

To speak of transition as a current object of study in the education of adults may seem obvious; but we can acknowledge that the change in global society to which the adult is required to adapt (more or less critically, more or less voluntarily), obliges the adult to deal with this element essential to trajectories of the life course. According to this logic, talk about transitions in adult life would be an evidence, an ephemeral praise of variability. The issue of transitions coincides, however, with a larger project of rethinking the identity of the discipline itself, which can no longer be tied solely to the function of acquiring skills related to employability or pertaining to the management of transversal skills able to support the final transition to a flexible model of the western adult, individualistic and oriented to
consumerism, as required (according to a functionalist logic) by the postmodern capitalism (Marzano, 2008).

The evidence of and the pervasiveness of transitions force reflection on one of the main vocations of adult education, that is the critical transformative issue that has, historically, given impetus to social change and has supported the thrust towards processes of critical awareness in development of the adult (Brookfield & Holst, 2011) as the pedagogies of Freire and Illich have shown.

Such a rethinking is related to the social and political outcome of such an issue, and also concerns, more generally, the relationship between the adult and the intentionality of the education prepared for him, as well as the relationship between adulthood and the meaning/value of practices able to put into focus (within floating transitions, values, goals) restoring to the adult a foundational and forward-looking dimension. Transitions graft themselves within the logic of transformation that at several levels - social, professional, personal, identity related, etc. - calls into question the role of the adult, as well as the education dedicated to him/her.

For these reasons, transition is difficult to manage and to think about: it queries the adult in relation to the reality that surrounds him, in relation to situations of mutation during which the adult is required to change, in relation to developmental proposals that require the adult to maintain consistency and continuity with himself even in changing conditions. More profoundly, transition poses the issue of meaning of contemporary adult education, swallowed up by the political dimensions of Lifelong Learning, confused with psychological care and self-therapy, identified more and more with effective methodologies of learning or teaching.

In this sense, transitions represent a challenge for today's adult education by underlining the discipline's need to deal with increasingly the mentoring of adults to support their transitions. The result is not the codification of a way to confront transitions, nor to obtain a list of skills useful to adults in transition.

Adult education should cope with transitions by suggesting paths of reflection, proposing possible answers to the questions of sense that transitions pose and through which adults must work to understand their mutable situation of life without losing the anchor of self.

To accomplish this, it is necessary to overcome a superficial reading of transitions, often viewed as external requests for change or as pre-made outcomes of change. Non-reductive explanation, which intercepts the semantic roots and the cultural dimensions of the concept, makes it possible to understand how transition represents a basic idea that allows an analysis of the conditions and the possibilities of education for adult education.

THE STUDY OF THE TRANSITION

Transition is a key theme in the social sciences but different fields develop the concept from their own disciplinary points of view. Multidisciplinary approaches provide distinctive meanings that better situate transition within a specific theoretical epistemology. Even where
disciplinary boundaries of a study create differences in definition, they underline the meaning of transition as a notion of change and as a dynamic implying modification and adaptation.

Starting from the ancient Greeks, Western philosophy has tended to criticize transition, censuring the concept as a negative idea. Anthropology’s foundation as a discipline is instead linked to debate about how transitions influence the cultural meaning in practices of social change throughout Western and non-Western societies. Psychology’s study of transition focuses on the individual’s developmental tasks. Sociology studies social structures and social roles across borders or over time. To develop a life-course perspective in any person’s life story, examining transition is an important dimension.

Consideration of transition from specific disciplinary approaches will outline how this transversal concept has influenced the specific epistemologies; furthermore, it will clarify how these distinctive interpretations are rooted in a common base by a comprehensive and broad signification of transition as a process of transformation. Reviewing the contributions highlights the importance implied in this notion in contemporary societies as a construct that increases a reflection between individual experience and social change, or between personal continuity and personal transformation in the life course perspective. Transformation can be a central dimension for rethinking the discipline of adult education in today’s post-modern scenario.

From philosophy’s ancient beginnings the concept of transition, viewed as a change and as becoming, has stood as the logical opposite to the stability and immutability that characterize the great philosophical systems of the Greeks. Transition appears to flee from any single definition because its qualities of instability and alterability introduce variations in substance, in form, in quantity of being. For this reason, transition has been ousted from the ontology and the philosophical speculations at the base of Western thought (Biasin, 2012).

In the fragments remaining of his work On Nature, Parmenides (6th cent B.C.) separates being from non-being, attributing primacy to ἐκτί (being, that which is not born and does not die) that which possesses properties contrary to becoming, that which is immovable, non-alterable, and indestructible. The influence of Parmenides’ ontology, his opposition to that which is transient, is found again in Zeno (6th-5th cent B.C.). Using his proof by contradiction (“reductio ad absurdum” in the paradox of Achilles and the tortoise, and in the paradox of the arrow, for example), Zeno supports the founder of the school of Elea in opposing multiplicity and the motion of things to favor the unity and immutability of being. Agreeing with Parmenides, the philosopher Plato (428-348 B.C.) puts the focus of his doctrine on the idea (εἰδος). In The Republic, using the allegorical myth of the cave, Plato clarifies distinctions that he sees separating tangible, changing and transient things from the world of eternal ideas associated with good, with mathematical truths, with perfection. The philosophical system of Aristotle (384-322 B.C.) is founded on a vision of reality as metaphysics, that is to say, on a philosophy that springs from first principles of being and knowing. Aristotle admits the ideas of becoming, of movement, of birth, of death, but he considers these to be attributes of entities in the real world. Philosophy first, however, studies being as beginning from substance, the stable and permanent substratum; Aristotle postulates the existence of a first cause, a prime mover as the un-movable point of commencement, eternal, unchanging, un-begotten, incorruptible, the thought of thought from which everything springs.
In the cosmology of Ptolemy (100-175 A.D.), which becomes the model of the universe until the Copernican revolution, we rediscover principles of the philosophies of Parmenides, Plato and Aristotle, in particular, the argument against becoming and movement (Kallio, Marchand, 2012). In Ptolemy’s astronomy, the lunar world and the sub-lunar world are separated. The lunar world is composed of an unchangeable and eternal element (the ether) from which the seven celestial spheres that govern the cycle of human life are formed. The sub-lunar world is characterized by 4 corruptible elements: air, water, earth and fire give form to the sub-lunar world which is characterized by imperfection, deterioration, incompleteness, and by continuous changes of state and condition that characterize inanimate things and all living beings from birth to death.

From ancient times, the system of thought in the Western world has been built on a basis of arguments contrary to transition and becoming. In the modern world, the philosophies of Descartes and Kant can be interpreted as continuing the ancient vision. In fact, Descartes (1596-1650) assigns a central role to clear and distinct ideas that come from mathematics as the indubitable and invariable criteria of truth. Kant (1724-1804), aiming to single out and define categories or pure concepts clearly distinguishes reality “in sé” from reality “per sé”, the “phenomenon” from “noumenon”, that which appears in changing forms from that which is instead itself.

The philosophies of being, from Parmenides to Kant, have given form to Western thought at the expense of the philosophies of mutability whose founder was Heraclitus (550-480 B.C.). The philosopher of Ephesus, noted for his aphorism “everything flows”, associated the reason of things not to being, but to the natural element fire, or better, to the metamorphoses of this element that changes shape and direction. Instead of linearity and logical progression, it is circularity and the continuity of movement that characterize the λογος of Heraclitus, linking it to the transmutation of natural elements, one into another, within a dynamic and permanent cosmogony in which everything is in transition. Contrary to Parmenides and Plato, Heraclitus believes all can be measured in terms of change, transitions of state, instability of form. Because everything dissolves itself and generates itself from its opposite, without divisions and separations, everything converges into a fluid and generating unity where opposites - mutable and immutable - call to each other and interconnect.

According to the philosopher and sinologist Jullien (2009), the prevalence of the Plato-Aristotle thought model instead of the Heraclitus thought model is at the base of the Western world and the culture's difficulty to think about change and to live through transition. Unlike Oriental culture, Western logic "stumbles" on the ontology of Plato and Aristotle which, founded on the principles of identity and non-contradiction, thinks in terms of opposites, separating being from non-being, separating unity from multiplicity, separating stability from motion. Transition insists on fluidity, on continuity, on the circularity of change, it flees from a single and stable definition of the ideal form of being that is typical in the logical rationality of the Western world.

Probably, this explains why the concept of transition entered the world of the social sciences only in recent times, but in the early twentieth century transition emerges as the reference category with which to interpret the meaning of social practices in the Western and Non-Western societies. In fact, the concept of transition was put into focus in The Rites of Passage (1909), by Arnold van Gennep (1873-1957) based on his observations of rituals in various cultures. Van Gennep’s study centers itself on the moment when, in a society, there
comes a change of state, of condition, of shape, of age. Comparing social structure to the image of an interior edifice in which it's possible to move from one room to another, the author explains how different societies - from those of ancient Egypt to those of Africa, from sacred to profane - use rituals of transition to signal change while at the same time maintaining unity and continuity at the individual level, aggregation and diversification at a societal level. Ceremonies and rituals dealing with some important moment of human life (birth childhood, adolescence, adulthood, engagement, marriage, pregnancy, motherhood/fatherhood, death) serve, therefore, as rules of transition, patterns "to control" the passage from one stage to another in social or individual life, legitimizing them without shocks or rippings. Van Gennep identifies a basic sequence, divided into three stages - separation, marginality, aggregation - through which the transition is "accompanied," meaning facilitated through a form of regularization of the transition from a before to an after, which otherwise are not connected. From an anthropological point of view, what is of central importance in the moment of transition is the time-in-between: a time or a space independent of "liminality" which indicate that transition is occurring and that allows seeing the process of transformation has taken place, generating a change at the social or individual level.

In this sense, van Gennep's studies have shown that, on the anthropological level, transition represents a basic structure in the life path of the individual. So, transition has therefore been interpreted as a reference construct in the path of human development, already working in childhood. On the psychological side, the studies of Donald Winnicott (1896-1971) take up the idea of transition as a crucial “zone of passage” can distinguish between non-perception and perception, or between the internal world and the external reality of the individual. The objects or phenomena that Winnicott calls "transactional" have, therefore, the function of imposing the mechanism of separation and inclusion that is learned in the first months of life, and which continues throughout life as a search for balance between illusion and reality, of between self and others. The new born learns to bear separation from the mother (breast) by managing the sense of emptiness and loss with transactional objects (stuffed animal, blanket, handkerchief, thumb) which have the scope to gestate an intermediate reality between the state of fusion with the mother and the phase in which the mother is perceived as separate and independent. The object is not in itself transactional, but represents the transition, the passage through which children are put to the test and learn to cope with a reality outside of themselves.

If in Playing and Reality (1971), Winnicott shows how transition is a fundamental mechanism of evolutionary development in a human being from the first months of life, Erik Erikson (1902-1994), in A Life Cycle Completed (1982) explains that transition itself is the epigenetic structure through which the whole existence of mankind, from birth to old age develops itself. In the model Erikson proposes, the cycle of life, progresses through a series of eight states, one contained in the another, that give life to an overall, continuous and cumulative process. At every stage new values and forces emerge, but also specific crisis and difficulties; it is not possible to move ahead without addressing and resolving the development tasks of the preceding phase. The premise at the base of Erickson's theory is psycho-biological: the human organism continues to develop after childhood and adolescence, proceeding through sequences of emerging potentialities. The change that characterizes the human life cycle according to this evolutionary configuration is made possible by the mechanism of transition, which permits passing through successive and gradual phases of development. Exploring the model of Erikson more deeply, Daniel Levinson (1920-1994) will focus on the ultimate sequences of the life cycle and, through empirical studies, will show how transition
represents the propulsive motor typical of adulthood, which cyclically alternates through periods of stability and periods of change. Transition marks the stages of adult development as a Life Course, and is a sign of two ages (30 and 50 years old) in which individuals engage in vital transformations that reshape their own way of life, dealing with adjustments and adaptations, and finding the capacity to cope with them.

The sociological approach to Life Course paradigm puts into relation the life of a person and the processes of that person's development, linking it to the pattern with which individuals respond to historical-social, personal, or family events. In particular Glen H. Elder (1998) speaks of linked lives to explain the capacity of control and of agency with which adults cope with transitions, thus "constructing" their life path. This last is composed of diverse trajectories (family, professional, cognitive, emotional, historical, etc.) that mark existence, and which form or modify themselves at the crossroads of individual biography and the socio-cultural context corresponding to transitions: turning points, milestones, watershed experiences. These last give shape the course of adult life because they are connected to moments of change, of great stress and anxiety (Almeida, Wong, 2009; Miller, 2010), but also to normative and non-normative events or to situations of discontinuity with respect to individual and social roles.

MODELS OF TRANSITION

Multidisciplinary approaches to transition have clarified how the idea is understood from varying points of view. Looking at philosophy, anthropology, psychology and sociology has revealed that transition is used variously as an idea, a category, a structure or an inherent pattern in the passage from one state or condition into another. The disciplinary differences converge in a shared definition - transition is a process of transformation seen as a movement that introduces change. The change can vary from a small mutation up to a rip, a compound fracture, a complete rupture. Transition is seen as a jump between states of stability, a means of bridging the gap dividing two states of security.

It's like an uncertain intermission between a before and an after, one that includes its own rules for deleting past conditions and obscuring future perspectives, instituting a sort of "temporary order" of the present (Biasin, 2012). Transition has the function of connection between two extremes, two situations, two opposing conditions. But, while opening to the development of new dynamics, transition also triggers regression, stasis, voids. Transition implies a progression not always linear, sequential or predictable.

The concept of transition is grafted with the polarized dynamic between two forces: on one part the need for security, for maintenance of the past; on the other part, the necessity to open, to break, which arrives with fear of a still distant future. Transition thus refers to managing a suspended and ambiguous present. It is with this structural schema that the principle model-makers have sought to describe and interpret transition in the psycho-social field. The starting point of these models is the theory formulated by Kurt Lewin after World War II. Lewin explains that change can only happen if it is preceded and followed by two specific moments of transition: first - Unfreeze - corresponds to predisposing conditions and favorable context; the second - Refreeze - reinforces the transformation and renders it stable. Lewin's schema is the foundation of the model developed by William Bridges (2009),
who studied transition in the organizational milieu viewing it as a not-simple process consisting of three moments close to and sometimes overlapping each other.

Transition does not coincide with change: change is the result. Paradoxically, transition begins with the end of a situation, condition or state (Ending), which implies, on the part of persons or organizations, the capacity of Letting go, and dealing with a Losing. Transition, therefore, concerns a sort of mourning about the past that needs to be managed; one must enter into the transition, not avoid it, in order to open to the future. According to Bridges, this stage comes after a Neutral Zone, a psychological No-man's-land in which the strongest emotions, the most negative feelings, clash with more positive pressures. In the Neutral Zone, adults try out new behaviors, new roles, new values, new ways of being and thinking; but they must also live with anxiety, with the desire to escape, with a loss of motivation, with confusion, with self-doubt. In this phase of critical re-alignment, filled with opposing impulses (chaos / order; energy / apathy; activity / passivity), trial and error move together until the transitional process ends with an effective renewal in a New Beginning. For Bridges, transition, is a demanding dynamic because it requires the time necessary to confer a meaning and a direction to the uncertain intermission the adults or the organizations must live. The model of Bridges reprises Lewin's phase of Unfreeze: the most critical moment for adults comes in this phase of losing control, in the passage through uncertainty and indecision, in the difficulty of interpreting such events in a positive manner, as an opportunity for choice and decision-making.

The premise of the organizational model of Bridges is that transition is a fundamental constant of a more general organic evolutionary process, correlated to the dynamic flowing of living beings and the "naturalness" of human existence itself. The implications Bridges finds, and which he applies in the Transition Management Program he created, are of the formative type. Change can be realized if a process of recognition, reconciliation and renewal is activated - starting in the past and moving toward the future, and avoiding interpreting transition as a destructive risk.

Nancy Schlossberg shares the same premise in one of the most significant models for transition; she conceives change as a natural and global force that connotes reality - historical, social, cultural and individual.

The evolutionary perspective adopted by this American scholar and her collaborators (Anderson, Goodman, Schlossberg, 2012) postulates that human beings, throughout all their existence, are called to respond, to confront, to adapt to changes, sometimes suddenly. The capacity to "invest" continually in our lives, which the adult develops and directs in various milieu (professional, relational, affective, cognitive, etc.), is innate, but is put to the test by transitions. Transitions represent the most critical moments of existence because they interrupt the current of life, the life-sustaining flow. For Schlossberg, transition is a Life Transforming Experience - a form of existential "adjustment" connected to vital events - expected, unexpected, and "non-events" - which an adult lives constantly and more or less consciously. Schlossberg's model puts accent on the necessity for adults and change to live hand in hand, without which transitions can become potential crisis moments for one's identity - personal, social, vocational. To prevent jeopardy, the adult must be able to think and act during the transition (or be helped to do so) by focusing on coping skills, calibrating points of strength and traits of vulnerability. Schlossberg (2007) compares the transition to a shock, like an up / down with which one must continuously cope. The individual perspective is the
key point because it affects the way each adult perceives and assesses the transition in relation to self. Very significant factors in this regard are the characteristics of personality, personal and family history, previous experience, age, gender, socioeconomic and cultural status - these influence the way in which transition is lived and dealt with.

Another important element in this regard is the context of the transition, which refers to the relation of the adult to the socio-cultural, historical, economic, social and relational environment that surround and affect the way a person stays in (and exits from) transition, perceiving its possibilities or living it as an obstacle. According to Schlossberg (2007), the ways transition impacts people plays a crucial role, because these directly affect routine, modes of thinking, roles, values - behaviors of the adult that are also altered due to the typology of transition itself (a positive event or negative, collective or individual, foreseen or unexpected).

Schlossberg explains that today's adults live a situation of continuous transition which engages them in a permanent movement of entering (Moving in) and of exiting (Moving out) between different transitions, which also requires passage through them. The theoretic attention of the scholar in defining a descriptive model of transition goes hand in hand with the diagnostic and practical concern of developing specific forms of counseling directed toward adults to help them cope with these situations, activating self-directed learning and self-development skills. The model of the 4S (acronym of the four components Self, Support, Strategies, Situation) aims to provide support of adults working to understand and react to the transition they are living. The 4S model is inspired by the principle of sports training, according to which it is not possible win a contest without training, constant and specific. Because transition is an unavoidable part of adult life, it must be approached and supported through a dedicated preparation to avoid its producing discomfort, stress, suffering, transforming itself into an experience of failure and defeat.

In this regard, contributions of adult education play an important role because its premise, that the possibility of learning is permanent and lasts throughout life, translates itself into the basic principle and mechanism by virtue of which an adult learns to negotiate and navigate through transitions.

**TRANSITION AS AN ADULT CHALLENGE**

Transition represents a double challenge for the contemporary adult because it configures itself on one hand as a requirement for external change and continuing learning, while on the other hand it calls for internal growth and permanent educability. Events - individual and social - the source of potential transitions, multiply themselves to present a wide range of choices and of repercussions to which the adult is called to respond. If on one side that call refers to empowering the capacity for autonomy and independent development of skills for self-management and self-education, on the other side the subject is left alone to confront the change, the transformation, the continuous social and learning demands. A greater capacity for autonomy, for freedom, for self-determination required of the adult by the "market" is counterweighted by higher risks of failure, greater insecurity, an augmentation of vulnerability and fragility (Bergier & Bourdon, 2009). In fact, points of weakness in the adult, and fractures in their life trajectories, become most evident around events of transition.
The de-institutionalization of the course of life and the disappearance of rites of passage (van Gennep, 2000) have transformed adulthood into the "time of the catwalk" (Helson, 2002) with continual transit between social exigencies and individual needs, between moments of equilibrium and times of transition, often disorienting. An evident contradiction marks adulthood today; the oscillations between demands for self-determination and situations of destabilization, between self-development and critical situations. With this paradoxical condition where autonomy coexists with vulnerability, and a need for self-development coexists with a need for help, one must load adult education as a discipline whose formative task is to assert the need for change, the urgency of transformation, the responsibility and the maturity of the adult.

Adult biographies are increasingly threatened by transitions because they are crowded with moments of existential anxiety, with relational and emotional difficulties, with situations of professional change, with continuous moments of crisis, rupture, recovery, stalemate, recommencement (Paul, 2002).

Who will I be after the transition? Who am I during the transition? What happens to all I was before? In moments of transition, the adult confronts many questions; adult education is called to provide possible answers.

Transitions expose the educational challenge of this discipline. We must not confuse adult education with therapy of the psychological type, nor identify it with a social task: adult education should give a resilient answer of mentoring to help adults interpret the complexity of the present in which they find themselves, by a labor of personal reinterpretation and of meaning. Coaching the adult across a transition is a strategic educational action today because it means taking care of exactly this critical intermezzo glimpsed between two stabilities, the passage from one condition to another: an uncertain present between a past to let go of (Bridges, 2009) and a future not yet delineated (Schlossberg, 2007). Accompanying the adult through transitions offers the opportunity to manage this time of unstable conditions, suggesting new aspects for planning a future allows glimpsing a possible beyond towards which the design of the trajectories of adult life can be corrected, modified or maintained.

This does not mean transitions the adult lives are tout court educational experiences or that they, in themselves, involve a learning process. It is not just the impact of the event itself (bereavement, loss of job, etc.) but more the manner of approach to, and the subjective perception of, transition that acts in regard to learning. The transition is, in fact, a process essentially subjective, potentially stressful, for the adult involved (Anderson et al., 2012), which brings into play a web of factors related to characteristics of personality, to individual and family history, to aspects tied to the social context (Merriam, 2005). Transitions can cause disorientation, anguish, self-doubt, but also a renewed commitment to self-care. For this reason, adult transitions need to be mentored, that is, to be "loaded with meaning," to acquire a specific intentionality as regards the adult's life history in order to activate transformative processes.

In this direction, Unindustria - an association of companies dealing with professional and corporate training in Italy - has organized an intervention for adult education intended for people without work. In the territory of Treviso (Veneto region), in training courses meant to teach new professional skills to adults that lost their jobs due to the closure of large factories and small businesses, special attention was also given to coaching during the difficult
transitional experience. Adults who lost their jobs - with little hope of re-entering the local labor market, almost completely moved to Asian countries -, lived this transition with anguish and anxiety, increased by the many implications to family, social relations, and identity. Losses included wages, security, self-esteem, self-image, perception of self-efficacy. Many households went into debt. During the training, both at the individual and small group levels, support activities, counseling and coaching were put in place to manage the transitional process.

The issue was not so much to find a new job (the future) nor to recover aspects and characteristics of a previous profession (the past), but to live the uncertain present of transition, supporting the adult in training, teaching him to balance elements of vulnerability with possibilities of autonomy. The basic coaching concept was to re-orient behaviors, attitudes, values, called into question by the work transition.

The purpose of the training was to solicit a new self-understanding on the part of the adult, in the face of a difficult experience that required not only a new position in the working reality, but also a renewed perception of self-image and of their identity.

It wasn't just a matter of interiorizing the uncertainty of job loss, or of accepting the flexibility of the labor market as the new cornerstone on which to solidify dimensions of personal or professional identity, it was more a matter of facing the work transition, living it as a transformative passage of identity, learning to choose the opportunities that transition offered, mitigating aspects of loss and suffering it entailed.

To think of the transition, in any context it occurs, as a possible educational process requires (an accompaniment to) critical awareness and to possible opportunities for emancipation and transformation. More than learning strategies and techniques of confrontation, more than on the analysis of present-day frameworks, attention should focus on the identity transformed by transitions: not a simple, superficial readjustment, but a deep commitment of a subjective-biographical type.

The aspect mainly put in evidence by this educational approach concerns coaching as a job of reflection centered on a relational and social dimension of support and integration. In this view, adult education adopts this formative challenge; coaching adults busy confronting their own existence brought into question, in it's the fullest sense, by the transition.

CONCLUSION

This paper presented transitions as a central issue for contemporary adult education. It was not intended to propose an interpretation that considered transitions as a result of the rapidly changing post-modern society that requires adherence to flexibility and global uniformity. We referred to this scenario in order to contextualize a more ample reasoning involving the characteristics of contemporary adult education, and the profile of the adult, both challenged by transitions.

Transition introduces ruptures, wounds, discontinuity, changes, but also adjustments and new elements into the life course and into the specific existential, emotional, professional areas wherein it presents itself. Transition has to do with change, with the transformative
processes that require a permanent adaptation, and yet support the possibility of continuous development.

Often associated with trigger events, transition may bifurcate into a menace and putting to the test, or else into an opportunity for improvement: it might assume (for the individual adult and for the discipline that occupies itself with his education) a value, punitive and damaging rather than emancipatory and liberating. It's not just a matter of interiorizing uncertainty and flexibility as structural components of the present; it's more a matter of reading transition as an educational dynamic that requires well-grafted reflection and awareness.

In this sense, educational activity aimed at adults, insisting on supporting transitions, allows the conferring of a deeper sense to change, orienting toward the future, and introducing adequate adjustments for thinking about and living through transitions.

REFERENCES


BLEND COUNSELLING: ADVISING PROSPECTIVE STUDENTS WITH VOCATIONAL QUALIFICATIONS ON THEIR WAY TO UNIVERSITY

Brunner, Stefanie
Universität Oldenburg
Germany

Kretschmer, Stefanie
Universität Oldenburg
Germany

Zawacki-Richter, Olaf
Universität Oldenburg
Germany

ABSTRACT

Since 2010, access to German universities has been broadened for people without traditional admission qualifications. Because of this expansion, the public higher education system has to meet several challenges. One of the most urgent tasks is the development of flexible support and counselling structures to facilitate a smooth transition from working life into higher education.

This is where the concept of blended counselling comes in. Linking to the tradition of blended learning, blended counselling connects online elements with face-to-face counselling contacts and thus allows a flexible and intensive accompaniment for prospective students.

Following the blended counselling approach, an online counselling portal was developed. Qualitative interviews were conducted with providers of counselling at the University of Oldenburg; the first counselling modules were developed and then tested in the summer term of 2013. This paper presents the theoretical background of blended counselling, the portal’s development and implementation, and the first evaluation results.

1. BACKGROUND AND RELEVANCE

Since before the amendment of the Lower Saxony’s Higher Education Law 2010, the Carl von Ossietzky University of Oldenburg was open to students with non-traditional backgrounds. In 2007, the university’s constitutional order showed the will to be open to all population groups. The consequences of demographic change, the requirements concerning the Bologna Process and our society’s development towards a lifelong learning knowledge society support the importance of this shift.

Since 2010, access to German universities has been broadened for people without traditional admission qualifications. Because of this expansion, the public higher education system has to meet several challenges. One of the most urgent and important tasks is the development of adequate and flexible support and counselling structures, preferably independent of time and place, to facilitate smooth transition from working life into higher education.
In recent years, the Lower Saxony ‘Offene Hochschule’ model project (‘Open university’, our own translation)\(^1\) created means for the accreditation and recognition of qualifications and skills acquired outside of university. At present, at different levels, the transition from professional to university education is being promoted. The Bund-Länder ‘Aufstieg durch Bildung: offene Hochschulen’ (‘Advancement through education: Open universities’, our own translation)\(^2\) competition funded by the German Ministry of Education and Research (BMBF) and the European Union aims at reaching new target groups, specifically employed persons with or without traditional admission qualifications for universities. The projects within the BMBF-promoted ‘ANKOM—Übergänge von der beruflichen in die hochschulische Bildung’ (‘Transition from profession to higher education’, our own translation)\(^3\) initiative develop e.g. preparation courses for people with professional backgrounds to support the transition into academic study after years of employment.

The need for opportunities supporting transition management will rise in the next several years, considering the fact that many of the concerned prospective students do not yet know that they have admission qualifications for university. Because of these developments, the counselling departments of the University (e.g. the Central Study Advisory Service and the Student Registration Office) have perceived an increased demand among this target group. As one of the first universities in Lower Saxony, the University of Oldenburg published detailed and comprehensive guidelines for professional qualified persons concerning the admission possibilities.\(^4\) At the same time, the need to talk about certain questions arises, e.g. ‘Do I really have admission qualifications and, if so, to what extent?’ ‘Can I manage the challenges studies pose?’ ‘Which competencies do I have to bring along?’ ‘Are there any preparation opportunities?’ ‘Can I manage my family duties, my job and a course of study?’

Besides the higher information and counselling needs, the following problem areas have been identified (Hanft & Brinkmann, 2013):

1) On their way to university, professionally qualified persons often have to contact many different advisors and institutions over a longer period in different phases of the counselling process to get all the relevant information. The reason for this is, among others, that many of the counselling institutions are responsible for only a small part of the required information that professionally qualified prospective students need before starting a course of study.

2) Sometimes, prospective students receive different and occasionally inconsistent information, e.g. concerning the admission qualifications, because not all departments and counselling services have the up-to-date information about university admission regulations for professionally qualified persons and therefore sometimes dispense incorrect information.

Thus, at present, the counselling situation presents itself rather as a jungle of possibilities and means with often unclear responsibilities, changing contact persons and inconsistent information. In an early stage, the first obstacles can arise that may prevent students from

---


\(^3\) [http://ankom.his.de/](http://ankom.his.de/) [Retrieved 08.10.2013]

beginning a program or, after successful enrolment, may negatively influence the further study process or even lead to dropping out.

To respond to the target group’s specific needs and to fulfil the demands of a transparent, professional and service-oriented advisory service, we developed, tested and evaluated a blended counselling model. This research is embedded in the project ‘InOS—Individualisiertes Online-Studienvorbereitungsprogramm für beruflich Qualifizierte’ (‘Individualised online study preparation courses for professionally qualified prospective students’, our own translation), funded by the German Ministry of Education and Research (BMBF). Special opportunities for the target group of professionally qualified prospective students are developed. An integral part of the project is the development and evaluation of a central online counselling portal with embedded counselling modules based on the concept of blended counselling.

2. BLENDED COUNSELLING: THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

2.1 DEFINITION: BLENDED COUNSELLING

Blended counselling can be applied as a flexible modular concept that combines online and face-to-face units and thus can be design tailored to the individual needs of prospective students with vocational qualifications.

According to Reinmann (2005), the concept of blended learning means ‘learning with different media and methods including virtual and physical rooms’ (our own translation). Thus, blended counselling is characterised as a special format of counselling that mixes ‘classical face-to-face counselling and online counselling’ (Weiß & Engelhardt, 2012, p.1). At present, this notion is not yet widespread within the counselling profession (ib., p.3), and no research is available concerning its implementation at German universities. The specification of the practical implications of blended counselling has to be made within the context and the focus of the relevant target groups. This means that the selection of online and face-to-face-modules depends on the target group and the specific concerns and needs regarding the information or counselling process. At present, online counselling is being offered and studied mainly in therapeutic and psychosocial contexts (Kühne & Hintenberger, 2009). A few universities have developed (?) a ‘virtual study advisory service, which mostly means ‘a well-designed FAQ-list’ (Reindl & Weiß, 2012, p.11, our own translation). Today, nearly every prospective student seeks information via internet (Heine, Willich, & Schneider, 2010), so the purposeful design of coordinated information and counselling opportunities via web and face-to-face-contact seems essential and reasonable.

2.2 BLENDED COUNSELLING AS AN APPROACH FOR AN ADVISORY SERVICE OF PROSPECTIVE STUDENTS WITH VOCATIONAL QUALIFICATIONS

Following Sieckendiek, Engel, and Nestmann (1999), counselling is ‘an interaction between at least two parties, where the counselor supports the counselee—with the use of communicative means—to gain more insight, orientation or problem-solving skills with regard to a question or problem’ (p. 13, our own translation). This implies that counselling should
enable the counselee to solve his/her problem independently by using his/her own resources.

The advisor’s task is therefore not to offer a solution but lies within the following components that we identified: 1) clarification of the request(s), 2) identification and supply of the needed information, 3) continuous scan for information and suggestions that could be useful for the counselee and 4) providing oneself as a counterpart for reflexion on possible courses of action.

As explained above, the target group of prospective students with vocational qualifications needs specific opportunities for counselling and information, with flexibility of time and space. To make this possible, in terms of blended counselling, online elements should be integrated into the counselling and information process. In practice, this means the development, programming and implementation of an online counselling portal. The modules of the online portal should consist of information but should also support the clarification process. Besides the external needs (such as time and space flexibility), some potentially positive effects can be evoked by working through some aspects in self-directed and independent ways in an online environment:

1) By giving the option to find, receive and filter information on their own, the counselees’ self-efficacy (Bandura, 1977) can be encouraged as well as the belief in their own ‘locus of control’ (Rotter, 1966), a psychological concept that means the belief in one’s capability of finding solutions in a self-directed and competent way. This, again, can encourage the counselee further in the development and decision process.

2) If the counselee, in the next step, contacts an advisor, essential information is already known. Therefore, less time is needed in the counselling process for the transport of information. At the same time, the ‘cognitive load’ (Sweller, Ayres & Kalyuga, 2011) is reduced in the counselling situation, for needed information is already prepared. Thus, the counselee has greater cognitive capacity for the further deliberation process and is not occupied with too many new facts.

3) Pure information concerns in counselling situations will drop; as a consequence, the advisors will have more time for ‘true’ counselling, which means that more counselees can be served.

However, an online counselling portal also has limitations: all information has to be embedded in the context. Users must be able to interpret facts and transform them in purposeful action. It is of high importance to point out that this counselling concept does not mean the generation of fast solutions. The portal explicitly does not aim at this; rather, efficiency and flexibility are the focus. An essential contribution of counselling is to transform place- and context-free information into knowledge that may be applied and put into action in daily life (‘Zweite Frankfurter Erklärung zur Beratung,’ 2012; ‘Second Frankfurt Declaration of Counselling’, our own translation) The concept of the online counselling portal in terms of blended counselling is designed to integrate the context as much as possible and to allow a smooth link to face-to-face counselling as soon as necessary. Then, the connection to the wider context falls to the advisors. It is obvious that not everything can be carried out by an online tool. In particular, when supporting study decisions or a change in the study subject, advisors need ‘double competence’: they have to know the facts concerning the subjects, and they have to be able to compare them and to ponder them in light of the counselee’s...
skills, competencies and wishes in order to fully cater to the prospective student's needs. (Stiehler, 2007).

If this advising contact happens to be in a face-to-face-setting or in an online chat or forum, depends on the specific situation. It is not reasonable to use a technical tool just because it is available: it has to make sense within the specific context, be perceived as helpful by both sides and be easy enough to use.

Because of the design of an innovative blended counselling approach that combines online and face-to-face-elements, these considerations lead to the following:

1) Within the online part of the counselling process, i.e. in the online portal, essential facts will be presented that are necessary and relevant for decision-making in advance.
2) This information is to be presented in a structured and transparent form and in a way that supports the prospective student in becoming active in a self-directed process.
3) Interactive elements and self-assessments assist the user within his/her self-exploration and reflexion and activate and support his/her belief in self-efficacy.
4) As soon as a user encounters limits in the online environment, they have an uncomplicated opportunity to get in contact with a responsible person via email, chat, Skype or phone (including the option of arranging a face-to-face appointment).
5) Structured paths are to be presented that combine online with face-to-face-elements. It is conceivable to use the results of the online modules in the meeting. At any point, it is the user’s decision to use only the online elements, to use them in any desired combination or to combine them with face-to-face-appointments.

3. PURPOSE, STRATEGIC AND STRUCTURAL EMBEDDING AT THE UNIVERSITY OF OLDENBURG

Two objectives are inherent in the planned undertaking: on the one hand, the blended counselling approach is being conceptualised theoretically as well as with respect to its transferability to the specific context of university advisory services. On the other hand, we have developed a beta version of an online counselling portal and document the design with regard to content and technical programming as well as its practical implementation. It is essential that the portal is consequently designed according to the blended counselling approach; it is not just a collection of various online tools and services. It is conceptualised on the basis of literature and empirical findings regarding the target group’s specifications and needs.

A challenge that should not be underestimated lies in the sustainable integration of new tools and web applications within the existing structures at the University. Since 2011, all study service units at the University of Oldenburg have been integrated in the ‘Department 3 for Study-related and Academic Affairs’. These service units are all engaged in supporting, advising and providing information for prospective students, enrolled students and graduates. The integrated units are the central study advisory service, student registration, the examination office, the international student office and career service. Following the organizational integration, a separate building for Department 3 is currently being constructed on campus, and it will be called the Study Service Centre (SSC). The Centre’s philosophy will
be to provide service as a ‘one-stop shop’: Concerns will be clarified upon first contact, and counselees will be distributed purposefully to the appropriate contact people. This will save time for both the counselees and the advisors because the counselees will not have to determine themselves who the right person is to contact.

Considering this, the content-related conception of the online counselling portal should not only include the needs of the target group of professionally qualified prospective students but should also be undertaken in especially close cooperation with the Student Service Centre units because they should feel supported in their daily work by the portal. Thus, we conducted interviews with colleagues from different service units to gain insight into counselling and networking processes that we can integrate into the portal (chapter 5).

Indeed, for the conception of the portal it is also important and necessary to inquire the demands and needs of the prospective users. Yet, in this paper, we focus on the institutional view, i.e. the counselling providers.

The intended technical integration should tie in with the university's website for prospective students and students, the so-called ‘InfoPortal Studium’, which is administered and maintained by the Department 3. This website will be re-launched in the process of the establishment of the new Student Service Centre. Thus, the optimal integration of the Online Counselling Portal into that website can be considered from the beginning.

4. ONLINE COUNSELLING PORTAL FOR PROSPECTIVE STUDENTS WITH VOCATIONAL QUALIFICATIONS

4.1 EXPLORATORY SEMI-STRUCTURED INTERVIEWS

Parallel to the conceptual and technical development of the Online Counselling Portal, exploratory semi-structured interviews were conducted with advisors from central and decentralised university units. The sample consists of colleagues from the status group of administrative personnel as well as research assistants belonging to a faculty or a department. They all engage in advising situations with prospective students with vocational backgrounds in their daily work. The underlying intention was, in addition to the literature analysis, first, to collect topics for counselling that are relevant for prospective students with vocational qualifications. Second, it was of interest to gain insight regarding the extent to which the university's advising institutions could benefit from the implementation of an Online Counselling Portal for networking and information management. Furthermore, the interviews’ results should reveal the theoretical development and substantiation of the blended counselling approach and be integrated into the portal’s conception.

The following questions were of basic interest:

1) What role does the target group of vocational qualified counselees play in everyday counselling life?
2) What topics do prospective students and students with vocational backgrounds bring into counselling situations?
3) How does counselling for prospective students and students with vocational backgrounds take place?
4) How do counselling institutions at the University of Oldenburg network and cooperate?

5) From the counselling institutions’ point of view, does a need to act exist and, if so, in what regard?

Based on these questions and the results of the literature analysis, a guideline was developed that contained narrative-inducing questions respectively impulses for seven different thematic blocks and were adapted successively during the interview process. Six interviews were conducted from March to June 2013, with an average duration of 75 minutes. They were conducted personally, recorded and completely transliterated following the transliteration system of Hoffmann-Riem (1984).

The analysis of the collected data is oriented at the procedure as described by Meuser and Nagel (2003, 2005) for analysing expert interviews. This procedure was chosen because it is an interpretative, reconstructive method that requires an intensive examination of the material and a systematic reduction and aggregation into a set of categories. A central characteristic of this method is the guarantee of permanent recursivity (Meuser & Nagel, 2005, p.91). In addition, it can be handled flexibly according to the particular research design (ibid., 2005, p.80, p.91). Due to the effort to apply this approach while collecting and analysing the data, the category system is not restricted to the categories and topics of the interviews’ guiding questions; rather, it mirrors the relevant systems of the interviewees.

4.2 INTERVIEW RESULTS

The analysis of the collected interview data provides important clues concerning the Online Counselling Portal’s development.

4.2.1 WHAT ROLE DOES THE TARGET GROUP OF VOCATIONAL QUALIFIED COUNSELEES PLAY IN EVERYDAY COUNSELLING LIFE?

As a central category, the definition of the target group of persons with vocational backgrounds was extracted. The interviewees follow the definition of § 18 (university access) of the Niedersächsisches Hochschulgesetz (‘Lower Saxony Law on Higher Education’, our own translation) but emphasise that the group members differ with respect to their individual qualifications, personal aims, motives and current environment. In particular, those persons with admission qualifications via the so-called ‘3+3’-regulation are perceived as a new target group in counselling work.5

Thus, the advisors have to be prepared for the fact that the special group of professionally qualified persons have differing prior knowledge concerning information about admission qualifications, study fields and how to organise university life—they come with a wide range of questions to interviews. Furthermore, counselling interviews with the target group’s members often require a lot of time.

---

5 The ‘3+3’-regulation means that, since 2010, after three years of professional education with a subsequent three years of occupation in that area, a subject-related admission qualification is acquired.
Inextricably linked with that category is the second category – how do prospective students with vocational qualifications distinguish from “traditionals” – those who come to the university directly after getting the Abitur, the common academic German admission qualification after 12 or 13 years of school?

This demarcation lies primarily in the professional life and experiences of the professionally qualified persons, as well as in their specific goals, motivations and expectations. The interviewees agree that members of this group often have a completely different attitude towards studying than students coming directly from school. On the other hand, they often know less concretely which requirements have to be met when starting a course of study.

In conclusion, the target group of professionally qualified counselees is perceived as increasing in everyday counselling as a group that can be clearly distinguished from traditional students and with specific demands.

4.2.2 WHAT TOPICS DO PROSPECTIVE STUDENTS AND STUDENTS WITH VOCATIONAL BACKGROUNDS BRING INTO COUNSELLING SITUATIONS?

Vocational qualified persons have special information and counselling issues. These include 1) clarification of basic issues such as admission qualification, study fields, organisation, structure, part-time study, etc.; 2) accreditation possibilities of vocational training and further education, as well as non-formal or informal acquired competencies on the job and 3) necessary preparation and recommended courses.

Questions concerning the compatibility of family, university and working life are central and stressed by the counselees, as the interviewees reported. Connected with these questions is the financial challenge. Furthermore, the professionally qualified persons seem to worry about whether they can manage to find their way at university. The interviewees emphasise, in this context, the importance of preparation courses.

4.2.3 HOW DOES COUNSELLING FOR PROSPECTIVE STUDENTS AND STUDENTS WITH VOCATIONAL BACKGROUNDS TAKE PLACE?

The formats of counselling include face-to-face-interviews, telephone calls and information/counselling via email. It is obvious, as already mentioned, that the counselling process with vocational qualified persons often takes considerably more time compared to other interviews. This is due to the particular concerns' complexity and due to the fact that the requests often can be solved only individually.

All institutions offer consultation hours as well as scheduled meetings that are compatible with the counselees' needs and working hours, which means in the early morning, late afternoon or early evening. However, it is emphasised by the interviewees that many counselees use days off or vacation days for these appointments.

Regarding for the type of counselling requested, it becomes obvious that pure information requests concern mainly the clarification of issues, e.g. whether an admission qualification exists. For questions concerning common decisions for or against studying or the choice of subjects, counselees should be empowered to find solutions by themselves:
4.2.4 HOW DO COUNSELLING INSTITUTIONS AT THE UNIVERSITY OF OLDENBURG NETWORK AND COOPERATE?

All interviewees approved the idea of more standardised networking and the cooperation of all advising institutions at the university. Although the internal networking situation is experienced as satisfactory on a personal level, a need for action at the structural level is rated as useful. Information often has to be collected actively and independently; a more standardised process could facilitate the exchange and ensure that everybody gets the relevant information he/she needs.

The university website for prospective students and students, the “InfoPortal Studium”\(^6\), lies within the responsibility of the Central Advisory Service, which is considered very useful for information management because various news arrives there from all departments and institutions of the university.

An improvement will be that all counselling institutions will move into one building in 2014 — the Student Service Center (SSC) — so for counselees, the number of paths will drop. They would also benefit from a harmonisation of the consultation hours, which is under discussion.

A need for action is cited for the expansion of networking and information exchange with external counselling providers, and the factor of limited personnel is highly relevant:

4.2.5 FROM THE COUNSELLING INSTITUTIONS’ POINT OF VIEW, DOES A NEED TO ACT EXIST AND, IF SO, IN WHAT REGARD?

As critical obstacles for vocational qualified persons on their way to university, the limited chances to get a place were mentioned.

Furthermore, within the 10% quota set by the Lower Saxony Higher Education Law (NHG), which reduces the chances of getting a place, there is no such thing as a list for waiting time as it is in the common quota. And another problem is the point in time when the university seat is assigned or refused: It is a challenge of coordinating the job resignation process when it is unclear whether one has a university place or not. It is fraught with risk to resign, but if the acceptance happens only very shortly before the semester starts, it is not possible to resign in time. As a reasonable preparation offering for professionally qualified persons, the promotion of self-assessment possibilities is stated.

4.3 CONSEQUENCES FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE ONLINE COUNSELLING PORTAL

The interviews show clearly that professionally qualified persons who are interested in a course of study face considerable obstacles, such as the question of financing, compatibility with family and work-life duties and the chance to get a place at all. However, if it is commonly desired to invite professionally qualified persons to study, these obstacles must be reduced, starting at the political level. This goes hand in hand with the development with a so-called ‘culture of welcome’. The advising institutions at the university do network, but they seem to be extremely interested in an increasing standardisation of communication and information processes. This underlines the impact of the development of person-independent knowledge and a communication management system. Regarding the consequences of the

---

\(^6\) http://www.uni-oldenburg.de/studium [Retrieved 08.10.2013]
portal construction, it is important to provide not only opportunities to address the manifold issues but also a specific structure for guidance. Beyond this, it is necessary to connect it in terms of blended counselling to an optional counselling process. The portal is not meant to be just another website but is instead meant to open up paths, chances and possibilities—it should be part of a ‘culture of service and welcome’ that is also currently enhanced at the University of Oldenburg by the implementation of the SSC.

4.4 THE ONLINE COUNSELLING PORTAL

The conception and technical realisation of the beta version started in March 2013. The first tests and evaluation took place in July. The core elements of the portal are information and counselling modules. The results of a literature analysis as well as the results of the exploratory interviews determined the form and content. The modules can be worked through without prior knowledge; they can be combined, in the guided way or in a variable and individual order. The portal links to relevant contact persons at the university at any point in the process.

The portal’s opportunities can be used as preparation for a counselling appointment by assisting in concretising questions and information needs. As mentioned above, counselling interviews may be structured in a different way when certain aspects have already been clarified. Counselees are already activated and challenged to take individual responsibility for the ongoing process. In addition, during a counselling interview, modules can be flexibly integrated into the process.

Currently, four modules are available: 1) admission qualification, 2) decision making, 3) a competence check and 4) preparation courses. The portal’s structure allows for the extending of modules at any point.

Counselees can work through the modules independently or use a ‘guided tour’ that takes the user by the hand and leads her/him through the important steps on the ways to a course of study. Currently, the core element is the interactive ‘admission qualification’ module. The aim is to clarify whether users have an admission qualification and its extent. The ‘decision making’ module supports the process of deciding whether a course of study is the right choice and, if so, in which area. Counselling opportunities and special courses are presented (e.g. coaching for study decision making, trial studies, etc.). The ‘competence check’ module presents an overview of free online tests for study orientation (e.g. the Self-Assessment Tool of the Association of North German Universities) as well as for personal competence checks. The ‘study preparation’ module is aimed at prospective students and students in their first semesters. Nevertheless, it could also be used during a course of study if special skills are needed (e.g. academic writing). The core element of this module is the InOS Online Study preparation programme. It currently contains modules for academic research and writing, preparation for law school and mathematics, the latter especially for economists. These modules aim at preparing for a course of study and/or close existing knowledge gaps. It is possible to get credits for a following course of study. The acquired results after working through the modules can be printed as a PDF file or on paper for further counselling interviews.

7 http://www.inos.uni-oldenburg.de [Retrieved 08.10.2013]
It is planned to expand the portal during the upcoming winter semester with the ‘accreditation’ and ‘study organisation’ modules and with functionalities for an interactive communication portal, e.g. forums, chat with advisors and a first-semester blog from vocational qualified persons.

4.5 EVALUATION

In July 2013, the Online Counselling Portal was tested and evaluated. Professionally qualified students at the University of Oldenburg and other universities as well as prospective students who participated the InOS courses in the winter semester tested the beta version of the portal. The students were provided with access to the portal, asked to look around thoroughly and requested to fill out an online questionnaire afterwards that contained questions concerning the appraisal of the user interface, the conception with regard to contents, suggestions for further functions and development and an overall rating. In spite of the low rate of return (only 7.6%), which seems to have been mainly due to the restricted time, some conclusions can be drawn for further development.

The results show that the participants are overall contented with the user interface, including the graphics, menu, usability and visibility of links to advising institutions at the University of Oldenburg. Positive feedback was submitted concerning the design, the clear structure and the current relevance of the contributions. Suggestions for improvement concerned the optimisation of the guided tour and the possibility of returning to the starting point of each module. The results show that the choice of topics meets the demands and wishes of the target group. The participants rated it positively that the information can be found in one place in a good overview rather than spread among different sites, For further improvement, the integration of a frequently asked questions list, forums and the possibility of meeting an advisor for a chat were suggested. A regular newsletter was also favoured.

5. CONCLUSION AND FURTHER PERSPECTIVES

The theoretical approach of blended counselling as a combination of online and face-to-face units can be considered innovative and pointing towards how adequate target group counselling can be designed. A literature analysis showed that blended counselling is currently discussed mainly in psychosocial or therapeutic contexts. The application of this concept in counselling settings at universities faces structural challenges, e.g. that advising takes place at different levels, both central and decentralised. Different advisors may be responsible for different issues, and networking and cooperation are often not standardised but dependent on particular persons and their informal channels.

The Online Counselling Portal for vocational qualified persons is the first step in implementing the blended counselling approach. It presents relevant information in a structured and clear way, it can be used independent of time and place, it can support preparation for counselling interviews at the university or it can be integrated within the counselling process by an advisor. Advisors can use the portal to gain information, to prepare for interviews or to promote the counselling process.
The portal’s development is in its beginnings. At the moment we are working with a beta version. The first test and conversations with professionally qualified students revealed that the portal is perceived as helpful and reasonable. The next steps will lie in 1) optimisation following the results of the online questionnaire, 2) an expansion of the modules and functionalities in terms of a communication platform and 3) further research and theoretical advancement of the blended counselling approach. The qualitative interviews with advisors will proceed, and it is currently planned to initiate a ‘round table’ with all counselling providers and stakeholders at the university who are involved with the target group of professionally qualified students. Furthermore, in the course of the implementation of the Student Service Centre (SSC) and the restructuring of the associated website (‘InfoPortal Studium’), it is welcomed to integrate the Online Counselling Portal, and consideration has begun concerning the development of a communication and knowledge management system.

6. REFERENCES


KNOWLEDGE TRANSFER IN CAREER GUIDANCE - EMPIRICAL AND THEORETICAL RESEARCH FINDINGS

Enoch, Clinton
Leibniz Universität Hannover
Germany

ABSTRACT

This contribution tries to develop a theory of lifelong career guidance and counseling which is based on discussions arising from educational science, especially concerning the debate on educational counseling. Special regard is given to aspects of knowledge transfer in career guidance which implies an educational research approach. Empirical data is presented reflecting guidance and counseling as a setting of fundamental interactional transformation with high impact on the life-courses of the clients.

1. INTRODUCTION

In this contribution I will try to develop a theory of lifelong career guidance and counseling\(^1\) which is based on discussions arising from educational science, especially concerning the debate on educational counseling. Guidance and counseling have not become an own academic discipline yet - at least not in Germany. The boundaries of theories concerned with career guidance to psychology, sociology and of course to practical “approaches” of counseling remain strong. I think there is a big chance of creating a theory of career guidance and counseling which uses a critical research perspective and benefits from the view of lifelong learning which has been established in the European Union (Ertelt/Kraatz 2011). The key issue of a theory of lifelong career guidance and counseling is based on a different conception of knowledge transfer which refers to an educational theoretical approach as outlined later on in this text.

In the recent years two developments concerning the EU-politics have to be observed very closely. On the one hand educational politics have become more influential and give a common framework for the developing of structures of each member state - EU-politics have created a common transnational framework of common understanding and interpretation. This unification process can, for example, be analyzed in terms of an educational policy research, governance-approaches or neo-institutional research approaches. In any case we can state a top-down process with an overwhelming impact on ways of how states and institutions should be organized, and at last how individuals should conceptualize their lives. Besides this partially analysis in sense of power issues on the other hand the educational EU policy has created a very useful framework to create a more reflected understanding of career guidance and counseling connected to learning processes over the life course. In this second sense career guidance and counseling is being placed as an interface settled between different sections of the individual career. So at a second glance the EU soft law approach (Grotlüschen/Haberzeth/Krug 2009, 351) has created a theoretical framework to understand and compare different issues of education in the EU sphere. Of course the

\(^1\) Both terms are used in similar meaning.
overwhelming influences of the EU onto the institutions of learning are seen critically in terms of an anti-capitalistic critic of economical paradigms. Indeed career guidance has become more and more an agency of streamlining individual careers in sense of the needs of transnational enterprises and due to economic challenges. But moreover career guidance and counseling often cannot correspond to these external references and is characterized by contra-intentional effects which do not match to socio-political and economic intentions. Career guidance and counseling cannot just act as an agency of distribution without losing its identity which is strongly connected to principles of humanistic psychology. Career guidance and counseling has ethical standards which refer strictly to the needs of the client and can therefore strengthen different career opportunities which not necessarily have to refer to socio-political and economic target aims.

These starting statements stress the fact that career guidance and counseling can to be perceived at two different levels with mutual reference: (a) A level of concept and in the new EU sense of an agency model referring to external target aims. (b) A level of empirical reality of different contexts of career guidance and counseling which need to be analyzed more closely. Since I have already pointed out briefly the impact of EU politics on career guidance I want to focus in the following sections the educational discussion of career guidance which lead to the establishment of a theory of lifelong career guidance and counseling. One major milestone of a theory of lifelong career guidance and counseling is grounded in empirical approaches which differ strongly from psychological analysis. Career guidance is not just conceptualized and settled between therapy and informational interaction. Moreover an educational perception of career guidance focusses on the main aspects of the individual life course of the client, of aspects of transformative and fundamental learning as well as to the aspect of emotional development. In this sense I will present in chapter 3 empirical and theoretical findings concerning knowledge transfer being an essential part of an educationally reflected analysis of career guidance.

2. THE DEBATE ON “EDUCATIONAL COUNSELING”

Educational theory has always had a big impact on the development of career guidance and counseling, but of course there have been many different influences from other disciplines as psychology or sociology. The debate on “educational counseling” which started in the 1960’s in Germany and continues until now is a distillation of many important stages of the discussion of the conception. Although I will refer to the debate evolving in Germany I think there is something very general about the discussion which leads to a new understanding of career guidance and counseling. The main key objective of the discussion on “educational counseling” affects the terms “learning” and “counseling” and moreover the complex relationship of these two general concepts in educational theory. I will stress two steps of the development of the discussion. I will then conclude knowledge transfer to be at the heart of an integrated theory of lifelong career guidance.

2.1 EDUCATIONAL COUNSELING AS A CONCEPT AND AS AN EMPIRICAL REALITY

In 1965 Mollenhauer wrote an essay on the educational phenomena of counseling which still offers the key questions which remain important to the present day (Mollenhauer 1965). He asked implicitly: Can we find counseling as a coherent set of social action in different
educational fields? And furthermore: What is the difference between contexts of “learning” and contexts of “counseling” when both actions are interconnected very closely? These questions cannot be answered in a simple way. Mollenhauer wants to identify common core elements of career guidance which can be perceived to distinguish between different settings of career guidance but also distinguish between contexts of “learning” and “counseling”. He discovers two levels of “educational counseling” which frame the debate: first a level of concept based on a rather unclear humanistic approach with reference to Rogers’ client-centered and non-directive concepts of counseling, and second a level of empirical reality with different styles of interaction which differ taking into account factors of context, methods and target groups. Likely these two levels are connected with mutual reference.

Concerning the level of concept he reflects on the modern image of counseling and comes to the conclusion that guidance and counseling are perceived in the educational sector as a more liberal understanding of teaching and educating. For many educators the social action of “teaching” has shifted towards the concept of counseling and guidance and for this reason both terms tend to appear as nearly similar concepts. The boom of educational counseling even refers to counseling being the opposite of education (Erziehung). This modern impetus seems to be very important for Mollenhauer, because in his sense counseling is a more democratic practice where clients are able to reflect themselves, their needs, wishes and problems.

In his approach Mollenhauer keeps up the theoretical distinction between “Learning” and “Counseling” to remain on both levels (concept and empirical approach). With reference to the life course model educational counseling is for him characterized by serious emotional situations which do not belong to everyday life. Career guidance and counseling in this sense is not a learning activity with endurance, it’s more a turning point of recognition and decision making. For Mollenhauer educational counseling is therefore situated in an educational field or refers to educational contexts or themes, but is itself not an educational situation. It’s a highlighted unusual situation for the client and meets the special needs of the client at a crucial point in her or his life course. The emotional dynamic of the situation is strongly connected to this unique and special situation, and it therefore cannot take place being a common part of everyday life. Conditions of teaching and learning in contrast tend to be implemented in everyday life and are characterized by less emotional conflict or difficulties. The emotional value of career guidance and counseling is created by an exclusive problematic setting for the client accompanied by emotions as fussiness, nervousness or ambiguity.

Furthermore Mollenhauer observes contexts of counseling in the educational field without an empirical evidence of the activity of counseling as described above. Some contexts which stick to the label of counseling as e.g. “Erziehungsberatung” better fit to the terms case-work and therapy. And some contexts use the label teaching and learning activities but fit very appropriate to the concept of counseling. Guidance and counseling as a label stresses the circumstance, that it can combine very different social actions that may even be paradox. The label and the concept are yet two merged factors of perception which are closely linked to one another. Both aspects are being used to define counseling in a common sense.

The essay of Mollenhauer points out these very important theoretical questions which still are being discussed until the present day. These two main levels of “educational counseling”, the level of concept (and label) and empirical reality are related to one another. For empirical
research using an educational perspective of theory it’s necessary to distinguish between them - this could lead to a more appropriate theory of lifelong career guidance and counseling.

2.2 EDUCATIONAL COUNSELING AS A FRAMEWORK OR A COLLECTION OF FACTORS

In recent discussions on “educational counseling” mostly a framework or collection is presented to combine the different concepts and labels, but not an integrated model or theory (e.g. Krause/Fittkau/Fuhr/Thiel 2003). “Educational counseling” is than being conceptualized with various interpretations. A main aspect refers to learning activities in situations of guidance and counseling. In contrast to Mollenhauer educational counseling can then be defined as a counseling situation where learning activities of the client occur. Furthermore educational counseling exists of the reflection of former learning activities of the client (De Cuvry/Kossack/Zeuner 2009; Kemper/Klein 1998). The reflection of learning activities can deal with biographical issues of the individual development of the client or deal with actual problems of the clients learning activities in trainings. Furthermore “educational counseling” refers to related contexts of counseling to the educational field but without drawing a distinction between self-labeling and external theoretical perception. The recent discussions of “educational counseling” as a framework or a collection have a broader view on counseling, but do not build a coherent model or theory which research could benefit from.

3. KNOWLEDGE TRANSFER IN CAREER GUIDANCE

In contrast to the recent discussion on “educational counseling” I would like to suggest a model or a theory of lifelong career guidance and counseling which is based on the works of Gieseke/Opelt (2004). The authors do not use or discuss “educational counseling” in particular, they rather develop some very helpful elements which together can be used to create a meta-theory for guidance and counseling – especially for empirical research. Gieseke and Opelt have created a theoretical typology based on empirical research of counseling processes. The approach was developed especially for adult education but the model fits also to other processes of counseling and has a general notion. They distinguish between three different types which are connected to three different patterns of interaction: informative, situative and biographical counseling. These types refer to the complex reality of counseling and reveal counseling being a non-standardized though professional type of interaction. These three types rely on the perception of different social actions which refer to different needs of the client.

“Informative counseling” at a first level is a very important aspect of counseling because clients seek information; mostly concerning job-related aspects this fact is underestimated (Enoch 2011). I will discuss this type and make ongoing remarks in chapter 3. “Situative counseling” points out a pattern of interaction defined by openness and vagueness. In this pattern the counselor and the client are able to discuss new ideas and create new ways of open questions; or solving the client’s problems if possible. The third type (“biographical counseling”) refers to an interaction process examining the biography of the client. Although biographical counseling is close to the setting of therapy, it differs concerning the aspects of learning and education.
In contrast to the discussion on “educational counseling” discussed above the counseling process in the model of Gieseke and Opelt refers strongly to learning and education, but is not defined itself - in accordance to Mollenhauers definition - as context of teaching and learning. And furthermore the context is related to building up new knowledge for the client. Career guidance and counseling is at its heart an open situation of reflection concerning lifelong learning aspects.

The shift of educational concepts towards lifelong learning and lifelong guidance implemented by the EU and other supranational organizations have an great impact on underlying societal norms and imply new concepts of career and counseling which differ strongly from classical concepts such as behavior therapy, client-centered counseling or systemic consulting etc. Recently increasing attention has been given to debates on knowledge societies and knowledge management in the field of educational science of adult education. In present discussions many concepts of knowledge are based on constructivism and system theory with a notion to distinguish between content and competence. In contrast to the constructionist’ view my own approach (Enoch, 2011) is based on a concept of knowledge which can be used to identify different narrative and discursive practices in career guidance and counseling. Knowledge in my approach contributes to the sociology of knowledge (e.g. according to approaches of Goffman and Grafinkel) and lies emphasize on interactional change of subjective world-views. Each context of interaction produces knowledge and emotions which are interlinked with one another. In my opinion every social context - no matter if it’s institutional or everyday interaction - deals with an emotionally embedded transfer of knowledge. For this reason all situations of career guidance and counseling refer to knowledge transfer and not only information based styles of interaction.

In concrete I have used in my analysis (Enoch, 2011) the method of qualitative conversational analysis to establish an interpretive account on the interactional process occurring in different case studies. The research results of the interaction analysis of the overall process of change in different cases can be described in terms of four broad dimensions or modi: “counseling”, “drift”, “flow”, “control”. The study identifies different problematical discursive practices which illustrate institutional boundaries of career guidance and counseling. The empirical research outcomes have an impact on the theoretical approach of the main terms of “knowledge” and “intervention” in educational theory.

Fig. 1: model of interactional patterns in career guidance and counseling

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A) &quot;counseling&quot;</th>
<th>C) &quot;drift&quot;</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B) &quot;flow&quot;</td>
<td>D) &quot;control&quot;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The four modi in brief:

A) The modi “counseling”
The interactional pattern “counseling” outlines the main understanding of career guidance, the gold standard in the genuine sense of the term. In the analysis this interaction style refers to humanistic values in the sense of Carl Rogers (with reference to empathy, a warm emotional setting and congruent behavior). The interaction is characterized by a high amount of reflection. Normally the speech of the case story is outlined by the client at the beginning. There is less new knowledge within the meaning of “input” provided by the counselor. This interactional pattern seems to be a starting point of transformation of the clients story and world view. This pattern is an ideal of counseling interaction and often takes place at the beginning or the closing.

B) The modi “flow”
In this second pattern of interaction humanistic values in the sense of Carl Rogers remain. The ideal of interaction can be defined as an „information-balance” (Engel/Nestmann/Siekendiek 2007). A high amount of input is provided by the counselor though the atmosphere is marked by understanding and an emotional situation of openness and mutual confidence. Although the interactional pattern is characterized by a high density of “information”, there is little reflection in the conventional way of understanding and long passages of monologs (especially by the counselor). This kind of interaction is mostly settled in passages in the middle of the counseling process. Although this modi is no ideal of interaction it’s a quite common performance and highly accepted because of the smoothness of interaction without conflict.

C) The modi “drift”
In comparison the modi “counseling” and “flow” the modi “drift” is characterized by a blocking situation and disturbance. No humanistic values in the sense of Carl Rogers can be perceived. Rather the interaction takes place in an unbalanced emotional manner which leads to misunderstanding and conflict. There’s little reflection but also no passages of monolog. Since there is a low amount of input this interaction patterns are short and are settled at turning points of the interaction, mostly in the middle or the end of the counseling process. The interactants have no real „control” of the situation while the interaction seems to drift until communication shifts to another modi. Often the counselor failed to perform the way he or she wanted to and reacts with a latent aggressive behavior. In the sense of conversational analysis the interaction exists of missing dialog slots to be able to act differently.

D) The modi “control”
As the modi „drift”, the modi “control” cannot be characterized by the classical humanistic values. Instead the situation is very unbalanced; there’s little reflection and long passages of monolog. The high amount of new input leads to an information-overload. The long passages are settled in the middle or end of the counseling process. This interaction style is not accepted because of conflict and negative irritation of the client. Anyhow this pattern seems to occur quite often - especially when the counselor wants perform and stress his or her competence. In this interaction pattern very often the client doesn’t respond to the counselors attempt although he or she has high control of the situation.
These four interactional patterns draw an empirical and realistic picture of career guidance and counseling in the public sector using an example taken from the public career guidance services in Germany. The general interpretation of the interaction styles though shouldn’t lead to a pessimistic view on career guidance. Moreover knowledge transfer seems to be an underlying dimension in the sense of conflict, confrontation as well as understanding and confidence.

A theory of lifelong career guidance which is based on a more empirical reflection of the interaction process has to stress the fact that adult learning in the process of counseling has to be conceptualized in a fundamental way of transformation. In this sense the EU-Definition of career guidance fits very well because it refers to lifelong learning as the heart of guidance and counseling: “The term [career guidance] was defined as referring to services intended to assist individuals, of any age and at any point throughout their lives, to make educational, training and occupational choices and to manage their careers. (…) (Watts & Sultana 2004: 107).

REFERENCES


This paper reports on a four year Australian Research Council funded Linkage Project titled Skilling Indigenous Queensland, conducted in regional areas of Queensland, Australia from 2009 to 2013. The project sought to investigate Vocational Education and Training (VET) and teaching, Indigenous learners’ needs, employer culture and expectations and community culture and expectations to identify best practice in numeracy teaching for Indigenous VET learners. Specifically it focused on ways to enhance the teaching and learning of courses and the associated mathematics in such courses to benefit learners and increase their future opportunities of employment. To date thirty-nine teachers/trainers/teacher aides and two hundred and thirty-one students consented to participate in the project. Nine VET courses offered in schools and Technical and Further Education Institutes (TAFE) were nominated to be the focus on the study. This paper focuses on student questionnaire responses and interview responses from teachers/trainers one high school principal and five students as a result of these processes, the findings indicated that VET course teachers work hard to adopt contextualising strategies to their teaching; however this process is not always straightforward because of the perceptions of how mathematics has been taught and learned by trainers and teachers. Further teachers, trainers and students have high expectations of one another with the view to successful outcomes from the courses.

In recent years a considerable amount of funding has been allocated to increasing Indigenous1 Peoples’ participation in education and employment. This increased funding is

1 Indigenous refers to the Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander peoples of Australia. Even though Indigenous is a homogenising term, that is, one people one culture, the meaning of the word in the context of this paper is the opposite. We recognise and respect that Indigenous people of Australia consists of many First Nations each with their own unique culture and histories (Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Social Justice Commissioner, 2008).
predicated on the assumption that it will make a difference and contribute to closing the education gap between Indigenous and non-Indigenous Australians (Department of Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs, 2010). The central tenet is that access to education for Indigenous People will create substantial social and economic benefits for regional and remote Indigenous People. The project’s aim is to address some of the issues associated with this gap with a view to improving young Indigenous people’s educational and life expectations and outcomes in order for them to experience success in education, daily life and employment thus contributing to society in ways that are enriching and meaningful.

Vocational education and training [VET] and Technical and Further Education [TAFE] Institutes across Australia play a major role in the provision of labour by responding to industry demands that are oriented towards an industrial training model, as well as addressing the barriers faced by disadvantaged groups such as Indigenous young people. As public providers, TAFE Institutes are required to respond to the needs of people disengaged from education and training, such as early school leavers and those who are unemployed and unskilled (Thomson & Hillman, 2010; Volkoff, Clarke, & Walstab, 2009). The challenges that these Institutes face in responding to such needs include trying to support Indigenous students who have experienced multiple and cumulative disadvantages through belonging to a number of disadvantaged groups such as low socio-economic groupings. Their needs are complex and therefore are not always met through broad client-based programs.

In some regional communities, a more localised community approach is adopted to better suit the diversity of learners; however, delivery is largely influenced by decisions made by Institutes about provisions within their regional context and the context of broader national and state/territory policies and targets (Volkoff, Clarke & Walstab, 2009). But as Institutes are faced with increasing demands to provide further educational and non-educational responses to such barriers, expanding consultation with communities and schools is necessary to address the increasing and more challenging needs of Indigenous learners (Bradley, Noonan, Nugent & Scales, 2008). This paper investigates the pedagogical strategies adopted by trainers and teachers who are expected to deliver broad based certificate courses who have found they are having to teach mathematics to support Indigenous students enrolled in such courses and who have high expectations about what they want to achieve. A discussion of the background to the project follows.

BACKGROUND TO THE PROJECT

In 2009, members of the YuMi Deadly Centre at the Queensland University of Technology commenced an Australian Research Council Linkage project that focused on ways to enhance the teaching and learning of mathematics in trades and certificate courses to Indigenous students in Year 11 and 12 of high school as well as students enrolled in TAFE courses. Preliminary discussions and consultations were held with key educationalists and community members in seven rural and remote centres about how to improve the outcomes for students enrolled in Certificate Courses and at the same time, address the teaching and learning of mathematics required for such courses. At the core of the discussions were questions about how courses were taught, student performance in courses and mathematics and how to support them with working towards successful completions. Through a process of collaborative consultation, agreement was reached that each of the seven sites could nominate two courses that would be the focus of the four year project. The courses included:
Metallurgy, Civil Construction, Indigenous Housing Repair and Maintenance, Children’s Services Certificate, Retail, Horticulture, and the Remote Area Teacher Education Program [RATEP]. The focal point of each of the nominated courses was the consideration of how to enhance the ways that Certificate Course teachers teach mathematics that is situated within the courses themselves. The project team advocate that productive activity in certificate courses and mathematical understanding are not always separate or in some instances are not separable, but dialectically related (see for example, Lave & Wenger, 1991 on situated learning). The next section discusses the focus of this paper, the influence of pedagogy and expectations on student achievement in certificate courses.

A REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE

The research literature reinforced the relationship between teacher, student and parental expectations as a means to improve student achievement (Alloway & Dalley-Trim, 2009; Sarra, 2012; Stein & Hussong, 2007). Such a relationship is critical if each of the above groups want better outcomes. Everyone has to invest into the challenges confronting students, including the students themselves (Sarra, 2012). Building strong relationships and having high expectations are vital. Related literature strongly supports this claim.

EXPECTATIONS: TEACHERS, STUDENTS, FAMILY

Student achievement is closely associated with teacher expectations of groups of students (Bol & Berry, 2005; Chilla, Waff, & Cook, 2007; Rubie-Davies, Hattie, & Hamilton, 2006; Thompson, 2004). A study of the reading performance of Maori, Pacific Island, Asian and New Zealand European students found that teachers did have expectations in reading for Maori students; however they were lower than their expectations for other ethnic groups despite the fact that Maori student performance at the start of the year was not lesser than the other ethnic groups. African-American high school students’ perceptions of their teacher’s expectations indicated that the majority of the students believed that their ethnicity was why their teachers did not have high expectations of them (Pringle, Lyons, & Booker, 2010). Differences in teachers’ expectations of particular groups of students were found to widen the gap between those students who can perform well academically and those who cannot (Bol & Berry, 2005). The consequence for low achieving students is that the emphasis is placed on teaching and testing basic, low-level skills (Lubienski, 2002). Consequently, when particular groups of students do demonstrate that they are capable of achieving, they are confronted with the low expectations of the teacher, thus constraining their educational opportunities in that subject. Here, success or failure in learning may be contingent on several related factors such as the differences in relations of power, the practices of the classroom context, teacher evaluations and expectations of students’ potential for learning (see for example, Berry, 2005; Lubienski, 2002; Sarra, 2012). Therefore, questions about who is learning what, and how much is learned (or how little), are in some degree questions about the relations of power and expectations implicated in the learning context. High teacher expectations are often translated into effective teacher pedagogy which in turn empowers students to attain these expectations (Jamar & Pitts, 2005).

A study that investigated the social and academic expectations for at-risk Year 8 rural high school students in Australia identified that students who had a positive perception of
education had higher expectations of themselves as opposed to those who did not (Stein & Hussong, 2007). The students with high expectations had more fulfilling school experiences compared to those students with low expectations and who were more likely to encounter barriers to schooling. Alloway and Dalley-Trim’s (2009) study of the influences and obstacles of student aspirations and expectations found they were two-dimensional, that is, personal and social, and were interconnected. For example, finances (the expense of attending university), apprehension and fear (moving to a large city), and attachment to home (the emotional ties and support of family and friends) were found to influence their personal lives and social lives and created obstacles and barriers to future opportunities for education, training and employment.

Parental expectations during the early years of a child’s schooling has long lasting effects over the course of the child’s school years (Marzano, 2010) thus influencing student self-expectations, engagement, and improve academic, behavioural and relationship outcomes (Chen & Gregory, 2009; Rimkute, Hirvonen, Tolvanen, Aunola, & Nurmi, 2012; Yamamoto & Holloway, 2010; Zhang, Haddad, Torres, & Chen, 2011). Family systems have a vital role with building and sustaining young peoples’ educational expectations (Rimkute, et al., 2012). They are mutually influenced by each other, and vary across each racial/ethnic group (Yamamoto & Holloway, 2010; Zhang, et al., 2011). That given, it is now appropriate to discuss the literature underpinning a model of pedagogy Reality, Abstraction, Mathematics and Reflection (RAMR) that is being trialled in the project with the view to addressing issues around pedagogies as they emerge through the delivery of VET certificate courses.

**EMANCIPATORY PEDAGOGY FOR VET CERTIFICATE COURSES**

What is central to the project are concerns for equity and social justice in education and the recognition of the structured nature of inequality in contemporary societies, its consequences in unequal access to valued resources such as power and knowledge, and the ways and means by which this situation can be changed. In response, in various ways, the project seeks to construct expanding emancipatory possibilities for students, teachers and trainers. From this insight, an alternative and more effective pedagogy informed by social constructivism was trialled in various learning contexts in the project.

Briefly, social constructivism builds on the constructivist position and rests on the premise that what students can do with assistance is more indicative of their cognitive development than what they can do alone (Brown, Metz & Campione, 1996; Marti, 1996). Moreover, the focus is on the interplay between language and thought (Sierpinska, 1998) and cognitive development and culture (Lave & Wenger, 1991; Saxe, 1991). Researchers who claim that priority should be given to social and cultural processes (Engestrom, 1996; Levine, 1996; Minick, 1996; Voigt, 1994) draw mainly from Vygotsky’s (1930) contention that social interaction and culture are constitutive of an individual’s cognitive development. Extending the constructivist view, Vygotsky observed that a student’s abilities are strengthened through quality social interaction between the students and the teachers or trainers. In the learning context, the teacher supports students at the cutting edge of their competencies and adjusts the amount of scaffold (Bruner, 1985) or support, to take account of the new learnings of the student. Vygotsky (1930) refers to this as a student’s “zone of proximal development” (p. 137), that is, the difference between a child’s actual development and potential development.
at that point in time. The actual extent of this zone is determined through problem-solving and collaboration with the teacher or more capable adult.

The research by Minick (1996) suggests that there is much to learn from exploring the connections between social practice and cognition through the face-to-face encounters of teachers and students in the classroom. One way of doing this is to explore the influences of curriculum and teaching materials on teachers and learners. Similarly, the study by Voigt (1994) found that negotiation of meanings is a necessary condition for mathematics learning. He pointed out that this was the case when “students’ understandings differed from the understanding the teacher wants the students to gain” (p. 215). Such differences are seen to be crucial to negotiations of meanings in the classroom. Hence communication between students and teachers and individual expertise should be supported in learning contexts such as certificate courses.

Informed by social construction, the YuMi Deadly Centre designed, trialled and implemented a pedagogic cycle of reality, abstraction, mathematics and reflection (RAMR) with the intention of supporting teachers and trainers with the teaching of mathematics, and then, the learning of their students (Ewing, Cooper, Baturo, Matthews & Sun, 2010; Matthews, 2008). Reality refers to factors such as the material setting, the teachers and students present and what they know and believe, the language that is used, the social relationships of the people involved and their identities, as well as historical, cultural and institutional factors (Ewing, 2009). It also includes the observations of mathematics taken from a teacher’s and or student’s perceived reality. In this sense, the focus is on how teachers and students produce their realities of mathematics in everyday life, as well as what the activities of everyday life are. It is a process of co-construction. The teacher and students contribute to the construction of a particular shared reality in the learning context. Thus, for teachers to understand a learner’s ideas, they need to orient themselves with respect to those ideas and the context within which they arise. From the perceived reality, the teacher supports the student to create abstract representations of it using the hands-body-mind—multisensory experiences, materials, language and symbols.

The process of abstraction emerges from the student’s reality, and in doing so, enables them to represent the identified reality using their hands, body and mind, materials, symbols and language in a range of ways to create meaning. Here abstraction refers to some kind of lasting change, that is, the result of abstracting enables the learner to recognise new experiences as having the similarities of an already formed experience (White & Mitchelmore, 2002). In this learning process, they are creating meaning. That is, abstraction and learning becomes a social matter in which experience and its interpretation inform each other. Through this process, negotiation of meaning becomes a necessary condition for mathematics learning (Voigt, 1994). When students’ interpretations differ from the teacher’s, negotiating meaning is crucial. As students negotiate, reflect and communicate in that context and articulate their thinking socially, their developing conceptual understandings are increasingly reified, that is, they take a reality of their own because they are made more explicit within the context. Through this ongoing interplay of participation, reflection and reification, learners give shape to their experiences and meaning for mathematics learning (Goos, 2004).

In this dialogic framing, abstraction, meaning and understanding are intrinsically relational. These experiences and the knowledge formulated from them serve as a basis for further
construction and negotiation of meaning, here, mathematical meaning because they have been abstracted from students’ perceived realities. However, the applications of mathematics from perceive realities and the reflection on that process, is not free from cultural bias and may result in struggles for teachers and students.

The discussion of the literature has highlighted several important aspects pertaining to expectations and their influence on student achievement. It has also elaborated the pedagogy informing the project. To this end, the interrelationship between, expectations, achievement and pedagogy is significant because each is influenced by the other. In classrooms where high expectations and effective pedagogical approaches are identified increases in student engagement, sustained participation and achievement can be found. The next section describes the methodology adopted for the project.

METHODOLOGY

The project adopted a mixed methods design aimed at benefiting research participants and included: participatory collaborative action research (Kemmis & McTaggart, 1988) and, community research (Smith, 1999). Participatory collaborative action research refers to is a “collective, self-reflective enquiry undertaken by participants in social situations in order to improve the rationality and justice of their own social and educational practices” (Kemmis et al., 1988, p. 5). Community research is described as an approach that “conveys a much more intimate, human and self-defined space” (p. 127). Community research relies on and validates the community’s own definitions. As the project is informed by the social at a community level, it is described as “community action research or emancipatory research” (Smith, 1999, p. 127). A series of collaborative action research case studies to improve numeracy teaching of Indigenous VET students was developed (Kemmis & McTaggart, 2000). The cases focused on the interaction between teachers’/trainers’ teaching approaches and Indigenous VET students’ numeracy learning. The approach emerging from the data was compared with those traditionally undertaken with Indigenous VET students.

PARTICIPANTS

This paper focuses on questionnaire responses from eleven students and semi-structured interview responses from four teachers/trainers, one principal and five students. Pseudonyms have been used to protect the identity of participants and specific sites.

DATA COLLECTION TECHNIQUES

Questionnaire surveys allow for the collection of demographic data and written responses to questions related to maths learning to develop a preliminary understanding of how they perceived maths, where they learnt it and who they asked for help. The survey was administered to new students in 2012. The semi-structured interviews allowed for deeper understandings related to expectations and pedagogy.
ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION

The survey asked student participants about a range of aspects including number of years studying course, grade finishing school, aims, and views about learning mathematics. The 2012 results are diverse and show a range of elements. For example, of the students who completed the questionnaire ten were males, and one was female. A number of the completed questionnaires emerged from the Certificate 11 in Civil Construction which has a high enrolment of males and as a consequence influenced the data in this instance (one female was enrolled in the course). A presupposition here could be that this course appeals predominately to males instead of females. An implication for this is that females may not identify themselves as working in the civil construction industry, although one female was enrolled in the course.

Students were asked about why they enrolled in the course they were studying. The purpose of this question was to identify if students knew why they had enrolled. Figure 1 provides this information. Of the participants who responded over half indicated that it was to "get a job". Although 55% indicated this reason, it indicates the traditional marker of a successful transition - getting a good job and becoming a responsible citizen (Circelli & Oliver, 2012). However, the success of a young person is determined on a range of factors (Circelli et al., 2012). Of the remaining students, skills and certification were identified along with "something different".

Figure 1. Student enrolments in course

![Enrolment in course](image)
Students were asked to rate mathematics as easy or hard on a likert scale (1 being hard and 5 being easy). Figure 2 shows a range of responses, suggesting it is somewhat easy/hard. Of interest was that none of the students indicated maths was easy.

The questionnaire asked participants to indicate where they learnt most of the maths they currently know. Figure 3 indicates the results of this question. Of the participants asked there were 12 responses (one student indicated 2 responses – school and on the job). Six of the responses indicated “on the job” with five indicating at “school”. Of interest is that one response indicated “everywhere”. A presupposition here is that the students see maths as something that is not simply isolated to school or on the job and that it is learned in many facets of life.
The purpose of asking students who they ask for help was to identify if students saw their teacher as the only avenue to provide assistance or whether it could come from other sources, such as family and or friends. Figure 4 indicates a range of responses (n=14) (some students indicated more than one person). Fifty percent indicated the TAFE teacher and fourteen percent indicated school teacher. Of interest here is that the responses suggest that students are more likely to seek help with mathematics within a TAFE or school environment and less likely to go beyond school. Notable is that indicated anyone, indicated google or a calculator and 14% indicate “not applicable”. The next section discusses the interview transcripts.

**SEMI-STRUCTURED INTERVIEWS**

Semi-structured interviews were deemed as an appropriate data collection technique because it provided participants with the opportunity to talk about their expectations. The interviews were conducted at four sites in 2012. One principal, four teachers/trainers and five students took part in the interviews. Ethical consent was given by all interview participants. The interview data was then transcribed and managed using NVivo, a software program designed to easily access the data and allow for the identification of text for analysis, thus, discounting text that received minimal attention.

**The transcripts overall**

A word frequency analysis was conducted for all of the interview transcripts. This method of analysis allows for understandings of the most frequently used words that occur in the interviews. It also allows for generalisations or themes to emerge from the data and, the identification of the most frequently used words and concepts. Overall the interview data indicates a range of elements associated with the leadership, teaching and learning of Certificate Courses for students. This aspect can be seen in the tag cloud in Figure 6.
Cluster analysis is a technique that allows for the visualisation of patterns in the data. It also allows items with strong similarity to be connected by linkage lines. The thickness of the linkage lines works to identify the strength of the linkages. If items have thick linkage lines there is a strong connection between the items. Conversely, if there are no linkages, they are identified as not having any links. Thin linkage lines indicate a link that is neither strong nor weak. The tag cloud in figure 5 indicates the strength of the linkages using a range of font sizes. The larger the font, the stronger the key items.

**Figure 5. Key words – interviews overall**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>apprenticeships</th>
<th>branding</th>
<th>brisbane</th>
<th>business</th>
<th>classroom</th>
<th>classrooms</th>
<th>community</th>
<th>competent</th>
<th>curriculum</th>
<th>different</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>difficult</td>
<td>discussion</td>
<td>happening</td>
<td>interested</td>
<td>straight</td>
<td>struggle</td>
<td>teachers</td>
<td>teaching</td>
<td>thinking</td>
<td>whatever</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Evident in this tag cloud are the size of the words community and teachers. A presupposition here is that community and teachers form the basis of the interviews overall suggesting that they are of significance. The cluster graph in figure 6 shows several strong linkages and clusters.

**Figure 6. Cluster linkages**
For example, the clusters associated with classrooms and community are very strong thus indicating a strong association with several other items on the graph. What is worth noting is that there is not a linkage line directly between classrooms and community. Rather, the linkage is classrooms, teachers and community. This is also the case for other linkages such as classrooms, community and apprenticeships; and community, curriculum and classrooms. Of interest is the limited association with discussion and interest.

Figure 7. Fine grained linkages

Narrowing the cluster analysis, keeping only the strongest links indicate one key cluster - community. In figure 7 previously, the cluster associated with community is particularly strong with interesting links to branding, apprenticeship, thinking, teachers, difficult and curriculum. The next section discusses the student transcripts.

The students' transcripts
A similar analysis was conducted using the students' transcripts. There were a number of positive aspects in the transcripts. Using tag clouds (figure 8) the larger words indicate a strong focus on understanding through the learning process. A presupposition here may be that understanding is critical for students who are keen to gain employment after they have finished their course.
In the cluster graph (figure 9), the tag cloud words from figure 8 are linked with other elements. For example, there are 3 key linkages shown in the graph: 1) understanding, communicate and experience, 2) teachers and explains and, 3) learning and different.

These linkages are significant given the focus of the project. For example, the investigation of the pedagogy used by teachers has revealed the connection between understanding, communication and experience and how they are interwoven with the teaching and learning process that takes place in learning environments such as workshops and classrooms. A presupposition here is that the learning and collaboration is situated in learning environments (Matusov, 1999). Within such an ideal context all participants play an active role, with no particular person having all the responsibility, while the integration of students’ contributions affords opportunities for negotiating meaning with other learners and teachers (Matusov, 1999). Through these experiences, students and teachers develop relationships that are supportive of learning, much like that of a community of inquiry and practice (Matusov, 1999). The identity of a learner is constructed through the expectations and pedagogy used by teachers. These practices include the teacher providing the support necessary to encourage engagement and the shaping of an identity of participation in that community. Where there are high expectations, and effective interaction between students and teachers, the students...
are more likely to identify themselves as construction and mathematics learners participating and negotiating mathematical meaning with other students and their teachers.

The following excerpts from three student transcripts indicate the importance of understanding, communication, learning and the role of the teacher. In doing so, the students commented on their confidence, the communication between the teacher and themselves, learning in a group and that there were places they could go to access further information about what they were learning as Artie explains:

... I’d like to gain a bit of confidence for the future, skills, um it's not the last for me anyway because I’m planning on doing the study on trades, see if I can get....I started yesterday, ...but confident, I’d like to go away confident from here which I am, Malcolm he's a good teacher, he helps. ... Oh he just gives us hints and all that. ... Because of the session we had here yesterday, I started....it got me thinking, it was a...it was running through me head so I’ve got a, I went and got a book on maths and all that....a couple of them and I went home and just got stuck into straight away. .... I need a calculator but I tried. ... I’m starting to understand it a bit.

In this excerpt, Artie highlights gaining confidence for his future and the role the teacher plays in his learning and understanding. Of interest is Artie’s reference to a previous session and how it prompted and enthused him sufficiently enough to seek out maths books after class to further assist in his understanding.

In the next excerpt India explains the processes that the teacher uses to assist in his learning of construction.

He explains it to us first to try get us to build it ourselves but as soon as we can’t do it and we ask for help, he’ll like break it down in a way so that we can understand and do it ourselves or if you’re still having a bit of trouble. He’ll just give us the answer you know, but at the same time that he’s giving us the answer, he’s explaining it so we understand at the same time, not just give us the answer.

Here India discusses how the teacher, Malcolm, scaffolds his learning. Drawing from the processes of explanation and abstraction, Malcolm supports the students with building an item or object but in doing so, scaffolds and supports the students to ensure their understanding. Of interest, is India’s comment about “the answer”. A presupposition here is that as the student is building and in need of support, the teacher may tell the student what has to be done and then the student replicates this directive. The next excerpt from Mark’s interview expands on the support provided by the teacher, Malcolm.

It's the main thing that we can communicate and work as a team, that's good hey and Mick.....he'll explain like the details properly to us and you know at least we can understand it too you know, other people they can go about it another way but [Malcolm] he breaks it down a little bit and at least we can understand what you know he's talking about and which way it's done, even with you like he's doing business and that, found out an easier way that we can do it, there’s always an easier way, just got to find it. ...I also got a little bit more understanding on how it works and what not you know. ... Oh it's good, you know we all.....we might have to just tell them a little bit to hurry up but we all get around to it and work as a team yeah, when it comes down to it we all get together and we do it you know. ... That's one good thing about it this little group that we've got cause we all can you know work together, communicate, it's all good you know. ... Well his /?/ help us like, come together, you know work as a team, and he
explains things good you know and we can......we all got a good understanding of how /?/ and that.

Highlighted in Mark's account is the importance of communication, working as a team and the teacher providing explanations in the process of teaching and learning. The nature of classroom relationships—between teacher and students and student and student—is crucial to student learning in classrooms and it appears from the student's perspective that this is the case. An interactive classroom is one which is guided by the teacher and allows students to find ways that allow them to interact, inquire and discuss their understandings about construction and mathematics, and relate this to their world beyond the classroom (Schoenfeld, 1994, 2002). To address this process in more detail requires defining a teaching and learning of mathematics that reflects “finding out why given techniques work, inventing new techniques, and justifying assertions” (Romberg & Kaput, 1997, p. 5). An interactive classroom is not a disorderly context, it is a work in progress that requires maintenance, and its focus remains on enabling students to acquire and apply understandings. During interactions between teachers and students and students and their peers, students attempt to convey their understandings and in doing so transform what they are attempting to convey (Thompson, 2001). In short, through classroom interactions, student understandings of what is constructive and mathematical are transformed. The next section discusses the transcript from one of the five students who went on to become a farm supervisor during the project.

**From student to supervisor**

One of the student participants, Paul, was of particular interest because at the beginning of the project in 2010 he was a student but had successfully gained employment as a farm supervisor. The farm was one of two contexts where he learned Horticulture and achieved a Certificate 1, 11, and 111 in Horticulture. An analysis of Paul's transcript identified several key elements (figure 10).

*Figure 10. Tag cloud – government, participants, supervisor and tomatoes*
First, using the tag cloud highlights four key elements including: government, participant, supervisor and tomatoes. Interestingly, how the words have been organised in the tag cloud succinctly shows his journey from being on CDEP and a student/participant to a supervisor who attends to growing tomatoes among other fruits and vegetables on the farm. Paul’s interview works to emphasise some of these elements further. Paul briefly describes that he had become the supervisor at the farm. To achieve this position, he elaborates what he had to learn over time and some of the obstacles and successes he encountered along the way.

I was a participant then and then I went for an interview for Supervisor and yeah I got it. About 3-4 years now Supervisor. ... I done my courses, oh mainly to do with horticulture, yeah Cert I, II and III, ... that just propagating seedlings....all that, fruit trees......cuttings off those, yeah and didn’t like the classes much but didn’t like writing you know, ... not at first, it was a, it was something you had to do when you were on CDEP when you’re a participant but then it changed and I, I like got into it, sort of like it, yeah so, at first I didn’t, I had to do it, yeah but then started liking it and it got easier, yeah.

Up the TAFE, yeah it was mainly in the classes and yeah once we came back here, we started to learn things here and it made a lot more sense, them books and that you know, hands on, yeah they made a lot of things seem simple you know, yeah I didn’t like the classroom much but I reckon out here on the farm, yeah but you can learn like maths and all that you know if you don’t understand it much.

This excerpt highlights several aspects. First, Paul talks about how he became a supervisor as a consequence of studying his Certificate 1, 11 and 111 at the TAFE. His brief story is a “snapshot” about emancipation and how through training he has achieved the position of supervisor. Second, Paul makes the distinction between TAFE classes and the farm indicating that learning made sense when it was “hands on” rather than in “them books”—he didn’t like writing. Third, as part of the requirements for CDAP, Paul had to attend classes and despite not liking it, initially grew to like it. A presupposition here is that attending the farm and learning how to grow fruit trees provided a “real” learning environment that was more aligned with how he learned. Of further interest was his statement that “out here on the farm, yeah but you can learn maths”. The next section focuses on principals’ and teachers’ interview transcripts.

The Principals’ and Teachers’ transcripts
An analysis was conducted drawing on the principals’ and teachers’ transcripts. Overall the interview data indicates a range of elements associated with questions related to expectations, that is, expectations of students, expectations of community, and expectations of teachers. Of interest are the high frequency words indicated in the tag cloud below (figure 11), for example, indigenous, students, community and education. A presupposition here is that each of these elements is informed by one another, particularly indigenous.
In the cluster graph (figure 12) this focus is further emphasised. There are several identifiable clusters indicating strong similarities, such as, students, communities, community, education, and indigenous. A presupposition here is that these elements are critical when discussing expectations. Of interest however, is the minimal or no linkage to teachers, teaching, training and opportunity. A further presupposition here is that teachers are less likely to discuss themselves thus choosing to focus on students, communities, education and indigeneity.
The cluster graph in figure 13 takes a more in-depth focus on the frequency of words. Of interest are the two clusters, 1) students, classroom and communities and, 2) education, curriculum and community. Both clusters suggest there is a strong link with community. This aspect is explained in the following excerpt from Miller.

Yeah it’s about understanding the relationship between a school... the Indigenous community that it services and finding out how the school responds to the needs of that community, finding out how language and culture is embedded in the curriculum, the pedagogy, the ways in which the teachers work with the students, the ways in which the administration of the school works with the students and with the community. The ways in which the community is able to influence what occurs at the school, at the decision making level and in the classroom at the chalk face, it’s all about discovering how the pedagogy of the school is assisting self-determination for Indigenous people, self-determination is a big concept and I always tell my students not to lose some of these concepts that we’re studying when they’re actually doing their interviews and they’re talking to people depending on who the person is.

In this excerpt, Miller discusses the significance of building strong relationships between community and school. In doing so, the importance of language, culture, curriculum and pedagogy are seen by Miller as critical to such relationships. Of critical importance in this excerpt is how the pedagogy of the school is identified and contributing to self-determination for Indigenous people. In the next excerpt Julia discusses some of the strategies that are adopted in her school.

Our Year 11 and 12 students, we’re looking for them to come out with levels that are equivalent to traineeship sort of level, for them to be able to get a traineeship or apprenticeship. Competent across literacy and numeracy as our two main focus subjects with some idea of what sort of area they’d like to go to whether it be horticulture, agriculture or business or those sorts of things.

Each of the teachers in those classrooms do a lot of work with the kids as they enrol, what they’re looking for and where they’re looking to go and do a lot of work with career development, especially Graham’s group. He does a lot with pushing kids towards traineeships or apprenticeships. The office does a lot of liaising with Council, other agencies, RTO’s and those sorts of things that have got apprenticeships and traineeships on offer. And then we feed that back to kids so we sort of say, once Graham’s got some more information about what they’re interested or sees what the kids are interested in. We can push for those apprenticeships if they come up and then we look at pushing them towards those directions and making opportunities available.

In this excerpt Julia explains some of the strategies used by the teachers. In doing so, she emphasises the importance of making connections with the council, agencies and RTOs who can further support the students with achieving their aspirations. What is critical in this excerpt is finding out the students’ interests and then identifying where the opportunities are to attain their aims.

In the next excerpt Malcolm discusses how the young people from his classes influence members of their community.

And that’s what they have a thirst for and even the younger guys, I’ve been told by a couple of elders in town, even the younger guys if they can show that they’re intelligent enough, they sort of like jump type of thing above other people and they say oh if you need a question
answered, go see that fellow over here, he's a smart fellow. They start doing that and then all of a sudden someone else in their community (says), I want to be a smart fellow, where did you get your smarts from? Then they say I went back to school or I went back to TAFE or I go to extra training, go along and have a crack at it. I’ve lost count of how many people and I don’t mind the boys handing out my telephone number to anyone but people that ring me up when are you doing the next course, so we were going to go down and see (the) Skills (Centre) and have a talk to them. I’ve been with (the) Skills (Centre) now 2 years solid, teaching with them because and it looks like next year I’ve got the next 6 months already booked out, so there’s not a shortage of work in town to do and there’s certainly not a shortage of the people wanting to better themselves as they go along and that’s.....for me that's my goal, if they want to better themselves and get somewhere ahead, I'll give up anything to do that, that's fine.

In this excerpt Malcolm describes the feedback he receives from elders in the community. In doing so, he explains the impact of students being role models for other young people in the community and that they too can enrol to learn and improve their future opportunities. Of significance in the excerpt is Malcolm’s comment “I'll give up anything to do that”. This comment suggests that he is very committed to his training and to the students who are enrolled in the courses he teaches. This is further reinforced in his comments about the potential of being booked out for the future.

The above excerpts discussed provide some insights into the critical elements of what is constitutive of teaching and learning – high expectations and pedagogy that is supportive of student learning. In doing so, there has been an emphasis on the relationships with community and how it is intertwined with the education process. To this end, the next section discusses the implications of the project thus far.

CONCLUSIONS

This project has positioned itself in a growing body of evidence-based research that emphasises the importance of schools, TAFE Institutes and communities building relationships to support the young people enrolled and enrolling in Certificate Courses. The research thus far in the project strongly indicates that by actively supporting teachers and trainers they are following up their ideas and collaboratively examining their work and how it “fits” with the curriculum, the community and industry. As a consequence of the project, there are several implications to consider:

1) it is likely that teachers and trainers who actively engage in developing their pedagogy further to support and sustain the learning of their students, are more likely to be collaborative in their endeavours to support their students and in some instances their communities. They are more likely to refine their knowledge and skills associated with the particular courses they teach;
2) increasing efficacy was identified in the overall data. Statements about engaging and building relationships with students and communities was evident;
3) with changes in practice come trials of new ideas, including those that are difficult and which present challenges for teachers and students. This process interweaves struggle and risk taking. Acknowledging these important aspects and working through them will enhance the teaching and learning process overall;
4) there is a strong interest for supporting students to build and enhance their future opportunities through training and employment. Such interest demonstrates the commitment of teachers who have the knowledge, skills and employment awareness to actively prepare students for the future;
5) there is an interest from students to fulfil their aims and aspirations and in doing so, successfully achieve further training and employment and;
6) where teachers adopt a team approach in the classroom, students develop a strong sense of belonging and identity as a learner.

Addendum
1. One of the students was successful with gaining employment as a farm supervisor.
2. A Masters of Research student, who worked on the ARCVET project as a research assistant, successfully gained his Masters of Research and in doing so has recently been awarded with QUT, Faculty of Education Master of Education – Research Outstanding Thesis Award. At the completion of the Masters project in 2012, he was appointed as the Indigenous Engagement Advisor for Thiess Pty Ltd, Australian Mining Division, Brisbane.

REFERENCE LIST


PROFESSION AND CONTEXT: TRAINING TEACHERS IN A SYSTEMIC, CO-OPERATIVE AND AUTO/BIOGRAPHIC VIEW

Formenti, Laura  
Università degli Studi di Milano Bicocca  
Italy

ABSTRACT

In the framework of lifelong and lifewide learning, training for teachers should be aimed to foster their positive attitude towards learning and learning to learn. A systemic, constructivist, and auto/biographic approach was used in a course for teachers in mathematics and physics. To propitiate lifelong and lifewide learning, they were invited to take an active and reflexive position towards their experience at school (past, present, and future), teacher/student relationships, and concept of learning. The general aim was to develop a reflexive attitude and explicit ideas about knowledge, learning, and the subject matter. Auto/biographical participatory inquiry was used as a method to learn through research: learners were invited to develop an individual and collective satisfying theory about their choice to become a teacher, their struggles for identity, and the challenges of a difficult social and professional situation.

You easily make errors when you plan your action in a very precise way, not leaving any space for the unforeseen (Carla)

Can lifelong learning be taught? What kind of training is needed to help teachers to build a disposition to learn at life scale and (consequently) to be able to propitiate the same attitude in their students? The EU agenda and national policies of education put an emphasis on lifelong learning, creating the basis for a new hegemonic rhetoric about learning in the “knowledge society”. Some critiques of this discourse address the limits of a simplified and generalized concept of learning (West, Merrill, Alheit & Anderson, 2007), the challenges and ambiguities of living in the learning society (Alheit, 2005), as well as the fact that many research findings and educational practices are absent from the EU documents, and seem to be completely ignored as parts of the lifelong learning process (Zarifis & Gravani, 2013). If “new goals are set” and “new actors and institutions are now engaging in adult education” (see the Conference claim), the relation between old and new is ambiguous and often paradoxical (Bron, Kurantowicz, Olesen & West, 2005), specially in “old” institutions as school.

Nevertheless, capacity to learn lifelong and lifewide is undeniably an important factor of adaptation, self-orientation, and even personal well-being in the complexity of post-industrial societies. Competences and life skills that are needed to live a good enough life in transitional times demand an investment on contexts and methods of learning, where learning to learn comes into the foreground.

New goals, then, appear for teachers' training, such as the necessity for adults who want to become teachers to re-think their relation to learning. This is crucial, if they are expected to foster openness to learn in their students. Many teachers, in fact, seem to maintain the “old”
idea of life as divided in phases, where learning happens in the beginning, then working life begins. In this paper, I will bring some arguments in favor of a method of training that involves research, namely co-operative inquiry with an auto/biographical orientation. I use it as a method to train new teachers, to propitiate their positive attitude towards learning and learning to learn.

I will show some relevant experiences, turning points and insights of a learning process involving 31 participants in a course that was a part of teachers' training TFA (active internship training), a new program started by the Italian Government in 2012-2013. TFA entails one year of apprenticeship in schools, while trainees follow courses in Pedagogy, Didactic, Inclusive Teaching, and workshops in the Didactic of their subject matters. Universities are responsible for the program.

The module presented here – titled "Profession and context" – entailed 24 hours in a class of future teachers in maths and physics and 16 hours workshop. It was the opening module in the whole course. Its general aim was to build awareness about professional identity in the context of school; a double edged aim: on one side, there is the individual, an adult who wants to become a teacher and brings into this project his/her own story, values, representations, emotions, theories about school and learning, about the subject matter and teaching it, life and adolescence (the level of school where these people will teach is high school, students aged 14-19). On the other side, school is an institution with rules and constraints, a place where different people live together interacting day by day, and building a collective idea of what learning is, precisely through these interactions. School as a system is made by individuals, but it is more than the sum of them: then, awareness of the systemic rules of functioning can bring insights into the processes of learning and teaching, and more generally of living together and building knowledge altogether.

A basic assumption of this program is to consider participants as insiders of experience. Most of them have some experience in teaching, all of them are living the internship during the TFA. Most of them have a very good curriculum in their subject matters: besides one or more master degrees, many have a PhD or other qualifications to teach (in other subject matters, Informatics for example, or lower levels of school). Nonetheless, all of them are pedagogically naif, and no one had any specific training in education. This is quite common in Italy, specially for the scientific curriculum.

As I will argue, participatory auto/biographical research is a way to voice the insiders' point of view, opening a possibility to chronicle, to value and to analyze experience, knowledge, and meaning. What is it to teach maths and physics at high school level? What kind of concepts, values, meanings are common sense in this group of people? How is a teacher identity built? I start by adopting a position of curiosity, a “not knowing expert” attitude, hoping to foster the same in the trainees.

All teachers need to understand the way their students (will) learn, their lebenswelt and relationship to knowledge (Fabbri & Munari, 2005); this can be done only by voicing their experience and meaning. To put learners into the foreground is then the first move of a relational, engaging, and co-operative training strategy, based on the systemic view, co-operative inquiry (Heron, 1996) and auto/biographic education (Formenti, 1998; Formenti & Gamelli, 1998).
PROPITIATING LEARNING

The task of education and training is to set up contexts for transformation in individuals, relationships, and workplaces. Knowledge is a dynamic and fluid process, made of interactions between the knowing subjects (as members of cultures and social groups) and the world, as well as among them. Learning to learn cannot be programmed, but only “propitiated”, from the Latin word *propitius*, a combination of *pro* (further) and *pètere* (to go). The Greek root of this word comes from *pètomai*: to fly. To propitiate, in fact, was in Ancient Rome the practice of consulting birds’ flight before taking any risky or important action. It is a good metaphor for learning, as an activity that also demands to *go further* taking risks, challenging identities, certainties and solid presuppositions.

For example, for someone who has a degree in physics or mathematics, to learn pedagogy is risky. It can raise awe, skepticism, mistrust:

*I must admit that I engaged in this course with a good deal of skepticism* (Cinzia)

*It struck me that when we are involved in an educational relationship we enact a pedagogy, even unknowingly, and all of us have a theory... save we often lack 'the words to say it'* (Alberto)

*In the last few weeks something unexpected, unforeseen, and above all unsettling happened to me: I attended a pedagogy course! Many issues were raised here, that are hardly ever accessible and usable unless a careful phase of reflection and 'appropriation' is taken...* (Tilde).

The feeling of dismay can pave the way to an opening; it is constitutive of learning. Nonetheless, if the challenge is too high or unintelligible, it can bring to closure and refusal. The learner position is affected by previous contexts of learning; I keep it in my mind, while designing the course. As Bateson (1972) argued, our actions reveal structures that were produced by repeated exposure to certain learning contexts. Someone who has a degree in maths has learned, far beyond the contents and language of the discipline, a *modus operandi*, a *forma mentis*, a specific relationship with knowledge (Munari, 1993). Any learning builds on a second level of learning, or *deuterolearning*, or learning the context where it takes place (Bateson, 1972). A shift is needed, then, from traditional attention for the contents to be learned, or more recently for the acquisition of new abilities and competencies, to the very process and context of learning. This is the aim of *operational epistemology* (Fabbri, Munari, 2005) and *practical hermeneutic* (Formenti, 2009), programs in adult education whose participants are invited to make visible connections between what and how they learn(ed), and to become curious and critical about the concept of learning they have internalized.

Among the meanings of *propitiate* there is also a relational one, i.e. the attitude towards someone, to have his/her favors, a cautious and seeking strategy to approach the unknown, specially when it appears threatening and intimidating. The teacher, as a *propitiator*, favors...
and mediates, by setting up the environmental, relational, emotional, cognitive, meta-cognitive conditions for learning (Formenti, 2007b).

[This course] entailed for me to be a student again, and besides of a matter that is not structurally fitting for me, hence I harbored some prejudice on it. Hence, I gained an optimal point of view, being in the same condition of many students, who face maths the first year at school, and I was able to experience myself very concretely the model of teaching that was proposed [...] I always found this matter quite elusive and complex [...] There were not only lexical difficulties, but structural [...] I learned to learn in a different way from the one I had been accustomed to, since my early years at school, I experienced that to learn in a different way is possible (Veronica)

How can “elusive and complex” knowledge be propitiated? This trainee is discovering a pattern that connects her experience to the students' experience. She uses systemic concepts to interpret what happened during the course. Problems can come from a new lexicon, to be learned, but even more from the structure of a discipline. Each person can perceive only those parts of the world that are meaningful to her, when a co-respondence between self and the world, self and the other has been established. What we normally ascribe to a phenomenon, an object, or someone, are not inherent properties, but the outcome of (previous) interaction. This theory of knowledge is favorable to learning, since it allows Veronica to stay in the difficult situation at hand and to make up goods reasons for it.

FROM RECIPROCAL POSITIONING TO THE COM-POSITION OF KNOWLEDGE

Recently I wondered about the most correct posture to be taken during group work. We use to menace students with punishments in order for them to be collaborative… I ask to myself increasingly often if their bad behavior does not depend more on me than on them (Paola)

A colleague pointed out the terms I was using to describe that class: 'naysayers', 'role problems', 'bored of being judged as such', and this made me aware that maybe I was not describing their position, but mine! [...] I was determined, during that meeting, to find a common strategy with my colleagues to 'make the children change' and to solve their problem, he really re-positioned me (Viviana)

What seems to propitiate learning, in the stories told by these teachers, are active postures, experimentation, dialogue with a critical friend, meta-communication. Taking care of relationships demands a lot of thinking and a kind of attention that is never granted. To question relational postures is a golden thread for training: I did it, in this course, during the very first lesson, when I invited participants to choose a sentence among 4 to define their position at start (in parentheses, the number of choices they made for each phrase):

- I hope to hear interesting things (19)
- I wish to receive clear instructions (3)
- I am already able to teach, but I need to ... (2)
- I would like to put myself on the line and experiment new things (7)
The high number of choices for the first sentence expresses both their skepticism in relation to the subject matter (see above), and an attitude that is quite common in the academic context. Generally speaking, in the Italian tradition quite a lot of “learning” happens through direct teaching, lectures, and a passive positioning of the learner towards the contents to be learned.

These sentences were meant to evoke the trainees postures in relation to knowledge and to the learning situation. After analysis of some hundreds learning biographies, Marie Christine Josso (1995) identifies 4 postures of adult learners: waiting (as in attending a conference, silent attitude), refuge (as in the “good active student”, obedient and task oriented), intentionality (as in andragogy, adult intentional position, awareness), and giving up (as in play, someone who is open to take risks). In the systemic view, these personal dispositions cannot be separated from a relational context; they are the outcome of a reciprocal composition between learner and teacher, or more generally among learners/teachers in a class. Inter-dependence of behaviors and concepts of learning builds structural couplings (Maturana, 1990): for each student position there is a teacher position. Besides, the macrolevel, i.e. the institutional and social context, defines and legitimates postures in a way that confirms the social order. Institutional habitus is quite relevant to learning processes. In figure 1, each line shows a “happy” structural coupling, where the match between participants and to the context appears satisfying. Happy couplings tend to self-confirmation, hence they are not favorable to second level learning, or learning to learn. To propitiate change, all postures should be taken, specially the unhappy, or uncomfortable ones, considered the starting positions and the desired outcomes. For a student who is waiting, a playful teacher can be disturbing, but also opening new possibilities. For an adult who is strongly committed to his/her own questions, to learn listening is extremely useful.

**Figure 1 – Relational couplings and postures in education/training**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Learner posture</th>
<th>Teacher posture</th>
<th>Examples of legitimizing contexts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Waiting</td>
<td>Starring</td>
<td>Conference, lecture, diagnosis, verdict, preach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refuge</td>
<td>Instructing</td>
<td>Coaching, training, instrumental learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intentionality</td>
<td>Listening</td>
<td>Learner centered program, andragogy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Giving up</td>
<td>Playing/guiding</td>
<td>Active exploration, co-operative inquiry, peer-to-peer education</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

How is it possible to “activate” students who already learned to stay sit, waiting for knowledge to be delivered? How can “too intentional” students be brought to learn something they do not want to learn? My aim here is to invite future teachers to become aware of their default position and to use more of the different options, in relation to the students/classes they meet. To this aim, I use co-operative inquiry (Heron, 19996) as a method, inviting the group of participants to share questions and answers. Discussions and conversations will then become individual writings, through reflexive journals: when using this method, it is
essential to keep track of the individual path of learning. The personal journals will become a basis for the essay that will be used, at the end of the course, for evaluation (see footnote 1).

Themes to be proposed in this course were established from the beginning: the first lesson, the construction of knowledge, strategies of communication, body and voice, the professional choice, relationships at school, cognitive facilitation. It must be said that this is not how co-operative inquiry should work. Participants in co-operative inquiry choose contents and methods of research through an ongoing open discussion. Another basic aspect of co-operative inquiry is a peer-to-peer relationship: evidently this requirement is not satisfied here, because of my presence as a teacher, and the academic context where it happens. But, as Heron himself states (1996), constraints and limits are quite common in the building of an authentic co-operative inquiry; some conditions can be considered as aims of the process itself, and not granted from the start. Here, the aim of increasing the participants’ choice and personal commitment is relevant to the general aim of fostering learning to learn and responsibility towards one's learning.

The method of co-operative inquiry goes through 4 cyclic passages that are interrelated in a dynamic spiral: authentic experience, aesthetic representation, intelligent understanding, and deliberate acting (Formenti, 2008). Each of them corresponds to a kind of knowledge:

- experience knowledge, that is evoked during the training both by living experience in the class and by evoking “radical memory” (Heron, 1996, pp. 115-130), i.e. auto/biographical incursions in sensitive, embodied life telling;
- presentational knowledge, where experience is expressed through a gesture, sign, image; an abductive, ambiguous, unfinished, hence generative, form of thinking that is explored through narration, the blazon (Galvani, 1995), metaphors (Formenti, 2011), theater and role playing...;
- propositional knowledge, where meaning is developed in discourse, by using a vocabulary, hence a social, cultural perspective; it is intelligent as it makes connections between (inter + ligo) experiences and forms of knowledge, com-posing them into maps, schemata, and statements/texts;
- practical knowledge is the poietic (constructive, generative) moment of research, introducing variations and proofs in everyday life and work, a trial-and-error procedure guided by understanding and aimed to produce new experience (hence, a new cycle of knowledge).

Experiential and presentational knowledge are subjective and rooted in the sensing body; to shift from subjective to social knowledge we need to use words, and to activate a collective mind, as in the propositional and practical kinds of knowledge.

The whole course is a collective research, starting from individual positions, that are explored, made visible and challenged, in relation to knowledge, in communication with others (students, colleagues, parents...), as well as to oneself and one's professional identity. The process installs an ongoing interrogation, starting from self-observation of the very concrete postures, i.e. the way bodies deploy in space, voicing, breathing:

I realized that in the class I payed no attention to the use of voice and I used it badly, shouting for instance. This produced a sense of frustration, sometimes declared, in
the students. By this, I was probably communicating power, a will to crash them, and they felt forced in a place where they did not really want to stay. In the last few weeks I really tried (before I said it, instead of doing it) to use my voice in a different way and to prefer silence (Annamaria)

To become aware that you have a posture means to have a possibility to change it. To see – to grasp – it means that you invest attention and energy on the quality of presence and listening (Gamelli, 2005). Attention brings to new questions:

-In these classes, chaos reigns: balls of paper, pieces of chalk scattered all over the floor, benches moved here and there and stacked in no precise order, students do not even realize when the teacher has entered the room [...] These attitudes are not nonsensical... our classes are telling something to us; the chaos where they live and make us to live is the outcome of something deeper [...] many messages, often conflicting, arrive to our students... (Tilde)

Learning entails a (re)positioning, be it practical, theoretical, ethical, relational. However, an adult learner who (re)enters formal education can become aware of the necessity of this (re)positioning only when something critical happens in his/her circumstances, that brings a breakdown in the continuity of experience. Dissatisfaction, conflict, need, desire are necessary to learn.

TRUE QUESTIONS AND EPISTEMOLOGICAL AWARENESS

Why does the mirror reverse right and left, and does not reverse top and bottom?

I pose this question, with some mirrors of different kinds, to the participants, organized in groups (of 5-6, with an observer). They have to give a motivated answer. I used many times this question in training (and research), however in this occasion I wondered: how would a group of experts, with a scientific background, react to it? I feared trivialization, and a ready-to-go answer, but it did not happen, and the 5 groups who were working on it had long and deep discussions. Each of them concluded with a statement, as required, and their final answers were diverse, well developed, but ambivalent, unfinished, dissatisfying to them. During the discussion, they became increasingly reflexive, on many themes.

The simplicity of the question caught us unprepared. After the first moment of 'disorientation' we decided to use the mirror to experiment. By putting it vertically [...] it reverses indeed. But then we positioned it horizontally [...] and this time it was bottom-top, no more right-left, being exchanged! [...] our dissatisfaction [for the answer] was a demonstration of our interest. Besides, we agreed that manipulation of the mirror was determinant both in articulating and 'verifying' our theory (Andrea)

We are speaking of teachers who think that physics can be taught and learned by reading books and listening to lessons. Andrea develops a theory where motivation to learn grows from a real question, and dissatisfaction for the answer. His previous habitus was challenged.
This question calls into play points of view somehow [...] If you don't assume a point of view, you get stuck and will not be able to answer [...] Problems arise when some people make a mix, identifying their position with another. Hence, none of the two can know anything, none of the two can understand, even not oneself [...] It is not enough to look at things from one point of view. We feel complexity and the necessity of relationship (Luca)

The question of the mirror raises epistemological issues: its combination of different kinds and levels of information forces the participants to question their usual way of knowing what they know (Watzlawick, 1984). How do we validate our ideas? What is a satisfying answer for a mathematician or a physicist, and would it be satisfying for a student too? Maybe yes, but what is it, a satisfying theory?

An important aspect of human cognition is manipulation, experimentation. It struck me, in this occasion, to realize that one of the groups in the room did not even give a look to the mirror, during the whole 40 minutes discussion. Two groups, instead, decided to go to the mirror only after a long and not concluding debate, centered on abstract ideas and formal models. This is not what I expected from people with a scientific background.

The cognitive habitus of the profession implies that these people have internalized an attitude to solve problems through formal means. They are quite good in using a conventional language, formulas, and they give for granted the meaning or framework of the question. This brushes off the scene a whole range of possible operations – cognitive, but also practical and relational – that are quite crucial in the construction of knowledge. Besides that, 2 groups out of 5 chose from the very beginning a strict disciplinary framework to solve the problem: physical in one case, and geometrical in the other. They were not aware that a “true question” is open to multiple descriptions, hence multiple ways to solution.

During the discussion, someone raised an issue: what happens if the question is posed in the class, at school, by a student? The first reaction is worry: a teacher risks to “lose face” if he/she does not have a ready-made, satisfying, and complete answer to all the students’ questions! This unrealistic but quite strong position shows how epistemological questions - what is it “to know”? - are connected to self-representation of professional identity, to values - what is right, what is expected by a teacher - and to emotions - “how do I feel” when I do not have the answers, or do I interpret true questions as provocations? Uncertainty is a constitutive property of knowledge, and of the teaching professions, as well as a favorable condition for learning.

MY RELATIONSHIP WITH KNOWLEDGE: TOWARDS A SATISFYING THEORY

The ongoing co-operative inquiry in the group brings about, during the course, ideas of one's relationship with the subject matter.

It happens quite often that the students ask what's the use of Maths, specially when concepts become difficult. Well, I almost always answer: “No use!” (Geremia)
When I am addressed a question like this, I am generally able to answer and to bring them to reflect on it, but I feel partially defeated, since evidently I was not able to pass on the right motivation (Paola)

What does it mean to learn? What does it mean to teach? I have heard many times these questions, but they take real meaning only when somebody turns them to oneself [...] merely knowing something does not give to us the right of teaching it: it is required from us that kind of enjoyment and pleasure that only comes from intimacy with the matter (Angela)

Being familiar with the subject matter, speaking its language, a teacher has the classic problem of all experts, who know and do things for granted, ignoring strategies and procedures they used in the past to learn what they know. Besides, having been good students in maths, they do not know the difficulties of bad achievers. To become a good enough teacher, it is important to re-conceptualize one’s relationship with the discipline, to de-construct and re-construct a satisfying theory of it, of the way it can be learned and taught, of its aims, difficulties, limits.

These theories take a form in the final product of the course, a text where participants are invited to develop their personal theory. But what is a theory?

“A theory is a coherent system of conceptualizations, strategies and actions, apt to provide a satisfying explanation, from a cognitive and moral point of view as well as aesthetic and practical, of the world we live and act in” (Munari, 1993, p. 61).

There is an epistemological shift, in this definition, from the traditional way of defining a theory, to a systemic and complex way, centered on composition and interrelation of different aspects of life and learning:

“[...] a theory is not only an idea, or a system of more or less well interconnected ideas, that we can contemplate outside us and separate from the contingencies of our everyday life, as the rationalist and empiricist traditions have wanted us to believe, although with different intents. A theory should also be useful, likeable, it should be able to satisfy the needs of our intellectual, spiritual, affective and physical life, all in all it should be able to have a positive relationship with us” (Munari, 1993, p. 108).

These final texts are written in the first person, and rich of narrative examples, as required. They are outcomes of the process of co-operative inquiry, and as such they are a corpus of data, to be analysed and used for further thinking. They are based on the following presuppositions:

1. To teach means to have a theory of teaching, hence an epistemology. Those who state they do not have one, have a bad one (as Gregory Bateson used to say). A theory is always personal, although it was developed (learnt) through regular exposition to certain contexts; our theory of teaching was mainly formed during school years, hence a (critical) reconstruction of early experiences as students can be a good way to reveal hidden theories.

2. Actions are embodied theories; a theory of learning and teaching is enacted through concrete gestures, positions, performances. General statements are not a good way to know
about someone’s theory, where many tacit and unconscious aspects are entailed. Narrative texts are more useful for this kind of inquiry than explanatory and abstract statements. Besides, the latter tend to become prescriptive: they say what “should” be done, and do not enlighten what “is” done and its effects.

3. The constructivist and systemic view entails a responsibility about one’s knowledge: what we see depends on how we act (von Foerster, 1973), so we need to develop a theory of learning that does not only depend on the other’s ability or motivations, but focuses on our efforts to open possibilities.

The practice of writing in the first person – auto/biographic writing, experiential writing, reflexive writing - is a powerful means to bring personal experience of learners into learning (Formenti & Castiglioni, 2014), to acknowledge the presence of learning in any aspect of life, and to challenge common ways of teaching and training professionals. Personal knowledge is the basis of all knowing, and writing is a way to make it visible, to reflect on it, to develop and change it. This needs some care, i.e. love and attention in doing things. Writing itself is a way to develop attention, a quality of presence in the learning context.

Narration is a composition of life (M.C. Bateson, 1989), it builds links between different parts of identity, of our story, sewing them into forms that can be seen and recognized by others. When this composition is accomplished in a group, within a research framework, the process can be very creative and generative, as it feeds on differences, on the others’ sight, on the others’ stories. New ways of thinking are then possible.

During a lesson we were asked to write - in a word - what is ‘knowledge’ for us: the first word that came to me was desire, de-siderium and its surprising etymology [the Latin word de-siderare literally means “to stop looking at the stars”]. In my life, observation of the starry sky always was [...] a moment of internal dialogue: facing the magnitude of infinity, in loneliness, one desires, regrets, feels uncanny, suffers, hopes, and is overwhelmed by an almost irrational joy. As in a gleam, I understood that emotion, disquiet, and even cognitive displacement, are inseparable aspects of learning: no concept is interesting in itself; it becomes interesting only when it assumes a meaning and a special value for the learner, when it generates new feelings and reflections, when it produces a new, extraordinary reading of the ordinary. (Celeste)

In this course, auto/biographical writing was used:
- to explore personal meaning connected to learning and teaching;
- to develop narratives as a way to connect theory and experience;
- to legitimate personal knowledge and voice, thanks to the “first person” writing; and
- to celebrate abductive and metaphoric thinking, as well as different forms of language.

Auto/biography in professional training is not an end to itself: it is an invitation to focus the process of learning, starting from experience, expressing feelings and emotions, values and ideas, finding ways to compose them in a form that is satisfying for the author. Besides, it can be shared and then questioned in a reflexive co-operative setting. The final aim, as I said above, is to build a satisfying theory of professional identity and the school context, a theory that can eventually sustain deliberate action.
Hence, the focus of auto/biography is not merely individual: it implies others at all levels, since biographical experience is shared, representations are also shared and used to start conversations, understanding is collectively built through open discussions, in little groups and in the class, and action brings in the group feed-backs from outside. Co-operation brings to embodied theories, in dialogue with experience and the context, entailing values, passions, positions; it is an engaging and “subversive” practice, as it challenges common places, and what was taken for granted. The search for a satisfying theory opens some space for new connections, for instance between scientific and human knowledge:

[Maths] teaches to reason in an abstract way, it edges away from reality [...] it gives then space to imagination thanks to logic-deductive thinking (Cinzia)

If human knowledge, and reality itself, is a personal interpretation made of different emotions or beliefs, and influenced by communication and by language, then mathematics itself [...] is something subjective, at least in our personal interpretation... (Chiara)

[Why mathematics?] because it is beautiful, because if Man has always been interested in it, this is certainly not by chance, because it helps us to be mindful citizens. And not “because it is useful” (Geremia)

THE PROFESSIONAL CHOICE: SELF-AWARENESS AND CARE

I dreamt of becoming a researcher, discovering new theories, new formulas, so much so that my friends made fun of me telling that I was going to write the ‘C Theorem’ (Carolina)

[My teachers] no matter how much effort I put in it, I was not able to bring to surface any memory of some human side in them. I am determined not to deprive my students of this aspect… everything else came by itself [...] it was an incentive for them to follow [...] while respecting my work... I realized that I felt good; I had become a reference point [...] Now I feel that I have grown as a person being in contact with them. I achieved better self-esteem and self-confidence. (Mario)

All our learning stories are about passion, flourishing from love and seduction, both in positive and negative terms. If my wish is passion growing in my students I must cultivate trust, esteem, confirmation, encouragement. (Miriam)

Self-narration was used during the course to explore past experience, specially at school (What kind of student was I?) and to search traces of early professional vocation (When did I think for the first time - I want to become a teacher?) (Formenti, 1998; Formenti, Gamelli, 1998). Memory work is not aimed to find in the past causes for the present, following a deterministic hypothesis, but to make sense and give weight to a choice that some trainees seem to take for granted. Auto/biography is a trigger to set in motion stories and meanings, beyond customary answers. When narrative thinking is triggered, stories pour out, as Delia tells in the example below.
This question could not be fixed with my customary answer since it asked for a fact. This brought me to reflect [...] I had no great professors in mathematics [...] Then suddenly like a flash some episodes came to my mind, with my father helping me with some mathematical problems [...] during those afternoons spent together with him, both of us reasoning on “little segments” that had to be added one to another, subtracted or compared, my esteem for him grew [...] and fascination [...] and above all a great passion for the subject matter that he was explaining to me! (Delia)

The biographic focus brings attention to existence as a whole (lifewide learning), and shows the complexity of learning: discoveries, dilemmas, challenges, strong emotions, ambiguities... Nothing is simple and linear in learning, or in life. A point of strength can become a weakness:

“Ironically, academic high flyers can struggle in such situations, and may need to learn, among other things, about their own vulnerabilities as a way of better understanding their pupils” (Merrill & West, 2009, p. 88).

Auto/biographic writing propitiates awareness, freedom, and critical thinking, as educational research has shown in the writings of Gaston Pineau, Pierre Dominicé, Marie Christine Josso, Duccio Demetrio and many others. Nonetheless, some conditions must be accomplished, to foster learning to learn: learners tell their stories (possibly, using different perspectives) in the aim to identify determinants of existence; they are supported in the challenge of becoming authors of their life, taking risks, making choices, in a word taking care of themselves, of their learning, and ongoing identity. Here again, questions are in the foreground: How did I become the person I am today? What do I want for my life? What kind of teacher am I/do I want to become? What can I do, to this end?

In the sharing of stories, diversity and commonalities emerge. Although the posture is self-reflexive, the group is very important, as it allows comparisons, beyond common places. The group also means recognition and new possible views. Self-theories are satisfying not only because they are experience based and value laden, but because they are shared by others.

IN CONCLUSION: CHALLENGES AND A CRITICAL VIEW OF LIFELONG LEARNING

This way of doing training and research with teachers is quite different from the hegemonic discourse in adult education that appears more interested in technicalities and functional learning (Formenti & Castiglioni, 2014). Reflexivity is used (at best) in relation to efficacy, to outcomes, while meaning and presuppositions, that are by definition subjective and elusive, do not receive enough attention. Similarly, relationships with knowledge, passion, critical thinking are very often marginalized in educational discourse. Willingness to learn does not depend (only) on the learner and his/her engagement, but on the construction of collectivities and organisations that are able to develop, besides cognitive and practical resources, emotional, ethical and aesthetic ones.

The concept of “adaptation” dominates the field; market rules, however, are not necessarily adequate to human needs, neither coherent with the richness and complexity of learning. Specially if we address those kinds of learning that are needed for a good enough life.
I confess that I often imagined other routes... I asked myself if all the study, the effort, the work would be appreciated and not wasted. All these doubts present themselves cyclically when a difficult day arrives, when the precariouslyness of this job steals any security (Cinzia).

How is it to learn a professional identity in a world like the present that preaches - and imposes as a new mantra - flexibility and adaptation? Young teachers chase multiple qualifications (for different subject mattes and different orders of school), to grant themselves better possibilities of employment. How much do they invest? How much satisfaction do they gain and how much passion can they put into teaching a “fall-back” subject?

Massimo’s story was quite enlightening: he wrote that during a brief teaching experience he had been afraid of giving a negative impression to the class, of being “too permissive, not commanding enough respect”. He received refusals by some students, and interpreted this as a sign of their weakness and lack of motivation.

But only when he arrives towards the end of his text, and apparently with no connection with the previous statements, he writes that he is teaching another subject, different from his specialization. Besides, he teaches in a vocational school “and this undeniably falls back on teaching, and you cannot fool yourself”. How does Massimo cope with this “not exactly ideal” situation? He tells that he found new passions, he went back to study and had the possibility to learn new useful notions, and now he finds that this difficult condition brought him to be more sensitive to his students' life:

[…] the mathematical training and the positive experience of having 'always understood everything' may be obstacles to understand the students' real problems (Massimo).

This example shows how many and complex kinds of learnings can take place in a difficult situation. Massimo's awareness of a gap between his desire and reality – and now, the new awareness of his own strategy of coping – could propitiate future learning, and more generally a positive attitude in it.

If we consider learning as a lifewide, not only lifelong, process (West, Merrill, Alheit & Anderson, 2007), we bring into professional training the complexity of coping to life, and this is much more than preparing people for a job. In the case of these young teachers, training to learn a professional identity means to become able to read the context, using agency and critical choice to build ways to live a good enough life. What do they learn while passing abruptly from a bakery school to a lyceum, from private to public school, from the city to suburbs or to a village school? How do they give a meaning to these experiences, so as to make them favourable to deuterolearning? This course tries to build some knowledge on these processes, while developing skills and competences in teaching.

A teacher should know well, and “be well”, not only for him/herself, but for the influence he/she has on students and their openness to learning. The task of society is to grant the conditions for this, not least by a revision of models in training and education, towards proposals – as the one here described – that interpret professionalization far beyond mere adaptation, as a “journey towards oneself” (Josso 2001). A journey that we can propitiate, never determine.
REFERENCES


HOW INTERNET BASED PARTICIPATORY CULTURE CAN BE CO-OPTED TO DEVELOP TEACHERS’ TECHNOLOGICAL SKILLS

Gilardi, Filippo
The University of Nottingham Ningbo China
China

Reid, James
Akita International University
Japan

I INTRODUCTION

In May 2013 we delivered a series of lectures and workshops at the Colegio Nuevo Gimnasio in Bogota as part of the “V Congreso Internacional de Lectura y Escritura: Nuevas Pedagogías”. The primary, and stated, objective of the workshops was to train Colombian schoolteachers in the use of Transmedia Storytelling techniques to teach reading and writing skills. The longer-term goal was for the teachers to reconceptualise their approach to technology and the classroom dynamic.

The Digital Divide that exists in the area of Bogota where our workshops were conducted manifests itself as one in which the millennial generation of affluent students have grown up expressing themselves in Internet-based participatory cultures, while the majority of the older less well-off teaching body have not. Each collaborative group consisted of students (aged 16 to 18) and teachers (aged 23 to 65). The workshops employed Transmedia Storytelling techniques that created egalitarian learning environments by dismantling the traditional classroom hierarchy. The groups were encouraged to view the teachers as collaborative participants rather than authority figures, and both students and teachers were asked to consider how they could learn from each other.

The students improved their ability to read and interpret literary texts, and to collaborate by sharing knowledge and ideas. They mentored each other and worked productively with others in problem solving. Likewise, the teachers had the novel experience of working with students as equals, and they also improved their awareness of digital technology.

In general, it was found that the students supplied creative ideas, and digital media knowledge and skills that they had acquired through their Internet-based social activities, while the teachers were able to provide an understanding of the complexity and the consistency of a narrative and had greater expertise of different writing genres. Students employed their experience of YouTube video uploading, Facebook picture editing and posting, Prezi presentations and twi twitter synthesis, while teachers were able to guide the content and style of writing depending on whether a genre was a newspaper article, a radio program, a poem, or diary entry.

By showing the teachers how to effectively co-opt the students’ innate creativity and familiarity with digital technology, we saw them become comfortable in a more collaborative and editorial role. It was seen that these two separate skill sets complement each other in the creation of digital Transmedia narratives.
At present, it is too early to say whether most or all of the teachers are employing Transmedia Storytelling techniques. It is certainly too early to say whether our project has inspired them to embark on a life-long quest of learning how to co-opt their students’ capacity with digital technology. However, the results we acquired from the questionnaire show that teachers were very surprised at the competence their students displayed with digital technology, and all respondents commented during the session that there is pedagogical validity in allowing students to employ their skills and creativity in classroom settings. Furthermore, we have found that in previous Transmedia projects, teachers have improved their skills in digital technology, and most of the teachers present at this workshop were hungry for practical applications of Internet-based technology they could use in teaching. As a consequence we set up an additional workshop to teach them how to create their own online learning courses using a free browser-based application called Memrise (http://www.memrise.com). We explained how this online course creator could be used to supplement class-work and form part of a Transmedia learning project by allowing students to individualize learning memes within each course.

We expect this study to be longitudinal in nature: we are in contact with the workshop participants through a mailing list; we are migrating our Internet central station from an institutional blog on which their Transmedia Storytelling projects are hosted to a more open, better designed and more engaging website; we will regularly survey them online; and we plan to return to Colombia in 2015 to conduct face to face meetings and focus groups.

II THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK AND METHODOLOGY

Our theoretical framework and methodology is based on a number of training techniques that have been designed to develop collaboration between students and teachers based on four concepts: Transmedia Storytelling, Participatory Culture, Active learning, and Multiple Intelligences (Reid, Hirata & Gilardi, 2011).

We had four goals for this workshop. The first was to help participants develop Transmedia Literacy - the ability to read, write, interact and learn through a wide range of platforms, devices, and different media such as books, videos, and social networks. Second, we sought to substantially increase the speed at which participants were able to create meaningful digital products. Thirdly, since the participants consisted of teachers and students, we wanted to see if the collaborations would engender a cross-pollination of role-specific knowledge and ideas. And finally, we wanted to see whether the participants in these projects came away with a different educational paradigm to work within. Instead of the traditional teacher-centred class dynamic that the participants are used to, this project introduced them to a collaborative dynamic where students and teachers share expertise and creative ideas. We plan to see whether this paradigm takes root over the coming years.

The methodology of our workshop series comprises the following steps: first we motivate the participants’ interest in the project by giving a multi-media presentation on the use of Transmedia Storytelling by the entertainment industry. We then show the audience some of the Transmedia products that prior participants have created. We describe how the participants were able to create these products by discussing the types of Participatory Culture that many young people are engaged with on the Internet. We then show how such projects fall under the domain of Active Learning, and how these approaches are generally
regarded as superior to traditional teacher-centred Passive Learning. And, finally, we use Howard Gardner’s theory of Multiple Intelligences to highlight that individuals have different learning preferences that can be accommodated within a Transmedia collaborative project.

II.1 TRANSMEDIA STORYTELLING

There is not as yet a universally acknowledged definition of Transmedia Storytelling. It is, after all, an age old phenomenon whereby stories are repeatedly told across different media; one only has to consider the enormous media-diversity in religious representation. Therefore, for our presentation of the concept, and how it has relatively recently been employed by the entertainment industry, we prefer Henry Jenkins’ precise formulation that “Transmedia Storytelling is the unfolding of stories across multiple media platforms, with each medium making distinctive contributions to our understanding of the world” (2006, p.293). This means that stories are not repeated through different media; rather each new media reveals new information about a consistent fictional universe. This is an intentional strategy since each story is designed with intentional lacunae that can only be filled in by visiting the other stories, yet each story is also self-contained and can be enjoyed in its own right. Jenkins argues that this process of world making is key “to sustain[ing] franchise development [since the universe], is sufficiently detailed to enable many different stories to emerge but coherent enough so that each story feels like it fits with the others” (Ibid). With the recent trend of rebooting superhero narratives (consider The Incredible Hulk, Batman, Spiderman, and Superman) and the deliberate creation of a consistent Marvel Superhero franchise, we can see Hollywood recognizing the economic opportunity inherent in the fact that fans enjoy new coherent universes to explore.

One of the most effective demonstrations of this was the Transmedia marketing strategy used to promote the low budget film The Blair Witch Project (Myrick & Sánchez 1999a). The narrative is the 1994 disappearance of three cinema students making a documentary on the Blair Witch in a Maryland forest. The Blair Witch Project movie purports to be a documentary using the students’ recovered film. The footage, however, is incomplete. It is unclear whether the three documentary makers are dead, though it does appear that they encountered an evil presence, and it is also unclear whether the footage is real or fictional.

The interest stirred up by the real filmmakers was created on a $15,000 Internet site which deliberately obfuscated the fact that this was a fictional portrayal. In Figure 1 we can see that the hub of the universe was this Internet site with the Transmedia products surrounding it. Clips from The Blair Witch Project were disseminated through various media channels. The fact that the footage appeared so genuine intrigued viewers who sought out The Blair Witch Internet site where they found an interview from one of the student’s grief-stricken parents, excerpts from another one’s diary, and police reports. Although none of these documents were portrayed as authentic, it was also not made evidently clear that they were fictional layers of world building.

As traffic grew to the website, new ‘proofs’ were added, with the result that over 75 million hits were registered. Online discussions about the authenticity of the evidence ensued, and speculation was ratcheted up by the filmmakers releasing another even lower-budget fake
documentary called *Curse of the Blair Witch* (Myrick & Sánchez 1999b) which aired on the Sci Fi channel just one day before *The Blair Witch Project* was screened in movie theatres.

Subsequent to the film’s critical and commercial success a number of other Transmedia tie-ins were created: A book called *The Blair Witch Project: A Dossier* (Stern, 1999) containing fabricated police reports, interviews and newspaper articles; eight young adult books called *The Blair Witch Files* (Merrill, 2000, 2001); a photonovel adaptation, two comic books; three video games and a less successful sequel. On a very limited budget the Transmedia layering of world-making resulted in enormous commercial success for the filmmakers.

![Figure 1: The Blair Witch Project Universe.](image)

### II.II INTERNET-BASED PARTICIPATORY CULTURES

*The Blair Witch Project* franchise is an early example of the type of digital Transmedia Storytelling that has become prevalent in recent years. The fictional universes created are a response to the emergence of participatory cultures that have flourished with the proliferation of Internet-enabled devices. Online fan forums and message boards, sampling and remixing of video and audio content on sites such as Youtube, and the ability of young people to access media concurrently have all attracted the interest of the media industry. In their 2009 White Paper Confronting the Challenges of Participatory Culture: Media Education for the 21st Century, Jenkins et al. cite a study from the Pew Internet & American Life project which reports that over one-half of American teenagers had created digital media content, and one-third had shared their creations online (Lenhart & Madden, 2005, cited in Jenkins et al., 2009). In the developed world the media habits of the millennial generation represent a sea-change from passive to active consumption. It is not just technology that enables this process, participatory cultures allow potentially anonymous users to socially connect, create, mentor and provide editorial feedback without having to formally prove their credentials. This democratisation of media is very appealing, as can be seen from the diverse forms of participatory culture that have emerged. These include Affiliations such as Facebook, message boards and metagaming; expressions such as digital sampling; fan videomaking and fan fiction writing; Collaborative Problem-solving such as Wikipedia and alternative reality gaming; and Circulations such as podcasting and blogging. (Jenkins et al., 2009)

### II.III ACTIVE LEARNING

It was the realisation that our students are active consumers of online media that prompted us to seek ways to utilize their skills for active learning projects.
Proponents of active learning posit that education is most effective when propagated through engagement with and discussion of topics (Johnson, Johnson & Smith, 1998). Such activities include debates, learning cells, pair and group work, class discussions, games, and collaborative learning groups, which may, for example, synthesise and present content to peers. It has been shown that these activities aid knowledge retention, impart interpersonal skills, and improve critical thinking and self-esteem more effectively than more passive teacher-centred learning environments (Lambert & McCombs, 1998; Freidman, Rodrigues & McComb, 2001; Bransford, Brown & Cocking, 1999).

Due to the proliferation of Internet-enabled laptops, tablet computers and smart phones, there are now more occasions where structured active learning activities can intersect with the digital experience of the student body. It has been recognised that the millennial generation are frequently plugged into Internet-based participatory cultures where they can communicate, express themselves and receive informal peer-mentoring (Cummins, Brown & Sayers, 2007; Dede, 2005; Gee, 2004). The aim of many educators today, therefore, is to co-opt such interests and re-direct some of this digital energy into more scaffolded learning environments. Consequently, our first two Active Learning Transmedia projects involved university students creating digital media products that could be presented online via a tutor moderated Virtual Learning Environment. Students reported that the projects had enhanced the following knowledge areas and skill sets: genre knowledge, vocabulary and grammar, technological competence, collaborative problem solving, ability to find, evaluate, synthesise, remix and disseminate media content, and the facility to create coherent learning universes (Gilardi & Reid, 2011; Reid, Hirata & Gilardi, 2011).

**II.IV MULTIPLE INTELLIGENCES**

Another rationale for students creating a diverse range of media products was predicated on Howard Gardner’s theory of Multiple Intelligences. Gardner maintains that individuals have differing intelligence profiles and thus vary in the way they think and solve problems. This concept that people have different ways of perceiving the world depending on their intelligence profiles is in line with the idea that students have their own learning strategies and styles. By creating a learning environment where they are free to use their preferences beyond the institutional context, our Transmedia framework can help students become more independent and efficient in their studies by enhancing the way they perceive, process, organize, present and retain knowledge. In the particular context of grade 11 students this is a key factor that will help them during the transition between secondary school and university, where they will be expected to learn more autonomously and adapt their own characteristics to that of the academy.

The Theory of Multiple Intelligences posits that each person’s profile is composed of at least eight different intelligences: linguistic, logical-mathematical, musical, visual-spatial, bodily-kinaesthetic, interpersonal, intrapersonal and naturalistic (Gardner, 1983, 1999). Everyone has varying degrees of intelligence in each category, so the following should not be seen as a categorisation of humanity into just eight types: Linguistic learners are good at learning languages and typically enjoy word games, reading, telling stories, and debating. Logical-mathematical learners enjoy working with numbers, experimentation, science and computer
Programming. Musical learners are sensitive to sounds, pitch, rhythm and tones. They learn best through listening and use music to help them memorize information. Visual-Spatial learners are good at visualizing and mentally manipulating objects. They enjoy creative and design projects and may learn more effectively through the use of pictures and videos. Bodily-Kinaesthetic people tend to be adept at sport and dance and like to learn while physically doing something. These people are particularly disadvantaged in traditional classroom settings. Interpersonal learners enjoy interacting and working in groups. By contrast, Intrapersonal people prefer working alone. They are sensitive and very aware of their own emotions, goals and motivations. Finally, naturalistic learners have a greater sensitivity to nature and are good at classifying natural phenomena (Gardner, 1983, 1999). If one accepts the postulation of differing intelligence profiles along this range, then it follows that education should seek to accommodate learning preferences by means of diverse activities. The Transmedia approach does this by activating several intelligences in the exposition of each given topic (Gardener 2008; Reid, Hirata & Giliardi 2011).

III THE WORKSHOP

Our 6-hour workshop was conducted over three days. The objective was to explore how to teach reading and writing skills through the creation of videos, comics, blogs, and other cultural media products.

The first hour of the first day introduced the concept of Transmedia Narratives and explained how the evolution of the Internet and new technologies makes it possible to create more appealing stories. The second hour was dedicated to the organization of the working groups and the presentation of the material that would be used during the following two days of workshops.

After the theoretical introduction, the fifty participants were asked to randomly create groups with, if possible, at least one teacher in each group. Eight mixed groups of between four and six people, and one group composed only of teachers were created.

The participants were asked to introduce themselves by talking about their passions and hobbies, and the skills they could bring to the group. They were then asked to choose one or more of the three short stories we presented them with, and to think of additional narratives that could be added to create a coherent Transmedia universe.

Given our time constraint and the need for participants to create meaningful projects, we choose to use short rather than longer texts that would have required deeper analysis. The readings we choose were “The Dinosaur” by Augusto Monterroso: “When [s]he/it awoke, the dinosaur was still there” (1998); “Horror Story” by Juan José Arreola: “The woman I loved has become a ghost. I am the place of her appearances” (1998); and “The secret of God” by Jaime Sabines: “He brought his lips to my ear and told me nothing” (1972). Each group had to choose one or more of these texts and develop a Transmedia universe.

On the second day, teachers and students started working together in the construction of the different Transmedia Narratives and the last day was dedicated to the finalization of the different products and the digitalization of them if needed.
IV PROJECTS

The different groups realized nine projects, although three were lost due to a computer virus.

The first group focused on the text “Horror Story” by Juan José Arreola. They developed eight different short independent texts that were digitalized using the online software Prezi (http://prezi.com/k8bkb_kkt6tb/untitled-prezi/). Each text is mostly independent from the others but put together in the right order they tell us a full story about a lover who is trying to recreate with a magic potion his lost love.

The first text is a short story, the second one is a recipe, the third text is a second short story, the fourth one a journal article, the fifth one another part of the story, the sixth one a pasquinade, the seventh is another part of the story, and the final one is a riddle.

From the quality of the texts and use of pasquinade, and the way the presentation was built to resemble a footpath it would seem that the predominant intelligences exhibited by this group are linguistic and visual-spatial.

The second group, inspired by the story by Juan José Arreola wrote a new story and adapted it to video. Despite this being more similar to a classical adaptation rather than a truly synergetic Transmedia narrative, it is a good example of proficiency with smartphone technology in the recording and editing of video media, (http://folders.nottingham.edu.cn/staff/zlizfg/PELICONGRESO.mp4) and of the different intelligences present in the group. A diverse range of intelligences is displayed in this project. The idea of rewriting the story and play with the content of the original text show a linguistic tendency, the need of a second interpretation of the text through a video indicates the presence of visual-spatial intelligence, while the style of the video where music rather than narration is used to guide us through the story signifies a high level of musical intelligence. The fact that the main character of the story is a dancer brings us finally to the expression of bodily-kinaesthetic intelligence.

The third group created a Prezi presentation to explain to children the short story by Juan José Arreola. (http://prezi.com/pl44me9lk5xs/cuento-de-horror-cng/). This is a good example of a narrative that could be easily integrated within a more elaborate Transmedia Universe. While the use of images and the online software Prezi suggest the presence of visual-spatial intelligences within the group, the choice of the subject and the final product indicates a predominance of interpersonal intelligences as the group members worked together to realise just one product with the clear goal of explaining something to others.

The fourth group also exhibited effective interpersonal collaboration and a wide variety of other intelligences. The presence of logical-mathematical intelligence is shown by the fact that they wanted to create a mobile app that would have allowed one to play the text in many different ways. They suggested three possible games that would transform the story “The Dinosaur” by Augusto Monterroso into an infinite collaborative creation. Due to time constraints, however, instead of creating an app they published a blog describing how their apps would function (http://dinosaurioinfinito.blogspot.co.uk). The first product gives the opportunity to expand the original story by adding short stories in chronological or non-chronological order that will infinitely expand the story in the future and/or in the past. The second writing game “The Dadaist Poem” presupposes that by reorganizing the words of the
short story it is possible to create other short stories that will open different possible interpretations of the original one. The last product is a drawing game. By folding a blank sheet of paper and drawing a part of the dinosaur’s body in each crease a final collaborative creation would be obtained, each time different depending on the people involved.

The fifth project synthesized the story by Juan José Arreola and the poem “The Secret of God” by Jaime Sabines in a new narrative that combines a comic, narration and music. The result is a video realized through PowerPoint (http://folders.nottingham.edu.cn/staff/zlizfg/Video.mp4) that tells us the story of a man that has been left by his girlfriend. She did not tell why she was leaving him, and now that she is not there he thinks he sees her everywhere - in the middle of crowds in the street, in the movies, and at parties. Despite being from a narrative point of view less complex than the other projects, this is just the first product of a potentially more complex Transmedia narrative as the final “to be continued” suggests.

We find this production particularly interesting for a different reason than the presence of several intelligences. One of the criticisms we have received is that our pedagogical framework is collaborating in the creation of a digital divide. This particular project shows how it is possible to create a Transmedia narrative without the use of digital technology, just with a pencil and a paper. The final digitalisation of this product was purely so that it could be included in the blog and viewed by the participants.

The sixth group built its Transmedia universe around the short story by Juan José Arreola. They created six different self-contained media products to explain the original story universe: a comic, a radio news item, two stories, a journal article, and a song.

The first product is a comic (http://prezi.com/1kppotnxhd1f/comic/) that is basically an adaptation of the original story: “The woman I loved has become a ghost. I am the place of her appearances”. It is followed by an item of radio news (http://folders.nottingham.edu.cn/staff/zlizfg/Grupo6FlashInfo.mp3) that tells us that the wife of a politician has become a ghost. This information expands the knowledge that we have about the story by giving information about the characters involved.

![Figure 2: the Juan José Arreola’s story Transmedia Universe.](image)

The third product is a short story (http://folders.nottingham.edu.cn/staff/zlizfg/Grupo6cuentodehorror.pdf) that conveys the emotion felt by a politician remembering the first dinner he had with his late wife. The journal...
article that follows (http://folders.nottingham.edu.cn/staff/zlizfg/Grupo6Noticia.jpg) tells us that it is actually the politician that died and that his wife is in a coma. This suggests that it is the politician who is a ghost, watching his wife lying in the hospital bed. The fifth product is a revised version of the original story (http://folders.nottingham.edu.cn/staff/zlizfg/Grupo6CuentoInvertido.pdf) that confirms this by telling us that the politician became a ghost and the wife cannot see him. The final product is a song (http://folders.nottingham.edu.cn/staff/zlizfg/group6cancion.mp3) where the wife of the politician realized that her husband is dead and she expresses her desire to join him.

This is probably the clearest example of how our framework is working. Each story is a self-contained narrative that tells us at the same time a single story while being part of a bigger universe. By consuming one of the products we experience a self-contained story. But it is only by consuming all the products that compose the universe do we realize that what we were imagining to be true of each single narrative was not necessarily what really happened.

As well as the clear signs of musical, linguistic and visual-spatial intelligence, the dynamic of this group suggested the presence of a high level of intrapersonal intelligence. The participants organized tasks efficiently at the beginning and then worked alone before finally collaborating once more in the editing stage.

V FINDINGS

Our goal was to create a collaborative learning environment to help students and teachers share their knowledge and develop new competencies. In particular, since we already knew that this approach works for the millennial generation, we wanted to see whether in this context, the teachers would learn technological skills from their students and reappraise their concept of learning.

We have been able to observe through the group projects how participants were able to interpret the texts through the use of multiple intelligences. Examples of the variety of learning and creative preferences could be found in all projects: Linguistic and Visual-Spatial (project n.1); Bodily-Kinesthetic (project n.2); Interpersonal (project n.3); logical-mathematical (project n.4); Intrapersonal and Musical (Project n.6th). Naturalist intelligence was also present in one of the projects lost due to the computer virus. We retain a video that was part of this project where a butterfly is the main character. (http://www.gilardi.eu/IMG_9049mariposa.mov), the video clearly shows sensitivity to natural phenomena.

Through a questionnaire answered by the participants we have been able to better define our framework. Most of the respondents think that the best size for this kind of project is of four people because if there are too many it becomes difficult to organize the work and assign roles.

Sharing knowledge and ideas seemed to be what people most appreciated. Participants made similar points about this throughout the questionnaire. When asked about what worked well within the group one student answered “The rain of ideas” while another wrote that the possibility to encounter so many different perspectives and ideas about a single topic and the
fact that everyone had different abilities to offer was the best part of the group dynamic. This is not necessarily always an easy task. One student for example was affected by the fact that it was sometimes difficult to mediate the ideas of everybody to reach a final group goal, while another one underlined the fact that sometimes people were negative about the ideas of the others or tried to impose their own ideas.

It seems however that this problematic was well solved within the group. When asked about what they considered to be one of the key skills that teachers were able to impart to the students, the same respondent answered that it was “to respect everybody’s ideas”.

We are unable from the data collected to say, however, if teachers developed digital technical skills or not. We can say from the feedback received during the workshop and from some comments in the questionnaires that some of them developed an interest in using online software such as Prezi, but the data are not sufficient to confirm that teachers developed or will develop technical skills due to their involvement in this project.

Nonetheless, three reasons make us reasonably confident that many of the teachers will develop their technological skills. The first reason is that the questionnaire showed that teachers increased their awareness of the potential applications of digital technology in the classroom.

The second reason is that teachers evinced a clear desire to learn how to use technology that has immediate practical use in teaching. During the week we spent creating Transmedia projects we also convened a separate workshop for teachers that introduced an online learning tool called Memrise. During this workshop the teachers created their own online learning courses for their particular subjects – Spanish literature, English literature and French.

The third reason we expect teachers to improve their technological competence is that there is a precedent. The authors of this paper have learned how to edit videos, upload them to Youtube, and utilize a variety of Virtual Learning Environments to host Transmedia products and message boards. Finally, although it may be the case that some of the teachers do not develop their own technological competence, teachers realized that it is pedagogically useful to utilize the creativity and digital skills of their students.

We believe that this generation of students will be the ones to revolutionize the educational sphere, just as their online social preferences have shaped the creation of entertainment media. It is vital, therefore, that educators attempt to stay ahead of the technological curve by observing the socially connected Internet spaces that teens inhabit, and as a result design teaching systems that encompass the multiple intelligences on display.

VI REFERENCES


WHAT ARE THE FACTORS THAT AFFECT THE TRAINING OF ADULT EMPLOYEES IN THE UNIVERSITIES OF MID-EGYPT ON ICT

Hendy, Mohamed H.
Beni Suef University
Egypt

ABSTRACT

The mean purpose of this study was to identify the factors that affect the training of adult employees who work in the universities of Mid-Egypt on information and communication technology (ICT). To investigate this purpose, a research questionnaire was developed in respect to the most famous factors that affect the training on ICT; and then was distributed to a random sample of adult employees in Mid-Egypt universities. After collecting and analyzing the research data, the results revealed that there were many factors affecting the training on ICT. The most important factors came to belong to ICT infrastructure, prepared computer labs, updated hardware and software, technical problems, ICT maintenance, and the internet access points. Moreover, several factors have been found to belong to adult employees, as ICT trainees, such as self-confidence, self-satisfaction, previous background on ICT, having a personal computer, training needs, and adults' anxiety to share in ICT training programs.

INTRODUCTION

The rapid advances in the field of information and communication technology (ICT) as well as the need to perform the institutional extensive work effectively have encouraged all social and educational institutes to functionalize the ICT resources and applications in innovative ways. Regarding the field of education, ICT generally is a multidisciplinary field that has inherent prospects and problems similar to any other applications. Carrasco-Embuena and Hernandez-Amoros (2012) explained that the use of ICT resources in the field of education has become a challenge that contributes to its improvement on all levels, particularly in higher education. Hatlevik (2011) explained that since 2006, the ability to use ICT has been one of the essential competencies in the educational field.

In higher education field, ICT resources have been used inside universities and colleges to conduct several very important tasks related to teaching and learning, research, and administrative tasks and works etc. So, all individuals of the university community should be aware of ICT resources, innovations, and competencies needed to functionalize and apply them. Many studies and researches indicated that the complete success of ICT inside higher education institutes depends on several factors related to ICT users, hardware and software, accesses, equipment and labs etc.

In respect to ICT users within educational institutes, there are several personal factors, as well as the institutional factors, that affect their using of ICT such as academic specialization, previous knowledge and experience, level of continuing training and professional development...etc. Even when they are invited to participate in training programs on ICT, there are also several factors that affect and prevent them from participating in those programs. Research recommends that diagnostic studies should continue to explore and
identify the factors that affect and prevent trainees, especially adults, in all fields from participating in those programs held for them. Accordingly this study tried to identify the factors that affect the ICT training of adult employees who work in the universities of Mid-Egypt.

STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM:

With the beginning of the third millennium, the ministry of higher education in Egypt supported all Egyptian public universities to have a unit under the title of Information and Communication Technology Project (ICTP) to enhance the teaching and learning process, research, and administrative works. This unit includes: Electronic Learning Center, Digital Library System, ICT Training Center, Electronic Portal, Network Unit, and Management Information System. So, one of those is the ICT Training Center that offers several training programs and workshops for the whole university community (faculties, students, and employees and administrative staff) to help them develop their skills and competences that are required and necessary to do their job tasks perfectly.

Regarding employees inside the Egyptian universities, most of young individuals, who were recently graduated and have been accepted to work permanently in the university colleges and units, are using ICT equipment in performing their tasks effectively, and ready to participate in ICT training programs held by the university ICT training center. On the other hand, adult employees are affected by several factors to participate in those such programs. Accordingly, the current study tried to answer the following two questions:

1. What are the factors that affect the training of adult employees who work in the universities of Mid-Egypt on ICT?

2. Are there differences among responses of the university adult employees that can return to their type of gender and level of education?

THEORETICAL BACKGROUND AND REVIEW OF LITERATURE

INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY (ICT):

Theoretically and practically, ICT now is more than a concept or a procedure, it is a system. Williams and Sawyer (2003) described it as a system that includes six main aspects which are hardware, software, people, data/information, procedures, and communication tools. They added that all these aspects are essential and should be integrated together to be functionalized and applied effectively in any field of life.

Currently, most educational institutes, whether in higher education or in pre-higher education, are provided with more ICT resources than ever before. This is based on the fact that ICT plays several roles inside educational institutes such as shorten the time needed to teach, to access data and information, to conduct research, and to perform administrative tasks. Moreover, the research found that ICT allows individuals to interact more together through using texts, audios, graphics...etc.; and then attain good learning and training. Hock, Chia, Ting, and Lim (2011) found that using ICT tools enhanced the learning environment and
helped students work collaboratively within and outside the classroom. Carrasco-Embuena and Hernandez-Amoros (2012) found that diffusion of using ICT inside university colleges and units is the starting point for moving forward and improving quality of instructional process in higher education. Miguel, Martin, Maldonado, and Nito (2011) explained that using ICT resources inside university campus allows individuals to play an active role and enables a higher number of professionals to perform lifelong learning which is recognized as an essential element of the European Higher Education. Maldonado, Martin, Lopez-Miguel, and Martinez-Almedia (2011) stated that using ICT resources in higher education institutes help to develop innovative educational programs.

In respect to the importance of ICT for employees and administrative staff inside universities, the words listed by Pool (2000) around the importance of ICT can be applied to them. He stated that using ICT effectively can help people be more dynamic in work, better communicators, more qualified in information access, more controllers in their work, more in their attention, more in flexibility and sensitivity, faster in work, and more enjoyed. In addition, through using ICT in performing higher education tasks, individuals of the whole university community use email, video conference, wikis, social networking, and text messaging to develop their target language in contact with their peers within the same field of work and in other work places. In this context Clarke’s study (1999) found that using an ICT guide to train adults helped them be aware of its resources and implications.

Generally, realizing the effect of ICT on the workplace and everyday life, today’s educational institutions try to restructure their educational curricula and classroom facilities, in order to bridge the gap in educational process. This restructuring process requires effective adoption of technologies into existing environments in order to provide learners and trainees with knowledge of a specific subject area, to promote meaningful learning, and to enhance professional productivity (Buabeng-Andoh, 2012 and Tomei, 2005).

TRAINING OF THE UNIVERSITY ADULT EMPLOYEES ON ICT:

Generally, training takes place after initial education or entry into working life and aims to help people update their knowledge and skills or acquire new ones. Concerning adults, training attempts to serve as a means of keeping their minds fresh and helps them be innovative in their fields. Therefore, according to Knowles (1984), the more traditional pedagogical models of training are inappropriate for use with adults especially in the field of developing ICT skills. This is based on the assumption that adults have a rich reservoir of experience that serve as a resource for training and learning, tend to be self-directed, tend to have a life-problem centered orientation to training and learning, and are generally motivated to learn due to internal factors.

Moreover, it has been inferred from several previous literatures and real adult training situations that there are several principles that can be behind the training of adults. Some of these are:

- a rich body of experience is essential for training to occur best,
- experiences yield explicit knowledge only if reflected upon,
- individuals learn best when focusing primarily on the goals of their training,
• effective training occurs best if trainees understand early what is to be learned and how it is to be learned, and
• purposeful practices are a more effective means of training and learning than less focused and less disciplined efforts.

However, Hentz, Dzubinski, Davis, and Nicolaides (2012) stated that adults are faced with multiple, often competing, demands from work, education, family, and leisure, which require adult education programs to carefully consider how best to meet these changing needs. Hentz and Others’ study found that responsive and dynamic graduate programs in adult education for 21st century should support the cultivation of critical and timely reflection, create online learning environments predicated on intentional community and mutuality, and for foreground the relationship between adult learning and developmental capacity to prepare adult education facilitators who stand confidently in the face of complexity and ambiguity.

Concerning training on ICT, it helps adult trainees understand the basic ICT skills and competences, overcome the challenges that meet performing ICT-based tasks, and attain technological literacy. Research has found that ICT training can appear in several personal aspects. Czaja, Lee, Branham, and Remis (2012) found that there is a significant increase in computer and internet knowledge and comfort with computers among the adults who received training on ICT resources. Wang, Lockee, and Burton (2012) found that most of adults, who participated in an interview about the importance of computer games, perceived computer game play positively. The participants believed that playing computer games contributed to their learning of computer skills and improved their life satisfaction.

Since the institutional and administrative tasks inside universities need new technological skills, the employees and administrative staff, as a component of the whole university community, should be learned, trained, and well acquainted with how to use, functionalize, and apply ICT in their positions effectively. Training programs on ICT should be held to help them improve their skills and competencies, solve their job problems, and develop their personal competencies in accordance with their training needs related to the effective use of technology in their positions. Those ICT and personal competencies surely help them be familiar with the new technological innovations.

However, although there are many investments in ICT in the educational field, there are many factors that have been found to affect training on and using of ICT such as attitudes towards technology (Tondeur, Valcke, and Van, 2008; Hock and others, 2008), and institutional support of ICT (Neyland, 2011). Schiller (2003) explained that personal characteristics such educational level, age, gender, educational experience, experience with the computer for educational purposes, and attitude towards computers can influence the adoption of technology in the educational field. Buabeng-Andoh (2012) explained that access to computers and updated software and hardware are key elements to successful use of technology in the educational field. A study by Yildirim (2007) found the access to technological resources is one of the effective ways to use ICT in the educational process. Pina and Harris (1993) found that there is a close relationship between the level of confidence to use ICT and the amount and quality of training available. McCarney’s study (2004) found that there is a need for a much greater emphasis to be placed on the pedagogy of ICT.
Despite those factors affecting training on and using of ICT resources differ from country to another (British Educational Communication and Technology Agency (BECTA), 2004), the issue is taking place either nationally or internationally. So any literatures and study results around this issue, like other issues, should be exchanged and discussed locally, nationally, and internationally to get more solutions and overcome the related problems.

PURPOSE AND OBJECTIVES/QUESTIONS:

Based on the belief that there is a gap between young and adult employees in the Egyptian Universities regarding their levels of participation in ICT training programs, the mean purpose of this study was set to identify the factors that affect the training of adult employees who work in the universities of Mid-Egypt on ICT. The specific objectives/questions of the study were a) to identify the factors that affect the training of adult employees on ICT; and b) to explore if there are differences among the responses of the adult employees that can return to some demographic variables (type of gender and level of education).

METHODOLOGY:

The target population of this study was the adult employees who worked in the Mid-Egypt universities (Beni Suef, Fayoum, and Minia Universities) through the academic year of 2012/2013. The criterion for those employees to take part in this study was that they must have completed at least 20 years working inside the university. A research sample was chosen randomly from among this target population. It consisted primarily of 320 adult employees; the final number of respondents was n = 252 persons.

The research data was collected through using a questionnaire which was developed to include (28) items that were developed from thorough review of the literature regarding the most famous factors that affect the training on ICT in the educational field (BECTA, 2004, Tondeur and others, 2008; Hock and others, 2008; Buabeng-Andoh, 2012). Those questionnaire items were distributed under three subtitles; a) factors belong to ICT training environment; that included 8 items, b) factors belong to ICT resources; that included 8 items, and c) factors belong to adult employees as ICT trainees; that included 12 items. Concerning the type of response to the questionnaire items, a three-point response scale was used (1-weak important, 2-important, 3-high important) in order to determine the participants' general beliefs about the items. In addition, three demographic questions were presented to the participants to respond to; those came on gender, age, and the highest level of education.

The questionnaire was controlled regarding validity and reliability. For the face validity, the questionnaire was submitted to a panel of experts in adult training and the ICT field. The panel was asked to review and provide a feedback on the instrument regarding the clarity of the statements, the relevance of each statement to the main title of the questionnaire and subtitles inside the questionnaire, the length of the whole questionnaire, and the additional suggestions that can improve the content of the questionnaire. Several comments from the panel were used to improve the quality of the instrument. Concerning the reliability, a pilot study was conducted with 22 randomly selected adult employees from the target population.
Those participants were not included in the research sample. However, the estimate reliability for the questionnaire, using Cronbach’s alpha, was 0.74.

After controlling the validity and reliability of the research instrument, it was distributed to the research sample of 320 adult employees in the Mid-Egypt three universities to collect the data. Two hundred fifty-two employees completely responded resulting in a 78.75 percent response rate. Concerning gender, 139 males responded with an average present of 55.16% and 113 females responded with an average percent of 44.84%. In respect to the level of education, 32 respondents came to have a secondary/postsecondary degree with an average percent of 12.7%, 192 respondents came to have a bachelor degree with an average percent of 76.2%, and 28 respondents came to have a graduate degree with an average percent of 11.1%. The data were entered and analyzed using computerized analysis software (Statistical Package for Social Sciences, SPSS) to calculate and present the study results.

RESULTS:

RESEARCH QUESTION 1: WHAT ARE THE FACTORS THAT AFFECT THE TRAINING OF THE ADULT EMPLOYEES WHO WORK IN THE UNIVERSITIES OF MID-EGYPT ON ICT?

To answer this question, descriptive statistics (frequencies and percentages) of the adult employees' responses for each statement were gotten using SPSS and listed in tables 1, 2, and 3 according to the subtitles of the questionnaire as follow:

A - Regarding the factors related to ICT training environment:

It is shown from table (1) that the high frequencies came to be between the two choices of “important” and “highly important” on the factors related to: the preceded information available on ICT training programs, ICT infrastructure, the preceded arranged schedule for ICT training programs, the extensive work in university colleges and units, and the existing of maintenance specialists in the work place. On the other hand, the high frequencies came under the choice of “weakly important” on the factors related to: the general university interest regarding the training on ICT, the university unit in which the employee is working, and the real need for ICT in work field.

B- Regarding the factors related to ICT resources:

It is shown from table (2) that the highest frequencies and percentages, came to be under the choice of “highly important” on all factors related to ICT resources except the factor number (7) which came around the extensive and varied fields of training in ICT that had the highest frequencies and percentage as a “weakly important” factor.

C - Regarding the factors related to adult employees as ICT trainees.

It is shown from table (3) that the highest frequencies and percentages came under the choice of “highly important” on all factors related to adult employees as ICT trainees.
RESEARCH QUESTION 2: ARE THERE DIFFERENCES AMONG RESPONSES OF THE UNIVERSITY ADULT EMPLOYEES THAT CAN RETURN TO THEIR TYPE OF GENDER AND LEVEL OF EDUCATION?

To answer this question, differences in perceptions of the adult employees regarding their beliefs about factors affecting their participation in ICT training programs were compared based on type of gender and the level of education using Chi Square test for association with alpha level of $p = .05$.

Tables 4, 5, and 6 explain the values of Chi Square regarding gender (1-male, 2-female) and level of education (1-secondary/postsecondary, 2-bachelor, 3- graduate degree) for each statement under the questionnaire subtitles as follow:

A- Regarding the factors related to ICT training environment:

It is shown in the first column of table (4) that there were no significant differences between responses of the adult employees that can return to the type of gender except the factor number 6 which came around the extensive work in university colleges and units. This according to comparing the obtained Chi Square value of (6.332) with the critical Chi Square value of (5.991) with level of $p = .05$, and where the degree of freedom is 2.

Also it is shown in the second column of table (4) that there were no significant differences among responses of the adult employees that can return to the level of education (1-secondary/postsecondary, 2-bachelor, 3- graduate degree).

B: Regarding the factors related to ICT resources:

It is shown in the first column of table (5) that there were no significant differences among responses of the adult employees on the factors related to ICT resources that can return to the type of gender because all Chi Square values here are less than the critical value of (5.991) with level of $p = .05$, and where the degree of freedom is 2.

Also it is shown in the second column of table (5) that there were no significant differences among responses of the adult employees that can return to the level of education except one factor which came around the extensive and varied fields of training in ICT. This according to comparing the obtained Chi Square value of (13.650) with the critical Chi Square value of (9.488) with level of $p = .05$, and where degree of freedom is 4.

C: Regarding the factors related to adult employees as ICT trainees.

It is shown in the first column of table (6) that there were no significant differences among responses of the adult employees that can return to the type of gender except two factors which came around the personal and family extensive work, and the allowed time to participate in ICT training programs. This according to comparing the obtained Chi Square values of (7.223) and (6.412) respectively with the critical Chi Square value of (5.991) with level of $p = .05$, and where the degree of freedom is 2.

Also it is shown in the second column of table (6) that there were significant differences among responses of the adult employees, regarding their levels of education, on the factors
related to shying to participate in ICT training, the previous background about ICT, the previous degree on ICT, and the adults’ anxiety to share in training programs on ICT. While there were no significant differences regarding the rest of factors listed in the table number 6. This is according to comparing the obtained Chi Square values with the critical Chi Square value of (9.488) with level of \( p = .05 \), and where the degree of freedom is 4.

**DISCUSSION:**

Concerning the first research question, it is obvious from tables 1, and 2 that respondents focused on the importance of many factors related to the ICT training environment and resources. Among those factors are: ICT infrastructure, prepared computer labs, updated hardware and software, ICT maintenance, and the internet access points, the multiple problems of ICT, the preceded arranged schedule for ICT training programs. These results came to be consistent with what Buabeng-Andoh (2012) explained regarding the importance of access to computers and updated software and hardware as the key elements to successful technology in the educational field. Also these results consisted relatively with the results of Yildrim’s study (2007) that found the access to technological resources as one of the effective ways to use ICT in the educational process. The results also consisted with what Snoeyink and Ertmer (2001) explained regarding the technical problems as a barrier to the successful use of technology in education and what Kirkwood, Vand Der Kuyl, Parton, and Grant (2000) noted regarding the difficulty of reconciling a training program which may require individuals in their own time; and then the training programs should be arranged and scheduled in early time.

Moreover, it is obvious from table (3) that respondents focused on the importance of many factors related to the adult employees as ICT trainees such as:

a) The self-confidence to use ICT; the result that consisted with that of Pina and Harris’s study (1993) which explored the close relationship between the level of confidence to use ICT and the amount and quality of training available.

b) The previous enough background and education on ICT; the results that came to be consistent with what Schiller (2003) explained regarding the importance of personal characteristics such educational level, educational experience, experience with the computer for educational purposes, and with what McCarney’s study (2004) found regarding that there is a need for a much greater emphasis to be placed on the pedagogy of ICT.

c) The existing of a personal computer; the result that consisted with the opinion of Buabeng-Andoh (2012) in respect to the importance of access to computers and with what Yildrim (2007) explored in respect to the importance of access to technological resources.

d) Self-motivation and self-satisfaction of training on and using of ICT in work; the result that came to be consistent with what Schiller (2003) explained regarding the attitudes towards computers that can influence the adoption of technology in the educational field.

e) The allowed time to participate in ICT training programs; the result that consisted with what Snoeyink and Ertmer (2001) and BECTA (2004) pointed out to the lack of training on ICT as one of strong barriers to use of ICT in educational field.
f) The real training needs for training on ICT; the result that came to be consistent with what Preston, Cox, and Cox (2000) focused on training needs that will continue to be an essential element of training on ICT skills.

h) Adults’ anxiety to learn with younger employees in the same training programs on ICT; the result that consisted with the results of Larner and Timberlake (1995), Miller and Connors (1996), and Truveria (2000) that explored the teachers (as adults) anxiety of using ICT in education.

Looking at the above results, we find it is logical that all these factors came to be important because they are essentials for training on and using of ICT in educational institutions. So they have come to be important factors as the above studies explored.

Concerning the second research question, it is obvious from tables 4, 5, and 6 that there were no significant differences between the responses of the employees in respect to the majority of factors that can return to their type of gender. From the total of 28 items, only three statements/factors had differences in responses by gender. Those factors are: the extensive work inside university colleges and units, the personal and family extensive work, and the allowed time to participate in ICT training programs. By looking at these three factors, we find that they are much related and naturally to find differences between the responses of males and responses of females; because females always feel busy more than males.

Also, it is obvious that there were no significant differences among responses of the employees that can return to the level of education in respect to the majority of factors listed above. From the total of 28 statements, only 5 factors had differences in responses according to the level of education. These factors are: the extensive and varied fields of training on ICT, shying to participate in ICT training, the previous background about ICT, the previous degree on ICT, and the adults’ anxiety to share in training programs on ICT. The higher frequencies and percentages for those factors belonged to the respondents with a lower level of education. The researcher finds this is naturally because the respondents with higher level of education recognize these factors well and may be find them to be simple, so they perceived them as less important.

CONCLUSIONS, RECOMMENDATIONS, AND INTERNATIONAL IMPLICATIONS:

CONCLUSIONS:

Based on the above results and discussion, it can be concluded that:

− There were many factors belonging to ICT training environment and resources and they affect the training of the university adult employees. The most important factors came to be related to ICT infrastructure, prepared computer labs, updated hardware and software, technical problems, maintenance, the internet access points, and the preceded arranged schedule for ICT training programs.
− There were many factors belonging to the adult employees themselves as ICT trainees and they affect their training such as self-confidence, previous background, having a personal computer, self-motivation, self-satisfaction, allowed time, real
training needs, and adults’ anxiety to share young employees in the same training programs on ICT.

− There were no significant differences between the responses of the adult employees to the majority of the factors that can return to their type of gender. Just three factors had significant differences in responses of male and female respondents.
− There were no significant differences among the responses of the adult employees to the majority of the factors that can return to their level of education. Just five factors had significant differences that can return to their level of education.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Based on the above results and conclusions, the study presents the following recommendations:

− Offering and presenting enough information about ICT training programs to trainees many months ahead.
− Insuring the existing of enough ICT infrastructure, maintenance, computer labs, updated hardware and software, internet access points to the training places
− Designing ICT training programs and workshops based on the real training needs of the employees.

INTERNATIONAL IMPLICATIONS:

Regardless of the level and type of the factors explored through this study, the results of this study, from the researcher’s point of view, can be beneficial for:

− The international organizations and institutes which are interested in preparing international reports on technology and education around the entire world.
− The researchers who conduct comparative international studies related to training on and using of ICT in education in developed and developing countries.
− The international agents that are interested in offering international training programs and workshops on ICT skills; to be based on real needs.
− The international specialists in technology and education through discussing the barriers to the use of ICT internationally.

REFERENCES:


ANNEXES

Table 1. Frequencies and percentages of the adult employees’ responses in respect to the factors related to ICT training environment (n=252)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item No.</th>
<th>Factors related to ICT training environment</th>
<th>Weak</th>
<th>Important</th>
<th>High</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>f</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>f</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>The preceded information available on ICT training programs.</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>19.4</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>The ICT infrastructure that can encourage training on ICT.</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The general university interest regarding the training on ICT.</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Item No.</td>
<td>Factors related to ICT training resources</td>
<td>Weak</td>
<td>Important</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>f</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>f</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>The existing of enough hardware that can encourage attending ICT training programs.</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>The existing of varied software that can encourage attending ICT training programs.</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>19.0</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The suitability of the current software for the new training needs.</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>21.4</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>The high costs of maintaining the hardware and software.</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>30.6</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>The existing of internet access points in employees’ work places.</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>The prepared computer labs for training on ICT.</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>The extensive and varied fields of training on ICT.</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>45.2</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>The multiple and varied technical problems related to using ICT that need continuing maintenance.</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>16.3</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2. Frequencies and percentages of adult employees in respect to factors related to ICT resources (n=252)
### Table 3. Frequencies and percentages of adult employees in respect to factors related to them as ICT trainees (n=252)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item No.</th>
<th>Factors related to adult employees as ICT trainees</th>
<th>Weak f</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Important f</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>High f</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Self-confidence as an ICT trainee and user.</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>12.3</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>34.9</td>
<td>133</td>
<td>52.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Shying to participate in ICT training programs like other programs.</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>27.8</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>29.4</td>
<td>108</td>
<td>42.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The previous enough background about ICT resources.</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>13.1</td>
<td>189</td>
<td>75.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Having a personal computer.</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>15.1</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>14.3</td>
<td>178</td>
<td>70.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>The previous degree or certificate on ICT and how to use it.</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>17.5</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>24.2</td>
<td>147</td>
<td>58.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Self-motivation to use ICT in work.</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>21.4</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>20.6</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>58.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Self-satisfying by using ICT resources in work.</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>27.0</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>22.2</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>50.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>The personal and family extensive work.</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>20.2</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>27.0</td>
<td>133</td>
<td>52.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>The allowed time to participate in ICT training programs.</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>16.2</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>31.0</td>
<td>133</td>
<td>52.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Incentives for the employees to participate in ICT training programs.</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>26.6</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>28.2</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>45.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>The real training needs for training on ICT.</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>215</td>
<td>85.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Adults’ anxiety to share young employees in the same training programs on ICT.</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>21.0</td>
<td>157</td>
<td>62.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 4. Chi Square values regarding gender and level of education (n=252), gender (male=139, female=113), level of education (secondary/postsecondary=32, bachelor degree=192, and graduate degree=28)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item No.</th>
<th>Factors related to ICT training environment</th>
<th>Chi Square</th>
<th>Regarding Gender</th>
<th>Regarding the level of education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>The preceded information available on ICT training programs.</td>
<td>0.211</td>
<td>4.009</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>The ICT infrastructure that can encourage training on ICT.</td>
<td>0.063</td>
<td>2.435</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The general university climate in respect to the training on ICT.</td>
<td>0.019</td>
<td>1.759</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>The nature of the university unit in which the employee is working.</td>
<td>0.303</td>
<td>0.437</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>The preceded arranged schedule for ICT training programs.</td>
<td>0.274</td>
<td>0.241</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>The extensive work inside university colleges and units.</td>
<td>6.332*</td>
<td>0.032</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>The real need for ICT in work.</td>
<td>1.160</td>
<td>1.002</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>The existing of maintenance specialists in the work place.</td>
<td>0.195</td>
<td>2.432</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Significant according to comparing with the critical Chi Square value where degree of freedom is 2 for the first column, and 4 for the second column.
Table 5. Chi Square values regarding gender and level of education in respect to factors related to ICT resources (n=252), gender (male=139, female=113), level of education (secondary/postsecondary=32, bachelor degree=192, and graduate degree=28)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item No.</th>
<th>Factors related to ICT resources</th>
<th>Chi Square values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Regarding gender</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>The existing of enough hardware that can encourage attending ICT training programs.</td>
<td>0.202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>The existing of varied software that can encourage attending ICT training programs.</td>
<td>0.021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The inappropriate current software for the new training needs.</td>
<td>0.182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>The high costs of maintaining the hardware and software.</td>
<td>0.521</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>The existing of internet access points in employees’ work places.</td>
<td>0.318</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>The prepared computer labs for training on ICT.</td>
<td>0.711</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>The extensive and varied fields of training in ICT.</td>
<td>0.632</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>The multiple and varied problems related to using ICT that need continuing maintenance.</td>
<td>0.410</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Significant according to comparing with the critical Chi Square value.

Table 6. Chi Square values regarding gender and level of education in respect to factors related to trainees’ characteristics (n=252), gender (male=139, female=113), level of education (secondary/postsecondary=32, bachelor degree=192, and graduate degree=28)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item No.</th>
<th>Factors related to adult employees as ICT trainees</th>
<th>Chi Square values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Regardin g gender</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Self-confidence in ICT resources regarding the quick performance.</td>
<td>1.045</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Shying to participate in ICT training programs like other programs.</td>
<td>0.061</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The previous enough background about ICT resources.</td>
<td>0.139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Having a personal computer.</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>The previous degree or certificate on ICT and how to use it.</td>
<td>0.664</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Self-motivation to use ICT in work.</td>
<td>0.122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Self-satisfying of using ICT resources in work.</td>
<td>2.321</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>The extensive personal and family work.</td>
<td>7.223*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>The allowed time to participate in ICT training programs.</td>
<td>6.412*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Incentives for the employees to participate in ICT training programs.</td>
<td>.543</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>The real training needs for training on ICT.</td>
<td>.025</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Adults’ anxiety to share young employees in the same training programs on ICT.</td>
<td>.212</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Significant according to comparing with the critical Chi Square value.
WORKERS’ TRAINING USING THE E-LEARNING METHODOLOGY THROUGH ENTREPRENEURS CONFEDE RATIONS IN SPAIN

Hernández Carrera, Rafael M.
University of Seville
Spain

ABSTRACT

Workers’ Training is a theme that is present in the most current academic and political debates. It plays a very important role in educational, economical, business and social development in our environment. What’s more, Lifelong Learning and Adult Learning should form the backbone of these educational processes. E-learning is a training methodology that is acquiring a special relevance in Workplace learning as well as public programmes for training for employment.

This study will go deeper into these concepts and is centred on a quantitative analysis of a Workers’ Training programme that has been managed using the eLearning methodology by one of the top entrepreneur associations in Spain. It is made up of two different parts: In the first part we will carry out an epistemological approach of training for workers and a definition of training for employment in Spain. The second section analyses a Training for Employment programme that has been developed by one of the principal Entrepreneur Associations in Spain.

To produce this research, a bibliographical study into Training for workers, Adult learning and Continuous Training has been carried out. Subsequently, the quantitative cross section methodology has been used to analyse the training programme of the Entrepreneur Confederation. It is based on the analysis of the questionnaires that are completed by the students when they complete any course related to Training for Employment. 15,000 questionnaires have been analysed on the basis of 10 categories / dimensions.

In this paper we will explain the main results of this research.

INTRODUCTION

Training in a company is an extremely important task if said company wants to have a future, this is even truer when considering the current European setting that is characterized by the largest economic crisis since 1929 and the constant closure of companies and businesses and the consequent job losses. Facing this scenario, a high level of adaptability is necessary, which requires a serious basic training. In the same way, important technical training is needed that is supported by cultural and scientific foundations that allow for the acquisition of new knowledge and skills that are increasingly more complex.

Due to the constant changes in our society and even more so in companies and the economy, this training needs to have a permanent character. In our opinion, Adult Education should be at the centre of these training needs, as it is aimed at adults – the workers. As we can see, Adult Education has its specific peculiarities, both in methodology and content.
One of the themes that identifies the current situation are the continuous changes that the globalized world that we live in is subjected to, where the transaction of goods and capital is continuous. In this setting, the general level of education and professional training of individuals becomes one of the main activities of a society that wants to be prepared and feel strong in a global village where everyone wants to provide their products and services. In this way, the more empowered, able to adapt to new requirements and capable of offering better services and products at a more economic price that a population is, the more advantages they will have over the rest of the actors that are taking part in this “play”.

It would have been much easier to explain this last part by saying that it would be a more competitive society, but we wanted to avoid this overused expression because normally competition and the struggle to win at all costs demonstrates that it is not an efficient alternative for establishment in the paradigm that has to govern the markets. We consider it to be more efficient to have a framework based on cooperation and building alliances between companies and organizations than based on competitiveness (which always works on the idea of competition and elimination of the other parties.) Competition only leads to competing, trying to gain the market at any cost, even though to achieve this we have to “smash prices”, tread on fundamental rights and sacrifice profitability, in both capital (company) and labour (the workers).

RESEARCH AIM

With this research we intend to reflect on Workers’ Training and on the repercussions that eLearning has on said training. We will specifically concentrate on the programmes that are developed by business associations, with our research dealing exclusively with the Worker’s Training programme by the Entrepreneurs Association of Andalusia, through which thousands of students / workers in Spain are trained in a multitude of productive sectors.

To do this, we will approach Worker’s Training from the perspective of Adult Education, a discipline that provides the backbone of any educational process that takes place during adulthood, as is the case with training in the work environment. We will carry out an analysis of the concept of Worker’s Training from the following points of view: productive, technological, cultural and personal achievement. We will try to discern the repercussions of this type of training on the growth and viability of the companies, and the growth as people of the workers themselves.

Finally, we will perform a quantitative research focusing on the analysis of the Worker’s Training that the Entrepreneurs Association of Andalusia (CEA) provides from an eLearning perspective.

In conclusion, with this study we hope to reflect on and explain clearly what Worker’s Training is, what possibilities exist when undertaking this task, what the role is of eLearning in this method as well as analysing a specific example of Worker’s Training through a public programme developed by a business association.
THEORETICAL STARTING POINT

WORKERS' TRAINING AND TRAINING FOR EMPLOYMENT

First of all, we would like to clarify what we mean by Workers' Training. When we say workers, we are taking into account both blue collar workers and white collar workers, that is to say, those professionals in any field who provide services to a public or private company, or to the state itself, in exchange for a salary. Therefore, when we say Workers' Training, we take it to mean the educative processes that suppose a transformation in these individuals from multiple perspectives, concerning both personal and professional development. We can also include here the training processes aimed at developing certain skills related to job performance. We also want to emphasize that this type of training would include worker awareness towards problematic aspects within their work environment, when generating attitudes and increasing awareness of these injustices that can be corrected or resolved through civic actions or through the group that is made up of the workers themselves. An example of this could be insecurity in the labour market or the growing trend of privatization of services and the public enterprises that belong to the state. In short, Workers’ Training includes political, personal and instrumental training.

Moreover, this research also addresses the Training for Employment programme (FPE in Spanish). The FPE in Spain has traditionally distinguished the following three subsystems – Vocational Training, directed at young adults who wanted to learn a trade, although some adults also took part in these courses; Occupational Vocational Training (FPO), directed at unemployed workers; and Continuous Vocational Training, directed at active workers. These last two subsections were merged into one when the changes in the Royal Decree 395/2007, from the 23rd of March, which regulated the subsystem of Training for Employment were introduced. Currently there are 2 main initiatives for the FPE in Spain, one that is called On-Demand Training that is organised by companies according to their criteria, for which the costs that are involved in the training can be reclaimed afterwards in the payments that are made to Social Security. This means that the training could work out as free for the company. The other one is called On-Offer Training and is chosen freely by the workers who can choose from a range of training programmes that are provided by Trade Unions and Entrepreneurs Associations and that is funded by the contributions made to the Social Security by workers and entrepreneurs. With this type of training, On-offer training, the worker can openly choose the course that interests them without approval or knowledge of their company. In turn, On-offer training is subdivided into two types: one that is directed at unemployed workers (the old FPO), and one that is directed at active workers (previously called Continuous Training). Our research is limited to the latter method, the On-offer FPE that is principally aimed at active workers in the 2008 convocation that was developed during 2009 for the Andalusian Entrepreneurs Association.

So, being a Training for Employment programme, in which only adults have participated, we consider that the paradigms of adult education should be present.
ADULT EDUCATION AS A BASE FOR WORKERS’ TRAINING

Workers’ Training, as we have mentioned, is nothing more than an Adult Education process. So, it should be guided by the paradigms and characteristic of this type of education.

Firstly, we would like to highlight that adult learning is a type of learning based on experience, that is to say that an adult will not start a teaching process as a Tabula Rasa, an adult comes with a range of life events as well as educational and social experiences.

As well as the knowledge that has already been gained: To know, To know how to do and To know how to be, there is a fourth knowledge (Reggio 2010). This fourth knowledge is the experience, the capacity to learn from everyday life, experience in a practical way and as everyday learning. It's not the result of the sum of the other three; it has characteristics such as depth of thought and the generative relationship with the world. (Reggio 2010).

Illustration 1. The Fourth Knowledge: The Experience. Source: own elaboration

Learning based on experience is neither academic nor scholastic learning. It comes from everyday life, from relationships and socializing. Through the passage of time, as individuals we accumulate knowledge and awareness that allow us to become knowledgeable experts in the subject.

Production of a learning process is often initiated in an intuitive way, taking different elements and fragments. We understand things by making connections between different events and experiences that have occurred in different moments. The contribution of Paulo Freire on the role of experiences and how they influence adult educative processes is also of great interest:

Reflection on experiences is also connected to the development of the conscience, with this “concientization” as a process of recognizing man’s place in relation to the world, capable of interacting with it, of finding scientific and critical explanations for phenomenon and problems, and in this way, of developing humanity itself. (Freire, 1971, quoted in Reggio 2010).
ADULT TRAINING VS. ADULT EDUCATION

Adult education takes place in many different life aspects and scenarios, such as with the family, within the community that we belong to, with the company that we work for or the association that we participate in. Now, it is important to distinguish between Adult Training and Adult Education. In our opinion, the second option empowers the individuals to make their own decisions, think for themselves and to grow as a human being. The first prepares the individual to give preset replies. Collado, Pérez and Lucio-Villegas, (1994) commented that "Adult Education is a process that allows adults to learn, using an appropriate methodology, how to give personal answers in whatever situation they find themselves in."1

On the other hand, there are many occasions that call for a formative process as the consequence of the appearance of some form of new technology in the workplace or the implementation of a new production system in a company. In these cases we would obviously not be talking about Adult Education but Adult Training. We are not saying that this type of training is not necessary, if that were the case, we would stagnate in the productivity realities in a specific moment. As a result of its own evolution, of scientific research and innovation and development, companies change and their necessities change with them. This, in turn, requires a constant adaptation for all the elements that make up the company: workers, managers and employers. Ultimately, adaptation to change is simply learning a new reality. With this we do not want to say that all changes are good and that we have to accept them and adapt to them without another thought, forgetting about any critical view of them. What is evident, in our point of view, is that companies are constantly changing and the workers would be both irresponsible to themselves and to their personal reality to not adapt to these changes that will eventually happen in their company without trying to change those things that are considered inappropriate or unjust.

According to Collado (1994) Adult Education is not something that is taught compulsorily such as military instruction or business training that is not chosen freely by the worker. In the same way, any training that aims to replicate responses designed by others will not be considered Adult Education but Adult Training, regardless of whether this has been received at prestigious business schools.

This type of education should be supported by a substantially different methodology to what is used in child education. It should be a methodology that tries to rediscover potential of learning from everyday life of adults and that, based on these, systematize the experiences. We should not forget that it needs to be an educational process, and not merely training. That is to say, it should allow people to answer for themselves and not just repeat the answers that they have learnt from others. As we have said previously, this does not mean to say that there should not also be some component of instruction; we just want to show that this aspect should not be the protagonist, the educational process should be.

Therefore, we cannot present Adult Education as a merely instructive process. The adults should be the protagonists, based on their needs and interests, selecting the most appropriate methodologies to respond to them. Otherwise you run the risk of neglecting the

---

learning time dedicated to reflection and finding common solutions by being unable to systematize and share learning experiences. Using a schooling methodology usurps the person of their adulthood, understood as the ability to make decisions in a responsible, independent and mature way.

According to Ettore Gelpi (1994) Lifelong Learning can be understood to be both formal and non-formal education; both self-training and institutional learning; both initial training and ongoing training. In this sense, the continual and radical changes in the production systems, the globalization and internationalization phenomenon and the huge revolution of information and communication systems that fosters the emergence of new educational demands and innovative learning (as is the case with eLearning).

According to Tejedor and García (2012, page 5) “The educational world, as is to be expected, is receiving the impact of ICT in all areas: management, teaching and research”. Of course, ICT is also altering Lifelong Learning. As we will see below, eLearning is becoming one of the main teaching methods for Training for the Workplace.

On occasions, we hear voices that suggest that Workers’ Training must conform to instrumental aspects related solely to production. In our opinion, Workers’ Training should be viewed in a holistic way, as it is impossible to mark out where working life ends and personal life begins, as they are often interrelated.

Therefore, continuous training and lifelong learning are essential, whether that is in the world of work or in a person’s personal life, giving the individuals the necessary tools to face the changes that are seen on a daily basis. In the same way, a methodological approach becomes necessary and an epistemological starting point that is in harmony with the principles of adult learning and that allows them to consolidate the time dedicated to production with the time dedicated to personal life, cultural growth and leisure.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

Below we are going to analyze a Workers’ Training programme. More specifically, we will analyze the data corresponding to an On-Offer Training Programme that is aimed primarily at active workers within the 2008 convocation by the Andalusian Entrepreneurs Association, developed during the year 2009. This plan will hereafter be known as the Contract-Programme 2008 (It is the official name of this programme).

The purpose of this analysis is to discover the relative basic data for the different training actions, how they are conducted as well as the score that they receive on the basic of the student and teacher analysis taken from the Quality Assessment Questionnaires. Our study will be centred, first and foremost, on the eLearning method as the role of e-learning in Workers’ Training through business associations is the object of this report.

The collection and analysis of the data was performed using a quantitative method. So we could say that the positivist paradigm has a determining influence of this part of the research. It consisted of observation, analysis and deduction of the data contained in the Quality Assessment Questionnaires completed by students and teachers. This observation was
developed through the study of the different categories and items that were collected in said questionnaires.

**CATEGORIES**

The various items from the Quality Assessment Questionnaires are divided into a number of categories. Depending on the type of training conducted, the questionnaire will have more or less items and categories. The following is a list of the number of items that each group will have according to the type of learning process used:

- 29 items grouped into 6 categories for in class learning.
- 24 items grouped into 5 categories for distance learning.
- 32 items grouped into 6 categories for eLearning.
- 36 items grouped into 7 categories for blended learning.

Below we will present the various categories that are analysed in the questionnaires. As we have mentioned previously, depending on the method of training conducted, there will be more or less categories. In the same way, there are two different categories for the teachers. Here we can see them all, regardless of the method of training.

*Course / Training activity contents*

*Tutorial System*

*Methodology and applied teaching aids in the course / training activity*

*Technical Resources (in the case of eLearning)*

*Course / Training activity organization*

*Instructors*

*Technical Resources and Installations.*

*Overall Rating*

Meanwhile, in the case of teachers, there are two different categories, that are listed below:

*Attitude of the group during the course / training activity*

*Assimilation of the contents*

**DATA ANALYSIS**

The data analysis has been performed with the assistance of a computer programme called “Manager for the evaluation of Lifelong Learning”. It was developed with the purpose of dealing with the data that was taken from the Quality Assessment Questionnaires.

Students who take part in any course of the On-offer training programmes aimed at active workers from any of the entities who successfully achieved funds for this purpose, administered by the Employment Department of the Andalusian Government, have to fill in the Quality Assessment Questionnaire at the end of the course. These questionnaires are then transferred onto the servers of the Employment Department using the previously mentioned tool.
The obtained data, after being tabulated, has been subjected to a statistical analysis in order to obtain a series of average values representing the categories that were evaluated in the questionnaires.

RESULTS

Regarding the methods of teaching, the contract-programme by the Andalusian Entrepreneurs Association has developed courses using the four possible teaching methods: eLearning, In-class, Conventional Distance Learning and Mixed Learning.

In the following graph, we can see the percentages of courses that have been developed for each of the four existing methods.

![Graph 1. Percentage of courses, according to the teaching method.](Image)

QUESTIONNAIRE ANALYSIS

Below, we are going to analyse the data that has been taken from the questionnaires according to two variables. Firstly, taking into account the different defined categories and analysing each method of teaching: eLearning, In-class, Traditional Mixed, Blended and Distance. This will be followed by an analysis of the score that was received for each item in their respective categories. On this occasion, we will only be taking into account the eLearning method, which is the method that interests us here.

By calculating the average of the scores given by the students in each of the categories of the different methods of teaching (except with the category of “Overall Score”) we can see how the best valued method is the Mixed method (8.8), followed by the methods of eLearning (8.4), In-class (8.4) and Distance learning (8.4), in last place is the Blended learning method (8.1). Regardless of these scores, all are within an optimum level; over 8 points.
Meanwhile, if we find the mean score in the “Overall Score” category in each of the methods, including both the scores from the teachers as well as from the students, the data does not vary as to which are the best assessed methods although there is a rise in the scores in the methods with the lowest score. As we can see in the following graph, the mixed mode continues to be the highest valued mode and blended learning the least.

**Graph 2. Average Score in all the categories, according to the method of teaching.**

**Graph 3. Average score in the “Overall Score” category, including all the methods.**

**CATEGORY ANALYSIS BY ITEM (JUST ELEARNING)**

Below we are going to analyse the categories according to the score with which the students evaluated each item in the eLearning methodology.

Firstly, the data relating to the timetables that the courses were completed in is presented.
As we can see from the graph, 69% of the courses took place fully outside of the working hours, 4% took place during the working hours and 27% took place in both timetables. This has a certain logic as On Demand Training does not require the worker to receive authorization from their company, it is something that they can decide motu proprio and, as a result, they do not normally communicate them to their company. Due to this, many of the courses are completed by the workers outside of their working hours, without having to answer to anyone about their evolution, progress, performance, etc.

As for the main reason why workers choose to undertake a course, in an online format in this case, we can see what motivated this decision in the following graph.
When asked what the main reason for undertaking the course was, the majority of the students (39%) responded that they were doing it so as to expand their knowledge, acquiring skills that will result in professional career progression, that is to say, the majority see training as an opportunity to achieve a professional promotion.

Following this motivation, the next criteria of importance when taking a course was the acquisition of new skills that could be applied to the workplace. In other words, 25% of the students had refreshing their professional abilities as one of their main motivations for training.

In third place in the order of importance when deciding to undertake a course is the personal development of the individual. 19% of the students that undertook online courses within the
2008 Entrepreneurs Associations of Andalusia (CEA) programme did so for personal development.

A change of jobs (either within the same company or somewhere new) is another important motivation for undertaking a training course. This was expressed by 14% of students.

Only 2% of the students responded that their reason for undertaking the course was just out of a general interest for the company. This low percentage is justified not only by the motivation of the students themselves, but also due to this being an on-offer programme in which the company does not need to participate. Companies often cancel their training needs through On-demand Training (subsidized), but they also complement this type of training with On-offer plans.

Finally, 1% of the students undertook the course for reasons other than those stated previously.

Below we can see a table summarizing the mean score in each category. In this way, we can see a snapshot of the aspects that are most highly valued by students. The 5 highest scoring categories are featured.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Mean Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I Course Contents</td>
<td>8.82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II Tutorial System</td>
<td>8.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III Methodology and teaching resources</td>
<td>8.85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV Technical Resources</td>
<td>8.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V Course Organization</td>
<td>8.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Graph 6. Average score in each category.*

As a conclusion to this section, it is worth highlighting that, in general terms, the students gave an excellent assessment to eLearning format courses, with an average score of over 8 in all the categories. Other highlights came in the score that was given to the Tutorial System, which is perceived as the most interesting service in the whole training process.

**STATISTICAL ANALYSIS (E-LEARNING METHOD)**

Below is a basic statistical analysis of the questionnaires that were answered by the students who took a course in the eLearning format. From the questionnaire we can see the data about the size of the studied population, the size of the sample, the arithmetic mean obtained in each item, the Standard Deviation and Confidence Interval. With these results we aim to provide sufficient empirical support to the research.
### Table 1 eLearning Statistical Analysis – (statistical Indicators)

**Convocation: 08-eLearning**

#### Course / Training Activity Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item No.</th>
<th>Item Description</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>n(*)</th>
<th>average deviation</th>
<th>maximum</th>
<th>minimum</th>
<th>range</th>
<th>CI(95%)*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C.I.1</td>
<td>There is a correspondence between the objectives and the contents of the training action.</td>
<td>26380</td>
<td>15681</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8,25</td>
<td>1,4551</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>(8,23 - 8,28)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.I.2</td>
<td>The course / training action has an appropriate combination of theoretical and practical contents</td>
<td>26380</td>
<td>15689</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8,02</td>
<td>1,6960</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>(7,99 - 8,05)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.I.3</td>
<td>The course / training action contents respond to my training necessities.</td>
<td>26380</td>
<td>15633</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8,08</td>
<td>1,6678</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>(8,05 - 8,11)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.I.4</td>
<td>The contents are of practical application in the workplace</td>
<td>26380</td>
<td>15563</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7,61</td>
<td>2,2300</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>(7,58 - 7,65)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.I.5</td>
<td>The contents allow me to develop professionally or personally.</td>
<td>26380</td>
<td>15617</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8,18</td>
<td>1,6990</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>(8,15 - 8,20)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*: Confidence interval for an average with a significance level of 95%.

n(*): Sample size needed to obtain data reliability of 95%

#### Tutorial System

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item No.</th>
<th>Item Description</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>n(*)</th>
<th>average deviation</th>
<th>maximum</th>
<th>minimum</th>
<th>range</th>
<th>CI(95%)*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C.II.1</td>
<td>I have had a tutor who has guided me in a personalized way</td>
<td>26380</td>
<td>15576</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8,73</td>
<td>1,6189</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>(8,70 - 8,75)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.II.2</td>
<td>The tutor solved my doubts</td>
<td>26380</td>
<td>15435</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8,80</td>
<td>1,5931</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>(8,77 - 8,82)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.II.3</td>
<td>The tutor has been accessible, with a guaranteed response in a period of 24-48 hours</td>
<td>26380</td>
<td>15479</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>9,04</td>
<td>1,4175</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>(9,02 - 9,06)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.II.4</td>
<td>The tutorials included the correction of evaluations</td>
<td>26380</td>
<td>15328</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8,94</td>
<td>1,5796</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>(8,91 - 8,96)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.II.5</td>
<td>I received a tutorial guide that allowed me to easily deal with the course from the beginning</td>
<td>26380</td>
<td>15503</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8,96</td>
<td>1,3906</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>(8,94 - 8,98)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.II.6</td>
<td>The course has provided me with access to specialized teachers to consult.</td>
<td>26380</td>
<td>15289</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8,67</td>
<td>1,7132</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>(8,64 - 8,69)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*: Confidence interval for an average with a significance level of 95%.

n(*): Sample size needed to obtain data reliability of 95%

#### Methodology and teaching resources used in the course / training action
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item No.</th>
<th>Item Description</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>n</th>
<th>n(*)</th>
<th>average</th>
<th>deviation</th>
<th>maximum</th>
<th>minimum</th>
<th>range</th>
<th>CI(95%)*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C.III.1</td>
<td>The methodology used was appropriate for the contents</td>
<td>26380</td>
<td>15681</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8,25</td>
<td>1,5650</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>(8,23 - 8,27)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.III.2</td>
<td>The course was divided into teaching / competence units that have facilitated the learning process.</td>
<td>26380</td>
<td>15630</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8,48</td>
<td>1,4241</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>(8,46 - 8,50)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.III.3</td>
<td>The course included exercises, case studies or simulations that reinforced knowledge acquisition</td>
<td>26380</td>
<td>15612</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8,38</td>
<td>1,6276</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>(8,35 - 8,41)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.III.4</td>
<td>The course included periodic self evaluation tests that allowed me to see the level of understanding.</td>
<td>26380</td>
<td>15598</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8,65</td>
<td>1,3899</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>(8,63 - 8,67)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.III.5</td>
<td>The available documentation and materials (manuals, sheets, reports…) are clear and understandable.</td>
<td>26380</td>
<td>15603</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8,51</td>
<td>1,5475</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>(8,48 - 8,53)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.III.6</td>
<td>If audiovisual media was used (audio tapes, videos, DVDs, multimedia material…) these were useful for reinforcing the lessons</td>
<td>26380</td>
<td>14353</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8,18</td>
<td>2,0070</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>(8,15 - 8,21)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*: Confidence interval for an average with a significance level of 95%.

n(*): Sample size needed to obtain data reliability of 95%

---

Technical Resources (In the case of eLearning)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item No.</th>
<th>Item Description</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>n</th>
<th>n(*)</th>
<th>average</th>
<th>deviation</th>
<th>maximum</th>
<th>minimum</th>
<th>range</th>
<th>CI(95%)*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C.IV.1</td>
<td>Applications and telematics services were easy to use (browsing, audiovisual quality, page design and icons…)</td>
<td>26380</td>
<td>15563</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8,63</td>
<td>1,4755</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>(8,61 - 8,66)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.IV.2</td>
<td>The materials are adapted to the eLearning method.</td>
<td>26380</td>
<td>15484</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8,67</td>
<td>1,4233</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>(8,65 - 8,70)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.IV.3</td>
<td>There were auxiliary methods available that facilitated learning (email and distribution lists, teleconferences, virtual library, search bars…)</td>
<td>26380</td>
<td>15289</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8,40</td>
<td>1,6804</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>(8,37 - 8,42)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.IV.4</td>
<td>The system included communication modules that facilitated collaborative work (forums, chats, virtual campus…)</td>
<td>26380</td>
<td>15263</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8,31</td>
<td>1,7431</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>(8,28 - 8,34)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.IV.5</td>
<td>When necessary, the company has provided the participants with the necessary equipment for course development.</td>
<td>26380</td>
<td>14097</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7,51</td>
<td>2,6898</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>(7,47 - 7,55)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.IV.6</td>
<td>There was somewhere where I could exchange materials with the tutor.</td>
<td>26380</td>
<td>14927</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8,22</td>
<td>1,9544</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>(8,18 - 8,25)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.IV.7</td>
<td>Connection and response times were correct.</td>
<td>26380</td>
<td>15332</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8,62</td>
<td>1,5428</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>(8,59 - 8,64)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.IV.8</td>
<td>I had personalized materials and itineraries</td>
<td>26380</td>
<td>14911</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8,07</td>
<td>2,0179</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>(8,03 - 8,10)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*: Confidence interval for an average with a significance level of 95%.

n(*): Sample size needed to obtain data reliability of 95%
### Course / Training Action Organization

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item No.</th>
<th>Item Description</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>n</th>
<th>n(*)</th>
<th>average deviation</th>
<th>maximum</th>
<th>minimum</th>
<th>range</th>
<th>CI(95%)*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.V.1</td>
<td>The course organisation was efficient (inscription, sending of materials, information about technical requirements, information about auxiliary services and tutorials.)</td>
<td>26380</td>
<td>15585</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8,78</td>
<td>1,4037</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.V.2</td>
<td>The course offered a support service via telephone, email or virtual campus that allowed me to solve any technical problems.</td>
<td>26380</td>
<td>15322</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8,86</td>
<td>1,3921</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*: Confidence interval for an average with a significance level of 95%.

n(*): Sample size needed to obtain data reliability of 95%

### Overall Rating

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item No.</th>
<th>Item Description</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>n</th>
<th>n(*)</th>
<th>average deviation</th>
<th>maximum</th>
<th>minimum</th>
<th>range</th>
<th>CI(95%)*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.VI.1</td>
<td>The course / training action satisfied my expectations</td>
<td>26380</td>
<td>15745</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8,43</td>
<td>1,5756</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.VI.2</td>
<td>The course / training action has increased my knowledge and / or abilities</td>
<td>26380</td>
<td>15703</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8,50</td>
<td>1,5398</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.VI.3</td>
<td>It is going to help me do my job better</td>
<td>26380</td>
<td>15580</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7,79</td>
<td>2,1533</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.VI.4</td>
<td>It offers me job mobility possibilities</td>
<td>26380</td>
<td>15418</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7,42</td>
<td>2,4157</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.VI.5</td>
<td>My overall rating of the course / training action is good</td>
<td>26380</td>
<td>15667</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8,61</td>
<td>1,4545</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*: Confidence interval for an average with a significance level of 95%.

n(*): Sample size needed to obtain data reliability of 95%
CONCLUSIONS

In this study we have tried to do a specific analysis of a Worker’s Training programme from a numerical perspective. We also aimed to learn more about the data relative to the teaching methods as well as the efficiency and impact that all these questions have had on the people who have participated in the training.

We have conducted an analysis according to a number of categories that has given us some extremely valuable data regarding this programme. It shows that the majority of the Training Activities that were developed in the contract-programme by the Andalusian Entrepreneurs Association (CEA) in this convocation have been via eLearning. 52% of the courses were developed using this method. This quantity increases if we add the hours that have also been taught via eLearning in the blended learning method.

However, the teaching method that received the best score from the students was the mixed method (In class + conventional distance learning) although only a few hundredths separated it from the eLearning and In-class methods.

Of all the categories that were analysed in this study, the one that was rated best without a shadow of a doubt was the tutorial function. This places the teachers in a privileged position regarding the analysed questions. Focusing specifically on the eLearning method, it was also the best rated category. Students have shown that one of the most important questions regarding this question was the accessibility to the tutors as well as the speed with which they replied to the students. The second best rated category corresponds to the Organization of the Course. In third position, the online methodology itself and the teaching resources, this shows us the positive perception that the students have about this teaching method.

Another of the conclusions that has been taken from this study is that, in the immense majority of the training, 69%, the training took place outside of the working time. As we understand it, this is because on-offer training is freely chosen by the worker, without their company being involved in the choice, as their implication in this type of training is far less that in on-demand training. In the case of the latter, it is the company itself that decides which training actions to teach, although they have the obligation of communicating said decision to the Trade Unions within the company.

Another of the most interesting pieces of data, as we understand it that comes from this study is the reason why the workers decided to participate in the course. The main reason is related to professional development, that is to say that the worker wants to progress in their chosen profession. The large majority of the students pointed out that they were doing the course, principally, because it allowed them to broaden their knowledge and therefore progress in their degree. Following this, the next motivation for undertaking a course was retraining. In our view, the great economic crisis that we have been part of during the last few years has made people fear for their jobs and, for this reason, they are more concerned about training and retraining so as not to become obsolete in either knowledge or competence.

The third motivation for doing a course was personal development, in this sense; it is an “altruistic” motivation as it does not involve receiving any pecuniary gain in exchange for the training, as can occur in the case of professional promotion.
Finally, we would like to highlight the high average scores that were achieved in the majority of the categories. We understand this was motivated by the high quality that the programme achieved. This programme was carried out by an organisation that has spent almost 20 years providing Worker’s Training, which means they have gained important knowledge about how to organize the types of activities that are referred to here. On the other hand, it is very important to take into account the large amount of funds that the organisation manages for this need, which should mean that great concern and pulchritude of execution and rationale for the program is shown, both from the perspective of content and the of teaching and tutoring processes.

Independently of what was said before, we have to take into account that the eLearning sector in Spain is one of the most highly developed in the world. This is a consequence, among other reasons, of having large funds that have come from the public funding Continuous Training Programmes during these 20 years of its existence in the system, since the appearance of the 1st National Agreement for Continuous Training in 1992. This has meant that the quality of the contents, in both the pedagogical methods and the technological methods have developed in such a way that the level that exists these days is extremely high, which, in turn has contributed to the perception of the individuals who study using these services being equally as high.

Finally, we would like to indicate again, the enormous weight that eLearning has throughout this entire Worker’s Training Project, which shows the sensitivity and interest that the Andalusian Entrepreneurs Association has for this methodology.

**BIBLIOGRAPHY**

ALHEIT, P. (s.f.). *La entrevista narrativa*. Manuscript translation by José González Monteagudo.


NEW CONFIGURATIONS OF GUIDANCE AND COUNSELLING – FROM SUPPORT FOR INDIVIDUAL DECISIONS TO A GOVERNANCE TOOL?

Käpplinger, Bernd
Humboldt-University Berlin
Germany

1. INTRODUCTION

Guidance and counselling receive a lot of attention within the discourse on lifelong learning (c. Watts/Sultana 2004, ELGPN 2012). Out of a policy-making perspective, it has been ‘catapulted to the front’ (McCarthy 2007) in order to mobilize adults to learn. A high number of new policy measures or funding schemes explicitly or implicitly in relation to lifelong learning have been implemented in the last years in many parts of Europe. Guidance and counselling are often central or peripheral elements in these configurations which often involve financing schemes, guides/counsellors, training agencies and various groups of individuals and enterprises. Although guidance and counselling did already in the past have different forms and types (c. Gieseke/Opelt 2004, McLeod 2004, Schiersmann/Remmele 2004), the hybrid and dynamic heterogeneity has been even increased when looking at present concepts and programmes. The paper will critically describe and reflect on this trend by analyzing not the policy discourse, but rather the programme implementations in their structures and some of their effects. The argument will be with pros and cons discussed that here in these programmes guidance and counselling is nowadays more a governance tool within these programmes and less a support offer for individual, free decision-making of clients like at least classical counselling theory presupposes. The paper concludes with three remarks in relation to the level of practice, the level of policy developments and continuing research tasks.

2. BACKGROUND AND RESEARCH QUESTION

Guidance and counselling receive increasingly attention within the discourse on lifelong learning (c. also Watts/Sultana 2004): “Career guidance is an essential component of modern education and training systems to (re-)orientate younger and older generations towards the acquisition of 21st century skills. In the current context of high unemployment, guidance can help raise the awareness of people, whatever their age or qualification level, of learning opportunities that lead to the development of new skills much needed on the labour market, or that increase self-employment and entrepreneurship. As such, career guidance contributes to the Europe 2020 headline targets on reducing early school-leaving, increasing participation in tertiary education, increasing the employment rate and combating social exclusion. As expressed in the 2008 Council Resolution on better integrating lifelong guidance into lifelong learning strategies, guidance represents a crucial dimension of lifelong and lifewide learning.“ (ELGPN 2012, p. 7)

This statement demonstrates in a typical way the high expectations connected to guidance and counselling within the present policy context for approximately the last 10 years. Guidance and counselling are considered as supporting tools in connection to the target of a successful implementation of lifelong learning. It has been 'catapulted to the front' (McCarthy
2007) in order to mobilize adults to learn. The choice of these militaristic terms seems to be unfortunate, but can be observed also in other European policy-related documents in relation to lifelong learning. (c. Egtenmeyen/Käpplinger 2012, p. 32) As often highlighted by critical scholars (e.g. Martin 2000), the economical targets dominate, while social targets are at least also mentioned, but democracy, enlightenment or emancipation seem not to be the prominent buzz words worthwhile to mention prominently.

A more detailed analysis of the policy discourse could of course reveal more shades and perspectives, but will not be done here. There exists already a rich body of adult education research in this respect by a critical policy analysis and especially an analysis from a Foucaultian perspective (e.g. Fejes/Nicoll 2008, Forneck/Wrana 2004, Milana 2012).

Somebody could also criticise that these extensive political declarations about the value of guidance and counselling were not followed by political actions with substantial consequences (c. Schiersmann 2008, p. 25). This would mean that the discourse on the political level is often only very loosely interrelated with the level of practice and real political administrative engagement. This seems on the one side to be at least partly valid since the institutionalization and a broad provision of guidance and counselling as a public and semi-public service for all adults is in most countries only in rudimental parts existing. (c. Watts/Sultana 2004) On the other side might it be the case that the rhetorics about the importance of guidance and counselling are actually not meant in the sense of providing a substantial infrastructure for guidance and counselling. The question how to finance such a broad service was raised early on in policy-related documents, but not solved (c. Watts/Sultana 2004). But it is one reason, why telephone services are discussed as a perhaps financially affordable option for governments and clients, although practice shows that it cannot be used in order to save money. (c. Käpplinger 2010) At least if really new demand should be satisfied and new user groups are won. Generating new demand remains to be expensive (idem).

When services in the fields of guidance and counselling exist or have been established, they are very often limited to some target groups or they are implemented with a non-permanent duration on project basis. This limits very often the sustainability of such services since often the services disappear when the project or programme financing terminates. Thus, there are a multiply ambivalences and contradictions existing when looking at the development of guidance and counselling on the policy level and on the level of practice. But again, the analysis of the discrepancy between policy statements and the implementation of schemes is not the main objective of this article. Thus, I agree explicitly with this research proposal: ‘the literature on the practice and provision of guidance has tended to be more prescriptive than analytical. We suggest that more debate is needed about the problems and constraints encountered in introducing and implementing guidance interventions.’ (Watts/Kidd 2000, p. 498)

Thus, what I want to discuss here more in detail is the way how programmes (and especially voucher programmes) for adults are implemented and which role guidance and counselling play structurally in these programmes (Käpplinger/Klein 2013). The present tendencies will be compared with classical humanistic, client-centred Rogerian approaches within guidance and counselling (c. Gieseke/Opelt 2004). The proposal for a new term ‘regulative guidance’ will be introduced and explained (c. Käpplinger 2013, Käpplinger/Klein 2013). Effects of this
form of guidance especially in connection with German voucher programmes will be presented.

3. DATA AND METHODS USED

Data will be used from two research projects between 2011 und 2013.

The project ‘Qua-Beratung’\(^1\) was funded by the Ministry of Labour, Integration and Social Affairs of the German regional government of North-Rhine-Westphalia (NRW) and the European Social Fund (ESF). The goal was to promote transnational exchange and to compare two regional programmes of this government (‘Bildungsscheck NRW’ - training voucher NRW and ‘Potentialberatung’ – potential consulting) with other labour market related measures in Europe. One central criterion for this comparison was that all measures should make use of guidance and consulting similar to the two German measures ‘Bildungsscheck NRW’ and ‘Potentialberatung’. ‘Bildungsscheck NRW’ is programme in which training vouchers are issued to individuals or to enterprises after an obligatory guidance session in public guidance offices. ‘Potentialberatung’ is targeted on small and medium-sized enterprises (SME) and offers 15 days of consulting for needs’ analysis, action/trainings plans and its realization. Thus, we have here two programmes which make use of guidance, Counselling and consulting on the one side for individual employees and on the other side for enterprises. The measure training voucher NRW even has two parallel access routes – one for individual employees and one for SME. Within the programme we made intensive desk and internet research on similar programmes in Europe. We found 154 programmes which make use of guidance, Counselling and consulting in a at least partly comparable way like the German two programmes (meaning that guidance, Counselling and consulting are not standing alone measures, but are combined with other measures like training or additional guidance/consulting offers). We then selected 10 measures from five countries (Austria, Belgium/Flanders, Finland, the Netherlands, and Norway). Study visits, expert interviews, analysis of evaluations and transnational workshops with programme administrators were then been made for these 10 measures in order to make in-depth analysis and comparisons. (c. overall results in bbb/HU 2012)

The project ‘Effects’\(^2\) was funded by the German Federal Ministry of Education and Research (BMBF-funding number W1366) and implemented by an international consortium with bbb Dortmund, 3s Vienna, AFI Bozen and SVEP Zurich (c. Käpplinger/Klein/Haberzeth 2013). The goal was to compare demand-side oriented funding measures like training vouchers and their effects in German-speaking countries/regions (Austria, South Tyrol and Switzerland). The issue of guidance and Counselling was not in the core of the project. But many voucher programmes (see overview in West et al. 2000) make use of guidance and consulting in order firstly to support the legal functioning of the programme and secondly to support the decision-making and choice of people interested in training vouchers. Thus, the role of guidance and counselling cannot been left out when analyzing such programmes, although the precise role of it is very differently in the programmes (e.g. ranging from obligatory to voluntary guidance and counselling, from core elements to peripheral roles within the whole

---


\(^2\) Homepage in German language: [http://www.effekte-projekt.de](http://www.effekte-projekt.de)
funding programmes). Finally, we analysed via questionnaires and interviews mainly participants of the training voucher North-Rhine-Westphalia, the training voucher Brandenburg, the training voucher Geneva, the employee fund WAFF in Vienna of the chamber of employees and the voucher in South Tyrol. Analysis of evaluations, programme analysis and expert interviews enriched the data collection and supported a multi-dimensional approach of perspective-entanglement (Gieseke 2010).

Results of both projects will be used and combined in the following chapters.

4. RESULTS: REGULATIVE GUIDANCE AND BEYOND

4.1 INTRODUCTION OF THE NEW TERM ‘REGULATIVE GUIDANCE’

When studying the almost 200 different programmes in Europe during the project ‘Qua-Beratung’ it became rapidly evident, that the meaning of guidance and counselling within many of these programmes cannot be described by classical institutional configurations of guidance and counselling.

The classical institutional configuration of guidance and counselling in the 20th century was the organizational model of a centre or a guidance office (c. Watts/Kidd 2000, pp 485-487). It is a place, where people can go totally or partly by their own will, if they encounter problems within a study programme or if they seek advice in order to find suitable educational course. There are existing connections and networks of the guidance centres with training organizations. Guidance and counselling should assist people in finding their own solutions. The outcome of the guidance process is in principle open and the client is in charge for her or his own decision-making. This description might be criticised as being an idealized version, but at least the core characteristics should be valid.

The programmes observed by us were different. It became clear that guidance and Counselling is in many programmes closely connected to pre-defined options. For example, this can be seen when looking at the Norwegian programme FRAM:

![Diagram 1: The Norwegian guidance programme FRAM displayed by an analytical grid](image)

Diagram 1: The Norwegian guidance programme FRAM displayed by an analytical grid
We did develop here an analytical grid in order to display and describe the different pathways in which guidance and counselling programmes are embedded. The FRAM programme starts (t1) with a by us so-called ‘regulative guidance’. Firstly, this means that the first step of participants in the programme (in this case enterprises are the participants) is that they have to attend an obligatory guidance session. The task of the guidance professionals is to check if the enterprises are eligible for the offering of an extended package of guidance hours (t2). The tool used is called ‘WAR’ (willing, able, ready), meaning that the guidance professionals have to check if the enterprises are really willing to participate, if they are able to participate and finally if they are already ready to participate. Thus, it can be made the first conclusion that guidance has here firstly a programme relevant meaning of selection. The guidance professionals are decision-makers and assessors which enterprises are suitable and eligible for receiving extended support by guidance.

A second example is the training voucher NRW in the German region North-Rhine-Westphalia (NRW). Peoples who are interested in making use of a training voucher (50 per cent co-financing of course fees by public money) are obliged to visit guidance centres (t1). During the guidance process people are firstly checked if they are eligible for receiving a voucher by a set of pre-defined criteria of the administration (the access to the training voucher is not free to all employees or citizens, but partly or especially targeted on and encouraging of low-qualified or employees with precarious labour conditions). Secondly, the applicants are supported with three alternative course offerings by the guidance professionals and - if all criteria are met - receive the training voucher itself, which clients can exchange with training organizations in order to enrol for a course (t2) or a course and to reduce the own course fees by 50%.

Diagram 2: The German training voucher programme “Bildungsscheck NRW” displayed by an analytical grid

More European-wide examples of similar programmes could be added and had been displayed similarly. They share the common ground that guidance is systemically situated within a sequence of measures which are pre-defined by the administration. It can be that like in FRAM that after a first obligatory guidance session decisions are made who receives additional guidance and who not. It can be that like in the training voucher NRW that after an
obligatory guidance session decisions are made who receives a voucher for co-financing individual training. Other configurations of guidance, training or other measures could be described by other programmes. Thus, we called this form of guidance ‘regulative guidance’ since it has the function to regulate and channel people interest on a programme. While classical guidance has the function to support the self-regulation of people, these programmes start with a regulation according the pre-defined criteria and options by the administrators of the programme. ‘Regulative guidance’ is defined as following (c. Käpplinger/Klein 2013, Käpplinger 2013):

‘Regulative guidance is an obligatory guidance for individuals or enterprises as a pre-condition for the voluntary usage of a public programme. The guidance professionals have the double task of judgement (checking, selection, etc.) and counselling within the pre-defined framework of a funding programme with its political and administratively defined goals. Guidance is at least partly designed as a transmission belt for the frictionless functioning of the programme.’

This definition and this new term make connections to other empirical studies in Germany, which also demonstrated the combination of counselling and judgement in guidance offers for potential start-ups (c. Maier-Gutheil 2009). It results in steering functions of guidance, which can be also observed in relation to gender relations and to vocational choices made (c. Ostendorf 2005). Overall, it would be naïve nowadays to assume that guidance and counselling is in general only or mainly focused on the support of the individuals. Nonetheless should be these observations not generalized for the whole field of guidance and counselling. There still exist very different configurations of guidance and counselling in the different fields of adult education, vocational education and related fields. This is very important to keep in mind in order to situate these research results properly and not to generalize it too broadly.

4.2 ADMINISTRATORS’ REASONS FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION OF ‘REGULATIVE GUIDANCE’

We have got in-depth insights within our projects in the motives of administrators’ decisions to implement such kind of guidance programmes.

A first motive was the negative blueprint and the experience with Individual Learning Accounts (ILA) in England. Here lead the distribution of public funding without solid checking and quality control to massive fraud and abuse. It is estimated that this amounts to a massage of 97 billion £ out of an expenditure or 290 billion £ (UK Parliament 2003). Nonetheless, it was later on concluded that ‘authorities could learn from the mistakes of the past. It soon emerged that the ILA should not be basically called in to question, but should be improved.’ (Dohmen 2007, p. 11; compare also Cheesman 2003). Thus, obligatory guidance was considered as one suitable measure of quality control in order to ensure that only eligible persons, eligible training providers and eligible training measures are chosen. It was

a central goal for our project 'Qua-Beratung' to find out how other countries than Germany deal with the challenge of quality assurance and adequate usage of public money. We found out that other countries/regions have similar approaches towards guidance within funding programmes. For example, an Austrian guidance professional declared that there are no problematic examples within their guidance programme and counselling processes, because the regularly quality checks and judgements of the guidance professionals prevent that public funding is misused. Overall, guidance is here embedded in a process of public co-funding and serves as a quality assurance tool in the sense that the pre-defined objectives of the programme are checked and respected by users.

A second motive is related to the assumption that the intransparent field of continuing education requires guidance in order to find relevant offerings. This is considered being valid especially for non-participants:

‘Especially employees not used to education or in training non-participating enterprises find it often difficult to identify which continuing education is meaningful. This is not least the fault of an intransparent market of continuing education in Germany. The choice of a suitable offer and a training provider can be a challenge. Here can normally only a guidance help.’

(Wilkens 2008, pp 23-24)

We can observe the construction and assumption that guidance is an especially important tool for less-informed, lower qualified people in order to find orientation. Thus, we can observe a target group specific sub goal of guidance within funding programmes. In many of the funding programmes which we have observed, it is often a special focus on some target groups like low-qualified, groups with higher labour market risks or small and medium-sized enterprises (SME). In relation to these special groups guidance is considered as the measure of choice in order to address special problems of these groups or organizations. These considerations share often the background of a certain image of low-qualified people, which is based on the diagnosis of a lack of information and the need for motivation and orientation via counselling. It would be an interesting task to research on the grounds of this diagnosis and its empirical justifications. The existing body of literature on resistance against education indicates that such a resistance is often individually well-founded (e.g. in non-monetary cost-benefit estimations in relation to costs for the private life) and a lack of information or orientation is not the primary motive for non-participation, but rather a lack of individual benefits and individual added value for the life situation. (Holzer 2004, Bolder/Hendrich 2000)

I will not comment more in detail on these constructions of learners and the functional embedding of guidance here by theoretical and normative arguments, but mirror these approaches by empirical results out of the voucher programmes in North-Rhine-Westphalia and Brandenburg. The choice of these programmes is firstly legitimated by the limited space of this article which prevents the detailed analysis of more programmes. Secondly, because of the chance to analyze this programme within two different research projects, I can make use of a richness of empirical data (c. Käpplinger/Klein/Haberzeth 2013).

In relation to the first function of quality and eligibility checks by guidance professionals it seems that this function is working quite well. At least in the sense to prevent misusing or fraud by users. There is no information available that there exists significant misusing or fraud within the voucher programmes despite a rather extensive public monitoring by protocols of the guidance process and statistical checks of the usage of vouchers. Thus, guidance seems indeed to have a preventive effect (c. Käpplinger/Klein 2013).

The effects of the ‘real’ guidance function are more diverse and complex. First of all, the usage of the voucher programme does not mirror the public and prominent assumption of non-informed users who desperately need guidance in order to find their way through the jungle of course offers and different training providers. It is rather the contrary the case, for example when looking at the evaluation and monitoring data of the Bildungsscheck NRW:

95.7 per cent of individual users indicated that they did already know when going to the guidance professionals which training measure they wanted. 86.5 per cent of individual users said that they did already know which training provider they want to use. (Muth 2008, p. 40)

The incentive training voucher seems to reach people who have rather clear ideas what kind of training they want to have. There are of course selective effects, but our analysis (c. Habertzeth/Käpplinger/Kulmus 2013) show that not solely the expected selective effects of vouchers - which critics often assume solely on theoretical and normative grounds - can be observed (e.g. over-representation of well-qualified people). Especially female employees in precarious employment positions in the social sector or health sector use vouchers very much. They have rather low incomes by simultaneously significant training obligations of the profession. They use the training voucher in order to fill financial gaps by the public-co-financing (idem). The training voucher helps them also in a sequential planning of the present work and envisaged parenthood (idem). Other risk groups like migrants which use the training voucher have also rather clear expectations and needs. (c. Koval 2013)

Unfortunately, many migrants are judged by process-produced data as low-qualified, but have in fact higher qualifications acquired in their native countries. Thus, the concept of low-qualification rests sometimes on rather vague grounds. Migrants rather complain that the training voucher is not enough made public to them within their communities. They perceive the voucher as an ‘invisible hand’ which they found rather accidentally. (idem) Thus, the assumption that guidance is a major support for overcoming the obstacles of an intransparent training market seems not to be totally valid, while the information about the main funding instrument is not spread enough within some target groups.

Simultaneously, there exists also significant satisfaction with the guidance offer. Approximately 90 per cent of client expressed mostly or totally satisfaction with the guidance process (SALSS 2008, p. 78). In our own interviews with users it was expressed by the interviewed voucher users that the guidance helped them to understand the correct usage of the programmes. (c. Käpplinger/Klein 2013) Some quotes of users:

- ‘The conversation was relaxed and very sympathetic. It lasted perhaps 20 minutes. And then you receive the 500 € as funding. I found this great.’
- ‘It was suited to my needs. I wanted only to know: Is this suitable for me.’
Many were satisfied that the guidance was easy to use, provided essential information about the programme and it required only a few minutes. 77 per cent of all guidance sessions are lasting less than 30 minutes (Muth 2008, p. 37). But some interviewees were also critical that the guidance process itself was too much focused on the protocol and the distribution of vouchers (c. Käpplinger/Klein 2013):

- ‘And a little bit I was also disappointed, because of this you do not go to a counselling. This was actually only something like assembly-line work, yes? Is there anybody? Then you tell something, which you tell all. And that’s it. This was not very individually. That was a pity for me.’
- ‘My impression was, they want by brook to bring their vouchers to you.’

Our empirical data shows that the standardized, obligatory model of guidance in relation to the voucher usage is confronted with very different client needs and expectations. In our Brandenburg study (c. Haberzeth/Käpplinger/Kulmus 2013) we have asked people in advance what they expect of the guidance:

- 42.7 per cent said that they do not need guidance
- 48.1 per cent said that they seek for information about concrete course offers
- 45.2 per cent said that they want to know more about their career perspectives

Approximately less than half of the people applying for a voucher have fixed plans and say before the guidance that they need no guidance. Others have often also pre-fixed plans, but they would appreciate to have a guidance session with broader perspectives beyond participation in continuing vocational education. They ask for a reflection on their career perspective for which the training participation is a tool and not a goal for itself. Overall, there exists a rather wide range of needs (and non-needs) in relation to guidance within voucher programmes. The administration of the programme recognizes by themselves that the guidance function has to be strengthened within the whole configuration of the training voucher programme:

The task of the guidance is also ‘to reflect jointly with the guidance professional the pre-field decision of the customer and perhaps to develop alternatives. The expectations of some customers that the guidance offices are only voucher issuing offices has to be often counteracted.’\(^5\) (Muth 2008, S. 40)

The obligatory character of the guidance function results in visits by a significant number of clients, which would not wanted to go to a guidance office without such an obligation.

Other users express the wish to still discuss even pre-defined training choices. Sometimes it is the case that they seek for confirmation if their early choice is really correct. Guidance has here the function of assuring and supporting choices already made by clients before the guidance session itself.

---

We have no extensive data on the views of the guidance professionals themselves, because this was not the focus of the projects. Forthcoming research in progress at least indicates that the administratively defined procedures of the vouchers seems to lead to an over focusing on procedures, protocols and the voucher issuing, while 'communicative chances', in which deeper trainings needs and individual situations could be addressed are missed out by guidance professionals within voucher programmes. Thus, obligatory regulative guidance within voucher programmes seems not to meet the expectation that it supports significantly the decision-making process of users and potential learners.

Even more provoking is the thought that guidance might constitute a major hurdle for some people out of different reasons:

> ‘The central question is how we can make it to place guidance in such a way that it is really perceived as support and not as alienating. Therefore, I think of low-qualified and qualified people. Even here a guidance offer might under some circumstances a not to underestimate hurdle, because I consider myself as enough competent and I know, what I want to do now. Or at least I believe that I know it.’ 6 (Dohmen 2009, p. 37)

This quote points out that the assumption that a certain lack of information leads to an appraisal of guidance seems to be a too quick and comfortable assumption. Also guidance is certainly not generally perceived by the public as something which is for people with problems, it is also a feature and it deserves attention if to visit guidance offices obligatory might indeed constitute a major hurdle. The training vouchers are predominantly used by women in Germany (approx. up to 70 per cent for each voucher programme with individual users in Germany, c. Käpplinger 2013, p. 68). This can be explained by the predominating using of vouchers within the health sector and social sectors, but perhaps the obligatory guidance does at least often men rather distract to use it. But this is a hypothesis which might be the topic of further research in relation to guidance and gender.

Overall, the real guidance function of ‘regulative guidance’ seems only partly been met. This seems to be caused by pre-decisions of the interested learners, the criteria of quality assurance which pre-define certain procedures and guidance professionals which seem to counsel in-line with the goal to contribute to raising training participation. That there is nonetheless certainly a need to reflect sometimes more in-depth pre-decisions of interested learners highlights for example this quote of a guidance client which received at the end a voucher for becoming a quasi-therapist education (c. Käpplinger/Klein 2013):

> ‘I have been in therapy for seven years (...) and then I felt again into a hole (...) Then I have, somehow I had the idea ‘Then you can make already an education for therapists by myself.’

---

6 Original quote: Die zentrale Frage ist, wie wir es schaffen können, die Beratung so zu platzieren, dass sie wirklich als unterstützend erlebt wird und nicht als abschreckend. Und da denke ich nicht nur an niedrig Qualifizierte, sondern genauso an Bildungsgewohnte. Auch hier stellt ein Beratungsangebot unter Umständen eine nicht zu unterschätzende Schwelle dar, weil ich mich ja möglicherweise selbst als ausreichend kompetent erlebe und schon weiß, was jetzt zu tun ist. Oder zumindest glaube, das zu wissen.’
The participation in continuing training of this person contributes to raising participation on lifelong learning (he received a training voucher). But is such a kind of participation what is responsible advisable for the person and the society? Thus, there seems to be sometimes a need to make more real usage of the guidance function within training voucher programmes. ‘Regulative guidance’ seems to conflict at least partly with a form of guidance which is more based on classical thoughts as helping clients or make their own decisions. Guidance as a really open process without pre-defined goals is partly at stake.

5. CONCLUSIONS AND OUTLOOK

I will now summarize three core results of our studies:

- Perspectives for practice and
- policy-related developments as much as
- future research perspectives will be sketched.

5.1 PROVISIONAL ESTABLISHMENT OF ‘REGULATIVE GUIDANCE’ IN WORKPLACE-RELATED GUIDANCE AND COUNSELLING

One core results is that ‘regulative guidance’ is a relatively new and an increasing feature which can be observed in many European countries. Typical measures like the Norwegian WAR (willing able ready) procedures are used for selecting participants for funding programmes via guidance. Thus, guidance and counselling are designed more or less explicitly as transmission belts for political agendas and goals. This is a conceptual change from prior (Rogerian) conceptions of guidance and counselling ideals which were rather oriented on the client and her and his goals. This might be criticised as an over-simplification of past practices. Of course, past practices had also hidden (political) agendas.

Nonetheless, we stick to the analysis that there is at least partly a change taking place which role guidance and counselling is given by policy administrations. The increased interest in guidance and counselling leads sometimes to a conception change of guidance and counselling. We cannot measure or estimate how quantitatively influential ‘regulative guidance’ is nowadays, because this was not part of neither of our two projects. But it has to be pointed out that many of the guidance centres have beside ‘regulative guidance’ also other forms of guidance which resemble more the classical approach of an open offer which is not bound to certain measures. Thus, it should be observed in future if forms of ‘regulative guidance’ expand or co-exist within guidance centres or remain rather a minor subfield within the field of guidance and counselling.

5.2 CHANGES IN ADMINISTRATIVE APPROACHES, BECAUSE OF MIXED SATISFACTIONS WITH ‘REGULATIVE GUIDANCE’

Overall, especially the training vouchers and their exact implementation are often subject of changes in their conditions (c. Haberzeth/Kulmus 2013). Even within our relatively short project duration we observed many changes made within the programmes. These changes were often related to the role of guidance. For example, for the training voucher Brandenburg
was the change made that the obligatory guidance was cancelled and made into a voluntary offer. The quality assuring and controlling function of ‘regulative guidance’ was replaced by an online application procedure with checks directly by the ministry and its administration. Also we did not evaluate this late change, we have at least some information that guidance professionals appreciate this change, because it helps them to make less guidance sessions, but to concentrate and focus the sessions on people with explicit information and guidance needs. Thus, ‘regulative guidance’ was removed as an obligatory step in Brandenburg.

In North-Rhine-Westphalia ‘regulative guidance’ still exists for the voucher, but the regional state implemented a new additional measure of so-called ‘guidance for vocational development’ (Beratung zur beruflichen Entwicklung). Also oriented on labour market related questions, this guidance programme has a longer duration (up to nine hours) and has actually (astonishingly) no really clear pre-defined goals. For example, it is not suggested that the guidance should lead to participation in training. One reason for this was the conclusion that ‘regulative guidance’ does not meet intensive guidance needs on the side of at least a group of people and the result of the guidance process should remain open.

Thus, we can observe that ‘regulative guidance’ is critically analyzed also by administrations\(^7\). There is an understanding that ‘regulative guidance’ with its double functions can not meet all expectations and is limited in its outcome. It will be interesting to study, how this presently rather dynamic developments will continue. Paradoxically, a movement into one direction (e.g. ‘regulative guidance’) might result in the long-run into simultaneous or consecutive movements into other directions. There are still different scenarios observable and possible in which directions the mainstream of guidance and Counselling will develop into. (Käpplinger 2009)

\(5.3\) DESIDERATA OF GUIDANCE PROCESSES ITSELF WITHIN ‘REGULATIVE GUIDANCE’

We have not analyzed by empirical fieldwork within our projects how the guidance processes really take place (e.g. by participating observations, audio-tapes or focused interviews with clients and guidance professionals). We have some information about the duration of the process (mostly less than 30 minutes) and we have interview side information from clients about the processes, while actually interviewing about the benefits of the voucher and the individual decision-making. Nonetheless, we know only a little bit how guidance professionals perceive by themselves ‘regulative guidance’. We have had some discussion with professionals in the field and there exists partly the position that ‘regulative guidance’ is not really guidance, but rather a helping with applications.

Other guidance professionals strengthen that guidance can even take place within such procedures. Here we need more research in order to estimate better the effects of the pre-defined character of ‘regulative guidance’ on the actual guidance process. Provisional analysis in a new research project (Käpplinger/Stanik 2014) gives first hints that even within ‘regulative guidance’ there are still ‘communicative chances’ for reflection and support

\(^7\) Also our project ‘Qua-Beratung’ was not planned as a kind of action research, I cannot exclude that the project had at least partly on influence on reasoning in the policy administration and the decision-making on policy levels.
beyond pre-defined standards. But it is a professional challenge to be aware of these chances and to wanting and being able to catch these chances. How to deal with the framework set from the outside by the political administration of funding programmes and making still individualized and client-centred guidance work? Overall, it can be assumed that the definition of goals for guidance influence significantly guidance practice, but this does not result in such a way, that the guidance practice is totally in-line with the pre-defined goals and standards. Thus, we need more analysis of real guidance and counselling processes by the means of transcripts or participating observations (s. Gieseke/Käpplinger/Otto 2004, Käpplinger/Stanik 2014).

Policy analyses are of course important, but educational research should go deeper than remaining on this level. It should be interested in which way practices are totally or partly affected by policies or even resistant against policies. Or in which way ‘double realities’ are established, meaning that pre-defined standards are officially respected, but simultaneously practices follow their own incremental rules, hidden agendas and path-logics within pre-defined frameworks. The empirical research on educational guidance processes has to be strengthened and intensified.

For example, such kind of research could inform practice about different developments of guidance processes and how to deal with the diverse needs of clients from receiving simple information to intensive biographical counselling. This could be crucial information for the further training of guidance professionals on the level of professionals.

On an institutional level it would be interesting to observe which effects ‘regulative guidance’ has on the guidance infrastructure. There exists the conclusion that the establishment of ‘regulative guidance’ has secured the position of many guidance centres and made the offerings more transparent. There has been an influx of financial resources for guidance centres. For example, only in North-Rhine-Westphalia have been between 2006 and 2010 225,000 regulative guidance sessions taking place (Muth 2011, p. 3) and an estimated amount of approx. 4 billion € have been spent for ‘regulative guidance’ only between 2006 and 2008. (Muth 2008, p. 15) The establishing of internet portals and data banks, which can help to find an educational guidance office, are also measures which have increased the visibility of and the access to guidance within this process. Other evaluations confirm that the guidance infrastructure has been significantly supported by ‘regulative guidance’ in voucher programmes (DIE 2011, p. 207). Thus, it would be interesting to observe on an organizational level which influences ‘regulative guidance’ has on the development of guidance centres. It has to be strengthened again, that none of these centres makes solely ‘regulative guidance’, but this form of guidance is mostly only one form of guidance offered. It would be interesting to observe if ‘regulative guidance’ endangers resources for other forms of more open and client-centred approaches or if the additional resources by funding schemes like the educational vouchers help to secure guidance centres which might be closed down or the staff reduced without such new resources.

In summarizing our results it can be pointed out that ‘regulative guidance’ is a comparatively new feature in the field of guidance and counselling. It is at first sight attractive for administrators and policy-makers. Critical science should be of course sceptical and reluctant in relation to this new form of guidance. Research solely oriented on direct (monetary) returns could criticise that guidance in combination with vouchers might not lead to significant increased participation rates (c. Messer/Wolter 2009). But is it the important goal of guidance
and counselling to increase participation or is the crucial goal to support individuals in their decision-making?

Nonetheless, we recommend to look empirical closely and exactly on the diverse effects in relation to guidance structures and clients. It might be easy to condemn rapidly this form of guidance, but perhaps this misses out chances to establish enhanced, more sense-making practices even within these pre-defined procedures. In addition, we experienced that the administrative staff is open-minded to reflect on and to change functions of ‘regulative guidance’. Thus, we would like to encourage to critical research, but not to encourage open developments by preliminary judgements and analysis solely on theoretical and one perspective-based judgement. Therefore more enhanced empirical research with encompassing the perspectives of clients, professionals and administrators seems to be still needed. We hope that this article encourages for elaborated research beyond desk research and beyond the analysis of policy documents.

REFERENCES


INTRODUCTION

Adults often come to rethink their future when working life changes affect their horizons for actions. Asking: Would I change my occupation?, a person rethinks his or her actual career building expectations. After some subject studies and working life experiences, teaching included, option may emerge to become a learning professional. Pedagogical training is considered a beneficial possibility in supporting this plan.

In Finland, the teachers' pedagogical studies can be included in teacher education programs or run as separate course. As separate course, the studies are continuing education for those who want to work as a teacher; who are interested in becoming teachers for different schools or who want to work as an expert in different sectors where pedagogical expertise is required or beneficial. At the University of Lapland, the focus of the separate pedagogical studies is on adult learning and training. Being aware of consideration of prior learning and experiences, we designers and educators talk and write about development to become learning professionals (those who do not have teaching experiences) and about development as learning professionals (those who already have teaching experiences) to give a signal of respecting all students equally and to point out that professional identity is an on-going process and to appreciate prior learning and experiences in teaching. Usually an adult learner joining the studies already has identified himself or herself according to some profession such as nurse or engineer according to previous education and work experiences. A change from being a nurse, for example, to a teacher of nursing and health care involves questions of reconstruction of professional identity. When designing meaningful and effective continuing education, we need to take into account these aspects.

In the research under discussion, we ask: What are the core elements affecting the reconstruction of professional identity when moving from another working position toward teaching in adult education, and what sort of role does pedagogical training play?

First, in this article, I address the working life context of the teachers' pedagogical studies (60 credits) and approaches to be(come) an adult learning professional and development of identity. Second, research practices and outcomes are discussed. At the end, I define guidelines for further reflection on the topic and how to design the studies to be better in content and in quality and to correspond better with expectations of learners.

PEDAGOGICAL STUDIES AND WORKING LIFE

Power structures like demographic progress or global economic hierarchy generate changes in working life. On an individual and also on society level, education is one potential way to respond these changes. For those who have plans to develop their individual careers,
education enables to gain new skills, knowledge and competences actually needed. Personal expectations, updated values and appreciations of communities may boost to study further and also to find new position in working life. In continuing education, it is a question of working life relations and know-how requirements; that is, the relationship between working life and qualifications bridge the personal conception of profession to status in working life. (Rhodes & Scheeres, 2004.) Hodkinson and Sparkers (1997) write about individual horizon for action connected to working life orientation built from habitus and the structure of the labour market. These aspects are significantly present during the teachers’ pedagogical studies discussed here.

In Finland, the teaching profession is regulated according to the government decrees (Decree on the Eligibility Requirements for Personnel in the Teaching Profession (986/1998; 1168/2010 and Decree on University Degrees 794/2004), which require, among other things, that to work as a qualified teacher on all levels must pass pedagogical studies. The curriculum consists of theory in the science of education, didactically oriented studies and supervised teaching practice.

The training under discussion is designed as a separate training of three semesters and to form an integrated unity of on-campus contact periods added with off-campus e-learning and individual work based on cumulative and blended learning principles (Graham, 2006; Koskinen, 2011; Macdonald, 2006; Singh, 2003; Stubbs, Martin & Endlar, 2006 Wenger, 1998). The process has to be kept intensive and fluent. Many of the students work when studying. They represent different fields of sciences; they have acquired a master’s degree or more or they are working through the final requirements of the degree. Most (81, 0%) of those who teach during the studies, teach in sectors where they have working experiences and theoretical studies. This requires the contents and the practices of the studies to be flexible and applicable to each student’s personal expectations and the qualifications of working practices. In adulthood, planning the future and fulfilling individual expectations is increasingly one's own responsibility, so there is a strong expectation that trainings support the process.

Pedagogical studies are meant to connect pedagogical knowhow with subject knowledge. Studying and learning are based on students’ prior learning and on experiences collected in working life. Assessing prior learning and individual abilities, the learner becomes aware of personal strengths and weaknesses connected to possibilities and threats of working life. According to Seppo Helakorpi, a Finnish researcher and senior lecturer in vocational teacher education, a teacher’s expertise is comprised of a subject domain, pedagogical domain, developmental and research domain and an organizational domain. (Helakorpi, 1999; Helakorpi 2009; Volmari; Helakorpi & Frimodt, 2009.) Pedagogical studies support the acquisition of the pedagogical domain. Talking about and evaluating expertise, there is also the question of personal beliefs and trusts on one’s own know-how and ability to act in practice.

There are various definitions of competences for adult learning professional, like national qualification requirements and qualification requirements on European Union level. (ALPINE, 2008; Core Competencies of Adult Learning Facilitators in Europe; Key competences for adult learning professionals, 2010.) More and more, in focus are capabilities to network and collaborate, to work with knowledge and technology, to be aware of working with and in society, and to be embedded in professional continuum of lifelong learning. (The national

405
framework for qualifications and other learning, 2009; Common European Principles for Teacher Competences and Qualifications, 2010.)

DEVELOPING PROFESSIONAL IDENTITY AS A PART OF CAREER BUILDING

Development of professional identity is considered an on-going, not linear process in which emotional, cognitional and socio-cultural aspects are at the core. (Billet & Somerville, 2004; Schepens, Aelterman & Vlerick, 2009.) When discussing the professional identity of adult learning professionals, we talk about career building (Hodkinson, Bowman & Colley, 2006; Hodkinson, 2008) and human resource development. In the framework of this article, optional process leads from a multidisciplinary to interdisciplinary understanding, where different traditions of different fields of sciences and practices interact, not just exist, in the same framework. Pedagogical know-how should be developed as an integrated part of each student’s personal, interdisciplinary expertise and identity. (Skill needs in Europe: Focus 2020, 2008.)

Based on sociological understanding, construction of any kind of identity is an individual and social, dialogical process. Everyone has various identities in harmony or in conflict. Professional identity is a social role connected to personal capabilities; knowledge, skills, attitudes and societal expectations are based on cultural and social aspects. Individual aims and plans to meet those goals emerge in strategies and end points. Understanding the identities makes it conceivable to interpret, prefigure and supervise actions. It is consciousness of the relationship between social actions and the distribution of work; that is, to understand one's position, status and membership in a profession and society. (Bauman, 2001; Eteläpelto & Vähäsarjanen, 2006; Giddens, 1991; Hall, 1999; Rhodes & Scheeres, 2004.) The complex, fast creation of new knowledge affects the understanding of professional development. To move from one position to another is a benefit of self-reflection, counselling and supportive, collegial reflection.

Through the years, many theoretical approaches have defined teacher identity, mostly from the perspective of the class and subject teachers. Development of teacher identity is seen as an on-going, dynamic process, following individual routes and lasting an entire life. In adult learning context, capability to change one’s view is especially needed. As such, it requires the aspiring teacher to engage in and to take responsibility for his or her own development (Beijaard, Verloop & Vermunt, 2000). Accordingly, the question arises: Is it growth and/or development? Growth is seen as an increase in the quantity of knowledge and skills and development as an increase in capability to change one’s view (Beairsto, 1996). Development of adult learning professional is a process including progressive problem solving, rethinking and redefining, and being awarded with the elements of professional identity. (Bogler & Somech, 2004; Guskey, 2000; Huberman, 1995; Postareff, 2007.)

Professional identity, based on experiences during working life, is an individual understanding about oneself as a qualified actor in working life; that is, one’s relationship to work, professional future outlook; what he/she wants to be; how to develop one’s own competences and career; and what are one’s values, ethics, aims and beliefs. (Beijaard, Meijer & Verloop 2004; Eteläpelto & Vähäsarjanen 2006; Ricoeur 1992.) There are two important and interwoven factors in development of teacher identity: the professional self and subjective educational theory (Kelchtermans & Ballet, 2002). Development of both starts
before the training continues and confrontation occurs in practice, in real teaching situations with full responsibility. During the pedagogical studies, students get teaching experiences under supervision; theories are applied into practice. Learning in interaction occurs during the teaching practices enriching the professional capabilities.

We can discuss career building when defining approach to be(com)ing an adult learning professional. With a career identity (Chappell & Johnston, 2003; Collin, 2009; London & Mone, 1987), a person defines himself or herself by work. Career identity consists of an involvement with a profession, occupation and work organization and with personal needs for advancement and recognition. Paul Ricoeur characterized narrative identity (Ricoeur, 1992) as dialectic of sameness and selfhood. When describing one’s position and actions in working life, a character in a narrative is an individual. Narrative identity defines an individual as being an agent of action. In narrative identity, character also reveals a form of selfhood. Ricoeur describes selfhood related to otherness, and sameness as a state of being the same as someone or something. In the context of working life, by defining who I am and where I belong, a person defines his or her professional identity by planning career. In fact, identity and change are compatible. Only through change we can maintain the development of identity, which is an on-going negotiation between selfhood and sameness in a real-world context.

Expertise as personal experience is based on the evaluation of current know-how, skills and the readiness to act and find solutions, pedagogical in this case, according to current goals. (Isopahkala – Bouret, 2005; Ramsden, 2003.) All learning professionals need theoretical and practical knowledge, capacity to adapt their expertise to different situations both individually and collectively, and capability to justify their actions. So, professional identity as a part of individual career is in progress in all educational contexts.

RESEARCH PRACTICES

In the research under discussion, we ask: What are the core elements of reconstructing professional identity when moving from one professional position towards the position of adult learning professional, and what role does pedagogical training play in this process? One hypothesis is that adult learning professionals have no collective identity; it is professional consciousness on an individual level but an important part of individual capability to see oneself as a professional and be able to develop competences related to the changes of working life and gain personal career goals along working years. The research is relevant to carry out to increase educators understanding on the topic and to support students’ individual development in the best possible way during the studies and to join in discussion of the topic.

Data was collected 2012 by interviewing people who completed the teachers’ pedagogical studies at the University of Lapland during last two-three years. The sample was optional; there were representatives of both genders and different fields of sciences. During the time, 157 students completed the studies; our sample consisted of 52 persons. The contact was initiated by e-mail and limited by there being no more valid student addresses. To form and deliver the questionnaire, the Webropol survey software online solution (http://w3.webropol.com/int/) was used. The questionnaire consisted of a section of semi-structured questions and a section of open-ended questions; 29 completed answers are
analysed. The informants represent the sampling criteria. There are also reflective writings from 34 students in training during 2012-2013 academic year. The reflections on reconstruction and/or development of identity of adult learning professional have been analysed by applying data based content analysis to group core elements of an identity building of an adult learning professional and benefits of the training. (Cohen, Manion & Morrison, 2000.) Based on the analysis, it was possible to form two type stories out of informants’ reflections. Some quantitative information is also given to frame the findings more precisely.

It is relevant to point out that the study groups seem to be quite similar year after year, when examining teaching and other working life experiences. Informants have working experiences in their subject fields before the studies from one till over 20 years. More than one half of informants (60, 1 %) had teaching experiences before the studies between 4-16 years. About one quarter (22, 3 %) did not have any teaching experiences. After pedagogical studies, one half (55, 0%) has taught fulltime, one quarter (23, 1%) work part-time and one-tenth (11, 2%) fill temporary teaching jobs. One third (34, 5%) of the informants work actually in vocational institutes, the others in vocational high schools (polytechnics) or universities, some in several institutions at same time.

RECONSTRUCTING AND RENEWING PROFESSIONAL IDENTITY

Renewing or reconstruction of professional identity depends on individual circumstances and aims. ‘Renewing’ represents the case in which a person emphasises his or her existing professional identity; being teacher or trainer regarding a special subject field and sees beneficial to strengthen pedagogical understanding. In ‘reconstruction’ the focus is on interdisciplinary orientation where the knowledge framework, skills and competences are taken into a new context and optionally enriched with new knowledge, skills and competences building up a new identity of an adult learning professional.

Thinking of identity as a part of career development seems to be strong; also understanding that one must learn throughout life is evident in the informants’ reflections. Whatever they have been doing, they have been eager to develop their know-how and ready to seize opportunities. They want to share their knowledge and experiences accrued during their working years; that is, to integrate practices and theories and to try to make tacit knowledge explicit. One of the common reasons why to become teachers is the desire to meet and work with people and to collaborate and network on different levels in the field of one’s own expertise.

According to the research, many have gone through a long learning and schooling path from the secondary level to higher education in the same subject field, building a wide understanding about the specific theories connected to hands-on work experiences. Quite often, the starting point of teaching work has been just coincidence; because of one’s network, one is invited to teach as an expert. The person may return again and again as lecturer and later joins to be one of personnel. If the experience has been enjoyable and rewarding, it is considered beneficial for the development of self-confidence and certainty. Still, many informants think that, to know something, is far away of knowing how to teach, how to share the knowledge in optional way.
There are three significance reasons over others to begin the pedagogical studies: one to fulfil eligible qualification to work as a teacher and to widen personal eligibility in labour market generally. Another is the possibility of flexible university studies to study pedagogical studies as a minor, to strengthen research abilities in the field of adult education and to increase the knowledge connected to career development in the near future. Third, there are individuals who are interested in exploiting their working life experiences in adult education and training in their field of expertise. They are developers of the field of their subject connected to working life changes. They also have the desire to change occupation, to be more active on the field of the subject; that is, to work as a teacher and develop the profession and science of the subject.

Those who saw that they adopted teacher identity already before the pedagogical studies, accentuated experiences in teaching, motivation to sort of work and subject expertise. They see also other, more personal factors supporting reflection to be a learning professional like: self-confidence, capability in interaction, capability in problem solving, collaboration and creativity. Supportive feedback at work and interest in learning and in world of education in general has been meaningful motives to become a teacher. Some put it like I am a teacher type or I like the positive image of teacher profession.

Almost one half (45, 6%) of informants strongly identified with the teaching profession, and one-third (31, 0%) identified themselves especially as trainers. There are also those (21, 0%) whose teacher identification is temporary but very few who do not recognise this sort of identification at all. Most (72, 5%) of the informants point out that professional identity started to redevelop during the studies. Some had a professional identity like entrepreneur or artist based on former studies and working experiences before the pedagogical studies and this identity continued to strengthen.

The findings indicate that the most affective facts supporting awareness and recognition of identity of adult learning professional were experiences in the subject field, self-confidence and trust in one’s own expertise. That comprises the knowledge framework of the subject field and an understanding of the subject field regarding pedagogy, general core abilities in pedagogy and schooling and a pedagogical understanding of adults’ learning and studying. To develop these, informants pointed out following: the significance of teamwork and democratic interaction; responsibility in diverse duties and supportive feedback, a challenging position in the work organization and the personal motivation to work. Also mentioned was the experience of wellbeing at work.

There are some facts that unbalance the personal trust and belief in the development of professional teacher identity and those are connected to actual challenges and changes in working life. Working circumstances are insecure, demanding and always in transition. Also limitations of the global economy and schools’ profit engagement have become manifest. Informants realise there is more and more work to be done, and quite a bit of it is no longer face-to-face. There is less time for counselling, though learners have more and more varied problems to solve. Some do not believe their work is appreciated in the future, and some feel the failure and lack of aptitudes like ICT-skills. Informants think that learning and teaching in web-based learning environment compensates for cuts in resources, which they believe is not ethical.
Some pointed out, as personal opinion that it is good to move to new positions in every ten years. And it has already happened and may happen again that some competences are not needed anymore because of changes in working life and technological development. That means changes for personnel too. Also entrepreneurship is seen as a possibility. Postgraduate studies are in process or in the plans of many as advanced education on the subject field or as continuing education to fulfil competences for working life.

According to the research findings, it is possible to outline two types of adult learning professionals and put together type stories out of informants’ reflections:

First see teaching as the best possible occupation for them. They are committed to the work. They see it as the fulfilment of their dreams, and they are conscious of their identity as a teacher.

It is nice to be a teacher. It’s rewarding, and it calls for involvement. I know my limitations, but it inspires me to “dig” for new knowledge. I can see how I develop with small steps. Difficult occasions after they have been reflected educate me. If it is conceivable to say to enjoy the work, I really do. I take responsibility, I work hard, and that seems to bring good results. My attitude to work and somehow easy going way to realise things, I believe to formalize one model for working. I try to give positive and stimulating feedback to everyone. I try to be creative and give various options to go through studies. Learners’ joy of success inspires me as a teacher. I feel that it is important that you have other activities too, not just your work. Almost without noticing, I have developed my teacher identity – a strong vision of what kind of teacher I wish to be and a strong notion of what I consider as good teaching.

Second, there are those who see teaching as a part of their expertise which makes it possible to work occasionally as a teacher and as an expert in their subject. They have a strong understanding of career building. These people take part in an on-going process to analyse their values and working cultures. To shift from a career in business life or social work to education, changes in cultural practices may challenge their understanding of values, aims and responsibilities. On their horizon is a call for action.

I did finish pedagogical studies beside master studies. After that I have been working in teaching but as well outside education on the field of my expertise (like tourism and business, marketing or social work). I needed working life experiences to be able to get a permanent job in polytechnics. Beside the work sector I had some classes in polytechnics. Later, I had a full time teaching position. I was also involved in projects and I was pleased to take part in all duties of the institute. After two to three years, the situation turned to be unsecure because of financial reasons, so I left the school and found permanent job in the field of my expertise. At the moment, I do some classes too. I liked teaching. The financial facts spoilt my way but after few years, I hope I am able to return to teach full time. And I must say, then, I have gain lot useful experiences again; updated my knowing in practice. But I could also continue working as I do now.
Also students, who actually study, see activities in one’s own field outside the education institute, important and appreciated. Some wondered if there is any need to build up a special teacher identity; professional identity is a combination of their identification to the expertise of their subject field added to pedagogical understanding.

I am still insecure about my teacher identity. I feel, I am not on my convenience area when teaching even I like it. On the other hand, the lack of teaching experiences influences this. Pedagogical understanding supports my current work too, even it is not teaching. Sometimes at school, working hours are not as regular as clockwork, and it may happen that there is hardly any free time. The sort of situation puts me to think, do I really want this and do I really need to recognise any special identity to be an adult learning professional. I must say, I like teaching - BUT?

ROLE OF PEDAGOGICAL STUDIES IN IDENTITY WORK

No doubt, the most meaningful component in one’s studies that fulfils individual expectations and understanding of teaching is supervised practice in a field school. Theories, skills and competences are practised, and collegial supervision supports the development of teacher identity or in some situations, also challenges the process. Informants see useful to learn beforehand and use in practice different sort of pedagogical skills like methods to activate learning, how to assess and evaluate learning, and optional ways how to plan and carry out teaching in face-to-face and/or in web-based learning environments. Self-reflection and evaluation of individual abilities are important parts of the studies and strengthen the identity development.

Acquiring an inquiry-oriented approach towards work, an inquisitive and open attitude towards learning and developing metacognitive skills gave me reason for self-reflection as a learner during the studies, as well as when acting as a teacher in practise. It is also helpful to notice that self-criticism towards the methods I previously used has increased.

Pedagogical studies guided me to analyse better my prior know-how and to answer to the question who I am and what I want to be and what do I appreciate as a teacher and/or a trainer and how I see my competences. I am more willing to experiment new thinks. My orientation to develop myself is stronger. I am more engaged to work on the field of adult education.

It is seen that an understanding on identity development has deepened in pedagogical studies. An individual’s theory of professional practice has also recently been broached as a basic of teaching work. A strongly appreciated resource is multidisciplinary study group. Student from different fields of sciences and with different sort of working experiences support each other and make available peer to peer learning which is never exploited enough according to informants. All new approaches to learning and teaching like problem based learning pedagogy, and others like are welcomed.

Those who consciously process their professional identity as an adult learning professional, teacher or trainer pointed out some basics as the most meaningful: subject expertise,
pedagogical understanding, the knowhow experienced in communication with one’s work community, the ability to collaborate on various levels of school system, and strong trust in yourself. All supportive practices to reflect on identity building during and after the studies are seen beneficial from the perspective of comprehensive professional identity in the framework of career building.

‘Teacher’ is often concerned with general education, and informants see adult education and vocational education quite differently. When they reflect on the process be(com)ing an adult learning professional, they see that they must open and reconstruct unconsciously built identities based on former experiences in schooling, studying and working through the years. Also they see that the understanding of learning and teaching has changed a lot. An adult learning professional facilitates learning, solves problems with learners, and needs the capability to counsel learners. There is less traditional teaching and more counselling and collaboration with colleagues and different partner organisations. Part of a trainer’s work is to develop one’s own know-how and practices, to create learning materials and to design contents and formats and training evaluations, sometimes even marketing belongs to this to-do list. Working life challenges and collaboration emerge especially when there is an actual change in a new working position. To collaborate and be active in research and projects is increasingly essential and those are seen interesting and increasing sectors of work, from second to tertiary education. Many of the informants see this as a part of personal development and possibility in career building. It is also seen a need of mentoring besides and in collaboration and teamwork. These topics are interwoven in expectations of the students.

The research findings indicate that, as learning outcomes of the pedagogical studies emerged: first better understanding of theories and practices in general and in integration of theories in teaching practices and second better personal trust and belief in one’s ability to be a teacher or a trainer. As individual learning outcomes concerning better understanding of theories and practices is the understanding on the pedagogical approaches to the subject field of science was more open after studies, and the assessment and recognition of prior learning and expertise was advanced.

My pedagogical know-how has advanced enormously during these teacher’s pedagogical studies. A whole new section is added to my subject expertise. Situation-specific ability to act and confidence have developed alongside subject know-how. I estimate that perceiving myself as an expert has come true very well. Now I am aware of the concept of teacherhood and I know how to consider my actions on a meta level in learning and pedagogical understanding. This is influenced not only by the reflective nature of the pedagogical studies but also by my professional identity which has strengthened through my current working experiences.

The ability to empower learners; both learners and the teacher students themselves was found stronger. An awareness of the ethics of the teaching profession, trust in personal know-how and the capacity to change one’s view were based on the development of reflective thinking. Learning goes on; so many issues were mentioned both as learning outcomes and challenges for further development like: coping with and updating new teaching methods and the increasing quantity of knowledge; rethinking and renewing
personal educational theory and better understanding of learning and teaching in multicultural contexts and teaching learners with special needs.

CONCLUSIONS

Adult learning professionals and adult learners are more or less affected by the same facts affecting configurations in adult education and societies. Changes in cultural practices of adult learning and changes in horizons for action challenge learning and counselling. Socioeconomic changes, new technology, new knowledge and the need to transform individual competences challenge adult education as science and as training practises to support development of individuals, also reconstruction of identities and careers. Transition of working life boosts individuals to rethink future and renew things. We need to be able to change our perspectives and continue internal and external negotiations also on working identities. There are as well ethnic factors affecting societies challenging educational systems on all levels; also in the teachers' pedagogical studies under discussion there are every year one or two immigrants to further educate themselves to become a teacher.

According to findings of this research, the core elements affecting in reconstruction of professional identity when moving from one profession toward teaching in adult education are: an understanding of the subject field regarding pedagogy, general core abilities in pedagogy and schooling and a pedagogical understanding of adults' learning and studying. It is more a question of creative and critical thinking and the ability to do knowledge work than a question of precise knowhow.

Whether a person feels like the dreams have come true being a teacher or the focus is on subject expertise, the very basics of counselling adult learning is seen as same. Development of professional identity of an adult learning professional, teacher or trainer or expert - whatever they want to be called – is an on-going negotiation between selfhood and sameness and between values and practices of two different fields of sciences; it is an interdisciplinary process.

In teachers' pedagogical trainings, the challenge to support adult learning and career building is flexibility of training and counselling; it is possible through various, creative ways for learners to gain the same competence. Flexibility is connected to assessment and validation of prior learning and individual expectations and aims for future studies and learning. There are many reasons to find one's way to pedagogical training and understanding adult learning and pedagogical knowhow are appreciated and seen beneficial also outside the school system in settings, for example, like human resource counselling. The role of the teachers' pedagogical studies is meaningful. It helps to gain competence in pedagogy and builds reflective understanding about adult learning and training, in theory and in practise. The expertise including a sense of identity of adult learning professional improves and provides opportunities to reflect on and even to change the perspective that have emerged through the years.

This research comprises one step in the research continuum, in which has been designed the blended learning format for the studies to increase flexibility, prior learning assessment and collaboration. Tools also have been created to improve reflection on professional identity using web-based learning environment and to promote critical thinking. The next step to
further develop the teachers’ pedagogical studies under discussion is to discover ways to strengthen peer mentoring and collegial supervision to account methods, technologies and assessment processes to support development of an adult learning professional. The students are taken as critical partners in planning and evaluating the contents and the quality of the studies. Working with these students as a teacher educator has strengthened the view: Every career pathway leads through individual, life-long learning in which adults achieve an education to fulfil their aims and dreams.

REFERENCES:


*The national framework for qualifications and other learning* [Tutkintojen ja muun osaamisen kansallinen viitekehys] 2009. Reports of the Ministry of education. Finland


NEW CHALLENGES FOR TEACHING AND LEARNING IN GERMAN UNIVERSITY EDUCATION

Langemeyer, Ines
Karlsruher Institut für Technologie
Germany

Rohrdantz-Herrmann, Ines
Karlsruher Institut für Technologie
Germany

Having transformed “diploma” into Bachelor’s and Master’s courses at German universities, conditions of adult education on an academic level have changed tremendously. This has often been described pejoratively as the tendency to make teaching in university courses continue along the lines of school instruction. Due to an increased formalised workload and the shortened length of studies to obtain the B.A./M.A. degree, negative effects of school-like teaching have been emphasised in terms of a loss of the students’ specific disciplinary competence, of their personality development and their capacity of independent scientific thinking (e.g. Kühl 2011; Euler 2013). Against this background, we are currently observing a revival of research-led, research-based, and research-oriented methods of teaching and learning. One example is the research project “Lehre hoch Forschung” (literally “teaching to the power of research”) at the Karlsruhe Institute of Technology, which is financed under the “Qualitätspakt Lehre” of the German Ministry of Education and Research with around 8 ½ million Euros from 2012 to 2016.

In this paper, the ways of research-oriented, research-led, and research-based learning and teaching at universities being used in classes, the reasons, and the limits of use are explored empirically. Against the background of our own experience gained from the research project at the Karlsruhe Institute of Technology, we explore the significance of theoretical experience as a possible outcome of research-oriented learning. Before we present the empirical data, we would like to point out that this presentation is no report of a completed research project. It should be considered the beginning of a research process, in which the data presented only is a piece of a puzzle. The gained insights shall help to develop the instrument and the methods used.

One problem – the problem of discontinuity – shall be mentioned: the changing of workplaces by Ines Langemeyer when she obtained a professorship at the University of Tübingen in April.

SURVEY ON RESEARCH-ORIENTED ELEMENTS IN TEACHING AND LEARNING AT THE KIT

When I (Ines Langemeyer) began working as an interim professor at the KIT to set up the research on teaching and learning, I found it important to gain insights into the acceptance and the use of research-oriented elements in teaching and learning at the KIT. In co-operation with the staff of the university’s office for quality management, we developed an online survey for the teaching staff that was released in January 2013.
The online survey was sent to the university lecturers in charge and omitted the student assistants supporting the lessons. The estimated number of teaching staff is approximately around 2500 and 3000.

Although the turnout of n=265 was not a controlled representative sample, it covered the range of departments with Mechanical Engineering, Civil Engineering, Geo and Environmental Sciences, Business Administration and Economics, and Physics being overrepresented, while the Humanities and Social Sciences, Architecture, and Informatics were underrepresented.

![Figure 1: Affiliation of university teachers to departments](image)

The survey did not favour among a variety of didactical approaches a particular one and therefore listed as generally ‘research-oriented’ elements the following items: “The introduction of a new theme to cover a problem of scientific research”; “students are independently researching with regard to a certain theme”; “students contribute with their research activities to a bigger research project at the institute/chair”; “students develop independently research questions”; “students exercise independently experiments”; “students summarise independently the state of research in one area”; “students develop and plan their own research project”; “students present correlations of scientific knowledge and research”.

418
As the figure below shows, most teachers seem to introduce themes according to a scientific problem. This result was expected to be a common method in academia. Other outcomes, however, seem to be specific of the academic landscape of KIT, i.e. a large number of courses in engineering sciences and natural sciences, since these subjects traditionally require more laboratory experiments and offer to a higher degree the possibility to participate in the extensive work in a bigger research project. Here, it is important to mention that the KIT has also obtained the financing for Big Science. Laboratory work and participation in research projects of the university give students a flavour of real research and enable them to practice some routines and methods, but are not necessarily combined with the challenge to develop independently a research question or the issue at stake on a theoretical level.

Moreover, the uneven affinity towards different elements of research-oriented teaching is an outcome that indicates a discrepancy. While the teachers questioned tend to involve students into real research projects (average = 3.67; 1=very seldom, 5=very often) and let them
exercise independently experiments (3.29), they do not use as much the opportunities by
which students develop independently research questions (2.49) and develop, plan (1.99),
and conduct (2.26) a research project on their own. We do not judge these differences from a
moral or dogmatic point of view – suggesting that there would be ‘one best way’ of teaching
or that there would not be any good reasons to favour the first two options rather than the
latter. But given the salient difference between merely involving students into research and
challenging them to think independently, we conclude hypothetically that teachers either
have different forms of awareness with regard to the didactical use and the advantage of
these independent research and learning activities or that they have (good) reasons not to
favour them without restrictions.

CORRELATIONS BETWEEN DIFFERENT METHODS USED

Our hypothesis must be specified by further analyses of the data. It is paramount to see that
participation in research projects at an institute or the conduct of experiments are not used
alternatively to the self-dependent development of research questions and research projects
on their own. If teachers apply one research-oriented method, they also tend to use others.
For example: There is a correlation between the items “students contribute with their
research activities to a bigger research project at the institute/club” and “students conduct a
research project on their own” by .336**. Similarly, there is a correlation between “students
conduct independently experiments” and “students develop and plan their own research
project” is .442** and a correlation of .542** between “students summarise independently the
state of research in one area” and “students conduct a research project on their own”. The
least significant but still significant correlations are with the independent variable “introduction
of
a new theme according to a problem of scientific research” and other methods, e.g. “students
conduct a research project on their own” (.157*). The factor analysis of these items shows
that that we can find two factors behind the choice of different research-oriented elements.
FACTOR ANALYSIS OF RESEARCH-ORIENTED ELEMENTS USED

Table 1: Factor analysis of the use of research-oriented elements

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rotierte Komponentenmatrix⁴</th>
<th>Komponente 1</th>
<th>Komponente 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Studierende führen eigene Forschungsprojekte durch.</td>
<td>0,887</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(students conduct a research project on their own.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Studierende entwickeln und planen eigene Forschungsprojekte.</td>
<td>0,858</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(students develop and plan a research project on their own.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Studierende erarbeiten sich selbständig einen Forschungsstand auf einem Gebiet.</td>
<td>0,693</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(students summarise independently the state of research in one area.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Studierende entwickeln selbständig wissenschaftliche Forschungsfragen.</td>
<td>0,689</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(students develop independently scientific research questions.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Studierende führen selbständig Experimente durch.</td>
<td>0,573</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(students conduct independently experiments.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Die Einführung eines neuen Themas erfolgt anhand einer Problemstellung aus der Forschung.</td>
<td>0,741</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(The introduction of a new theme is according to a problem of scientific research.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Studierende recherchieren selbständig zu einem Thema.</td>
<td>0,733</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(students are researching independently a certain theme.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Studierende präsentieren Forschungszusammenhänge in Lehrveranstaltungen.</td>
<td>0,600</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(students present interrelations/ linkages in seminars/lectures.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Studierende arbeiten in Teilprojekten eines Forschungsprojektes am Institut/Lehrstuhl mit.</td>
<td>0,594</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(students participate in the work of research projects at the institute/chair.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Extraction method: main component analysis.
Rotation method: varimax with Kaiser normalization.
a. Rotation converges in three iterations.
(Explained variation: 46,9% = Factor 1; 12,7 = Factor 2)

The two factors can be distinguished with regard to self-dependent forms of learning. Items that load in the first factor are components of a didactical design which focus on highly self-organised forms of learning while items that load in the second factor show that teaching is not as much oriented towards self-dependency but rather towards guided forms of learning.
We can also resume the three definitions to distinguish didactical approaches:
a) *Research-led* teaching which is a form of teaching based on the ‘information transmission’ model, that follows a curriculum structured around subject content, and which focusses on understanding research findings;

b) *Research-oriented* teaching which favours a curriculum structured around research processes as well as subject content, which focusses on understanding research processes, inquiry skills and ‘research ethos’;

c) *Research-based* teaching that is based on a curriculum designed around inquiry-based activities; its focus is on learning through inquiry and thus aims at minimising the teacher-student division.

If we consider these three forms of teaching, we can interpret the two extracted factors cover in the first case (factor 1) research-based elements while they include in the second case (factor 2) both, research-oriented and research-led elements. This reduction can be underscored by strengthening that the distinction between a) and b) is quite small – both include the criteria “structured around subject content” – and the distinctions between a) and c) as well as b) and c) is rather big. Consequently, we drop the distinction of “research-oriented teaching” as a third version beyond “research-led” and “research-based” and use this term as we have already done as a generic term.¹

Although we do not aim at prioritising research-based over research-led teaching in general, we argue that students cannot develop their capacity of independent scientific thinking without practicing it. According to this thesis, it is impossible to make considerable judgements on a scientific plane, if one is unable to pose relevant theoretical questions and apply self-dependently relevant criteria to it (cf. Langemeyer 2013). The premise to identify what is relevant in science is to identify what must be taken into account as the most advanced status of research.

The factor analysis with regard to teachers’ judgements and attitudes on the use of research-oriented elements is therefore illuminating and again depicts a bifurcation like the analysis above.

¹ A systematic matching of didactical approaches and items was missing and should be undertaken in a follow-up study.
FACTOR ANALYSIS OF JUDGEMENTS AND ATTITUDES ON RESEARCH-ORIENTED ELEMENTS

Table 2: Factor analysis of judgments and attitudes about the use of research-oriented elements

Rotierte Komponentenmatrix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Komponente</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Der Einsatz forschungsorientierter Elemente in meinen Lehrveranstaltungen ist mit der Menge des Stoffs gut zu vereinbaren. (The implementation of research-oriented elements is compatible with the quantity of learning contents.)</td>
<td>,827</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Für forschungsorientierte Elemente ist die Zeit in meinen Lehrveranstaltungen ausreichend. (Time is sufficient for research-oriented elements in my classes.)</td>
<td></td>
<td>,772</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Der Einsatz forschungsorientierter Elemente ist nach meiner Lehrerfahrung für Veranstaltungen mit einer großen Teilnehmerzahl geeignet. (According to my teaching experience, use of research-oriented elements is suited for classes with a large number of participants.)</td>
<td></td>
<td>,678</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meine Beurteilungskriterien lassen sich gut auf offene Lernformen anwenden (My evaluation criteria can be applied well to open forms of learning.)</td>
<td></td>
<td>,665</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Forschungsorientierte Elemente eignen sich dazu, Studierende in der Studieneingangsphase (1.-2. Semester) an wissenschaftliches Arbeiten heranzuführen. (Research-oriented elements are suited to introduce students in their first year of study to scientific work.)</td>
<td></td>
<td>,572</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Die meisten Studierenden sind mit forschungsorientierten Elementen in der Lehre überfordert. (Most students are overstrained by research-oriented elements.)</td>
<td></td>
<td>,414</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wenn ich forschungsorientierte Elemente einbaue, komme ich in einen Konflikt mit dem Anspruch an eine gerechte Leistungsprüfung. (If I apply research-oriented elements, I get into a conflict with my own ideas of a fair form of testing.)</td>
<td></td>
<td>,514</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wenn Studierende selbständig an Forschungsfragen arbeiten, werden wissenschaftliche Standards genau eingehalten. (If students work independently on research questions, they comply exactly with scientific standards.)</td>
<td></td>
<td>,477</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Extraction method: main component analysis.
Rotation method: varimax with Kaiser normalization.
a. Rotation converges in three iterations.
(Explained variation: 46,9% = Factor 1; 12,7 = Factor 2)

According to these two factors, teachers’ judgement and attitude either conveys that research-oriented methods are found useful without restrictions or that they are seen as well
as a challenge to both students and teachers. Nevertheless, there is an intersection of both factors in the item “Research-oriented elements are suited to introduce students in their first year of study to scientific work.” We therefore assume that despite of the awareness about problems arising with research-oriented elements, there is still a positive attitude towards the idea of research-oriented teaching and learning.

There is also a differentiation between reasonable periods of time within the courses.

![Figure 3: Reasonable periods of time for the introduction of research-oriented elements](image)

Among those who answered that students should learn by means of research-oriented elements already at the beginning of their studies, some supplied us with additional explanations: “Each knowledge transfer should include aspects of research”; “In general, teaching on an academic level should be based on and correspond with the newest proven results of scientific research”; and “students should experience from the beginning what scientific research is about and should have the time to find out whether they want to continue working in this area after their studies”. This issue cannot be answered in a general manner. It is important to be aware of the specific challenges included in research-oriented elements.
A majority of lecturers identify research-oriented elements with heightening the significance of learning matters (74.5%) and to raise student’s enthusiasm for scientific issues and problems (66.7%) but only 52.1 per cent believe that students would become more independent in their own ways of thinking. Moreover, only 22.8 per cent saw an advantage of research-oriented elements with regard to students’ capacity to discriminate between a relevant and an irrelevant matter in relation to certain scientific problems. In sum, reasons for research oriented elements were provided that highlight the potential to raise their motivation for studying, creative thinking, scientific curiosity and to comply with the standards of scientific methods. This result underscores the hypothesis that a number of lecturers questioned are either not fully aware of the significance of independent thinking for scientific research or have (good) reasons not to believe that research-oriented elements necessarily foster it.

We shall therefore present some more analytical outcomes. With regard to judgements about the use of research-oriented elements, several reasons correlate with the first factor:

Figure 4: Reasons for using research-oriented elements
Table 3: Correlation between reasons for using research-oriented elements and factor 1 on judgements and attitudes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor 1: Positive judgements/attitudes about the use of research-oriented elements in correlation with reasons why they are implemented</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Ich kann mich bei der Vor- und Nachbereitung der Veranstaltungen entlasten. (I can relieve myself with regard to preparation and the follow-up.) | -0.346**  
| Studierende entwickeln ein tieferes Verständnis für Zusammenhänge. (Students develop a deeper understanding for interrelations/contextual matters.) | 0.284**  
| Studierende können Gelerntes besser transferieren. (Students can transfer better what they have learnt.) | 0.298**  
| Studierende können zwischen Wesentlichem und Unwesentlichem besser unterscheiden. (Students can distinguish better between what is essential and what is not essential.) | 0.245**  

Factor 2 on judgements and attitudes (a problem-centred view on the use of research-oriented elements) do not correlate in any significant manner with reasons.

Factor 1 on the implementation of different research-oriented elements (the research-based form of teaching) correlate significantly with the following reasons:

Table 4: Use of different research-oriented elements in correlation with reasons for applying these elements

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor 1: Use of research-based elements in correlation with reasons for applying these elements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Studierende entwickeln ein tieferes Verständnis für Zusammenhänge. (Students develop a deeper understanding for interrelations/contextual matters.) | 0.197**  
| Studierende entwickeln analytische Fähigkeiten. (Students develop analytical capacities.) | 0.286**  
| Studierende werden in ihrer Arbeitsweise selbständiger. (Students become more independent in their way of working.) | 0.178*  
| Die Arbeit von Studierenden ist für mich bzw. für meine Arbeit nützlich. (The work of students is useful for me/my work.) | 0.285**  

Factor 2 on the implementation of different research-oriented elements (the research-led form of teaching) correlates significantly with these reasons:
Table 5: Use of different research-oriented elements in correlation with reasons for applying these elements

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor 2: Use of research-led elements in correlation with reasons for applying these elements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Der Stoff wird dadurch anschaulicher. (Research-oriented elements make lectures more understandable.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Der Stoff wird für die Studierenden bedeutsamer. (Research-oriented elements heighten the significance of the subject matter.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Studierende entwickeln ein tieferes Verständnis für Zusammenhänge. (Students develop a deeper understanding for interrelations/contextual matters.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Studierende können Gelerntes besser transferieren. (Students can transfer better what they have learnt.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Studierende lassen sich für das Thema meiner Veranstaltung begeistern. (Research-oriented elements help to raise students' enthusiasm for the theme of my lecture).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Studierende werden in ihrer Arbeitsweise selbständiger: (Students become more self-dependent in their way of working.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Studierende lernen zusammen zu arbeiten. (Students learn to cooperate.)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

We conclude from these analyses that the four factors stand for orientations that cannot be depicted simply on a linear correlation with gradual differences in reasons. Arguments for and against using research-oriented elements may rather be a combination of different reasons, attitudes and forms of application.

REGRESSION ANALYSES ON THE FOUR FACTORS AND YEARS OF EXPERIENCE

Teaching experience\(^2\) itself has an impact on whether teachers use research-oriented elements or not. The following diagram shows the differences between the groups in relation to the sum score for a first orientation.

---

\(^2\) To avoid problems with data security, the questionnaire did not include the item „age“. “Years of experience” was used instead.
Figure 5: “How many years are you already giving lectures in a scientific environment?” in relation to the sum score of research-oriented elements used.

The t-test comparing group 1 (0-3 years) and group 4 (16 and more years) is significant with respect to factor 2 on judgments (problem-centred view) with averages of 0.207 (0-3 years) and -0.398 (16 and more years): \( t = 2.159; \text{df} = 46; p = 0.036 \) (Sig. 2-seitig) (variances are even). That means, that teachers with 16 and more years of experience respond significantly less to a problem-centred view than those with only 0-3 years of experience. The t-tests for a comparison of groups 2 (4-8 years) and group 3 (9-15 years) with group 4 are however not significant.

Another significant difference consists between group 1 (0-3 years) and group 4 (16 and more years) with respect to factor 2 on the use of research-oriented elements (research-led teaching). Averages are -0.151 for 0-3 years and 0.387 for 16 and more years: \( t = -2.246; \text{df} = 79; p = 0.027 \) (variances are even). Similarly, the t-test for a comparison between group 2 (4-8 years) and group 4 on factor 2 (research-led teaching) has a significant outcome with averages of -0.078 (4-8 years) and 0.387 (16 and more years): \( t = -2.168; \text{df} = 89; p = 0.033 \) (variances are even). There are no significant outcomes for comparisons between groups 1 and 2, 2 and 3 as well as 3 and 4. This means that teachers with 16 and more years of experience respond significantly more to research-led teaching than teachers with 0 to 8 years of experience.

Finally, there is a significant difference between group 3 (9-15 years) and group 4 (16 and more years) with respect to factor 1 on the use of research-oriented elements (research-based teaching). Averages are 0.324 for 9-15 years and -0.294 for 16 and more years: \( t = 2.613; \text{df} = 72,819; p = .011 \) (variances are not even). That means that teachers with 9-15
years of experience respond significantly more to research-based methods than teachers with 16 and more years of experience.

What we may infer from these analyses is that teaching experience matters with regard to identifying and solving problems that occur with research-oriented elements as teaching or learning methods. This could shape the grounds why these lecturers favour research-led teaching over research-based teaching. With regard to the comparison between group 3 and 4 on research-based teaching we can assume that this difference is not only a matter of gradually gaining more teaching experience but maybe also a matter of a generational difference.

This thesis can be supported by the following analysis. By means of regression analyses, we can see that the positive view has in general a significant effect on the response to research-based teaching (factor 1 on the use of research-oriented elements) \( (b_1 = .275; R^2 = .073; p = .012) \) as well a significant positive effect on the response to research-led teaching (factor 2 on the use of research-oriented elements) \( (b_1 = .447; R^2 = .231; p = .000) \). A problem-centred view (factor 2 on judgements) has in general no considerable effect on the response to research-based teaching (factor 1 on the use of research-oriented elements) \( (b_1 = -.082; R^2 = .006) \) and similarly no considerable effect on response to research-led teaching \( (b_1 = -.046; R^2 = .002) \). In relation to years of experience, the picture is more differentiated.

The following table gives an overview of effects in consideration of the years of teaching.

**Table 6: Regression analyses on the four factors**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Years of teaching</th>
<th>Independent variable: Positive view (factor 1 on judgments/attitudes) on the use of research-oriented elements</th>
<th>Independent variable: Problematic view (factor 2 on judgments/attitudes) on the use of research-oriented elements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0-3</td>
<td>Research-based: ( b_1 = .387 ) ( (p = .057) ) ( R^2 = .143 )</td>
<td>Research-based: ( b_1 = -.194 ) ( R^2 = .033 )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Research-led: ( b_1 = .508^{*} ) ( (p = .017) ) ( R^2 = .216 )</td>
<td>Research-led: ( b_1 = .087 ) ( R^2 = .006 )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-8</td>
<td>Research-based: ( b_1 = .110 ) ( R^2 = .015 )</td>
<td>Research-based: ( b_1 = -.103 ) ( R^2 = .014 )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Research-led: ( b_1 = .414^{**} ) ( (p = .001) ) ( R^2 = .335 )</td>
<td>Research-led: ( b_1 = .040 ) ( R^2 = .003 )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9-15</td>
<td>Research-based: ( b_1 = .455 ) ( R^2 = .153 )</td>
<td>Research-based: ( b_1 = .104 ) ( R^2 = .006 )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Research-led: ( b_1 = .467 ) ( (p = .056) ) ( R^2 = .236 )</td>
<td>Research-led: ( b_1 = -.291 ) ( R^2 = .064 )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 and more</td>
<td>Research-based: ( b_1 = .009 ) ( R^2 = .000 )</td>
<td>Research-based: ( b_1 = .311 ) ( R^2 = .154 )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Research-led: ( b_1 = .006 ) ( R^2 = .000 )</td>
<td>Research-led: ( b_1 = .189 ) ( R^2 = .075 )</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Here, we see that significant effects are only observable with regard to teachers with 0 to 8 years of experience and this effect is only significant for research-led teaching. Teachers having up to 15 years of teaching experience and a positive attitude towards research-oriented forms of teaching also clearly have a positive effect on using both, research-based and research-led forms of teaching. Only for those with 16 years and more of experience, a positive view is basically without effects. We may interpret these outcomes as a hint to a change of generation. All these findings however need further empirical investigation and analyses.

Another possibility of analysing the data with respect to years of experience, esp. the category of 16 and more years, is to look at contingencies with regard to reasons for using research-oriented elements. Here, we find that group 4 (16 and more years of experience) has a significant response to considering the reason that with research-oriented elements students learn to work together. Those with more experience are more likely to stress the positive effect on students’ ability to cooperate.
Table 7: “How many years are you already giving lectures in a scientific environment?” in relation to reasons for using research-oriented elements.

How many years are you already giving lectures in a scientific environment? * Which reasons do you identify for the use of research-oriented elements?: Research-oriented elements support students in cooperating

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Years</th>
<th>Number of observations</th>
<th>Standardised residua</th>
<th>Research-oriented elements support students in cooperating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0-3 years</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>.9</td>
<td>In total</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-8 years</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>.9</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9-15 years</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>-.2</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 and more</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>-.5</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In total</td>
<td>175</td>
<td>-2.0</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chi-square tests

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>value</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Asymptotic significance (2-sided)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chi-square Pearson</td>
<td>16,790(^a)</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Likelihood-Quotient</td>
<td>16,289</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Correlation linear-to-linear</td>
<td>13,374</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of valid</td>
<td>266</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. 0 cells (0,0%) have an expected frequency less than 5. The minimal expected frequency is 18,13.

Furthermore, the years of experience influence significantly whether teachers consider the reason to use research-oriented elements to motivate students: More years of experience have a positive effect on the likeliness to consider this reason.
How many years are you already giving lectures in a scientific environment? * Which reasons do you identify for the use of research-oriented elements?: Research-oriented elements motivate students in seminars/lectures crosstab

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>How many years are you already giving lectures in a scientific environment?</th>
<th>Which reasons do you identify for the use of research-oriented elements? Research-oriented elements motivate students in seminars/lectures</th>
<th>In total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0-3 years</td>
<td>Number of observations</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Standardised residua</td>
<td>1.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-8 years</td>
<td>Number of observations</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Standardised residua</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9-15 years</td>
<td>Number of observations</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Standardised residua</td>
<td>-.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 and more years</td>
<td>Number of observations</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Standardised residua</td>
<td>-2.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In total</td>
<td>Number of observations</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chi-square-tests

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>values</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Asymptotic significance (2-sided)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chi-square Pearson</td>
<td>13,319*</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>.004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Likelihood-Quotient</td>
<td>13,884</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>.003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>correlation linear-to-linear</td>
<td>11,115</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of valid observations</td>
<td>266</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* 0 cells (0.0%) have an expected frequency less than 5. The minimal expected frequency is 20.32.

These outcomes underscore that teachers with 16 and more years of experience have a different view on students learning that is more oriented towards students’ motivation and less towards competition. These findings need as well further analyses.
DIFFERENCES BETWEEN THE FACULTY A TEACHER BELONGS TO

The following table shows that teachers in the faculty of mathematics use research-oriented elements the least, teachers in the faculty of Electro and Computer Science, Chemistry and Bio-Sciences, and Human and Social Sciences the most:

Table 8: The use of research-oriented elements in faculties

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Report</th>
<th>SUMScore</th>
<th>Einsatz</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Affiliation of university teachers to departments?</td>
<td>Mittelwert / Average</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Architecture</td>
<td>19,9091</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civil Engineering, Geo and Environmental Sciences</td>
<td>18,7838</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chemistry and Biological Sciences</td>
<td>28,7308</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chemical Engineering and Process Engineering</td>
<td>24,3333</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electrical Engineering and Information Technology</td>
<td>25,2222</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Humanities and Social Sciences</td>
<td>27,8421</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informatics</td>
<td>25,9688</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mechanical Engineering</td>
<td>23,0513</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mathematics</td>
<td>14,4444</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physics</td>
<td>21,0000</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business Administration and Economics</td>
<td>21,1935</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>House of Competence</td>
<td>26,0000</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Centre of Cultural Studies and General Studies</td>
<td>19,0000</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>14,5000</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In total</td>
<td>22,9660</td>
<td>265</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These results are plausible with regard to the “nature” of the disciplines as mathematics have in general a rather small empirical basis – although it forms the basis of quantitative research methods.

This underscores our argument not to infer generally from the use of research-oriented elements that they would (so to speak automatically) ensure a higher quality of teaching and learning. It depends on the context and the purpose whether certain research-oriented elements can improve these activities. For further investigations, it will be important to
explore the effects of these elements. We suggest that a theoretical foundation of the fitness of research-oriented elements for specific learning objectives and learning needs will be paramount.

WHAT IS THEORETICAL EXPERIENCE?

With regard to this term, we need to unfold a bit more the underlying problematic. Techniques of doing research are taken for granted without thorough reflection of the theoretical basis or the epistemological and philosophical implications of the subject matter under investigation. This is not a cause, but a symptom of the presently existing division between method and methodology, between empirical and theoretical sciences. Therefore, also scientific judgements are often made in two ways: Although some approaches mainly make a difference to asserted knowledge by bringing precise measurements, models of calculation, or techniques of observation to perfection, others emphasize that research has to be critical of the epistemological means and concentrate on differentiating concepts and theories. Innovations in science thus emanate either from "technological" improvements or from purely philosophical efforts, which are not related to each other. The curriculum of Bachelor’s and Master’s courses may reflect this division by placing the knowledge of methods ahead of the knowledge of theories. Consequently, both forms of knowledge are not strategically connected to each other. If the curriculum is shaped like this, it gives rise to a conflict for both teachers and students.

Given the students’ expectations that they would simply need to acquire a corpus of methodical knowledge, the starting point of the conflict consisted in the fact that the complex dimensions of theoretical experience is overlooked or neglected – not in seminars or lectures as such, but by the students without intent. Their expectation was that the purpose of teaching consists in communicating knowledge (Vermittlung von Wissen) in terms of ready-made facts or approved insights. However, knowledge is not identical with experience. One can have knowledge without having it integrated into one’s own scope of experience. In contrast to knowledge, experience is a reflected form of personal involvement, a way of experiencing the world, and a way of rendering given aspects of the world into subjective meaningful objects. It is obvious that self-dependent forms of learning during an independently conducted research process therefore suffer from the lack of subjective meaningful objects. But this gap needs more reflection.

The crux consists in the fact that theoretical experience can emerge only on the basis of theoretical experience. This is not a vicious cycle in teaching and no tautology! Everyday-life experience is not non theoretical. However, it is not elaborated in the form of scientific theories and quite often at odds with common sense beliefs. Scientific research serves the purpose of reconstructing causal connections, interactions, of identifying the general within the particular/the concrete, and of analysing in what ways processes of a higher order determine the processes of a lower order, etc. These purposes can only be fulfilled by acknowledging not only the capacity of empirical research methods but, above all, the work of concepts. Concepts do not reflect or express scientific insights, in terms of experience, they rather work or help to produce scientific thoughts by grasping a certain problem and, at best, by solving it in a certain manner. Concepts in use can therefore be distinguished with regard to the level of thinking to which they belong (cf. Vygotsky 1962). They often do not differ as symbolic signs, but as semantic tools. Therefore it is difficult to identify differences in
the communication process when someone is unfamiliar with these differences as such. Consequently, teaching must serve the purpose of creating the prerequisites for a communication process about the subject matter to work out on a scientific level. This is only possible when we understand the significance of theoretical experience and its correlation with the students’ (scientific) interests. Within academic studies, this experience is about leading our concepts in use into a crisis.

In other words, theoretical experience is possible only when we consciously take on a certain theoretical perspective (which may also be a perspective adopted in everyday life), deal with it in a subjectively meaningful way, and plunge it into a crisis. It is necessary to experience this discrepancy that a certain theoretical problem cannot be resolved with the intellectual strategies available. Only then are we forced to realise the limits of our previous perspective that are overcome by expanding it within a new theoretical perspective.

CONCLUSION

There are more issues that require consideration if we are to discuss the possibilities of organising theoretical experience of this kind. We try to address them in a general manner and to relate them to the prevailing type of university management:

One aspect is the increased number of lectures and seminars that students from different disciplines attend. The new curricula of Bachelor’s and Master’s courses more often consist of modules that are designed for the supply of teaching across different university courses. Thus, the management calculates that the scarce teaching capacities are more effectively used. In addition, disciplinary and interdisciplinary co-operation projects have an advantage in the competition for research funding. Consequently, we assume that the traditional division of academic disciplines into sub-disciplines partly loses significance. University teachers are required to co-operate more intensively with each other regardless of paradigmatic or epistemological divisions and gaps and therefore scientific struggles and the forming of traditions seem to be less adequate to foster and consolidate that cross-disciplinary structure of co-operation.

If this diagnosis is true, we need to explore whether the students’ enculturation with regard to particular scientific paradigms has lost significance. An important effect of this would be that research-led and research-oriented learning meets the challenge of a lack of clear orientations within the general situation of universities. Due to the neglect of theoretical differences, research experience is less characterised by struggles between different theoretical approaches. Consequently, students are less stimulated to ground their experiences in a conscious adaptation of theoretical perspectives. An indication for this loss could also be that the curricular design of Bachelor’s and Master’s courses pays particular attention on generic competences to ensure – beyond a certain degree of expertise – professional skills rather than scientific qualifications.

Research into teaching and learning thus exceeds the boundaries of classroom or curriculum research. It needs to be proceeded on a more general level of socio-cultural developments. This report gives a first outline of the project.
REFERENCES


TRAINING MANAGERS: A CASE STUDY OF A FRENCH CORPORATE UNIVERSITY

Mallard, Simon
University of Rennes
CREAD (Research Center on Education, Learning and Didactics)
France

Eneau, Jerome
University of Rennes
CREAD (Research Center on Education, Learning and Didactics)
France

Davis, Kate (Translation)

ABSTRACT

This paper will analyze the learning design from the learning designers’ and trainers’ point of view. Focusing on the training system, we use a threefold model: “ideational”, “functional” and “experienced” dimensions of a training system.

In the French public mail company, training for all managers is provided by a department of the Corporate University: the “School of Managers”. How has the project evolved since the original plan? If there are some gaps, how can we analyze the fact that, when it comes to innovation, “things never go exactly as planned”? Using interviews with designers and trainers involved in this project (N=7), we present the results of a discourse analysis performed with computer-assisted software. Answering the main goals of the research, the results will help us to better understand the prior ideas of the people in charge of the original system about (a) professionalization of managers, and (b) emotional and socioaffective dimensions of learning.

INTRODUCTION

Skill development is hugely important for the Human Resources department at La Poste Courrier, one of the main postal operators in Europe. The aim of their HR policy and more generally of their corporate policy is to develop their workers’ employability, meet the challenges of the present and best prepare for the future in order to ensure the growth of new postal offers while at the same time improving working conditions and improving the economic performance of the business.

In 2009, a special entity, the École des Managers, or School of Managers was created to assist managers as the business underwent change, in particular the increase in the size of the sorting centres and the new, expanded role and implemented practices that the managers there have to play. The School of Managers was focused on creating, putting into place and evaluating a training programme for managers at La Poste.

These training programmes take into account managers’ experience and focus on workplace situations for learning. This position means the programme has to look at the complete
human being and understand learning in various dimensions – cognition, conation and emotion (Barbier & Galatanu, 1998). The study of the training courses presented herein is part of a doctoral research project examining the emotional and socioaffective dimensions of the training these managers receive.

In this paper, we will look at how these issues are taken into account in the development and implementation of these training courses, from the point of view of the designers and trainers. We will not examine here the learners' point of view. The context for this study will be briefly presented to highlight how original the School of Manager's educational project is (École des Managers, 2009). The theoretical framework for the analysis of the training "system", proposed by Albero (2010a, 2011), will then be reviewed. Two types of data will be used to illustrate the theoretical basis: observing participation and the analysis of semi-structured interviews. All of this data will allow us to answer the following questions: How do the designers and trainers view the emotional and socioaffective dimensions in professional training? How are they taken into account during the design and implementation of the training system? What differences are there between the system as it was originally designed and the system as it is implemented?

CONTEXT OF THE STUDY: TRAINING MANAGERS AT LA POSTE

La Poste is seeking to decentralize its organization with the goal of delegating greater power to the field in order to meet the strategic, human, financial and legal aims of the business. The organisational model is intended to be both top-down and bottom-up. The decentralization they are seeking should be taken on board by the employees, starting with the current organi culture: the slogan used widely in the company is “La Poste of tomorrow is built by the postal workers1 of today”. Faced with the changes of decentralization, the School of Managers works with managers in their new roles and on their position with regard to their superiors, the people under them, their peers and their work environment. Since 2009, more than 3000 managers have been through this training.

The School of Managers is currently located in the La Poste corporate university, which is responsible for training all postal workers in La Poste, meaning nearly 150,000 people. Up until 1991, the training departments remained attached to the ideals of teaching, school and managers, all notions that belonged to the bureaucratic, governmental structure in place. This is because La Poste in France was a public administration up until 1991. Since 1991, La Poste has been moving towards a private business model (reflected in its current status as a Société Anonyme, or public limited company) while still retaining its particular culture. As for the new training policies and the “manager factory”, “adult education” for the company's managers is now called “continuous professional education for managers” (Cristol, 2011; Wildemeersch & Salling Olesen, 2012). At the organisational level, institutionalizing these changes, the term Corporate University (Université d’Entreprise) was first used beginning in 1994 and became official in 2005. In the courses, the “professional positioning” has become a more important concept than the "organisational culture". In terms of pedagogy, the methods used focus on action, interaction, games and experiential education. In addition, the School of Managers’ pedagogical project includes emotions as one of the elements that encourage learning and in particular memorization.
Beyond the semantic, institutional and pedagogical changes, the most important change was from initial, obligatory employee training after they successfully completed a competitive, national test – meaning they became civil servants after an internship period – to a “lifelong learning” approach. Up until then, training went with beginning a job and made it possible to transmit a particular culture from the top down. Now training methods and their aims are much more varied – face-to-face ‘classroom’ courses, blended learning, adapting to a position, skill development, etc. In this context, the fact that the School of Managers takes emotions into consideration represents a clear break with the traditional pedagogical models that formerly underlay training policy, design and implementation.

However, the change, like all innovations in training, has not gone without a hitch and modifications have been made between the initial intentions, the training's implementation and its current form. The School of Managers did indeed develop an ambitious project for the business, considering its past. But how has the project evolved since its earliest design? To what extent have emotional and socioaffective dimensions been taken into account in developing and implementing the project? More generally, what differences do we see between the initial project and the current reality?

**THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK: EMOTIONS AND TRAINING SYSTEMS**

The School of Managers here will be examined as a “system” in the sense used by Albero ( dispositif in French often translated in Foucault's work by apparatus), in terms of technical organization and the strategic implementation of resources for a specific goal (Albero, Linard & Robin, 2009; Albero, 2010a, 2010b). Agamben (2007), like Foucault, defines the “system” as (a) “a heterogeneous series that includes almost everything, both discursive and otherwise […]; (b) The system always has a concrete strategic function and is always within a structured power relationship […]; (c) as such, it is the result of the combination of power relations and knowledge” (Agamben, 2007, pp. 10-11).

The use of the term system is justified by the mechanisms, the procedures and the ends-means relation that serves as a logical control of action, all of which “give the training course the status of an engineered thing with a highly technical connotation” (Albero, 2011, p. 59). On one hand, technique is to be considered a part of culture; on the other hand, according to the Heideggerian approach, technique should also be considered in an ontological way, in relation to the “being” rather than existence, and also in relation to “technical action” (Albero, 2010b). It is the relationship between technical action and being that needs to be elucidated here, in order to understand the gap between the innovation sought and how that innovation is implemented, between prescribed activity, real activity and the reality of the activity (Clot, 1999). In other words, by analysing the system in its two-fold “technical” and “social” dimension as well as on different “ideational, functional and experienced” levels we can observe and understand why, between the plan and the implementation, when it comes to innovating in professional training just as in other fields, “things never go exactly as planned” (Albero, 2011).

With this in mind, the study of the system is organised along three lines (Albero, 2010a). The first, the “ideational dimension” includes the guiding values and the principles and goals of the system. The examination here sheds light on the School of Managers’ ideas, principles, models and values. The second dimension of the system is the “design references”. This
means studying how the ideals are implemented, that is to say how the ideals are translated into action by operators, in our case the design and implementing of the training system and how this system is rolled out through the decision makers and how it functions. The third line is the experience of the people who go through this system. Every person interprets the situations experienced subjectively given his/her character, life experience, needs, explicit goals or implicit aims and even how they view others as they try to “work together” (Albero, 2010a). In this paper, we will only discuss the experience of designers and trainers; we will not go into the learners’ experience, which will be dealt with in another portion of the research that is currently under way.

Concerning the specific role of emotions in this training system, the emotional and socioaffective dimensions will be dealt with here as “adaptive phenomena” and include subjective feelings, psycho-physiological responses and a cognitive evaluation, as well as a behavioural dimension and expressive aspects (Channouf & Rouan, 2002; Sander & Scherer, 2009). They are often brief and changing; they could be compared here with a physical “gesture” which the body makes for itself and others to see (Dumouchel, 1999). In this bio-psycho-sociological view, emotions and feelings are seen as an individual and a social phenomenon of adaptation. Lastly, the role of speech and verbalisation should be considered in terms of emotional manifestations as they allow us to understand ourselves and others (Averil & Rodis, 1998).

The emotional and socioaffective dimensions, little examined in research on adult education and even less in workplace training, are often suspected of being counterproductive to the “rationality” of learning. In terms of methodology, the difficulty of capturing emotions – and because of their nature, controlling them – limits the extent to which they can be considered when studying adult education, particularly within an organization. The role they play is therefore often ignored despite the fact that numerous authors in different fields stress the very weighty even determining role, in some cases, that emotions play in human conduct (Damasio, 2010; Darwin, 1981; Gardner, 1983; Le Breton, 1998). We could not possibly examine all the causes and characteristics here, so we will limit ourselves in this paper to studying how they are taken into account (or rather not) in the training system proposed by the School of Managers, from the point of view of the designers and the trainers in particular.

**DATA COLLECTION AND ANALYSIS METHODOLOGY**

To answer the questions originally posed about the changes in manager training at La Poste and how emotional and socioaffective dimensions were included in designing and implementing the training, we established a protocol for gathering and analysing data.

As for gathering data, the presence of a doctoral student (S. Mallard) at various committees, meetings and discussions with the School of Managers team can be considered a “pre-existing detail” (Van Der Maren, 2003), which exists independently of the research. The researcher’s positions shifts between “participating observation” and “observing participation” (Soulé, 2007): participation in the team (meetings and other discussions), training development activities, etc. For all of these activities, the doctoral student’s research gave a justifiable reason for his presence.
In addition, a series of semi-structured interviews (7 in all) was held between March and April 2013 with different people from the School of Managers; all of them were involved in developing the course and three of them also implement it as trainers. The interview chart was drawn up based on Albero, Linard & Robin (2009) with a view to describing and analysing the design of “innovative” training systems. These interviews were transcribed and analysed using the text analysis software Alceste, and the detailed analysis reports were interpreted.

To start, the software breaks down the text to be analysed (all of the interviews) into relatively homogeneous fragments called “context units”. Then, the software seeks to classify them hierarchically; the fragments are divided into two distinct “classes” according to the vocabulary used. The fragments in the larger of the two classifications are then distributed again until two new classifications are found. This distribution and classification operation continues until a stable number of classifications is achieved (Kalampalikis & Moscovici, 2005). In the end, each lexical classification is described using a specific term and includes “reduced forms”. These make it possible to understand the signifiers behind the words, or the “sound-image” to use Saussure’s terms (1975).

In this case, analysis of the interviews yielded five lexical classifications (1) participants’ emotions and subjectivity; (2) trainers’ interpersonal skills in managing emotions; (3) implicit or explicit theories included in the design; (4) necessary questioning of the issue of emotions in the design; (5) the role of emotions in learning activities. The data in these five classes adds to, supports or calls into question the data from the “observing participation” mentioned above.

RESULTS: WHAT THE SYSTEM DESIGNERS AND INSTRUCTORS SAY

In the first lexical classification “participants’ emotions and subjectivity”, there is a high chi-squared value for adjectives and adverbs, meaning a high occurrence rate or a high co-occurrence of these terms. They are used to describe the properties of nouns or nuance the meaning of verbs, respectively. They provide the precision in discourse that socioaffective and emotional dimensions require. This classification is a set of words that describe the dimensions mentioned in the interviews; emotions are therefore “subjective” and “individual” according to one of the people interviewed. The reduced forms found here are for the majority produced by men while there is a significant lack of them from women and the trainers (negative chi-squared value). These forms are used for the majority by the designers in connection with their role in the design, thus removed from the “manager learners”. For them, the ideas of “enjoyment”, “emotion” and “feelings” are very subjective and related to the individual, to every subject and for that reason, it would be difficult to qualify these subjective dimensions for someone else. Moreover, as one of the subjects interviewed stated, there are different ways of imagining training. One way would be to “follow the objectives in a concrete way”, but “disconnecting the human aspect” and leaving aside any emotional dimension. The second way would be to take into account the “individual’s subjectivity”. In order to do that, they would have to constantly ask a question that is almost impossible to answer: “does the way I am designing this bring out particular emotions?” In the designers’ view, the emotional experience is subjective and constitutes a challenge when designing a system. However, this classification does not reflect the discourses in their
entirety because it is the most isolated of the classifications and is significantly more represented in the discourse of one designer in particular.

The second classification, known as “trainers’ interpersonal skills in managing emotions” is the most well represented in our study (47% of all of the context units) and includes a set of adverbs, nouns and words indicating a spatial relationship. This classification specifies the context for the training’s implemented as a combination of a particular time and place (“moment” and words indicating a spatial relationship) and persons (“people”) which needs to be a “true” or real experience (very frequent occurrence), described by one of the subjects as “being a part of real life”. Here, managing emotions in a training course depends upon a certain skill on the part of the trainer: an emotional know-how, being able to create relations, to make them make sense. One person spoke of the trainer as the keystone, i.e. the one element that brings together different parts and makes the construction (in the architectural sense) hold together. In other words, the trainer creates cohesion for multiple dimensions, including emotions, in learning. This know-how is distinct from what is required when designing a training system. In this classification there is a distinction and even perhaps opposition between the statements by trainers and designers (significant presence and absence, respectively). At certain points, the designers even distance themselves – they are not the ones implementing it and, in their opinion, the system that they designed and constructed has less influence on how the participants in the training system learn than the trainer’s technical knowledge. Some say there is almost a separation or independence between the two levels, designing and implementing training systems. How do these two activities overlap and complement each other? From an organizational point of view, development and implementation are two separate entities. This classification poses the question of creating learning resources and the resources (human, technical or other) that need to be mobilized to foster an emotional climate that facilitates managers’ learning. In other words, they implicitly ask “how do you create a climate that fosters learning?”. The significant absence of intensity markers shows perhaps the trainers’ inability to describe the “ingredients” that encourage a “good” emotional atmosphere in the training room. The participating observation confirms these elements and highlights the wide range of practices and diversity in how trainers take emotions into account in training. The observations also show how important the spatial arrangement for the training area and the use of space and resources are, and these depend heavily on the trainer.

The third classification corresponds to the “theories included in the design”, which is closest to the second classification (“trainers’ interpersonal skills in managing emotions”), contains the following vocabulary: “framework, concept, start, limit”. There is a significant presence of the French auxiliary verbs “to be” and “to have” and interjections. There is a significant absence of modal verbs, adjectives, adverbs, modal markers and person markers. This classification includes a somewhat nebulous subject. Some of those interviewed noted that the framework for the School of Managers’ pedagogical project seemed “fuzzy” and “informal” for the designers because it is not specific enough or shared broadly enough. In addition, some of the participants regretted that they had no chance to discuss the theoretical references used (called the “framework” in the interview), or the theories put forward: this lack of dialogue is even likened to “censorship” by one of the people interviewed. For another person, the pedagogical project is seen as being related to the political orientations of the business, at least as he understands them. There may also be differences in different participants’ perceptions. The theories about management and the pedagogy were not discussed within the group and were selected outside of the group of system designers.
Concerning emotions, no theory held by designers was discussed because emotions constituted a “non-subject”. Lastly, on the implementation side of things, the participating observation found that the trainers each created their own individual definition of what a La Poste manager should be, based on their own personal and professional experience, sometimes even as a former manager or sometimes from more “private” theoretical knowledge. But in general, no one was able to answer the question “What makes a La Poste manager?”. It is the same for the question of experiential learning or learning from experience – according to the results from the participating observation neither the designers nor the trainers agreed upon a single view. Experience was considered at best something that shapes an adult and the trainers work de facto in experiential education. Others feel that experiential education is more a form of “feedback on experience” provided by managers.

The fourth classification, concerning a “necessary questioning of the issue of emotions in the design”, closest to classification 1 (“participants’ emotions and subjectivity”) and furthest from classification 3 (“theories included in the design”), includes modal verbs, person markers, modal markers and markers for intensity. Conversely, adjectives and nouns are significantly absent. The questions that all of these people were asked concerned a particular subject, emotions, which was not brought up during the design and yet was implicitly included (“we have the elements in mind”). For two of the people participating in the project, the subject of emotions, although it was not explicitly present when developing the course, was nonetheless clearly included. For one of the people interviewed, the fact that they cooperated on developing the project (“being together” and “doing together”) helped to “include emotions”. The selection of those who played a role seems to be another implicit factor in the project – everyone who helped design the system was chosen for their “individual” profile, their individuality and the sensitivity they would in their own way include in the design.

Finally, the fifth classification covers the “role of emotions in learning activities” and shows a high presence of verbs, adjectives and adverbs and a significant absence of “-ment” adverbs (French suffix corresponding to “-ly” adverbs in English) and nouns. In other words, the people interviewed are talking about action, and more specifically learning activities (“finding out”, “memorizing”, “inciting”, “making possible”, etc.) that can encourage emotional and socioaffective dimensions. Here, the activities that incorporate the most emotions are those most often cited by the people interviewed. In this classification, the learners also make their entrance (the term “intern” although its use is relative). The notion of “trust” is highlighted because it is a requisite, according to the subjects interviewed, for expressing emotions in a group. In response to the question they were asked, the interviewees particularly associated emotions with memorisation (which is part of the pedagogical project). However, the responses were much broader and took into account emotions both in the system’s design and its implementation. The question the interviewer asked was clearly seeking to find examples of activities using emotions. The way the training is organised into seminars and modules would seem to make it “fertile” ground for taking the emotional dimensions into account. Some seminars (the “first” one in particular) encourage emotions being taken into account. However, one of the people interviewed held a different view; in his opinion emotion is precisely “what’s missing” in the system. The only emotions present in this system were expressed during the design phase and not in its implementation; that was in the debate in which each person hoped to put in place their chosen theory. Classification 5 seems to be the most distant from the others and illustrates for some examples of how the pedagogical activity includes emotions, or quite the contrary, for others, how subjectivity and emotions are missing. There is then a tension here between two opposite views.
To summarize, according to classification 1, the issue of emotions is an individual question. However, it is up to the trainer to manage this emotional dimension in the training situation (indicated in classification 2). Although, as indicated in classification 4, emotions were implicitly included in the development (presence of verbs and absence of tool-words), class 5 includes a certain number of examples in which emotions were gradually taken into account.

**DISCUSSION AND OPENNESS**

From the five lexical classifications given by the Alceste analysis, two major views take shape: the first concerns designers and the second the trainers who implement the system. Everyone makes a distinction among teaching activities according to the “emotional level”. While Isen (1987) finds that emotion is “intimately” tied to cognition, the interviewees, for the most part, separate cognition and emotion. Thus for the system's designers as well as for the trainers, cognition excludes emotion and emotion excludes cognition.

The diagram below shows the tensions between (a) the designed forms, from design to implementation and (b) the degree of subjectivity. The first axis could be described as the designed axis and the second one as the subjectivity axis. This allows us to examine the learning activities (analysis of practices, skills portfolio, games, etc.) that are implemented according to the views of the designers and the designer-instructors. What is designed to have a high emotional content does not necessarily have that content in practice and vice versa.

Lastly, a certain number of activities, such as those arranged on the diagram and some that are included in the course, either may not be cited or may not be known to the subjects interviewed given that not everyone is aware of the end result or the pedagogical process and everything that “really” happens during the training.
Diagram: Tensions in how emotions are included

Given the different analyses provided by Alceste, and particularly those in the fifth classification, we can infer that the policy and the design, in principle, provide a framework that fosters emotions. Despite that, the positioning of various activities is very approximate. In the interviews, the subjects could not justify why and how the specific activities can encourage emotions. According to the views of the people interviewed, the effectiveness of the system depends principally on the trainer. There was then no connection between the designers' and the trainers' “design references” (including all the theories put forward, which should also be found in the realization of the system’s “ideational dimension”). What is striking for their absence from the interviews is the training group and the learners, for whom the system was in fact created. They only appear in the fifth classification, a small portion of our body of data. The final target is only rarely mentioned in the interviews. Yet while the role of the trainer as a mediator does seem key, the space allowed the learner in the system is every bit as important since they are the key figure in the learning act.

Furthermore, it is important to highlight that the emotional and socioaffective dimension had never been discussed before the interviews done for this research. Yet this aspect was indeed included in the School of Managers’ pedagogical plan. In other words, the plan does not seem to be entirely understood or broadly shared. The lack of a defined theoretical framework, or one that can be defined collectively, seems to be a problem for cooperative work. Working with the threefold approach used by Albera, the ideational dimension, i.e. the guiding values, principles and aims of the system, may not be known or shared by everyone.
Similarly, in the development, the “design references” are not sufficiently discussed or even defined according to some of the interviewees.

Concerning the role of the trainers, their freedom in the training activities is subject to the constraints of the design. There are in fact even two sets of constraints – those imposed by trainers based on their “ideals” and that given by the system designers through the “design references” contained within the training system. The differences in the views and by extension the experiences of the people interviewed seem to stem from a difference between the trainers’ and designers’ “ideational dimension” and the “design references” of the trainers who are called upon to implement the system as constructed.

To use Austin’s terms (1970), creating a system is not at all a “performative utterance”: it is not enough to simply write or say something (or even to suppose, on a yet more implicit level), to cause the trainer and learners to do, think, feel or cause emotions. Constructing the training system is a necessary step that lays the framework and describes it so that the trainers and learners may make use of it. Put differently, the “content of the system” which will be defined here as the ability of the system to welcome and symbolically contain emotional and socioaffective dimensions, is only guaranteed on the condition that the system’s policy, design and implementation are articulated and made to be “containers” in their turn. The “ideational dimension”, the “design references” and “experience” (every figure interprets the situations they experience differently) seem to be quite mixed up here.

The emotional dimension was not explicitly included in development and implementation and can therefore only partially be part of the training system. To make it so, it would be necessary to include individual and group reflection on the subject during the development phase; a debate concerning the implications of the “cognition, conation and emotion” triptych (Barbier & Galatanu, 1998) certainly seems necessary for including them. If these conditions are met, we feel that the emotional and socioaffective dimensions can foster a system that works as “a space for (re)creation and experiential appropriation (as part of) sharing and exchange” (Klein & Brackelaire, 1999, p. 68), or in a word, with intersubjectivity. The aim would be to develop systems that are “places to create and reclaim experiences, bringing about involvement and integration in social life, ‘moving towards the social’” (ibid). Emotions, previously defined as physical “gestures” for oneself and for others would then be welcomed within the group and could “anchor” transformations in the “body” (physical or symbolic) of the group and the individual.

In the training that the School of Managers proposes, and according to what the participating observer noted, participants express a strong need to be recognised and appreciated by others. Each participant’s job may not be appreciated in their own workplace; then in the training their peers accept it with a range of emotions and more or less verbalised expressions. Hospitality, i.e. how what is foreign or a stranger is welcomed and especially how emotions are welcomed, must be possible and has to have been the subject of prior preparation during the development of the system. This study then encourages a view that includes “hospitality for the stranger”, that is to say “the challenge of moving from hostis to hospes, from the stranger to simply one not known, and from this unknown to a guest” (Cornu, 2008, p. 26). In other words, the issue is finding how to “make room for the other, for their emotions”. In order to connect the “ideational” dimension, the “design references” and later the participants “experience”, the design step needs to include a more explicit and more broadly shared theoretical framework. Otherwise, as this study shows, the different views
that individuals hold, what is left implicit and the gap between designers and trainers leaves a lot of room for subjectivity and reinterpretation of the role that emotions could (or should?) play in manager training.

In terms of practical steps to take, while the ideals are clearly stated in the School of Managers’ policy, it is probably necessary to state these ideals more clearly and to make sure that they are shared more generally by the different figures responsible for policy and especially by those responsible for developing training. For that reason it seems necessary to better define the theoretical framework concerning management, managers and emotions (as shown in diagram); this will make it possible to bring the two extremes of the designed axis in the diagram, design and implementation, closer together. Beyond the “vertical” connection between the ideational, functional and experienced dimensions, it seems a “horizontal” adjustment is necessary. For example, the design references for trainers and designers are different and should probably be discussed. This should be beneficial to constructing a system that “contains” and welcomes what is unknown, strangers and the unknown.

In terms of theoretical implications, while this study does not include participants’ experiences, further thesis work will examine their experiences and seek to answer the following research question: what place and what role do emotions hold in the training context in managers’ professional development at La Poste? The differences noted between the interviewees, those responsible for developing and implementing the training, seem to result in part from differences in interpretations, too much left unspoken and ideas and theories that are not shared broadly enough. We may well expect the differences between participants’ experiences, those of managers following the training course planned specifically for them, to be even greater.

ENDNOTES

1. By “postal workers”, they are referring to everyone working for La Poste, not simply mail carriers.
2. The software Alceste analyses the data as a “possible discourse”. It isolates co-occurrences and “lexical ‘worlds” that form the basis of the discourse or represent the speaker’s “mental environment” (see: http://www.image-zafar.com/en/alceste-software).
3. Words in quotation marks are from the analysis report produced by Alceste.

REFERENCES


A NEW PROFESSIONAL OCCUPATION IN ADULT’S EDUCATION: THE RVC PROFESSIONAL

Paulos, Catarina
Universidade de Lisboa
Portugal

ABSTRACT

This study is part of a broader investigation integrated in a PhD program in education whose goal is the analysis of a professional activity related to adult education – the RVC Professional. This occupation started in Portugal in 2001 with the implementation of the processes of recognition, validation and certification of competences. This research aims to answer the following questions: Who are the RVC Professionals? What were their previous professional experiences? How did they learn to do all tasks involved? What image do they have of themselves? The data gathering technique used was the biographical interview. This research results have revealed that the RVC professionals have academic studies in the social sciences and humanities as their basic training. The learning how to exercise the professional activity is a self-training and hetero-training based learning, but also an experiential training. The RVC professional’s self image is mainly centered on the relationship component of their professional activity.

INTRODUCTION

This study is part of a broader investigation integrated in a Doctorate in Education Sciences – Adult Training, whose objective is the analyses of a professional activity related to adult education - the RVC Professional (Competences Recognition and Validation Professional).

This occupation began with the implementation of the process of recognition, validation and certification of competences, with the abbreviated form of RVCC process, in 2001, initially developed in the Recognition, Validation and Certification of Competences Centers and later, from 2008, in the New Opportunities Centers (NOC).

The purpose of this study is to examine the career path trod by the RVC Professionals until they reach their current role, to find out how they learned to perform this occupation, their basic training, and to discover how they see themselves and the work they perform. The issue under study falls into theoretical frameworks from the fields of Adult Education and Sociology of Education.

THE EMERGENCE OF NEW PROFESSIONAL OCCUPATIONS IN THE FIELD OF ADULT EDUCATION

The emergence of new educational practices in the education and training of adults field, particularly with regard to the recognition and validation of competencies led to the transformation of some existing professional activities (trainer to RVC trainer or teacher to
RVC trainer) and the emergence of new occupational activities (referral and diagnostic professionals and RVC professionals).

The processes of recognition, validation and certification of competencies appeared in Portugal in 2001, in the centers for the recognition, validation and certification of competencies, currently designated New Opportunities Centers. This is a recent educational practice, which allows facing the adult as the main feature of their training (Canário, 2008), resulting from a government initiative and set in a wider context of policies related to the promotion of lifelong learning. Noteworthy to remark is the design of the Memorandum on Lifelong Learning, prepared by the European Commission, resulting from the European Council meeting, in Lisbon, in March 2000.

The practices for competencies recognition are based on the assumption that people learn through experience and should have a social legitimacy from those acquired experiences. This process is based on the capitalization and appreciation of life paths and the learning done in non-formal and informal ways. This idea is supported by Canário (2006, p. 23) when he states that “the recognition of the importance of non-formal learning paths created the systematic practice of processes of recognition, validation and certification of acquired experiential”.

In this process several adult education professionals are involved, including trainers and RVC professionals. The involved professionals in the processes of recognition and validation of competencies hold an essential function at the level of the individual valorisation of acquired experiences, in promoting their self-esteem and self-image, to aid awareness and clarification of the learning done, in the support of the construction of identity and sometimes reconciliation of the person with their life path (Pires, 2007).

The outlined research focuses on a specific type education professional that intervenes in the process of recognition and validation of competencies which is the Professional RVC. This professional establishes a closer relationship with adults, promoting remembrance of life experiences, dialogue, explanation of activities for each task, writing skills, discussion, cooperation and interpersonal relationships among group members. In this process, the purpose of the RVC Professional is to help the person identify the acquired experiential, based on the totality of their life path, and to establish connections/articulations with the competences of the referential (Cavaco, 2009). The main function of the RVC professional is based on the phase of the recognition of competencies, aiming to explore the life paths of every adult in order to highlight the competences of the referential, to motivate and engage the adults in processes of reflection, self-analysis, self-recognition and self-assessment. This professional also intervenes in the process of validation of competences issuing, alongside the trainer, an opinion regarding the competencies highlighted throughout the process. The RVC professional is the one which establishes a closer relationship with adults, promoting remembrance of life experiences, dialogue, explanation of activities for each task, writing, discussion, cooperation and interpersonal relationships among group members. Throughout the process of recognition and validation of competences, an RVC professional adopts various postures, such as animator, educator and accompanier (Cavaco, 2007).
Throughout their life path, the adult builds a sense of what he is and how he feels and understands the world, the way they experience both themselves and others; this feeling that Boutinet (2001) refers to as the concept of self or image of itself, shape the basis of the construction of identity. Identity is not just a finished state, but it’s a process that changes throughout the life path of a person being influenced by the challenges and backgrounds with which it was faced. Among the various dimensions that structure the life path of a person, “craft and profession remain indispensable for structuring the identity of the adult” (Boutinet, 2001, p. 199).

Identity is a subject whose study experienced a strong growth from the second half of the twentieth century. However, the scientific approach to this field of knowledge belonging to sociology and psychology has been intertwined with conceptions derived from common sense (Kaufmann, 2005). According to Kaufmann (2005, p. 80), identity is a process “intrinsically linked to individualization and modernity”, which first appeared on the margins of society while potentiated by state machines, and later, more specifically in the second half of the twentieth century, began to regulate the social construction of reality. Identity as a historical process is mainly defined by the ability of subjective creation. In dynamic terms, the identity is the process by which the individual “increasingly reshapes the social substance that constitutes himself” (Kaufmann, 2005, p. 80).

The individual throughout his life is subjected to a wide variety of contexts by going through varied and heterogeneous experiences and assuming several roles. The individual will be formed on the basis of socialization experiences that take place in multiple, diverse and sometimes contradictory social contexts, giving rise to what Lahire (2003) designates as plural actor. The plural actor reveals itself heterogeneous “different, as the domains of existence in which it is socially driven to evolve” (Lahire, 2003, p. 47).

To Dubar (1994), the term identity is addressed as a mark of belonging to a collective, to a group or a category, which allows individuals to be identified by others, but also to identify themselves in relation to others. Dubar (1997) conceptualizes identity as a relational process and as a biographical process. In the first instance one tries to define what kind of person is an individual, namely the identity to the other - identity “given by another”. Thus, it is through the established relationships and activities they undertake that an individual is identified and is taken to accept or refuse the identifications it receives from others and institutions, with a shaping of the individual from the image and definition the others have of him. In the latter case it's expressed the kind of person an individual wishes to be, namely the identity for them, experiencing a process of active internalization and an embodiment of the identity by individuals themselves.

The identity forms are located at the intersection of self-construction biographical processes and the processes of relational and institutional recognition by the other. The common point of these two heterogeneous processes was designated transaction, as a way to express the increasingly interactive and reciprocal labor relations and the increasingly internalized and uncertain character of career paths. The identity forms are "provisional crystallizations of socially legitimate forms for the individual to define himself and be recognized by others" (Dubar, 1994, p. 377).
According to Dubar (1998), the identity forms are forms of professional identities that focus on the relationships between the world of training and the world of work or employment. They are also social identities “to the extent that a given social system, social standing, wealth, status and/or prestige depend on the level of training, employment situation and position in the professional world” (Dubar, 1998, p. 80). The identity forms are not considered stable forms. According to the author, the identity forms are conceptualized as analysis tools through which we achieve the understanding of modes of action of individuals, they are “ideal types constructed by the researcher to account for the configuration and distribution of speech layouts delimited by the preceding analysis” (Dubar, 1998, p. 79).

Mendes (2005) states that the individual constructs his identity from the social noise and conflicts between the various agents and sites of socialization, and not by reproducing the identical, originated from the socialization with family or group of friends. Identities are thus activated “by the contingencies, the struggles, constantly being discovered and reconstructed in action” (Mendes, 2005, p. 490). They are relational and varied, based on the recognition made by social actors and differentiation, interaction fulfilling an important role in this process. For this author, the identity is socially distributed, constructed and reconstructed in social interactions.

Identities are formed from the narration of the subject itself and its social life experiences, “they are constructed in and through discourse in specific historical and institutional places, in specific practical and discursive formations and by precise enunciative strategies” (Mendes, 2005, p. 491). Similarly, Correia (2006) argues that identity is constructed by individuals during their life paths, with the contribution of the interaction of institutions and the community.

**METHODOLOGY**

This ongoing research aims to answer the following questions: Who are the RVC Professionals? Which graduate studies and lifelong training benefited from? What were their previous professional experiences? How did they learn to perform all the tasks involved? What is their self-image and what meaning do they ascribe to their work?

It is the purpose of this comprehensive survey to answer all of these questions in a way that will deepen our knowledge of this professional activity. The chosen methodology was qualitative, which bases itself on a comprehensive perspective, allowing the portrayal, interpretation and critical or reflexive analyses of the studied phenomena (Gonçalves, 2010). This methodology is a type of data retrieval and analysis (Padgett, 1998) that focuses on the way people interpret and ascribe meaning to their experiences and the environment in which they live (Holloway, 1997). This approach tackles the subjects' behaviour, perspectives and experiences.

Data collection was performed through a series of biographical interviews (Pineau & Le Grand, 2002). 32 interviews were held with RVC Professionals working in New Opportunities Centers. Audio recordings of the interviews were done with the subjects' consent, in order to better examine their statements. Data taken from the interviews was processed through content analysis (Bardin, 1995).
AN OUTLOOK ON THE ACTIVITY OF RVC PROFESSIONALS

Results from this investigation allowed us to determine that RVC Professionals possess a varied array of skills and originate from several different academic and professional backgrounds. Usually, they hold higher education degrees in social and human sciences, mostly in Psychology, Sociology and Education Sciences. A smaller number of RVC Professionals hold teaching and social service degrees.

As far as training is concerned, RVC professionals are divided in terms of the areas of greatest investment. Some prefer to focus on training related to their professional activity or area of academic studies.

I have done postgraduate training and this year I will finish my specialization in brief psychotherapies. I have also done post graduate training in sexology. Always, in my area of study, psychology. I have never done anything related to adult education and training. I always prefer to focus on psychology and this year I will finish my brief psychotherapies specialization, it’s been five years. (RVC Professional)

I finished my Master’s degree in 2008, so I now feel strong enough to go for a PhD, we’ll see what happens (…) I became a Master in Education Sciences, I focused on learning disabilities and psychopedagogical intervention. I intervened in a school context, in order to examine how schools responded, and I later focused my study on clinics, namely on what type of response was obtained from psychopedagogical intervention clinics. (RVC Professional)

Other RVC Professionals have opted for other types of training - namely at a postgraduate level - which are related to the field of adult education and training. This option is taken to fulfill a need to acquire further knowledge that will allow them to develop their skills and become more proficient in their activity: “I’m specializing in adult education and training, at the Institute of Education. (…) I really wanted to acquire more skills in this field in order to evolve at a professional level” (RVC Professional).

I decided to do this Masters [in Education Sciences, specializing in adult education and training] because in 2005 I began working in this field of RVC process for the DGFV team. I started to realize that what I wanted was to work with this adult segment of the population that possesses little to no schooling at all - and I became more and more interested in how did Portugal get to this point in terms of education. (…) That was one of the main reasons for doing this Masters degree, so that I could learn more about the history of adult education and training and open new perspectives so that I could get to know myself better professionally and also become better at my job. (RVC Professional)

RVC Professionals have previous professional experience in a variety of fields, such as psychology, professional training, human resources and teaching: “I used to work with visually challenged people because I studied psychology, specifically the psychology of social exclusion. So, I have worked with people with some sort of disability, and I also worked for ACAPO” (RVC Professional).
I began my activity during my work experience period in the field of teacher training, namely in the analysis of the needs of teacher training and the planning of training in new technologies (also for teachers). After that year of work experience, I worked as an external employee (with no contract) at the national teacher training center, essentially developing training plans for teacher training and teaching IT classes. (RVC Professional)

I graduated in Sociology in 2005, and I was lucky enough to immediately begin working in projects from the European Union’s Equal program for gender equality in businesses and companies. I collaborated with one of the project’s partner institutions, and I was simultaneously working in projects focused on gender equality and the balancing of professional life with personal and family life. (RVC Professional)

I began teaching right there at the C. P. school, it was my first real professional experience. I had been tutoring for several years, but I only actually taught classes roughly a year before my work experience period. After that, I luckily was able to be hired as an in-house teacher at this school, as a Math’s teacher (my field of study). I’ve been through practically all levels of education, except the 8th grade. In the meantime, this school has applied to become part of the New Opportunities project for the New Opportunities Center. (RVC Professional)

Regarding the professional trajectories of RVC Professionals (since completion of their graduation until the moment they start performing this professional role), they aren’t generally straightforward but punctuated by incursions (some lasting several years) in other professional areas. This is in agreement with what was observed by Andersson, Köpsén, Larson and Milana (2013) on his research on the qualification paths and professional trajectories of adult educators in two EU countries, Sweden and Denmark. In this study, Andersson et al. (2013) found that there were adult educators who had previously worked in other areas and that, due to events that occurred in their lives, changed occupation coming to adult education; whereas others become adult educators due to the inability to get a job in their academic qualifications area.

Learning how to work as an RVC Professional is achieved both through reading several publications dedicated to recognition, validation and certification (particularly those focused on benchmarks for key competences) and by moving from theory to professional practice through a self-training process: “I read a lot of stuff, large amounts of documentation and studies that were already published when I first started back in January 2010. And I obviously studied the benchmarks, because I had to” (RVC Professional).

(…) Through work. Nobody actually taught me anything. I didn’t get a lot of guidance from people, from colleagues I learned to do this by myself, every day I increasingly improved with experience, but it is a continuous learning process. (RVC Professional)

In other cases, knowledge was acquired by interacting with peers with professional experience, who worked as informal trainers, through the systematic presentation and explanation of the procedures through which competences are recognized, as well as active observation of these experienced professionals practices.
When I first came here I learned as much as I could about all the activities, I had co-workers who supported me and also taught me some of their practical skills. I also observed some of my colleagues’ sessions. The whole thing is actually quite intuitive. (RVC Professional).

Like I said, on a first stage we went to Seixal a lot of times, and I learned through the sharing of experiences and observing Seixal’s experience, since this was one of the pilot centers. At the time there was a lot of talk about Seixal and the IEFP (Institute for Employment and Professional Training), so we learned a little bit about that reality by living it and applying their structures and chronograms. Afterwards, we also adapted and adopted a lot of the work tools we found in Seixal (…) During this first stage, there was no specific training program. (RVC Professional)

These technicians have also learned to perform their professional tasks by taking training classes provided by the supervising institution (the National Adult Education and Training Agency [NAETA]), followed by the National Qualification Agency [NQA]) as well as other certified institutions (such as the New Opportunities Centers directed or co-directed by the Institute for Employment and Professional Training).

I started working in early November and I remember that during that year I had received training from the National Adult Education and Training Agency. Over several days I learned everything about referential, competences balance methodologies, jury sessions and about how jury sessions should take place. All of this really helped me. (RVC Professional)

Adults also learn by drawing from their pool of acquired experiences, which they activate whenever the need arises (Boutinet, 2001): “Afterwards, I learned a great deal, maybe also through intuition and my previous professional experience with adults” (RVC Professional).

I did it thanks to my background in psychology and also by trying to understand, by studying the manuals and applying my experience to the subject at hand. (…) I applied my experience, my knowledge and, of course, my background as a clinical psychologist, so that I could, as they say, take those criteria and RVCC work methods and make them my own. (RVC Professional)

The process of becoming an RVC professional is based on self-training and hetero-training, as well as experiential training through direct and reflected contact (Pineau, 1991).

RVC professionals believe that their job is essential for the competences recognition, validation and certification process, by fulfilling the role of organizers for all of the work carried out by both trainers and adults. They see themselves as mediators for both the competences recognition and validation process and the relationship between the adults and their trainers.

The RVC professional is the process’ engine from its beginning right up until the person’s certification is completed. The RVC professional is the one who more closely follows the candidate - I would go as far as saying that he/she is the most essential element for the process’ and the candidate’s success. (RVC Professional)
On my first session, I usually tell the adults that the RVC professional is really the one who mediates the process that takes place between themselves and the trainers. But sometimes I think, it's not just about mediating the work carried out by adults and their trainers, it's about much more than that. The whole thing about mediating, helping and guiding, it's about you making a difference in people's lives, changing them for the better. (RVC Professional)

My job here is to manage the group's functioning; I'm the one who controls the group's planning, dates, sessions, as well as extra appointments that might need to be supported by myself or the trainers. I also give some support to biography development - and it has to be done in a plain and accessible language so that I can help these people to write down their competences they have acquired throughout their lives as well as this work's structure and organization (RVC Professional).

These adults' educators believe that interpersonal skills (communication, motivation, conflict management) are crucial for their professional activity: “I think there are some necessary characteristics - actively listening to people, being able to be tolerant and patient. Above all, it's a process of self-motivation” (RVC Professional).

Furthermore, they consider that IT skills and competences are also essential for competences recognition and validation.

Working the candidate’s motivations, making sure they never become demotivated, working with people's expectations, uncovering what their competences are, since they have a hard time realizing what they actually know and how to write it down for the record. We need to apply some skills and methods that make them understand what is it they are going to write on that portfolio. It's a competence-uncovering process: to understand the candidate's history, what did he go through and which of his experiences are useful for this process. (RVC Professional)

When you ask what does being an RVC Professional mean, people who work in the field mostly mention interpersonal skills, focusing on support, motivation and reinforcement: “For me, being professional is not about being in a training room and encouraging the discovery of competences. It's a lot more than that and essentially this is our main job: being available for candidates.” (RVC Professional)

It's about trying to improve the value of what is already a very positive thing in this kind of process (...) but what I really appreciate is the whole thing I mentioned earlier - following up, supporting, listening, valuing, valuing what is positive about people, I think that is what's most important. (RVC Professional)

How the performance of this professional activity is viewed varies over time - from an early, “idealistic” perspective, to a realist outlook brought on by political and administrative demands imposed by both the institutions responsible for the New Opportunities Centers and by social constraints. It should be pointed out that the interviews were held during a period of great uncertainty - at the time, several centers were on the verge of being closed down by administrative order and there was no information on how competences recognition, validation and certification would be implemented in the future.
When I first got here I was looking for strategies and promoting certain types of helpful activities and situations (...) these days, I am not in the mood for that because there is no motivation. The fact that we don’t know what is going to happen to us and the fact that the government, the country itself disregards us... it just makes me unhappy, because we’ve done a lot and it was all for nothing. (RVC Professional)

FINAL REMARKS

RVC Professionals are a recent novelty in the field of adult education. Their basic training is mostly in the field of human and social sciences. During their career path as adult educators, they engage in a variety of further education and training activities. On one hand, we find professionals that choose to invest in training that is mostly in line with their current professional field (adult education). On the other hand, many others prefer to invest their time in their original academic or professional fields.

These technicians, just like many others in different fields, have had non-linear lives, marked by disruptions and transitions - biographical profiles which have, according to Dominicé (2006, p. 348), a higher level of “randomness”. Much like what young people go through, according to Pais (2005), the professional paths of adults are marked by “turbulence, flexibility and impermanence” (p. 11), in which the perspective of a stable routine or a predictable career is replaced by “a confrontation with a flexible labour market” (p. 17).

Overall, RVC Professionals learn their skills in a work context, through contact with more experienced peers (at the same or in other New Opportunities Centers) as well as observation of professional practices - a process of imitation and questioning. Learning is also done through reading materials and documentation that is focused on competence recognition and validation. Furthermore, they also learn through transposition of assumptions and work recommendations provided by the institutions in charge of competence recognition and validation processes, progressing through trial and error. Undergoing postgraduate or shorter non-formal training is also another way to progress as adult educators in the field of competences recognition, validation and certification processes.

Therefore, the training path of RVC Professionals encompasses self-training, hetero-training, and learning through experience, “through which the necessary technical procedures and moral standards are transmitted, and knowledge is preserved and accumulated” (Cavaco, 2003, p. 143). Fernández (2006, p.16) tells us that “the workplace is a place of learning, because increasingly the best way to learn something is to do it”.

The activity developed by RVC Professionals can be included in what Demailly (2008) calls relationship activities, which defined by the demand for interpersonal skills. RVC Professionals self-image is one that is essentially focused on the relationships aspect. They consider that their professional activity is strongly focused on providing support over the competences recognition process - one hand, they work towards driving and guiding the activities and tasks in which the whole process is based on; on the other hand, they are also mediators and providers of support that strive to prevent adults from abandoning the process or excessively prolonging it.
This self-image is also mutable and variable, changing and reconstructing itself over the course of time. Abreu (2001, p. 95) tells us that professional identities are developed over the course of the professional activity, in a workplace context - theirs is not a static or definite nature, rather they are constantly “evolving over the course of history and life and built through more or less conscious choices that provide it with new orientations and meaning”.

Academic education and training is highly valued. Successfully completing and obtaining academic degrees is correlated with the possibility of continuing to work as a RVC Professional. According to Dubar (2003, p. 51), “training is essential for the construction of professional activities because it facilitates the incorporation of knowledge that simultaneously forms the structure of the relationship with work and one’s career path”.

In essence, it can be said that work is the central element in the process of construction, destruction and reconstruction of identity forms, “since it is at the workplace and through work that individuals living in salary-based societies, acquire the symbolic and financial recognition of their activity” (Dubar, 2003, p. 51) and it is through it that they ascribe meaning to their lives, become autonomous and gain access to citizenship.

REFERENCES


WORK MOTIVATION AND EMPLOYEE MOTIVATION METHODS IN MANAGERIAL WORK

Piirainen, Anna
University of Helsinki
Finland

INTRODUCTION

The role of employees in corporations has changed in recent years due to the following factors: changing tasks, responsibilities and management of one's own work (Murtonen, et al 2008; Arvonen, 1991, p. 3.). To be able to perform their tasks, employees need to improve their skills in order to meet the challenges at their workplace. Motivated employees have been perceived to be one of the key factors in the success of the company (Drake, et al. 2007). Motivation improves learning and empowers employees to improve their expertise. Some work environments require their employees to be more motivated than others. Good example of these types of work environments is a grocery store where the work is hectic and the situations change rapidly. This explains the high requirements for the performance of employees. They need several different skills to be able to execute their tasks properly. Leaders have a central role in motivating employees and in managing organizational knowledge effectively (Bryant, 2003). This is the reason why grocery store managers should have the knowledge of how to motivate employees.

The word motivation can be defined as “the degree to which an individual wants and chooses to engage in certain specified manner” (Mitchell, 1982). It can be divided into two categories: intrinsic and extrinsic motivation (Saleh & Grygier, 1969; Ryan and Deci, 2000). Intrinsic factors are directly related to the performance and extrinsic factors are related to the environment in which the job is being performed (Saleh & Grygier, 1969).

According to famous psychologist, Abraham Maslow, motivation arises from an unsatisfied need or set of needs (Maslow, 1943). Maslow divides human needs into five categories arranged in a hierarchy of their priority: physiological needs, safety needs, social needs, esteem needs and need for self-actualization (Maslow, 1943; 1954). Physiological needs form the first level (or the lowest level) of the hierarchy and are essential for survival. They include basic needs as hunger, thirst and need for sleep (Maslow, 1943). Safety needs are the second level of the hierarchy and include needs for familiar and safe environment and also needs for financial security. The next need level, social needs, include needs for love and belongingness. After social needs in the hierarchy are esteem needs, which include needs as self-respect, achievement and esteem of others. The fifth and last (or highest) level of needhierarchy is the need for self-actualization. It refers to the need to utilize one’s potential and do everything one is capable to do. (Maslow, 1943; 1954.)

When one category of these needs is satisfied, it ceases to be a motivating factor. Thereafter, the next level of needs in the hierarchy order emerges as a motivator. The last levels of needs can nevertheless be fulfilled before satisfying the first levels of needs. However the lower level needs should be relatively better satisfied than the later level needs. (Maslow, 1943; 1954.)
Along with Maslow, another famous motivational researcher is Frederick Herzberg, who has developed the two-factor theory of motivation together with his research group (Herzberg, Mausner & Snyderman, 1959). He researched factors affecting people’s attitudes about work and listed those factors either hygiene factors or motivational factors. According to Herzberg (et al 1959), hygiene factors increase job dissatisfaction and these factors are for example company policy, supervision, interpersonal relations, working conditions and salary (excluding incentive pay). Motivational factors increase job satisfaction, for example achievement, recognition, the work itself, responsibility and advancement.

Herzberg doesn’t consider job satisfaction and job dissatisfaction as opposites of each other. (Herzberg, 1968). He thinks that avoiding job dissatisfaction creates a great base for increasing job satisfaction but this doesn’t lead to a greater level of job satisfaction or work effectiveness on its own. Motivational factors satisfy the higher level needs as the need of self-actualization. Herzberg states that work motivation mainly arises from achievements and personal growth through assigned responsibility.

TRANSACTIONAL-TRANSFORMATIONAL LEADERSHIP

Leader’s actions have been perceived to have a strong effect on employee’s motivation level (Bryant, 2003; Torrington, et al 2005, 312-313; Juuti, 2004, 166-167; Perry & Porter, 1982). Therefore managers should pay attention to the usage of motivation methods to be able to motivate their employees in the best way possible. Transactional-transformational leadership is a theory mainly developed by James MacGregor Burns (1978) and further developed by many other researchers, for example Bernard Bass (1985). It has been considered an effective leadership theory, which meets well the requirements of nowadays companies (Rubin, Munz & Boomer, 2005; ref. Osborn & Marion, 2009; Aaltio, 2008, p. 47.). It has been perceived to result in high motivation level, engagement and performance at different organizational levels and in companies operating in different industries (Lowe, et al 1996; House & Aditya, 1997, p. 441.; ref. Bryant, 2003).

In his book Leadership (1978) Burns identified two types of leadership: transactional and transformational. Transactional leadership is based on an exchange between the manager and the employee. In transactional leadership manager changes something employee wants to the work employee does for the company. Transactional leadership can be divided into three components: contingent reward, management by exception and laissez faire leadership. (Bass, 1997.) In contingent rewarding manager gives employee a reward if the performance of the work is good enough. In active leadership manager monitors work and is frequently seeking failures. In passive leadership leader takes action only when the mistake has already happened. Laissez-faire leader is inactive and avoids decision making and supervisory responsibilities. (Hater & Bass, 1988). Laissez –faire leadership can be considered as an extreme form of passive leadership or even non-leadership (Hartog, et al 1997).

The main motivational methods in transactional leadership are contingent rewarding, work monitoring and reacting to failures at work (Burns, 1978, 4; Hater & Bass, 1988). The incentive to work can be an external reward which can be money, products, recognition of others or something else that employee wants. (Burns, 1978, p. 4.). The incentive can also be a desire to avoid failures (Hater & Bass 1988). Hence the motivational methods of
Transactional leadership are mostly connected to work environment and the personality of the employee but not so much to the characteristics of the work itself.

Transformational leadership is the other type of leadership Burns (1978) represents in his book. The purpose is to satisfy the higher levels of employee's needs (Burns, 1978). In this kind of leadership manager motivates employees beyond their self-interests for the good of the group, organization or society (Bass, 1997). He identifies the needs of the employees and pursues to increase the motivation level and work ethic of his employees and also himself (Hautala, 2005, p.13.). In addition, manager also tries to improve employees’ self-esteem (Bryman, 1992, p. 95.).

Transformational leadership can be divided into four dimensions: idealized influence, Inspirational motivation, Intellectual stimulation and individualized consideration (Bass, 1997). In idealized influence (or charismatic leadership) manager acts as a role model for employees. This kind of leadership is strongly dependent on manager’s and employees’ personalities: in some organizations the role model is sought more likely than in others. (Bass, 1985, pp. 35-38.)

In the dimension of inspirational motivation manager pursues to inspire employees and effect on their feelings. It also includes community spirit building and organizational commitment. (Bass, 1985, pp. 63-64.) According to Bass (1985, p. 64.) Getting inspired increases employees work motivation and thus impacts on the effectiveness of work.

*Intellectual stimulation* refers to developing employees’ problem solving skills, thinking, imagination, beliefs and values. Therefore it is not directly aiming at developing company’s actions. (Bass, 1985, p. 99.) To be able to stimulate employees intellectually, manager should have more expertise regarding the specific action in which the stimulation happens. Manager also has to have the capability to execute his plans. (Bass, 1985, p. 104.)

The fourth dimension of transformational leadership, individualized consideration, refers to treating employees as persons. It bases on two-way communication between the manager and the employee. Through individualized consideration employee’s desire for knowledge, comprehension about oneself and individual need satisfaction can be improved. Manager also pursues to increase employee’s trust in his chances to influence at work. (Bass, 1985, p. 97.)

Bass states that the most important motivator transformational leadership adds to transactional leadership is increasing employee’s sense of self-worth to engage and commit the employee (Bass, 1997). Bass states that both leadership styles, transactional and transformational, are needed in effective leadership. Transformational leadership rather adds the effects of transactional leadership than forms a substitute for it (Bass, 1997).

THE NINE COMMON THEMES IN THE THEORETICAL PART OF THIS STUDY

In previous research and literature on work motivation and transactional-transformational leadership there can be found nine common themes. The themes are work monitoring and measuring the outcomes of work, feedback, assigning responsibility and authority, trust, building community spirit, information distribution, meaningfulness of work, individual
characteristics and exemplariness (see figure 1.).

![Diagram](image)

**Managerial work**

- Transactional leadership
- Transformational leadership

**Motivational methods**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Feedback</th>
<th>Assigning responsibility and authority</th>
<th>Trust</th>
<th>Work environment and community spirit</th>
<th>Information distribution</th>
<th>Meaningfulness of work</th>
<th>Individual characteristics</th>
<th>Exemplariness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Figure 1. The nine common themes.**

**Work monitoring** is an important factor effecting work motivation. It is one of the Herzberg’s (1968; 1959) hygiene factors and also an important part of the active dimension of transactional leadership (Bass, 1985). Monitoring also makes rewarding for successful work and reacting to failures possible. Rewarding is a central part of both transactional and transformational leadership and it has been perceived to have an effect on employee’s work motivation (Bass, 1985; Burns, 1978; Salimäki, et al 2009; Esbjerg, et al 2010). Reacting to failures instead is a part of active leadership in transactional leadership (Hater & Bass, 1988).

**Feedback** also has a remarkable impact on work motivation. It has been perceived to impact on employee’s self-esteem and therefore on employee’s individual characteristics (Ashford & Black, 1996; Järvinen, 1999, pp. 26-29; Porter & Miles, 1974). Increasing employee’s self-esteem is also one part of the transformational leadership (Hautala, 2005).

**Assigning responsibility and authority** can be seen as one form of involvement, which is a motivational method described by Perry and Porter (1982). In this method employees get responsibility for their work and also freedom to act the way they believe is the best (Heikkilä-Laakso & Heikkiä, 1997, pp. 341-347.). Increasing responsibility has been perceived to improve employee’s work motivation (Drake et al, 2007; Herzberg, 1959; Porter & Miles, 1974). Responsibility is also one of Herzberg’s motivational factors (Herzberg, et al 1959, pp. 113-114).
Trust was mentioned in the theoretical part of this study several times. Trust building is an important part of transformational leadership (Bass, 1985, p. 47; Nadler & Tushman, 1990). It is also one of the factors explaining work motivation according to Torrington, Hall and Taylor (2005, pp. 312-313). Trust as a phenomenon in work environment has also been perceived to be in positive connection with the success of the company (Antila, 2006, p. 71). It makes the daily communication, decision-making and co-operation easier in the work place (Seppälä, 2012, p. 37). Hence trust occurred to be a very important factor in relation to motivating employees.

Community spirit has in several studies perceived to have an effect on work motivation (Esbjerg, et al 2010; Van Knippenberg, 2000; Seppälä, 2012, p. 50; Porter & Miles, 1974). Communication in the work community can also be seen as an important factor in trust building and responsibility sharing: by getting to know the employee, manager can evaluate the amount of trust the employee is worth and the responsibility the employee can carry. (Seppälä, 2012, pp. 49-50.)

Information distribution is one of the factors Torrington, Hall and Taylor (2005, pp. 312-313.) list to effect on work motivation. It is also important regarding knowledge development of the employees (Varila, 1999). Information sharing is based on trust and the lack of trust weakens information distribution (Laine, 2008, pp. 109-110).

Meaningfulness of work has also an effect on work motivation (Torrington, Hall & Taylor, 2005, pp. 312-313; Porter & Miles, 1974). It includes professional and knowledge development as well as highlighting the importance of goal attainment, which are motivating instruments represented in several theories (Herzberg, 1959, pp. 113-114; Esbjerg, t al 2010; Bass, 1985, p. 20). Intellectual stimulation is also one of the dimensions of transformational leadership (Bass, 1985, p. 99). Supervisor can effect on the meaningfulness of the employee’s work with his leadership style. Experiencing meaningfulness of work is also strongly connected to company’s work environment, work distribution, equal treatment and the level of employee’s independency. (Antila, 2006, pp. 52-55.)

Taking notice of employee’s individual characteristics occurred also as a major factor in the theoretical part of this study. Individual characteristics are listed as a part of Porter’s and Miles´ factor groups explaining work motivation (Porter & Miles, 1974). Also Torrington, Hall and Taylor (2005, pp. 312-313) state that identifying individual differences is a key element in motivating employees. Also in both transactional and transformational leadership employee’s needs and the level of employee’s self-esteem are identified.

One of the factors that is typical in nowadays work life is work flexibility (Sennett, 1998, p. 45; Julkunen, 2008, p. 105; Mamia & Koivumäki, 2006, p. 1). It can be seen as one method in taking notice of individual characteristics. When used wisely, flexible working hours can create advantages to both employee and the company. (Uhmavaara, 2006, p. 74.) Taking notice of individual characteristics has been perceived to have an effect on the work motivation of grocery store personnel (Esbjerg, et. al. 2010). Hence it is an important factor in this study.

Exemplariness occurred as a part of transformational leadership in the theoretical part of this study. Managers own example is a key factor in charismatic leadership, which is one of the four dimensions of transformational leadership. (Bass, 1985, p. 35; Nadler & Tushman,
Hence it forms an important motivation method regarding this research.

**METHODOLOGY**

The aim of this study was to find out how grocery store managers can motivate employees to do their best at work. The data was gathered by using semi-structured interview (Kvale, 1996, p. 132). An interview is a conversation with a structure and a purpose. It deviates from an equal conversation between two equal operators because the interviewer drives the conversation forward and controls the situation, topic and questions of the interview. (Kvale, 1996, p. 126). In this study the interviewer controlled the situation by asking more detailed questions and following that all the interview themes were discussed.

The interviews were based on the nine themes presented before in this article: work monitoring and measuring the outcomes of work, feedback, assigning responsibility and authority, trust, building community spirit, information distribution, meaningfulness of work, individual characteristics and exemplariness. The themes were found in transactional-transformational leadership and the theories that explain work motivation.

The sample in this study consisted of ten neighborhood store managers from three different grocery store chains. The interviewees were chosen through discretionary sample (for further information, see Piirainen 2012, p. 58). The contacts were made by telephone and via e-mail. All the stores in which the interviewees were working were of the size of 130-400 square meters neighborhood stores. The stores were chosen in three largest grocery store chains in Finland. There were from six to seventeen employees working in the stores picked to this study. The managers interviewed were aged between 23 and 50. Five of them were females and five of them were men. The interviews were arranged in January, February and March 2012 and the data was analyzed between May and September. The research was completed in November 2012.

After the interview, the interviewee filled a questionnaire about the themes discussed earlier. In the questionnaire the interviewee had to evaluate the importance of these nine themes as motivation methods in their daily work. Five-point Likert-Scale was used to evaluate the importance of the methods. There were also empty areas in the questionnaire where it was possible to fill out motivation methods outside the themes presented. The main purpose of the questionnaire was to provoke more conversation about the themes. Another purpose was to find out if one or some of the themes were considered to be more important motivation methods than others.

**INTERVIEWING**

Interview questions should be understandable and keep the conversation going on and at the same time they should be in a descriptive form and motivate the interviewees to tell about their experiences. (Kvale, 1996, p. 130.). In this study the atmosphere was kept as relaxed as possible. The questions were open and interviewees talked freely about their experiences and perceptions. Kvale (1996, p. 129) states that the more spontaneous interview procedure can cause more spontaneous and unexpected answers from the interviewees. According to him, an opening question may ask about a concrete situation (Kvale 1996, p. 129). The key
questions in this study were “How do you make your employees to do their best at work?” More detailed questions were asked after that depending on the answers to the first question.

DATA ANALYZING

The research material was analyzed by using data-based content analysis. Content analysis involves establishing a set of categories and falling instances into these categories (Silverman, 2009, pp. 158-159). In data-based content analysis the units of analysis are chosen among the data in accordance with the research design. The purpose of the analysis is to form a theoretic entity based on the data collected. (Tuomi & Sarajärvi, 2009, p. 95). In this study the categories arose from the conversations between interviewees and the interviewer. Hence they were formed on the basis of the data collected in the interviews.

ETHICS

In this study the interviewees were given a written short description about the study, its purposes and the use of the interviews. That is a preferable procedure according to Kvale (1996, pp. 153-154). The interviewer promised that the data was only used in the purpose of a research and the citations were only shown anonymously. The interviewees were also asked to give their written agreements of the interviewee to participate in the study and allowing the data to be used in future.

RESULTS

Three motivating method groups were found: work environment, meaningfulness and monitoring. Work environment includes community spirit, listening, caring, taking notice of individual characteristics, exemplariness, trust building and trust expressing. Meaningfulness includes task variety, knowledge development and information dissemination. The third motivating method group, monitoring, includes task clarification and work measurement, the outcome of successful work performance and the outcome of insufficient work performance. All this subcategories include individual motivating methods which the managers use. (see table 2.).

The interviewees talked about the different motivational methods in same sentences. In several situations more than just one motivation method was used. For example according to the experiences of the interviewees, meetings are situations where managers build community spirit but also share information.
Table 1. Motivating method groups

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>WORK ENVIRONMENT</th>
<th>Community spirit</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Listening</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Taking care of employees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Taking notice of individual characteristics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Exemplariness of the supervisor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Trust building</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Trust expressing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEANINGFULNESS OF WORK</td>
<td>Task variety</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Knowledge development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Information dissemination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WORK MONITORING</td>
<td>Task clarification and work measurement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The outcome of successful work performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The outcome of insufficient work performance</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**WORK ENVIRONMENT**

First and largest motivational method group, work environment, includes community spirit, listening, taking care of employees, taking notice of individual characteristics, exemplariness, trust building and trust expressing. Community spirit occurred in this study as arranging collective events, creating an open atmosphere at work place, increasing humor and jokes, resolving conflicts, talking about non-work related topics, arranging contests, scheduling and treating employees equally. Listening occurred as confidential conversations, receiving feedback and listening to employee’s wishes and ideas. Taking care of employees consisted of directing employees to occupational health services, taking care of work safety and giving consolation.

Taking notice of individual characteristics occurred in this study as supporting employee’s personal life, noticing individual differences in learning and competence, noticing employee’s personal interests and treating employee’s in line with their personalities. Exemplariness formed an important motivation method in this study and was mentioned by nearly every manager interviewed. It includes manager’s own positive attitude against work, doing all kinds of tasks, working effectively, evolving manager’s own competence, doing own tasks as expected and following company’s rules.

Trust occurred in this study through two dimensions: trust building and trust expressing. Trust was built by defining employee’s areas of responsibility, harmonizing goals, accepting manager’s own responsibility as a supervisor, supporting employees and confidentiality. Trust expressing consisted of sharing responsibility and decision making to subordinates, giving space and freedom to act, communicating about supervisor’s high expectations and the belief that subordinates can manage their work and delivering information at work.
**MEANINGFULNESS**

Second motivation method group, meaningfulness, consisted of task variety, knowledge development and information dissemination. Task variety occurred in this study as varying work shifts and tasks and varying the persons responsible. Knowledge development occurred as in-store education, external education, familiarization and increasing multitasking and the understanding of the meanings of the activity. Information dissemination included verbal communication and written communication.

**WORK MONITORING**

The third motivation method group, work monitoring, consisted of three parts: task clarification and work measurement, the outcome of successful work performance and the outcome of insufficient work performance. The first of these three included goal setting and informing about the goals, observation, following customer feedback, receiving peer feedback and following economic indicators. The outcome of successful work occurred in this study as giving positive feedback, concrete rewarding and organizing collective events. The outcome of insufficient work performance included resolving the cause of the failure, giving constructive feedback, informing about the failure, organizing additional training and re-regulation, highlighting the importance of the activity, directing to occupational health services, punishing, threatening and guiding to do other tasks.

In conclusion it can be stated that grocery store managers use multiple different methods while motivating their employees. Some of the motivation methods were used in several situations. For example directing employee to occupational health services was described as one aspect of taking caring of employees. On the other hand it was one method used to decrease the outcomes of insufficient work performance when pursuing to solve the problem originated in employee’s health. The motivation methods appeared to occur partly overlapping and effecting work motivation in different ways. Hence it can be concluded that instead of separate factors, the motivation methods can be seen as a coherent entity where the methods have influence on each other’s. (For more detailed information, see Piirainen, 2012, pp. 66-112.)

**DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS**

The theory base of this research consisted of transactional-transformational leadership and theories of work motivation, especially Maslow’s hierarchy of needs and Herzberg’s two-factor theory of motivation. Nine common themes were found from the theory conversations: work monitoring and measuring the outcomes of work, feedback, assigning responsibility and authority, trust, building community spirit, information distribution, meaningfulness of work, individual characteristics and exemplariness. These themes were used as a base to the semistructured interview where 10 grocery store managers were interviewed about the motivation methods they use in their daily work.

Based on the data collected, the motivation methods were classified to three main groups: work environment, work meaningfulness and work monitoring. All of these three main groups
included several smaller motivation instrument groups, which consisted of individual motivation methods.

The data included several motivation methods from both transactional and transformational leadership types. Concrete rewarding, which is one of the motivation methods of transactional leadership, was used as a motivation method according to every manager interviewed for this study. On the other hand many managers mentioned that concrete rewarding is not so important way to reward employees as giving positive feedback. Feedback can be an appreciation for the employee and signify manager’s acceptance. In that case feedback can be seen as a transactional motivation method. Also the negative dimensions of transactional leadership occurred in this study, but not very strongly. Giving negative or constructive feedback, threatening and even punishing were used as motivation methods in case of an insufficient work performance. However, most of the managers interviewed appeared to favor other methods instead.

The motivation methods of transformational leadership occurred especially in the methods groups of work environment and the meaningfulness of work. They include highlighting the importance of the work, communitisation and common goals. Managers also pursued to develop knowledge and skills of employees, which help employees to satisfy their upper level needs. Also exemplariness was shown strongly in the interviews. Every manager interviewed for this study mentioned that own example is one of the most important motivation methods they use in their work. Hence it can be stated that exemplariness is especially important motivation method in grocery store environment.

In this study, trust occurred as an essential part of the work environment. In other studies and in literature it seems to be a wider unity. In conclusion it can be stated that trust forms a fundamental base for the usage of other motivating methods. Additionally these other motivating methods have correlations among each other. Instead of separate instruments, the motivating methods form a wide, coherent entity in which the different methods have an influence on each other.

Figure 2. The relations of motivation methods.
In conclusion it can be stated that the motivation methods found in this study have multidimensional effects. Instead of aiming to motivate employees regarding one single task, the motivation methods appeared to be used to increase overall motivation level. According to several studies, both transactional and transformational leadership types are needed in effective leadership (Den Hartog et al., 1997; Bass, 1985, p. 26; Lowe et al., 1996). The results of this study are similar: both transactional and transformational leadership are needed in motivating grocery store personnel.

This research focused only on the motivation methods used by grocery store managers. It would be interesting to continue this research further to find out how employees react to these motivation methods. It would also be interesting to do research in different industries and interview managers working at different levels of organizations.

REFERENCES


470


THE PEER GROUPS BRIDGING THE DISCIPLINES AND SOCIAL CONTEXTS IN HIGHER EDUCATION

Piirainen, Arja
University of Jyväskylä
Finland

ABSTRACT

The aim of the study is to promote understanding of peer groups meanings from the students' point of view. The research task is to find out teaching students’ conceptions of the andracogical peer groups in the health science teacher studies at university. Teaching students’ peer groups are based on andracogically formed principles. The participants are (65) health science teaching students, who started in 2009-2012. The data (578 written pages) was gathered by using essay writing in the end of their one year teacher studies and analysed by a phenomenographic method. The results are three hierarchical categories of peer groups' meanings: 1) Value of otherness in participation the peer group 2) Otherness in peer group as a mirror to personal teaching; 3) Community as the basis for a high-quality education. The results of the study indicate how and why a teaching student’s peer group is significant in andracogical teacher education.

INTRODUCTION

Teachers are examples of students, so their activity is also guided by the expertise of the future. In this research we see the development of expertise as human’s lifelong learning. Learning can be viewed as individual, group-based, inter-organizational or regional. To be a regional network expert it demands also autonomous, expanding expertise. (Piirainen & Viitanen 2010.) Learning through work and learning at school are very similar (Tynjälä 2008). It has been shown that diverse types of informal learning also take place in communities along with new discourses (Eraut 2004). Especially recently attention has been paid to learning in networks and regions, for example, shared expertise and “innovative knowledge communities” (Tynjälä 2008). Shared expertise can be regarded as a pedagogical practice, in which responsibility and knowledge are shared between the workers. The members motivate each other, provide feedback and jointly steer the common functions (Nonaka & Konno 1998; Penttinen et.al. 2013). Expertise as a community process develops expert communities rather than individual experts in specific fields. (Bereiter & Scardamalia 1993; Bereiter 2002.) Community process can take place also in education. Individual and expanding substance is the opportunity to increase participation in decision-making and to ensure implementation of effective practices, ideas and projects (Jackson 2000). Shared expertise is considered a crucial element in shared leadership, community knowledge and the creation of a learning society (Wenger 1998; Scott & Caress 2005). It has also been a common andracogical principle at least in Northern countries (Grundtvig 1929, Lindeman 1961/26). To share expertise demands also personal self-directed/regulated learning, which has been the main idea in western adult education since Knowles (1975; Eekelen et. al. 2005; Savičević 1999; 2008).
The term ‘peer’ refers to a teaching student with a comparable education level (fig 1). The awareness of ‘peerness’ is the basis for peer group processes (Sunwolf 2008, p. 2.) The members of the peer groups are different persons, who are in the same situation. But peerness can also develop to exploit shared knowledge as in team work. (Sunwolf 2008, p. 19). But groups can also be challenging learning places, when the interaction with others enforces group processes to the unknown direction (Isaacs 2001 pp.247-256.). The ‘sameness’ can enforce social support also within the groups. Members of the group must consider one another to be equals in at least one particular element which can be shared within the peer group. Members of a peer group share one common factor, which can be age, background, experience, social or other situation, etc. This does not need to be shared at every moment, as long as there is an agreement of the common or effective guidance in higher education requiring particular knowledge of small group instruction. (Sunwolf 2008, pp. 19-20.)

The activities of group work in teaching students’ education are based on ideas of cooperative learning (Johnson & Johnson, 1982); the participants support each other as they learn together. Group activities also aim at empowering individuals and intended learning outcomes are personally meaningful, in response to the needs and personal growth of the individual (Colvin & Ashman, 2010). A peer group can so be seen as a place to share experiences, to get emotional support and feedback from each other, to obtain new perspectives and increase one’s consciousness, to acquire important social skills and confidence in the future, and to effect changes in attitudes and behavior (Coman et al., 2002; Hiltula et al., 2012; Penttinen et al. 2013; Symes 1998). Peer groups are widely and systematically used in the contexts of social and health issues (Kettunen et al., 2006; Wallin et al., 2009), advancing new higher education bachelor students to the academic student life (Skaniakos et al. 2013) and teachers peer support (Heikkinen et al., 2012; Piirainen & Skaniakos 2013).

Small group counseling requires particular knowledge sets and skills of the instructor. Borgen et al. (1989) suggest several necessary steps for the group counselor to effectively promote group work. These include planning learning activities to develop new knowledge, skills and attitudes. To successfully carry out these activities, the group counselor should have the personal skills of directing, influencing, assisting and delegating group processes. The group counselor should also have micro-level skills of reaction, interaction and action in order to be able to respond to the needs of individual group members. Counseling should be done in regard to the needs of participants, in order to fulfill their individual expectations. In addition, group counseling also demands an understanding of the different stages of group development. Design of the group includes structuring activities to support its goals. All of these are done in correlation with the members’ needs for social and cognitive support. The peer groups as pedagogical practice has discussions, which give opportunities to construct a mutual understanding of the discipline field and possibility to identify your experts during the group sessions (Penttinen & Vesenkari 2013). If teaching students’ education in peer groups is mirrored partly on the model of small group counseling, it is no wonder that peer groups can be common learning situations for teachers and according to Burr (1995) possibility to get contextual social perspectives.
The health science teacher education has five different kinds of small groups, which have different tasks for learning and collaboration development (see fig 1). The smallest peer groups are the book clubs, which are formed as counseling small groups, where the students themselves form the group and how to study the books concerning learning and teaching phenomena. The learning groups are concentrating more on the learning process, when the subject of the group's session is more reflective learning from student's point of view. The experienced teacher is the instructor of the learning groups and takes care of the timetable, participation and answers the questions concerning the teachers' learning and practicing in real school environments. The study groups are formal educational groups from all health science teaching students', which has a curriculum accepted by a university health science department. The lecture group is largest and it concerns the whole university andracogical teaching students, from all departments. (see fig 1.)

The aim of this study was to promote understanding of the students' peer group. To reach this we find out the teaching students' conceptions of the peer groups in the end of their health science teaching studies at university. The Teaching students' programme is based on andracogical formed principles: continuing personalized learning, inquiring attitude, and dialogue.

METHODS

The participants in this study are students, who have been chosen to be educated in andracogical health science teaching (n=65). The data were gathered by using essay writings (Richardson & St. Pierre 2008) one diary and portfolios from the same (n=65) (n=52, 88% women and n=14 men, 22%) teaching students, who had started their master level health science teaching studies at University between years 2009-2012. The essays were written in the end of their studies, the theme was to reflect on your learning to be a teacher.
and what was the meaning of peer group in your learning. The whole data is 536 written pages. Ethical approval for the study was obtained from the ethical committee of the University and the students gave their written consent for using the data in publications.

The data was analysed by a phenomenographic method, which focuses on variation in human meaning, conceptions and awareness of experiencing a phenomenon as in this research of the peer-group in teacher education. Different ways of understanding phenomenon can be categorized according to the awareness shown by key aspects of the phenomenon (Marton & Booth 1997/2005). Key meanings are described as themes and as variations of these themes, which then are formed into hierarchical categories of description. (Marton & Pong 2005) The research data is collected writings of individual experiences, and the aim is to emphasize the whole as well as the parts in a single outcome space of variation. This was achieved by taking a collective way to experiencing peer groups. The focus is to find out the systematic relationship between different meanings, the phenomenon. Due to the hierarchical nature of the categories, some conceptions of peer-group can be regarded as more complete and more complex than others.

The result of the phenomenographic analysis is summarized in figure 2 and in table 1. Figure 2 shows the identified descriptive categories and their structural relations, whereas table 1 presents the themes of variation. The descriptive categories do not represent the conceptions of individual students but relate to the variation in the students’ conceptions of peer groups identified in the research data of this study. A theme was formed whenever there was enough evidence that an overall expression of meaning had been distinguished (Marton & Pong, 2005); and next, a draft set of descriptive categories was defined, refined and named. The second phase of analysis focused on identifying the structural relationships between the identified categories. In other words, the three categories describe the peer group on a collective level (Marton & Booth 1997/2005). We refer to these aspects as themes of variation. To confirm the results during the analysis, the process of re-reading the original essays was repeated until there was no significant change in the types of categories being determined. The set of categories was based on the analysis, but they are not determined in advance (Åkerlind 2005, 2008). During the analyze process we went back and forth to the original data to confirm the results and minimize the influence of our own viewpoints (Åkerlind, 2005).

RESULTS

After the whole four steps of phenomenographic analysis, the results of the study showed that the six emerging peer group’s themes were the nature of knowledge, nature of reflection, change of perspectives from learning to teaching, situation, and the nature of ethic and cooperation. All these six themes seemed to vary as three stages. Based on the descriptions of these theme variation, I was able to group together and distinguish varying ways of understanding. Three hierarchical categories of peer group description emerged: I) Value of otherness in participation the peer group quality education II) Otherness in peer group as a mirror to personal teaching; III) Community as the basis for a high quality education. (see fig 2) The hierarchy of categories means that in the category of III Community as the basis for a high quality education has categories II and I in it. The same teaching student can be at one theme on category I and at another theme for example, the ethicality theme in category III to be responsible for her/his own learning to be a teacher and keep her rights to study more
and take care of other members learning possibilities and rights. She can even get others the same practice possibilities that she has herself. The categories are common conceptions of peer group.

Figure 2: The hierarchy of peer group categories in teachers’ higher education

I Value of otherness in participation the peer group

II Otherness in peer group as mirror to the personal teaching

III Community as the basis for a high-quality education

1. VALUE OF OTHERNESS IN PARTICIPATION OF THE PEER GROUP

The categories differ from each other so that in the first category the peer group is a possibility to participate together with other familiar, in same learning situation being students, and continue learning during education. It is significant to learn to be a participant in the group with members from different health science disciplines, different teacher experienced, age and family relationships. The teaching students reflected on how I grow as a teacher in future and be a group leader. It is important that colleagues to create teachers own growth. They feel that they have the right to learn and practice the cooperation and interaction skills in a familiar group. Teaching students experience the book club and sometimes also the learning group as peer groups, which are the smallest groups in teacher education. The sameness creates a common atmosphere, a safe situation to experience and practice teaching methods, being in front of student groups, the right to teach and lead the learning situation without a stranger to be diminishing. (table 1.) The students wrote that this is the first stage to ask own questions and listen to others in the group to begin to be a shared expert as a professional teacher. Teaching students wrote the differentiations between peer group and group work as teaching technique. They didn’t seem to accept the group working teaching technique, but they liked to participate to in their teacher student’s book clubs and learning groups. (table 1.)

First theme was the nature of knowledge where the variation is from students own way of knowing; the practical knowledge is suitable also to the students. And the teacher’s differences are the starting point for learning to be teacher and have own learning
experiences form teaching methods. The next authentic citations of teaching students describes the way the first category Value of otherness in participation the peer group find out:

“I can practice teaching in our learning group and in the group work we can concentrate how to teach different things. We can handle common problems in teaching and how to manage or rid them. Everybody of us has our own way of seeing and experiences from good teaching, but however we made different creative solutions as learning group to the teaching.” (Linda 2013, d7)

“I am natural and casual teacher who realize my own ignorance in our learning group…” (Aaro 2010, d2)

“I have now right to learn to be a teacher. I have to know my presuppositions…” (Toini 2010, d3)

“I think, that teacher cooperate and motivate students by asking questions.” (Maria 2011, d1)

(The first names of teaching students show only the male students (Aaro is a man) and the number after name (2010) show in which year the student wrote this. The d is diary and the number after that shows the page number in which this citation is.)

2. OTHERNESS IN PEER GROUP AS A MIRROR TO PERSONAL TEACHING

The differentiation between the first (Value of otherness in participation the peer group) and second (Otherness in peer group as mirror to personal teaching)- category is the possibility to be a part of a developing group to see yourself as a familiar mirror and get critical evaluation and questions from others. Teaching students found the peer group larger than only book club (see fig 1.), also the learning group and study groups can be spaces where students reflect their own action or ideas about contents or books you had read. The demanding is shared and creative atmosphere, where the teacher students asked and allowed others to see them as a teacher before classrooms and other learning situations. The whole group is working together and have sometimes flow action. Group can have troubles, but those do not split or crash the team. Group can solve problems together without outside help and evaluate the solution together in face-to-face meetings or with social media. The common understanding feeds the group members' feelings of sameness and otherness. The teaching students' common understanding allows also critical cooperation and the members of the peer group try to bring the ideas outside to other clinical education groups and teacher communities. But they also want to reflect experiences in their own peer group. Changing from teaching students learning to personal way of teaching started and students prove also the power of teacher in own practicing. Then the peer group is widening so that also other education situations in different contexts are spaces for learning new teaching methods etc., which grow the confidence to be a teacher in teacher communication. The teaching student wrote how peer group members' otherness is important in this category.

The critical attitude toward their own and others knowledge is important in peer groups were the others are as my co-reflectors and they wrote how I want peer group members to be my developmental evaluators helping me to be a good teacher. Students can understand teaching students’ culture as common language with them. Common understanding lets them develop their teacher ships together. The next authentic citations of teaching students describe the second category Otherness in peer group as a mirror to personal teaching:
3. COMMUNITY AS THE BASIS FOR A HIGH-QUALITY EDUCATION

was the most interesting and surprising researched. Then the peer group has widened from the book clubs to the learning and study groups (See fig. 1). Even the lecture group, which was the largest group in teacher education, was important space where the students critically participate in the conversation and feel familiar to be a part of this education. The teaching students create together new teaching or learning ways or develops the whole learning situation or learning communities. The peer groups made possible to the teaching students the common shared knowledge creation. Peer groups have been a basic idea where to practice and get courage to try and enhance teaching and even new groups in education. Students feel that they can continue the peer group after education. They want to have their own space to develop themselves and have critical ideas to develop high school system and others. Teaching students can together create new learning situations and develop the learning communities. Then they feel that they are ready to be teachers and even develop new ways and ideas of learning. Students realize how different opinions and attitudes can widen their own horizons of persons, teaching and learning. Peer group as a shared continuing learning situation was the essential theme where the shared experienced has place to practice. If teaching students did not notice the situation, then they participate to the peer group session, but they did not want to share their personal or professional knowing in it. When students realize the honor of shared situation, then the peer groups were spaces to developing their own and others teachership. (see table 1) The teaching students wrote about this third category of Community as the basis for a high-quality education, as followed:

“Teaching construct together by conversation with colleagues in community and it is very useful for my own growth.” (Hilla 2011, d3)

“Teaching is committed to different situations and also my own social learning and participating to teaching is part of it.” (Jyri 2010, d2)

“….doing together develop teaching and create interactive atmosphere. In the open space others comment can open a nodal point and direct the common learning”. (Maisa 2010, d4)

“Knowledge creation together develops the whole community...The teacher education changed my way of teaching. Common videotape analyses were my best learning experiences, where we share thoughts and experiences of responsible teaching with my colleagues in peer-group. It help me to lighten my weight... The teacher can listen and be authentic attended in community when the shared teachership can develop community.” (Susu 2011, d1-2)

“We together with my teacher student college tried diary as evaluation method in teaching practicing. It was a positive experience, the higher education students were
satisfied and they had really thought about their own learning. I think it is very suitable way of evaluation to the psychophysiological physiotherapy subject. We have been thinking if it is possible to evaluate the learning diary by numerous way, but maybe it is more meaningful to the student, that she can get response from her learning diary. May be it is enough if the diary handlers all contents, if not then we can ask her to continue writing.“(Raija 2013, d33)

“I think, that every student, who has past the teaching, has something (conversations, written tasks etc.) to give to the education. How the education shall develop according to my or our teacher students' group? I think that the power of community learning has been one important stand point in our teacher education and hope that it would be so also in future. “(Saara 2013, d11)

Table 1: The health science teaching students’ three categories of the peer group’s meanings.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes and variation of themes</th>
<th>I Value of otherness in participation the peer group</th>
<th>II Otherness in peer group as mirror to personal teaching</th>
<th>III Community as the basis for a high-quality education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Nature of knowledge</strong></td>
<td>Practical knowledge for teaching</td>
<td>Critical knowledge in group</td>
<td>Embodiment knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Nature of reflection</strong></td>
<td>Teachers differences</td>
<td>Others as my mirror</td>
<td>Developing in peer-group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Learning to teaching</strong></td>
<td>Own learning experiences form teaching methods</td>
<td>Teaching with others</td>
<td>Situational teaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Situation</strong></td>
<td>Create common atmosphere</td>
<td>Group learning space</td>
<td>Common space to develop</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ethicality</strong></td>
<td>Right to learn and teach</td>
<td>Peer evaluation of own teaching</td>
<td>Share responsibilities to teach and learn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cooperation</strong></td>
<td>Ask questions and listening others</td>
<td>Share common language</td>
<td>Develop community together</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION**

The teamwork and collaboration are highly topical issues also in teacher education. The aim of this study is to promote understanding of peer groups meanings from the student teachers’ point of view in teacher education. The result of this study is that student teachers' conceptions of peer groups had six themes and phenomena of peer group widens to the sameness, otherness and shared developing, from participating different communities to the reflective teaching partnership and the most meaningful peer groups made student teachers to develop learning communities and create new communities in higher education. This study
found out, that peer groups are important spaces during teacher students’ learning process. Groups are situations where students felt sameness and differences to reflect their own action in familiar space, where there is trustful atmosphere, possibilities for dialogical conversation and evaluation. So in the peer groups students developed their own teachership with others and developed it further by being an active evaluating team. Peer groups made it also possible to create other teams in schools and research groups.

The results of this study showed that the different peer groups in health science teacher education at university seem to give teacher students opportunities to experience student-center education. But the peer groups, which gave been more counseling purpose (Colvin & Ashman 2010, Coman et. al. 2002; Hiltula et. al., 2012; Penttinen et al. 2013; Symes 1998) as book clubs and learning groups are spaces where the sameness seems to be most important to share knowledge, reflect own social growth and own learning process to be a teacher (table 1 themes) and bridging the line of disciplines. But the health science teacher students’ conception does not have a therapeutic purpose. The results of this study can be compared to Åkerlind’s (2011) argumentations that awareness from own learning to others learning mirrors my change by the process. The second-life learning spaces are challenges for teachers; there the peer groups are going to be more important and also creative learning situations (Nussbaum et.al 2009), where they can bridge the social contexts.

Figure 3: The peer groups bridges I-III at higher education.

According to the results of this study the peer groups have three different main aspects of themes, which can be developed in higher education. One is the social growth as a person by participating in the familiar friends group, which have same interesting points and regular meeting times. The second is the willingness to learn to be and behave in different groups as an expert or leader and have good cooperation skills to be able to bridge different social contexts. The teacher as counter or instructor is part of new student-centered teaching. Åkerlind (2008; 2011) has awakened also this kind of conversation according to her studies. The third is the learning process to become a good teacher. In this process the others in peer group and their responses and peer evaluation and dialectical discussions are an important
part of peer groups. Peer groups atmosphere is most important to dialogical conversations and openness to otherness in group, where you can be opposite and argue from your point of views to be able to bridge different disciplines (see fig 3). The andragogical experimental learning theories (Knowles 1984) and situational learning (Malinen 2000; Jarvis 2006) highlight this kind of critical reflection or cognitive dissonance (Engeström 1987)

In this study, phenomenography was chosen as the methodological approach in order to catch the variation in teacher students’ understanding of the peer group phenomenon. In most phenomenographic studies, the data on students’ conceptions are gathered via interviews. In this study, we decided to explore the feasibility of essay writing for this purpose, because writing has been proven to be a functional tool for reflection and learning (Tynjälä et. al. 2001). The data of essays proved to be versatile and descriptive. We believe that writing diaries and portfolios encouraged the students in our study to reflect on their experiences of the different aspects of peer group in a similar but more defined way as dialogue through interviews might have (Marton & Booth 2009, p. 130). Åkerlind (2005; 2008) also emphasizes that essays can be an expressive medium through which individuals can report about certain aspects of their individual world.

We shall see further if the new way of learning-centered teaching can so change also the higher education. Then the focus in teaching can be the students’ learning. (Åkerlind 2004; 2005; 2011) For example, the reflections on Finland’s top success in PISA studies (OECD 2006) have emphasized that in many aspects the Finnish education system deviates from practices typical in many other Western countries (e.g. Sahlberg 2010). Therefore further research is needed to understand teaching students’ conceptions of peers and otherness in different cultures and education systems as well as in other domains and professions.

This study had focus only on health science teacher education at university, so it is interesting to continue this research to other teacher education and other cultures to find out if this peer groups is only Nordic phenomena and what other meanings the peer groups get in other educational groups as folk high school (see Kulich 1984; Penttinen et.al. 2013; Penttinen & Vesenkari 2013). Also more research is needed to find out how the teacher is participating in peer groups. Peer groups are only one part of teacher students learning so we need more research to develop teacher education. The results of this study indicate how and why teacher student’s peer groups have different kinds of significance in bridging the disciplines and social contexts in health sciences higher education.

REFERENCES


FROM SOCIAL EDUCATORS IMAGINARY TO SOCIAL EDUCATORS TRAINING: LESSONS LEARNED IN A GRUNDTVING PARTNERSHIP PROJECT

Virgilio, Flavia
University of Udine
Italy

ABSTRACT

The paper presents the experience of a Grundtvig partnership project which explored the role played by informal citizenship learning in social housing urban environments (SHe) and the related educational challenges for social educators, practitioners and also researchers. The paper focus is related to issues concerning social educators' and NGO practitioners' professional training. The aim of the paper, in this perspective, is to offer introductory theoretical and methodological remarks for training of social educators and NGO practitioners in social housing environments.

In the research activities we focused on the following research questions:

- How do social educators and NGOs' practitioners perceive the educational aspects of their professional role?
- Which kind of dynamics are stimulated by these educational interventions in multicultural neighbourhoods where ambivalent feelings on diversity and plurality are shared by local and foreign inhabitants?
- How can professional training of practitioners stimulate reflection and in-depth understanding of living together in multicultural urban contexts?

We assumed that the views social educators had on citizenship, social housing, their role, the spaces and the people they worked with could be very relevant to the educational results they could get. This assumption is based on the idea that reflection on action could enhance the capacity to reflect also in action, giving a fundamental contribution to continuous self-education process (Schon, 1983).

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK, RESEARCH QUESTIONS AND METHODOLOGICAL APPROACH

The paper presents the experience of a Grundtvig partnership project which explored the role played by informal citizenship learning in social housing urban environments (SHe) and the related educational challenges for social educators, practitioners and also researchers. The paper focus is related to issues concerning social educators' and NGO practitioners' professional training. The aim of the paper, in this perspective, is to offer introductory theoretical and methodological remarks for training of social educators and NGO practitioners in social housing environments.

The basis for this reflection is the idea of informal learning as conceptualized by Schugurensky (2000: 4) and the concepts of learning for reflexive citizenship and learning for active citizenship as expressed by Johnston (2005: 48). These concepts entails dynamic
connections between citizenship as status and citizenship as practice (Lister, 1997; Delanty, 2000) and the interplay between these connections and the related forms of learning in formal, non-formal and informal contexts.

In the research activities we focused on the following research questions:

- How social educators and NGOs' practitioners perceive the educational aspects of their professional role?
- Which kind of dynamics are stimulated by these educational interventions in multicultural neighbourhoods where ambivalent feelings on diversity and plurality are shared by local and foreign inhabitants?
- How can professional training of practitioners stimulate reflection and in-depth understanding of living together in multicultural urban contexts?

As stated by Johnston, in exploring new forms of learning for citizenship “it may also be necessary to move beyond the boundaries of conventional adult education literature and engage with different but allied discourses” (Johnston, 2005, pp.55).

Mainly we refer to two different kinds of these discourses. On one hand Aiwha Ong's discourse on the relation between social educators' identity and professional role and the kind of citizenship shaped in social services (Ong, 1999; Ong, 2003). We are interested in exploring how different integration practices contribute to create situated conditions of possibilities and constraints for both migrants and education professionals working in heterogeneous contexts (Ong, 2003). At the same time we take in consideration the anthropological reflection on the interplay between local and global in building citizens' identity in the context of globalized arenas and flows (Appadurai, 1996). The anthropological perspective allowed us to explore the imaginary related to the professional role of social educators and the related issues of social inclusion, empowerment and social citizenship.

We have intersected this anthropological point of view with the analyses on educational spaces and the relevance of spaces in learning processes (Roets et alii, 2012; Biesta and Cowell, 2012; Wildemeersch, 2012; De Visscher et alii, 2012). Our approach is based on ethnographic tools which allowed researchers to investigate the kind of learning produced in informal settings.

The goal of the ethnographic approach in our research on citizenship learning processes is not the accumulation of ethnographic data by an academic anthropologist/ethnographer in order to produce an interpretation of the observed cultural reality. “Instead, the anthropological method is understood as an engaged empirical field-based practice strongly grounded in critical observation, reflection and production, which is shared by a group of expert and non-expert researchers who use the knowledge gained in the process to act upon socio-cultural reality. The anthropological method is, therefore, a learning process which brings the researcher and the researched together in an empirical encounter that has a transformative and possible emancipatory potential” (Cervinkova, 2011: 183).
The Grundtvig partnership called "ACTS: Active Citizenship and Social Housing: learning citizenship living together", has been realized by a partnership of three Universities and two civil society organizations based in Italy, United Kingdom and Finland. The aim of the project was to explore which kind of contribution informal learning in the context of social housing could give to reinforce "social cohesion, active citizenship, intercultural dialogue, gender equality and personal fulfilment" (EACEA, 2010).

The project addressed theoretical and methodological issues in informal citizenship education with disadvantaged groups with the aim to develop guidelines for training of social educators acting as adult educators in these environments. In this paper we present the qualitative methodologies we have used to explore social educators' representations as a starting point to plan and renew their training.

In Italy we worked throughout the project process with a local NGO called "Vicini di Casa", working in the field of social housing services.

We decided to choose as case study area a town district called Borgo Stazione in the southern part of the town centre, including the railway station. The reason for this choice is related to the fact that the district has a high percentage of foreign inhabitants (22,28%) compared with the rest of the city (14,30%). This percentage has increased during the last ten years. In addition, some of the activities realized by Vicini di Casa are concentrated in the area. In particular the NGO manages a social housing building in the area; supports economically and from a social point of view different persons living in the area; and was in charge of an information office at the bus station.

At the same time the area has a very controversial reputation in the town. Generally it is perceived as an unsafe place because of its increasing heterogeneity.

Vicini di Casa social educators are involved in a wide range of interventions at different levels in the area, aiming at building citizenship processes and inclusion activities in this very bad reputed context.

We assumed that the views they had on citizenship, social housing, their role, the spaces and the people they worked with could be very relevant to the educational results they could get. This assumption is based on the idea that reflection on action could enhance the capacity to reflect also in action, giving a fundamental contribution to continuous self-education process (Schon, 1983).

The social educators who took part in the project activities were twenty-five.

Twelve of them, working with Vicini di Casa NGO participated in all the project activities, the others took part in the final phase of the project when we validated the professional profile and discussed the professional imaginary and the case studies. The 25 social educators are the all professionals working in SHE at regional level. We collected and analysed twelve self-analysis forms and twenty-four professional case studies.
In the process of supporting NGO practitioners we have tried to enhance a self reflective path, mapping the professional profiles as mentioned above and working on professional imaginary of NGO practitioners at three levels according to the following principles:

- the research process as learning and changing process
- self analysis and evaluation as basis for building professional learning
- centrality of exchange among different social actors
- centrality of interaction between learning and action (Alessandrini, 2005: 163).

At a first personal and group level, we have tried to map representations of social educators of issues at stake in the project. In Italy, relevant researches have been realized in the area of housing problems investigating social educators' and social workers' representations (Massari, 2000; Cardano et alii, 2003).

At a second comparative level, we have exposed social educators to different experiences of community working in different countries and we have invited Vicini di Casa to organize in Italy workshops to host practitioners from different countries to present them their intervention model and their activities.

Thirdly at a reflexive level, we have realized some sessions of shadowing, following social educators during their normal work activities and we have discussed with them the materials collected.

We have used the results of research activities to propose possible directions for social educators training.

**CHANGING THE PROFESSIONAL IMAGINARY**

Our assumptions of implicit roles as adult educators of social educators in SHe relates not only to the centrality of relational aspects in the work they did, but also to the fact that through their technical intervention and their professional everyday practices they contribute to build a certain kind of citizenship that concerns both educators and educated citizens (Ong, 2003).

The project idea arose in little talks with Vicini di Casa social educators. They highlighted the fact that the new social housing projects promoted in Italy by the Integrated Real Estate Fund System (Sistema Integrato di Fondi immobiliari - SIF), dedicated to social housing projects entail a completely renewed role of social educators in SHe. The new system was introduced by Article 11 of Decree Law 112/2008, transformed into Law 133/2009. The system aims to promote and test innovative financial instruments and methodologies that enable participation by a wide range of social and financial categories who are capable of contributing and integrating planning, design, and financial resources on behalf of social housing projects. Social Housing projects under this new legal framework implies the role of Social Manager.

"By «social management» we mean the whole set of the activities related to property management, and to the management of the interaction among the people who live in that property. The manager selects the tenants and involves
the residents in actions designed to develop a sense of community and belonging. This professional figure is of fundamental importance to effectively guarantee the respect of the common good by the residents, and to avoid the risk of early physical and functional obsolescence of the buildings. In fact where integration and involvement of the inhabitants of a real-estate complex are indispensable for the success of the whole operation, the traditional activity of facility and property management incorporates the management of social aspects as well" (Del Gatto, Ferri, Pavesi 2012:112-114).

This means that Vicini di Casa social educators should update their working profiles and acquire new competences in order to play this new role.

The first social educators’ request during the project activities related to the need to reinforce the social educators’ professional profile by mapping their competences and exploring what they need in order to cover the new roles.

In our work with Vicini di Casa we have used a four step analysing process in order to design the professional profile fostering organizational learning:

- self-analysis of the working profile (present and future)
- self-evaluation of skills and individuation of weaknesses
- narrative collection of case studies
- exploration of social representations of key issues.

We held two workshops with social educators and proposed them to analyse their current competences and roles in the framework of Vicini di Casa organization. The result was the map of current skills social educators consider to master. In the second workshop we asked them to imagine the expected changes they envisaged in their role in order to match with the new framework of Social Housing. The results have been compared with data and information emerging from interviews with Vicini di Casa management committee.

After this first mapping step we have explored work biographies of social educators in order to investigate the significance of critical change processes for their individual and collective learning (Evans, 2013). Practitioners were questioned about their work experience, their perception of strengths and weaknesses in their work approach and the meaning they attribute to key issues in the project.

We have classified the material collected identifying actual (social mediation, effective communication, professional self-awareness, education in social housing contexts, support and information in home searching, networking with social services, legal and administrative support activities) and future (community work, social planning, social management of social housing communities, property management and facility management) work areas. The profile descriptions has been validated during two focus groups with all the social educators working in regional NGOs in the social housing field.

The exploration of social educators’ profiles has been intersected with adult educators’ profiles as defined in the document “Key competences for adult learning professionals” (B.J. Buiskool, S.D. Broek, J.A. van Lakerveld, G.K. Zarifis, M. Osborne, 2010). The central idea emerging is that educational aspects are implicit in many social educators’ profiles, from nurses to NGOs practitioners.
In fact our exploration demonstrates that the general key competences of social educators in SHE are exactly the same of those described in the document "Key competences for adult learning professionals", even if the social educators who take part in the workshops and focus groups do not describe and perceive themselves as educators in the first instance. They tended to consider first of all the technical, administrative and legal aspect of their profiles while discussing and collecting their professional biographies very different points emerged.

They consider as the most important aspect of their work personal and supportive relations with people involved in SH interventions while the socio-economical condition of people is considered as the decisive risk factor for projects aiming at social inclusion of marginalised people.

The very interesting thing is the fact that while the first factor is completely under professional control of social educators, the second is completely out of their control, subjected to difficult conditions of labour market and to the weakening of welfare system protection in the crisis turn. In fact another very weak point underlined by NGO practitioners is the fact that they feel themselves as the last bastion of a collapsing welfare system. Even if they cooperate in integrated approaches with social services, mainly they manage the "last chance cases". They feel like the terminal of a social protection system which tends to marginalise the marginals because of the reduction of resources and the growing competition for social services among poor Italians and foreigners. Finally they are in a certain sense expected to solve like private (and marginal) players of Civil Society Organizations the effects of social crises that public services are not in a condition to face.

In this sense NGOs practitioners could be considered as marginal players in the welfare system, playing their role in marginal spaces where marginalized citizens live. They are invited to assume the role of empowering marginalized people following the general approach of persuasion, normalisation, and inclusion (Rose, 1996; Vandenabeele et alii, 2011). In this sense NGO practitioners also in the new Italian SH framework risk becoming part of those social technologies which assure the possibility to govern spaces and encounters with regulatory effects (Ong, 1999). In our trajectory of research we try to move from this approach which implies “participating and relational citizens” (Vandenabeele et alii, 2011: 196-201) to the idea of “indefinite citizen” (Vandenabeele et alii, 2011:201-204). NGO practitioners as adult educators are invited to reflect on “the literal meaning of e-ducation, […] Education in this sense means the exploration of spaces which are anomalous or alienating rather than ‘pleasant’ or ‘nice’, and therefore enable us to envision a kind of citizenship which reflects our present-day ways of living together” (Vandenabeele et alii, 2011: 204).

SHE could be conceptualized as spaces where these ways of living together are experimented and "where education and learning are again connected to societal issues, under the inspiration of old and new values such as democracy, social justice, sustainability, freedom, responsibility, equality and solidarity" (Wildemeersch, Olesen, 2012: 13)

RESULTS

Some results emerge from our action research. The first one is the fact that social educators tend to oversimplify their vision of challenges and solutions in SHE, while questioned on
models and methodologies of intervention. They consider as key factors for successful or unsuccessful interventions:

- characteristics of the citizens (employment, personal resources, to be active and able to participate, social networks, …)
- characteristics of the context and related possibilities to cooperated with social services in an integrated approach
- lack of possibilities in the social housing stock at local level.

The role of social educators seems to be perceived as marginal except for those aspects concerning relational aspects and educational support.

The images social educators used to conceptualize the relation with the persons in need they work with correspond to those emerged in other researches led on services devoted to assure safe housing conditions to disadvantaged groups (Massari, 2000).

The answers given by NGOs practitioners tend to be similar to those given by other social educators in different contexts in terms of explanatory models and typologies of intervention (Massari, 2000; Cardano et alii, 2003). Mainly these answers could be related to three explanatory models, described with three images:

- the broken wing and his liberator
- the prostitute and the hard client
- the active support (Massari, 2000).

The first part of our work tended to make social educators aware of this explanatory models leading their work. We tried to get this aim by three different movements:

- inviting people to look at similar problems in other places
- inviting people to look at the same problems with other eyes, assuming the point of view of external observers visiting their work places
- shifting social educators’ point of view from a single case based approach to a community approach, where different points of view on problems and solutions are in reciprocal dialogue.

These three movements are classical of the anthropological methodology, based on the idea of mobilization of view points, field work, questioning people and coming back home to write ethnographies.

The second part of our work was aimed to exploring alternative and supposed innovative ways to face social problems in marginal areas and with marginal people, trying to shift social educators’ point of view from a rational based intervention to a creative and innovative way of thinking social change (Van der Veen and Wildemeersch, 2012).

We explored community mapping and community arts as opportunities to look at social problems, and possible solutions, with other eyes, less based on concrete and functional interventions and more based on imagining a new kind of citizens’ participation. The guiding idea is that all kind of social intervention is a meta-narrative of our way to give meaning to the world and to justify our action in the world (Andreotti, 2010). From an educational point of
view educators have to be aware that their meta-narratives contribute to build one of the possible stories of persons, places, problems, social services.

This kind of exercise could allow social educators to avoid implementing, uncritically, policies coming from outside and above, even those aimed at social inclusion and social cohesion.

What does it mean in terms of training design for social educators and NGO practitioners working in SHe?

It could mean a shift from a training centred on contents and methodologies, to one centred on processes and professional reflexivity.

It could mean a shift from a training centred on reproduction to a training centred on innovative and creative ways to think at being citizens in these times of crises.

It could mean to shift from educational solutions good for everywhere to context related solutions, where educational processes are strongly embedded in places.

It could mean a shift from theories of citizenship and social inclusion to citizenship practices.

It could mean a shift in social activities in SHe from social cohesion and inclusion to social laboratories of practiced citizenship (Roets et alii, 2012; Biesta and Cowell, 2012), taking into account the complexity of differences in terms of classes, ages, gender, lifestyles and ethnic background and the global/local interplay among these elements.

CONCLUSIONS

The research activities we realized in the framework of the ACIS Grundtvig partnership project could offer a relevant contribution to the actual reflection on changes in adult education in three directions.

First of all it contributes to show that while adult education is loosing its boundaries, perhaps weakening its social role as the professional role of adult educators, we could find emerging profiles of adult educators enclosed in different professional profiles, as in our case emerged for NGO social educators.

While key competences for adult learning professionals have been analysed and common frames of reference developed to assure common basis for assessment and training in formal and non-formal contexts ((B.J. Buiskool, S.D. Broek, J.A. van Lakerveld, G.K. Zarifis, M. Osborne, 2010), the lack of research is evident in informal contexts. In the case of our project informality relates to a double sided role that social educators play in inclusion and citizenship education processes nowadays. On the one hand they play their professional role as educators in informal contexts (the playground of a block of flats, the info points for migrants, the stairs of a social housing block where conflicts and tensions take place). On the other hand they play their professional role as educators in informal ways, while they give information or while they explain how to follow the common rules of a block of flats to prevent conflicts or while they facilitate reciprocal knowledge of flat owners or tenants when new and “difficult” tenants arrive, like in the case of migrants or Roma people.
While at a first level in the official tasks assigned by local authorities to introductory programs social educators are working in, their role is conceived mainly in technical administrative terms, our research shows that the educational aspects are very strong, even if very often implicit. Mainly this educational role is perceived and played in the form of social mentoring (Social Mentoring Research Group, 2007).

The second relevant dimension our research contributes to build on relates to the supposed relevance of innovative methods, like arts and maps in our experience, in adult educators curriculum. It is supposed that this kind of participatory and emancipatory methodologies could contribute to reinforce activation and produce active inclusion in a better and more rapid way. With regard to ‘activation’, ‘a process of convergence is, on the other hand, observed at the level of the ideological and ethical opinions entailed by this notion. This process of convergence entails a redefinition of the social question, with a tendency towards a reading of risk (of unemployment above all, but also of sickness, poverty, and so on) in moral rather than political or social terms. Central to this paradigm is the regulation of persons' behaviours (Serrano Pasqual, 2003).

Social educators intended as adult educators are often requested to play the role of social regulators, as in the new SH framework in Italy. While their training as community educators could answer to this new role requested, their education should be addressed towards a more critical understanding of the interplay between socio-political dimensions in the crisis of the welfare-state systems and the related challenges in terms of social citizenship, constructed in and through social services. At this regard, our hypothesis is that technical training should be combined with reflexive training and tools, like professional biographies and professional case telling. This kind of education could cover a wide range of professional profiles, from social educators to agronomists, from nurses to urban planners and entails innovative ways to imagine adult educators’ curriculum moving from skills acquisition to competences in participating in livelihood practices, from learning from other to learning from otherness (Wildemeersch, 2012).

Finally, very relevant for social educators training is the idea that in public spaces, like SHe, democratic experiments, like to manage a common space or to decide democratically where and how to establish a condominium garden, can turn private troubles in public concerns (Bauman, 1999) and contribute to shape public spaces in spaces of citizenship, where alternative views can come to existence and traditional hierarchies can be questioned. Our project shows how SHe could be seen as places for civic learning that enable political agency and democratic subjectivity (Biesta, 2011).

This perspective opens new dimensions for social educators education, where places could play a central role for citizenship practices of both marginal citizens and social educators and "education could be conceived as creating conditions in which people’s identities are interrupted by the presence of others who articulate opinions, or different expressions of what life and living together is about" (Wildemeersch, Kurantowicz, 2011:130).
REFERENCES


IV. INSTITUTIONALIZATION
1. INTRODUCTION

With this paper I aim to investigate the relationship between adult education and the third sector (or non-profit-organisations, respectively). It shall be shown, how certain linkages between the both can be used to provide a more insightful picture of organisational learning in that area – especially by circumventing some of the more common concepts of organisational learning which stem from a more or less visible behavioristic tradition and are essentially related towards companies. I will briefly reconsider that discussion in the first section but then leave it and move on to concepts of adult learning which may be utilised to conceptualise organisational learning from an adult education perspective. I will elaborate on if (and how) the persistent question on the relationship between individual and collective learning in adult education can be answered freshly by taking over this perspective. Eventually I will briefly explore further applications of adult learning concepts to the learning (non-profit) organisation.

In this paper, I will mix different versions of the notions non-profit-organisation and “third sector”. Unfortunately, the distinction between the two is not always easy to be drawn. Partly that may be due to shortcomings of the analytical preliminaries. But further, it is due to the fact that those areas are really intertwined and different schemes to distinguish them (cf. UNESCO Institute 2011, S. 108f; Wintergerst 2010; Anheier 2000) are not always congruent. Furthermore, it has to be considered that organisations of the third sector sometimes appear as providers of adult education without necessarily regarding themselves as such (cf. UIL 2009, 108; UKNCU et al. 2009, p. 53). Thus, in this paper I will apply a rather blurred concept of the third sector to keep the general line of thought as visible as possible, while probably sacrificing a bit of the desirable analytical precision.

2. ORGANISATION AS PSYCHE – COMMON VIEWS ON ORGANISATIONAL LEARNING

2.1 START FROM BEHAVIOURAL ORIGINS...

In the behaviorist tradition, learning is considered a linkage between a stimulus and a response which is not native. It may be established by the well-known processes of classical or operant conditioning or any more sophisticated approach within this tradition. However, to describe this perspective one usually points to the very feature it is lacking – behaviourists put emphasize on the fact that they (and anybody else, no matter what s/he is claiming) don’t know anything about the psyche itself, the “inner states” of the learning individual (also known as the famous black box concept, which, surprisingly, cannot easily be tracked back to one particular author). Organisational behaviour, in this respect, means, that some kind of stimulus is experienced by the organisation and in return it will come up with a certain
reaction. Consequently, organisational learning means that the chains between stimulus and response are altered.

2.2 **MOVE OVER TO COGNITIVE PSYCHOLOGY**

In the cognitive tradition (which has been adopted e.g. by Kolb, cf. Kolb 1984), learning is an ongoing process of establishing an equilibrium between two processes, which Piaget called accommodation and assimilation. Facing an incoherence between the individual's concept of the world and its sensual (or intellectual) experience, the individual tries to harmonize both either by assimilation of the experience (i.e. integrating it in an existing "picture") or by accommodation (i.e. changing that picture fundamentally in a way which allows to integrate the respective experiences afterwards). Again, this concept might be transferred to organisations: Organisations may experience some change in their environment and then either try to integrate it into an existing concept or change the concept accordingly. Often this idea is applied to failure or success of companies (though not always in a justified manner). Failing companies may have overstretched the assimilative potential of their concepts while successful companies undergo the more demanding, but in the long run more promising path of accommodation.

2.3 **AND POSE SOME QUESTIONS**

However, some questions arise when we apply either concept to organisations: Why should we use the concept of the black box while we usually know so much about the inside of any organisation in focus? What, on the other hand, does it mean when we talk about organisations experiencing something? How can we imagine the path from experience through reaction to mindful (organisational) decision? What exactly does assimilation mean for an organisation? And accommodation? What are the driving forces for organisations to act according to the theory (e.g. to undergo efforts to reduce the experience of incoherence)?

To tackle those questions, there are several opportunities:

- Elaborate further on the application of learning theory to organisations. Following the canonical line of paradigms from behaviorism through cognitivism (cf. Bélanger 2011, Pätzold 2011b), this will most probably lead to some kind of organisational constructivism. It may be tempting to elaborate on such a concept, however, there is quite some evidence that just piling up those paradigms already did not contribute too much to the understanding of adult learning (cf. ibid.) – so why should we expect it to be much more fruitful as for organisations?
- Move over to theories of organisational learning which are further developed (e.g. by March and Olsen, 1979, or Argyris and Schön, 1978). While this provides some further insights into learning in NGOs and in the field of adult education, one should not oversee that those approaches themselves are rooted deeply in the above mentioned paradigms. Applying them thus may lead to similar difficulties.
- Considering the rich body of theory and research on the learning of adults existing parallel to the classic paradigms and/or going beyond them, it seems promising to apply those approaches to the learning organisation as an entity.
I will follow the third alternative, not least because the focus on the non-profit sector probably speaks for this strategy: NPOs feature some characteristics which seem well adaptable from the perspective of adult education and adult learning theory. And, fortunately, they also lack some characteristics of profit organisations, which are quite difficult to handle in our context.

3. NPOS AND ADULT LEARNING

3.1 WHAT ARE NPOS?

Many articles and books on NPOs start with more or less complicated suggestions about how to define their subject. While cross national and historical analyses have shown a variety of justifiable definitions, depending on the particular context (c.f. Salamon and Anheier 1997), we may still refer to a core set of features of NPOs which can be assumed to be quite stable. Anheier (2000) states, that NPOs are

- “organised, i.e. possessing some institutional reality, which separates the organisation from informal entities such as families, gatherings or movements;
- private, i.e., institutionally separate from government, which sets the entity apart from the public sector;
- non-profit-distributing, i.e., not returning any profits generated to owners or equivalents, which distinguishes non-profits from businesses;
- self-governing, i.e., equipped to control their own activities which identifies those that are de jure units of other organisations; and
- voluntary, i.e., being non-compulsory in nature and with some degree of voluntary input in either the agency’s activities or management” (Anheier 2000, p. 2).

It is due to that features that NPOs are tightly related to values. Volunteers usually don’t engage just because they have some free time to spend. As they are not rewarded by monetary profit, they devote their work to goals which they share. Thus they “are populated by people who have strong beliefs, values and commitments to the work they are doing” (Edwards 1997, p. 238).

Similarly, values play a crucial role in adult education in its diverse facets. From historic to contemporary conceptions of adult education, from characteristics of its stakeholders to its popular programs we can observe the importance of values as a source of identity and a binding goal (cf. Flowers 2009). Comparing this aspect of adult learning with core aspects of the NPOs produces some interesting parallels, as shown in table 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Adult learning</th>
<th>Non-profit organisation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Role of values and emotions as drivers for learning</td>
<td>Role of values as constituent building force</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Large extent of non-monetary motivation for learning</td>
<td>Not for monetary profit by definition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(relations to theories of intrinsic motivation, self-determination theory etc., c.f. Ryan and Deci 2000)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adult learning often takes place in NPOs</td>
<td>NPOs particularly depend on the individual learning of their activists</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Table 1: Adult learning and NPOs*
3.2 ADULT LEARNING IN ORGANISATIONS

The criticism on traditional learning theory, which was sketched in section 2, has led to a variety of alternative approaches, which strive to be applicable within the context of adult learning, thus surmounting the shortcomings of learning theories, which are based on the learning of children (cf. Pätzold 2011). One promising step in this direction is Peter Jarvis’ concept of learning as the change of the whole person in her or his life world (Jarvis 2006). Jarvis gives an outlook on which aspects of the learning process may be considered, and there is empirical evidence that his approach covers important characteristics of adult learning (Pätzold 2012, 2011, 2008). Particularly, he emphasises the role of non-cognitive aspects of learning, be it the lived body or emotions. However, it seems not yet appropriate to apply this approach to organisational learning as it seems too open towards interpretation (and misinterpretation). Thus, in the following sections we will use a concept of adult learning established by the Danish researcher Knud Illeris.

While there are some similarities to Jarvis’ work, the core idea of this concept relates to Piaget’s above-mentioned idea of equilibria – the learning person is always challenged to establish a balance between cognitive and emotional aspects on the one hand and between oneself and the social environment on the other. Illeris has depicted this idea using a rather famous triangle (see figure 1a).

While there are some similarities to Jarvis’ work, the core idea of this concept relates to Piaget’s above-mentioned idea of equilibria – the learning person is always challenged to establish a balance between cognitive and emotional aspects on the one hand and between oneself and the social environment on the other. Illeris has depicted this idea using a rather famous triangle (see figure 1a).

Having this pictorial concept, we may try to apply it to organisational learning. Do we find similar processes and a similar aiming for balance? Obviously we cannot expect a mere literal application of the concept. However, there are instructive parallels to organisational tasks and processes. Figure 1b offers a kind of translation of Illeris’ triangle with respect to organisations.
We may now combine both triangles to a model of interrelationship between the learning individual and the learning organisation (figure 2). At this point we can see how values become crucial. Not only do they form a link between the individual’s emotional state and the organisation culture (a), they also are relevant for the willingness to learn and to share (b) and interpret the environment (c).

From individual cognition to knowledge management: Individual cognition relies on the ability to acquire and integrate knowledge. Newly acquired knowledge must be accessible to be useful in particular situations. In Illeris’ model, this process is to be balanced with emotions, e.g. by a willingness to learn. Such willingness is equally necessary for the individual to contribute to organisational learning. Also, there have to be the respective structures to support such learning, e.g. by procedures to support the exchange of knowledge. Furthermore, an organisation requires its members to be willing to share their knowledge instead of jealously concealing it. In table 2 profit organisations and non-profit organisations are compared with respect to the integration of the individual and the organisation and to the
handling of progress. It shows that the abovementioned condition is much more likely to apply to NPOs then to POs.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Profit organisation</th>
<th>Non-profit organisation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Problem of integration of organisational and individual’s interest/principal-agent-problem (c.f. Schreyögg 2008)</td>
<td>Principal-agent-problem is solved to a large extent by similar goals – otherwise dealing with it probably is part of the core business</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical progress under conditions of carefully nourished advances in knowledge</td>
<td>Social progress under conditions of knowledge as a common good</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2: NPOs and POs

In economic terms, the relationship between the members of a PO is fundamentally a relationship of competition. While I would not deny the occurrence of altruistic relations within companies, nor the possibility to collaborate just for the sake of it. Yet, behind that lies a struggle to maximise one’s own share of the profit. In NPOs, on the contrary, it is assumed that the members share collective values (e.g. environment protection, justice, faith) which motivate them to make individual knowledge accessible to others to promote the mutual goals. An evidence for that could be seen in the urge for transparency in many NPOs. Furthermore, there is a significant tendency to popularise knowledge, ranging from scientific facts to best practice. In (adult) education in particular, we face today an ever-growing movement towards publishing under open access conditions (examples are RELA, ROSE-Journal and according efforts by many publishers).

From the individual’s environment to the organisational field: Organisations, as systems, act in a particular environment, as do individuals. Organisation theory emphasises that the organisation’s environment consists of areas of different proximity and importance. The providers of necessary goods, for example, may be more relevant than a distant authority. A closer analysis based on the new institutionalism reveals that organisations act in a particular surrounding called organisational field (DiMaggio and Powell 1983). For a PO this field is largely defined by products (which are consumed, exchanged, produced, altered etc.). If we imagine it as a network, the edges more or less consist of business relations. NPOs are not that tightly related to economical exchange, thus the organisational field is much more coined by other organisations and individuals advocating the same goals, ideas and values. Thus it becomes more important for the individual members to experience the organisational field not only as an area, where similar organisations act, but also one where one’s individual values find resonance in the thinking and action of other individuals. Briefly, the individual members of an NPO demand their organisation to interact with others, individuals as well as organisations, which they can respect and appreciate. Again, values are obviously central for that. Some evidence for that lies in the fact that NPOs strive to establish networks of credible organisational partners. Adult education NPOs take great care not to be confound with POs by choosing or avoiding certain partners and by being critical towards certain organisational practices (see quality management as an example). Particularly, there is a considerable discussion on the pros and cons (mainly the latter) of implementing typical means and tools of managing profit organisations in NPOs, a phenomenon sometimes referred to as managerialism (Meyer, Buber and Aghamanoukjan 2013; Evetts 2011).
4. OUTLOOK

Having utilised one concept of adult learning (that of Illeris, in our case) one might explore others (e.g. Bateson’s levels of learning, see Bateson 1972) to monitor – and eventually promote – organisational learning in NGOs. With respect to the crucial meaning of values in this context it is inevitable that such an approach eventually must cover learning II (also called “deutero learning”, Bateson 1972, p. 292), transformative learning or similar levels of learning according to the respective theoretical framework. Examples of where NGOs demanded transformational learning by their members (and their donors and friends, as well) are numerous. Typical instances for that are

- Organisations of international co-operation have undergone several paradigmatic shifts from supporting individuals or regions suffering from aridities to creating and maintaining global, co-operative policies on issues like “water” or “climate change”.
- Educational NGOs had to deal with several turning points in policy of as well as knowledge about education. The UNESCO Institute of Lifelong Learning (UIL), for example, set off as a platform for international, open minded cooperation as for educational issues, shifted its attention to educational co-operation as a means of foreign aid in the 1970s, focussed on adult education and out-of-school education in the course of the Faure Report (Faure et al. 1972), becoming today one of the main institutional bodies to foster lifelong learning in a global perspective (see www.uis.unesco.org).
- Providers of academic education, like universities, need to face an upcoming change of demand – statistics show that student mobility is not only explained by obvious influences like the ability to speak certain languages, also there is at least a tendency to associate different subject areas with different regions of the world (Burkhart et al. 2013, 50f). Traditional orientations, be they nationally or towards certain partner countries, seem to blur against a kind of upcoming new international division of work.
- Organisations of adult education face changing environments as for globalisation, changing economic frames and value change which demand massive reconsiderations of formerly steady concepts like learning, competence and “Bildung”.

Undergoing transformative learning is always a risk. We simply don’t know where we end up. Thus the linkage of individual and collective values, besides other aspects, may also serve as a source of identity in a changing world. Accordingly, the change of values within NGOs is not something which can be neglected, neither is it a mere necessity. In fact it is a core task for value driven organisations to maintain as well as develop what they stand for. Consequently, their identity does not just base on certain values but also on particular ways of conducting a social process in which such values can be made a subject of change of the individual as well as the organisation. Such change then is a specific domain of adult education.

REFERENCES


ABSTRACT

The aim of this study is to reflect on Adult Education and its relationship with Sociocultural Community Development (SCD), based on theoretical assumptions that underpin the field of knowledge and action of Portuguese SCD practitioners.

The theoretical framework is drawn from a review of literature on adult education, formal and non-formal education, experiential learning, sociocultural community development and the expected skills of professionals engaged in SCD.

The methodology is qualitative and focuses on conducting semi-structured interviews with a group of SCD practitioners who completed their initial training in sociocultural community development in the school year 2011-2012, at a Portuguese state school of higher education. A content analysis was applied to the collected answers.

The main findings and conclusions suggest that SCD practitioners consider, in general, SCD to be a strategy for adult education, as it requires acting with adult audiences in a great diversity of social and cultural settings.

ADULT EDUCATION AND TRAINING: A BRIEF OVERVIEW

Adult Education is a relatively new expression when considering the history of Adult Education and Continuing Education. However, according to Canário (2008, p.11), there has always been education for adults. The term was coined and developed during the 19th century and first quarter of the 20th century. It derived mainly from State projects to develop the basic literacy of illiterate adults as part of their professional training. Civic organizations and political unions and associations viewed the purpose of and investment in adult education as a social process of movement of the masses allied with popular education.

By the end of World War II, Adult Education had reached a peak. It was then understood as a form of civic education, stimulating democracy and common culture, when hope and a feeling of belonging were the major sentiments emerging in an otherwise war-devastated Europe. From the 1960s onwards, after the UNESCO Second World Conference on Adult Education (the Montreal Conference), this concept became a factor in promoting economic and social development, both nationwide and internationally.

According to Canário (2008, pp.13-14), Adult Education began in the 1960s, to encompass a broad field of social intervention including Adult literacy, Professional training, Sociocultural community development (SCD) and Local development. Adult literacy is a second learning
opportunity intended for adults, tailored to suit the historical, social and institutional backgrounds against which it takes place.

Professional training, as a form of lifelong training, aims to improve and update the qualifications of a labour force faced with rapid social and economic development. Local development is viewed as social intervention because it aims to link adult education with emancipation of the populations pertaining to specific communities. Finally, SCD, being an educational type of action that sets out to cater for emergent social changes, becomes a form of strategic intervention in the domain of the social, cultural and local development of European and world core and semi-peripheral countries.

Canário also states that at the beginning of the 1970s the framework of Continuing Education (Éducation Permanente) emerges as a continuous process in the building of the individual, closely linked with his life from birth to death (Canário, 2008, pp.87-88). Continuing Education drives the reorganization of the educational system by viewing each person as the subject of his own education, rooted in the assumptions of continuing, diversified and globalised education. However, restricting the use of the term Continuing Education to apply to a period after basic schooling led it to be identified with Adult Education.

In Portugal, Adult Education after the April revolution, in 1974, is markedly dependent on frequent changes in educational policy (Lima, 2008, p. 31). Therefore, changing those policies and investing in popular education, in education in community living, as well as in local development became urgent, as these were identified with social commitment and democratic educational policies (Lima, 2008, p. 33). However, as stated by Lima:

a questão (...) reside em saber se a educação popular e de base de adultos, nas suas conexões privilegiadas com a educação comunitária, a educação cívica e para a cidadania democrática, com o desenvolvimento local, ainda mantém um potencial educativo e formativo reconhecido pelas políticas públicas e pelos grandes actores institucionais. (Lima, 2008, p. 51)

This author further states that the organizations committed to popular education have changed and risk losing their original purpose and importance.

According to Melo (2012, p. 490), Adult Education and Training can presently be divided into three categories: Adult Education, Citizenship and Labour. The concept of Adult Education is related with producing an informed citizen able to appreciate culture, as well as with building the individual by giving him access to more knowledge, culture and the foundations of democracy and democratic living (Melo, 2012, p.491). Regarding the Citizenship dimension, Melo argues that this has been taken as a form of social intervention aimed at changing and improving society. In this regard, popular education is an example of Adult Education. The Labour category comes as an answer to the changes that are wrought by urbanization and industrialization, which require a more skilled labour force, with better schooling and technical knowledge. The workers themselves look for specific professional training (Melo, 2012).

---

*1 The issue is whether popular and adult forms of education, in their close connections to education in community living, education for civic and democratic citizenship, and local development, still retain an educational and training potential which is acknowledged by the relevant institutions and by public policies. (Lima, 2008, p.51)
Finger and Asún (2003, p.111) state that with Adult Education being an obvious and universal need, in which each person engages individually and of his own volition, it is turning into a private movement. Furthermore, the practices of Adult Education are informed both by trends towards individual self-sufficiency and towards individual competitiveness (training, professional qualification) (Finger & Asún, 2003, p.112). These authors suggest that the idea of adult education is focusing on individual learning (self-guided learning), since independent learning practices are becoming increasingly common among industrialised countries (Finger & Asún, 2003, p. 114).

Osorio (2005, p. 17) emphasizes that Continuing Education is a natural process that has taken place in every culture. For this author, Continuing Education encompasses education as a whole, whether it takes place in formal, non-formal or informal situations, since in its dedication to the conscious and continuous enhancement of the person’s quality of life, it has a bearing on each individual’s family background and on the community to which they belong. (Osorio, 2005, p.21).

FORMAL, NON-FORMAL AND INFORMAL EDUCATION VERSUS SOCIOCULTURAL COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT: A DISCUSSION

The last decades have witnessed, along with the discussion on Continuing Education, a discussion on formal, non-formal and informal education (Osorio 2005, p.21).

In the opinion of Barros, formal education occurs within the scope and rationale of school (Barros, 2011, p. 84), whereas to Pinto (2005), formal education takes place in state or private teaching institutions by means of a sequence of well-established and quantitatively assessed stages, in which the school years are organised in units with a defined syllabus. This kind of education provides official diplomas and certificates.

Regarding non-formal education, within the sphere of Adult Education and Training, the Instituto Português de Apoio ao Desenvolvimento, in cooperation with independent organizations, came up with a proposal for a national strategy for development education that would become a joint statutory order by the Ministries of Foreign Affairs and Education. In it the distinction between formal and non-formal education is clearly made: non-formal education is defined as the kind of education which does not take place in formal settings and does not usually provide a diploma or a certificate (Statutory order 25931/2009, p.48398).

The national strategy goes further in stressing the relevance of non-formal education by identifying its contribution to improving skills other than those developed in formal education settings, and to reinforcing civic and social skills. Considering that non-formal education activities are considered to be more flexible and better suited to experimentation and innovation further reinforces this notion (Statutory order 25931/2009, p.48400).

According to Trilla (2004), SCD and non-formal education are interconnected, as non-formal education is one of the specific intervention areas of SCD. The author states that SCD comes under the heading of non-formal education because it has educational goals though these are not accomplished within the formal education system and curricula. Trilla adds as justification the specificities portrayed by SCD: paying attention to the interests and needs of
the receiving populations; active and participative methodologies where people’s experiential learning is valued as a source of knowledge, regardless of their school qualifications; and non-uniformity of space and time. Also the SCD intervention contexts (institutional yet not formal) and types of activities (conducted with non-formal structures) are one more argument in favour of sustaining SCD as a non-formal type of education.

Leisure pedagogy and leisure time education are two more central issues in non-formal education. Trilla (2004) includes these topics in the framework of socio-educational intervention, and consequently, within the sphere of education. The author concedes that leisure time workers (which includes the English so called “youth workers” who can in certain contexts be identified with SCD practitioners) view their own work as educational because it is social, pedagogic and has specific goals, though occurring in non-formal settings (holiday camps, leisure youth centres, recreational libraries…).

Regarding informal education, Pinto states that this corresponds to everything we learn, automatically, from the context in which we live: the persons with whom we informally bond, the books we read or the television we watch, the multiplicity of situations we experience daily with the more or less explicit intention of learning (Pinto, 2005). In the opinion of Tight (2002, cit.in Barros, 2011), informal education comprises all forms of learning accomplished by the individual through his relationship with others.

For Cavaco (2002), informal education is intrinsic to ManKind and is a non-organized type of education, which can be intentional or not, and is called education because of its effects in changing the individuals’ knowledge, behaviour and attitudes (Cavaco, 2002, p.26). In her opinion this concept cannot be dissociated from the concepts of formal and non-formal education as the three types of education are intertwined. Therefore, if formal education is usually linked to the school context, non-formal education is the one occurring in educational contexts with clearly stated educational goals but lacking an official syllabus. In its turn, informal education takes place naturally, even though unconsciously and without explicit intention.

**EXPERIENTIAL LEARNING AND EXPERIENTIAL TRAINING IN ADULT EDUCATION: WHAT CONTRIBUTION?**

Cavaco (2002, p.27), affirms that the ability to learn through experience is of major relevance. Consequently non-formal and informal educations are valued as supplementary to formal education. On the other hand, some authors say that experiential learning and experiential training are two different ways of regarding one’s experience. The first expression, originating in English-speaking countries deals with experiential learning. The second expression, derived from the German, relates to the training through life experiences (Finger, 1989, cit. in Cavaco, 2002, p.28). In effect, if experiential learning corresponds to the individual experiencing a situation, experiential training in turn represents the connection between the person and the culture (Finger, 1989, cit. in Cavaco, 2002, p.28).

From a different perspective, Josso (2002, pp.15-16) says that approaching life histories is a research methodology which has in the past 15 years contributed to the training-research2

---

2 ‘Recherche-formation’ in the original wording of Josso.
processes. This approach allows for understanding of training, self-training and their own respective characteristics, as well as the specificities of the training processes and those of the trainees.

Montenegro (2003, p.57) reflects upon and discusses the concept ‘adult eco-training’. To this author, ‘self-training’ adds a formative aspect to the relationship that the individual has with the world of things, whereas ‘hetero-training’ gives a formative aspect to the individual’s relationship with other individuals. In its turn, ‘eco-training’ is the global, interdependent and transforming social environment of relationships and lies between the physical (the things) and the social (the others) involvement of the individual (Montenegro, 2003, p.58).

Canário (2006, p. 35) states that acknowledging the relevance of experiential learning is not a novelty, as it reflects an adult education trend that goes back to the post-WWII period. In his opinion the Continuing Education movement and the appearance of the research approach to life histories are among the most significant outcomes of Adult Education. If, on the one hand, the Continuing Education movement came into being under the aegis of UNESCO, in an attempt to promote the humanization of development, on the other, the recent evolution of the Adult Education field is marked by a certain erosion of the Continuing Education ideals (Canário, 2006, p.35).

**SCD: A STRATEGY FOR ADULT EDUCATION?**

**SCD IN PORTUGAL: A HISTORICAL OVERVIEW**

In Portugal, according to Lopes (2008), SCD gains prominence mainly from the 1960s onwards. This author states that SCD is a relatively new form of social intervention. The expression used in Portugal, Animação Sociocultural, derives from the French Animation Socioculturelle, which came into use in the 1960s. However, in his opinion, the ancestors of SCD in Portugal can be found in the 1st Republic period (1910-1926), during the military dictatorship and the subsequent Estado Novo regime (1926-1974), and in the period which culminated in the April revolution. Lopes (2008) points out that popular education and cultural movements and initiatives to put an end to illiteracy can be found as early as the eve of the 1st Republic.

The appearance of the Popular Universities, a philosophical-literary movement that stood as a cultural landmark of the 1st Republic, created seminars and free courses in the open air, in collaboration with professional associations (Lopes, 2008, p.97). Popular Universities provided a non-formal education within a framework of interventions resembling the ones found in SCD (p. 98).

Socio-educational interventions during the 1st Republic make it possible to regard primary school as an institution suited to the implementation of social transformations and collective changes. The pedagogical practices are innovative, flexible, open-minded, and cater for the rounded development of the child. However, the attention given to the children seems to exclude the significant group of illiterate adults that are not required to attend school. It becomes urgent to address this social problem and implement initiatives aiming to promote the social inclusion of these adults. The movement of mobile schools, as they were called,
made for a direct link to the illiterate or poorly literate populations. Fighting or eradicating illiteracy becomes an overriding governamental concern.

On the other hand, the social and community movements generate the creation of recreational and cultural associations. According to Lopes (2008, p.102), these organizations aim to provide their members with recreation, opportunities to establish relationships, and instruction linked to the conquest of leisure time by workers and their need for a personal improvement. Nevertheless, this idea of community association has little impact due to the long working day (at that time 12 to 16 hours). In the opinion of Lopes (2008), these are nevertheless the social movements that heralded the real impact of SCD. By aiming to serve the respective members, these associations facilitate their own personal, social and cultural development through the implementation of cultural, social and leisure activities.

Also in the opinion of Lopes (2008, p.106), the arrival of the Estado Novo dictatorship, grounded in the 3-axis assumption of the major relevance of God, Homeland and Family, provoked a new twist in Portuguese society. In an atmosphere of totalitarian authority and control the people are passively placed in front of cultural events (p.107) and SCD turns into an instrument to enhance the political strategy of collective indoctrination into the regime's values (Lopes (2008, p.106). Thus, participation, autonomy and self-organisation are greatly hindered. In contrast, the Fundação Nacional para a Alegria no Trabalho gains prominence. This official organisation puts on a diversity of actions and activities, such as holiday camps, trips and excursions, sport events, seminars, the workers' theatre and educational cinema sessions, for the state employees and their families.

The 1960s in Portugal correspond, in the opinion of Lopes (2008), to a quest for social and cultural change and freedom, but simultaneously for innovation. Side by side with the political struggle embodied in Marxist and Leninist ideals, anarchist, democratic and youth protest movements, like the student crisis of 1962 ('crise académica de 1962'), emerge.

With the so called ‘Primavera Marcelista’ (1970-1974)3, SCD experiences an official regulation that brings with it a higher profile and acknowledgement of its practices. A ‘policy of youth’ can be witnessed, even if this is no more than a good intention. Putting it into practice would require an essential ingredient, the bedrock of SCD: Democracy (Lopes, 2008, p.131).

In the opinion of Lopes (2008), it takes the April revolution for SCD to come into its own, simultaneously with the regrowth of community organizations and popular education, linked to the freedom of speech and of association, and the principles of equal opportunity. These movements are rooted in a broad notion of citizenship, cooperation, solidarity and active participation in the lives of groups and communities. SCD, as a vehicle of popular mobilisation, becomes involved in upholding human rights, association movement, and for active participation the social, cultural and economic dimensions of Portuguese society. Fighting for the right to leisure time (non-working time), to leisure and to culture intensifies and SCD comes to greater prominence, with a greater sense of purpose for its action within communities. This is a time marked by a relaxation in the rules governing public

3 ‘Primavera Marcelista’ was the term coined for the period following the death of Salazar in which the political regime was the same, but with a tendency to democracy. The head of government was Marcelo Caetano.
manifestations in public spaces (streets, gardens, squares) and a time of collective expression, in which 'as pessoas se animavam e animavam os espaços colectivos', i.e., people were willingly and enthusiastically involved in actions together with others and in community spaces (Lopes, 2008, pp.153-154).

According to Lopes (2008), SCD enjoys its golden age from the years immediately following the April Revolution until 1998. The Inter-ministerial Commission on Sociocultural Community Development, as well as Regional Commissions on SCD, are formed; issues related to the deontology of sociocultural practitioners, their professional status and training are widely debated; and the first SCD Centres are created, under the auspices of an official financing agency. Also, during this period the expected skills of SCD practitioners are defined, and the first in-service training and qualification courses are held; activities within the sphere of socio-educational intervention and new projects are carried out; voluntary activities by SCD practitioners are valued and critical reflections about SCD beliefs, goals and ideals are engaged in; scientific literature and theories on SCD are published.

**SCD: SOME POSSIBLE CONCEPTS**

The diversity of meanings attributed to SCD is as large as the diversity of authors writing about it. Returning to Lopes (2008), one can notice the existence of a variety of guiding paradigms about the knowledge and practices of SCD: the technological paradigm, the interpretative paradigm, and the dialectic paradigm (pp.70-72). In effect, anchoring on these 3 paradigms, SCD concepts are subject to different interpretations: in the opinion of Garcia (1976 cit. in Lopes, 2008, p.143), SCD is a synonym of life and action, is a project of qualitative reshaping of daily life, is a way of looking, of seeing, of paying attention.

According to Trilla (2004), the concept of SCD turns around the concept of culture, which can be extended to Social Sciences, Education Sciences, Cultural Anthropology, Psychology, Philosophy, History and other fields of knowledge. By discussing the concept of culture in the sphere of SCD, this author expresses the meaning it conveys in terms of Cultural Anthropology: knowledge, values, traditions, habits, procedures and techniques, rules and types of relationship (p.20). It is from this idea that SCD acts and defines its beliefs, goals, ideals, techniques and procedures, when establishing relationships with the target community. Regarding SCD, Trilla defines it as follows:

> O conjunto de acções realizadas por indivíduos, grupos ou instituições numa comunidade (ou num sector da mesma) e dentro do âmbito de um território concreto, com o objectivo principal de promover nos seus membros uma atitude de participação activa no processo do seu próprio desenvolvimento quer social quer cultural." (Trilla, 2004, p.26)

---

4 ‘Animar’ means to give life, to give enthusiasm; to make more alive, to interest, to enthuse, to encourage. The word derives from the Latin *anima* (breath, air, soul).

5 The set of actions performed by individuals, groups or institutions within a community (or part of it) and within the boundaries of a defined territory, aiming mostly to promote in its members an attitude of active participation in their respective social and cultural development process. (Trilla, 2004, p.26)
SCD PRACTITIONERS: WHO ARE THEY? WHAT DO THEY DO? FROM CONCEPTIONS TO PRACTICES

THE CONCEPTIONS...

Loureiro, Cristovão and Caria (2013) discuss the knowledge of the Adult Education professionals in Portugal by referring to certain relevant studies:

Most studies on adult education workers (…) have been made around such issues as the profession, professionalization procedures and professional development. The debate about the existence (or not) of adult education professionals and the necessary requirements to be a professional (academic degree, basic theoretical competencies, codes of ethics, regulations to define and access the profession, among other issues), has been enriched by different authors in the last two or three decades. (Loureiro, Cristovão & Caria, 2013, p. 66)

Larrazábal (2004) is an author who proposes a definition of the SCD practitioner. In her opinion, the SCD practitioner occupies a position between the educator and the social worker: educator because he tries to stimulate for action, which implies an education geared to attitude change; social worker because his educational action is performed with persons, groups or even larger collectives (p.124). Another feature of the SCD practitioner is his public relations role, because he should be able to establish positive communication between persons, groups, communities and between all those and the social institutions and official organisms (Larrazábal, 2004, p.125).

Bento (2007, p.9), argues that the SCD practitioner can be a sociologist or an artisan; a historian or a workman; a teacher or an artist. For Lopes (2008, p.525) however, the SCD practitioner is a social worker who, through a professional vocation, a political commitment or a religious belief, tries to change society by working with the common people in the street, with outcasts, with groups, with the community and all the deprived members of society.

According to the Associação Portuguesa para o Desenvolvimento da Animação Sociocultural (APDASC), SCD practitioners should have the proper qualifications to enable them to plan and implement an intervention project within a community, institution or organisation, making use of social, cultural, educational, sporting and recreational techniques (APDASC, 2013a). The qualified SCD practitioner corresponds to the professional who has successfully completed a 1st cycle of studies (in accordance with the Bologna process) in one of the following: Sociocultural Community Development, Sociocultural Community Development and Intervention, Educational and Sociocultural Community Development, Cultural Community Development, Socio-educational Community Development, Cultural Community Development and Education (2013a).

Regarding professional activities, the APDASC (2013a, p.4) states that the SCD practitioner is the worker responsible for designing and directing sociocultural diagnostic processes, as well as for planning, implementing, managing evaluating SCD projects, plans and programmes. He enjoys the rights to participation, training and information for the performance of his duties; to technical, material and documentary support; to safety in the workplace and to collective negotiation (APDASC 2013a).
As far as duties are concerned, and abiding by the code of conduct of his profession, the SCD practitioner should bear in mind the following principles: professional conduct; sociocultural action; social justice; reliable information and confidentiality; continuing training; professional solidarity; respect for the persons receiving his intervention; institutional coherence; community participation and, last but not least, dovetailing of functions and coordination (APDASC 2013b).

Costa (2010), argues for the profession and professional qualification of SCD practitioners, based upon knowledge of employers’ real needs, for which skilled and competent professionals are increasingly in demand. These professionals are expected to work in close liaison with persons, groups or even communities seeking local and global development.

THE METHODOLOGICAL OPTIONS: A PRELIMINARY STUDY

When considering the methodological options for this research, the main goal of which is to reflect on SCD as a strategy for Adult Education, starting from the conceptions and practices of SCD practitioners, we chose a qualitative approach where we carried out interviews with a small group of SCD practitioners who completed their initial training in sociocultural community development in the school year 2011-2012, at a Portuguese state school of higher education. Semi-structured, in-depth and explicit interviews (Vermersch, 2000) were conducted and a content analysis of the responses was subsequently completed.

The preliminary data presented here are the result of the completion of five interviews with recently graduated practitioners. Additionally, we analysed the content of the transcripts of semi-structured interviews, a process that Bardin (2009) identifies as a way to take advantage of so-called qualitative material in which the researcher is confronted with a set of "x" interviews, and ultimately aims to be able to infer something, through these words, about a certain situation (...) representative of a population of individuals or of a social group Bardin (2009, p.90).

THE PRACTICES OF SCD PRACTITIONERS

The table displayed below aims to present the characteristics of the interviewees with regard to gender, age and their professional and training trajectories.
Table 1. Characterization of the interviewees

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interviewee</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Age interval (years)</th>
<th>Professional background (trajectory)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>E1</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>36-40</td>
<td>Youth worker in Leisure Time Activities, Accountant, Secretary (current position)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E2</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>31-35</td>
<td>Cashier; Supervisor; Clerk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E3</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>36-40</td>
<td>Clerk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E4</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>over 40</td>
<td>Adult Literacy field campaign coordinator; Coordinator of Training courses: setting up of a leisure time centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E5</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>over 40</td>
<td>Clerk (in the same career position, from 1997 to 2001, in the field of young people and the elderly); Local Agents Training, after May 2009</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Author

When analysing the information in Table 1, we can see that, in relation to gender, all of the respondents are female, and only two of the five interviewees had already exercised their professional activity in the field of SCD.

The following table summarises the choices made by these female SCD practitioners regarding the 1st cycle of studies in SCD in a Higher School of Education, within the State Polytechnic network of institutions, and the reasons/motivations for these options.

Table 2. Options taken in regard to the 1st cycle of studies in SCD and underlying reasons/motivations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interviewee</th>
<th>SCD = First option when applying to higher education?</th>
<th>Reasons/motivations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>E1</td>
<td>Yes.</td>
<td>Previous professional trajectory in connection with children, Leisure Time Activities and SCD.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E2</td>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Elementary teachers’ qualification (Visual and Technological Education). Wanted to attend a cycle of studies connected to non-formal education; with professional output; in which you work with people.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E3</td>
<td>Yes.</td>
<td>Personal identification with the syllabus of the cycle of studies, with the training project (of the school in question) and with the possible career opportunities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E4</td>
<td>Yes.</td>
<td>The cycle of studies in SCD has a direct relationship with her previous career; Extension of her knowledge in the field of SCD; the academic context of an ESE (Higher School of Education - Polytechnic) is different from the University.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E5</td>
<td>Yes.</td>
<td>To gain real knowledge of the territory (technical knowledge of SCD); possibility of career advancement.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Author

As for the choices made with regard to the 1st cycle of studies in SCD and the reasons/motivations underlying these options, only one interviewee (E2) states that SCD was not her first choice, since she had previously attended a course in Elementary Teaching (Visual and Technological Education).
We proceeded to an analysis of the respondents’ answers regarding their professional training and identity, as well as their views on the activity of the SCD practitioner. With reference to professional training and identity, E1 states that she sought to pursue a ‘higher level of training, training within this professional area’, which would allow her to ‘meet teachers and classmates, come into contact with different work methodologies (individual and group), and share knowledge and experiences’; E2 states that the cycle of studies enabled her to ‘work with different audiences, in different contexts and aspects/fields; to help others in their own transformation; to develop, emancipate and feel useful’. E3 says that she felt an identification with the profession and the profile of the SCD practitioner; as did E4, who adds that the cycle of studies provided ‘professional development, the promotion of culture, the social recognition of the professional activity in which she is currently engaged. Finally, E5 refers to the ‘continuity of her work, in addition to personal and professional development’.

When asked about the views they hold on the activity of the SCD practitioner, E1 said: ‘he is the professional working in the cultural, social and educational fields; the person who involves and positively spurs other individuals, groups and communities into action; a vehicle of knowledge and culture’. E2 refers to the SCD practitioner as someone who is ‘versatile, understanding, transformative, supportive, multifaceted’; E3 states that the SCD practitioner is a professional who ‘designs SCD projects; intervenes with all kinds of public’; E4 argues that he is the professional who ‘fosters community development; is a vehicle of cultural and social knowledge’; E5 states that the SCD practitioner ‘promotes interactions between people; performs SCD activities with all types of audiences’.

It could be concluded that, on issues related to professional identity and the training of the interviewees, there is a wide and distinct range of responses but with some points of convergence: personal and professional development and the ability to work with different target audiences.

When asked about their professional projects for the future, the interviewees said:

- ‘To continue to invest in SCD, especially in the cultural field; to design, develop and evaluate projects for SCD and community intervention’ (E1);
- ‘To practise SCD as a professional activity; to design new sociocultural projects; to improve the quality of life through improvement of work’ (E2);
- ‘To change professional activity (climb the career ladder); to contribute, more actively and meaningfully, to my employer’s organisation; to develop and coordinate projects within SCD’ (E3);
- ‘To proceed with the current work, in a more cohesive way (with tools, methods and techniques specific to SCD)’ (E4);
- ‘To proceed with the current work, in a more cohesive way (with tools, methods and techniques specific of SCD); to integrate and coordinate multidisciplinary teams’ (E5).

FINAL REMARKS AND EMERGING ISSUES

After conducting a review of the literature in the contexts of Adult Education, Continuing Education, formal, non-formal and informal education, experiential learning and training, and Sociocultural Community Development and the expected skills of the respective...
professionals, a theoretical framework based on leading authorities, (Portuguese and international) was established. In this way, we set out to engage in a reflection on the possible relationship between Adult Education and Sociocultural Community Development, viewed from the conceptions and practices of SCD practitioners.

Indeed, according to Ander-Egg, (2000, cit. in Fonte, 2012, p.67),

apesar de haver quem afirme que não existe nada substantivo que se possa chamar Animação, que se trata de uma abstração, de um rótulo para designar certas atividades, sem uma função bem definida, são conhecidas as derivações, amplas classificações e variedade de funções que atribuem ao Animador Sociocultural.6

To Ander-Egg, (2000, cit. in Fonte, 2012, p.69), the SCD practitioner is a catalyst/promoter/facilitator who motivates people, encouraging their participation. However, to Serrano and Puy a, 2007, cit. in Fonte (2012, p.70), the SCD practitioner must have the combined skills of an educator, an agent of social change, a public relations officer, a social mediator, and an intercultural promoter. In this regard, one of the SCD practitioners interviewed, E1, states that the SCD practitioner is the ‘professional working in the cultural, social and educational areas (…) a vehicle of knowledge and culture’, while E4 argues that this professional ‘fosters community development; is a vehicle of cultural and social knowledge’.

Osorio (2004) reflects upon Sociocultural Community Development and Adult Education. This author states that SCD is related to the areas of Continuing Education, Adult Education, non-formal education, popular education, education for leisure and for leisure time, cultural dissemination, cultural management, social promotion and community development (Osorio, 2004, p.238). The transition to cultural democratization is, in the view of that author, one of the closest connections between SCD and Adult Education, since access to culture and cultural assets is one of the most important milestones in adult development. (Osorio, 2004).

We should like to end with some concluding remarks and some emerging issues:

- What is the relationship between Adult Education and Sociocultural Community Development?
- Is there, effectively, a noticeable change in conceptions and practices of Adult Education, originating from the growth and significant presence of Sociocultural Community Development?
- Can we associate Sociocultural Community Development practitioners with Adult Educators? In what way?

Because there is no single answer to these questions (as they are debatable in a broader and more comprehensive framework), it is considered relevant and appropriate to further public debate concerning the connection between sociocultural community development and Adult Education, among peers and in the wider community of those who are dedicated to reflection, discussion and research around these topics.

6 Although it is sometimes said that there is nothing tangible in the term Community Development; that it is an abstraction, a label to designate certain activities, without a well-defined function, the derivations, broad classifications and variety of functions assigned to the SCD practitioner are well known. (Ander-Egg, 2000, cit. in Fonte, 2012, p.67)
REFERENCES


V. SYSTEM AND POLICIES
CHANGING CONFIGURATIONS IN THE GOVERNANCE OF ADULT EDUCATION IN EUROPE: DISCUSSION OF SOME EFFECTS OF THE LISBON STRATEGY IN PORTUGAL

Barros, Rosanna
University of Algarve
Portugal

ABSTRACT

This article discusses the effects of the Lisbon Strategy and the new European governance of adult education at the national/state level. It critically addresses the changes which took place in political discussions, concerning the construction of the European Education and Training Space. The main argument is that since the Lisbon Strategy there has been a change in the governance of the adult education policy within the European Union, with new goals, emphases and priorities for national agendas, together with a new political market role, creating marketable skills for the 21st Century adult learner. Some of the noticeable implications for Portugal with these changing configurations, with particular regard to specific aspects of the recent developments in the national adult education programme, are analysed. We do this by selecting a group of discerning authors in the field of educational sociology as the main theoretical framework. This paper presents some of the conclusions of a critical research-focused discussion on the main policy documents and programmes currently produced as technical guides for this educational sector. In short, since 1999 we have noticed the emergence of new processes and institutions that have created various hybrid configurations in Portugal, with a new adult education and training policy mainly publicized as promoting new opportunities for the adult learner. We think that this must be placed in a wider context that discusses opportunities in the neo-liberal context of globalisation. We conclude with some questions to be addressed by committed researchers in this field.

INTRODUCTORY THOUGHTS

The trans-nationalization of education in the Community context has been carried out in a sequence of three principal phases (Etxberria, 2000; Field, 2001; Antunes 2005). Initially there was a more general framework within the field of educational politics, which took place in two sub-phases: one that took place between 1971 and 1986, in which the institutionalization of education is seen as an area of joint Community cooperation and action; and another which happened in two steeps, between 1986 and 1992 and then again between 1992 and 1998/9, when there is Community political intervention in the field of education. The third phase (which is still on-going) corresponds to the construction of the systematic expression of policies and of the European education and training space, whose emergence, in our opinion, represents a real turning point in the elaboration of public policies.
for the sector which, innovatory since then, fall within the ambit of an education governance with different logics for different points in the capitalist world-economy system (Luke and Luke, 2000), in the sense that their guidance and orientation is now carried out in accordance with a globally structured agenda (Dale, 2005).

After the peak in a process of producing policy documentation to support the construction of a systematic expression of European policies (between 1992 and 1999), we reached the eve of the launch of the so-called *Agenda 2000/Lisbon Strategy*, with a growing network of cooperation in which powerful interconnections were constructed through which different bodies from different countries drew up complex networks of objectives, plans and projects, all interlinked (such as mobility, competitiveness, social cohesion) which slowly became key policy concepts (Fejes, 2010), which informed and moulded the Community and national policies (Holford, 2013). In this process the education and training of adults (ETA) was increasingly helped along by a central political agenda for the promotion of competitiveness in the European economy, giving continuity, although now within a sectorial ambit, to the economic-based and instrumental rationale of the more general Community policy guidelines in the framework of the supposed bankruptcy of the Welfare-State.

Between the Treaty of Amsterdam of 1997 and the Treaty of Nice of 2001, there is, to our understanding, a short politically fundamental historical period which, based on the general proposition “to mark a new phase in the process of European integration” (Treaty of Amsterdam, 1998:17), represented a turnaround in the way each member State was carrying out the national governance of its education. Since then ETA has been restructured allowing the emergence of a supranational governance, based on the idea of a strengthened cooperation and coordination, which is so innovative that we sustain that with the Agenda 2000/Lisbon Strategy there was a turnaround in the relation of strengths in the levels of educational governance, which represents a new and decisive phase in the reinforcement of the ways in the Europeanizing of ETA's policies (Barros, 2013a).

Through the sequential combination of political interventions of the *Luxemburg Process*, the European Union (EU) managed to transform what was essentially national education policies for the adult education sector (AE) into one single chapter of human resources global management with a supranational mandate more attached to the new Community employment policies, in the context of accelerated growth of the new industry of information (Milana, 2009), and from which one could not expect a mandate similar to the old concerns of social transformation, benefitting from social and redistributable justice, which a more humanistic pattern in educational governance, inspired for example by the guidance of the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), would insist in registering as a backdrop to a national agenda of public educational policies (Rubenson, 2006), for a sector with a discerning tradition in the historical ambit of the international movement of the AE (Barros, 2011a), that cannot be perceived to be present in the construction of the new *European Space for Education and Training*, which should have been consolidated by the year 2010 (extended to 2020), and whose activities of governance are closer to what Dale (2005) conceptualized as a neoliberal standard of educational governance.

In fact this European Education and Training Space started at the turn of the century, from a stipulated set of initiatives from which, on the one hand, we can highlight two extraordinary European Council Summits: the Luxemburg Summit (November 1997) which brought about
the European Employment Strategy (EES), and the Lisbon Summit (March 2000) which brought about the Memorandum on Lifelong Learning, on the other hand highlighting the Programme of Common Objectives for 2010, which would later be redefined simply as Education & Training 2010. The result of this set of strictly stated initiatives is a new phase in the Europeanizing of educational and training policies, which would bring about a profound impact on the educational sector destined for adults.

POLITICAL GOVERNANCE OF ADULT EDUCATION WITHIN THE EUROPEAN UNION

Within a time period of merely thirty years there has been a move, in the European context, of a pioneering institutionalization of education as an area of cooperation (between 1971/6 and 1986) to attain a progressive Community political intervention in the field of education and training (between 1986 and 1998/9) and finally, to attain a systematic linking of European policies on education, training and employment, which should culminate in the construction of a European transnational education and training space, which is already at an advanced stage (since 2000). It is a European space which transcends the very Community and which has its principal driving force in the EU. Or rather, what we can observe is that in the construction of this new European space the most emblematic initiatives involve either the Member-States from the EU, the countries applying to join, or those that are part of the European Free Trade Association (EFTA), making up a variable geometry of political platforms of European States in which, as Antunes underlines, the EU “tends to amplify and deepen its capacity to act and influence, redesigning the boundaries of what it can do in terms either of political areas or territorial limits” (Antunes, 2005: 128). Contributing to the success of this process, the mechanisms and effects of the hegemonic globalization, both direct and indirect, seem to be implicated, or rather, the new neo-liberal matrix of transnational governance (Nash, 2000; Corry, 2010). To paradigmatically illustrate the introduction of this new way of acting, seen as “good European governance” (European Commission, 2001: 17), which transcends the educational field but which affects it greatly, are the two pillars of the European strategy for the construction of the society of knowledge: the Luxemburg Process and the Agenda 2000/Lisbon Strategy.

So, at the start of the 21st century, ETA’s national policies appeared to overlap with a new European context of coordinated policies, making up a multi-tiered matrix of policies (Barros, 2009) whose priorities invariably emanated from the economic sphere. It was therefore, in the horizon of the single currency, and following on from the assumptions of the Amsterdam Treaty (article 125), that firstly the Luxemburg Summit took place, where we saw the beginning of a strategic process of multilateral supervision and cooperation in the domain of European employment policies, which was given continuity in the Lisbon Summit, only this time convoking, more strictly for the same effect, the domain of ETA, which appeared written into the assumptions of the paradigm of lifelong learning. In this way, a new procedural way of elaborating public policies was agreed in the new European Employment Strategy² (EES), and materialized in the new Open Method of Coordination³ (OMC), to structure what was

from then intended to be a concerted action\(^4\) in areas defined as priorities at the highest level of governance. Seen from the *Memorandum on Lifelong Learning* as strategies for the implementation of national employment policies, delineated in this way (through the European Social Fund regulations analysed between 2000 and 2006), the new ETA policies fitted within the more general ambit of a new political paradigm whose methodology voluntarily linked, and in the same direction, a network of subscriber-States to comply with directives and strategic guidance from the EU, to attain pre-defined results, with clearly fixed time limits. In other words, with the Agenda 2000/Lisbon Strategy a whole new educational order emerged (Leney and Green, 2005; Nuissel, 2006), which had in its great international statistical projects\(^5\) the direct translation of a cosmopolitan consensus on “the improvement of the quality of education” (Torres, 2000: 138), which currently appears to prevail amongst the bureaucratic and political elite who move in intergovernmental platforms at the European level (Nordin, 2011), and it is grounded on its adherence to the new policy paradigm based on numbers, essentially a policy for statistics.

What appears to be happening with the emergence of the regulatory State inclining towards neo-liberalism, whose modernisation strategy is based on the training and development of the social elite, is a radical narrowing of humanistic assumptions which outline the educational policies as a social right to be democratically negotiated in the national forums of the Welfare-States (Lima and Guimarães, 2011) so that, from the perspective where we are, what predominates today as the principal corollary of the new European OMC is, and which is the opposite of what is publicized, “an elitist style of public management” (Coraggio, 2000: 83) based on a “governmental *intelligentsia*” which makes summit agreements with global actors opting to carry out “special work to legitimize those agreements *ex post facto*” (*id.*, *ibid.*). Or in other words, the new trans-European policy where new actors, new institutions and new processes emerge, involve, as Antunes’ highlights, “accentuated forms of *democratic deficit* through which the field of public policy decision has gradually been reconstructed” (Antunes, 2006: 87).

It is in this scenario that a whole new context of ETA policies has been developed, in which, significantly, the national ETA actors, in relation to the global actors, and the actors of ETA sub-nationals, in relation to the national actors, see their socio-political influence increasingly reduced to the field of the mere execution of policies which, in their turn, seem to increasingly proceed, under the form of “vertiginous cascading changes” as Antunes (2006, 2007) calls them, to emphasize that, in the context of the construction of this new European Education and Training Space, the transformations that are happening are dramatic, especially by the “discretionary nature of the participation criteria and the problems of transparency and taking responsibility and accountability for public funds” (Antunes 2006: 87), in a process which is evolving towards a tendency of “exclusion of the protagonists and of the possibly divisive

---

\(^4\) The essence of the guide-lines of the first Employment Summit in the EU’s history, carried out in 1997, was an appeal for concrete and urgent action on the part of the member-States, in accordance with four structural aspects: employability, with the aim that everyone acquires competences to find work in a context of change; entrepreneurial spirit, to facilitate the drive and leadership of new businesses and facilitate the recruitment of employees; adaptability, aiming to develop new flexible ways of working to allow for safety and flexibility; and equal opportunities, aiming for equality between men and women in terms of access to the labour market. These are precisely the four leading pillars of the NEAP (1999), drawn up, based on the RCM no. 59/98 of 6 May and implemented in Portugal, for the period 2000-2005, by the 13th and 14th constitutional Governments.

\(^5\) See the repeated editions of the Education at a Glance – Indicators, for example.
processes (...) expedient that can be seen to be entirely efficient in the elimination of conflicts of interest and in the silencing of divergences.” (Antunes, 2007: 50). It is, according to us, precisely in this sense that one can interpret the growing reduction of the political to the technical, which can be confirmed since the Agenda 2000/Lisbon Strategy in a myriad of European recommendations⁶ which are presented as a technical solution elaborated for a supposedly inevitable situation and which today constitute the triumph which Lenhardt and Offe had already designated as the “technocratic mistake” (Lenhardt and Offe, 1984: 48). This phenomena has been used, for Portugal as well as for Europe, to legitimize the construction of a new educational orthodoxy (Shaw and Crowther, 1997; Field, 2002) destined to establish a new general and trans-European ETA logic.

HYBRID CONFIGURATIONS IN THE PORTUGUESE SCENE

It is only in 1999 that a National Agency for the Education and Training of Adults (ANEFA) came about in the Portuguese panorama. A set of eight attributes destined to expand the sector is imputed to this Agency, three of which we will highlight: that of celebrating programme-contracts with other public and private entities, also investing in the formalization of territorial partnerships; that of constructing a system of recognition of prior learning (RPL) in the adult population, aiming for school and professional certification; and that of motivating, informing and advising adults relating to the possibility and opportunity of lifelong learning.

The Socialist Government (re-elected in 1999) directed government action along two great transversal commitments: the society of information and knowledge and equality of opportunities. In the ambit of social politics, education, training and employment re-emerge as the structural axes of the national political agenda for education, seen as “absolutely necessary so that we can fight the battle of productivity and of qualification of employment” (Programme of the XIV Government, 2000: 22), prioritising “the development of ETA” (id, ibid: 25), seen as a fundamental element to “operate at ground level a set of great transformations” (id, ibid: 28), triggered by twelve action proposals, four of which stand out: the mandate attributed to ANEFA in the sense of developing a joint work of promoting education and training throughout life, contributing to reform recurring education; the goal of making Portuguese workers of all generations qualified, making up, from 2002, at least 10% of the work force in each year; the objective of promoting the attainment of the obligatory schooling in adult citizens through modules which allow that certification; and the intention of altering the rules for the co-financing of the training, promoting the quality of the actions and the stability of the institutions which develop it, new opportunities for individual access to the training and a greater decentralisation in the decision making. During the Socialist Government, the national emergence of a hybridity in the guidelines of the educational policy for the sector became visible (Barros, 2013a) crisscrossing discourses of a constructivist tendency from a discerning perspective with discourses advocating social efficiency which links the usefulness of education to economic productivity (Teodoro and Aníbal, 2008).

Therefore the year 2000 as well as the year 2001 were remembered in Portugal for the arrival of ANEFA, which according to Santos Silva represented “a fundamental qualitative

---

⁶ These recommendations were analysed by content analyses (Grawitz, 1986; Vala, 1986), and by discourse analyses (Olssen, Codds and O’Neill, 2004).
step in the reorganization for the public of a material that is so decisive for our future as well as for the qualification of our working population” (Santos Silva, 2002: 67). In this way, activities are promoted aimed essentially at finding out the educational situation of the working population by means of “the creation of flexible solutions that give voice to education and training, through organized routes, from RPL processes and modular training systems” (ANEFA, 2001c: 29). Alongside the Recurring Education of Adults, basic and secondary, and Extra-Curricular Education, the structure of the new ETA offer includes, from this period, the following activities: an offer of Adult Education and Training Courses; an offer of Actions To Know +, and an offer of Recognition of Prior Learning. Due to which, as a result of public policies effected by ANEFA there has been a real increase in the national network affecting the sector, and therefore an important expansion in the diversification of the offer, in spite of the excessive concentration of efforts in a segment of the adult population: the working population.

Next, we will characterize each one of these new possibilities referring to the ETA system. With respect to the offer of ETA Courses, what stands out as innovative is its conception with a logic of double certification, school and professional, following a model, which should be integrated, based on a referential of key-competences (RKC) for adults, and grounded on the transversal principle of beginning each ETA course based on the RPL of each learning-adult (mostly adults with few qualifications, often at risk of social exclusion). In this way a new starting point for the pedagogical processes that involve adults, trying to overcome “the double inheritance” (cf. Canário in ANEFA, 2002c: 50) which has characterized the recent history of the sector in Portugal, namely that of the schooling side which has persisted in the recurring education of adults, and the professional training side, tending to reproduce a functional perspective of the relationship between training and work. Agreeing with Canário, “these two traditions are situated at the antipodes of a training that claims to be based on the centrality of the learning subject, from the RPL and having as a reference not a list of contents but an increased set of competences to build on” (Canário in ANEFA, 2002c: 50). In this sense all its curricular conception, innovative in sector, involves a created modular system “within a perspective of individualization and differentiation of the routes of education-training, including integrated components of professionalizing training and of the training of the basics which allow the obtaining of a single certificate” (ANEFA, 2001a: 7-8) in one of the three levels of certification with which the pilot-Project of the ETA Courses would begin by being implemented in the Portuguese context. The public report of the first 13 ETA Courses observed, was, in 2002, presented under a positive light encouraging “the progressive increase and consolidation of this new type of educational offer, directed to adults without schooling or whose schooling does not cover the basic “obligatory” education” (Canário in ANEFA, 2002c: 49). Regarding the central governance of this new offer, what stand out is the adoption of a model which, according to Trigo, “invites and appeals to all the organizations in

---

7 It is only with respect to the Portuguese adult working population that the new ETA activities are being developed. There is a universe of almost 4,700,000 working people of whom, according to statistics from the Ministry of Work and Solidarity of 1998, “almost 2,400,000 do not have the 9th year of schooling, which means that 30% of the working population are semi or unqualified, which means they have a training lower that level III of professional qualification” (cf. ANEFA, 2001c: 29).

8 The obtaining of an ETA Certificate, until 2007, could be one of three types: Basic 1 (B1), the equivalent to the 1st cycle of Basic Learning and to Level 1 of Professional Qualification; Basic 2 (B2), equivalent to the 2nd cycle of Basic Learning and to Level 1 of Professional Qualification; or Basic 3 (B3), equivalent to the 3rd Cycle of Basic Learning and to Level II of Professional Qualification. Proceeding to a fourth level, from 2007, to include secondary education of 12th year level.
the civil society, accredited by the Institute for Innovation in Training (INOFOR) to develop ETA Courses” (Trigo, 2002b: 116), which in this ambit especially represents the clear induction of new forms of educational governance in the sector.

With respect to the offer of Actions to Know +, what stands out is the structure of these short term training activities, which were conceived to cover a vast range of possible training domains, allowing the adults to enjoy one or more modules (50 hours each) differentiated between them: initiation, acquiring greater knowledge or consolidation of knowledge (cf. ANEFA, 2001c: 31). Its creation served as a support to the other offers allowing the attainment of the objective “to develop or strengthen competences in professional, school and personal domains” (ANEFA, 2001b: 45; 2002b: 37), accomplishing the general strategy linked to the creation of a new ETA system, namely: “to promote learning throughout life, contributing to an efficient response to the requirements of the tertiary and economic development” (id, ibid).

Finally, regarding the offer of RPL, immediately what stands out is its integration into a strategy which holds that “Portugal has an under-certification” (ANEFA, 2001c: 39), thus justifying the creation of “two great areas of intervention (...) [to] give the opportunity to all citizens and particularly those with less schooling and those in work and out of work to see recognised and certified the competences and knowledge which, in the most varied contexts, were acquired throughout the course of their lives” (ANEFA, 2001b: 21). It was, on the one hand, the building of the RLP System and on the other hand, the gradual construction of a Network of RPL Centres. Therefore, according to Santos Silva, ANEFA has the responsibility to intervene based on the principle that “it is possible and necessary to value the experience and the professional capacities, apart from personal and civic, of the adults to also improve their educational level” (Santos Silva, 2002: 73). ANEFA’s priorities, during all of this period, were to develop the essential in the inherent methodological processes in the RPL system, in other words – the basis of the model of organisation and intervention inherent in the RPL process, the specific materials to support the structural and organizational development of the practices (kit for the RPL process), the diverse direct instruments of support for the RPL professionals and for the adults in the process, indirect devices to support an adequate technical/pedagogical documentation for all those involved in the RPL process, the compilation and divulgation of theoretical support materials in the evaluation process of competences and the construction of the adults’ Personal Dossier (cf. ANEFA, 2001b: 21-38; 2002a: 19-23). Its activity in this domain left for others the stabilizing of procedures relating to: the national register of external evaluators, the definition of the technical-pedagogical administration of the Centres offering RPL and the accreditation of potential promotional entities of new RPL centres. All this left the functioning of the RPL Centres, to be part of a network and working in partnerships, for a future consolidation (Barros, 2011b). This offer was politically written into a line of facing the problem of under-certification, by which the educational policy guidelines are weaved, perhaps tighter here, according to hybrid lines (Barros, 2013b) recognising the potential of the RPL process for the “construction of opportunities and training routes congruous with the paths and the past acquisitions of those being trained” (Santos Silva, 2002: 142), admitting the necessity to avoid this offer being transformed into an “administrative attribution of school titles” (id, ibid), at the same time redefining the physical goals each RPL Centre will have to accomplish, in terms of certification, to make this investment efficient within the objective of contributing to “restore the accumulated delay as quickly as possible” (id, ibis: 141). This is, therefore, the model for
the national structuring (with a hybrid configuration) of the new ETA offer to the public after
the Agenda 2000/Lisbon Strategy.

NEW GOALS, EMPHASES AND PRIORITIES IN THE AE NATIONAL AGENDA

There was a new process, of a transnational nature, of drawing up public education policies
which emerged in Portugal to coincide with a cycle of socialist governance (of the 13th and
14th constitutional Governments, between 1996 and 2002) and which, particularly for this
sector, had in the new institution of ANEFA its sustenance at a national level.

It is in this sense, it seems to us, that the new role of ANEFA can be interpreted in a wider
context, that is, the upstreams and downstreams of its effective realizations resulting from its
short but decisive (between 1999 and 2002) period of existence. So, not being in cause its
obvious potential to intervene to provoke new educational landscapes in a sector excessively
tiered in the Portuguese context, what stands out from its more general mission involves, on
the one hand, the effective contribution to restructure the model of social regulation helping
to implement a redefinition of the State’s roles, nowadays increasingly regulated and
coordinated, of the Market, renewed in an almost-market, and of the civil society, transfigured
into a tertiary sector of social partners (Held, McGrew, Goldblatt and Perraton, 1999). Or
rather, operating, on the upstream, through an active introductory role of new forms of
educational governance at national level, which would allow the quick admission into the
sector of new institutional combinations, based on programme-contracts and in the form of a
partnership, with a striking investment in the creation of a myriad of promotional entities as
strategic elements of a new order in ETA’s processes and social relations.

On the other hand, what also stands out as an integral, more general, part of its mission is its
contribution to the internal continuation of goals and objectives defined transnationally, which
for the present case represent signs of the emergence of a new world educational order
(Field, 2002), more significant, however, for the Portuguese context, in its aspect of
Europeanizing the national educational policies for the sector. Or rather, operating
downstream, by means of an active role of prolonging the new forms of educational
governance situated at the supranational level, which opened a path for the full introduction
in the political agenda of a new triple domain of education, training and employment, and a
new logic of making public policies, protagonized by the EU, and in agreement with the new
OMC which, producing common instruments of governance for the European space,
contributed to the emergence of a new multiple-tiered political system (Liebfried and Pierson,
1995).

Based on the data of the critical content and discourse analysis carried out we maintain that
from 1999, and therefore in away politically innovative and complex, there was a turn in the
field of AE. A turning point that is written into a wide and silent political revolution that,
contrary to what is stated in some documents and speeches of the dominant international
bodies, as in the case of the Memorandum of Lifelong Learning (2000), is clearly and
principally ideological. It seems to us, in this sense, that ANEFA carried out a macro key-role
in the national start-up of the multi-tiered governance of the new ETA, which we claim to be
today already fully implemented into the sector, not being indifferent to the fact, outlined by
Melo, Lima and Almeida, of ANEFA seeming, observing its performance, to have been
“conceived as a mediation structure, and in some cases, perhaps by regulation, of initiatives
that originate from interventions from the domains of education and employment and professional training” (Melo, Lima e Almeida, 2002: 118). In other words, its “role as an indirect driving force” (id, ibid:120) was functional for the new political process, transnational but still emerging and at this almost imperceptible phase, of transformation from the education public policy sector, which had moreover always been fragmented in the national AE domain, into something substantively diverse: the new ETA policies. It is a political process, written in transitional times, which seems to increasingly be less a process of writing policies which involves, on the one hand, traditional mechanisms of the representative democracy, and on the other hand, what we habitually classify as educational policy for adults (Griffin, 2002), to then become a natural process and new ambition, which involved new processes in the configuration of the structural time-spaces of the contemporary capitalist societies through new mechanisms of power, in this way triggering a new political process sustained by a substantive redefinition of the very State (Sträth e Torstendhal, 1992).

Since then the national ETA agenda has presented new goals, emphases and priorities as can be seen for example in the new cycle of socialist political governance (of the 17th and 18th constitutional Governments between 2005 and 2011). It established a new speed and rhythm for the implementation of this new political process of demarcated educational governance, firstly by the Agenda 2000/Lisbon Strategy, initiated by the European Council in the Spring of 2000, and later, by the re-launch of that same Agenda 2000/Lisbon Strategy, which was reinforced by the European Council of the Spring of 2005.

In this period policies of rationalization were put in place9, typical of the model of educational governance prevalent at supranational level and of a neoliberal kind, being able to identify, by the contents analysed of the new instruments of governance, not just in planning but also in guidance and social conciliation, which are now speedily produced, a whole range of discourses10 in line with the new paradigm of the drawing up of policies which point to two principal aspects: the explicit idea of moralizing the educational system, which for the sector is based on the promotion of equality of opportunities, fostered by the creation of new opportunities; and the implicit idea of promoting social control, which for the sector is based on the idea of the individual’s responsibility to become employable through more education and training, preferably throughout life, and in all walks of life.

It is, essentially, a new political process which has materialized because of the significant proliferation of new national instruments of governance11 turning, for its part, to other

---

9 See the Programme of the 12th Constitutional Government of Portugal.
10 See Speech of the President of the Republic, Jorge Sampaio, on 12/12/05
11 What stands out in this array of national instruments of governance is principally: the National Action Programme for Growth and Employment (PNACE, 2005-2008), which constitutes the heart of the social governance of this new cycle and which is represented as “a response from Portugal to the new lines of guidance from the Lisbon Strategy and constitutes a reference framework for the diverse governmental policies of the macroeconomic and microeconomic ambit and for qualification and work,” having created under its auspices seven sectorial policies, out of which we highlight the one produced by a special work group for qualification, employment and social cohesion, which drew up ten measures to “strengthen the education and qualification of the Portuguese” (cf. www.estrategiadelisboa.pt); the National Employment Action Plan (NEAP, 2005-2008), which presents five “strategic and high priority challenges” (which are in line with the Decision of the European Commission no. 2005/600/EC of 12th July, which sets out eight guidelines for the employment policies of the member-States), out of which we highlight that of “strengthening the education and qualification of the population,” and within this NEAP fifteen lines of intervention are contemplated, from which we highlight three directly referring to the EES and to its plan to “invest
transnational instruments\textsuperscript{12}, both contributing to weave, through the OMC, a *European web of multi-tiered governance of ETA* which contributes to confirm, at an educational level, the hypothesis put forward by Liebfried and Pierson (1995) of the emergence of a political system of multiple levels.

It is possible in this way to interpret the Initiative of New Opportunities (INO), the last document of educational policy drawn up in Portugal for ETA (in force between 2005 and 2012) as an *instrument of synthesis*, or rather, representing the most recent element in the educational multi-tiered governance of the ETA sector.

**FINAL THOUGHTS ON INTERPRETING THE CHANGING CONFIGURATIONS OF AE GOVERNANCE**

As a propitiating element in the national drive for a multi-faceted governance of the new ETA, as much at the subnational level as at the supranational level of its scale of organization (Dale, 2005), the performance of ANEFA\textsuperscript{13} was fundamental. Particularly, the socio-political marks left in the Portuguese social scene by its clear and assumed intention to institute a new social contract around the sector (Trigo, 2002a), would turn out to be not only strategic for subsequent developments at the level of the consolidation of a new logic in accordance with the provision of an education for adults, reformulating the very activities of educational governance such as, inclusively, legitimately allowing a more extensive overhaul of the role of the Welfare-State, in the area of producing social policies (Barros, 2012a) by means of celebrating a whole new rhetoric, now hegemonic, around the idea of the greater participation of the social partners in political decisions, an idea which, moreover, this model of social partnership, contributes to validate and expand in a discursive level.

Portugal, being a country on the European semi-periphery, characterized as resisting a strong, centralized State, having a weak and disparate market, and a civil society simultaneously strong in its compensatory social provision and weak in its demands for a civic-political organization, the new institutional combination based on the form of the partnership, advanced synonymously with its participation, would be constructed with a dual purpose, on the one hand that of legitimizing the central projects of the political system, in this case of an educational nature, by means of its supposedly democratic assumption on the

---

\textsuperscript{12}This wide range of supranational instruments of governance works in conjunction with a range of instruments of supranational co-financing, particularly important for the Portuguese context in the ambit of the 3rd Community Support Framework (2000-2006), such as: PRODEP III; the Operational Programme for Employment, Training and Social Development (POEFS); or SOCRATES 2 (highlighting the Grundtvig Action). Later emerging from these Structural and Cohesion Funds for 2007-2013 is the National Strategic Reference Framework (QREN).

\textsuperscript{13}ANEFA was created in 1999 and made extinct in 2002. Since then the Portuguese ETA has been governed by different entities: the General Management of Vocational Training (DGFV, between 2002 and 2005); the National Agency for Qualification (ANQ, between 2006 and 2012); and the National Agency for Qualification and Professional Training (ANQEP, since 2012).
part of organizations and peripheral institutions from the civil society and, on the other hand, that of contributing to substitute the conflicts of plural interests by a cooperative negotiation, in this sense getting us used to understanding the motives for which “the socio-educational partnership emerges as a strategy (instrument) of cooperation with a systematic perspective of the relationship between the educational system/the economic and social system” (Marques, 1994: 50).

In this way, the partnership is established by the initiative of the state power itself, and according to Antunes “as a way of promoting interventions capable of overcoming impasses and obstacles and of promoting ways of acting in line with conditions and valued objectives” (Antunes, 2001: 183). The new actors and entities, which now participate legitimately in this process of elaborating educational public policies, especially contribute to bring about a redistribution of responsibilities, indirectly allowing a redirection of the terms according to which will give a new emphasis to ETA, as the importance of the sector is illustrated in the ambit of the Conciliation Agreement on the Employment Policy, Work Market, Education and Training, signed in 2001, in which various measures to increase ETA were established, such as the consolidation of the offer of ETA courses, the offer of RPL and the offer of continuous training of working employees with minimum obligatory levels of annual training attendance, constituting a set of measures understood, in essence, as contributing to an effort to promote schooling and professional training, as well as the quality of work and the acceptance of socially active policies (cf. CES, 2001). It is, in our view, a question of what Licínio Lima identified as “an intermittent movement of recentralization/decentralization and of regulation/deregulation which emerge as forms of concentrating and centrally controlling the powers of decision and of political choice and of simultaneously decentralizing in merely functional terms decisions of a predominantly instrumental type and operational at peripheral levels” (Lima, 1997: 53).

This is the logic that, since then, has characterized the new form of educational governance of the sector which, at the national level, is grounded in the structural idea that the role of the State in the modernizing of the country would especially consist of promoting the creation of “strategic training operators” (cf. Mesquita, 2000). Therefore the Portuguese democratic capitalist State took on the role, even if following the lines of a hybrid ideological guidance between the humanist and neoliberal model, of the State giving a voice to a growing network of ETA promotional entities, in this case created through ANEFA, in a composite political formula putting the State in charge of regulation\(^{14}\) and the financing\(^{15}\) of the ETA offer and the new network of public and private promoters, the property\(^{16}\) and the supply\(^{17}\) of that same

---

\(^{14}\) Although here joined with ANEFA itself, to stipulate the general definition of norms and generic organizing criteria of the specifications of the new offer.

\(^{15}\) The financing is predominantly public, but comprises a significant partnership of supranational co-financing from the EU’s Structural Funds. With regard to this, Alberto Melo emphasizes that, in general, the new phenomena of an influx of expenditure from the EEC/EU’s Structural Funds unleashed since Portugal’s adhesion to this supranational regional organization, would contribute to “strengthen the central powers and administrations, which immediately guaranteed the monopoly of its programming and management (...) searching in general for the public services to strengthen and enlarge as much as possible its financial, technical and institutional power, without any perspective of conception/management shared by programmes and measures” (Melo, 2003: 8).

\(^{16}\) The promoting entities should previously belong to the list of entities registered in INOFOR (Governmental Institution for Continuous Learning), to guarantee the existence and possession of the necessary resources for the adequate development of education-training actions.

\(^{17}\) The State and ANEFA having previously stipulated competences and ways of acting it automatically falls on the promoting entities, respecting the terms of the designated dossier of technical-
offer, these being the institutions of social coordination for the national level, involved in each one of the four activities of relevant educational governance, in the theoretical perspective proposed by Dale (2005) and adopted here, to interpret this new emerging educational order, direct result of the active involvement of the State, analysed here by way of its effort in the construction of an informal ETA subsystem. Therefore, the tensions particular to the Democratic Capitalist States seem to have been confronted by the Portuguese semi peripheral State according to a contradictory model which, on the one hand, faces and assumes the necessity of relaunching and expanding an excessively tapering educational sector and, on the other hand, agrees as a priority to national competitiveness and to the necessary requisites for the European adoption of a new model of economic development based on the industry of information and of knowledge.

The strength of the European mandate, based on the idea of an essential link between education, training and employment, would therefore call for a readjustment of the priority aspects of intervention through which ANEFA constructed the whole of this new national educational offer. It is, in our opinion, an example of the indirect external effects of globalization (Dale, 2005) to justify the reinstatement of the sector in the political agenda of the socialist Government, in force between 1995 and 2002, to finally allow the consolidation of a vaster socio-political transition project (Griffin, 2002), and structured globally, in which the conception of traditional themes from the ambit of adult education policies (the old AE policies) go through a re-conceptualization of the same themes now seen as problematic written into the ambit of employment and training strategies (the new ETA policies). Therefore, it seems to us possible to interpret in this sense the fact, already noted by Licínio Lima, that in ANEFA's performance “the modernizing logic, easy to bring about, and especially the qualification of the human resources, necessary for employability and the acquisition of competences to compete, clearly predominated over other aspects which were present in the initial ANEFA projects” (Lima, 2005: 48). As a result of the active role of ANEFA in the national prolongation of new forms of educational governance situated at supranational level, it is shown, as also happened at European level, that what predominates, although not at the level of discursive rhetoric, perhaps even more humanistic than before, is a palliative understanding for the present mission that the public education activities and training for adults should carry out, which in part explains that in ANEFA we can confirm, as Lima highlights, that “the induction predominated over intervention, the “logic of the programme” curbed the “logic of public service,” the announced policy development was limited to the production of strategic guidance with a view to the creation of conditions for tertiary intervention, in the same way as the announced link between education and early training came to reveal the subordination of the former to the agendas of the latter” (id, ibid: 48-49). Or rather, what this process illustrates is a national development of the recent process of changing configurations of AE governance in Europe, observable since the Lisbon Strategy.

pedagogical management, to assure the provision of the new educational-training services for the adults.
REFERENCES


Trigo, M. M. (2002a). A ANEFA no Quadro do PNE. In Isabel Melo e Silva, José Alberto Leitão e Maria Márcia Trigo (org.). Educação e Formação de Adultos – Fator de Desenvolvimento, Inovação e Competitividade (pp. 132-134). Lisboa: ANEFA.

Trigo, M. M. (2002b). Balanço de Um Ano de Atividade. In Isabel Melo e Silva, José Alberto Leitão e Maria Márcia Trigo (org.). Educação e Formação de Adultos – Fator de Desenvolvimento, Inovação e Competitividade (pp. 115-119). Lisboa: ANEFA.

INTRODUCTION

This paper examines how education and community development practices are shaped by ideas and contexts which in turn influence the spaces we live in. With considerations of Henri Lefebvre’s work on the Production of Space (1974), this paper emphasizes a social spatial restructuring of everyday life and a movement towards spatial understanding. Its intention is to take something implicit – i.e. space – and make it explicit to adult education and community development theory and practice. Through linking ideology, knowledge and practice to producing spaces, we highlight some of Henri Lefebvre’s thoughts. Our basic premise is that the most pressing social conflicts today are spatial ones – they are increasingly urban – and that we require a pedagogy for community development practice that interrogates and creates spaces. Illustrations are taken largely from Berlin, Germany, highlighting spatial conflicts and recent processes of appropriation. In agreement with Lefebvre, we claim that, ultimately, the act of making space – producing space – is an embodied community act that can provide a basis for building a theory of community development pedagogy – of praxis – by engaging with Lefebvre’s loosely etched pedagogy of appropriation.

TRANSFORMATION AND EDUCATION

Adult education is often conceived of as a project linked to the pursuit of social transformation, to development and growth, to improving democracy and social life, and to addressing inequality. Generally, community development focuses on resolving local issues and building alternative institutions (Ledwith, 1997). It rallies around solidarity, self-help and agency (Buttarrarcharya, 2004) and addresses unequal power relationships for social change (Ledwith, 1997, 2007, 2011). Adult education and community development mirror each other – as one informs the other and is bound together in shared principles of participation, cooperation, praxis and self-determination (Foroughi & Durant, 2013).

Different philosophical ideas in adult education relate to different forms of practice, often connected to institutional and formal learning. There is a crossover with the thought and practice of community development. The following provides a brief overview of some of these traditions, particularly progressive, critical and neoliberal tendencies and their connections to forms of practice.
PROGRESSIVE – INSTITUTIONS AND EVERYDAY LIFE

John Dewey (1916), in an age of economic and industrial growth, brought attention to the connection between education and democracy formation in the American society; Dewey expressed the idea that the quality of education we receive shapes the institutions we form, establishing a direct relationship between democratic institutions, education, and democratic life (Finger & Asún, 2001). Dewey referenced school education as building the quality of institutions which, in turn, build societies. Equally, the quality of institutions is linked to the quality of education which Dewey saw as influencing the depth and breadth of democracy, an idea that is also echoed in literature and discourse in development, citizenship and democracy – where learning and participation go hand in hand with building institutions which create vibrant democracies (see Tett, 2010; Hall, 2006; Escobar, 1992; Sen, 2001).

Eduard Lindeman, a contemporary of Dewey’s – and another central figure in American educational thought – brought significant attention to adult education and its link with community development. He focused more on everyday life and experiential learning with a commitment to democracy and community organizing. Lindeman pointed out that everyday life was where people were at in their communities, where learning would take place through experience. In his view, everyday life has the power to be transformative and is based on the quality of early education (Finger & Asún, 2001). So, while Dewey focused on education to strengthen institutions for growth and development, Lindeman concentrated on the quality of social life linked to education (Finger & Asún, 2001). Both based their work on the promise of democracy. From the perspective of their work, we can argue that, wherever access to or the quality of education are poor, it may be assumed that democracy would not prosper – and that political and social life would falter.

The context of their work and ideas belongs within the time period of American expansionism in the early 1900s. Dewey and Lindeman helped to forge a case for adult education linked to community development and democracy. Their work falls into progressive approaches to education where education is seen as preparing people for democratic life and for humanizing progress and development (Finger & Asún, 2001).

This is an important consideration; the humanizing of development that Finger and Asún refer to, the notion that development needs to be humanized, is under-emphasized within development work but questioned rigorously in post development criticisms. Critics of this approach see it as the creation of a new set of hierarchies – introducing the question of who is developed, who is educated, who is literate – and who is not (Escobar, 1995). Assumptions were made by those in the global North about what those in the South needed and were lacking, setting up an ideological dichotomy of haves and have-nots, of knowledge that mattered and knowledge that didn’t. It spurred critiques developing into subaltern studies, post colonialism, and criticisms of western universalisms. English and Mayo (2012) point out that initially, these approaches were oriented more on rights to education and were extended to those who did not have access, making up for educational gaps; but since the 1990s, this idea has been degraded into an individualised lifelong learning agenda that places responsibility entirely on individuals and not on the organizations or institutions involved. In such a process that could be described as disconnected from all attempts at humanization, development is strictly about economic growth - with no link to broader, human growth.
CRITICAL APPROACHES

Critically addressing power imbalances and systemic oppression are at the core of the many works in critical education stemming from critical theory. Paulo Freire and some of his contemporaries of the 1960s and 70s brought about a shift in perspective that involved critiquing institutions, limitations in everyday life, and systemic imbalances of power, and they introduced cultural action as a means to counter power. Through their work, critical or radical education began to look at issues of hegemony in institutionalized education as a way of maintaining power imbalances – e.g., students learn to be inactive; they learn to accept oppression which, in turn, serves to maintain an exclusionary educational mandate in very general and broad ways. Critical education seeks to address power imbalances through a variety of processes. Freire articulated an approach that is still relevant today, a process that, in short, included dialogue, naming the world, consciousness, and (cultural) action. His ideas stem from Marxist concepts, exemplifying economic and social realities and stressing the relations of production, exploitation, false consciousness, and alienation in order to maintain subjugation. Notions such as social justice or deepening democracy emerge from critical education along with a language of transformation and anti-oppression. Through critical theory and critical education, other resistance-based theoretical and educational schools continue to emerge – feminist, postcolonial, subaltern etc.

Critical pedagogy is linked to the late 1960s – in independence movements, civil rights movements, women’s movements – and it gained ground as a shift began to take place. The late 1960s are seen as a time of cultural action and powerful counter-cultural narratives (Welton, 2013). As platforms of alternative learning, social movements provided fertile environments for transformation and experimentation. After the mass protests and deep rooted social changes of the 1960s, the neoliberal period – beginning in the 1970s – undermined strides made in education (Welton, 2013:27). During this time, a crisis in oil production brought about a significant global shift. It brought dependence to the global south on the north – as global institutions forged a path for development based on a free market and belief in economic growth and profit (Springer, 2010). Nations became increasingly riddled with debt which the people absorbed in everyday life through a lack of services, limited opportunities, and shrinking employment options as they entered into global economic practices. As Harvey (2005) notes, the socio-economic model that this shift has implemented is based on accumulation of wealth through dispossession and scarcity. Essentially, it is about space.

The spatial turn coincided with the rise of neoliberalism as neoliberalism made it unmistakably clear that space was not natural but was and is produced (Peters & Kessl, 2009). Theorists like David Harvey, Henry Lefebvre and Michael Foucault all significantly influenced the spatial turn – with Harvey’s introduction of Marxist ideas into geography through critical geography (Smith, 2001) finding its parallel in the development of critical pedagogy. In its initial development, critical geography was a response to the fundamental realization of geography and the spatial as socially produced – and also to the growing understanding that crises were being isolated and localized rather than identified as systematic (Smith, 2001:8).

Until today, Lefebvre’s *The Production of Space* (1974) helps to build on our understanding of the dynamics of space and its production. For Lefebvre, space is essential to capitalist survival; without a capitalist production and re-production of space, the very foundations of
capitalism are at stake. The trinity of capitalism, as he argues, relies on space for its continued existence. This trinity (land, capital, and labour) incorporates control over and priority of the economic or exchange value as assembled in institutional space (p. 282). Institutional space, according to Lefebvre, is based on three elements in continuous relationships: 1. *Global space*: organizations such as the World Bank or the World Trade Organization create global spaces and global power that are beyond the reach of the local. 2. *Sovereignty*: refers to the nation state – who control physical land. Lefebvre describes the state as violent – that it takes violence to maintain this sovereignty as the state attempts to reduce differences and create homogeneity. Fragmentation, or localism, makes this more manageable, as pieces and parts are fragmented into bits that can be controlled and can be negotiated. (Lefebvre, 282); 3. *Hierarchical*: things are arranged from lowest to highest, where one is better than the other, one location better than another, certain knowledge better, a certain gender better, etc.

Mental space is another space of hierarchies – and important to understanding how ideology becomes rooted in and connected to what we take as knowledge. For Lefebvre, mental space combines ideology with science – quantitatively over qualitatively –, and the development of knowledge is fragmented into specific epistemologies separated from everyday life, which, in turn, creates a kind of knowledge base that is considered better than knowledge embedded in everyday life. Expert knowledge is placed as an important component of control over spaces as well as in the growing knowledge economy. The distance to everyday life creates hierarchies of what is considered legitimate. Two kinds of knowledge emerge: one that serves the elite and is specialized and identified as hierarchically superior – and knowledge that people have, that comes from experience, from different ways of knowing, that might, e.g., be bodily, and that comes from dialogue with each other. In order to illustrate this, Lefebvre points to the absurdity of specializations and fragmentations consistent with expert knowledge – for example it would imply someone who knows only how to drive, so only drives, or someone who knows how to type, only typing, arguing that knowledge specializations fragment and alienate people even further. Mental space plays an important role in the control of space, as ‘experts’ make decisions about how space is ordered and used. Access to specialized knowledge becomes valuable – based not so much on ‘use’ value but on exchange value.

To further illustrate divisions in adult education, Jarvis (2007) sees education within neoliberal capitalism as advancing individual and capitalist accumulation pursuits; learning as an extension of work. For Jarvis, the continual changes in the global economy demand that people learn, some keeping up with it, while others are excluded from it. In his view, knowledge has become something that is rather economic than public (Jarvis). Cunningham (1989) goes on to argue that technology and consumer-based education has alienated people, more specifically women and the poor who cannot afford to fully participate in it. For him, neoliberalism regulates access to education and therefore marginalizes specific social groups. This could be seen as creating spaces of exclusion, of shrinking spaces connected to a paradigm of neoliberal policy and development – an idea that is picked up by Giroux & McLaren (1994) in reference to a continued lack of funding for alternative programs. Adult education has become increasingly technical and consumerist, moving away from its original roots in social change (Cunningham, 1989 & Jarvis, 2007) and its connection with everyday life and participation in democracies.
While much of adult education has thus been disconnected from everyday life and community development, Shaw (2008, 2011) asserts that democracy, adult education, and community development have, in fact, all been delinked. He points out that discourse around these intrinsically related fields has been fragmented and replaced by concepts such as social capital and capacity building in community development, which she considers as technical and consumerist terms. Adult education in itself, she argues, has come to be considered as increasingly technical and separated from its former role in social transformation. It seems that both community development and adult education have become appropriated.

Community development, under neoliberalism, finds itself in a difficult quagmire. Communities are expected to be responsible for themselves, and notions of active citizenship mean that communities bear the burden of their problems (Geoghegen & Powell, 2009; Burkett, 2011; Fung & Hung, 2010). This plays out in a variety of ways. Localization and community development work finds itself fragmented from broader social issues and from global processes, becoming increasingly involved in service provision instead (Shaw, 2011; Peters & Kessl, 2009). Also, communities find themselves labelled as good or bad, as deserving or not, as economically valuable or not. A second area of community development is under corporatist partnerships which represent a new governance project of civil society, government, and market partnerships (Geoghegen & Powell, 2009). Linked to democracy and political legitimation, this trajectory often finds itself confronted with unequal power relations. At the same time, however, the possibilities from partnerships are seen as positive – seen in participatory budgets and in increasing institutional responsiveness to communities. A third area is connected to social justice work through social movements creating their own spaces and making demands (Geoghegen & Powell, 2009). Social justice and social movement work tends towards creating spaces. Each of these trajectories impact on the spaces they exist in – or are conflicted by. What all areas center on is deciding what happens and how resources are distributed. Each trajectory of community development also illustrate Lefebvre’s institutionalized view of elite capitalist control through global spaces, through sovereignty that localizes, and through hierarchies.

**WORK & HOUSING**

The urban has been restructured. Cities, especially global cities, have become hubs of power in networks of global finance capitalism (Sassen, 2006, 2007, Jarvis, 2007). Over the last decades, increased city restructuring has led to sharp socio-economic and spatial inequalities and new social forms. The informal economy is growing in cities alongside the high income commercial areas and escalating gentrification concurrently with rises in homelessness (Sassen, 2006, 152). The organization of work also undergoes significant transformations. Subcontractors replace the factories, thereby formalizing work, moving work to neighbourhoods, and creating industrial homework (Sassen, 2006). The new financial class is visible in gentrified neighbourhoods, and their preferences for customized products do not facilitate unionizing but instead increase the informal economy (Sassen, 2006:172). Hiring is informal and takes place between people who know people – characterizing newcomers to the city and through networks finding work (Sassen, 2006:153-155). While social capital and networking are the mantras of community development, people tend to get stuck within their networks, limiting them to a perpetual status quo (Shin, 2013). Hierarchies
can be reinforced. Potential for recreating a colonial administration with newcomers at the bottom is a risk that has been played out in Paris and other locations.

This restructuring has created specific needs which are partially gendered – women as sex workers, as domestic workers, in low waged jobs. Women, immigrants, and other marginalized groups are produced by outsourcing (Sassen, 2006:179). Informalization has introduced the household and the community as important economic spaces in cities (Sassen, 2006:180). The shape of the everyday has shifted: manufacturing is disappearing, high and low incomes are the norm, and these changes in conditions restructure the city (Sassen, 2006:197). New territorial boundaries are being drawn, and what used to be national boundaries are now boundaries between self and other, a development which “divides, inscribes and incubates new ways of action that structure everyday life in different ways” (Bartlett, 2007:224).

A review of the recent literature on Community Development brings posits that cities and the urban restructuring of everyday life require more attention (see for example: Bhide, 2009; Checkoway, 2011; Ingamells, 2007; MacKinnon, 2009; Purcell, 2011). Bhide (2009) emphasizes the displacement of working class and poor populations in Mumbai, as the city focuses on modernization and development, as housing disappears to make way for economic investment, and as work spaces simultaneously disappear – shifting people into an increasingly governed informal sector where policies continue to limit access. Such developments constitute an assault on spaces for the poor, on spaces of residence, of work, and of cultural expression. He further insists that the tools provided by community development, especially within participatory approaches, are failing us, suggesting that new knowledge and new tools are necessary (Bhide, 2009). Experiences in participation – in partnership attempts – are reinforcing the power of the elite while seeking legitimacy to govern resulting in participation, not only being tokenistic, but delegitimizing the concerns of the people (Cooke & Kothari, 2001) through a singular focus on an economic benefit. Purcell (2011) responds similarly, pointing out the need to focus on understanding the dynamics of space, suggesting stealth and the quasi-legal need to enter into discussion for community development education and action, and asking how we can use spaces and tactics.

SPACE AS PRACTICE

Hou (2010) explains spatial practice as using spaces as acts of resistance; Escobar (2001) calls for occupying local spaces for alternatives. From the perspective of adult education, there are some pertinent questions surrounding what people are learning from involvement and how they learn in order to act or what prevents them from acting (Hall, 2006; Foley 1999; Welton, 1995). For Hou (2010), insurgent spaces are found in sphere of the quasi-legal, in night markets, street dances, community gardens, and a range of other activities.

Purcell (2011) points out that strategies promoted by government and institutions support the dominant order; tactics, in contrast, belong to individuals, and they include Hou’s suggestions of insurgent spaces. Purcell further suggests that if we can learn about tactics and how to support them, they can be turned counter-hegemonic, moving into a ‘Gramsci moment’. He calls for learning tactics which are resistant to totalizing discourses (Purcell, 2011: 8-9).
Smets (2011) agrees that there needs to be a focus on places and spaces within community development practice, not so much for a general focus on the accomplishments that is typical of the way we look and define community development, but rather on processes that interconnect time, place, space, and network in community building, seeing it as a process through which different learning taking place. Many authors make the point that place analysis linked to wider structural issues is needed in community development while a focus that only fixates on local intervention misses the opportunity to engage in structural changes (Defilippis, Fisher, & Shragge, 2007; Ledwith, 2011; Pitchford, 2008; & Bharcharya, 2004). The connection with critical geography helps to keep in mind that place is where the global is played out (Sassen, 2006).

It is at this intersection of space, learning and community that Lefebvre suggests a pedagogy of appropriation but leaves much of the details up to us. He discusses creating counter spaces – spaces of difference that are about the inhabitants and users, that place use value over exchange value. He suggests as well that spaces that are created locally cannot stay local – they need to be made global. So we are challenged with imagining spaces of difference. For Lefebvre, our isolation, alienation, fragmentation, and hierarchies need to be challenged and significantly altered. In order to achieve that, Lefebvre suggests that what we need is a pedagogy of appropriation. We need to do more than take back; we need to create anew.

According to Lefebvre, Production of Space, a pedagogy of appropriation entails

1. **The body** – we need to use all of our senses. To use all our senses resists the current model that is based solely on the visual and discursive. We are fragmented from our bodies, as what is seen and what is written are prominent in our societies – privileging what is seen, and hiding reality. Part of this overcoming in an unveiling – that we see past consumerism which conceals, distracts, and fragments.

2. **The process of getting there comes in moments** – moments of rage, beauty, joy, sorrow, or elation signify events, where something different occurs – where everything is, in a moment, different and full.

3. The production of space – and by this Lefebvre – refers to all spaces as being produced spaces, consisting of different components which create a triad: perceived, conceived, and lived. **Perceived space** is everyday life – typified by our movement through it and our fragmentation. **Conceived space** is generally the realm of the technocrats and planners who create and control space, decide how it will be organized, and who will benefit from it. **Lived space** is the imagination, the symbolic meaning, and the possible. For Lefebvre, it is in the realm of lived space where ideas for revolution for difference occur – experienced in profound moments where possibility is first imagined. Within this triad, we can see the different elements of the triad represented in community development work – for instance in everyday life we experience alienation, fragmentation and localization which has increased under neoliberalism, in governance projects we interact with expert planners with different degrees of tokenistic and authentic participation and in our lived and engaged space we imagine a better
The third part of an appropriation pedagogy is in creating convergences with these three parts – everyday, conceived and lived make clearer opportunities for altering our spatial practice.

4. Lefebvre suggests, as part of this appropriation that we may alter time through getting in touch with cycles as contrasts to linear based capitalism. From his perspective, TV, e.g., is linear, while gardening is cyclical. Taking up cyclical activities are considered to be a resistance and a way to regain time vs being governed by time. Cycles coincide with bodies, and with nature. According to Lefebvre, change comes through repetition in everyday life; repetition represents need, and as we repeat motions, what we continuously and repetitively need becomes something that we want, and with this difference comes possibility. In this argument, Lefebvre implies consumerism– that need has been fabricated as consumerism, and that at some point the belief that we needed to consume would shift to wanting something different. Yet, this idea also applies to other situations.

TEMPORARY SPACES IN BERLIN

In Berlin, community gardens have been created by people who seek to be in non-commercial space, to connect with others, and to end a sensation of alienation (Foroughi & Durant, 2012). In September 2012, a refugee strike developed in the Kreuzberg neighborhood. Refugees walked across the country, leaving the refugee camps they were not legally permitted to leave, and came to Berlin to make demands for their rights, and creating a temporarily new community. Each refugee camp across the country had a different set of rules governing it as a localized entity. Talking to activists during the protests, some of them repeatedly said that every day used to be the same; months go by, but you cannot leave the camp, you cannot work, you cannot go to school, you are forced to wait, and that is stressful and depressing. In part this repetition played a role, and the imagination of something better did as well – a new need emerged breaking the repetition. Their collective movement was about ending isolation, alienation, and fragmentation – about shattering the everyday existence and thinking of more. It was about developing a new sense of rights: for example, the right to be in Germany, the right to freedom of movement, the right to decide and plan, the right to justice. All of these realizations came from seeing through the contradictions that Germans could move, could work in their countries, and see the gross lack of democracy enacted on them and on the country.

While the protests continued, activists created a social, learning, public, political, and physical space at the same time. Each part of Lefebvre’s spatial triad – this is the notion that space is socially produced – can be found dialectically within the protest. For example the triad – is made up of a) perceived of everyday space, which represents the repetition and alienation of everyday life; b) conceived space – the space that is controlled and organized by elites, by experts; and c) lived space – the imagination and symbols of living – frequently this is experienced passively, however it is the site of imagination and possibility and imagining something different. The spatial triad in protest is altered through a new spatial practice. For example, 1: Everyday life – activists reject the repetition and fragmentation and join together, everyday changes dramatically. 2: They decide that they can decide for
themselves and through lived space see their treatment as unjust and violent – thus they question the logic of control and repression. 3: They imagine difference, that what they want is movement, connection, and decision making that is about dignity as a collective. Within the protest the activists are very diverse – coming from multiple countries with multiple issues – converging together and overcoming their own prejudices that may be gender, homophobic, racist or classist. The physical occupation - an occupy-style camp set up in Kreuzberg - was meant, as well, to be a place of healing and of learning for the German public to understand the life situation of the refugees, and for the refugees to expand democracy in Germany for all by demanding it. Speaking with activists, a number of them emphasized feeling happy through connecting with other people or by learning German or English; some said they felt the best they had in many years and that, through this, they realized that more was possible, that better was possible. A kind of embodied new space of being and of new knowledge emerged in the first months of the occupy style camp.

CONCLUSION

An important point Lefebvre makes is that we often cannot see what matters, that power structures remain invisible. Choice, accordingly, may be an illusion as long as it is hidden within consumerism; in truth, there is no choice. Being seen is a part of the war of position as explored by Gramsci, and it is also a part of inhabitants getting involved, becoming active, and deciding for themselves. It is part of the notion of a social spatial justice (Soja, 1989, 2009). In the on-going refugee protest in Berlin, protesters explained that the reason for being there was to be seen, that they were otherwise being physically hidden from society in refugee camps on the outskirts of towns and on city fringes. Many of the protesters we conversed with asserted that most Germans did not know what the situation of refugees in Germany was, that it was unfair for them to not know what the government was doing, and that to alter the situation of refugees would improve democracy for everyone in the country. The contradictions of movement between countries, the situation of being stuck in the margins, the injustice of who matters and the nature of citizenship as an exclusive construct was made perfectly clear. Being seen represents a form of teaching the public, of being in space; a form of resistance and an invitation. At the same time the protests were taking place in Berlin, similar protests and camps developed in countries across Europe. What we suggest is to pay attention to the various aspects of spatial production – as educational praxis.

Having lived through fascism and occupation, and greatly disappointed by the failure of the Paris Commune, Merrifield (2006) sees Lefebvre as needing to see the possible in the real and hold on to revolution. As we look at the ideas that Lefebvre put forward around the urban being the site of revolution, the strategy that needs to be employed is a sense of rights and social spatial justice through actions that claim spaces – in terms of rights to the city, in recent events happening around the world that are taking places in cities and collectivizing our hopes in spaces. Accepting that space is socially produced means that space is relational, and according to Freire (1970), reflecting on how we are situated is an act of learning (p. 91). For Lefebvre, on the other hand, our motions and rhythms, our spatial practice, is an act repeated and embodied. Conceived areas of space are about control and organization of space, about how it is represented, defined, and controlled by technocrats and elites through planning. Lived space is how we imagine it, is symbolic and cultural, and
lies where perceived and conceived spaces meet; and thereby, it permits us to deconstruct and re-construct spatial realities.

Our actions for social change are manifested spatially. Our understanding of the spatial can only give us a way of reflecting on what we do, where we do it, with whom we do it, how we do it, and why we do it. Community development is, indeed, a critical spatial practice that we need to embrace and, where necessary, re-appropriate. Connecting with concepts espoused by Lefebvre helps us to decode our place within the production and reproduction of space. We need to consider expanding a pedagogy of appropriation.

REFERENCES


ABSTRACT:

A contingency perspective makes possible a radical reframing process of migration. In this new point of view, latent forgotten and till now suppressed forms of migration become visible and ready for theoretical reconstruction: apart from sedentism, nomadism becomes visible as an equal form of life and epistemologically relevant. Contingency and reframing the topic of research abolishes current epistemological obstacles and exposes new points of observation without determining any anticipation processes. In discourses of social science, these new points of observation are already latent but not available in a social-political way. In view of unveiling new perspectives on migration Adult Education takes part in social structural transformation process and assumes an innovative function for discovering new futures by making new spaces available and developing them for "life not yet lived".

PREFACE

Migrants are currently perceived from an extremely unilateral point of view. They are mostly regarded as people arriving and less as people leaving. "Die (...) Migrationsforschungen gingen von der gemeinsamen Vorstellung aus, die zwischen den Sende- und Empfängerländern generell zu beobachten waren. Erkenntnisleitend war dabei die historische Realität des einseitig fließenden Migrationsstrom von den Sende- zu den Empfängerländern“ (Han, 2006, p. 150). This "historical reality", as described by Petrus Han, is remarkable because migration includes in principle – as well as from the perspective of historical collective experiences – both directions: arriving and leaving. "Migration wird dabei stets als Phänomen der Gegenwart dargestellt. Dabei wird so getan, als handle es sich um ein bevölkerungspolitisches Phänomen, mit dem derzeit die Gesellschaften in Europa, Afrika, Asien, Indien oder Amerika das erste Mal konfrontiert wären" (Hahn, 2012, p. 15). That is the reason why two issues are highly relevant today: On the one hand, migration is linked with discourses about "integration" and on the other hand, there are negative connotations such as threatening the welfare state and fragmentation of the social cohesiveness of the host society. "Das Thema ‚Migration’ hat in Europa negative Hochkonjunktur. Den Hintergrund bilden weltweite Migrationsprobleme und europäische Ängste vor wachsendem ‚Wanderungsdruck’" (Bade, 2002, p. 11). This is because migration issues are mainly related to a security policy dispositive called "securitization of migration field" (cf. Hess & Kasperek, 2010, p. 9). In order to be able to unravel this epistemic-political reduction, critical research is necessary. In an attempt to view migration from a world society point of view, I propose here a first approach in opening new perspectives on migration. For this project my article first focused on (1) currently epistemological obstacles in dealing with migration and tries to reconstruct them. The "big failures" of present migration concepts create the need to revise this topic in their deep reaching layers and to discuss the theoretical foundations. This issue
is often ignored. Epistemological obstacles call for a research approach in dealing with current scientific issues. This approach should be able to question self-evidential structures with the help of the contingency perspective (cf. Reckwitz, 2004; Schäffter, 2011). (2) Reframing migration in a world society perspective shows that migration can not be sufficiently understood from a substantialist point of view. In critical research, only a relational view on migration allows epistemological obstacles to be observed thoroughly. (3) Looking beyond these far reaching limitations by using substantialist perspectives on migration, epistemological obstacles can be observed in other scientific disciplines as well.

Migration concepts as they are currently employed and which fall back on implicit and normative premises, are experiencing growing legitimation difficulties by tracing new development perspectives. These new points of observation are already latent in discourses of social science but, unfortunately, not available in a social-political manner. Nowadays this results in the yet to be explained phenomenons and “uniqueness” (Canguilhem, 1979, p. 67) having to be protected against current hegemonic thought patterns. Otherwise nostrifications from dominant research paradigms severely prevent alternative perspectives being discovered. This protection is especially required when new paradigms are announced. In this context, adult education should assume an innovative function in order to discover new futures by making new spaces available and developing them for “life not yet lived“ (Bloch, 1973).

1. CONTINGENCY PERSPECTIVE

Overcoming epistemological obstacles in dealing with migration requires the reconstruction of the migration term observed in its antinomy (cf. Bachelard, 1978, p. 153): sedentism and nomadism. Until now, predominating naturalisation was questioned by the contingency perspective on research subjects (cf. Reckwitz, 2004; Schäffter, 2011). This procedure is based on the multiplication of different distinctions. This displays diversity that already exists. From this novel point of view, forms of migration that until now were suppressed become visible and available for theoretical reconstruction. This epistemological step opposes hegemonic discourses on migration issues and creates the conditions needed for the possibility for new perspectives on the development of migration to be formed.

The breakdown of the term migration into its antinomy – sedentism versus nomadentum – presents an asymmetric relationship between both terms (cf. Schroer 2006, p. 116). This shows that sedentism is not based on problemized normative premises. Moreover, this process of making visible clarifies why a sedentary perspective is often epistemologically underestimated and neglected in the field of migration research. A look at the line of difference – nomadism seen as deviant and sedentism as “normality” – implies a change of perspectives, by which the pole of sedentism is focused. This provides a way of sufficiently dealing with the migration term in its historicity and complexity. In dualistic structures, sedentism gains a positive and nomadism a negative value. In this classification both designations comprise different attributions of meaning(cf. Lenz, 2010, p. 67). This distinction is supported by hegemonic practices of the group of sedentary people and permanently reactualised by them. The fact that only immigrants are referred to, but not the sedentary people who mostly remain in the latency in relation; in terms of a blind spot is also characteristic of this common designation and identity policy.
**Sedentary perspective**

First, the focus of the sedentary perspective is combined with becoming visible. So far, the latency of the sedentary perspective seemed due to their none comprehension normative. In dealing with migration following interfering, epistemological assumptions can be illustrated: (a) "methodological nationalism", (b) container model of society and (c) "metaphysics of sedentary perspective".

**(a) Epistemological obstacle I: „methodological nationalism“**

From a disciplinary point of view "methodological nationalism" presents an occasion to get away from the suggestion that migration studies are an innocent, neutral and value-free category of analysis (cf. Wimmer & Glick Schiller, 2003, p. 577).

Methodological nationalism is an ideological orientation that approaches the study of social and historical processes as if they were contained within the borders of individual nation-states. Nation-states are conflated with societies, and the members of those states are assumed to share a common history and set of values, norms, social customs, and institutions (Glick Schiller, 2010, p. 28).

Besides research in the field of migration by Nina Glick Schiller, Thomas Faist and Andreas Wimmer, Wolfgang Bühl describes this epistemological obstacle in the late 1970s:

Das Nationalstaats-Paradigma steht ganz in der Tradition des für die Sozialwissenschaften insgesamt so hinderlichen Substanzdenkens. Wenn mit der Zeit auch deutlich geworden ist, daß jedenfalls die Person nicht als homogene, invariante auch geschlossene Einheit anzusehen ist und daß die Verbindung von Personen in verschiedenen Vergesellschaftungen nicht als nur äußerlich gedacht werden kann, so hat man die antik-mittelalterlichen Substanzkategorien jedoch bedenkenlos auf die zwischengesellschaftlichen (...) Beziehungen abgeschoben, die damit weiterhin als asoziale Beziehungen dargestellt werden. (...) Staaten wie Gesellschaften werden dabei nicht einfach (...) als 'black boxes' repräsentiert (...); vielmehr werden in einer Art sphärischer Primitivtopologie kurzschlüssig Erklärungshypothesen, Prognosen und normative Forderungen aus einer undifferenzierten Substanz- und Eigenschaftstheorie abgeleitet (Bühl, 1978, p. 16).

The "obstructive substance thinking" and its coupling with the "methodological nationalism", which Bühl emphasizes, implies significant consequences in dealing with migration.

**(b) Epistemological obstacle II: “container model of society”**

That concepts of "container model of society" are not “value-free“ is revealed in discourses on migration in many places. „Die Geschichten und Codes (…)”, die an Orten und in Räumen lagern (…) prägen, formen und gestalten sie auch vorab. (…) Räume fungieren demnach als Kontingenzbeschränker, sie setzen der Willkür, der Kontingenz und dem Würfelwurf enge Grenzen“ (Maresch & Werber 2002, p. 14). The conclusion, as far as this "contingency restrictive“ epistemological obstacle is taken into account, as Bühl presents it, is therefore: „Wissenschaftlich geht es also darum, aus dem steril gewordenen Nationalstaatsparadigma herauszukommen und einen Bezugsrahmen zu entwickeln, der geeignet ist, die funktionalen
Interdependenzen und transnationalen Qualitäten in den internationalen Beziehungen zur Darstellung zu bringen" (Bühl, 1978, p. 16). The "methodological nationalism" and the "container model of society" are closely interlinked and cause diverse narrowness in the context of migration studies.

Systematical, methodological nationalism takes the following ideal premises for granted: it equates society with nation-state societies, and sees states and their governments as the cornerstones of a social sciences analysis. It assumes that humanity is naturally divided into a limited number of nations, which on the inside, organize themselves as nation-states, and on the outside, set boundaries to distinguish themselves from other nation-states. It goes even further: this outer delimitation, as well as the competition between nation-states, presents the most fundamental category of political organization. Indeed, the social science stance is rooted in the concept of the nation-state. It is a nation-state outlook on society and politics, law, justice and history, that governs the sociological imagination (Beck, 2007, p. 287).

Ulrich Beck's analysis emphasizes again in this connection, what consequences arise from the epistemological obstacles. This is all the more staggering because at this point it is already clear that assumptions with a epistemological background have a massive influence on policy guidelines in dealing with migration (eg. "Fortress Europe" or criminalizing specific forms of migration).

(c) Epistemological obstacle III: "metaphysics of sedentary perspective"

Often going unnoticed is the epistemological obstacle "metaphysics of sedentary perspective". In his studies on the use of metaphors in different scientific disciplines Tim Cresswell was able to reconstruct how the "metaphysics of sedentary "passes through modern thought (at all)" (Lenz 2010, p. 37): "In much of humanistic geography, then, mobility once again appears as a dysfunction. [...] What is evident in both spatial science and humanistic geography is a very strong moral geography that marginalizes mobility ontologically, epistemologically, and normatively" (Cresswell, 2006, p. 26f.). The pathological view on nomadism or rather on mobility, the simultaneous moral appreciation of sedentary perspective and the unquestioned normativity of this position is what this epistemological obstacle is all about.

It is the disorder produced by mobility (among other things) that was at the heart of their view of society. It is certainly not all bad. Mobility is, after all, what separates the city from the country. Mobility is connected to civilization, progress, and freedom as well as deviance and destitution. But the mobility is still framed within a moral geography of place and locus that is constantly threatened (Cresswell, 2006, p. 37).

Besides the "methodological nationalism" and the "container model of society" it becomes clearly visible that there is no debate on whether the sedentary perspective is capable of perceiving sufficiently nomadic movement (cf. Pries, 2008, p. 11 ). A "Grenzverletzer jedenfalls ist der Nomade allein aus der Perspektive eines Seßhaften" (Toral-Niehoff, 2002, p. 88). In epistemological terms sedentism assumes a highly justified position, because the sedentary perspective forms the point of departure for defining migration:
Wer aber fixiert an seinem Ort verbleibt, wer glaubt, daß es einen „Ursprung“ gibt und man sich nur auf diesen ursprünglichen Standpunkt zu stellen braucht, um die „wahre“ Perspektive einzunehmen, der kann von seiner Situation im Labyrinth keine angemessene Auffassung gewinnen (Röttgers, 2002, p. 126).

On the one hand nomadism therefore describes "normal state" and on the other hand sedentism as a „state of emergency“. "Der Nomade im Labyrinth [ist] dagegen mobil [...] Er beherrscht nicht von einer Residenz aus ein Territorium oder ein Zeitalter mit seiner Perspektive, sondern ist unterwegs „on the road“ (Röttgers, 2002, p. 126; see also Deleuze & Guattari, 1997, 522). Kurt Röttgers points out the epistemological difference already mentioned: the position of a central perspective is based on an „ontology of sedentary perspective“ and does not seem to be able to perceive adequate migration when searching a central perspective to an over-view (cf. Deleuze & Guattari, 1997, p. 39; Röttgers, 2008, p. 17f.).

Besides the outlined initial position in this article, there are a variety of discourses, which don't label mobility as "different" or "deviant". Nomadism is described in a manner that is found in all parts of the world. Now it is time to put the "obvious" dimension of the migration term in focus, which is reflected in different formulations such as migration, itinerancy, mobility or nomadism. I would like to illustrate these positions with short quotations in order to illuminate the diversity of existing discourses.

Ludger Pries (2001, 2008) criticized the prospect of sedentary perspective in the field of migration strongly in his migration studies: „Migration ist so alt wie die Menschheit“ (Pries, 2001, p. 5) und umfasst eine „Lebensform“ (ebd.). „Über mehrere Generationen an einem Ort sesshaft zu sein, markiert (…) nur eine kurze Episode“ (ebd.) Klaus Bade, another scholar in the research field of migration speaks of nomadism as an anthropological constant: „Den ‚Homo migrans‘ gibt es, seit es den ‚Homo sapiens‘ gibt; denn Wanderungen gehören zur conditio humana wie Geburt, Fortpflanzung, Krankheit und Tod. (…) Die Geschichte der Wanderungen ist deshalb immer auch Teil der allgemeinen Geschichte und nur vor ihrem Hintergrund zu verstehen“ (Bade, 2002, p. 11). The third position: in the research of historian Sylvia Hahn it is interesting that sedentism is characterized as a "state of emergency": „Ausgeblendet bleibt hingegen die Tatsache, dass Migration vielfach ein fixer Bestandteil im Lebenszyklus früherer Generationen war. Zahlreiche historische Studien haben mittlerweile aufgezeigt, dass Sesshaftigkeit in früheren wie gegenwärtigen Gesellschaften eher die Ausnahme darstellt(e)“ (Hahn, 2012, p. 16). Moreover Hahn describes the consequences regarding discourses on the „container model of society“.

With Hahn's quote I return again to the concept of the territorial nation-state. The creation and formation of national states is a concept conceived almost 250 years ago. Today it is the dominant social structures that put an acute stop to nomadic movements, preventing it and – in a legal sense - condemn them (cf. Schroer 2006, p. 185).


In our "neonomadic era" (Schroer) the introduction and enforcement of the nation-state concept affects mobility options. Besides the significant deterioration of the conditions for migration, the nation-state concept also constitutes the methodological framework.

To give an interim summary; the contingency perspective enables epistemological obstacles to become visible. Nevertheless, it remains a substantia list view on migration, neither the sedentary perspective nor the view of nomadism is chosen.

Die radikale Dichotomie Seßhafter hier, Nomade dort erweist sich bei genauer Betrachtung als ein ideologisches Konstrukt, das beide Seiten zur Abgrenzung verwenden. (...) Selbst der reine Nomadismus ist eine hochspezialisierte Wirtschaftsform, die zur Deckung lebenswichtiger Güter auf den Austausch mit Seßhaften angewiesen ist (Toral-Niehoff, 2002, p. 88; see also Lenz, 2010, p. 41f.).

In fact both perspectives do not aid us sufficiently due to their dichotomous divide.

Rather than presenting "definitions" of migration (cf. Han, 2000, 2006), I would like to sketch out consequences of the substantialist view of migration and the sedentary perspective as the unquestioned starting point in research approaches to migration.

In the light of the discussion this far, the conclusion shows that a substantialistic use of migration would be

- epitomize designations as „traits“ and naturalize them.
- typify these „traits“ first as individual and then as belonging to the collective
- order the asymmetric line of difference (sedentism/nomadism).
- combine this distinction with normative ratings and
- correlate them with other social attributions and assessments (eg. "illegal immigrant").

"People with a migration background" will be identified in this context and included as a special group. By the use of a substantialistic perspective of migration, adult education allows the continuation of certain normative “traits” of migrants. Pedagogical concepts that recur at this point regarding property provisions such as nationality, culture substantive concepts or stereotype production support a specific hegemonic order sublimely.
Remember the conclusion Wolfgang Bühl came to earlier: "wissenschaftlich also geht es darum, aus dem steril gewordenen Nationalstaatsparadigma herauszukommen und einen Bezugsrahmen zu entwickeln, der geeignet ist" (Bühl, 1978, p. 16). Nina Glick Schiller submits a similar proposal on this topic: "A global power perspective on migration could facilitate the description of social processes by introducing units of analysis and research paradigms that are not built on the methodological nationalism of much migration discourse" (Glick Schiller, 2010, p. 26). From this angle, I regard my attempt to reframe migration in a world society perspective as a way to explore alternative development perspectives. Due to the detachment from the epistemological obstacles the conditions of possibility significantly change concerning the observation of migration. Only a non-substantialist approach to migration enables heterogeneity and diversity to become visible without entering the trap of taking nomadism as a preferred solution to the problem.

One of the risks in celebrating and embracing a mobilities paradigm that reinforces undesirable tendencies in migration and globalisation studies is that while we might think that we engage in a critical analysis of the state and its changing control over populations and territory, we often contribute to the reproduction of the state as a prime unit of analysis (Kalir, 2013, p. 325).

Similarly, Andreas Wimmer and Nina Glick Schiller are also aware that the new perspectives on migration should not touch on only one perspective on migration:

"We note that many who have attempted to escape the Charybdis of methodological nationalism are drifting towards the Scylla of methodological fluidism. (...) Moreover, while it is important to push aside the blinds of methodological nationalism, it is just as important to remember the continued potency of nationalism" (Wimmer & Glick Schiller 2003, 600).

In overcoming "methodological nationalism", it would be recommended to link migration to a concept of society, which can be extended to the world society, based on the work of Rudolf Stichweh (2000, 2004, 2008). This reframing also bridges the epistemological obstacle "metaphysics of sedentary perspective" in the clarification of the research subjects in the field of migration. This view redeemed previously exclusionary processes of attribution to groups and raises awareness of alternative perspectives on migration. Stichweh describes world society as

ein in sich relativ geschlossener Zusammenhang von Handlungen und Kommunikationen [...], der alle Strukturen und Prozesse, die in ihm beobachtbar sind, selbst erzeugt. Wenn man Gesellschaft so auffasst, kommt ein sozialer Zusammenhang dieser Art in der sozialen Situation unserer Zeit nur noch ein einziges Mal vor und zwar als System der Weltgesellschaft" (Stichweh, 2004, p. 1).

If we assume that in the past a variety of different societies co-existed without coming into contact with each other, then this can be said to change after the „kolonialen Expansion Europas und der damit verbundenen Inkorporation eines großen Teiles der Welt die Emergenz einer neuen Ebene weltweiter Strukturbildung, die alle anderen sozialen
Strukturen als Binnenstrukturen des Systems der Weltgesellschaft neu bestimmt" (ibd.).

While embedding migration into a world society view, some clarifying notes should be pointed out. „Die Weltgesellschaft ist System als weltweite Anschlussfähigkeit von Kommunikationen“ (Stichweh, 2000, p. 54). Stichweh declares a global dynamic; the reference for any communication. Many, if not most communications and actions take no account of national boundaries, but exceed them easily (eg. politics, economy, religion - world politics, world economy, world religion). All these social function do not refer to the „container model of society“.

Staatlichkeit als nationale Souveränität ist für die Weltgesellschaft offensichtlich nicht nur strukturelles Faktum einer darunterliegenden Systemebene, vielmehr kristallisiert auf der Ebene der Weltgesellschaft eine Erwartungsstruktur, die bestimmte Komponenten nationaler Staatlichkeit normativiert und als normative Erwartungen an Einzelstaaten adressiert (Stichweh, 2000, p. 55).

The concept of world society can be understood in this interpretation as a heuristic model of explanation, which is able to analyze the changes to boundaries and horizons (cf. Faist, 2000, p. 46). Worldwide differences do not refute this world society perspective, but acknowledge it outright as there are internal differentiations in such cases. By referring to a theory of society based on communication it becomes clear that it is not a container model of society that is at the core. When using the concept of society there is a danger of it being connected to "methodological nationalism" in general. This is important because a major aim is to overcome this epistemological obstacle. However, that means that nation-states do not lose their significance in establishing structures (cf. Jansen & Borggräfe, 2007, p. 8f.). From a world society perspective nation-states have the function to limit the globalizing influences and adapt them to regional conditions. This undoubtedly optimize its policy function.

Using the communication-theoretical approach, change in social structures of functionally differentiated society can be observed. Schäffter (2001) identifies this with "transforming society" and highlights six characteristics that describe the current "confusing labyrinth" (Röttgers). The complex issue contains

- eine politische Restrukturierung [...], ein krisenhafter Höhepunkt betriebswirtschaftlicher Rationalisierung von Wirtschaft und Verwaltung,

At the level of a non-substantialistic description the antinomy between dualistic terms is presented as a result of social construction. The "Power of Distinction" (Neckel, 1993) becomes increasingly questionable and attacks ideology.

Dealing with migration in this way means that current designation practices are no longer possible concerning certain groups. With the expansion of a world society perspective, all the epistemological obstacles - "methodological nationalism", "metaphysics of sedentary perspective," the container model of society and the substantialistic definition of the research subjects lose their power. From a radical point of view this perspective of a transformative world society shows that every individual in the world can now be seen as a "traveller". The
difference seen here is only focused on immobility versus mobility and solves the substantialistic dichotomy between sedentary perspective and nomadism. The solution of this dichotomous separation reveals a reciprocal relationship structure.

A relational definition of the research subject in the frame of a world society overcomes the "methodological nationalism". Migration, identified as a universal phenomenon is no more appropriately addressed as being deviant of a stationary view. The new alternative perspective arises uno actu from the complementary interplay between sedentism and nomadism in the context of an overarching space of possibilities. Sedentary perspective and nomadism are both recognized as legitimate forms of life. Therefore, the sedentary perspective is characterized by immobility and the nomadism perspective by modest or unique "mobile sedentism". The determinability of migration is now expressed in terms oscillating between "stationary mobility" and "mobile stationarity". “In studying migration, the challenge is to avoid both extreme fluidism and the bounds of nationalist thought” (Wimmer & Glick Schiller, 2003, p. 576).

Against this background, the concepts of transmigration and hybridity receive special attention (cf. Bhabha, 2000, Glick Schiller & Faist, 2010; Faist, 1998, 2000, 2010; Pries, 2008; Wimmer & Glick Schiller, 2002, 2003). This view provides the conditions to observe migration in a communicative world society beyond methodological nationalism.

A relational view on migration explains the equality and integration of two sides to an overarching organizing principle. At this point, the legitimacy of border regimes falls under strong pressure. This criticism is directed against isolation of the existential movement regarding a variety of nomadic cultures and demands recognition of this way of life based on human rights (cf. Habermas, 2011).

3. EPISTEMOLOGICAL CONSIDERATIONS: TWO CRISES IN DEALING WITH MIGRATION

With a scientific background, substantialistic views on research subjects gain importance. In this case, I will try to show how a substantialist perspective on migration affects opportunities for discovering new development prospects. In referring to „transformation society“ (Schäffter, 2001) adult education is under pressure when structural changes in society are not taken seriously.

Therefore, an epistemological problem arises in this context. In issues of migration, two crises grow increasingly. I would describe them as the disciplinary and as epochal crisis. The significance of disciplinary and epochal crisis is due not least to the fact that disciplinary theory is understood as embedded in a historical and social context of discovery. Nevertheless, both crises affect each other complementarily. Referring to the work of Michael Hoffmann, he notes that ",die moderne Wissenschaftstheorie seit ihren Anfängen durch einen Gegensatz bestimmt (ist), den man gewöhnlich mit Bezug auf Hans Reichenbach als den Gegensatz von „Begründungszusammenhang“ und „Entdeckungszusammenhang“ diskutiert ("context of justification" und „context of discovery“ (cf. Hoyningen-Huene, 1987) (Hoffmann, 2005, p. 1). The differentiation between "context of justification" and "context of discovery" contradicts Hoffmann by arguing from the concept of knowledge:

Subsequently, it makes more sense to observe as Hoffmann’s conclusion „welche Rationalität in Prozessen der Erkenntnisentwicklung steckt“ (ibd.: 3). He refers back to an epistemological inquiry into the "genesis of knowledge" (ibid.) and shows how they twist in the disciplinary and epochal crisis (cf. Schäffter, 2013). In relation to the work of Gaston Bachelard (1984, p. 46) it is subsequently clear that epistemological obstacles have a special role in the discovery of development prospects and can not be understood solely from a factual point of view:


In this sense, epistemological obstacles can be interpreted as a political critique of ideology. At the same time, it offers opportunities for adult education to deal with this.

From a disciplinary point of view, research appears to be in danger, when existing concepts and terms are translated into everyday language. This is often insufficient while addressing implicit assumptions and lack of understanding of the implicit weakens the already limited „Erkenntnispotentialität“. Using the example of the discourses in social geography, Antje Schlottmann points out the ambivalence of everyday linguistic formulations precisely:

Die allgemeine Gepflogenheit, von den Dingen zu reden, als seien sie, oder genauer, als existierten sie unabhängig vom Beobachter, ist eigentlich kein Problem. Ganz im Gegenteil, wir sichern doch auf diese Weise notwendiges kommunikatives Verständnis. Dass wir auch in Bezug auf räumliche Sachverhalte zumindest im alltäglichen Sprachgebrauch davon ausgehen, dass der Platz in der bekannten Welt, auf den wir durch Eigennamen oder Zeigewörter verweisen, für alle derselbe ist, nicht-relational, sondern absolut verankert, ist umso wichtiger, als dass erst so Wege beschrieben und Treffpunkte vereinbart werden können. Das brauchen wir jeden Tag. Das ist unproblematisch und nützlich. (...) Theoretisch in dem Sinne, als das die Problematisierung des essentiell Seiendem und einer ontologischen Festschreibung von Räumen (...) erst im Rahmen eines theoretischen Paradigmas entsteht, das Räumlichkeit als absolute Tatsache kritisch betrachtet. Erst dies schafft die Voraussetzung dafür, über praktische, selbstverständliche Handlung in einer anderen Weise nachzudenken, ja, sie gegen alles herrschende Normalverständnis infrage zu stellen. (...) Dem geht die Idee voraus, dass genau diese selbstverständliche Art und Weise, von den Dingen zu reden, in irgendeiner Weise nicht angemessen
oder gar falsch ist, dass hier zumindest also ein Problem vorliegt, das eine wissenschaftliche (erkenntnistheoretische oder auch empirische) Beschäftigung begründet (Schlottmann, 2013, p. 189f.).

Following John Searle's speech act theory, Schlottman emphasizes further: „Epistemisch subjektive oder epistemisch objektive Tatsachen werden im alltäglichen Sprachgebrauch und daran anschließenden perlokutionären Akten wie ontologisch objektive behandelt. Dadurch erhalten sie einen Status, der sie unverhandelbar, quasi ‚natürlich‘ erscheinen lässt“ (Schlottmann, 2013, p. 199). Liisa Malkki describes how strong ideas of common sense are located in everyday language. „Such commonsense ideas of soils, roots, and territory are built into everyday language and often also into scholarly work, but their very obviousness makes them elusive as objects of study“ (Malkki, 1997, p. 54). Both quotations pointing out, that the danger based on the duplication of everyday language in science contexts. Taking over "native views" on research subjects and their affirmative acknowledgment by a naive-realist empiricism is highly instrumental, manipulative, and stabilises current hegemonic thought patterns (cf. Schäffter, 2011). This discussion of methodological and epistemological issues in the field of migration research describes the core of the disciplinary crisis. In discourses on migration this is shown in the "methodological nationalism" (cf. Bühl, 1978; Wimmer & Glick Schiller 2002,2003) and in the substantialistic definition of migration.

As anticipated already, social structural change presents the epochal crisis. When social transformation processes should be taken seriously, then, simultaneously, the view of migration can be extended to a world society perspective (cf. Benhabib, 2004; Stichweh, 2000). The conditions of possibility in the detection of alternative perspectives on migration significantly change by dealing with migration in a world society view. „Daß der moderne Nationalstaat mit seiner Einheitlichkeit von Staatsvolk und Staatsgewalt, von durch Grenzlinien markiertem Staatsgebiet und Staatshoheit sich in einer epochalen Krise befindet, ist inzwischen ein Gemeinplatz“ (Kaufmann, Bröckling & Horn, 2002, p. 19). With the theorization of migration phenomenon based on the “container model of society” come more epistemological obstacles connected to the epochal crisis. Among other things, this provoked the current view of migrants as "incoming".

Obwohl mittlerweile allgemein anerkannt ist, dass Migration eine ebenso lange Geschichte hat wie die Menschheit selbst und daher ein wichtiger Teil der allgemeinen Gesellschaftsgeschichte ist, erscheint es interessant, dass gerade diesem Aspekt im kollektiven Gedächtnis, in der Erinnerungskultur der europäischen Gesellschaft, nur wenig Platz eingeräumt wird (Hahn, 2012, p. 9).

An understanding of migration that implicitly relies on a sedentary perspective therefore involves a rigid understanding of migration in citizenship sense view, preventing social development. This hegemonic suppression is expressed exemplary in the keywords "irregular documented", "Fortress Europe", "sans papiers" or (cf. Schwenken, 2006), and also lead to the criminalization of specific forms of migration. From the descriptions of the disciplinary and the epochal crisis arises the consequence to assume a research approach that has to consider not only the present difficulties in the determination of research objects, but also has to deal with the constitution of research subjects beyond.
REMARKS

For the detection of alternative development perspectives on migration, my endeavour took its starting point in the observation that substantialistic definitions on migration bring epistemological obstacles in tow. Their unquestioned self-evident character and normative claim act forcefully, which is almost obvious from a disciplinary and epochal view. Especially in dealing with migration it becomes clear how "migrants" were constructed by a substantialistic understanding.

Thereafter, several findings become apparent to discourse on migration: A relational perspective on migration in the context of a communicative world society crumbles attribution practices and differences. This once more emphasizes the positive annotations of the human principle of "migration as a form of life" and puts further pressure on rigid nationally-territorial perspectives on migration, questioning their justification. The reference to substantialistic views on research subjects almost reveals it's involvement with the prevention of social development, particularly in the development and implementation of human rights. Their latency has so far prevented this research subject from discovering alternative development perspectives on migration.

With this endeavour to identify the epistemological obstacles in their deep structures, an opportunity was presented which leaves a non-essentialist direction of observation. Taking a relational perspective on migration sharpens the view in identifying blind spots whilst dealing with migration. In the social-political dimension the dramatic consequences a substantialistic view on migration has are revealed and furthermore, it becomes very apparent just how important it is to consider epistemological obstacles.

REFERENCES


EDUCATION DECISIONS OF EMPLOYED PERSONS: THE INFLUENCE OF ADULT EDUCATION VOUCHERS

Haberzeth, Erik
Technische Universität Chemnitz
Germany

Kulmus, Claudia
Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin
Germany

ABSTRACT

Over the last decades, many European countries have introduced vouchers as an instrument of financing continuing education. Especially in Germany, there is a growing body of voucher programs (Haberzeth, Kulmus & Stanik, 2012). They are intended to increase the demand for continuing education by reducing its direct costs for the individuals. Apart from controversial discussions about selectivity in the usage of this instrument, there is a lack of empirical insights into the effects of this instrument. The purpose of this paper is, thus, to determine how adults use vouchers and what influence vouchers have on decisions on participation in continuing vocational training. We are presenting results of a research project in which the voucher “Bildungsscheck Brandenburg” as an example of a voucher was studied. By using qualitative and quantitative methods it is shown how the effects of public interventions vary according to structural conditions in which the users are embedded and also to the individual life planning including private perspectives.

INTRODUCTION

Over the last decades, many European countries have introduced vouchers as an instrument of financing continuing education. Especially in Germany, there is a growing body of voucher programs (Haberzeth, Kulmus & Stanik, 2012). A “pure” voucher can be described as “an earmarked payment made to a training consumer for use at the education or training institution of their choice” (Cedefop, 2000, p.15). It covers the costs of the chosen education or training either completely or partially. In Germany, the first program was introduced in 2003 at federal level by the Federal Employment Agency, followed by similar types of vouchers at federal and particularly at state level. A widely known example is the Training Cheque North Rhine-Westphalia. Vouchers represent a demand-side public financing strategy of continuing education. They are intended to increase the demand for continuing education by reducing its direct costs as well as to strengthen individuals’ choices by providing them with purchasing power. However, this instrument is also criticised because it seems to produce selective effects, i.e. it leads to an overrepresentation of people with a high qualification level (Dohmen 2010).

Apart from the controversial discussion, there is a lack of empirical insights into the effects of this instrument, especially from an educational standpoint. Common research uses mostly economic and sociodemographic indicators to value its effects. There is not much evidence on the perspective of the individuals or users, more precisely, the role that vouchers play in the individuals’ educational decisions and planning of learning activities. The purpose of this
paper is, thus, to determine how adults use vouchers and what influence vouchers have on decisions on participation in continuing vocational training. Our approach intends to widen economic views that focus mainly on the deadweight effect and on labour market effects (Schwerdt et al. 2011). We are presenting results of a research project in which the voucher “Bildungsscheck Brandenburg” as an example of a voucher was studied. By using qualitative and quantitative methods it is shown how the effects of public interventions vary according to structural conditions in which the users are embedded and also to the individual life planning including private perspectives.

DEVELOPMENT OF ADULT EDUCATION VOUCHERS IN GERMANY

In order to promote lifelong learning, governments employ different mechanisms such as grants, loans, vouchers, tax subsidies or subsidies to providers (Balzer 2001). From a theoretical point of view, it is possible to distinguish two basic strategies of government intervention: supply-side financing on the one hand and demand-side financing on the other hand. In practice, however, these two strategies are often intertwined, thus, the funding methods are not exclusive. For example, a learner might use a voucher for a course which is offered by a provider who receives subsidies from the government. Within a supply-side strategy, governments grant subsidies to providers of adult education either for (short- or middle-term) projects and programs or for a long-term institutional promotion. Public money is given directly to providers so that they can offer programs and courses of adult education. The aims are to offer a basic provision of adult education, to foster courses, which are supposed to be important for society and for the political and societal development. Moreover, programs and courses can be developed and offered for special social groups, e.g. for people that are less inclined to education.

Within a demand-side strategy, public money or monetary equivalents to money are given directly to the individuals. This strategy is intended to strengthen the position of the consumers by enhancing individuals’ ability to exercise choice in the education market and hence to promote competition amongst the providers. This is supposed to lead to products that are better fitted to the needs of the consumers and produced more efficiently.

Over the last decades, several countries in Europe have introduced voucher or quasi-voucher programs to stimulate the participation in adult education. Some examples are the Chèque annual de formation in Geneva/Switzerland, the Voucher individuali in South Tyrol/Italy or Training Cheques in Belgium (Käpplinger, Klein & Haberzeth 2013). Different terms are used for this type of program which makes it sometimes difficult to identify all of these programs. They also differ in various points, but there is one core: a public co-funding that addresses individuals and in some cases also companies.

The following table shows an overview of voucher programs in Germany. On the federal level, there are three that differ mainly regarding their target groups: for example, the first one addresses unemployed people while the last one targets employed persons. They were introduced between 2003 and 2008. Furthermore, there are many vouchers on a state level, e.g. in North Rhine-Westphalia, Hessen or Hamburg. The last program was introduced in

---

1 The results presented here a part of a larger study by Haberzeth, Käpplinger and Kulmus (2013). The study was conducted by Humboldt University Berlin, department of adult and continuing education, and financed by the German Federal Ministry of Education and Research (BMBF).
2012 in Bremen. A voucher is a coupon that covers the costs of a chosen training. In some of the mentioned programs, this coupon is missing which means that people have to pay the course fees in advance and are reimbursed after having finished the training. This is called a quasi-voucher.

Table: (Quasi-)Voucher Programs in Germany (as to 01/2013)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of the Program</th>
<th>Launch</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Förderung der beruflichen Weiterbildung (FbW) (Bildungsgutschein)</td>
<td>01/2003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weiterbildung Geringqualifizierter und beschäftigter älterer Arbeitnehmer in Unternehmen (WeGebAU)</td>
<td>2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bildungsprämie (Prämiengutschein)</td>
<td>12/2008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>State Level</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bildungsscheck Nordrhein-Westfalen</td>
<td>01/2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qualifizierung von Beschäftigten (Sachsen-Anhalt WEITERBILDUNG)</td>
<td>2007 (1992)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weiterbildungsbonus Schleswig-Holstein</td>
<td>2007 (2011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qualifizierungsscheck Hessen</td>
<td>04/2008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kompetenzentwicklung in Unternehmen Mecklenburg-Vorpommern</td>
<td>12/2008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QualiScheck Rheinland-Pfalz</td>
<td>07/2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bildungsscheck Brandenburg</td>
<td>08/2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weiterbildungsbonus Hamburg</td>
<td>11/2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weiterbildungsscheck Sachsen</td>
<td>11/2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thüringer Weiterbildungsscheck</td>
<td>9/2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bremer Weiterbildungsscheck</td>
<td>05/2012</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: own illustration

Even if these programs differ in their details, there are some main features that characterize those voucher programs:

- Co-Financing: own financial contribution of voucher users (often between 20-50 percent);
- Maximum Level of Funding (often 500 € per person);
- Limitation of individual availability (1-2 vouchers per year);
- Target Groups: often SME or employees of SME, sometimes other preferred groups (e.g. low educated, low-income people);
- Guidance/Counseling (obligatory or optional);
- Accreditation of Training Providers (often quality management).

Although the number of voucher programmes has increased over the last years, vouchers are not firmly entrenched in the financing system of adult education in Germany. Most of the programs are mainly funded by the European Social Fund which also means that their duration is limited and depends upon the length of the funding period.
RESEARCH ON VOUCHERS

The remarkable development of voucher programs in Germany took place almost unnoticed by theoretical and empirical analysis of the scientific discipline of adult education. In general, the discussion of such programs is mostly conducted on the level of abstract models and the empirical base is still inadequate and patchy. The few empirical studies that exist mainly consider issues pertaining to economics. They therefore focus on overall economic labour market effects or deadweight effects (Schwerdt et al. 2011). Other possible effect modellings are not taken into account, especially from an educational point of view.

The existing evaluations (i.e. SALSS 2008) indicate that participation rates vary according to socio-economic factors (gender, age, level of education etc.). However, participation decisions of the individuals have hardly been analysed in an andragogical perspective which necessarily includes the professional and private contexts that people are involved in. Therefore, the aim of this contribution is to develop a theoretical perspective that allows to identify effects of public interventions in a broader way and to generate other forms of effects than simply the deadweight one.

THE STUDY OF THE “BILDUNGSSCHEQUE BRANDENBURG”

The Training Cheque Brandenburg is one typical example of a voucher program at the state level in Germany. The program exists since 2009, however in July 2012, the funding guidelines were modified. Only employed persons are allowed to apply for the program and only vocational training can be funded. The program covers 70 percent of the course fees, the level of funding is open. An application is possible once annually. Before the change of the guidelines, the level of funding was limited to 500 Euro, however, it was possible to use the program twice per year.

The research design of our study included quantitative and qualitative methods: a program analysis of 3,481 vouchers, a written questionnaire for users, guideline-based interviews with users, and interviews with providers of adult education (in more detail see Haberzeth, Käpplinger & Kulmus 2013). The research questions were:

- What influences do vouchers have on decisions on participation in continuing vocational training?
- Why and how are vouchers used? Under which personal and social conditions?
- For what course topics and types of course are vouchers used?
- What does this financial incentive mean for adults’ participation?

In the following sections, some main results are presented. The overall results can be found in Haberzeth, Käpplinger and Kulmus (2013).

“UNEXPECTED” SELECTIVE EFFECTS

The most striking result is that there are “unusual” participation rates and, thus, an “unusual” participation selectivity in the context of this program, compared to general participation rates in adult education. Firstly, women use the vouchers a lot more the men. This is the case in a number of voucher programs. The proportion in Brandenburg is 69 to 31 percent. This is a
clear difference to the general participations rates in Adult Education at least in Germany where the proportions are almost equal between men and women.

Secondly, the vouchers are often used for languages courses (“Sprachen”). However, especially significant is the high use for courses in the area of health care (“Gesundheit, Medizin and Wellness”) and social services (“Soziales”). 40 percent of all vouchers are used for these two areas.

**Figure: Voucher use by topics (absolute number)**

![Bar chart showing voucher use by topics](image)

*Sources: own calculations; data to 31.12.2012*

These courses are strongly related to the profession of the participants: some of the courses even require a primary vocational education certificate in order to permit participation. The health care sector mainly includes professions like physiotherapy, occupational therapy and health prevention. The social service sector includes for example geriatric care, social pedagogy and early intervention.

That leads to the third result: vouchers are used especially intensive in the health care and social sector. Other sectors that usually have high participation rates (banking sector, insurance companies etc.) do not use the vouchers a lot.

With the qualitative approach described below, we tried to understand these results in more depth. Why can we see such rates? As we will illustrate, vouchers are often used in areas/sectors that have a financing problem, a low wage level, and a high demand for training.
QUALITATIVE RESULTS: INCREASED FINANCIAL NEEDS IN CERTAIN PHASES OF LIVE AND CAREER IN THE SOCIAL AND HEALTHCARE SECTOR

Through the analysis of the interviews it can be shown how the financial incentive is interlocked with structural and individual factors on one hand, and with the life course on the other hand. This will be shown on the basis of two patterns that are particularly important within the usage of the Training Cheque Brandenburg.

The first pattern contains young women in an early stage of career. They work as physiotherapists or ergotherapists or as social workers. For them it is – firstly – important to specialize and to establish in their career. Therefore, they have to participate in continuing education intensively because there is a number of treatments or services that they are only allowed to conduct when they have certain certificates (and to get them, they have to attend certain trainings). Secondly, the jobs in this sector are quite knowledge-intensive and challenging, new knowledge and new treatments are being developed continuously and working with humans generally requires a high level of social competence. Hence, employees in that sector have to invest money and time in their continuing education.

However, the income level of these young women is relatively low and companies in that sector do not provide much financial support on continuing education. Mostly, the employers are small-sized enterprises or non-profit-organizations that hardly have much financial resources. Thus, the employees have to finance their trainings themselves.

Beyond that, personal interests have to be taken into account. In this group of young women this is especially the intention or plan to start a family. The women are thinking a lot about how to manage having a baby with their job and their training needs. Starting a family is perceived as a break in their life-style. They anticipate that after having a baby, they will have to spend more money and time on other things than on continuing education.

Marion, 28, ergotherapist:
„And, let me say this, when I’m 40 years old, when I have two children, a car, some insurance and maybe some other things that have to be paid off, well, then I can’t afford such training. […] That’s just why I say to myself: this is important to me. I mean, I’m setting my priorities and I say: I’m trying to qualify now while my noodle (head, authors) is still fresh. So, later on it might be too late, when there are children and stuff, I won’t have any time left. That’s why I say to myself: OK, I’m trying it now, as long as I still can, to invest the money on training. (3/114-122ff.).

This quote illustrates that the interviewee has a sequential planning of life in mind: in an early stage of their career, the women in this pattern prioritize their job and education. After having the first child however, they can modify this priority because they have already finished the most important certificate-trainings.

In this situation, the voucher plays an important role for the women. It allows them to participate earlier in trainings and to participate in a faster succession than it would be affordable without financial support; also, they can take these important but expensive certificate courses.
The second pattern contains women in a later stage of their career who also work in the health care and social sector. Thus, the structural conditions are quite similar. For these women, of course, it is not relevant to start a family or to establish in the career, even though family issues are still important for them. The aim of these women is rather to develop or even to change professionally in order to maintain work ability in older age.

Annette, 49, social worker, specializes in early intervention: „And I notice that, and also my colleagues do, that you can't work until 67. I mean, just before my 67th birthday, I am going to be retired. And it's simply a question of mobility, so, just imagine that I wouldn't be able to drive a car anymore: I would be immediately out of the job. It's impossible to work only in the office or in one single location. It's really impossible. We have to visit the families, go to the nurseries and so on. That's why I'm thinking about taking a correspondence course in family counselling or something like that. When I work in counselling, I hopefully can do that quite well even if I have a physical handicap. (2/499-502)

The work they are doing is physically and mentally demanding and with increasing age, the employees anticipate not to be able to work within the same job until regular retirement age. Decisions and planning on vocational training therefore aim at developing new job perspectives and less demanding types of work, such as counseling or teaching instead of direct social work.

In this situation, the voucher supports the preservation of health and work ability in a later stage of career. It is used to take courses for occupational reorientation that mostly are certificate-courses and, thus, large and expensive.

CONCLUSION

The usage patterns of the Training Cheque Brandenburg show clear differences with respect to the general participation rates at least in Germany. An “unusual” selectivity of this instrument can be identified, mainly by topics, sectors, and gender. Vouchers are often used for professional courses within health and social topics that are strongly job related. They are therefore used by employees in the health care and social service sector, which is predominated by women.

The financial incentive “reacts” to special needs that on the one hand result from structural factors, such as working or training conditions: complex and demanding work tasks in the social sector lead to high training requirements. But given the relatively low income-level, employees in this sector have difficulties to meet these training demands, which is why special support needs seem to be almost inevitable. On the other hand, there are personal interests, such as issues of family planning or retaining health and work ability that need to be considered. In order to explain usage and functions of vouchers it is essential to take on a life course perspective. It allows to identify critical phases in the life course where the combination of structural factors and personal interests lead to an increased need and usage of financial incentives. The relevance of including structural and individual factors in a life course perspective has been shown by identifying two patterns of usage: in an early career stage, when professional interests (establishing the career) can compete with family planning and therefore lead to special training needs, and in a later career stage, when a highly
demanding job can compete with health interests and the need to retain work ability until retirement.

These results also indicate that for a broader understanding of the effects of vouchers, it is not satisfactory to focus solely on deadweight effects. In the patterns above, several influences on participation could be identified: vouchers can increase individual participation when people attend more trainings at the same time. They can influence the date of participation because they facilitate to participate earlier in expensive courses, and finally they can influence the choice of providers and forms of education because they enable people to choose a more expensive and/or extended course. In addition, vouchers can stimulate reflections on training needs because they extend the spectrum of (financially) possible courses. These effects do not correspond with the deadweight effect which describes that a private investment on education that was already planned is just substituted by public financing. Even if the financial incentive does not foster new training activities, it can accelerate skill development or increase individual participation. Analysing voucher programs should therefore include a multidimensional modelling of effects.

REFERENCES


EMANCIPATION INSTEAD OF DISCIPLINE

Heikkinen, Anja
University of Tampere
Finland

ADULT EDUCATION’S “PROJECTS IN THE MODEL”

“The second (methodological issue – AH) is the relevance of intellectuals’ particular political projects for the development of abstract concepts. Through their ordinary participation in the political struggles of their day, social scientists’ common sense views of their lived experience get entangled in the production of scientific concepts, with the result that the categories used for description and analysis become part of different political projects that treat abstraction and causality in particular oriented ways” (Narotzky 2007).

In the beginning of 2011, the Dean of our brand new School of Education informed the staff that identification with disciplines is over in the university, and if anybody’s concern in the future, it will rely on the interest of learned (research) societies. We are in the forefront in implementation of global lifelong learning – or R&D&I, or HRD - policies, by establishing broad, problem and learning outcomes-based study programmes. The making of European area of lifelong learning, requires discipline-, teacher- and process-specific studies to be replaced by standardized courses and modules. The staff and students of our School are experiencing the consequences. On the one hand, the previous discipline-based (permanent) positions, especially professorships, are fading away, while candidates with “generic” and problem-based expertise (with a short-term contract) are invited into tenure tracks and project-based research. Reduction of face-to-face teaching – and hence need of human resources - through digital study-environments and business-led open access platforms has been encouraged. On the other hand, effort and resources are targeted to support students’ individual study plans, counselling and guidance. Instead of offering intellectual challenge, the student-customers should be satisfied by positive learning experiences, supported by psycho-pedagogical therapy. Instead of a search for conceptual clarification of reality, the external funders should be served by analyses about the marketability of their (learning) products. When all students and researchers study any issues from early childhood to terminal care from the perspective of problem solving in learning environments with no content or context, the need for distinctive study of adult education, or adult education scholarship has disappeared.

I will question here, if academic “adult education” may in fact have functioned as a tool for the innovation and implementation of current institutional reforms and policies, which effect education regimes as a whole everywhere on the planet. Could it be that the adult education gospel of empowerment, self-directedness, emancipation from restrictive, oppressive and elitist disciplinary knowledge has paved way for this since its entrance in the academy? Does this connect to the (growing?) indifference or even arrogance of the disciples of adult education, towards conceptual and theoretical development of their field? Perhaps (academic) adult education is, despite or rather because of persistent celebration of its progressivity, exemplary on how the revolution is eating its own children.
The discussion is based on reading of selected, but representative, texts from critical and radical adult education, from developmental work-research and from constructivist adult learning “theory”. These will be related to findings from historical research on development of adult education as practice and field of study. Statements about the relation of representative texts to current policies and changes in education, especially academic education, are made in the context of Finland. However, Finnish adult education is predominantly following the Anglo-American hegemonic discourses, and education policies are even proactive in relation to trans-national, OECD and EU education policies. Therefore I assume that discussion in this context is applicable also to many other countries in Europe.

BRANDING A DISCIPLINE?

According to the standard story, adult education has developed into an academic field of study in stages. It emerged as a companion of adult education practice, then moved towards supporting education of adult educators, thirdly started to transform educators’ practice into theory. In the fourth stage it transformed into a mature discipline by proceeding into meta-theoretical reflections on its accumulated concepts and theories. (Finger 1990, Tuomisto 1985.)

In 2006 I claimed that “the story of “adult education” as a discipline or field of study has been that of normalisation and de-politicisation” (Heikkinen 2007) ¹. In this context I would like to formulate this statement as a question, how far and in which way does or should “adult education” - like any other discipline or academic subject - overlap with its target? It may not be distinctive to adult education, but the challenge of relating theory to practice has characterized its disciplinary identity ever since its entrance into disciplinary landscape.² For most of the pioneers or founding fathers in different parts of the Western world, the most crucial identity issues were the relation of theory and research to social and political change and to existing theories and research. (Stubblefield 1988, Charters & Hilton 1989, Tuomisto 1985). Alongside development of distinctive political and practical space for adult education, many argued a need for “new science”, which could not be reduced to sociology, psychology or education. However, in many cases this was due to adaptation to the contemporary disciplinary and university political situation. For example, during the 1920s, adult education had difficulties to be accepted as a new topic or field or social science in the US, and the study of free folk-edification work (later adult education) was established in Finland after being rejected by educational science. (ibid, Kantasalmi 2010)

In the 1920s-30s, research and study programmes were in the Anglo-Saxon world commonly physically established in university units for extension studies or adult education programmes. While the founding fathers almost exclusively were deeply engaged in contemporary politics and “adult education” activities, it seems natural that their main concern was how the field related to practice and politics. For example, Lindeman argued for a new social science, which would develop its concepts and theories in joint research between researchers, practitioners and adults. Thus the “practice” of research should overlap with the practice of adult education – social movement - itself. Others considered the

¹ I use quotation marks in order to remind about the advocating function of naming a discipline or field of study.
² It’s contemporary “mother discipline” education is a close example, but the advocating concept-formation of such “foundation disciplines” like sociology and psychology can be questioned as well.
distinctiveness to emerge from exploitation of social scientific, psychological and educational theories and research by bringing them into the distinctive, holistic, life-worldly context of adult education. In Finland, adult education study was considered a part of professional education for public administration and civil society organisations. Its core was a reflection of the spiritual and ethical aims of folk edification work. However, what is common to all documents and narratives of “adult education” is the original commitment of the discipline or study to promote social progress, emancipation and empowerment of “people” – as “adults”, “learners”, “workers”. (Charters & Hilton 1989, Tuomisto 2013.)

Another fundamental choice by the pioneers in setting the foundations for “adult education” was the exclusively humanistic, spiritual and social-scientific definition of their topic. Despite factual activities and their agents with their explicit and close connection to participants’ material lives, economical and occupational aspirations, the founding fathers insisted on considering them as social and spiritual movements. Following his Nordic and Central-European colleagues, Lindeman stated that the “true” adult education is focusing on intellectual, cultural and spiritual growth (of individuals) and on social or folkish ends (of communities). (in Stubblefield 1988, 146.) In Finland Zachris Castrén defined ethics as the foundation for adult education (folk edification work), leading people to search for truths, which would open their minds to cultural values, and which could constitute the edifying basis for their lives. (Castrén 1934.) Since then “adult education” has been exclusively human and social-centred and excluded considerations of human life at individual, collective and meta-collective level from perspectives of natural sciences.

EXAMPLES OF “TRUE” ADULT EDUCATION

In the following, some examples on identification of “adult education” are presented. They are intellectually highly interesting and important: the point is not to question their academic or other quality, but to show the marginalization of disciplinary development in the field.

One smart solution to legitimize and characterize the distinctiveness of academic adult education has been to define it as a “bridge science” in line with social psychology. (Alastalo 2009, Suoranta et al 2008.) Serge Moskovici and Ivana Markova (2006) show how social-psychology was introduced into the academy and implemented in different parts of the world, as part of the Americanization of (social) sciences in the post World War II.3 The war-time US offered brilliant markets for group-dynamical and opinion studies, which were developed in cultural anthropology, psychology and sociology in development of social policy, business and work-organizations. The social-psychological “bridge science” proved the usefulness of human and social sciences in identification and control of labour market and other contradictions. Theoretical deficiency and cultural differences were hidden behind innovative methods like experimental and psychological laboratory-research and experiential analyses. Through analysis based on empirical data the objective variables and indicators could be applied across cultural differences. (Alastalo 2009.) In adult education, the “bridge” is suggested to emerge by (eclectic, deliberate) exploitation of results from social sciences (disciplines) in developing interpretations on society from the perspective of emancipation

3 The authors claim that the trans-nationalization process was an authentic endeavour, based on the nature of the discipline. However, the US researchers prioritized countries under the Soviet control, and the whole process was financially supported by American post-war aid programmes.
and political action (activism). The distinctiveness of research and studies of adult education would build on their resonance with the whole society and social being. (cf. Suoranta 2012.)

Currently, “true” adult education researchers are searching for identity in digitalization of learning (social media) and post-modern discourse on rhizomes. “The concept of rhizoactivity aims to construct a theory of lifelong learning... The learning theory in the garden (of lifelong learning research – AH) is actually a rhizome. It sprouted in the garden and made its own connections and drew lines of flight” (Kang 2007). Robin Usher suggests rhizomatic research instead of the model of science, powered by desire, instead of objectivity. “In order to “ground” this way of seeing research differently I have taken lifelong learning and electronic communication as both context and catalyst within which to locate and foreground research. There is a powerful symmetry between lifelong learning, hyper-connectivity (which uncannily embodies, and has helped to bring about, a society with rhizomatic characteristics) and Deleuze and Guattari’s critique of hierarchy and authority... Lifelong learning presents itself as a legitimate area of research and being rhizomatic it requires a rhizomatic approach and sensibility in the researcher. The hyper-connectivity of the Internet reinforces this development influencing the way research is carried out and the way its knowledge outcomes are distributed and used – a research without hierarchy and authority.” (Usher 2010). In other words: the “true” adult education research is only possible by merging with the “true” adult education in non-hierarchical, hyper-connective digital networks, where desire substitutes the search for truth, in order to conceptually reach and promote actualization of the society that research is vibrating with.

An exemplary account of “the true” adult education of today reads as follows: “Contingently, education is about developing imaginative, workable, ethical communities, which do not suppress differences or cause the proliferation of fragmented and weak communities, but strive to develop values of critical understanding and resilience” (Maginess 2012). Maginess explains her success as researcher by giving learners “a place and a space to construct, to create a new concept of community characterised by compassion, honesty and resilience.” This is possible, because adult educators do not use academic argumentation typical for orthodox pedagogy. Instead of theorizing the ideal of adult education, she refers – in popular fashion – to the theoretical authority of Paolo Freire. By using critical pedagogy she has developed a model of learning, which is “partial, unstable, uncertain, imperfect and subject to interrogation” (ibid).

A similar example of “true adult education’s” distinction from hegemonic educational paradigm, exploits the concept of therapisation introduced by Frank Furedi and Kathryn Ecclestone. The researcher made interviews with unemployed young adults in an educational project. When young men report that they had been empowered with improved self-esteem, a researcher denies this and claims that “they were eager to give a convincing image of themselves as active, developmental and self-disciplinary.” (Brunila 2012). Although joining the projects was based on serious learning and behavioural difficulties, Brunila accuses them of not providing “the highest level of education”. However, neither Furedi nor Ecclestone are against therapy, when it is needed. According to interviews youngsters recovered from learning difficulties, started to trust in themselves, make plans and take responsibility, but a researcher translates: “the ethos of therapisation makes young people more inward-looking and leads to an internalisation of the idea that societal problems such as unemployment, a lack of education or a criminal background are in fact individual-based” (ibid). The “true” adult education researcher does not need to respect the words of her
informants. Instead, she concludes that the education project “becomes limited to a question of learning how to speak according to what is expected of you” (ibid.).

Education for citizenship is one flagship of adult education. “True” researchers look for original spaces for adult education, for example by looking at images of people in places, where “citizenship practices are shaped” looks at images of people in different places. (Vandenabeele et al 2011.) Researchers criticize mainstream concepts like social cohesion and lifelong learning for closing such spaces. They are not developing a theory, but “(R)ather, we wish to open the possibility of seeing things differently and altering our way of thinking” (ibid). “Producing new knowledge means inventing a new idiomatic form that facilitates translation between empirical stories and philosophical discourses”, in this case different ways of looking at “citizenship as an emplaced and embodied practice on the other hand”. What to do with these stories and knowledge? Following Rancière they confess that their stories remain unreadable to those who insist on finding causes and lessons, but are readable to “spectators who play the role of active interpreters, who develop their own translation in order to appropriate the ‘story’ and make it their own story”. The reader is left with the notion that “society in general, and adult education in particular, have reached a point at which creative approaches to exploring new, unexpected roads are needed” (ibid).

It would be logical that the concept adult education is relational to adult growth (as a personal and collective process). However, the adult education narratives prefer development, and increasingly only adult learning. Furthermore, learning is interpreted as an activity, whose subject can be an individual, an organization, a society or even an economy. The agency in education and teaching is replaced by neutral and anonymous environments, communities and practices of learning. Instead of theories of education and teaching, educational researchers are developing home-grown theories of learning, learning organizations, environments, communities and practices. However, typically such theories build on qualitative accounts on single cases of individuals, groups or organizations. (cf. Wenger 1999.) Instead of systematic and cumulative evidence, they seem to function as triumphant models for reaching proper, intended learning outcomes.

Many learning theorists utilize populist versions from neuroscientific research. It has become increasingly fashionable in teacher training and in testing and competitions of skills and competences. The standardized learning outcomes seem objective and neutral for teachers and public bodies, and both for employers and employees unions. These theories draw from brain research statements, for example in order to compare humans with computers. (Lonka et al 2012) Accordingly, humans are described as poor computers, who only can store 3-7 items instantly in their work-memory; they are inclined to logical failures, conservatism and self-centeredness. Furthermore, humans are disturbed by stress and excitement, have difficulties to grasp complex situations, and hardly strive at scientific or statistical thinking. However, through emotions and motivation human brains can be shaped. In obtaining optimal brain capacity, environments with mirroring and interaction are considered most efficient. By use of cognitive prosthesis humans can exploit computers: if they develop positive attitudes and emotions to digital interaction, they can distribute information processing and biological burdens to technology. Superior ubiquitous learning environments integrate e-books, net materials, group meetings, mobiles, interactive whiteboards, workspaces, avatars, videos. An example of research design is a study group sitting by their computers in a circle around the teacher. S/he is still needed to prepare the “pedagogical manuscript” for starting the session, where participants communicate digitally in real-time
with each other and the teacher. (ibid.). Could anyone advertise more effectively the global digi-business with their quickly outdated facilities and learning packages?

However, “true” adult education researchers ignore learning theorists, who build on neurosciences: they are accused of deliberately concealing of the social and political essence of learning. The hegemony of sociological (and managerial) discourses in adult education is reflected in theories of communities of practice (like learning) or learning as a practice. It can easily be linked to the grand narrative of adult education that it has grown “out of practice, as a practice related to and addressing problems and challenges occurring in everyday life” (Finger et al 2001). Though discourse on learning seems culturally and politically neutral, it becomes loaded when combined with practice. In the Anglophonic meaning advocated by Lave and Wenger, communities of practice (learning) are branded by engagement and involvement, by the ability to practice a particular practice. The interest of Lave and Wenger in communities of practice was related to their “theory of situated learning”. Therefore, adult educators specify their discussion practice as “informal” and “everyday life” learning. Concepts of communities of practice and situated learning have expanded into theories of knowledge management and construction, where learning is interpreted as (successful – from someone’s perspective) socialization in a group or group activity. During the launching of this “learning theory”, I experienced several projects, where colleagues from Mediterranean countries had difficulties in adopting the Anglophonic meaning. They kept on translating Wenger’s concepts as activities in a neighbourhood, although this did not fit the conceptual framework of the projects. However, it was important in showing how the linguistic colonialism operated in seemingly democratic research cooperation.

The advocating nature of adult education as practice and theory is commonly legitimized by the need to revitalize its tradition as “a critical social science” against the hegemony of neo-liberalism. (e.g. Salo 2011.) “Theories” about learning as a practice, communities of practice, take for granted that “practice” equals to liberating (emancipatory) practice. Instead of empirical clarification, “critical and engaged” adult educators and researchers develop exclusive definitions, which identify them as the true followers of adult education tradition. (e.g. Barros 2012). They are considered to adhere to principles of socio-educational and socio-cultural emancipatory perspective, based on popular education and community interventions for local development. They interpret themselves as strongholds of “political resistance to the dominant management-based ethos associated with adult education and learning in both public and private institutions, succumbed to a market-based rhetoric” (ibid). The distinctiveness of adult education “theory” relies on pragmatism and affinity to “concrete problems occurring in the everyday life”. More important than cumulative research on realities of adult education is establishment of counter-hegemonic discourses and emancipatory research strategies. In the fight against neo-liberalism, adult education would no more suffer from “being too practical and pragmatic, short-sighted, small-scale, profit-oriented, fragmentary, depoliticized and normative” (Salo 2011).

The narrative of adult education research and theory as building on practice and promoting practice maintains its development into academically-authorized advocacy and consultancy for a variety of stakeholders, clients and customers. The explicit version is theories of human resource and organizational development, in the paradigm-mall constantly criticized by others because of their explicit market-orientation. However, the developers of learning environments and packages, of adult learning professional programmes, of evaluations and evidence for policy-making, have always had their distinctive knowledge-markets. One of the
most booming products has been developmental work research, which has smartly adopted innovations from business and engineering. The concept of change laboratory with its knotworking-theory has been successfully extended to new emerging living laboratories, like “Building Information Model” standard. In a current consultation in a municipal construction project, researchers report, how “(a)rchitect participants created the basic models, performance indicators, and other technical tools for the experiment. In the third meeting, one of the engineers explained how the energy calculations would be tested in the knotworking experiment. Another engineer described the method of cost calculations. A group of the architects had created indicators for measuring for the evaluation of the design alternatives and the integrated design collaboration. The aim was also to create a combined instrument for decision making with all key figures on one excel sheet only” (Kerosuo et al 2013). It is hard to grasp the reason why certain – rather conventional - phases of the BIM project should be named knotworking. Does the one excel sheet indicate that individual or collective boundary-crossing learning is taking place, and what could it mean?

The point here is not to undermine the novel insights and fruitful outcomes of current mainstream “adult education” research, but to highlight the continuation of the narrative of the “true” adult education research. Therefore, other examples could have been presented, from biographical and/or life-historical research, from dialogical and counselling research and so forth. What seems to be exclusively characteristic for most of them is, that they maintain the “original” statement of “true” adult education, where method – emancipatory, transformative - is what makes adult education distinctive both as practice and as field of study. As a “bridge science”, the performative and calculated exploitation of approaches and methods from sociology and cultural theory, or from learning psychology and business studies, is legitimized as “adult education” by its potential for social activism or organizational development, which needs no clarification of the ontological and epistemological logic of bridging.

FROM ACTIVISM TO REALISM?

How far has the commitment to emancipation and social change in the “true adult education” had impact on emancipation of oppressed individuals and groups or on increasing equality and well-being among populations? One consequence of the anti-disciplinary or anti-scientific legacy of adult education is the growing internal faction focusing on the search for evidence on effectiveness – benefits – of adult education as a practice with distinctive academic rationale. This is accompanied by expansion of study programmes for adult learning professionals in Europe and elsewhere. (cf. Buiskool et al 2010.) Another paradoxical consequence is the impact of the “project in the model” of “true adult education” on educational policies and pedagogical programmes, which build on self-directed, learner-centred, experiential, emancipated learning. The seemingly open, free and borderless digital learning is making disciplinary-based, cumulative, scholarly study superfluous and even detrimental for authentic and creative individuals and groups. The ideas of European Qualification Framework for Lifelong Learning, exemplary in the European Higher Education and Research Area under making, resonate brilliantly with the unbounded, rhizomatic concepts of adult education as theory and practice, but at the same time making them superfluous and even detrimental as anything distinctive. They also nicely parallel the recent policies and programmes of embracing creative destruction and revolutionary paths in global economies and industries.
One could argue, that because of the anti-disciplinary and anti-scientific commitment of adult education has enhanced its effective immersion into global market capitalism, as practice, policy and research. (Larsson 2010, Munch 2010, Puhakka et al 2011.) While some compete in evaluation and developmental research markets, others do so in academic meriting markets, each searching for brands in order to distinguish as innovative, exceptional, and excellent. (cf. Heikkinen & Teräsaahde 2011, Teräsaahde 2012.) The dull and restricted populace of adult education as adults, educators, planners and administrators raises little interest among academic innovators: adult education should represent “radical thinking, which resists the grammar of dullness” (Filander et al 2010).

A suggestion about clarifying the theoretical distinctiveness of “adult education” by bringing its different traditions – fields and layers –together and by reflecting adult education in the context of education in a wider sense (as a whole, whatever this means), is not new. Peter Jarvis (1992), for example, made the proposal in his review on the state and origin of adult education research in Europe (and Anglo-Saxon world). A crucial aspect of such an endeavour should be multi-level, cross-cultural and historical (genealogical) analysis about the actual transformation of the landscape of “education”, as practices, policies and theories (cf. Heikkinen 2007), self-critical and cross-cultural research on emergence of the field, on struggles about the field, internal and external, by different actors and alliances (Heikkinen 2012c) From the perspective of real-historical analysis of the founding fathers, the key actors and alliances, their programmes and conceptual constructions in the struggle on adult education might reveal the political “projects in the model”, which have been constituting “adult education” as an academic subject. The canonized self-interpretation of “adult education” as “conceptualization and theorization” of the practice (as emancipatory, progressive movement) can be questioned by showing the real-historical actors, networks and discursive divisions about cultural - linguistic, industrial-economic, political, epistemological – hegemony. Potentially such self-deconstructive exercise could liberate researchers from performing activism, and open space for self-critical and systematic observation and analysis on the sphere of human reality called “adult education”.

Where I disagree with Jarvis and many others in suggestions of disciplinary reflections, is his commitment to adult learning as the key category for “adult education”, and learning reduced into social activity and/or practice. The human and social-centered commitment of “adult education” excluded since the start considerations of human life at an individual, collective and meta-collective level from perspectives of natural sciences. Despite other differences, the contemporary suggestions on adult education (lifelong learning) theory are explicitly rejecting science (as natural science or inquiry applying “the model” of natural science). “According to scientific world view, life just exists and develops in the process called evolution. For humanist researchers, including adult educators, life is in fact not evolution at all, but meanings” (Suoranta 2012). From my point of view, this rejection is fundamental for the identity of adult education (and more widely to human and social sciences): both from practical and from theoretical perspective, the ignorance of developments and findings in

---

4 In Finland, this could, for example, show the confrontation between Finno-Ugrian, rural/peasant and Swedish/Germanic, civic/military/bourgeois cultures, leading to conceptual “victories” and compromises in emerging academic adult education. More importantly, it could reveal their embeddedness in wider educational, political and economical struggle, and suggest the programmatic nature of the establishment of distinctive sphere of “adult education” as practice and theory. (Heikkinen 2011, 2012c).
natural sciences is alarming. How can we as academic adult educators refuse to learn (sic!) about the embeddedness of human existence, life and means of livelihood in the collective of humans and non-humans, and about the conditions for the future maintenance of the human reality? (cf. Latour 2004, Gazzaniga 2010, Carr 2011, Bryant 2011, Welsch 2012.)

The challenge remains, who will take the initiative. Following the statement of our Dean in 2011, is it so, that in the corporate capitalist universities there is no space any more for self-directed, self-critical disciplinary discussion and development? And if there are no other collective agents to take the responsibility than learned (research) societies, what could this mean to organisations like ESREA? What is its responsibility in questioning the identity and position of “adult education” in the changing world. “Instead of being academic surveillance and career promotion organisations with their exclusive conferences, networks, journals and other publications, research associations and societies could provide platforms for collective self-critical discussion and debate about the identity and role of adult education researchers” (Heikkinen 2007).

REFERENCES


WE MAKE THE ROAD BY WALKING\textsuperscript{1} – COLLECTIVE KNOWLEDGE BUILDING AND ACTION

Holmstrand, Lars
Linnaeus University
Sweden

Härnsten, Gunilla
Linnaeus University
Sweden

ABSTRACT

The current tendencies in most European societies can be characterised by the strengthening of power and control on a societal level as well as in education. In working life processes of de-qualification of work are spreading to wider areas and branches. The question we raise in this paper is whether there is any potential in adult education that can counterbalance these tendencies. We therefore scrutinize three radical traditions, those of: the Myles Horton at Highlander, the Paulo Freire pedagogy and the Swedish Research Circle. We conclude that there are some important common elements that must be present for the critical and empowering potential to be realised. In each of the three cases the collective knowledge building characterising the work clearly either includes or inspires action. So there is an obvious connection to the growing Participatory Action Research (PAR) paradigm that could be strengthened by using insights from radical adult education.

BACKGROUND

The market orientation in practically all educational areas seems to be spreading with an ever increasing speed all around the world. In principle this means that education is more and more treated like a commodity. This has opened up for profit hungry transnational companies who can buy and sell schools any way they chose in order to get as high return on their capital as possible. The tendency at universities is increasingly being characterised as what has been labelled as "academic capitalism" (cf. Delanty, 2001, pp. 115-129). An important part of this change, not least in Sweden, is the increasing bureaucratic control concerning the everyday work at all educational levels. In Sweden, for example, the separate National School Inspection Authority has recently been established to increase the control in schools.

These tendencies have been identified and described already many years ago by researchers like Harry Braverman and Basil Bernstein.

Braverman’s (1974/1977) classical book about the degradation of labour during the 20th century could very well be a description of current processes in working life. His observations of what was going on almost half a century ago are also valid now. The only difference worth

mentioning would be that the changes are much more rapid today. Another important circumstance that Braverman points to is the extensive and unnecessary education for an increasing number of jobs that only demands adaptation. This description certainly is not less accurate in the beginning of the second decade of the 21st century.

Basil Bernstein’s concepts from his writings in the 1970ies, *Class, codes and control* and 1990ies (Bernstein 1996) are fruitful in discussing the changes in society - and even more in the educational sector - that has happened during and after his research. His main concepts about *power and classification and control and framing*, developed from the 1960ies and on, have been used in many contexts and can still be useful in order to understand the situation today. In the chapter “Aspects of the relations between education and production” (Bernstein, 1975, pp. 174-200) he emphasises that it also is important to note the relationship between class and codes:

“Class is conceived as the fundamental *dominant cultural category*, created and maintained by the mode of production. It is the basic classification which creates the social relationships of production. However, the realizations of this dominant social category vary in time. That is, the *form* taken by the social relationships of education has changed over time.” (p.175)

In this context he also notes the possibility of both “the dependent and relative autonomous features and relationships between education and production” (ibid). At this time he discusses the many different faces that education can take and also puts forward that a *code* is determined by the values of classification and framing: “A code is a regulative principle, tacitly acquired, which integrates relevant meanings, the form of their realizations and their evoking contexts" (p.180).

Different codes, classification and framing change and give also the possibility to different practices in production as well as in educational settings. In any society though, the origin of the dominant code of schools is repeating the dominant cultural category: “In capitalist societies this is class. Class structure and relationships constitute and regulate both the distribution of power and the principles of control.” (p.181)

Bernstein also emphasises that “education is dependent upon production but also possesses a specific independence or relative autonomy in the constituting of its codes” (pp.191-192). Thus, he notes that: “if the systemic relations of education are strengthened, it increases the penetration of power relationships into education” (ibid).

In the book from 1996 Basil Bernstein summarises many different research projects, conducted by himself and colleagues around him. In a chapter named “Thoughts on the Trivium and Quadrivium: The Divorce of Knowledge from the Knower” he discusses what this break meant in the 1990ies and we can easily see the relevance of this:

“Today throughout Europe, led by the USA there is a new principle guiding the latest transitions of capitalism. The principles of the market and its managers are more and more the managers of the policy and practises of education. Market relevance is becoming the key orientating criterion for the selection of discourses, their relation to each other, their forms and their research. This movement has profound implications from the primary school to the university.
This can be seen in the stress on basic measurable skills at the primary level, vocational courses and specializations at the secondary level, spurious decentralization and the new instruments of state control over higher education and research.” (Bernstein, 1996, p. 87)

In a research project, developed at Stockholm University 2001-2006 (Härnsten & Wingård, 2007), a group of eleven researchers scrutinised the gender structures in university education, partly by using participatory research. Among their very apparent observations was that:

“The power over universities is conducted by both the state and the private sector through the current economic system. Here resources allocated to the already well known are favoured, to that which colleagues and the right receivers appreciate and feel comfortable with… Research grants are given to already established and secure environments that are not too challenging …” (p. 73).

They further noted the following:

“The control that is exercised over the operation of universities is lacking corresponding examples in modern time. The state is controlling the activities through all regulations, evaluations and decrees that emanate from a number of different levels in the system. This results in a rigid and incredibly time-consuming procedure in the activity. The time that today is used to design, scrutinise, make transparent, publish on the Internet, control and so on, all course descriptions, curriculums and study plans is appalling. The time of the teachers and researchers can to a considerably less degree be devoted to meeting the students in an open and mutually constructive spirit.” (ibid)

But, in the project the researchers also found this:

“There are undercurrents also within the academy that are based on different and – in our view – considerably more interesting perspectives. We who have had the privilege to work in this project are convinced that pedagogy – as science and as practise – can be extremely exciting and not least important for illuminating what is considered as relevant knowledge, who decides this and, not least, how is it produced.” (Härnsten & Wingård, 2007, p. 76)

It is issues like these that is governing science and education (bildung) from a democratic perspective and what we as researchers and teachers have to develop. Similar ambitions have earlier also been expressed by e.g. Taylor, Barr and Steele (2002).

The observed tendencies in most educational activity has made us more and more interested in finding examples that are demonstrating the possibility to work against the currents.
THREE RADICAL ADULT EDUCATION TRADITIONS

The question we raise in this paper is whether there is any potential in adult education that can counterbalance these tendencies. We therefore scrutinize three radical traditions. Myles Horton at Highlander was partly inspired by the Scandinavian folk high schools and created a similar kind of school. This Highlander tradition has been an important force for both the labour movement and the civil rights movement in the United States. Paulo Freire developed in South America the well-known liberating and empowering “pedagogy of the oppressed” that has been influential all over the world. In Europe the research circle tradition, with its heritage from the Swedish labour movement and popular education, was developed in the 1970ies as a tool for cooperation between trade unions and universities. What is the potential in these three traditions for collective knowledge building and action? What can be discerned by looking critically at the theoretical foundations and the practical operation of each of them? We use a selection of a few examples of important writings from each of these traditions and analyse the theoretical and practical aspects that have been most significant.

MYLES HORTON AND THE HIGHLANDER TRADITION

Myles Horton (1905-1990), one of the founders of Highlander Folk School in 1932, is an important North American educational thinker who worked very consequently according to his ideas. He got inspiration from a number of radical intellectuals like e.g. Reinhold Niebuhr, Jane Addams and John Dewey. Some of his radical friends persuaded him to visit Denmark in order to learn more about their Folk High Schools. It was also with practical and economic support from friends that he was able to find a place in the Appalachian Mountains in Tennessee and start the Highlander Folk School building on many of the characteristics of the Scandinavian Folk High Schools.

Education “from the bottom up, to help powerless people empower each other and become collectively involved” (Horton, 1976, cited in Jacobs, 2003, p. 257) is the idea that has been practised in Highlander. Horton explains in an interview in 1986 the reason behind this: “We were interested in building a democratic society and were going to use education as one of the means to changing society.” (Jacobs, 2003, p. 34) He further stresses that Highlander is not a school but educational (and Horton points to the basic meaning of the word educate that is to “draw out instead of pour in”). According to Horton: “The purpose of Highlander has always been the same: to try to contribute toward a genuine democratic society through radical social, economic, political, and cultural change in this country.” (ibid) He immediately explains that by democracy, he means it “in the full philosophical sense of people governing themselves and working out the system that make that kind of relationship possible”.

Frank Adams who has written about the idea of Highlander notes that “…Highlander sought to educate people away from the dead end of individualism and into the freedom that grows from cooperation and collective solutions” (Adams, 1975, p. 208). The same author observes that Dewey, whose thinking Horton was inspired by, claimed that “civil and political democracy were meaningless without equivalent economic and industrial democracy” (Adams, 1975, p. 13). The kind of society that Highlander was aiming at was:

"...a society organized on the basis of voluntary association and mutual cooperation, rather than limited democracy and authoritarianism. The ideal of
educating for citizenship in a fully free democracy is vastly different from the ideal of educating to serve a state…” (Adams, 1975, p. 205).

Horton admits that Highlander from the beginning had the explicit goal to contribute to a revolutionary change and to achieve economic democracy as well as a political democracy (Jacobs, 2003, p. 34).

When Horton (in a text from 1973) is developing his thoughts concerning democracy he writes that “a range of hitherto unfamiliar decision-making methods” should be developed and that they should “involve all those affected by the decisions being made” (Cited in Jacobs, 2003, p. 248). He also notes that education “is too important to be left in the hands of institutions and experts”. Radical educators, he suggests, should spend “half of his work time in the community” (p. 249). According to Horton the only way to work for radical changes in the educational system is “for educators to make alliances with as many likeminded people as they can”. (p. 250)

In the same text from 1973 Horton acknowledges the influences and inspiration from similar contexts and what the lessons are:

“We have learned from the folk schools in this country and abroad, from Paulo Freire and other like him, and from the great popular movements of this century that people become motivated when they are personally involved in processes relating directly to them and their life situations.” (ibid)

Among other sources that have supplied a background and been useful at Highlander, Horton mentions Marx that provided a perspective and at Highlander “we’ve always accepted a class analysis of society, and we know where we belong”. (p. 267) He is also clear about the historic role of the working class. At Highlander the attempts to “build some solidarity” might be the beginning of a process “that could lead to revolution”. (p. 269) To “get group solidarity and some cooperative spirit” is anyhow essential according to Horton (ibid).

The practical operation of the Highlander tradition is closely linked to the educational philosophy. Frank Adams (1975) writes that Horton became convinced that: "...the people, no matter, how poor or untutored, would know what they needed to learn, if he could only learn to listen to them and to translate what he heard into an educational program". (p. 24) From the beginning Horton had imagined that he would learn how to make decisions for the poor people but he then realised that “he should help people make their own decisions” (ibid).

In Horton’s own words, what they actually do at Highlander is “to build on what they identify as their own problems…get them to share experiences and…introduce information only if specifically requested to do so.” (Cited in Jacobs, 2003, p. 253)

It is very clear that Horton and the staff at Highlander were extremely cautious not to impose any knowledge on the participants. Horton explains this: “We think people become educated by analyzing their experience and learning from other people’s experiences, rather than saying there’s a certain body of knowledge that we need to give them.” (Cited in Jacobs, 2003, p. 34) Rather a quality that was cherished at Highlander seems to be the ability of the staff to teach their own capacity to learn.
Adams (1975) notes that a fundamental pedagogical idea applied at Highlander is to “learn from the people” and “start their education where they are” (p. 206). Another typical Highlander idea that is practised is described by Horton in the following way:

“Probably the most important thing we do for people is to have them participate in an actual democratic experience – a ripe experience where people are free to talk and make decisions, where there is no discrimination, and where their experience is valued.” (Cited in Jacobs, 2003, p. 49)

PAULO FREIRE AND HIS EMANCIPATING PEDAGOGY

Paulo Freire (1921-1997) is probably the most well-known and cited proponent for emancipating and conscientization pedagogy. He is also often referred to as one of the important contributors in the Action Research tradition (See e.g. Reason & Bradbury 2001).

In his first book in English, published in 1970 in New York, Paolo Freire supplies the base for the more general and philosophic groundings for his pedagogy. His own theoretical and practical work had started already in 1947 in Brazil where he developed it during the beginning of the 1960ies with support from the progressive government at that time. But as it also became dangerous with its focus on liberation and critical consciousness he was put in jail for revolutionary activity after the military coup in 1964. Very soon he was released but urged to leave the country. In Chile he then could further deepen his work and also write a book about his experiences in Brazil (In Portuguese in 1967 and in French in 1970). Next year, in 1968 his more general book was ready, but never printed in Portuguese, instead in English 1970 and in German in 1971.

With the publishing of “Pedagogy of the Oppressed” in 1970, Freire became an internationally recognised educational thinker who highlighted the relationship between education, politics, imperialism and liberation.

First of all Freire is very clear about the fact that education is never neutral. Either it is an instrument for the domestication and domination of man or an instrument for man’s liberation. A pedagogy of freedom focuses on making people aware of how social structures are used as instruments of power and violence.

One important concept in Freire’s writing is the culture of silence. In addition to the situation in the third world Freire points to that the majority of the citizens in the industrialised countries must also be considered to be enclosed in the culture of silence. Not least through public education the oppressed become victims of an “oppression of their minds” consisting of various myths. He describes what this means in “modern society”:

“Perhaps the greatest tragedy of modern man is his domination by the force of these myths and his manipulation by organised advertising, ideological or otherwise. Gradually, without even realising the loss he relinquishes his capacity for choice; he is expelled from the orbit of decisions.” (Freire, 1974, p. 6)
This calls for a demystifying work and a scientific criticism of reality that should be developed in cooperation between scientists and practitioners. A problem, however, that Freire points to is that many scientists have a limited and flawed picture of reality due to the continuing specialisation into clearly defined fields. This might narrow the area of knowledge and result in what he calls “specialisms”.

This demystifying work demands an alternative pedagogy:

“Our pedagogy cannot do without a vision of man and of the world. It formulates a scientific humanist conception which finds its expression in a dialogical praxis in which the teachers and learners together, in the act of analysing a dehumanising reality, denounce it while announcing its transformation in the name of the liberation of man. For this very reason, denunciation and annunciation in this utopian pedagogy are not meant to be empty words, but an historic commitment.” (Freire, 1970, p. 40)

Already from the beginning of his writing Paolo Freire was very clear about how to use ideas and what the needed requirements were for the involved educators.

“The problem oriented education does not and cannot serve the interests of the oppressors. No oppressive system would aloud the oppressed to ask the question: Why? Indeed only a revolutionary society can carry this kind of education through in a systematic way, but that does not mean that the revolutionary leaders need to take the whole power before they can use the method. In the revolutionary process the revolutionary leaders cannot use the bank method, as an interim action, legitimated by reasons of effectiveness and with the ambition to sooner behave in a genuine revolutionary way. They must be revolutionary – and I mean “dialogical” - from the beginning.” (Freire, 1970 p. 87, translated from the Swedish edition)

Another fundamental concept in Freire’s pedagogical thinking is of course: dialogue. This requires a strong faith in people, a faith which at the same time needs to be realistic in view of the existing conditions, but which must not for that matter forget the visionary aspect. Freire explains:

“Faith in man is an a priori requirement for dialogue…‘dialogical man’ is critical and knows that although it is within the power of men to create and transform, in a concrete situation of alienation men may be impaired in the use of that power.” (Freire, 1970, p. 60)

According to Freire dialogue is an encounter between individuals, mediated by the world, in order to name the world. A dialogue, then, cannot occur between those who wish to name the world and those who do not wish this naming. Another requirement is that both parties must practise humility. In addition to this Freire mentions hope and critical thinking as other prerequisites for a genuine dialogue. Without hope, you are resigned to a hopelessness characterised by a denial of and escape from the world. Critical thinking is related to action. For a critically thinking person, the continuing transformation of reality is the most important thing in the humanisation of man.
Hope is an important concept in Paulo Freire’s work and he comes back to it many times. He is very clear about the necessity never to give up hope and to always find something to change, however small, in order to keep struggling.

In the “third world” as well as in the so called western countries Freire’s work and writing has been used in alphabetisation as well as in different other ways to do liberating work. Not least has it inspired the folk high school movement in the Scandinavian countries. But is has also been misused, and reduced to a more general pedagogic idea about dialogue as a kind of “speech methodology” used in schools and other formalised educational settings. This has often resulted in a more “hidden pedagogy” in Bernstein’s terminology, and in that way must be regarded as an even more effective manipulation and domination.

**THE SWEDISH RESEARCH CIRCLE TRADITION**

The research circle tradition in Sweden emerged in the 1970ies as a result of a pilot program concerning university courses for trade union representatives (Nilsson, 1990). For the union people the study circle was well known and an important part of popular education in Sweden. During the same decade many radical changes took place in the society among other things new labour laws were passed (above all The Co-Determination Act and The Work Environment Act, both of 1977). The trade unions turned to Lund University for knowledge that could help them to use these laws. The research circles were invented as a kind of bridge between the more general university knowledge and the experiential knowledge of the unions and their members. Later this idea spread to other contexts.

A research circle can be described as a kind of study circle that is strengthened by the participation of one or more university researchers. This arrangement provides a tool for collective and democratic knowledge work and thus contributes to breaking the divide between researchers and researched. In contrast to the Horton and Freire traditions there is no single central person that has developed the research circle tradition. Rather it has been growing as a collective academic enterprise where an impressive number of researchers representing different disciplines and universities have contributed (See ALC, 1990).

A fundamental aspect of a research circle is the collective construction of knowledge. In principal it is a dialogue between two kinds of knowledge: the experiential and first hand contextual knowledge of the “practitioners” – e.g. trade union representatives, people from a certain workplace or a vocation on one hand and the scientific or theoretical knowledge of the university researcher(s) on the other hand. The mutuality of this dialogue is vital and it usually takes some time to establish the favourable group climate for this. It demands having respect for each other and the different competencies at hand. The ideal is to establish equality between all participants. Holmstrand and Härnsten (1992) note that the circle work might be described as a “collective construction of knowledge” where creative discussions may lead to results where it is “perfectly clear that no single individual (in the group), if ever so clever, would ever be able to reach as far as the group has in its collective process” (p. 241). Through this collective knowledge building what we have labelled *democratic knowledge processes* (Holmstrand & Härnsten, 1996) can occur. We also regard the research circle as a pedagogic tool to do research with and not on the people who are engaged in the problems at hand. For the participants in a research circle the experience of taking part of the knowledge work has often been an emancipating event. Research circles,
then, offer a humanistic and democratising approach where it is possible to contribute to the empowerment of those who want to change (Holmstrand & Härnsten, 1992, Härnsten, 1994a, Härnsten & Holmstrand, 2002). Bertil Lundberg (1997) describes the research circle from an empowerment perspective: “In its genuine form, grounded in popular movements, the research circle is a tool for underprivileged – a way for powerless people and groups to strengthen the control over their own conditions” (p. 63). He adds that this demands respect and humility and what a research circle needs is support and not pointers. Lundberg further notes that a research circle must be cherished and used sensibly. He admits that good results can be reached without “caring too much about its soul” but stresses that “under good conditions it can achieve amazing results” (ibid).

Who then can work as a researcher in this context? In a research circle the participants should have access to an abundance of knowledge resources. Therefore the researcher must be well acquainted with different theoretical traditions and know many other researchers. Another fundamental function is to make use of the critical and self-critical attitude towards all kinds of knowledge, not least knowledge produced by research. Further a deep knowledge about different research methodologies as well as emancipating pedagogy is needed. The researcher has a special responsibility to make sure that the experiences and perspectives of everyone are brought forward, to facilitate in finding the hidden knowledge and not least to connect the emerging body of knowledge to structural perspectives.

Lönnheden (1997) points to the many valuable competencies a researcher might bring to the circle:

“In addition to the theoretical knowledge and the possible practical knowledge a researcher can have in a subject area, he or she possesses a competence to summarise and develop categories, to lift secret or unimagined stones, put forward questions and hypotheses that perhaps frightens, tickles, provokes or pleases” (p. 33).

Certainly all this might be felt like putting to high demands on a single researcher, so these demands must be met collectively by a group of research persons. This also means that cooperation among researchers, often from different disciplines is absolutely necessary.

The practitioners contribute with their first-hand knowledge about the focused problem. The researcher(s) bring to the circle their knowledge from research that has relevance for the problem. They also contribute with their professional competence as researchers in dealing systematically with research problems, developing new knowledge and documenting the process. Further they have the function as members of the academic community to find colleagues from various disciplines that can contribute to the circle work with relevant research. In this way potentially all research in any field from any corner of the world could be accessible for the research circle. Not least importantly the researcher can bring the fundamental scientific attitude of being critical and at the same time self-critical. The special character of a research circle and its potential is probably well captured by Holmstrand, Härnsten and Isacson (1989) who describe it as:

“…a way to deal with problems that otherwise will receive no attention, either in union work or in research. The research circle liberates us from conventional structures, it is a new form, a kind of forum that provides a free space where we
may reflect both on everyday problems and on more universal matters. At best, new perspectives open up and the foundation of a new quest for knowledge is established. For all the circle participants (union representatives and researchers), the research circle means a possibility to leave the everyday work behind for a moment. It lets you step back and think about the situation. Under favourable conditions, the research circle can be a highly creative environment.” (Holmstrand et al, 1989, cited in Härnsten, 1994b, p. 15)

The research circle idea has in recent years been used in many different contexts and with various groups of participants. The format of these circles can be very tempting and there is an obvious risk that the radical potential can be lost. Recently we have unfortunately seen a number of uses, or even misuses, of the research circle idea where its fundamental elements are not present to any substantial degree.

CONCLUSIONS

What we find is that there is a considerable potential in these traditions and it should be possible to work in a Freire inspired way and in a Horton inspired way, but indeed adapted to the current time and contexts. A point we want to stress is that it should be an advantage to systematically make use of knowledge from research and also to do research about the issue at hand as well as about the collective knowledge building process and its conditions.

The research circles are potentially useful where there exist several thick layers of “ideological sludge” making it difficult to understand why there are such huge and growing gaps in economy, power, social status, health and so on between different groups of people. A considerable body of university research with research circles and also about the research circle processes has been established in Sweden (e.g. Wingård 1998, Holmstrand & Härnsten 2003, Andersson, 2007, Siljehag 2007, Härnsten & Wingård 2007).

In our three traditions there are various forms of working with people in a cooperative way leading to an increased consciousness of the power structures in the world around us. The only way of achieving a lasting change is to have trust in people in line with what both Freire and Horton emphasise. In our late-capitalist era where the power structures are very strong but at the same time more hidden than before a critical social science is of utmost importance. When the two just mentioned conditions are combined, emancipating and empowering tools like the research circle can provide an opportunity. The democratic knowledge processes that can take place in research circles will most probably produce unusually well grounded and therefore also sustainable knowledge.

The traditions discussed above are pedagogical and have made and can continue making important contributions to PAR as a new paradigm that is characterised by an extended epistemology and a radical democratic approach (cf. Reason & Bradbury, 2001). Without these characteristics it is questionable whether much of what is labelled Action Research is really different from more conventional research of various kinds.

So what then are the common characteristics in the traditions discussed above?
Firstly the focus must be on a real and vital social problem to know more about and to take action on. In all three traditions it becomes very obvious that there is a fundamental concern for people and the problems and challenges people are facing. The same concern is also very important in the action research paradigm.

Secondly some kind of connection to a social movement must be at hand. In all three traditions there is an explicit ambition to connect to different social movements even if it varies during time whether and to the extent this is possible. At Highlander this connection has been clearly manifested in the early days with the labour movement, later with the civil rights movements and today with e.g. the occupy Wall Street movement. Freire tried in northern Brazil, but had eventually to leave, his ideas has been used also many other places. At least in the beginning of the research circle tradition there was a very obvious connection to the trade union movement.

Thirdly a genuinely democratic attitude is characteristic of the educational activity. In all three traditions there are elaborated and radical ideas about democracy and the need for trying to transform society in its ground in a radically democratic direction.

Fourthly there is a pedagogical consciousness permeating the knowledge processes set in operation. Key concepts in all three traditions, just to mention a few, are: mutuality, dialogue, respect, hidden or silenced knowledge.

Another striking element is the extension of the educational aspect into a kind of researching activity including all participants. In the Horton and Freire traditions different kinds of investigating the current circumstances are apparent. Not least Horton used different methods to find useful facts and knowledge. Followers, e.g. John Gaventa, clearly promoted research activities and today Highlander is even called Research and Education Centre. The more explicit connection to research, however, is developed in the research circle tradition. Here it is even a prerequisite and a basic point in the tradition.

Finally, in each of the three cases the collective knowledge building characterising the work clearly either includes or inspires action.

It is apparent that an important foundation in all these traditions is a radical view of democracy that is considered necessary to build from the bottom up. Different times and different contexts put different demands on the forms and conditions needed to perform this grass-root democratising work.

From what we have just concluded it is obvious that there are close connections and interrelations between radical adult education traditions and PAR. And as a consequence it is often difficult and even unnecessary to draw the line between these activities. But there are several issues that need closer attention.

PAR is usually described as having roots in Freire’s pedagogy. Neither Freire nor Horton explicitly claim that what they do is research. It raises the question “is there any research done in these contexts?”. What does it mean to be a researcher? One important aspect must be trying to connect knowledge from scientific (wissenschaftlich) research with issues raised in practice. Another role of the researcher is to systematically investigate and document the knowledge work done. This is not a primary objective in adult education, but in
educational research which is concerned about knowledge building processes of different kinds. Not least should the conditions for genuinely mutual and democratic processes be scrutinised.

In PAR as well as in radical adult education, the participatory nature of the work aims at an extended epistemology which can only be achieved when the knowledge work is characterised by a truly democratic and collective dimension. When this is developed the dominant tendencies of today’s society are challenged.

In each of the three cases the collective knowledge building characterising the work clearly either includes or inspires action. It is only logical that the growing PAR paradigm has obvious roots in these radical adult education traditions. By engaging in the transition into this new and enlarged paradigm researchers would not only contribute to deliberating their own work but as well to developing the collective and democratic knowledge needed for change at all levels of our societies. And that – if anything – should be the role of adult education!

The experiences within radical adult education traditions as well as in PAR demonstrate the importance of having close relations to social movements. The climate at universities for research with democratising ambitions is today tougher than before. This makes the building of alliances and cooperation with forces outside the academy even more urgent. In Sweden SPARC (The Swedish Participatory Action Research Community) is developing links between universities and organisations like folk high schools, municipalities and new and old social movements. A major purpose is to establish a national doctoral program in “democratic knowledge and change processes” where the courses are open also for interested persons from the abovementioned organisations (see homepage: www.sparc.nu).

In principle adult education can, as pointed out in the radical traditions, either contribute to adaption or to change. The PAR paradigm, the radical education traditions and the global justice movement all share the belief that another world is possible – with more equality, justice and solidarity. They can all benefit from each other. In PAR the insights and experiences from radical adult education should be inspiring and useful. And in democratising radical adult education connections to research and researchers would provide material for more substantial knowledge building.

Acknowledgement: We wish to express our gratitude to our friends and colleagues Mary Brydon-Miller and Patricia Maguire who introduced us to the Myles Horton and Highlander tradition.

REFERENCES


ADULT LEARNING THROUGH PARTICIPATION IN THE ECONOMIC (AND POLITICAL) ENVIRONMENT

Kopecký, Martin
Charles University, Prague
Czech Republic

INTRODUCTION

The paper focuses on the issue of practice of democracy in the context of contemporary crisis. The current crisis, as every crisis indeed, presents an incentive for redefinition of key social institutions. This offers an opportunity to review the relationship of democracy, active citizenship, economy and especially of work with adult learning.

In recent decades, the mentioned areas were associated with learning; and in the mainstream education policy (represented by the OECD and EU, in particular), the learning was attributed a role in promoting economic objectives. The competitiveness in the global economy was the decisive priority.

It is the aim of this paper to bring attention to the alternative models of economy (and partly of politics) as sources of opportunities for learning democracy as well as development of individual identities.

The paper uses the principle of linking the ailment in one area to different areas. Disturbances in economy (labour market) present the source of disturbance in the sphere of citizenship. The development of economic rights and economic democracy may, on the other hand, become the source for strengthening the practice of democracy in a wider sense of the term. Such a process would substantially contribute to adult learning.

In the paper, I am avoiding the evaluation of individual economic and political models presented; I only consider them as incentives to learning. My interest does not focus on the consideration of their strengths and weaknesses.

1)

The paper attempts to point at the connection among the topics of economics, work and democracy, and the affinity of learning for and by work on one hand and the ability to participate in the political life on the other hand.

Today's time is – especially in the West – time of crisis. The crisis usually tends to be an impetus for the search of alternatives. The search for alternatives, polemics over their proposals and attempts to implement them become sources for learning. The crisis proves to provide a vigorous impetus for thinking about work and consumption not only as economic phenomena but also as cultural and political ones.

The search for alternatives to practices which did not prove successful in the past decades does not necessarily have to focus on entirely new ideas and approaches. In order to better
understand the relationship between work and learning, a source of inspiration may be found in the chapters of thought of remote history. These may often be a source of stimuli that may be updated.

The idea that labour is the source of self-creation of a man is not new. In its elaborate form in western tradition, it was popular mainly among the representatives of German classical philosophy of 18th and 19th century. Creative work was perceived as the source of freedom whereas alienation of labor was seen as the source of human suffering. Under certain circumstances, work may connect us with our fellow citizens but it may as well separate us from each other. At the same time, it may alienate us under certain circumstances from ourselves.

Among many classical authors dealing with the issue of (im)possibility of a combination of labour and freedom, e.g. Marx, Lafargue and Gramsci may be named. Study of modern history teaches us that the form of work is, in a long term, not only the subject matter of research of social thinkers but also of the participants of economic relations. E.g. Olesen (1996) shows the means by which industrial workers reflect their work experience and how this experience corresponds to learning and education.

Labour is a powerful agent of socialization, learning and education over a significant portion of the life of man. Significant social changes take place in connection with labour, which thus becomes the space for various social conflicts. The responsibility of social thinkers includes opening of issues, how the participants of such conflicts understand their causes, connections and their potential overcoming (Marcuse, 1991, p. 96–105).

2)

The term democracy belongs to the most frequently used words in the public arena. Yet, in connection with labour, the usage of this term seems problematic, perhaps much more so than e.g. in connection with the family or education. While in the family the imbalance historically typical of gender relations or relations between parents and children seems to be overcome in the long run (though slowly), the economy has been over decades typical for the increase of various inequalities and imbalances, including those in terms of power. This has also been one of the defining features of the neoliberal economic globalization.

In terms of the connection between labour and democracy, not only the issue of participation in the decision/making or access to the wealth produced seem crucial, but also the possibility to make use and develop one’s skills and bring about a self/fulfillment through work. Sennet (2006) mentions the significance of usefulness and craftsmanship. With a certain portion of simplification, we could compare the significance of both these terms related to labour with the crucial term of social theories of the end of the 20th century – recognition.

The term work is wider than the term labour, and the term economy is wider again than the term work. Let’s start with distinguishing the first two terms. Work may mean any activity corresponding to the long-term needs of the people in such a manner, that human energy is purposefully used for the production of certain goods or provision of services to other people. Work occurs where obligations are felt and where the need to coordinate human efforts arises. Such definition includes not only the activities located at the labour market, but also
work for affiliated persons – work in the household and voluntary work. In any of the above forms the fact is apparent that labor creates or changes social relations or at least complements the existing ones.

If I want to focus on the forms of work that may be described as alternative, it does not mean that I wish to avoid the labour market and follow e.g. voluntary work. My purpose is different. I would like to focus on the features that could be common to all forms of labor, although less typical of some, i.e. the elements of democracy and social responsibility. It is my ambition to point at the motive which does not come from the area of economic notions but in politics, and yet we can and often also wish to count on it in various fields of individual as well as social life. Only with difficulty can we find someone opposed to democracy as such and its development. Yet works dealing with the strongly understood motive of democracy in economics (e.g. Schweickart, 2002; Albert, 2012) contravene embedded ways of thought as well as the present mainstream of economics and politics. It must be added that the above authors also underline the issues of equality, solidarity and participation. In thus conceived economic democracy they perceive the solution of the pressing difficulties of contemporary economics or, as the case may be, the entire society.1

We do not participate in economic life only as producers but also as consumers. Not everyone is active as a producer but all of us consume to a smaller or larger degree. It would therefore seem that the defense of permeation of the two universal roles – the economic and civil ones - requires an extensive argumentation.

The fair trade movement seems to be a good example of a link between the behavior of consumers and citizens. It is remarkable for its ability to interconnect social, economic and ecological issues on a global scale (Sumner, 2008). Fair trade is based on the increase in consumer responsibility displayed in the form of particular choices, at best linked to other choices based on the same reasoning. Therefore an advanced form of this movement may lead to attempts to establish entire fair-trade organizations (e.g. schools) or communities (the idea of fair-trade towns).

Let’s take a brief notice in this connection of the phenomenon of common ownership and use of things. Sharing is widespread for example in the use of personal vehicles. Its effect is both economic (lowering of costs) and ecological.

Another example of the combination of consumer and political behavior may be perceived in the mass consumer movement, which – in reaction to a specific current issue – decide to boycott a certain corporation. Beck (2007) perceives in such an increase of consumer awareness a significant mark of the establishment of a global civil society.

Not only problems set in a specific time and place but also concepts oriented at the future (although presently implemented only to a marginal degree) become the subject-matter of activities on the border between politics and the economics. The concept of (unconditional) basic income (e.g. Van Parijs, 2007) may be considered remarkable. It is not without interest that in 2013 an all-European petition campaign has been under way to support the introduction of the unconditional basic income on the European level.

1 The idea of economic democracy based on participative approaches is not an entire novelty. The colorful tradition of cooperatives developing since the 19th century at the latest may be pointed at.
Discussions such as the one on the basic income, provide numerous incentives for learning. They provoke reconsideration of the forms of the fundamental attributes of modern society, such as the relationship between the government and the society, citizenship, work, social politics etc. It is not an exaggeration to say that polemics of this type inspire thinking about the basic development of civilization. Social theoretical issues prove to be very specific and frequently also personal. 

Meaningful learning reacting to the issues of development of civilization may be conceptualized by means of the Eyerman’s and Jamison’s (1991) model. The authors distinguish three levels of the cognitive praxis of social movements - cosmological, technological and organizational. On the first level, the main general goals are being dealt with: why a certain movement exists, what social change it seeks to bring about. Here, fundamental cultural disputes take place. On the second level, there is a debate over the particular goals to be achieved in order to bring about the general goals. At last, the third level focuses on the procedures to be used in order to achieve the goals set.

The idea of intentional termination of economic growth and transition to a society, which would prefer sustainability and life quality, may be considered an example of a complex issue requiring processing on all of the above three levels.

The concept of civic work speaks about the necessity to depart from certain important patterns of thought typical for the industrial society. The debate over civic work has been taking place for at least 20 years, and it discusses the motive of untenability of the idea of the only full-fledged form of work – i.e. as paid employment carried out in the environment of the labor market. Civic work presents work in other than market connections and ties it to social recognition.

Another remarkable example of an attempt to interconnect the solution of economic and political questions consists in the participatory budget concept. The concept rests on the possibility to exercise direct influence of the citizens on the preparation of public budgets, especially town (city) budgets. The citizens thus decide matters over which they do not have direct control in the electoral model of democracy. It is remarkable that participatory budgets are practiced in various cultural contexts – above all in Latin America and in the West (Villegas, Fragoroso, Florinto, 2009; English, Mayo, 2012).

If the so-called third sector – the organization of civil society – was on several occasions (e.g. by Putnam and his followers) labeled as the creator of social capital and school of democracy, there is no reason not to attach the same characteristic to phenomena such as the participatory budget.

---

2The issue of changes to education (of the adults) in case of introduction of basic income would certainly provide enough material for a separate treatise. We can speculate, whether the life standard guaranteed would release opportunity and desire for personal development and self-fulfillment by means of various forms of learning. Would it then be possible to (at last) reap the fruits of development of civilization as (under specific conditions) foreseen e.g. in the theories of post-industrial society of leisure-time society? Would the basic income bring an incentive to leave work as a mere necessity for survival? Could adult learning, which may without exaggeration be considered an important achievement of civilization and the hope of modern-type society, undergo a steep progress?
So far, I have focused on education and learning as something accompanied by or initiated by economic and political activities. Now, there is an opportunity to draw from the “core” of thought on the meaning of adult education. I would like to refer to the selected contributions on the conceptualization of possibilities and tasks of education (of adults) as an agent of social changes. I will rely on material from the period of initial consideration of the political concept of lifelong education as well as on the thoughts on the contents of the concept of lifelong learning.

The early 1970s were strongly inclined to general reflections on democratization in education as well as in the society at large. The development of democracy should have been the crucial goal of adult education, then conceptualized as a crucial part of lifelong education. Lifelong education should have helped to deal with all the crucial challenges of its time: political, cultural as well as environmental. Economic questions were not postulated frequently, or at least not as central ones. Still the 1970s may be inspiring thanks to their typical emphasis on the development of community life, social justice and ability to participate in the public life. The ideas of the Faure report have not been fulfilled, but that does not disqualify the ideals contained therein, although they were presented with a large degree of boldness, and maybe even naivety (Boshier, 1998; Finger, Asún, 2001).

Illich has then played the role of a remarkable and extremely influential thinker. His ideas from this period were based on the request for a fundamental social change that would overcome the ailing of the bureaucratized society. Changes in the fields of education and learning should help the broader social transformation. The emphasis on spontaneity, participation and lack of hierarchy, ability to associate as well as the development of skills through engagement and experience make the author’s heritage still living (Finger, Asún, 2001). Learning is understood by him as something quite natural and inseparable from social relations. Illich’s expectation of a whole-scale social change is an aspect difficult to transfer to our context. Presently, we are more likely to follow the parallel existence of many alternative ways of community life which, at least in the West, do not present any perspective of a whole-scale social change. Yet their ideological orientation still fulfills Illich’s ideal of an active community and sharing. The movement using the Local Exchange Trading System (LETS) may serve as a good example here.

The period of the 1990s was typical for an enormous political emphasis on learning, which should have become one of the basic axes of reaction to the process of globalization. The process of globalization has to a large degree taken place the same way as the ascent of global capitalism. Policies including the policy of lifelong learning promoted by international organizations and countries focused on the ability to succeed in the global economic competition. To put it in short, economics has become the imperative of politics.

The emphasis on success in the market became decisive for the interpretation of the meaning of learning, while the issue of economic democracy was not underlined. The goal of active citizenship was linked to other spheres than labor and consumption. Although

---

3 It would be imprecise to say that the relationship between economics and democracy was not discussed at all; such discussions however took place rather in the field of research than educational policy.
emphasis was put on competences useful in various areas of life, they were understood with typically economic biases (Illeris, 2009). Another remarkable approach is the division of adult education to vocational and the rest, i.e. non-vocational (Eurydice, 2007).

It is possible to formulate a requirement of withdrawal from the sharp distinguishing of learning for the field of work and for the field of citizenship. The relationship between work and education is not limited to vocational education and training (VET). At the same time, the thesis that social movements would resign on economic issues has not been proven.

The phenomenon of citizenship includes also economic citizenship, and democracy involves its economic level. Therein probably rests an enormous and still only scarcely captured room for learning.

4)

The research of adult education and learning in connection to the forms of economics and politics may be developed in two ways. The first is historical and the second focuses on the present. Both ways may follow two levels: the level of programmes (ideas) and the empirical level focused on the research of learning.

The second level relates to the relationship between activities developing the participation of citizens in various forms of democracy in economics and politics. It stems from the belief that participation is closely linked to learning, and that the change of social conditions of life bring about the change of conditions for learning.

The main goals of the intended research consists in capturing the remarkable forms of informal learning linked to the sphere on the border between economic and political life. Up to the present, the topic of economics and informal learning has been most frequently discussed in connection with the development of competencies, employability and competitiveness (Fejes, Olesen, 2010). The topic of alternative economic models however permits the search for bridging the sphere of economics and social movements, while local as well as global occurrences may be followed. The research of the development of alternatives on the local level permits the focus on the networking of the bringers of alternatives, on regional, national and transnational levels.

The research of activists of the above movements and the ways of communication applied by the movements to address the public seems to be of particular interest.

5) CONCLUSION

The ideas of the development of adult and lifelong education frequently bore utopian traces. The term utopian frequently bears negative connotations for us. At the same time, we can understand it as an important part of culture and a source of social dynamics (Mannheim). Utopias help to promote progress; e.g. certain parts of our usual ideas of democracy or human rights used to be utopian at their time.
Education (of the adults) is an activity aimed at the future. It reacts to contemporary human needs. At the end of the third quarter of the 20th century, it may have seemed that the social conflicts related to labor and economics lose their significance. Consequently, it was necessary to modify such expectations. The significance for adult education of economic issues interrelated with political, social and environmental issues, is undeniable.

Further research should focus on how these issues are articulated in the society as they become a part of the educational dynamics.

REFERENCES


Euroepan Citizens’ Initiative for an Unconditional Basic Income
http://basicincome2013.eu/
About Parecon
http://www.zcommunications.org/topics/parecon/
Degrowth Magazine
http://en.demagazine.eu/
ABSTRACT

This paper aims at presenting the research on the adult education field in Portugal during the last decade and some characteristics of certain invisible colleges, “networks where ideas grow and results are communicated” (Larsson, 2010, p. 98), actors who exert influence on the (re)construction of scientific knowledge. In this work of a comprehensive epistemological nature, a qualitative methodology was adopted. The focus was on two research techniques: document analysis (Sousa, 2005) and content analysis (Bardin, 2009). 72 documents were analyzed.

The main findings of this study emphasize that: i) some invisible colleges in Portugal are concerned with national and international public policy, learning in adulthood, etc., while others show a particular interest in issues of local development; and ii) debates can be found that do not fit the production of the “main invisible colleges” and therefore seem to be far removed from the most dealt with domains of scientific knowledge.

UNESCO AND THE EU: CONTRIBUTIONS TOWARDS THE CONSTRUCTION OF THE FIELD OF ADULT EDUCATION

With the end of World War II adult education flourished. The context of economic development, alongside with the changes which the war had imposed upon the world at large, were key factors to this development. Actually, it was in this post-war setting that those which would become the general lines of adult education began to take shape, thus giving rise to several different practices and discourses.

According to Rosanna Barros (2011a, p. 95) “it was after the establishment of the United Nations (UN) and its several specialized agencies that adult education has become a noticeably more specific field of educative action at the international level”. It was, in fact, in this context that the influence on adult education of one international agency in particular, UNESCO, became manifest.

Since then UNESCO has been organizing and stimulating several events (such as the International Conferences on Adult Education) which “(...) involved the participation of representatives of the member states and aimed to define international education policies and to influence the content of national policies” (Lima & Guimarães, 2011, p. 113). Indeed, these events have contributed decisively to adult education, both at the level of its growth and expansion and in the way it has been reflected upon during the last decades; not only through the events which have just been mentioned, but also for their commitment to a humanist adult education imprinted in such key-documents as i) the Faure Report (Faure et al., 1972), published in 1972, and the Delors Report (Delors et al., 1996), published in 1996.
Besides UNESCO, the European Union has also been showing an ever-increasing interest in education, as well as, lately, in adult education, even though these are not central items in its agenda (Lima & Guimarães, 2011, p. 70). As a matter of fact, the interest of the EU in adult education, particularly as far as lifelong learning is concerned, has grown in importance, thus strongly influencing education and the field of adult education. In this context two relevant documents to the establishment and shaping of the field of adult education were issued: i) ‘A Memorandum on Lifelong Learning’ (Commission of the European Communities, 2000); and ii) ‘Adult learning: it is never too late to learn’ (Commission of the European Communities, 2006).

To sum up, the importance of the two aforementioned organizations to the shaping of the field of adult education is undeniable. However, this role has suffered several changes throughout the years as the emphasis on skills, qualifications, recognition and validation of experiential learning, productivity and competitiveness has been increasingly stressed, particularly by the EU, always with the preservation and creation of employment in mind (Lima & Guimarães, 2011, p. 108).

DEVELOPMENTS IN ADULT EDUCATION SINCE 1974: INFLUENCES UPON THE UNDERSTANDING OF AN AREA OF REFLECTION AND PRACTICES

In the Portuguese context the history of adult education before 1974 reveals some public policies concerned with giving basic instruction and remedial education, as well as non-formal education. However, the year of 1974 constitutes a landmark, since the new regime has come to show more democratic political orientations.

A long path has been walked in the field of adult education in Portugal. Since 1974 several initiatives have been undertaken, from which the following can be highlighted: i) The Plano Nacional de Alfabetização e Educação de Base de Adultos (PNAEBA) (1979), ii) the Lei de Bases do Sistema Educativo (LBSE) (1986), iii) the Agência Nacional de Educação e Formação de Adultos (ANEFA) (1999-2002), iv) the Direcção-Geral de Formação Vocacional (DGFV) (2002-2006) and v) the Iniciativa Novas Oportunidades (2005-2011).

Bearing in mind the influence exerted by international organizations and considering the discontinuity of public policies in the field of adult education in Portugal it is possible to grasp the complexity which characterizes it and has dictated its constant (re)construction. Just as it is the case internationally, also in Portugal changes can be perceived to have occurred throughout the years. Skills and qualifications, as well as the recognition, validation and certification of skills have come to dominate political discourses and to gradually guide/set the limits of the action of the actors.

METHODOLOGICAL NOTES

This article, the result of a qualitative research (exploratory case-study) supported by document research (Sousa, 2005) and by theme/category-guided content-analysis (Bardin, 2009), aims at presenting the research carried out in the field of adult education in Portugal during the last decade, as well as certain features of some invisible colleges.
Realizing the impossibility of encompassing the whole of the academic production that can be found in the field, we have chosen five criteria that have been used as guides to a procedure of intentional sampling (Almeida & Pinto, 1975) and which have enabled us to build a corpus of documents: i) publication (documents published in book form with origination in doctoral and master’s theses, and articles, published in journals from the educational area); ii) nationality of the author (works written by Portuguese authors); iii) language of publication (works written in European Portuguese); iv) date of publication (works published between 2000 and 2011, including these dates); and v) place of publication (works published in Portugal). With these criteria in mind we have worked with a corpus of documents composed of 72 documents: 21 books and 51 articles.

In order to be able to study the aforementioned documents we have built an analysis framework bearing in consideration the proposals put forward in ‘Documentos Preparatórios III’ (Lima et al., 1988) and in the book ‘Educação de Adultos. Um Campo e uma Problemática’ (Canário, 2008). This framework of analysis, let that be clear, aims solely at systematizing and understanding the above mentioned documents; documents which constitute reflections upon, or enquiries into, specific themes and/or issues.

In accordance with this, the analysis framework concerning the field of adult education thus put forward includes five subfields (themselves made up of several sectors). That is:

i) In the subfield of policies/orientations we include: the analysis of the orientations for adult education emanating from international organizations such as UNESCO, the EU or the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), among others; national public policies; the policies and orientations of companies and/or CSO/NGO’s with respect to education, training and learning;

ii) In the subfield of the contexts/organisations/projects with educational aims, we include the analysis of formal education organizations (school); non-formal educational organizations; and projects and initiatives with educational aims;

iii) In the subfield of actors/individuals we include analyses of the educator, trainer, (sociocultural) animator, teacher, etc., of adults, the learner, trainee, student, participant, etc.; and other types of individuals;

iv) In the subfield of educational practices we include analyses of basic instruction/schooling/literacy (basic education), (lifelong) professional training; local development/(sociocultural) animation/extensive education; and the recognition and validation of knowledge acquired through experience;

v) In the subfield of themes we include general analyses, such as citizenship, learning or experiential training, i.e., non-specific issues that, for that very reason, don’t fit into any of the aforementioned subfields.

To sum up, the field of adult education as it is understood in the present work includes different subfields, from policies/orientations to educational practices. However, and importantly, even though we have built an organized framework of analysis, the possibility of hybridization between the various subfields has not been ruled out; that is, some of the documents studied actually deal with issues which are common to more than one subfield.
A GLOBAL VIEW ON THE SELECTED DOCUMENTS

The results of the research carried out have allowed us to identify several revealing aspects of the reflection on, and academic production of, the field. This article favours the analysis of i) the central themes of the works; ii) the authors with more works selected to the corpus of documents; iii) the authors who are most often quoted or referred to; iv) the documents which are most often quoted or referred to; v) the allocation of financial means to the works; vi) the place where the works have been published.

Central themes of the works

As it is easy to realize from an analysis of Table 1 the works carried out in the field of adult education in Portugal during the last decade mirror its heterogeneity and complexity. Actually, and at odds with what one could expect, among the 113 references identified solely in the subfield reserved to works on contexts/organisations and/or projects with educational aims have we been able to distinguish a noticeable difference (only 13 references) when compared to the other subfields. As for the subfield of policies/orientations, 30 references were identified; in the subfield of actors/individuals, 27; in the subfield of educational practices, 22; and in the subfield of themes, 21.

It is nevertheless important to highlight at least four sectors within the subfields which display more references: i) policies/orientations – national (17); policies/orientations – supranational (12); iii) actors/individuals – other individuals (12); and iv) educational practices - recognition of knowledge acquired through experience (11). Furthermore, it should be kept in mind that some of the works aren’t solely focused on only one sector of a subfield: some of them have shown clear traces of thematic hybridization.
### Table 1: Number of works per author

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subfields</th>
<th>Sectors</th>
<th>Number of references</th>
<th>Subtotal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Policies/Orientations</td>
<td>Supranational</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Nacional</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Companies</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contexts, Organizations and/or</td>
<td>Non-formal education organizations</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Projects with educational aims</td>
<td>Formal education organizations</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Projects, initiatives and/or activities</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Actors/Individuals</td>
<td>Educator, trainer, (sociocultural)</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>animator, teacher</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Learner, trainee, student, participant</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Other types of individuals</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational practices</td>
<td>Instruction/schooling/literacy (basic education)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(Lifelong) professional training</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Local development/</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(sociocultural) animation/</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>extensive education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Recognition and validation of</td>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>knowledge acquired through experience</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Themes</td>
<td>Learning</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Experiential training</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Citizenship</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Participation/Parental education</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Educational models</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Equal opportunities</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(Subjectiv) welfare</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Gender studies</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Reflexivity</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>113</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

On table 2 one can see the distribution of the selected works in relation to their respective authors. This table contemplates all the documents (seventy-two), i.e., books and articles. As one can tell, among the selected works and their 68 different authors, the authors with the highest number of works are Cármen Cavaco (5 with exclusive authorship), Armando Loureiro (5 – 3 with exclusive authorship and 2 in co-authorship) and António Simões (5 – 3 with exclusive authorship and 2 in co-authorship).
Table 2: Authors most often quoted or referred to

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author’s name</th>
<th>Number of works</th>
<th>Single author</th>
<th>Co-author</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alcoforado, Luís</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amiguinho, Abílio</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barros, Rosanna</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cavaco, Cármen</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cristóvao, Artur</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ferreira, Joaquim Armando</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fragoso, António</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lima, Licínio C.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lima, Margarida</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loureiro, Armando</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matos, Armanda</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montenegro, Mirna</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oliveira, Albertina</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pinheiro, Maria do Rosário</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pires, Ana Luísa</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Silvestre, Carlos Alberto</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Simões, António</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Veloso, Esmeraldina</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outros</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>49</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The analysis carried out has enabled us to understand the following global data about the 72 selected works. We have identified: i) 3798 authors – 933 of them Portuguese (24.57 %), 2722 of them foreigners (71.67%) and 143 associations/others (3.77%); and ii) 9193 references to works in bibliographies – 3492 works written by Portuguese authors (37.99%), 5112 works written by foreigners (55.60%) and 589 works by associations/others (6.41%).

As far as the authors who are most often quoted or referred to are concerned, it is important to stress the number of references to works by Licínio C. Lima (178), Alberto Melo (133) and Rui Canário (122). Regarding this, one can see Table 3, which displays the results attained with the analysis we have carried out.
Table 3: Works most often quoted or referred to

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Number of references</th>
<th>National author</th>
<th>Foreign author</th>
<th>Association/Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Licínio C. Lima</td>
<td>178</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alberto Melo</td>
<td>133</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rui Canário</td>
<td>122</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paulo Freire</td>
<td>108</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boaventura S. Santos</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Augusto Santos Silva</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>António Nóvoa</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Luís Rothes</td>
<td>64</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stephen Stoer</td>
<td>61</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>José Alberto Correia</td>
<td>59</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Almerindo Janela Afonso</td>
<td>57</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ana Benavente</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>António Simões</td>
<td>45</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pierre Bourdieu</td>
<td>42</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marie-Christine Josso</td>
<td>38</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gaston Pineau</td>
<td>37</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ana Oliveira Pires</td>
<td>36</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anthony Giddens</td>
<td>36</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paula Guimarães</td>
<td>36</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peter Jarvis</td>
<td>36</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNESCO</td>
<td>79</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comissão Europeia/Comissão das Comunidades Europeias</td>
<td>62</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OCDE</td>
<td>45</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANEFA</td>
<td>42</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assembleia da República – Programas de Governos Institucionais</td>
<td>42</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>25</td>
<td>1636</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

At this point, and since it seems more interesting to focus our attention on a more restricted group that may allow us to effectively understand which works are responsible for the constructed and reconstructed theoretical mould of the field of adult education, we have opted only for the works in which the number of references identified is above or equal to ten. Thus it was possible to identify 16 bibliographic references: i) 10 from works by Portuguese authors, ii) 3 from works by foreign authors and iii) 3 from works by associations or others.

As can be seen in Table 4 there are three works which stand out from the others: one by Rui Canário (23), one by Paulo Freire (23) and another one by Augusto Santos Silva (20).
As far as the financial means allocated to the works are concerned it was possible to identify 15 references in the 72 selected works. Through the analysis of these references we were able to discriminate four institutions/entities/programmes responsible for the allocation of financial means. Among these institutions/entities/programmes, the one that more evidently stands out is the Fundação para a Ciência e a Tecnologia (10), for the contrast discernible on table 5.
Table 5: The place of publication

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institution/Entity/Program responsible for funding</th>
<th>Number of references</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FEDER/POCTI SFA 160 490</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fundação Calouste Gulbenkian</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fundação para a Ciência e a Tecnologia</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRODEP</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>15</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In relation to the place where the works we have selected were published, and as stated on table 6, 9 different cities have been found: an important number of them were published in Lisbon (26) and in Coimbra (24), with an interesting number of publications both in Braga (8) and in Porto (8).

Table 6: Invisible colleges in the field of adult education

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Locality</th>
<th>Number of selected works</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Braga</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cascais</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coimbra</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lisboa</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mangualde</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Porto</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Santiago de Compostela (Spain)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vialonga</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xátiva (Spain)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Without reference to the place of publication</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>72</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to Staffan Larsson (2010) it is possible to identify networks through which researchers publicize their work and engage in dialogue with their peers, that is, invisible colleges. Invisible colleges, on the one hand, i) exert a strong pressure on the researchers, thus accurately mirroring the (in)equalities and (dis)similarities between them; on the other hand, they assume a crucial role in divulging scientific knowledge, since they ruthlessly regulate which works are worthy of distinction and which works are not.

For this author there are some indicators to bear in mind which enable us to identify the limits, or borders, of invisible colleges within the field of adult education and thus to get to understand them: i) publications and quotes, as instruments to gauge the reputation of researchers and drivers of an economy of publications and quotes; ii) the allocation of financial means, important to this enquiry due to the fact that there are discrepancies between different regions of a country, different regions of Europe and different regions of the world; (iii) the language, since authors who publish their work in English are more likely to be read and studied, being consequently more likely to be quoted and to get credit for their work; and iv) geographic location, as a determining factor of the easier/more difficult access to published works as well as to the possibility of making scientific knowledge public.
Some notes on the Portuguese reality

With this framework as a basis it is possible to identify certain *invisible colleges* and to put forward a few statements about them. To underlie what we’ve just said, we shall give two examples of two *invisible colleges* in the *field* of adult education in Portugal: i) a nationwide one, built around the allocation of financial means and moulded by it; and ii) a regional one, revolving around a particular object or theme of study, which resorts to specific individuals and to characteristic methods.

In relation to the first *college*, whose definition is limited or circumscribed by the allocation (or not) of financial means, some of its features are its noticeable tendency to back works originating in doctoral theses (despite the fact that some research projects have been backed as well⁴) as well as to integrate authors who correspond to one or more of the following attributes: i) being authors whose work is gradually getting more credit in the *field* and who already possess a vast array of published works (see on table 1, as an example of this, the case of Armando Loureiro); and/or ii) being authors who have been assisted by researchers of recognized merit (see Rosanna Barros’s works, 2011a, 2011b, assisted by Licínio C. Lima; or Carmén Cavaco, 2002, 2009, assisted by Rui Canário)⁵. In addition to what has already been said, the fact that these works tend to be published in Lisbon (7 out of 15) or Coimbra (5 out of 15) is yet another feature of this *invisible college*.

As for the second *college* it is possible to identify it through the following features: i) the fact that it favours as its object of study, or theme, the well-being of the adult/aged person; ii) its works being published exclusively in Coimbra, having it been impossible to spot them in any other journal or book in the *corpus* of documents we have studied; iii) having cross-sectional or experimental studies as its base; and iv) favouring the use of tests, scales and questionnaire surveys (see the works of Lima *et al.*, 2001, Simões *et al.*, 2003, and Lima, Oliveira & Godinho, 2011).

This *college*, as can be inferred from the data on tables 3 and 4, doesn’t fit into any of the major *colleges* in the *field*. On the one hand it doesn’t contribute with any of the publications which are most often quoted or referred to in the selected works; on the other hand, among the authors associated with it, such as, for instance, António Simões, Luís Alcoforado, Albertina Oliveira, Margarida Pedroso Lima, Joaquim Armando Ferreira, only the first is among the authors who are most often quoted or referred to.

**FINAL THOUGHTS**

*Invisible colleges*, taken as strongly regulated networks aimed at the dissemination of scientific knowledge which are continuously constructed and reconstructed by the actors and their (inter-)relations thus directly and indirectly affect the struggles which take place in the academic milieu (Larsson, 2010). They thus clearly contribute to the delimitation of what should be favoured or set aside (Edwards & Usher, 1998). In other words, these actors are responsible for the maintenance or destruction of the “sphere of promotion of scientific culture” (Machado & Conde, 1988; Conceição *et al.*, 2008) of the *field*, an autonomous universe of specific relations (Bourdieu, 2011). As a matter of fact, changes in the tendencies of enquiry and the developments of academic production in this *field* (re)create themselves around *invisible colleges*. 
In accordance with what has been said, there seem to be supporting conditions to affirm that there are some networks of actors, even though the empirical base of the present work does not allow us to discern clearly how close these networks are. In fact, the faint connections between national contexts and their actors and interests amount for a small part of the difficulties, the biggest complication lying in the facts that adult education is not a discipline with a clearly defined object of study and that there isn’t a journal specifically dedicated to this field in Portugal, as stated by Larsson (2010). As a consequence the habit of publishing works in journals which are different in focus, such as sociology journals or journals on education at large has taken roots, thus creating problems for adult education. Staffan Larsson (2010, p. 108) corroborates this idea and states that “with this comes short-sightedness – one can always open new connections and leave old ones, not caring much about the research fields and its development since there are several actor-networks, weakly connected and somewhat like amoebas”.

In conclusion, the present work enables us to understand a little better the research in the field of adult education in Portugal during the last decade. In truth, it hints at the fact that it follows the lines of thought disseminated both by UNESCO (for example in the emphasis this organization lays on the individualization of processes and on the importance of non-formal education) and the EU (particularly, among others, as far as the recognition of knowledge acquired through experience is concerned). Additionally, many works adhere to critical approaches, reflecting some historical developments in adult education in Portugal since 1974. Among these, many of those which deal with the analysis of public policies.

ENDNOTES

1 The magazines selected for this work were: i) Educação, Sociedade & Culturas; ii) Educação: Temas e Problemas; iii) Investigar em Educação; iv) Revista de Educação; v) Revista Lusófona de Educação; vi) Revista Portuguesa de Educação; vii) Revista Portuguesa de Pedagogia; and viii) Sísifo.

2 Here we fit all the authors of whom we have selected one work only. Among them can be found: Mariana Gaio Alves, José Pedro Amorim, Alexandra Aníbal, Patrícia Ávila, Fátima Barbosa, Cristina Barcoso, Alda Bernardes, Ana Paula Caetano, Rui Canário, Mário Caramujo, Inês Coelho, Luísa Dornellas, Ana Sousa Ferreira, Fernando Ilídio Ferreira, José Luís Ferreira, Isabel Freire, Teresa Freire, Maria Filomena Gaspar, Patrícia Godinho, Paulo Granjo, Paula Guimarães, Andreia Jorge, Maria Clara Keating, Justino Magalhães, Helena Marchand, Joaquim Marques, Teresa Medina, Alberto Melo, Madalena Mendes, Peres Monteiro, M. Alfredo Moreira, Paula Morgadinho, Lurdes Nico, Cristina Nogueira, Natércia Pacheco, Elisabete Passarinho, José Américo Pereira, Helena Quintas, Maria da Conceição Ramos, Natália Ramos, Miguel Ribeiro, Luís Rothes, Teresa Sarmento, Mafalda Seoane, Ana Maria Silva, Manuela Terasêca, Hélder Touças, Maria Márcia Trigo e Vanessa Veríssimo.

3 We here consider all the works produced by entities, national and international, such as, for example, UNESCO, OECD, European Commission, ANEFA, etc.

4 Regarding this, see the works of Margarida Pedroso Lima et al. (2001) and António Simões et al. (2003).

5 Note that both Rosanna Barros and Carmén Cavaco are also authors who have gradually been gaining credit in the field.
REFERENCES


615


**OTHER REFERENCES**


Németh, Balázs
University of Pécs
Hungary

ABSTRACT

This paper will demonstrate how research work on the history of Hungarian adult education has evolved in the last two decades according to major research themes and problem areas to reflect distinguished trends and issues of adult education research within changing contexts and environment. Also, the paper will underline some key particularities of the rise and fall of research work on the history of adult education in Hungary.

INTRODUCTION

Hungarian adult education dramatically changed through the making of an open society and market economy (Németh, 1989) and, also, favoured some particular research dimension having been accelerated by international organisations, such as UNESCO, the OECD and, likewise, the newly emerging European Union in between the economy, employability and the community/society, citizenship. Hungary, by becoming an associated member of the EU, opened ways to new ways of adult education and training, thereby, enabled research and development work to help adults finding their careers, identities, values either individually or through their communities. Many former structures of adult education, like the folk high-school, could rise and expand their mission (Sz. Tóth, 2002), on the other hand, second chance schooling fell back and almost faded away after 1990 to leave behind fifty years of adult schooling (Bajusz, 2005).

It is essential to point upon the roles and values of some distinguished research schools to settle their trends and issues which have influenced major research works based upon, for example, the Durkó-school to frame cultural roles and functions of adult education (Durkó, 1998; 1999) together with an expanding use of comparative approaches by Maróti (Maróti, 1998)

On the other hand, an important role of László Felkai must be considered referring to significant analysis and reflections to connect educational policy research and that of the history of adult education in the context of how adult education and/or training became an integral part of educational, employment or cultural policies and related thinking in modern Hungary after 1867 (Felkai, 1998a; 1998b). From the beginning of the 1990s, Felkai provided, in several papers, an accurate description of the evolution of institutionalisation of adult education and related movements of particular social groups and strata from 1850 to 1950. One should also note that this kind of historiography was not new in all terms, since Pál Soós from the University of Debrecen (Soós, 1998), Andor Maróti from Eötvös University (Maróti, 1992, 1998) and László Harangi (Harangi, 1998) turned attention to the history of Hungarian adult education and called for particular research work in the field. Gyula Csoma
was, interestingly, an advocate of *research work on workers’ schools and second chance schooling* which reached its peak in the 1970s Hungarian adult education and was incorporated to the mainstream school-policy in socialist Hungary until 1985-88 (Csoma - Gellért, 1963)

**MAJOR PHASES OF HUNGARIAN ADULT EDUCATION RESEARCH WORK - SIX PERIODS OF RESEARCH-WORK IN HUNGARIAN ADULT EDUCATION SO AS TO SIGNAL THE CHANGE AND DEVELOPMENT OF MODERN ADULT EDUCATION RESEARCH**

- **Period I.** – The beginning and early phase of Hungarian adult education research work (1962 – 1973)
- **Period II.** – Special focus on the relation amongst adult education, ideology and labour. The emergence of culture and science oriented adult education research work with more emphasis on emerging trends and issues of adult education in a rather international context (1973 – 1985)
- **Period III.** – The phase of new routes and closer relation to Western Europe and the outer world. An impact of UNESCO CONFINTÉA IV and other international research cycles to accelerate systematic adult education research. Revival of the Hungarian folk high-school movement (1985 - 1991)
- **Period IV.** – Hungary became an associated member of the EC/EU. Hungarian adult education research got closer to comparative research, to European research issues in social sciences with interdisciplinary dimensions. The impact of scientific networking, conferences and adult education associations/institutions. An impact of the rise of adult education research (EAEA; IIZ-DVV; UNESCO UIL, History of Adult Ed. Internat. and Central European Conference Series on AE, etc.) (1993 – 2000)
- **Period V.** - Preparations for EU Membership – Even closer ties towards the EU and other international organisations/institutions. Intensive participation in comparative adult education research and development work during the so-called ‘Lisbon-decade’ through several European programmes and Lifelong Learning initiatives to focus on adult learning (e.g. FP, Erasmus, Grundtvig, Leonardo, etc. (2000 – 2010)
- **Period VI.** - A slow fall-back of adult education research in Hungary as part of international trends. Limited holistic, more reductionist approaches in research work with constantly emerging focus on labour market, skills and employment related impacts. Complementary orientation to spatial structures (e.g. learning cities/regions and learning communities) and the reconfiguration of citizenship. (2010 –

**THE ROLES AND IMPACTS OF THE FIRST THREE PERIODS UNDER COMMUNIST RULE**

The first period I indicated clearly demonstrates that communist Hungary followed a post-war wave of democratization of schooling, therefore, it had to open way to the reorganisation of schools and secondary schools for adults in a more democratic manner five years after the revolution against Soviet Russia in 1956. This era generated a start of a more critical mind in
social sciences, psychology and sociology and allowed particular networking towards western scientific groups. It was Mátyás Durkó who in the 1960s used the German model of andragogy in a particular context so as to underline the role of adult education in the modernisation of cultural organisations and institutions through pedagogical and andragogical research both in theoretical and in practical dimensions. Durkó established a special school for the research and development of adult education at the University of Debrecen in the late 1960s and combined his approach with folklore, sociology, history, psychology and pedagogy. The thirty-years functioning of the Durkó-school definitely helped the modernisation of the theory and practice of Hungarian adult education and, finally, set a frame of cultural roles and functions of adult education (Durkó, 1999).

Gyula Csoma, in the same period, started the critical analysis of the evolution of second chance schooling and, later on, turned his attention to the conditions of successful adult learning, therefore, underlined the necessity of effectively constructed curricula for adult learners (Csoma, 1998.) Kálmán Benő, on the other hand, analysed the struggles for development of school-education of adults in the short post-war years of free cultural education (szabad művelődés) from 1945 to 1948. (Benő, 1970). This period was dominated by formal learning of adults and indicated a clear need for ideology-based structures and methods in adult education. Simultaneously, an outstanding attention towards the reconfiguration of cultural life and the modernisation of culture-based education accelerated some alternative forms and routes of expression, thoughts which welcomed those particularly new waves in philosophy, performing arts, sociology and newly rising critical thoughts in educational philosophy coming from the West. The impact of 1968 and other anti-war youth movements called for a more critical mind in research.

This period established the need for developing not just structures/infrastructures, but also, the rights and actions for a more democratic society which, for example, resulted in the initiative of ‘Citizens' Europe’. Eventually, the period itself was intellectually inspiring for outlining further research in the history of adult education with a more comparative approach so as to focus on actual trends and issues in a rather internationally bipolar environment.

The second period of Hungarian adult education research was dominated both by emerging labour oriented trainings for workers in a world of missing labour market and adult schooling, complemented by a more holistic world of culture and scientific dissemination. All those areas of adult education work demonstrated state-owned institutions and organisations to systematically control adult education, training and cultural activities based on state monopoly and need opposite to any grass-route initiatives, struggles. The period was abnormally operated and all educational processes generated alternative ways of expression of thoughts and ideas and led to the erosion of the system in the following period. However, this second period implied some special experimental attempts and models which tried to implement some critically inspired methods, approaches of adult education and opened some ways for some new researches, for example in the field of research work, in order to reconfigure what modern could be meant and expressed in reality in Hungarian adult education. The historiography of the period, signalled by Felkai, turned attention to the historical contexts to understand the role of the state, the roles of new social classes, like intellectuals, the intelligentsia, working class, changing conditions of the almost disappearing peasantry, etc. Another dimension for historical research was indicated by the analysis of the evolution of in-service trainings of major companies and enterprises from 1850 to 1950. This attempt was accelerated by economic historians, like Iván Berend T., Miklós Szuhay (Berend – Szuhay, 1975) or László Katus (Katus, 1979) and Béla Krisztían, a talented researcher of
vocational education and training, who pointed out the roles and peculiarities of post-war modernisation of vocational education and training in Hungary to enter into a phase of real modernity in the early 1960s (Krisztián, 1985 – 86)

The third period of adult education research in Hungary was dominated by new routes and reforms. The state tried to modernise its system of adult education and training and gave way to many alternative adult education associations trying to prepare for the overall political change of the regime. János Sz. Tóth and others organised a new association for Hungarian folk high-schools in 1988 on the basis of the declaration of UNESCO CONFINTÉA IV in Paris in 1985 (UNESCO, 1985) Likewise, movements of civic groups urged protest movements for free and open cultural, economic, arts and political life, started to struggle for environment protection of land, water, and air. Adult education actions reflected social, political and economic changes and, therefore, historical research work tried to get rid of political and ideological burdens and started, accordingly, to collect examples of adult education and training in modern Hungary from 1850 to 1950 and even up to 1970 to show in what ways adults could learn and perform better in their learning today’s man could make use of (Felkai, 1986). This period was an obvious preparation for such an intensive and rather complicated series of actions.

THREE PERIODS OF ADULT EDUCATION RESEARCH IN A DEMOCRATIC HUNGARY

The fourth period of Hungarian adult education research, from 1992 to 2000, demonstrated a special shift in between two generations. Durkó, Felkai, Maróti, Harangi and Zrinszky urged their former students as a second generation of researchers, like Koltai, Sári, Pethő and Sz.Tóth to maintain historical research work and, together with them, initiate new higher education programmes for adult educators at BA and MA levels so as to shift historical research into academic environment. Almost all Hungarian state universities established new departments of adult education/andragogy or continued the operation of former department of cultural studies, popular education, human resources development to include adult education research work.

In this period, Maróti led a detailed comparative OTKA (National Scientific Research Fund) research project in 1994-95 to discover similarities and differences amongst adult education organisations and institutions in some particularly important European countries, like Britain, Denmark, Austria, Switzerland, Finland, Sweden, Germany and Italy. In this group, Harangi was writing of Danish adult education and Pethő was doing the same over Austria and Switzerland. (Harangi, Pethő and Maróti, 1995). László Zrinszky published his book on adult education in 1998 and one chapter this book dealt with the comparative study of modern German and Hungarian Adult Education (Zrinszky, 1998.) Katalin Gelencsér provided a quality research book on the relation between culture-based informal education and the emergence of adult education in Hungary. Gelencsér, in her book on the History of Hungarian Cultural life from 1780 to 1980, tried to underline the functions of participation of adults in culture as a special form of informal learning (Gelencsér, 1998a; 1998b) Sz. Tóth wrote some accurate papers on the re-establishment and developing perspectives of folk high-schools as leading the Hungarian Folk High-School Society (Sz. Tóth, 1998).
Dénes Koltai initiated a new format for adult education research work at the University of Pécs and combined andragogy studies with newly emerging training of adult educators both for cultural institutions and for enterprises as human resource managers. This new construction enabled a systematic research work to start in order to well establish a functional change of adult education in theoretical and practical aspects. Amongst some other higher education institutions, the University of Debrecen, and the University of Pécs joined IIZ-DVV Budapest Office to make a map of Hungarian adult education and training. Erika Juhász from Debrecen, and Klára Bajusz from Pécs joined this research project in 1997. Later, Juhász turned to research themes of non-formal autonomous learning and learning communities (Juhász, 2009), while Bajusz became interested in Folk High-school development and second chance schooling (Bajusz, 2005).

The first conference on Hungarian adult education research was held in Dunaújváros in 2000 with the support of IIZ-DVV and UNESCO UIL. Németh marked this event to call for systematic research work on the history of adult education with a new paradigm (Németh, 2001.).

At the same time, Németh initiated research partnership with Pöggeler who, during the 1990s, organised the series of international conferences on the history of adult education. A result of this partnership was the eighth international conference on the history of adult education which was held in Pécs, Hungary in July, 2000.

It was Tamás T. Kiss who, in between 1992 and 2002, researched the history of informal adult education in Hungary in the interwar period of 1920-38. T. Kiss accurately dealt with the character of the educational policy of conservative governments in Hungary of the indicated two decades after World War I. Interestingly, T. Kiss underlined the impact of the marginalisation of adult schooling and, instead, the emergence of informal adult learning and education to lack any democratic approach toward participation and citizens autonomy (T. Kiss, 1998).

A major impact on the research of the history of adult education in Central-Eastern Europe were some significant conference series on the history of adult education. One was the so-called Pöggeler conference, namely the series of International conferences on the history of adult education which was held in every other year after 1982 (the conference booklets were published by Peter Lang in a series called Andragogy – Pedagogy – Gerontagogy). Its 8th Conference was held in Pécs, Hungary and some significant researchers of the history of adult education from Hungary attended the event. Another impact was the well-known Salzburg–talks on adult education, organised by the Austrian Folk High-school Association.

A third impact was the so-called Strobl conferences on Central-European Adult Education, organised by Prof. Volker Otto. This conference series were taken on the move and, in between 1996 and 1998, this series of event visited Hungary two times with the support of IIZ-DVV (DVV International), Debrecen in 1998 and Pécsvárad in 2000. DVV International and its Budapest Project Office supported the participation of Hungarian researchers to such scientific events, where people like Sári (Sári, 2000.), Maróti (Maróti, 1998), Soós (Soós, 1998.) and Sarolta Pordány (Pordány, 2000.) held presentations in particular themes on Hungarian adult education. Pordány became very much interested in the research of informal adult learning and evolution of citizenship education and community learning. (Pordány, 1998, 2000.). Sándor Striker and Mária Arapovics are two researchers from Eötvös
University whose research field is participation, citizenship education and the roles of civil society. (Arapovics, 2005, 2007; Striker, 2011)

Another dimension of this period is the growing number of national conferences on adult education, dominantly influenced by UNESCO CONFINTÉA V and its Declaration (UNESCO, 1998), opened new platforms for research actions based on several themes, such as participation, methodologies, target groups, profession and professionalization, relevant learning theories, adult education policy developments in the EU, etc. Also, The European Commission and its DG Education started to promote a new planning of adult learning programme as part of the 1996 European Year of Lifelong Learning, based on the 1995 White Paper on Education and Training.

The research activities, at the end of the decade, were heavily influenced by the 1999 Presidency Conferences on Adult Education in Mainz, Germany in May 1999 and in Turku, Finland in September, the same year.

The fifth period of Hungarian adult education research can be considered as the peak of research work.

The second generation of researchers became fully aware that a younger generation ought to start intensive research work. Therefore, Maróti, Pethő, urged Sándor Striker, Mária Arapovics, Mária Kraici and Orsolya Kereszty to continue historical research in the studying adult education. Sarolta Pordány was also supported by Maróti so as to establish a civic association for the development of adult education. In the second half of this decade, this association became one of the research platforms for adult education and its e-periodical (Adult Education Review/Felnőttképzési Szemle) has so far published papers on the history of Hungarian adult education. (www.feflearning.hu). At the University of Debrecen, Rubovszky, Kozma and Durkó helped Erika Juhász and Gábor Erdei to continue adult education research. At the University of Pécs, Koltai helped Klára Bajusz, Éva Farkas, and Németh to initiate new research projects and continue history studies in modern adult education. Klára Bajusz, Csilla Filó and Balázs Németh wrote a detailed book on the history of Hungarian adult education from its beginning to 1950. (Bajusz – Filó – Németh, 2004) Gizella T. Molnár, at the University of Szeged, made significant emphasis to collect young scholars so as to research the relation amongst culture, learning and adult education.

After 2002, Hungarian researchers established two distinguished platforms for the development of academic work, namely, of education and research referring adult education. One was the Adult Education/Andragogy Sub-Commission of the Hungarian Academy of Sciences. The other was a higher education platform for the development of adult education, namely, Professional Commission for Andragogy. Both platforms have supported research activities in adult education and promoted interdisciplinary research actions with other academic disciplines, as sociology, philosophy, history, political science, economics, law, library and information science, etc.

While adult learning and education was taken into mainstream educational policies both at European and national levels, the so-called Lisbon process opened gates to the newly structured Grundtvig programme, which, as part of Socrates II and later the part of the integrated Lifelong Learning programme, strengthened adult education research until the end of the decade.
This new wave of European partnership helped Hungarian researchers in adult education to follow the custom having been strengthened during the fourth period and, accordingly, expanded adult education research towards many colleagues, partners in EU-member and in candidate countries. The Erasmus, Grundtvig and Leonardo project umbrellas, together with the FP6-7 initiatives promoted such a research orientation. From 2000 to 2010, several research projects signalled directed analysis of Hungarian adult education in comparison to European and international trends and issues. Moreover, this era gave impetus for a new conference on Hungarian and German partnership in adult education developments with the support of DVV International. This event was held at the University of Pécs, on 27-28. September, 2002. Gábor Erdei and Balázs Németh were co-ordinating one workshop on adult education research and they concluded, that one of the most dynamically rising research field of adult education was historical research (Németh, 2003).

One must also keep in mind that the Lisbon decade was a fertile era for adult education, as a new act on adult training was passed in 2001, therefore, a new Institute for Adult Education started its roughly ten year of function to develop quality adult learning and education. One element of its mission was to promote quality research. The Institute itself initiated several studies on Hungarian adult education and training and helped researchers to publish their findings in concrete booklets and/or in its periodical, called Training of Adults. Moreover, the Institute launched trainings for adult educators and, additionally, provided training materials which include a rather detailed series of studies on Hungarian Adult Education with some specific aspects on structures, methodologies used, labour market trends, main features of target groups in adult learning and on adult education research (NSZFI, 2005 – 2007).

Paradoxically, orientations to the history of adult education, however, started to decrease at the end of the decade to give way to more reductionist approaches with a clearly labour market, and employment centeredness. It is rather remarkable that not only adult education was unable to strengthen its status in most member states, but also the Grundtvig Group within the European Commission could not preserve its positions and a slow decrease signalled the marginalisation of adult education research through the fall of Grundtvig as an European adult education program. The economic crisis in and after 2008 favoured a purely employment oriented approach and a clear return to skills development opposite to the development of key competences.

In the Lisbon-decade, however, a small, but very dynamic and new generation of researchers turned attention to the research of the history of adult education. Figures, like Krisztina Máté, Szilvia Simándi are from a new researching student group which might form later a fourth generation of researchers to underline some new research topics and themes so as to reflect the historical scope, yet one ought to note that this new generation of young researchers has been very small and much smaller than the one a decade earlier. (Máté, 2012; Juhász - Simándi, 2008).

Some members of the third generation, like Orsolya Kereszty has outstandingly researched the movement of education of adult women and its relation to women’s movements from 1870 to 1920. Also, she has revisited informal education of adults in late 19th Century Hungary. (Kereszty, 2011; 2012). Others, like Márta Miklósi analysed the history of adult education for prisoners/criminal-andragogy in Hungary (Miklósi, 2011)
The sixth period of Hungarian adult education research began in late 2010/early 2011 and its peculiarity is marked by an almost dominantly reductionist approach to focus on economy, employment and labour market, thereby, a slow shift from school-based adult education and scrutiny of non-formal adult learning and education. Some interests on the research of history of Hungarian Adult education stayed and are with us, however, they are marginalised struggles of historiography with a close scope of comparative research methods and orientations. Also, a decreasing international co-operation is recognisable, since a limited number of researchers hold enough capacities and professional language skills to turn their research themes into international frames of partnership in associations as ESREA, EAEA or into some project-based actions.

The last two decades of Hungarian adult education research resonates the impact of growing international linkages of most researchers working within higher education environment which dominates adult education research in Hungary.

One of the few adult education research units is the Lóránd Eötvös University and its Faculty of Pedagogy and Psychology where the Department of Adult Education runs several research on adult learning and education from various perspectives. This Department organised the joint conference of ESREA and its two networks, one on the history of adult education and one dealing with citizenship issue. (Adult Education and Citizenship: Relationship in Space and Time – ELTE PPK, 16-18. 06. 2011) Apart from the interventions of Kereszty and Németh in historical research aspects, Ilona Szóró pointed out the role of Reading Circles and Lajos Olasz dealt with the development of civic competencies in agrarian society through autonomous organizations (Szóró, 2011; Olasz, 2011)

Another research unit is the Department of Adult Education of the Faculty of Arts of the University of Debrecen where some directed research deal with autonomous learning of adults, and with learning regions and learning communities, led by Erika Juhász.

The University of Szeged and its Faculty of Teacher Training hosts today an Institute of Adult Education where the main characteristics of the research of adult education are the scrutiny of the changing functions of cultural institutions in adult education and, at the same time, those of the labour market training enterprises and institutions.

The Faculty of Adult Education and HRD of the University of Pécs has become an identical place of adult education research in Hungary, as this Faculty and its predecessor has been a member of EAEA, and EUCEN for more than a decade and the Faculty has been involved in several European projects to develop quality adult education and research. Some major research issues of the Faculty were museums as new places for adult learning, development of the profession of adult educator, second chance schooling, guidance and counselling in adult earning, active citizenship, validation of prior and experimental learning, history of movements and institutions of adult education in Hungary, labour market, comparative adult education research, politics and policy in the development of adult learning and education and local - regional development through learning cities and regions.

The Faculty has an e-periodical, called Knowledge Management where people researching adult education are welcomed to publish their research finding. Also, the Faculty has strong research ties with some distinguished universities in Europe through European projects, where adult education research has been rather quality centred. One may mention here the
At the same time, one ought to make a summary of reasons for the rise and fall of Hungarian research work in the history of adult education, or at least, to explain the nature of a rather reductionist, employment oriented epoch to dominate the beginning of the second decade of the 21st century. It must be recognised that vocational and labour market adult trainings have been dominating the training picture in the last ten years, and research work has been shifted from a rather holistic position into a rather reductionist one. It seems that a rather natural process can be identified from one period to another that after a while adult education research may fall back so as to reconfigure itself to new criteria, conditions and to new social, economic, political, etc. expectations. In 2000, Pöggeler concluded that the research of adult education always reflect periodical rise and fall in adult learning and education. (Pöggeler 2000)

This paper tries to demonstrate, somehow, that there are specific roles, missions and tasks of a new generation of researchers insisting on and continuing with a more holistic approach on trends, and practice of research work in order to make it rise again, by complementing reductionism with issues of cultural, demographical, ethical-philosophical, gender, sociological, psychological, etc. aspects. (Németh – Pöggeler, 2002). It seems that this current decade has provided a new climate in which researchers of adult education must describe and analyse the conditions, structures for a proper learning climate in adult learning and to demonstrate the needs for quality adult education by underlining accomplished results and values of previous times to promote participation and better performance.

SPECIFIC FEATURES HISTORICAL RESEARCH INCLUDE COMPARED WITH OTHER KIND RESEARCHES ON ADULT EDUCATION AND TRAINING

One must indicate to this issue that historical research has been successful to demonstrate that its features have always reflected the need of and its dependence on holistic and interdisciplinary approaches. I do agree with Pöggeler, who argued that “in the history of adult education, the interdependence between education, politics, economy and social life must be considered.” (Pöggeler, 1996). It is obvious that the historical research has a feature to demonstrate that the history of adult education is also the history of institutions, organisations, people and their motives for lifelong learning. Yet the historiography of adult education has mainly been devoted to adult education in just one state, people or nation. However, it must be considered today as regional, continental and world history with comparative aspects (Leirman and Pöggeler, 1979) The influence of creative personalities and thinkers as founders of new institutions and schools for research have always been remarkable (Bajusz – Németh, 2011)

Another feature of historical research is that it mainly concentrates on modern times, therefore, historical research mainly cover, in Europe, three centuries from 1780 to 1980 so as to demonstrate how and in what ways modernity has needed enlightened and free individuals to explore, develop and change their communities, their mind and the outer world. A key feature of historical research is to reflect ways, methods, structures of how masses of
adult have been involved in learning, education, training and how adults changed their own lives by learning dominantly in informal ways, and, in what forms a new system of adult education and training has been created to offer equal opportunities in the system of education. Finally, a key feature of historical research in adult education is to demonstrate examples of good practice, which moved beyond borders, communities, so as to develop a collective memory over the benefits of adult learning and critical mind through concrete achievements in adult education.

STATE OF AFFAIRS OF HISTORICAL RESEARCH OF ADULT EDUCATION IN HUNGARY REGARDING THEMES, PUBLICATIONS, TOPICS EXPLORED / FORGOTTEN AND PERIODS STUDIED, SOME RELEVANT JOURNALS, SOCIETIES.

In the above chapters, I have tried to underline some characteristics of the rise and fall of historical research in Hungarian adult education. Accordingly, one must conclude that historical research in Hungarian adult education, in the last two decades have focused on the period of 1850 to 1950, and only a very few attempts have been made to analyse the post-war period and, moreover, adult education and training practice of communist times in between 1950 and 1990. Themes of historical research cover, however, specific institutions/associations with relevant activities in Hungary for the development of adult learning education (e.g., Cycles of Popular Education, Folk High-Schools, women’s associations, workers’ associations, workers’ schools, community associations of protestant churches, prison education, agrarian associations and cycles, reading societies, libraries, Urania House (Felkai, 1998), university extension and popular academies, etc.)

Another theme-group is some significant movements on the history of adult education, like workers’ movements, women’s movements, movement of free education (szabad tanítás), agrarian movements, religious movements, political parties’ movements and peace/democratization movements, post-war movement of free cultural development (szabad művelődés), etc. A third theme-group is creative person and personalities in Hungarian adult education (e.g., Miklós Jósika, István Türr, József Eötvös, Gábor Baross, Kunó Kliebelsberg, Kálmán Újszászy, Sándor Karácsony, Béla Radnai, Jenő Széll and Mátéyás Durkó, etc.) One can find some quality papers on key figures in the history of adult education in the history conference booklet edited by Maróti, Sári, and Kálmán, Rubovszky (Maróti – Sári – Ruboszky, 1988).

A fourth group of themes is devoted to the evolution and practical examples of methods in adult learning and education, and a fifth one can be related to the research of certain political era and its relations, connections to adult education.

Having scrutinised all major publications of research conferences, monographs, and essays on the history of Hungarian adult education and ones on history of adult education by Hungarian adult educators for the period of 1993 and 2013. it is obvious to conclude that there are not more than 2 monographs, 4 conference booklets and 51 publications on historical research. I tried to cite many of them upon author in this analytical paper.

Major research topics in the historical research community are, for example, person and personality, social movements, demographic trends and migration, integration of certain social groups, industrialisation, the development of open societies, the roles of the state in
adult learning and education, the impact of education and training policies, professionalization in adult education, the influence of specific target groups in adult learning, comparative aspects, the role of ideals and ideologies, the rise and fall of adult education institutions/associations, the impact of social mobility and democratization; active citizenship are just few example which, I consider specific features.

So far as scientific periodicals are concerned, there are five existing periodicals available for researchers to publish their findings. One is the Adult Education Review (Felnőttképzési Szemle), which is an on-line e-periodical of the Association for Adult Education. Another one is Knowledge Management (i), which is the quarterly of the Faculty of Adult Education of the University of Pécs. The third one is called Training and Practice (Képzés és Gyakorlat), which is the periodical of Kaposvár University and the fourth one is the Vocational and Adult Training (Szak- és Felnőttképzés), that periodical is the official Journal of the National Employment Office. The Faculty of Arts of the University of Debrecen publishes the Acta Andragogiae et Culturae.

It is a peculiar situation that some neighbouring universities offer publication possibility for Hungarian researchers, therefore, Masaryk University in Brno welcomes papers on adult learning and education in English into the Studia Pedagogica, the university periodical of the Faculty of Education.

Likewise, the Faculty of Education at the University of Belgrade publishes the Andragogical Studies which periodical invites researchers to submit their papers for publication in English.

As I have indicated in a previous chapter, Hungarian researchers established two distinguished platforms for the discussion of education and research developments and issues referring adult education. One is the Adult Education/Andragogy Sub-Commission of the Hungarian Academy of Sciences. The other is a higher education platform for the development of adult education, namely, Professional Commission for Andragogy. Both platforms have supported research activities in adult education and promoted interdisciplinary research actions with other academic disciplines, as sociology, philosophy, history, political science, economics, law, library and information science, etc. Connections towards history enabled adult education researchers to reflect to some international research themes in history research through connections and partnerships towards ESREA, ISCAE, EAEA, etc. while considering Hungarian adult education and its structures, conditions.

An independent civic organisation is the Association for Adult Education (Felnőttképzés Fejlesztéséért Egyesület) which was founded in May 2005, by adult educators and researchers in order to promote quality adult learning and education. This Association organises conferences, workshops on adult and lifelong learning, citizenship education and on R+D+I themes around adult education and training with a special attention to learners.

THE STATUS OF RESEARCH OF THE HISTORY OF ADULT EDUCATION IN THE CONTEXT OF EDUCATIONAL RESEARCH OR OTHER DISCIPLINES

It must be clearly indicated that the status of research of the history of adult education in Hungary is fairly obvious. In academic context, it is considered as part of educational research, therefore, an example to underline this reasoning is that the annual conference on
the Educational Science is understood as a regular research platform where researchers of
the history of adult education can appear in concrete symposium or workshop dedicated to
their research field.

DIFFICULTIES AND/OR ADVANTAGES OF EUROPEAN NETWORKING

Having participated most research platforms of adult education in Europe for the last fourteen
years, I think that only ESREA has advantages as a network on researching adult education
through its networks’ meetings, workshops, conferences and its distinguished publishing
activity of RELA. Those advantages are reflected in the interdisciplinary scope of members;
the international composition of members, also, in the variety of networks within the organisation and in the collaboration amongst network on certain research issues and themes.

CONCLUSION

This paper aimed at analysing the evolution of research on adult education in Hungary with a special attention to the development and changes of historical research in the same field. An attempt was made to describe how a particular rise and fall of historical research can be identified in the last two decades, and what kind of external and internal changes and impacts formed or, sometimes, deformed historical researches on adult education in Hungary over a half of a century.

REFERENCES

Arapovics, Mária: The Role of Civic Organisations in the Education of Adults beyond the Age of 45/A civil szervezetek szerepe a 45 év felettiek képzésében. In. Sz. Molnár, Anna (Szerk./ed.) (2005) Training Needs and Opportunities of Older Adults beyond the Age of Forty-five./Az idős felnőtt rétegek felnőttképzési igényei és lehetőségei. Budapest: NSzFI.


Pethő, László (1996) Adult Education in Austria and Switzerland/Az osztrák és a svájci felnőttoktatás. Budapest: MTA OTKA


Soós,Pál: Experience and Conclusions over the 200 years History of Hungarian Adult Education/ Tapasztalatok és következtetések a Magyar felnőttnevelés kétszáz


THE LIMITS AND DIVISIONS OF ADULT AND CONTINUING EDUCATION IN 20TH CENTURY MODERN EUROPE. HISTORICAL AND POLITICAL DIMENSIONS AND PATTERNS.

Németh, Balázs
University of Pécs
Hungary

SHORT ABSTRACT

This paper will examine and address key issues and reasons which made adult and continuing education in 20th Century Europe strongly depend on particular social patterns and norms reflecting the status and perspectives of autonomy and intervention. However, it will demonstrate a correlation between underdeveloped markets, open societies and that of closed, autocratic politics.

Therefore, this paper will come to conclusions that it is, consequently, not at all surprising that EAEA and other civil society groups in European adult education, and UNESCO UIL critically mark the need for more integrated policy developments in European adult learning and education and, also, for more co-operation amongst European states to promote the dissemination of good practices and quality researches in order to balance the economic with more social.

“5. That the necessary conclusion is that adult education must not be regarded as a luxury for a few exceptional persons here and there, nor as a thing which concerns only a short span of early manhood, but that adult education is permanent necessity, an inseparable aspect of citizenship, and therefore should be both universal and lifelong.”

(Ministry of Reconstruction - The 1919 Report, 1919, P. 5.; Reprinted by the University of Nottingham in 1980)

INTRODUCTION

In the last two hundred years, adult education has become an advocate of modernity, namely, of organised social and economic development of liberalised societies and regulated economic production, and the case of the history of modern British adult education, for example, well underline this argument (Fieldhouse, 2000) Historical research of adult education in Europe has reflected that even in the semi-developed, modestly democratised states, for a while, favoured the spread of adult education and its movements (Kulich, 1984). However, Steele argued that a special rise and fall could be identified in the period of 1848 and 1939, therefore, one must recognise that development of adult education institutions, organisations and movements have always been non-linear (Steele, 2007)
HISTORICAL, POLITICAL AND SOCIAL DIMENSIONS AND PATTERNS

Even post-modern societies are not completely sensitive to the very relative implications of the basic rights of their fellow members. Therefore, it is necessary to turn attention to examples of attempts when the democratisation process reached some states and signals were made to move adult education to becoming a part of educational policies in reality. It started mainly at the turn of the 19th and 20th centuries that most Nordic countries passed laws on education to recognise adult schooling and education with equal rights as that of public and higher education. Soon, the British coalition government set a special commission right in the last year of World War I. so as to make use of adult education in order to prepare for a dramatically changing post-war social and economic environment. The famous 1919 Report was taken as an outstanding document which recognised adult education as a permanent national necessity and as an inseparable aspect of citizenship and, for this reason, it should be universal and lifelong to promote an intelligent public opinion (Ministry of Reconstruction - The 1919 Report, 1919)

Opposite to these above mentioned political realisations of the importance of developing open and democratic societies, many states in continental Europe, where right wing or left wing extremes took power in the interwar period between 1919 and 1940, chose a different and rather anti-liberal and anti-democratic route, therefore, simply did not allow education policy to represent pluralism of thought, of institutions and, consequently, gave way to authoritarian policy making and systematically got rid of adult and second chance schools. In some countries, governments closed down schools for adults and only allowed or promoted informal adult learning. The growing state-control did not necessary change in Central-Eastern Europe after World War II where the emerging communist rule kept strict control over adult education, even though it did support the schooling, education of masses of adults under direct regulations without significant alternative ways, methods of teaching and available teaching materials. (In relation to Hungary - Pethő, 2000; referring to the former GDR - Opelt, 2005) It happened only after 1945 that Western and Northern Europe could turn back to and strengthen the building of liberal democracy and make use of adult education and training in rather balanced forms until the erosion of the welfare state.

A second significant signal for the societal role for adult education was the one of Lindeman who argued, in a very important period of the interwar situation, that adult education would have a role in the development of effective learning, moreover, in social change and, also, in the building of democracy (Lindeman, 1926; Brookfield, 1987). At the same time, in the Weimar Republic of Germany, Rosenstock and Picht underlined a need for a more systematically structured action in adult education, andragogy, so as to differentiate the action of the education of adults from pedagogy and, simultaneously, from that of demagogy (Picht – Rosenstock, 1926).

Those historical examples call for the limits and divisions of early 20th century’s adult education and its struggle for being recognised as a tool, on the one hand, of developing advanced second chance schooling and, on the other, as an appropriate means of citizenship and community development. Accordingly, it must also be indicated that civil societies in Central and Eastern Europe, however, have been very week to organise their own liberal adult education and reach for wider participation in autonomous ways of community education and adult learning. This is rather obvious in today’s conditions and in the practice of adult education leading to limitations in dominant policies towards adult
education and training in order to serve labour market interests. Paradoxically, there were many more schools for adult learners in most former communist countries, between 1950 and 1990, than today, as the return of once reduced illiteracy and functional illiteracy would require the development of basic and secondary education for adult learners being former drop-outs.

The diversification of adult education has dramatically fallen back and has been limited to minimal second-chance schooling and many more flexible non-formal training programmes in skills-development for adequate labour. Social and lifelong learning skills/competences are, on the other hand, falling back and adults hardly find spaces of acquiring or upgrading skills becoming necessary in harmonious social life in community, families and at the workplace (Finger, Matthias – Asún, José Manuel, 2001, 2004).

In the post war environment after 1945, it took roughly two decades that European countries got through a significant democratization, even countries of Central-East Europe represented mass education for adults, though systems of education were taken under strict state control. It happened from late 1960s and from early 1970s, depending on the countries, that a more social-oriented, and fairly social-democratic policy shift has strengthened adult education in the Western and Northern part of Europe to reach for wider access to ‘second chance’, compensatory, community-orientations, further education, inclusive policies, etc. Also, the recognition of the social allocation functions of adult education and training reached the public policy environment in Europe at the turn of the 1960s and 1970s, roughly at the time when education was indicated to reach a crisis-period, according to Coombs in the Western world (Coombs, 1968). Adult education became interesting and a direct means of government policy for a compensatory social allocation mechanism. This process could be understood as a temporary collaboration of social democratic forces to achieve educational reform in a period of time when business groups wanted to accomplish a modernising shift towards industry and services.

According to Beck, education and training of adults was incorporated into the expansion of social space in the sense of ‘simple modernisation’ (Beck, 1992). The reform attempts of the 1970s were considered as a fair input to the expansion of structures of individual mobility and the expansion of social space in European societies (Bourdieu, 1979.)

The British example is outlined in the famous Russell-report which considered adult education as if the economy did not exist (Jackson, 1997), whereas, new policies later considered adult education and training for the economy as if society did not exist. The Russell-report was researched and written in the time of the final years of the welfare-state when engagement of attention to popular education dramatically changed. Two decades later, social cohesion declined, full employment, as a cornerstone of consensus, was dropped off from the political agenda of all parties in the UK. As Russell indicated, in order to link personal, community and vocational interests in civil society, there needs to be cooperation, collaboration and alliances across public institutional patterns and between the state and NGOs. Later on, the market model pushed educational providers to defend institutional interests in order to compete and, consequently, to make people choose alternative provisions where service and combination of time and space were more appropriate (ibid, 1997).
The other example of the period is the internationally well-known *Faure Report* which appeared at a time before the crisis of the welfare state. It implied a conceptual differentiation between policy and that of strategy which have not yet been explored in the adult and lifelong learning literature. In reality, the conceptual frame, according to policy, defined the UNESCO approach to describe adult and lifelong learning as a way of thinking about educational policies of member states. The Report differentiated policy from strategy. It was representing a planning approach which reflected the intervention of a welfare state, at the time, which had not been totally endangered by neo-liberal determinism, and the globalisation of reductionist economic approaches. The Faure Report took a definitely clear position and called attention to potential threats imposed by mass media and communication and for the promotion of democratic citizenship, environmental protection, and international solidarity. Adult educators and researchers of adult education policy development have to recognise it as a heavy document of progressive policy orientation towards welfare tasks and responsibilities adult education, as part of the system of education, and signalled a need for higher level of state interventions and, also, a higher degree of national sovereignty (Griffin, 1999; Rubenson, 1999).

Finally, one must indicate the role of the Club of Rome and its famous paper on *No Limits to Learning*. That document called for a more enthusiastic support for learning beyond time and space to allow societies to resolve their problems and open up to new dimensions of growth in more holistic and immaterial aspects. Also, the same document called attention to the changing nature and scales of state intervention into education (Club of Rome, 1979). In the 1970s and onwards UNESCO was one of the few international organisations to keep on promoting lifelong education and adult education, as a definite part of the concept, on track, therefore, with its declarations in 1973, in 1985 and after (CONFINTEA III) assisted a policy change to come into reality in the second half or, at least, at the turn of 1980s and the 1990s.

For the following four decades adult education and training has had to face several rises and falls and, also, an attempt of moving and keeping adult education as part of educational policies in Europe. The European Unification and the changing climate for a more holistic policy orientation towards lifelong learning opened gates for an embedded adult learning policy line for the newly emerging European Union, its member states and, likewise, to candidate countries. This era could make use of the almost twenty-five years of research work on the history of adult education which highlighted some limits and divisions of adult education referring to methodologies used, participation, the changing nature of institutions and associations in communities of adult learning, policy directions, local and regional scopes and autonomies of citizens and related responsibilities.

Research on the history of adult education, which was mainly organised and co-ordinated by a few scholars in Europe from the early 1980s, by such researchers as Pöggeler, Leirman, Zdarzil, Joachim Knoll, Fieldhouse, Field, Turos, and Friedental-Haase and Samolovcev, took particular themes into the focus of research in order to reflect the limits and divisions of the very much divided adult education and training in Europe. This research revisited some major documents and policy papers on adult learning and education in a more holistic and interdisciplinary approach. These new positions and major publications have taught us today that, for example, it is rather outstanding for contemporary European adult education, that the 1919 Report has a message for us today, namely, that states of Europe should consider adult learning and education as a national necessity and promote it as the part of welfare citizens may want to make use of.
Researchers, in my understanding, ought to recognise that the evolution of adult education resembles the change of society, therefore, unusual/atypical forms of adult learning must be considered as important and new forms of learning spaces and communities are to be considered. It is rather a wrong position to think only in traditional settings and structures while the history of adult education reflects a process of on-going preparation for change and change for developments in social, economic, political, etc. settings. This phenomenal recognition may teach us to turn the limits and divisions of adult learning of the 20th century for the benefit of new formations of adult education of today (English, Leona M. – Mayo, Peter, 2012)

Another pattern of the limits and divisions of adult education is that it slowly lost its direct attachment to social movements. In between 1850 and 1950, adult education could imply several movements and reflect the needs for being educated. It is somewhat paradox, that researchers would need examples of good practice of historical research to prove the social benefit of adult learning and education. Hake, as a good example of positioning historical research, argued that historical development of the availability of education and training for adults can be best understood as the social organisation, by others for adults or by adults themselves, of structures of opportunities for them to gain knowledge, skills, attitudes and values.

Hake stressed that opposite to public education, the historical expansion of the learning of adults and new learning spaces used by them cemented an alternative channel of social mobility through non-formal routes (Hake, Barry J, 2006) Early forms of modern adult education in the late 19th and early 20th centuries formed an alternative way of social allocation distinct from formal education. In some cases, however, non-formal routes enabled entry to formal qualifications which stayed as a prerogative of public education systems (Arvidson, 1995).

ADULT EDUCATION, THE STATE AND SOCIAL ISSUES

Pöggeler pointed out that „In the history of adult education, the interdependence between education, politics, economy, and social life must be considered” (Pöggeler, 1996). When researchers of European adult learning and education examine the modernity features of systems of adult education in countries of Europe, they have to realise that the evolution of the state has strongly influenced the impact and roles of adult education upon the development of autonomies of individuals and their communities, depending mainly on political and economic interests (Pöggeler, 1990). In the development of adult education, a significant point was the emergence of the welfare state as it started to form its educational policy based upon the expansion of basic rights to its citizens generally from 1850 and onwards. For adult education, it took until 1950, in Central and Eastern Europe even further, that the process of democratization made most states to recognise that adults would have a basic universal right to learn and be educated. It is a peculiar paradox that there are individuals in many parts of Europe today, who cannot implement this right of theirs, although, they would formally have every right to do so. According to this context, Bélanger rightly underlined the impact of non-working time referring to the development of new social space with new issues. (Bélanger, 1995)
The rather obvious over-polarisation of educational demands on the constraints and claims of work has generated, in the last five decades, an anachronistic situation as adults participate in learning activities in a multiple ways and for various reasons, therefore, one must recognise that the development and changes of educational demands can only be understood through attention to the social participation and to the new social actors which tend to be fairly autonomous from direct labour conditions, such as feminists, ecological, and other new social movements of particular regions throughout Europe. Problems of environment, population and health cannot be solved without the urge for and commitment to social participation, and on the empowerment of citizens, consequently, on learning provisions to opportunities to increase social and cultural creativity in order to strengthen rationality in collective actions.

It is peculiar how far the analysis of non-working time may clearly reflect that, in the periphery countries of Europe which go through a crisis in employment, non-working time is extremely away from free-time, hence, became a reservoir of exclusion, of forced employment, thereby, leading to survival actions, a scrutiny for work in the informal or black economy to compensate insufficient salaries, etc.

The relation of current educational policies to adult learning and education has a strong correlation to certain demands, the demand of the labour market, and that of the society. These two demands are rather difficult to meet at the same time, since the first one aims at raising capacities and performance in work, while the other considers production of goods and the maintenance of infrastructures as one and not the only task for citizens. That is why Gelpi pointed out some educational and cultural realities in the aspect of struggles for development since he argued that a kind of contradiction between the institutional offer and the educational demand was a significant fact about education. Also, he pointed out that a major impasse in the world of education, likewise in adult education, was reflected by the fact that most disadvantaged countries and social groups had the most unmet needs, without benefiting from contemporary civilisation, for example, in the field of education. Gelpi signalled that such countries, which had a limited control over their economies, and workers, who had marginal roles in the labour market without the possibility or with limited positions for negotiation, would be the least able to guarantee formal education to all of their people or, for those who were workers, etc. and for many others in the community (Gelpi, Ettore 1984).

Adult education is a form of social policy, the product of deliberate action by organisations to influence society. Youngman underlined that this policy requires a variety of bodies, including the state and organisations of civil society, to meet the needs, claims and interests of different groups. (Youngman, Frank 1999). Also he referred to Griffin to explain that the policy making processes involving those organisations were shaped by, for example, competing definitions and narrations of what kind of interventions are useful in the society, consequently, what forms of adult education should be undertaken (Griffin, Colin 1987). In his famous book on adult education as social policy, Griffin argued that the policy perspective of adult education drew attention to the part played by adult education in particular progresses: the degree to which it legitimated cultural goals, in particular those having to do with patterns of consumption and leisure, or with domestic, community and social roles. He also highlighted the impact of incorporation of adult and continuing education into manpower policies of the state (Griffin, 1987). Simultaneously, Griffin pointed out the roles of the state in adult education, having been described by Styler in the frame of liberal democratic, socialist and Third World models, by arguing that those three models may not be able to fully reflect the
limits and divisions of the role of the state in adult education as the state would be interested, in general, in adult education for its functions referring to manpower planning, addressing social priorities, controlling expectations of people, helping social inequalities be reduced, etc. He concluded that all political regimes might use adult education when addressing their social priorities and to manage their economies (Griffin, 1987).

Jarvis called attention to the role of adult education in the development of democracy, and he underlined that the relationship between adult education, learning and democracy was extremely complex. Neither adult education, nor formalised learning appear essential to the establishment of whatever democracy was, even in the aspect of critical thoughts appearing in the manner of questioning the decisions of elites. I think he was just partially right to underline that adult education and democracy is a political phenomenon, so in this respect, only when the content and method or process, product of adult education are directly political that a direct and significant relationship between them can be traced, and such relationships, according to Jarvis, are rather rare (Jarvis, Peter 1990). On the other hand it is, therefore, obviously remarkable, accordingly, how recent researches on the history of adult education and policy developments indicate that “the diverse formulations throughout Europe of the ‘social question’ as one of the key issues in the development and organization of adult education.” If we agree with Hake and Laot, than it turns Jarvis’s point paradox as almost every issue is somewhat political in adult education (Hake, Barry J. – Laot, Françoise F, 2009).

INVESTING IN SOCIAL CAPITAL

Today's problems are, paradoxically, reflected by the limits and divisions of adult education. Field warns us that our learning society is constrained by powerful tendencies, not simply towards the reproduction of existing inequalities but also towards the creation of new forms of exclusion. It is helping to erode established social relationships and to call into question widely held patterns of shared meanings. Field, interestingly, pointed out the reflections of Alheit who called for a rethink of politics in the light of the learning society (Alheit, Peter 1999). I presume that the same ought to be done in the roles of lifelong learning policies and the roles of EU institutions in rebalancing social and the economic within adult education programmes for member states (Field, John 2006).

CONCLUSION

This paper comes to conclusions that it is, consequently, not at all surprising that EAEA, other civil society groups in European adult education, and UNESCO UIL all critically mark the need for more integrated policy developments in European adult learning and education and, also, for more co-operation amongst European states to promote the dissemination of good practices and quality researches in order to balance the limits and divisions of adult education for better adult learning with more participation and better performance.
REFERENCES


Club of Rome, (1979) No Limits to Learning – Rome


Ministry of Reconstruction - The 1919 Report, 1919, P. 5; Reprinted by the University of Nottingham in 1980

Opelt Karin (2005) DDr Erwachsenenbildung. Münstere: Waxmann

The Rise and Fall of Adult Education Institutions and Social Movements.
Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang Pp. 61-75.


Pöggeler, Franz (1990) (ed.) The State and Adult Education. Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang


VIOLENCE INTERROGATES ADULT EDUCATION TODAY.  
A RADICAL AND CRITICAL REFLECTION

Riva, Maria Grazia
University of Milan-Bicocca
Italy

ABSTRACT

I want to reflect on the relationship between violence and education. In the twentieth century, after two cruel World Wars, European society concentrated its energies and hopes also on education, but this turned out to be a great illusion. Atrocities and violence have not decreased at all. My reflections draw on some theoretical models from psychoanalysis, psycho-history, hermeneutics, pedagogy and critical sociology, post feminist thought, theory of complexity, Group relations Method and methods of qualitative research, as models enabling us to critically and not unilaterally address the events. The method is based on the analysis and the review of my experience as a researcher, adult trainer, supervisor, psychotherapist and university teacher. The project of development of the world of education in the second half of the twentieth century, including adult education, was often based on an individual and collective unconscious split. After the two World Wars and the student revolution in the 1960's, we tried to leave the wounds and the tragedies behind. But many debris were not worked through: anger, anxiety, revenge, grudge. Adult education has the historical and political task to inquire into this serious issue of violence, looking for new models and methods.

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK AND METHOD

My reflections originate from an understanding that draws on some theoretical models from psychoanalysis, psycho-history, hermeneutics, pedagogy and critical sociology, post feminist thought, neurophenomenology, theory of complexity, Group relations Method and methods of qualitative research, because they seem to me, on the whole, the most significant theoretical models enabling us to critically and not unilaterally address the events and phenomena of our contemporary times. The method is based on the analysis and the review of my experience as a researcher, adult trainer, supervisor, psychotherapist and university teacher. In order to carry out this analysis and to reflect about it, I use concepts and categories of theoretical approaches and models stated here above.

BACKGROUND

Education has been one of the great topics of the second half of the twentieth century and has involved agencies that were traditionally in charge of training, such as the schools as well as the industry and the service sector. Therefore, a number of new training agencies have developed and taken up increasing shares of the labour market. At the same time, because of the technological development of society, companies and governments have started to require a meaningful increase in training so as to have qualified personnel. In Europe also the High Education and Academic Research system has been more and more
geared to an educational model designed to meet the requests of the industrial and productive world. For example, the new European programme which finances research, Horizon 2020, doesn't give much space to research in the field of Social Sciences and Humanities. At the same time, we have seen the growth of adult education models and practices, preoccupied with the social and psychological dimension that is often shared only by small cultural elites but is unable to stir enough interest of the Government, the financial sponsors and the masses. However, personal and social violence against women, children, and different ethnic groups, at school and at home, at work and in the streets is increasingly raging. We need to compare these two contemporary phenomena and ask ourselves why, while education as a means of social growth, improvement of life conditions and enhanced sense of active and conscious citizenship has been financially supported, such a high level of violence and cruelty has broken out throughout the planet.

THE TOPIC AND THE QUESTIONS AT STAKE

In the twentieth century, after two cruel World Wars, European society concentrated its energies and hopes also on education, as we can see in the Marshall Plan in 1947. Through the ERP – European Recovery Programme – and under the aegis of the United States it aimed to the politico-economical reconstruction of Europe in a variety of ways: allocation of remarkable fundings, technical and commercial consultants, educational and training visits to some American companies, reconstruction of bridges, railways, factories and farms, waterworks, sewers, development of schools, fight against illiteracy for young and adult population. Education was regarded, both consciously and unconsciously, as a beacon capable of resolving all the problems. A typical and cyclic historical climate – such as in ancient Greece, in the Renaissance and in the eighteenth century Enlightenment – developed. There education embodied the hope to finally change everything: no more atrocities and violence such as those that had just been experienced. We can maintain that education was understood also as Paideia and Bildung (Cambi, 2005) (the latter being the eighteenth century version of the former), especially during the reconstruction following World War II. The notion of education being capable of shaping the humanity of men and women through the encounter of culture was thus re-established. With such an historical background, culture and education were also imbued with the hope to finally change everything, and not to witness atrocities and violence anymore. So, education was understood as a way to forge the minds.

Obviously, once again, this turned out to be a great illusion. Atrocities and violence have not decreased at all, although in some contexts they are expressed in different ways than the traditional ones, rather through the instruments of economic and financial war. Violence against women is committed more than ever. Parents abuse and kill their children, children kill their parents. Wives and husbands kill one another. Racism, in its violent expressions, is widespread along with contempt for the different and the foreigner. Social protests are often quenched with violence in many areas of the world. But then, now more than ever, with the destructive technological know-how that we have, the entire society – and particularly the world of adult education – needs to question itself with an urgency that cannot be procrastinated any longer. Of course, the history of the twentieth century is characterized by a huge complexity associated with political, economic, financial, religious, cultural and social variables that we cannot comprehensively address here. In this context we emphasize mostly the pedagogical and psychological sides that are correlated with historical events.
History is imbued with pedagogy, because it is made by men and women that pass on to the following generation some educational models and practices typical of their society and culture. In turn, society and culture contribute to shape men and women, through their constitutive action of socialization, in a loop action-feedback-internalization of rules, regulations, ideologies, models, systems of allowed or forbidden, lawful or illicit behaviours and feelings. It is high time for adult education to question itself. It is high time for adult education to scrutinize itself. But what happened since the end of World War I till now? What didn’t we see? What did we miss at the collective and individual unconscious levels? What are we passing on transgenerationally without being fully aware? Which virus? Why are we not able to stop the continuous episodes of violence? If education aims at changing individuals and people, why is it unsuccessful? What is the specific social responsibility of adult education, being addressed also to the people who, in this historical moment, are in command?

ADULT EDUCATION: CRITICAL PART

I think that adult education needs to inquire deeply and radically into the topic of violence that spreads latently or breaks out overtly, as violence is the result of children education by the family, other educational agencies and the environment in general. Therefore, adult education is at play at several levels, both because the adults who are committing violence and atrocities today were children in the past, educated by other adults, and because they educate those around them – their own children and children in general, youth, other adults, co-workers – and finally because, as adults, they are accountable for preserving the planet, the society, and the well-being of the other human beings, whether adults or children. This is a big educational task. An important preliminary remark is that we need to think about adult education from different perspectives at the same time, to have a wide, unrestricted, complex view that does not flatten out because it is too pragmatic or merely technically-oriented. Adult education, I think, needs to be thought in terms of the diffusion of education, through the media and social contacts, in terms of models, forms and concrete practices by which we educate the adults and with the adults and, last but not least, in terms of the ideology underlying different approaches to the educational work with adults. It is just as important to think adult education from an existential point of view in terms of personal working through. In other words, it constantly intertwines events and life vicissitudes and the individual conscious or unconscious working-through of such experiences. It is meaningful to regard the history of adult education also from the prospective of individual, society, and history interweaving, i.e. to see how historical, political and social changes have modified the official notions of adult education and how history has shaped the adults from different generations, educating them through the forms and the ways by which the historical events have unfolded. It is extremely important to emphasize once again how these changes and conditioning occur both at conscious and unconscious invisible levels. The twentieth century history, marked with all sorts of tragedies and atrocities, is an important example. If general education, and in particular adult education, aims at changing people and societies in favour of greater individual and collective well-being, how comes that – despite decades of ideological, theoretical, methodological, and practical investment in adult education – this well-being is not so widespread? How comes that – despite the investment in education – violence is rampant? These are radical core questions that the world of adult education needs to address boldly. Confronted with these deep and structural questions, it becomes
clear that we cannot just focus on issues concerning the models, the methodology or the tools to be used in adult education. Here the radical issue of sense-making is at play.

The development of education, and particularly adult education, in the second half of the twentieth century was based on an unconscious collective split. Having just come out from the terrible traumas of the two World Wars, people wanted to forget everything as the wounds were too serious and still lasting. Generally, education has always been considered as a healing process or a magical device, but this cultural operation did not achieve the social purpose assigned by the collective unconscious. On the contrary, it was a great illusion, because traumas were not worked out completely. Violence in interpersonal, social, political relationships continues to be used as an instrument of conditioning, threat, blackmail, control of critical thinking and opposition to the status quo. For example, a group of German and Israeli psychoanalysts – that were later joined by other fellow analysts coming from the whole world – set up an Association called ‘Partners in Confronting Collective Atrocities’. They have organized numerous Conferences (in Cyprus, Israel, Poland) that are aimed to develop strategies to confront with the legacy of past and present atrocities, in order to open up possibilities for changing the future. They started recognizing that the legacy of Holocaust was an obstacle to the ability of Germans and Israelis to relate with each other, because of unconscious hatred on the part of the victims and their descendants, and guilt on the part of the descendants of the perpetrators.

“The Holocaust appears to have cast a very long shadow, its most immediate impact being to poison the relationship between Germans and Jews. It was hoped that once the full extent of the genocide that lay at the heart of the Nazi project, together with details of the many levels of atrocity associated with it, were fully exposed, their sheer horror would contribute to a determination never again to allow such trains of events to be set in motion. Sadly, this hope has not been realized. Since the end of World War II we have witnessed worldwide seemingly unstoppable cycles of inter-group hatred and violence - ethnic, religious and cultural. Are we doomed to repeat these destructive patterns endlessly, or is it possible to engage with the legacy of the past in such a way that it opens up the possibility of a better future?” (http://www.p-cca.org/about/, Retrieved July 21, 2013)

We witness horrendous situations of violence between different nationalities or opposing factions within the same nationality, such as in the dramatic cases of popular upheaval in the Arab countries in the last years. In a recent Congress at the Chamber of Deputies of the Italian Parliament, called The necessary truth – The reconciliation processes of the Arab Springs, the topic of rape as a war weapon, practiced also after the end of the war in the countries involved in the Arab Spring with all its contradictions, was discussed. A young woman reported her terrible story of tortures in Libya. Her face and body were covered by a niqab, the traditional Islamic dress that leaves only the area around the eyes clear, and she wore it to remain anonymous. The room was softly lit and the cameras were off to the same end.

Then, in a shaky voice, she reported about the days of rape, tortures, electrical shocks that made her abort and then caused her sterility. The woman explained that she had been taken into custody after Al Jazeera filmed her with some girl-friends as they were inviting other students to go out into the streets against Qaddafi. Few hours later her nightmare began. “They arrested and kept me naked the whole time. They raped me continuously, then...
tortured me with electric shocks. I asked them to close the door at least when I was sleeping. I have not seen my girl-friends ever since. And my family is now telling me: ‘Hadn’t you messed around with politics, nothing would have happened to you’” (http://www.repubblica.it/solidarieta/emergenza/2013/07/03/news/egitto-62312311/?ref=HREA-1. Retrieved July 21, 2013)

We need to start from the fact that the past, with its events, traumas, wounds, crimes, and retaliations, is constantly conditioning us and that the future is closely determined by the past. The future unfolds and is shaped depending on how the past has dealt with a number of core issues and problems. If we do not keep that in mind, we make a serious mistake that will exponentially affect all the players involved, both private and institutional. The violence that broke out during the Arab spring cannot but affect the future relations between nations and people with different political and religious orientations. How can we seriously think to build a different, better future claiming to get rid of the past through an act of will? With a general and hopeful invitation to goodness, forgiveness, and properly acting from now on? Here, we clearly see the usual arrogance of man who feels omnipotent and keeps on thinking obstinately that he can control his own and other people’s thoughts, emotions, conscious and unconscious behaviours. Psychoanalysis has been showing that the human being does not control the unconscious processes, but this is too hard a truth to be internalized fully, particularly since human beings have been able to develop technologies which make them feel that they own an infinite and growing power. Somehow, we continue to think – like during the Enlightenment, the Industrial Revolution and the Positivism, that if we do not have full power yet, it is sufficient to wait for the development of science and technology.

In Europe, at the end of World War II, too many atrocities and violence were committed with such a systematic planning of tortures and extermination, supported by the imagination of a diabolic omnipotence, that it was not possible to simply turn the page and start again in a different way. In fact, this was attempted as, in the immediate future, some wounds could not be worked through, but it failed. Everything, as is usually the case, smouldered, ready to blow up again. The Holocaust put in place the extremist authoritarian educational model, typical of many cultures – certainly those in many European countries – charged with sadism and a will to humiliate, injure, torture, offend, and abuse. However, there were also other situations where violence broke out and used the authoritarian educational model, such as in Spain with Francoism and in Italy with Fascism. Yet the attempts following the end of the official hostilities did leave many unresolved issues. Keeping the memory of the atrocities alive, the witnessing of the survivors, the continuous information, the museums and monuments built as perennial remainders for the new generations have never really affected the mutual hidden prejudices between nations and different factions. Many debris from the violences employed during the war by the different sides, factions, groups and nations have not been worked through. This is why they are doomed to re-emerge in a variety of forms, sometimes disguised and unrecognizable, as soon as the right situation appears.

Later, we have witnessed the student protest in the 1960’s and in the following decades. It was expressed in a variety of ways, at times violently, at times peacefully. Within the protest movement many contradictory forces were at work and, in some countries, generated phenomena of terrorism of various political orientation, such as in Italy and in Germany. The governments and societies responded to these protest movements often, though not always, with violence. As we have mentioned, we don’t want to overlook the huge complexity of the factors at play in the twentieth century, but we rather focus on the educational and
psychological aspects inherent in the historical events. History is a carrier of pedagogy, as
the historical events educate and shape people who in turn, with their own personality and
education, shape and mould the historical events. The protest generations in the 1960’s and
70’s tried to make the dream of promptly changing everything and getting rid of the old
habits, the old social and educational models, the ideologies and the repressive and
standardized behaviours, come true. In particular, the fighting generations attacked the
authoritarian educational model at work in the society at all levels, at school, in the factory, in
the family, in the relationships between men and women, parents and children, in the relation
between the state and the citizens, in the religion and the army. However, those generations
did hope to wipe out the thousand-year-old authoritarian model lying at the basis of every
society since ever straightaway. Of course, they managed to affect many aspects of the
institutions and social models, in the school and the family. The youth of those generations,
one they grew up, often became the carriers of the same authoritarian and repressive model
they had criticized. In many other cases, though, not having fully made the dream of
changing everything at once come true led to disenchantment and bitterness, social
withdrawal, and disengagement from the society and the politics. However, we can see here
some issues that were overlooked, particularly those concerning the root of the illusion to
change and of the strong feelings in the following disillusioned stage. We also need to
scrutinize what happened once the protest was over and how this protest later turned into
greater adjustments to the status quo in the various societies. When the protest generations
violently undermined the past habits and models, inevitably some debris were generated but
not enough worked through. We can maintain that the entire history of the twentieth century
is pervaded with unseen, unrecognized debris that were not regarded as a main element for
a new form of radical adult education.

VIOLENCE AND EDUCATION

It is very interesting that violence referred to a pedagogical model – the authoritarian one –
through which other behaviours, ideas and supports were imposed. Hence, we can gather
that education is closely interwoven with the exercise of power in general and with violent
power in particular, and that it connives at it. Just as interestingly, violence and sadism have
been expressed through educational practices with children, youth and adults – like in
confinement camps, in politico-social organisations where children, youth, women, adults
gathered, not to mention the army, i.e. the foundation of the pedagogy of nations that aimed
to expand to the detriment of others. This reflection leads us to ask ourselves radically as to
what education is, on what it is based, what its deep and invisible implications are, what the
use of education on the part of adults, societies, cultures, governments is. No doubt,
education is an important tool for societies that, in order to perpetuate themselves, develop
rules and regulations to make the individual take up behaviours and attitudes consistent with
those designed by the perpetuation of the society and the culture themselves. “The outer
face is the rule as the product of an external, collective will. The inner face is the rule as a
mental object, as a representation of the mind of the agent that is somehow regulated by it”
(Conte, 1991). While the rules define somehow the general principles of behaviour, the
regulations are understood as propositions prescribing actions and procedures, behavioural
patterns that need to be put in place to adjust to the kind of social relations in any given
society (Marsh, Rosser, Harrè, 1980). Thus, morals are understood as the formation of an
inner guide that regulates the individual behaviour in harmony with the values recognized by
the social group of belonging and their translation into rules and regulations (Zaltron,
Favretto, De Piccoli, 2001). Along with this structural framework, lying at the basis of the formation and permanence of cultures and societies, we find the tool of sanction. Sanctions are one of the ways of making sure that the individual has learned the rules and regulations of society and respects them. Sanctions operate both at an explicit level, through clear punishment, such as body punishments and fines, and at a non-explicit level, through less clear punishments mostly affecting the individual’s psyche (Ferrari, 1997).

The authoritarian pedagogical model is usually considered as a very useful means to drive the human being to apply rules and regulations externally and to internalize them. It is particularly so, if it is exercised since childhood (Miller, 1998). The adult then has to internally deal with this deep and unconscious internalization – that moulded the structure of his/her personality – throughout his/her life. Often, internally addressing the legacy of authoritarian education is a source of conflicts, since – when the authoritarian educational model was pervasive –, it attempted to quench the individual’s vitality and creativity to the detriment of an adjustment to the rule and its supporting ideology. When the adapting education was so radical and pervasive, it was internalized by the individual as a significant part of the personality structure, so much that it can be viewed as the inborn nature of the individual. Consequently, the person often experiences great psychic suffering and unrecognized anxiety. The person might have cultivated hatred and resentment against the authoritarian and castrating education he/she received. If the person, in his/her developmental history, had no chance to express this anger, hatred, resentment, wish for revenge and to share these feelings with somebody capable of understanding and listening to him/her, the person will be driven by unconscious forces to keep these feelings hidden, to bury them under the conscious level. This unfortunately very frequent phenomenon has severe consequences, since those who cannot express in words the tears, the pain, the regret of what could have been but wasn’t, in fact flare up in acting-out, i.e. thoughtless actions without awareness. The individual, dramatically dealing with the structural part of the authoritarian model internalization – its ideologies, rules, regulations, morals – finds him/herself struggling with parts of him/herself. The most castrating parts try to attack and punish the most vital ones and vice versa. Then, the individual, trapped and hopeless, trying to stop this inner fight, attacks him/herself physically, ends up becoming insane or displaces this destructive attack onto others with the unconscious illusion to get rid of the unbearable inner burden. Alice Miller, for example, has reconstructed Hitler’s life history according to the hypothesis that he received a violent and cruel education at home and later he displaced it onto the Jews and, in general, his opponents, in an attempt to unconsciously take revenge of his wounds and traumas. In this case also, at the level of individuals, there is a huge accumulation of debris coming from the educational actions through the authoritarian model. Here we are referring to psychological, symbolic, cultural, and social debris.

So, we need to further explore how the debris left by the authoritarian pedagogical model at the individual level intersect with those left by coercion at a societal level, how the debris of the World Wars, and particularly those left by Nazism and Fascisms, have hiddenly operated to form an agglutination of individual and collective psychic fantasies. We also need to understand how the debris – in the rubble of authoritarian educational models that collapsed under the attacks of the youth protest and spread across all societal areas – connects individuals and social climates, individuals and violent behaviours. We need to inquire into the consequences of these multiple layers of debris in society, no doubt in our Europe that, during these troubled times, is dramatically trying to find ways and forms of communal life between different nations, often by using tools of imposition, sanction, economic and financial
war. The authoritarian educational model seems to continue to be a core element in the history of relations between societies, cultures, people, between adults and children in many contexts and situations. This model appears to be a pivot around which a variety of events, dynamics, movements – both at individual and social levels – gravitate by identification or opposition. In our contemporary times the authoritarian educational model has apparently left room for more affect-loaded, freer relationships that seem to pay greater attention to individual sensitivity and creativity. However, faced with the continuous violence widespread in all contexts – both public and private, individual and collective – we may need to change our mind and rather say that freer and more respectful educational forms exist juxtaposed with other forms charged with those debris left by the authoritarian model in those who experienced it and those who fought it. The very dream of changing everything right away, besides casting some light on a typical part of the psychic human functioning – just think about Freud's pleasure principle and its correlated omnipotence – is closely associated with the authoritarian educational model. Indeed, the omnipotent dream of changing everything quickly parallels and is linked to the feeling of not being able to tolerate the frustration of a castrating and punitive education. The protest movements were a revolt against the pedagogy of the actual and symbolic fathers, in the illusion of finally taking revenge of the exercise of a coercive and often even physically violent power.

The greatest illusion was to believe that it was possible to shake off the heavy educational internalized burdens through physical rebellion. However, our psyche does not so easily yield to command. We can see how, with the post-war reconstruction and 1968, two great dreams of changing everything were expressed. People thought that it was possible to put a lid on many things of the past in order to start all over from then on. That was not the case. In fact, we can say that in both situations we have seen a heavy and very dangerous split: only the good sides were emphasized whereas the negative aspects were overlooked. The latter invariably showed up again! And they keep on showing up over and over, in terms of violence, cruelty, tortures, racism, rapes, atrocities of all sorts. All one has to do is to read a newspaper in the morning: it is a war report! Such unrecognized negative aspects circulate everywhere, at individual and collective levels, as ghosts that poison the relationships between individuals and between nations. Also the remarkable investment in the world of education in general, and in adult education in particular, that occurred in the twentieth century, should have taken these psychological negative aspects more in account, so as to be more effective. On the contrary, we generally focused on offering positive models, with ideologies aiming at emancipation, active and conscious citizenship, resilience, increase in effectiveness and efficiency, competitiveness in the development of cognitive and behavioural skills. Obviously, all these goals can be very helpful, but only if they are integrated with the above-mentioned aspects.

ADULT EDUCATION: PROACTIVE PART

DESTINY OF THE DEBRIS AND THEIR EDUCATIONAL WORKING THROUGH

We need to deconstruct these individual and social ghosts. If the wounds of the violence suffered in the past, of the primacy of the powerful and successful men over the weak and the marginalized people in the world, of the authoritarian model which is still in power – although more covertly – are not treated, if most of the personal and professional
relationships are not integrated, I believe that the role and the possibility of adult education to really affect society will turn out to be seriously undermined.

Explicitating the truth often seems to be an essential step, as Laura Boldrini – the President of the Chamber of Deputies of the Italian Parliament – said when she opened the congress The necessary truth – The reconciliation processes in the countries of the Arab Springs.

Peace and reconciliation of the people torn by the wars go through the truth, particularly about the dramatic issue of sexual abuse as an instrument to be used against women, as well as children and men during the wars or in post-war situations. “Recalling is a very painful process. Not all the victims can do it… But the narratives can contribute to lead individuals, communities and societies into the future. Only by telling the truth, peace and reconciliation can re-emerge” (http://www.repubblica.it/solidarieta/emergenza/2013/07/03/news/egitto-62312311/?ref=HREA-1. Retrieved July 22, 2013)

But then, can we explore what truth we are referring to? What meaning or meanings do we attribute to truth? The truth of information or the truth of emotions? Can the truth of recalling be enough? As we know since Freud, there are screen memories and censored memories, memories that split some aspects and leave them hidden because they are too painful. There are memories that describe a happy world, because being confronted with a dramatic truth is intolerable. Can we express all the memories through narrative? Sometimes memories are expressed in other forms, through the body, the dreams, the drawings, and art. They become hidden forms of truth-telling that need to be understood and interpreted. And another aspect to be recalled concerns the truth of the others, even the truth of the perpetrators. What is their truth? What are their memories? To mention this point, along with the truth of the abused, seems always to be irreverent. And yet, if we don’t consider all the different truths and the explicit or hidden memories, we cannot work in depth at the level of the collective social discomfort surrounding us. Keeping the dramatic memory of the atrocities alive and giving information and endless evidence of it is very important but not sufficient at all, as is often declared, to prevent this violence from occurring again. We have witnessed similar tragedies in the world. To be on the side of the abused and the defeated ones, by claiming loudly their rights needs to go along with more complex actions, in ways that are still to be explored so as to understand what were the reasons, the feelings, and the dynamics of the violent perpetrators. Those who want to work for an improvement in the social well-being need to look both sides at the same time, both truths of the abuser and the abused. Here, we are not talking about a general conciliatory attitude or catholic compassion. We are talking about something else, that is, the possibility to try to understand the reasons of both the violent acts and the hatred and revenge that these acts generate in the abused, in order to be able to integrate, over time, the different stances rather than keeping them split. If we don’t find or devise new contexts, settings, methods that lead to such an integration, violence – pushed under the surface in the hope that it will disappear – will continue to re-emerge. And the world will continue to be surprised, as if it did not understand where violence comes from. We conclude with the words of the group of German and Israeli psychoanalysts, which I have mentioned earlier, that have founded an association called “Partners in Confronting Collective Atrocities”, that works towards developing strategies to engage with the internal legacy of past atrocities. They ask themselves if there is the possibility to devise a setting where such forces could be engaged honestly and safely. Moreover, they ask themselves if such an engagement could make a difference. They organize experiential working
conferences in order to give a response to this challenge, using the Tavistock Group Relations model, which integrates psychoanalytic and systems approaches. They want to create a context in which:

“experiences relating to the Holocaust that are ordinarily disowned could be discovered, voiced and comprehended. For each group the physical presence of the other served to bring to the fore complex and difficult feelings that included painful and entrenched group enmity, hatred, prejudice, cruel persecution and unbearable shame and guilt; once in the open they became available to be worked on. The work that takes place is therefore intensely personal, forging new bonds of trust across old divides, and allowing participants to examine the ways in which the legacy of the past, alive within, bedevils the current relationships of individuals and groups. Developing insight into how the burdens of the past are alive within us, within the experiential conference setting, has helped many individuals to move on to a more hopeful future. We believe that such individual movement fosters group movement, and PCCA’s experiential conferences will continue to serve these aims. In addition to the German/Jewish core issues, however, there has been a growing awareness of the need to work on newly invoked enmities (e.g., Arab/Jew; Muslim/Jew-Christian; Palestinian/Israeli), which have particular urgency in light of the dangerous escalation of armed conflict in our world. The model we have developed has been used also to work on “the tense triangle” (Bar-On) of Germans, Israelis and Palestinians today, including Others, to shed light on what is going on, and to contribute towards building a better future” (http://p-cca.org/about/, Retrieved July 23, 2013)

Adult education has the historical and political task to inquire into this serious issue of violence, looking for new models and methods to lead the adults and the groups toward a psychological and social integration.

CONCLUSIONS

My analysis leads me to maintain that the project of development of the world of education in the second half of the twentieth century, including adult education, was often based on an individual and collective unconscious split. After the two World Wars and the student revolution in the 1960’s, we tried to leave the wounds and the tragedies caused by various kinds of violence behind. But many debris were not worked through: anger, anxiety, revenge, grudge. Adult education has the historical and political task to inquire into this serious issue of violence, looking for new models and methods that will enable adults and groups to operate a psychological and social integration. Memory needs to be inscribed in adult education projects based on wider educational models that include and understand some aspects that have been split so far. Particularly, we need to explore the role that the authoritarian pedagogical model – one of the most used tools to employ violence – continues to play more or less covertly at all societal levels. Therefore, we need to review the meaning, the kind, and the form of political and social investment in adult education.
REFERENCES


Richards M. (2002). From war culture to civil society: Francoism, social change, and memories of the Spanish Civil War, Bristol, eprints.uwe.ac.uk/13410/1/H%26M-pre-
ABOUT THE CHANGES AND CHALLENGES OF ADULT EDUCATION IN POLAND IN THE YEARS 1989-2013

Solarczyk-Szwec, Hanna
Nicolaus Copernicus University
Poland

Matusiak, Anna
Nicolaus Copernicus University
Poland

Szwech, Agata
Nicolaus Copernicus University
Poland

ABSTRACT

The purpose of this article is to present the changes that have taken place in Polish adult education in the years 1989-2013 under the influence of multiple factors, i.e. social, economic, political and those relating to civilization on the whole. This article is an attempt to answer the following questions: does modern adult education in Poland meet the expectations of society? Is it a driving force behind modernization?; and, does it respond to the needs of the modern labour market? These issues have been presented in an international context, in the light of statistical data and from the perspective of original reading of the literature on the subject.

1. INTRODUCTION

Far-reaching transformations have taken place in the Polish educational system ever since 1989. The new socio-political-economic system, liberated from the chains of real socialism and centralism of management of all aspects of life in Poland, "imposed" transformation on all educational levels. It was also an important stimulus for change within Polish adult education. Civilizational change occurring in the last 25 years around the world, dynamic to a degree perhaps never before experienced in human history, also became another key driver for its reform. Thus, in a sense, the current situation of adult education in the Polish Republic is a result of both of these groups of processes, i.e. the internal ones resulting from the change of the political system in Poland and the approach to this issue of national policy makers and other organizers of the learning space, and the external ones associated with global modernization transformations and trends observed on the international arena and / or those imposed by Polish participation in the activities of the structures of different international entities [1,2].

The three main questions that are worth answering, to introduce the reader to the contemporary condition of Polish adult education, can be formulated as follows:

a) Does the state of Polish adult education today meet the expectations of society, after more than two decades since the collapse of real socialism and the beginning of Poland's (re)construction of fully democratic structures of a civil state and society?
2) Is adult education, as happens in many other countries of the modern world, the driving force behind socio-economic development and, therefore, an important part of the comprehensive modernization of the Polish Republic?

c) Is the scope and extent of citizen participation in various forms of adult education in Poland (formal, non-formal and informal education) appropriate to the needs / challenges of today's labour market and social life?

2. POLISH ADULT EDUCATION IN THE LIGHT OF INTERNATIONAL CHALLENGES

The Common Declaration of the European Ministers of Vocational Education and Training and the European Commission - Copenhagen Declaration "On enhanced European cooperation in vocational education and training", agreed in autumn 2002, stressed that participation in adult education "is essential for the promotion of employment, active citizenship, personal development and fighting social exclusion (p. 2)" [3]. For many years adult education in societies has been a catalyst for change, opening over subsequent decades universal access to education: in the second half of the 1940s and in the 1950s to elementary education and, with time, vocational (e.g. in Poland and other countries of the former "Eastern Bloc") [4,5,6]; in the 1960s and 1970s all over the world to secondary education; and today to higher education [7,8,9]. Thus, it has become one of the major causes of transformations in the social structures of individual countries, especially of a noticeable transfer of large groups of citizens from the working class to the middle class and, eventually, also to the upper class. These processes, however, did not bring social equality, as a growing gap between the still insufficient number of those benefiting from education and further training and the large group of those staying away from education became evident.

The above findings confirm the diagnosis provided over the years by, for example, the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), emphasizing that "for those who have successful educational experience, and who see themselves as able, continuous learning is an enriching experience that heightens a sense of control over their own lives and their own environment. However, for those who are excluded from the process, or who prefer not to participate in it, the dissemination of lifelong learning can only have the effect of deepening isolation from the world of those "rich in knowledge". This results in economic consequences, involving the under-utilization of human potential and increased spending on social assistance, as well as social consequences in the form of alienation and declining social infrastructure" [10]

Thus, in the last 25 years, education has been promoted to the rank of capital, which is worth investing in because it determines, much more so than in the past, the quality of human life and an individual's social position. A good education gives you a chance to live in the socio-economic mainstream of your country, whereas qualifications inadequate to the needs of the labour market and the various conditions of social life can become a cause of social exclusion. Therefore, education of citizens is an important indicator of the intellectual capital of each state. This is more and more clearly visible also in Poland. Reference is made in particular to the impact of the level, scope and quality of education of citizens on the development of key components of intellectual capital, such as the following:

- human capital – that is, the potential accumulated in all Poles expressed in their education, life experience gained, attitudes and skills;
• structural capital – that is, the potential accumulated in the infrastructure of the system of education and innovation, i.e. in educational, scientific, and research centres, ICT and intellectual property;
• social capital – that is, the potential accumulated in Polish society in the form of recognized values and standards of conduct, public trust and commitment;
• relational capital – that is, the potential of the image of Poland abroad, the level of integration with the global economy and attractiveness for its foreign "customers" – business partners, investors and tourists. [11]

The government analyses conducted in Poland indicate that the resources provided in the individual components above can and should become a source of current and future well-being of society [12].

The growing importance of education resulted in extending the period of education in Europe in the years 1970-2000, including by an average of three years in Poland. At the same time, the working week was reduced from six to five working days. Thus, the overall balance of an individual's free time in the last 50 years has remained unchanged. It can therefore be stated, in some approximation, that an average Pole could, during his or her lifetime, devote as much time as his or her parents did to various forms of adult educational activity. However, the development of modern civilization causes a situation in which the role of education (and qualifications as the final product of the process) has increased significantly. Currently, every adult has to create their educational path consciously. Entering into employment and adult functioning in society, graduates of secondary schools and universities should therefore be aware of the inevitability of having to return to education and be prepared for the following:

a) educational and professional career planning throughout their whole lives,
b) their own educational and professional career management throughout their whole lives,
c) professional and spatial mobility,
d) lifelong learning [13, 14, 15],
e) participation in the "silver economy" [16].

In the context of the necessity, apparent in modern times, to change one's job / profession probably several times during one's lifetime, it is not so much the level of education itself, but the individual attitude towards adult education that will determine the social status of individual citizens. The product (sum) of these attitudes will in turn largely affect the potential / intellectual capital across Poland.

3. ADULT EDUCATION IN POLAND – QUANTITATIVE INDICATORS

Despite the noticeable overall increase in the level of educational aspirations of Polish society in the last two decades, the attitude of less educated persons and those over 40 years of age towards enhancing their own qualifications and, more broadly, towards education in general, stills remains problematic. The Report of the Chief Statistical Office on

\[1\] silver economy – an economic system aimed at exploiting the potential of older people and taking into account their needs – see: http://aktywni45plus.eu/silver-economy-srebrna-ekonomia (12-09-2013).
adult education in Poland at the end of the last decade [17] shows that nearly two thirds of those aged 25-64 (64.2%) did not participate in any forms of education or training. Only one in three people (35.8%) undertook or continued their education. Such a rate of participation of adult Poles in various forms of education is, certainly, highly unsatisfactory and shows that building public awareness in this regard becomes a major challenge in promoting lifelong learning in Poland.

Among people undertaking their education after the age of 24, every twentieth person has undertaken training in a variety of schools for adults (formal education), nearly every fifth person has studied for extra qualifications at various courses and training events (non-formal education). A quarter of respondents also declared their participation in informal education, understood in the CSO [GUS] statistics as "self-study without the help of a teacher". Detailed data are shown in Table 1.

Table 1. The percentage of Poles aged 25-64 by participation in formal, non-formal and informal education

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Specification</th>
<th>Persons participating in education:</th>
<th>Persons not participating in any form of education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>in any form</td>
<td>formal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total *:</td>
<td>35.8</td>
<td>5.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>men</td>
<td>35.4</td>
<td>4.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>women</td>
<td>36.2</td>
<td>6.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in cities</td>
<td>41.8</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in villages</td>
<td>25.3</td>
<td>3.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: the figures do not add up to 100%, because one person could simultaneously participate in several forms of education/training.

Source: Chief Statistical Office, Adult education, Warsaw 2009, p 25

Four out of five people (80.8%), working professionals, increased their level of education within the system of formal education, which attests, on the one hand, to a high desire to improve their own qualifications by the working population of Poles, while on the other hand, to the requirements established by many employers, "forcing" their employees to adopt this type of approach. Unfortunately, the participation in formal education of persons falling within the categories of "unemployed" and "economically inactive" does not instil optimism. Barely one in eleven unemployed and just over one in ten economically inactive people confirmed their participation in some form of adult education "school".

The dominant categories of the working population who gained qualifications within the system of formal education were specialists in a field (41%), technicians and other professionals at the medium level (18%), office workers (10.2%) and public officials, senior officials and managers (7.5%). Farmers, gardeners, foresters and fishermen were among those who undertook a form of education/training on the rarest basis (in each case only one

---

2 The report of the Chief Statistical Office [Polish: GUS] cited here (Adult Education, Warsaw, 2009) was developed on a representative sample of 20,634 adult Poles.

Note: All the figures quoted in this article – unless another source has been identified – come from the study.
in a hundred of them (1.1%) undertook a form of training in the system of formal adult education).

Employed or self-employed people in areas such as education (19.9%), public administration and national defence (14.7% in total), industrial manufacturing (12.9%) and health care and social assistance (11.1% in total) were among those who undertook a form of education/training on the most frequent basis.

In the light of the quantitative data cited earlier, Poles' participation in formal adult education is not satisfactory. What results, then, in terms of quality does this type of training produce? In this regard, the research conducted among students of schools for adults in one of the southern regions of Poland can be representative of the situation in Polish society as a whole. Namely, it confirms empirically the low level of autonomy of the respondents, both individual and in learning, and their strong dependence on institutions, repetitive practice of learning and trained patterns of building identity. The respondents pointed to the need for external organization of education and formulated a number of expectations with regard to organizational facilitation, financial aid, and strict control of the learning process itself. They perceive themselves, meanwhile, as compliant participants in education, adhering to rules, and not rebelling against the school as an organization.

The attitude of adult learners can be defined as involved or committed but non-autonomous, that is, they are willing to undertake learning activities, but do not wish or are not able to take responsibility for the quality and progress of the process. Such an attitude results from the poorer educational, cultural and social capital of the backgrounds they come from, and the stiffening of these attitudes is also affected by the culture of learning in institutions of adult education, which goes in the direction of "offering a therapy" to their learners, while when implementing educational activities they turn to the classical repertoire of school teaching methods, though at the same time liberalizing the relationship with students. This is welcomed by students, who thus confine themselves to their educational ghetto, tacitly accepting the measures and practices within the framework defined and provided by the institution and not taking any steps to redefine, criticize or renegotiate them. Nor do these institutions encourage this, since maybe they do not envisage in education the potential for social change, or at most for better adaptation [18]. Regarding extra-mural studies, the situation looks pretty similar in the light of written comments made by students. Extra-mural studies are considered primarily in terms of adaptation to the labour market, rather than an opportunity to work on one's own identity [19]. Thus, formal adult education performs neither an emancipatory nor critical function, which means that the majority of adults remain passive in the face of social change.

Non-formal education and training (in the form of training sessions) is undertaken in Poland mostly by employed, highly qualified people, having a particular profession, for whom improving their qualifications and gaining new skills is a way to accelerate their careers and promotion at work. Thus, adult education is not used as a strategy to leave the zone of social exclusion, but primarily as a strategy to adjust one's competences to the challenges of the labour market (Table 2).

---

3 The research was conducted by Ewa Kurantowicz and Adrianna Nizińska from Dolnośląska Szkoła Wyższa in Wrocław [the University of Lower Silesia] in Lower Silesia in the years 2009-2011.
4 The research was by Alicja Jurgiel-Aleksander of the University of Gdańsk.
Table 2. Participants in non-formal education by the level of their education and status on the labour market

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Specification</th>
<th>The level of education of participants in non-formal education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Higher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employed</td>
<td>49.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>29.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economically inactive</td>
<td>36.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


People active in the field of non-formal vocational education select courses (content) offering hard competences, much less frequently choosing soft ones. When examining forms of education, it turns out that traditional forms of transfer of knowledge, not conducive to discussion, questioning, negotiating widely-held meanings or creativity, still dominate. Therefore, it should not be expected that non-formal education in its present form will contribute to the turn of competence towards autonomy, criticism, and innovation.

What seems worrying is the rate of participation in non-formal education provided in the report of the Chief Statistical Office, showing that only about 25% of adult Poles declare participation in this form of education. Eurostat estimates, exploring a slightly different statistic since they refer to employed adults, say in turn that only 10% of this group take part in informal adult learning, allocating for it an average of just over 40 hours per year, placing the Polish Republic in one of the last positions in the European Union in this regard [20].

If, therefore, following the literature on the subject, we accepted that most of the competences needed in social life are gained informally, and thus informal education is the basic strategy for lifelong learning and formal and non-formal adult education are only complementary forms [21], then it follows that a large part of adult Polish society are becoming more and more helpless (less qualified or competent) facing the demands of the dynamically changing world.

A number of factors differentiating the approach to adult education in different populations can be indicated. The following table (Table 3) shows the impact of a few important ones on making an educational effort in adulthood.

Table 3. Factors differentiating the approach to adult education among Poles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>Characteristics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>sex</td>
<td>The people not participating in any forms of adult education in Poland are equally men and women, thus, sex is not a factor differentiating Polish society in this respect.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>place of residence</td>
<td>More than a half of the urban population and as many as three-quarters of the rural population do not take part in adult education, making the place of residence an important element differentiating the approach to adult education.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The older people get, the less frequently they benefit from learning opportunities, thus, more than three quarters of people over 55 years of age do not knowingly undertake any educational activity any more. The highest percentage of those not participating in adult education (about $\frac{4}{5}$) occurs in the group of adults who did not complete secondary education, whereas the lowest one occurs among adults with higher education. In the whole group of those not participating in any form of education, slightly more than a half are employed, but among the unemployed almost three quarters of Poles undertake no additional training at all.

Source: Own study by the authors – from the CSO [GUS], Adult Education, A Report, Warsaw 2009.

The main reasons for not undertaking any form of formal, non-formal or informal education by Poles after 24 years of age, as provided by the adults themselves, are varied. Table 4 shows a few of them, those most frequently indicated by the respondents.

Table 4. The reasons (excuses?) for failing to make an educational effort in adulthood by contemporary Poles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Reason provided</th>
<th>The percentage of adult Poles</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>no such need for their own interests</td>
<td>44.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>no such need in their work</td>
<td>43.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>lack of motivation to resume studying</td>
<td>40.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>too high a price of a course / training</td>
<td>32.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>health problems / age</td>
<td>32.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>lack of time for family reasons</td>
<td>24.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>lack of an adequate offer close to the place of work / residence</td>
<td>18.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>lack of support from the employer</td>
<td>16.6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


4. CONCLUSION

Ever since the collapse of the Polish People's Republic, a satellite to the Soviet Union, more than two decades ago, Polish adult education has undergone a far-reaching transformation. Freeing itself from "unwanted ideology" and centralized management, Polish adult education found itself in a new socio-political and economic situation, in which, step by step, it had to build its position in a more and more democratic country, while also experiencing significant changes itself. On the one hand, attempts continued to be made to save the form and content of adult education from the past through their adaptation to new challenges and tasks while, on the other hand, a number of new institutions / organizations emerged, wishing to organize the educational activity of adult Poles in different ways.

Nowadays, school-based forms of education continue to play the major role on the Polish market of educational services for adults. At the same time, general education is dominated by vocational education, within which institutions with a well-established long-term position,
such as continual education centres (CEC) and vocational training centres (VTC) maintain their strong position. In recent years, the apparent development of the education of seniors, especially the universities of the third age and the increase in short-term projects in the field of adult education financed by European Union funds, is also a novelty in the Polish situation.

Still, the ideas of adult education, and more broadly the ideas of lifelong education, require action to disseminate them widely in Polish society. Only well-thought-out PR actions may encourage "resistant" adults, who still account for nearly two-thirds of the adult population of Poland, to take advantage of the educational offer.

A comparative analysis of the current value of the intellectual capital of Poland with the data for 16 other European countries conducted a few years ago by a Team of Strategic Advisers to the Prime Minister [22] showed that different generations of Poles are placed in distant positions, when compared with other European countries. This means that in this respect the distance between Poland and the most developed European countries is still considerable and significant. Until recently, it was not too big an obstacle to the development of the country, since the competitiveness of the Polish economy was based on advantages such as low labour costs, a large market, and location in the centre of Europe. However, contemporary Polish society and the desire to build a knowledge-based economy require substantial strengthening of the intellectual capital. Investing in education, which determines the course of one's professional career, should be the basis of this process. It is important here to treat both these types of activity, i.e. education and professional work, as a lifelong undertaking.

Referring towards the end of these considerations to the questions posed at the beginning of this article, it must be objectively concluded that there is still much to do in Poland in all the three issues raised here. Thus, the answers at present, as indicated in the content of this outline, would be only partially affirmative. However, both policy makers as well as theoreticians and the relatively large number of practitioners of adult education in Poland are aware of the importance of adult education to building the intellectual capital of the country and preventing the social exclusion of individuals and whole social groups. This in turn gives us hope that in time we will be able to answer each of these questions positively in the Polish context.

REFERENCES


5 Respectively, the generation of children and youth is in 13th position in the ranking, the generation of students in 14th position in the ranking, the generation of adults in 15th position in the ranking, and the generation of seniors in 16th position in the ranking.


## AUTHORS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Antunes, Fátima</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ambrósio, Susana</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Araújo e Sá, Maria Helena</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aust, Kirsten</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bancheva, Elmira</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barros, Rosanna</td>
<td>521</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Biasin, Chiara</td>
<td>274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brunner, Stefanie</td>
<td>287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brusch, Michael</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buddeberg, Klaus</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bushe, Hugh</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Büsch, Victoria</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Castiglioni, Micaela</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cooper, Tom</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cox, Anna</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Desmarais, Danielle</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dietel, Sylvana</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Durant, Christine</td>
<td>537</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ebner von Eschenbach, Malte</td>
<td>549</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eneau, Jerome</td>
<td>437</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enoch, Clinton</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evans, Rob</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eveleigh, Alexandra</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ewing, Bronwyn</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fairfoot, Glen</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formenti, Laura</td>
<td>328</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foroughi, Behrang</td>
<td>537</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Galimberti, Andrea</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gilardi, Filippo</td>
<td>343</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gold, Margaret</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guimarães, Paula</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haberzeth, Erik</td>
<td>564</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Härnsten, Gunilla</td>
<td>583</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hartz, Stefanie</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heikkinen, Anja</td>
<td>572</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hendy, Mohamed H.</td>
<td>355</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hernández Carrera, Rafael M.</td>
<td>370</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Holmstrand, Lars</td>
<td>583</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iacovides, Ioanna</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Isopakhala-Bouret, Ulpukka</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ivanova, Maria</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>James, Nalita</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jennett, Charlene</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kääpplinger, Bernd</td>
<td>7, 11, 388</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kloetzker, Laure</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kondrup, Sissel</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kopczyk, Martin</td>
<td>596</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Koskinen, Helena</td>
<td>404</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kretschmer, Stefanie</td>
<td>287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kulmus, Claudia</td>
<td>564</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Langemeyer, Ines</td>
<td>417</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lichte, Nina</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lucio-Villegas, Emilio</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lundgren, Henriette</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mallard, Simon</td>
<td>437</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matthews, Chris</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matusiak, Anna</td>
<td>654</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monginho, Ricardo R.</td>
<td>604</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morrice, Linda</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Németh, Balázs</td>
<td>617, 633</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Olesen, Henning Salling</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Palmer, Anna-Marie</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paulos, Catarina</td>
<td>449</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pätzold, Henning</td>
<td>497</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perla, Loredana</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Piela, Anna</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Piirainen, Anna</td>
<td>460</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Piirainen, Arja</td>
<td>473</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pojarliev, Alexander</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quintana-Murci, Elena</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reid, James</td>
<td>343</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Riekmann, Wibke</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Riva, Maria Grazia</td>
<td>642</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rohrdantz-Herrmann, Ines</td>
<td>417</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salvàn-Mut, Francesca</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sarra, Grace</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

663
Schmidt-Hertha, Bernhard ..............245
Schneider, Daniel ......................73
Simões, Ana Maria ....................506
Simões, Ana Raquel ...................14
Solarczyk-Szwec, Hanna ..............654
Szwech, Agata .........................654
Thieme, Victoria .......................229
Vinci, Viviana ..........................144
Virgilio, Flavia ..........................485
Zawacki-Richter, Olaf .................287