



RESEARCH PAPERS

from the Department of Social Sciences

Institut for Samfundsvidenskab og Erhvervsøkonomi

Research Paper no. 5/03

Study on national employment strategies towards migrants and ethnic minorities (NatEmp-project) Country Study Denmark

Assistant Professor Shahamak Rezaei, Ph. D. & Consultant Lars Høeberg Nielsen, M.Sc.

Roskilde University, Denmark

Research Paper no. 5/03

**Study on national employment
strategies towards migrants and ethnic
minorities (NatEmp-project) Country
Study Denmark**

**Assistant Professor Shahamak Rezaei, Ph. D. &
Consultant Lars Høeberg Nielsen, M.Sc.**

Roskilde University, Denmark

Research Papers from the Department of Social Sciences, Roskilde University, Denmark.

Working paper series

The Department of Social Sciences is one of the largest at Roskilde University with 43 permanent scientific personnel together with several Ph.Ds, and other teaching staff. Most of the academic personnel have a background in economics, political science or sociology. It is a general goal of our department and the rest of Roskilde University to foster interdisciplinary teaching and research. The later can be seen from the five main research lines of the department, namely:

- ❖ Welfare State and welfare society
- ❖ Public organisation and poliy analysis
- ❖ Innovation and processes of change in service and industry
- ❖ Institutions, actors and institutionalisation
- ❖ Public sector economics, organisation and planning

The Research Papers from the Department of Social Sciences are edited by Associate Professor Anders Christian Hansen

Please note that:

The papers are on a 'work in progress' form, which means that comments and criticisms in the form of feed-back are welcomed. For this purpose, the address(es) of the author(s) is specified on the title page. Readers must also be aware that the material of the working papers might be printed later in journals or other means of scientific publication in a revised version.

© The author(s)

All rights reserved. No part of this working paper may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the author(s).

ISSN 1399-1396

Abstract

This report contains the Danish country study as part of the study on national employment strategies towards migrants and ethnic minorities (NatEmp-project). The project is carried out for the European Commission DG Employment and Social Affairs by the EuroFor network and with the Berlin Institute for Comparative Social Research (BIVS) as the coordinating partner. The objective of the NatEmp-project is a comparative analysis of the national programmes and strategies for the integration of immigrants and ethnic minorities in the labour market in all EU Member States. To this end country studies in each of the 15 Member States are carried out.

Keywords: EU, Labour Market, Labour Market Policy, NatEmp-project Danish Country Study, Migrants and the Danish Labour Market, the Danish EQUAL programme, the Danish National Action Plans for Employment (NAPempl) and the Danish National Action Plan to Combat Poverty and Social Exclusion (NAPincl).

Address for correspondence: shre@ruc.dk

Study on national employment strategies towards migrants

and ethnic minorities

(NatEmp-project)

Country Study Denmark

**By Assistant Professor Shahamak Rezaei, Ph. D. & Consultant Lars
Høeberg Nielsen, M.Sc., Roskilde University, Denmark**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction.....	6
Strategies in context: The Danish labour market and the situation of migrants and ethnic minorities...	7
Migrants and ethnic minority related activities in the Danish NAPs on Employment 1999-2002	10
NAP on Employment 1999.....	10
NAP on Employment 2000.....	10
NAP on Employment 2001.....	11
NAP on Employment 2002.....	12
Migrants and ethnic minority related activities in the Danish NAPincl 2001	15
EQUAL measures	17
Good practice.....	20
Diversity and Social responsibility.....	20
Ry – a municipality that needs every citizen.....	21
Conclusions	22
Literature	24
Additional on-line information sources	24

Introduction

This report¹ contains the Danish country study as part of the study on national employment strategies towards migrants and ethnic minorities (NatEmp-project). The project is carried out for the European Commission DG Employment and Social Affairs by the EuroFor network² and with the Berlin Institute for Comparative Social Research (BIVS) as the coordinating partner.

The objective of the NatEmp-project is a comparative analysis of the national programmes and strategies for the integration of immigrants and ethnic minorities in the labour market in all EU Member States. To this end country studies in each of the 15 Member States are carried out.

Following the overall objective of the NatEmp project, the country studies aim at mapping and analysing the national strategies and to identify examples of good practice that may be useful for the further development of a European strategy and the programmes of the individual Member States.

Due to the circumstances involved, this report has been written based on desk research solely. The report has thus been written based on reading and analyses of existing literature and information sources within the field including the Danish National Action Plans for Employment (NAPempl) and the Danish National Action Plan to Combat Poverty and Social Exclusion (NAPincl), a number of relevant articles and evaluation reports and various on-line information sources. For an overview please refer to the list of literature at the end of the report.

The Danish country study contained in this report is structured as follows:

In chapter 2, the situation of migrants and ethnic minorities on the Danish labour market and is described.

In chapter 3 and 4 a mapping of the initiatives related to the integration of migrants and ethnic minorities on the Danish labour market is carried out. The point of departure is the Danish National Action Plans for Employment (NAPempl) and the Danish National Action Plan to Combat Poverty and Social Exclusion (NAPincl), which contains most of the relevant strategies in the area in question. The NAPs are, however, supplemented by additional information sources.

In chapter 5 the Danish EQUAL programme is described and analysed.

Chapter 6 contain examples of good practice both within and outside the EQUAL framework.

Chapter 7 holds the conclusions of the study.

¹ The authors owe a deep debt of gratitude to Dr. Thomas Schwarz, Berlin Institute for Comparative Social Research, BIVS, European Migration Centre, Berlin, Germany, for giving us the opportunity to conduct this project. Thanks also go to Professor Dr. Ulf Hedetoft, Director of the Academy for Migration Studies in Denmark, AMID, Aalborg University, Denmark, for his comments and guidance.

² The European Research Forum on Migration and Ethnic Relations.

Strategies in context: The Danish labour market and the situation of migrants and ethnic minorities

Since 1993 Denmark has experienced a significant decline in unemployment. Unemployment has been reduced from 12% to around 5% (although recently unemployment has been increasing) and the employment rate has grown from 71% to close to 75%, thus being among the highest in the European Union.³

For migrants and ethnic minorities the situation is substantially different although the situation has improved in recent years.

As of January 2002, the number of immigrants in Denmark numbered approximately 320.000 persons (415.000 including descendants), thus constituting about 6% of the total population (7,7% including descendants). Of the total number of immigrants, approximately 210.000 (290.000 including descendants) were from less developed countries, which have experienced the greatest difficulties with regard to employment.⁴

As can be seen in

³ The development has been ascribed to the favourable macroeconomic situation, changed wage expectations, changes in the bargaining system and changes in labour market policy as a consequence of the 1994 labour market reform (e.g. de Koning et al 2002). A main element of the reform was the principle of right and duty to activation for all adult unemployed persons after a period of 12 months of unemployment. The main activation measures were job training in the private and the public sector and education, including specific education programmes designed for the unemployed.

⁴ Less developed countries defined as countries outside of Scandinavia, the EU and North America.

Table 1, the unemployment rate of immigrants has remained substantially above the general unemployment rate. Although the unemployment rate of immigrants has been more than halved since 1993, it is at 11,9% still more than double that of Danish born citizens. Likewise, if one takes a look at the participation rate for immigrants, it too shows a marked difference as compared to Danish born citizens.

Further it should be mentioned that despite the fact that unemployment among immigrants has been decreasing since 1994, labour market participation rates have remained almost constant since then.

Table 1 The labour market situation of immigrants

	1993	1995	1997	1999	2001
Unemployment (%)					
Overall	12,4	10,4	7,9	5,7	5,2
Immigrants - total	28,4	26,5	19,8	14,7	11,9
Immigrants - less developed countries	39,1	36,9	27,8	19,1	15,4
Immigrants - developed countries	18,8	16,6	13,5	9,7	8,1
Participation rate (%)					
Overall	80	79	77	78	78
Immigrants - total			55	56	56
Immigrants - less developed countries			51	51	51
Immigrants - developed countries			59	61	62

Source: Danish Statistics 2002

A recent report from the Ministry of Refugee, Immigrant and Integration Affairs summarising research results with regard to integration (2002) concludes that the higher unemployment rate among immigrants as compared to Danes is based both on a higher risk of becoming unemployed, longer spells of unemployment and shorter spells of employment. Immigrants are thus found to have greater difficulties gaining permanent employment as a way out of unemployment.

Among the reasons cited for the lack of labour market integration are:

- lack of educational qualifications
- insufficient Danish skills
- high minimum wages
- lack of economic incentives
- discrimination and non-acceptance of educational attainment

In general it is concluded though, that the knowledge of the causes for the lack of integration is still sporadic and imprecise.

It should be mentioned that although the participation and employment rate of immigrants from less developed countries is generally much lower than that of Danish born citizens there are also large differences within this group according to nationality. As an example, the employment rate of immigrants and refugees from Somalia is only 15%, whereas it is 56% for immigrants and refugees from Vietnam and 51% for immigrants from Turkey.

Part of the explanation for this difference can be found in the length of stay in Denmark. Research has thus shown, that there is an increasing trend of increased labour participation by immigrants from third countries the longer they have resided in Denmark (Ministry of Refugee, Immigrant and Integration Affairs 2002).

Migrants and ethnic minority related activities in the Danish NAPs on Employment 1999-2002

In the following, the activities contained in the NAPs on employment towards migrants and ethnic minorities are identified and described. The main focus is on the 2002 NAP and the (change of) strategy this reflects.

NAP on Employment 1999

According to the 1999 NAP on employment the general reduction in unemployment and the introduction of the right and duty to activation accentuated a need for special measures in relation to disadvantaged groups of unemployed. The main aim is thus to create a more inclusive labour market. To this aim measures focus on

- The initiation of preventive measures to prevent people from losing their labour market attachment (to reduce the risk of exclusion cf. above)
- Reducing the number of persons entering into the groups on public support, and
- Creating room on the labour market for people who are presently excluded from the labour market

As regards measures, which are specifically targeted to migrants and ethnic minorities, only few references are made in the 1999 NAP. One specific example though, is a number of projects concerning education and training offers to refugees and immigrants between the age of 16 and 25, who lack the necessary qualifications to participate in ordinary education and training programmes.

The education and training projects that are mentioned above form part of the integration act, which took effect on January 1st 1999. Only few references are made in the 1999 NAP to this act. The main elements and strategies are described as part of the NAPIncl.

Other measures are implemented by the social partners, including a special action plan for the integration of ethnic minorities into the labour market and a number of specific measures to promote ethnic equality and combat racism.

In addition, measures for migrants and ethnic minorities are contained in a number of the local employment pacts receiving funds from the ESF (51.6 million DKK). Three out of the five pacts that receive funding from the ESF thus have projects that are especially aimed at migrants and ethnic minorities.

NAP on Employment 2000

The overall employment strategy cited in the NAP 2000 is one of increasing the labour force in order to balance the demographic developments, which other things being equal will result in a fall in the labour force. To balance the demographic developments the overall employment strategy thus aims to increase the number of

labour market entrants and to increase the occupational activity of the individual age groups.

At a general level the strategy is amongst others pursued by reforms of early retirement schemes, strengthened activation measures and education and training programmes, changes in the system of adult vocational training, preventive measures and the continued development of the inclusive labour market.

As for measures specifically relating to migrants and ethnic minorities the NAP 2000 mentions the general action plan for better integration, which was submitted by the government in February 2000. The NAP mentions the following initiatives for improving the integration of ethnic minorities on the labour market:

- Language courses offered at an earlier stage to unemployed with insufficient Danish skills
- Easier access to wage subsidies for highly skilled unemployed
- The establishment of a mentor scheme for better integration of ethnic minorities into the labour market
- Increased knowledge about and use of the competencies of the ethnic minorities. In relation to this point, a national centre was established in January 2000 for validation of educational qualifications of foreigners including migrants and ethnic minorities.

The NAP 2000 also refers to an agreement between the social partners to start a fact-finding and monitoring study concerning equal treatment and non-discrimination in order to combat discrimination on the labour market.

NAP on Employment 2001

New measures towards migrants and ethnic minorities do not play a prominent role in the 2001 NAP. This is reflected in the 2001 Joint Employment Report, which stresses that “more attention needs to be paid to the integration of ethnic minorities” (JER 2001) and in the Councils 2002 recommendation, which also stresses the need for further efforts towards the integration of migrant workers.

The new initiatives, which nonetheless are contained in the 2001 NAP, are:

- Danish lessons offered at an earlier stage
- The establishment of special units in PES regions with the most refugees and immigrants to strengthen placement activities
- Establishment of partnerships among enterprises, local authorities, the PES, education and training institutions and other local actors
- Extension of wage subsidies for ethnic minorities to include also persons on social assistance and newly unemployed persons.

The 2001 NAP also announces a strengthening of measures against discrimination of exposed groups in order to increase the participation rate of migrant workers. This includes a number of new initiatives to follow up on the 1999 action plan for changing attitudes in connection with integration of ethnic minorities on the labour market in the state sector.

NAP on Employment 2002

Parallel to the previous NAPs an increase in employment is among the primary labour market policy objectives stated in the 2002 NAP. An increase in employment is described as “a central prerequisite for the Governments economic objectives, including the reduction of public debts, tax freeze, and moderate real growth in public consumption” (NAP 2002).

Labour market policy is thus described as playing an important role in meeting these objectives by increasing participation rates and contributing to a further reduction in unemployment. As stated in the NAP this objective of significantly increasing the supply of labour “is a very ambitious one, especially in the light of the fact that Denmark is among the EU countries which have the highest participation rates and the lowest level of unemployment” (NAP 2002).

One of the initiatives that are emphasised in order to meet these objectives is better integration of immigrants and refugees on the labour market. Higher participation rates of migrants could thus contribute significantly to fulfilling the aim of an overall increase in the supply of labour and labour market integration policy actually plays a prominent role in the 2002 NAP, which is a point also mentioned in the chapter on Denmark in the 2002 Joint Employment Report (JER Supporting Document, 2002).

The initiatives towards migrants and ethnic minorities in the 2002 NAP are part of the governments programme “On the track towards a new integration policy”.

The measures towards migrants and ethnic minorities described in the 2002 NAP are:

- A model for work practice in enterprises, where the enterprises in return for the offer of labour will have a duty to offer work introduction and training.
- An invitation to the social partners for proposals for recruitment of persons who have difficulties obtaining a foothold in the labour market.
- More flexible and enterprise oriented teaching of Danish.
- Strengthened possibilities for quick labour market entry for newly arrived refugees. These are to include individual contracts between the individual and the municipal authorities specifying the need for Danish lessons, qualifying training courses and work practices.
- Strengthened economic incentives to take up a job by the introduction of a starting allowance for persons who have not been in the country for seven

out the preceding eight years. The starting allowance is 30% - 50% lower than the full amount of social assistance and is combined with higher thresholds before earned income is deducted in the social assistance.

As a follow up to the integration package the government in May 2002 made an agreement with the social partners and the local authorities concerning labour market integration of immigrants and refugees.

The agreement aims to establish a stepwise model for integration through a combination of Danish lessons and attachment to enterprises including in the form of work practices as described above.

It is still too early to assess the effects of the different measures, but especially the introduction of the starting allowance has been criticised for the level of social assistance it entails and the fact that refugees and immigrants may receive this lower level of assistance for up to seven years.

As regards the prominent position of measures for labour market integration of migrants and ethnic minorities in the 2002 NAP this is parallel to what may be seen as a (almost paradigmatic) change of strategy.

Whereas the overall purpose of the integration act stipulates a broad concept of integration encompassing labour market integration as well as social and cultural integration, the liberal government – although the overall purpose of the act remains the same as in 1999 – has articulated an almost exclusive weight on labour market integration. Pushed to extremes, this sphere of integration is at the same time seen as means and as an end in itself.

This change in strategy has consequences for policymaking and -implementation. The government's determination to address the severe problems with high unemployment rates for refugees and immigrants was given a visible symbol with the making of the Ministry of Refugees, Immigrants and Integration (cf. below). The shift in strategy becomes visible when one compares the former government's general action plan for better integration (see the description of NAP 2000) and the above mentioned "On the track towards a new integration policy". The latter almost entirely focuses on labour market initiatives, while the former is much broader in focus, thus including initiatives in sports clubs, primary schools and social policy initiatives.

Another visible sign of the change in strategy is the reform of the teaching of Danish. When the integration act was implemented in 1999 a complementary "Teaching of Danish Act" accompanied it. The rationale behind the act was to increase the quality of the Danish teaching. The administrative responsibility was placed in the Ministry of Education and was built on didactical and pedagogical thinking. This logic – sustained by the profound identity of teaching institutions with a much broader mission than preparation for the labour market – in many ways conflicted with the logic of the integration act, building primarily on labour market logic (PLS RAMBOLL, 1999; 2000). The liberal government, acknowledging the importance of language skills as a means to increase self-sufficiency, addressed this conflict by two measures.

Firstly, it stressed the attempts of the previous government to create closer links between enterprises and language teaching. One example of this is by literally moving classes and teaching from schools to enterprises. The philosophy is to integrate teaching with the specific needs for concepts and words that are accentuated when e.g. a refugee is trained in an enterprise. The vocabulary needed at a carpenter's will be different than the one needed in a child-care institution. It should be mentioned, however, that this philosophy has been criticised for narrow-mindedness, as it is argued that this model underemphasizes the acquisition of broader language skills needed to take part in society as a whole.

Secondly, this movement is backed by legal and administrative reforms that support the philosophy. Recently, the teaching of Danish-act has been dramatically changed. The monopoly of municipal language schools has been removed opening a window of opportunity for private teaching-companies offering teaching in close connection with the needs of the enterprises.

Thus, the change of strategy is accompanied by specific policy initiatives.

Another development that should be mentioned in some length is the establishment of a new Ministry of Refugee, Immigrant and Integration Affairs as part of a wider reorganisation of government departments following the general elections in November 2001.

The ministry has taken responsibility for all aspects of policy in this area, which means that a number of responsibilities have been transferred from other ministries, most notably the Ministry of Employment (previously the Ministry of Labour) and the Ministry of Social Affairs.

While it is still too early to draw firm conclusions with regard to the results of this reorganisation, it is hoped that it will lead to a higher degree of coordination and consistency of measures towards migrants and ethnic minorities. On the other hand it may also be feared that measures towards migrants and ethnic minorities will be decoupled from the general labour market policy if sufficient coordination does not take place.

The initiatives in the government programme "On the track towards a new integration policy" are mentioned as part of the government's reply to the 2002 recommendation that Denmark should "pursue incentives to encourage yet more people to take up employment, particularly through further development of the inclusive labour market and further efforts towards the integration of migrant workers". The initiatives under this programme are also mentioned under guideline 7 "Discrimination and social integration".

Although the initiatives are presented as a reply to the Council's recommendations one should probably not overstate the influence of EU programming on the Danish policy including the recent change of strategy that was mentioned above. Although the exact influence of EU programming is unclear, the strategy change should not least be ascribed to domestic politics including the change of government coupled with the demographic challenges of increasing the labour force.

Migrants and ethnic minority related activities in the Danish NAPincl 2001

The Danish 2001 NAPincl mainly focuses on measures from a social policy point of view, which means measures towards persons receiving for example cash assistance, sickness benefits and rehabilitation benefits, whereas measures towards persons covered by unemployment benefits are contained in the NAPs for employment.

Most of the employment related measures in the NAPincl are contained under the heading of a more inclusive labour market. The vision of an inclusive labour market was introduced parallel to the implementation of the labour market reform in 1994 by the Ministry of Social Affairs. According to Bredgaard (2002), the vision had a dual approach focusing on the one hand, on reducing the risk of exclusion from ordinary employment and, on the other hand, integrating already marginalized groups into the labour market.

In relation to the implementation of the Danish strategy for a more inclusive labour market one can generally speak of three types of measures (Bredgaard 2002):

- Public campaigns to influence, create, and change attitudes and behaviour of stakeholders
- Economic instruments including wage subsidies, activation policy and funding of different types of project
- Establishment of a number of organisations that are responsible for the implementation of the strategy at national, regional, and local level. These include Local Coordination Committees where social partners and local authorities are equally represented, the National Social Council, and a number of special consulting organisations each of them dealing with different aspects of the strategy.

The main part of the initiatives toward migrants and ethnic minorities that are contained in the 2001 NAPincl are part of the measures that were introduced under the integration act, which came into force in January 1999.

As described in the 2001 NAPincl, the main objectives of the act are to:

- *“afford new immigrants and refugees equal opportunity to participate in all aspects of society – culturally, economically, politically and socially. Additionally with respect to religion – and working life.*
- *assist new immigrants and refugees in becoming self-sufficient, and*
- *provide new immigrants and refugees with an understanding of Danish society’s basic norms and values”* (NAPincl 2001).

At the organisational level a major change in relation to the previous legislation is that the responsibility for integration of newly arrived refugees and immigrants was transferred to the local authorities (the municipalities).

As was the case with the introduction of the labour market reform in 1994 the integration act is based on a 'right and duty' approach. For newly arrived refugees and immigrants the main initiative contained in the integration act is a three-year induction programme that includes courses on Danish society, Danish lessons, and activation. The integration act obliged refugees and immigrants to participate in the introductory programme in order to be eligible for social assistance.

The integration act also include a housing regulation obliging the municipalities to accept a certain number of newly arrived refugees in order to secure a more even geographic distribution of refugees.

The integration act was evaluated in 2000 with the following primary conclusions (PLS RAMBOLL, 2000):

- The level of training for refugees was very low. Most municipalities offered the mandatory course in Danish society and teaching in Danish but only a minority actually offered training on projects, in public institutions or at private enterprises. Especially the latter was almost non-existent. The evaluator concluded that the low level of training might result in difficulties with fulfilling the goal of self-sufficiency after the three years induction programme.
- The integration act introduced a duty for the municipalities to manage the induction programme with action plans describing goals and activities in the programme. The quality of these plans was poor. The plans did not build on the individual competencies of the refugees and did not meet the objective of binding the local efforts together.
- The local integration strategies did not focus on local partnerships. Partnerships with enterprises did only exist in a few municipalities, and the interaction with unions or clubs was almost non-existing. There was, however, one exception to the missing partnerships. The integration task thus became one of the largest inter-municipal fields of cooperation.

As already mentioned, government strategy has changed since the formulation of the integration act and the presentation of the 2001 NAPincl. Thus, although the overall purpose of the act is the same as in 1999, focus is now more exclusively on labour market integration, including as a means to achieve social and cultural integration.

For migrants and ethnic minorities that are not newly arrived, the NAPincl refers to yet another action plan, which was drawn up by a committee representing eight ministries. This action plan, which was presented in February 2000, consists of a number on initiatives that are implemented locally in cooperation between local

authorities, social partners, and organisations representing refugees and immigrants and a number of other actors. Among the initiatives mostly directed to labour market integration are:

- Strengthened employment services
- Easier access to wage subsidies
- Establishment of a national centre in January 2000 for validation of educational qualifications of foreigners including migrants and ethnic minorities (cf. also the 2000 NAPempl)

Besides the measures contained under the integration act and the above mentioned action plan, which are specifically targeted to migrants and ethnic minorities, the NAPincl describes a number of general measures and initiatives that also encompasses migrants and ethnic minorities such as flexible working arrangements, new employment service methods, and the introduction of 'The Social Index' which aims at increasing corporate social responsibility.

EQUAL measures

The EQUAL programme is the follow up to the previous Community Initiatives Adapt and Employment under the European Social Fund. Structured on the four pillars of the European Employment in addition to a separate theme addressing the needs of asylum seekers, the programme aims at combating discrimination and inequality in the labour market.

In the Danish context 20 EQUAL projects have been approved for financial support. The following table shows the distribution of projects according to thematic field and according to the intended beneficiaries.

Table 2. EQUAL projects listed according to beneficiaries

Thematic field	Number of migrants relevant projects*	Total number of projects
1A Employability – (Re-) integration to the labour market	11	11
1B Employability – Combating racism	0	0
2C Entrepreneurship – Business creation	0	0
2D Entrepreneurship – Social economy	0	0
3E Adaptability – Life long learning	0	4
3F Adaptability – Adaptation to change and NIT	0	0
4G Equal opportunities – Reconciling family and professional life	0	0
4H Equal opportunities – Reducing gender gaps and desegregation	2	4
5 Asylum seekers	1	1
Total	14	20

* Projects where at least 20% of funds are directed to migrants and ethnic minorities

Source: EQUAL database at <https://Equal.cec.eu.int/Equal/jsp/index.jsp>

As shown in the table only six of the 20 Danish EQUAL projects are not migrants relevant, when judged according to the share of funds that are allocated for migrants and ethnic minorities in the individual project.

Also as illustrated in the table, most of the projects focusing on migrants and ethnic minorities are primarily aimed at integration or reintegration in the labour market under the employability pillar and these projects accounts for more than half of the total number of projects. It should be mentioned though that the Danish Labour Market Authority, which manages the Danish EQUAL programme, had hoped for a larger number of projects focusing on equal opportunities between men and women (DMA/Research and Nellemann 2002). The predominance of projects focusing on migrants is thus only partly intended, although from the onset 43,5% of the total funds were intended for the improvement of migrants' and refugees' or asylum seekers' integration and possibilities on the labour market.⁵

⁵ According to the information provided by the Danish Labour Market Authority on the homepage for the EQUAL programme in Denmark 33,5% of the total funds were intended for the improvement of migrants' and refugees' integration and possibilities on the labour market; 33,5% were intended for the reduction of gender gaps; 15% were intended for improving the possibilities on the labour market for the socially marginalized; and finally 10% were intended for improving asylum seekers integration to the labour market (www.socialfonden.dk/socialfonden/equal.asp).

A key element of the EQUAL programme is partnerships between key actors, both at the national level and at the transnational level.

Within the Danish EQUAL programme especially three types of *national* partners are predominant, namely municipal enterprises, public education centres and organisations supporting the socially marginalized groups. On the other hand, only few private enterprises are represented among the national partners.

With regard to the *transnational* partners especially public authorities, but also education centres and enterprises are predominant.

In the light of the change of integration strategy at the governmental level it is, however, interesting to take a closer look at the partnership-profile of the 11 EQUAL-projects targeted at refugees and immigrants. An analysis of the partners shows that the largest partnership segments – representing one fifth of the partners each – are consultancies and training institutions (both private and public) and public authorities such as departments in municipalities or offices of the regional labour market authorities (AF)⁶. Research institutions (4) and organisations (2) such as trade unions and private enterprises (2) are only represented in a few projects.

Compared to the overall change in strategy there are some good and some bad news. The good news is that the EQUAL-projects – at least some of the projects involving a large number of partners – are solidly founded in the public authorities that have the primary responsibility for the integration task and thus for implementing the new strategy.

The bad news is that the projects are not embedded in the private sector. Only one project includes private enterprises. Thus the gap between the strategy in the NAP 2002 and the partnership-profile of the EQUAL projects are quite obvious. This gap is further increased if one looks at the ties to the largest organisations in the labour market. As mentioned the main national workers organisation (the Danish Confederation of Trade Unions) and the National Employers Union are almost excluded in the EQUAL-projects.

According to the on-going programme evaluation of the Danish EQUAL programme, there is a high degree of coherence between the EQUAL programme, the EES and the Danish NAPs (DMA/Research and Nellemann 2002).

As regards the individual projects, these are generally assessed as describing and building themselves closely to the key elements of the EQUAL programme, i.e. partnerships, thematic approach, innovation, empowerment, transnationality, and mainstreaming (DMA/Research and Nellemann 2002).

On the negative side, the on-going programme evaluation concludes that there is “a risk of the EQUAL projects becoming elitist” as a result of the projects being closely linked to academic ideas, terms and notions (DMA/Research and

⁶ Consultancies, though organised on a private basis, are not regarded as enterprises in this context. They are primarily functioning as project managers and not as enterprises trying to open up for changing their organisation, implementing new practices or creating new jobs.

Nellemann 2002). According to the evaluators this could hamper the dissemination of the results and findings of the different projects.

At this stage it is not possible to assess the effects of the different projects.

Good practice

In this section two examples of good practice are identified and briefly described. The first project “Diversity and Social Responsibility” is an EQUAL funded project under the theme 4 H “Equal opportunities – Reducing gender gaps and desegregation”, whereas the second example of good practice is to be found outside of the EQUAL framework.

Diversity and Social responsibility

The Diversity and Social Responsibility project is inspiring because it is founded on a partnership between two major Danish enterprises that have partnered to develop and change their organisations in order to adapt to societal renewal. The two enterprises – TDC (the leading telecommunication company) and DSB (the Danish Railways) – are also worth mentioning because their project, besides the impressive potential in volume, represents a substantial (process oriented) innovative approach concerning organisational development and –management. The project, which is described in more detail below, is inspired by Diversity Management, which in a Danish context is a relatively new approach.

Context

Personnel policy in TDC is to reflect the composition of the surrounding community, for instance regarding ethnic background or sex. Implementation of the policy has, however, been unsatisfactory. Similar difficulties have been experienced by DSB. The two enterprises are especially concerned about the lack of effects in the long run when special attention to e.g. integration of ethnic minorities decline. Consequently, their ambition is to generate methods that can assure these effects in the long run.

Organisational approach

The project aims at anchoring social responsibility and inclusiveness in core business strategy, business processes, organisational development and HR-strategy. This holistic approach will, according to the project logic, produce results in the long run.

The approach is value-based rather than rule-based and aims at developing an inclusive, non-discriminatory work culture in the light of previous drawbacks regarding equal opportunity programmes focusing exclusively on specific groups. Earlier initiatives produced resistance in the organisations which the holistic strategy should address. Besides the strategic and managerial tools such as performance management systems, the specific initiatives include measures such as training of staff, information strategies, new recruitment activities, composition and succeeding monitoring of teams characterized by diversity etc.

Expected outcomes

The project expects results in the following areas:

Organisational outcomes:

- Policies and action plans will reflect the goals of integration and inclusiveness
- Development of a holistic approach to EQUAL opportunities at the local, national and international level
- Ambitious internal dissemination strategy involving empowerment of participants, internal reporting via web sites, videos and external reporting through training programmes for TV and educational material. To underline this strategy the two enterprises have partnered with The Danish National Television.

Effects on target group and organisational output:

- Activities will result in higher proportions of target groups in staff.
- Activities will result in improved employee well-being, better quality of products and customer service.

Ry – a municipality that needs every citizen

Not surprisingly there are a number of interesting initiatives in Denmark that complements the EQUAL projects. The one that is mentioned here represents an approach to integration that is gaining influence in Denmark. The initiative called “Ry – a municipality that needs every citizen” has been selected on the grounds that:

- it is a partnership transcending the public-private dichotomy
- it is a partnership including a number of private enterprises and thus job potential
- it is locally initiated and maintained
- the approach integrates public sector duties with the needs of the local enterprises with the ambition to increase efficiency

Local partnership approach

The initiative builds on a local partnership involving enterprises and the local authorities, most significantly the municipality of Ry. This network improves the possibilities for immigrants and refugees in a number of ways. In the short run the introductory programme is improved by more and relevant training possibilities. As an example, a craftsman can actually try, maintain and develop his skills in a relevant enterprise rather than on a project trying to resemble an enterprise. Furthermore, the teaching of Danish becomes integrated with the needs related to the job situation and the understanding of Danish culture is based on real life

interaction in the labour market. In the long run the possibilities for ordinary jobs is improved.

Integration encompasses all aspects of life

In contrast to the new integration strategy enforced by the Danish Government the partnership in Ry has adopted a different and more “holistic approach”. Their line of argument is that families should function in all aspects of life, including the labour market. If they do not refugees will move from Ry after the three-year integration period, which will mean that Ry, according to the rules of dispersion of refugees in Denmark, shall welcome new refugees. Instead of solid integration the municipality will start over and over. Thus, the activities in the partnership includes the social sphere aiming at integration both adults and children into the social life of the community.

Day to day activities run by coordinator

In order to coordinate activities, increase and maintain the number of enterprises included in the network, detect needs, give counselling etc. the partnership has employed a coordinator. This coordinator interacts with the local authorities. In order to stress the connections to the labour market and the ambitions to meet the demands of enterprises the coordinator is physically placed at one of the main partners – a large local enterprise. Thereby the coordinator is given legitimacy when he contacts enterprises. He is actually calling from an enterprise and not from the public sector.

Conclusions

Labour market integration and integration in general of migrants and ethnic minorities have had a prominent place in the Danish political debate since the latter part of the 1990's.

Consequently, a number of initiatives and reforms targeted towards integration have been presented in recent years. Lately the pendulum has swung heavily towards labour market integration, whereas the previous strategy was much broader in focus.

The focus on labour market integration is illustrated both in the 2002 NAP on employment, where labour market integration plays a rather prominent role and also by the government programme presented in 2002 “Towards a new integration policy” (Ministry of Refugee, Immigrants and Integration Affairs 2002), where it is stated that “in the Government's opinion it is beyond all doubt that work is the key to successful integration”. Following this, the programme focuses almost entirely on labour market initiatives.

As already mentioned, the present focus on initiatives focusing on labour market integration should not least be ascribed to domestic politics including the change of government coupled with the demographic challenges of increasing the labour force. As regards domestic politics, the aim is for migrants and ethnic minorities to become self-supporting to a larger degree than today. One may also, however, identify a more strategic side of the present focus. After the change of government there has thus been a tightening of immigration policies aimed at reducing the

number of migrants and refugees entering Denmark and gaining residence permits. The focus on (labour market) integration of migrants and ethnic minorities may be seen as the second leg of this policy, which to a certain extent has been used to balance critique of the tightening of immigration policies.

Although the European Employment Strategy has also have played a role in the recent reforms of Danish integration policy, it does seem that the present focus on labour market integration can largely be ascribed to the domestic Danish debate and political situation.

As regards the EQUAL programme, its main role may be described as a funding opportunity for projects alongside different national initiatives. In this respect a large part of the organisations involved are organisations that already work in the field of combating discrimination and inequality in the labour market although the programme does seem to have succeeded in bringing a number of new organisations together.

If looking at the coherence between the EQUAL-programme, the EES and the Danish NAPs (cf. chapter 5), the Danish EQUAL-programme reflects the overall European strategy well. As mentioned, the rather prominent role of employability measures is, however, to some extent an unintended result as the Danish Labour Market Authority, had originally envisaged a larger number of projects within the equal opportunities pillar.

The relatively poor labour market integration of migrants and ethnic minorities shows that the effects of the existing labour market initiatives and educational programmes have not been good enough. However, as stated in a recent report from the Ministry of Refugee, Immigrants and Integration Affairs:

Extensive knowledge exists about the insufficient extent of labour market integration, less about the causes, and almost no knowledge about what can be done to increase integration (2002).

Although the government aims at increasing the effects of these efforts it is still too early to assess with greater certainty whether the recent initiatives constitute an effective recipe for labour market integration of migrants and ethnic minorities. A greater attachment to and involvement of private enterprises does seem, however, to have a potential for a strengthening of the labour market integration efforts. The identification of good practice examples should be seen in this light.

Literature

- Bredgaard, T. (2002). "The Vision of an Inclusive Labour Market – Denmark in an European Context", *Paper prepared for IREC 2002*. Aalborg: Aalborg University
- DMA/Research and Nellemann Konsulenterne A/S (2002). *Evaluering af EQUAL programmet*. Copenhagen: Labour Market Authority.
- de Koning, J; Layard R.; Nickell. S.; and Westergaard-Nielsen, N. (2002). *Policies for Full Employment*. London: London School of Economics,
- European Commission (1999). *Joint Employment Report 1999*.
- European Commission (2000). *Joint Employment Report 2000*.
- European Commission (2001). *Joint Employment Report 2001*.
- European Commission (2002). *Joint Employment Report 2002*.
- Ministeriet for flygtninge, indvandrere og integration (2002). **"Integrationsforskningen i Danmark 1980-2002"** Copenhagen.
- Ministry of Refugee, Immigration and Integration Affairs (2002). *Statistical Yearbook of Foreigners in Denmark 2002*.
- Ministry of Refugee, Immigration and Integration Affairs (2002). *On the track towards a new integration policy*. Copenhagen.
- PLS RAMBOLL Management (1999). *Evaluering af den kommunale integrationsindsats*. Aarhus: PLS RAMBOLL Management.
- PLS RAMBOLL Management (2000). *Integration i praksis: Kommunernes første erfaringer med integrationsloven*. Copenhagen: Ministry of Internal Affairs.
- The Danish Government (1999). *National Action Plan for Employment 1999, Denmark*.
- The Danish Government (2000). *National Action Plan for Employment 2000, Denmark*.
- The Danish Government (2001). *Denmark's National Action Plan to Combat Poverty and Social Exclusion (NAPincl) 2001/2003*.
- The Danish Government (2001). *National Action Plan for Employment 2001, Denmark*.
- The Danish Government (2002). *Denmark's National Action Plan for Employment 2002*.

Additional on-line information sources

- www.ams.dk (The Danish Labour Market Authority)
- www.bm.dk (Ministry of Employment)
- www.inm.dk (Ministry of Refugee, Immigration and Integration Affairs)
- www.sm.dk (Ministry of Social Affairs)
- www.socialfonden.dk/socialfonden/equal.asp (The European Social Fund in Denmark)

RESEARCH PAPERS from the Department of Social Science

To obtain a copy:

The papers can be downloaded free from the following address:

<http://www.ssc.ruc.dk/>

Paper-ready copies can also be obtained at a price of 40 DKK

Request and order for paper-ready copies can be made to the following address:

Secretary Janni Villadsen

Department of Social Sciences

Roskilde University

P.O box 260

4000 Roskilde

Phone +45 4674 2597

Fax + 45 4674 3080

Research Paper no. 1/00

Birgit Jæger
SCOT in Action

Research Paper no. 2/00

Leopold Galicki
Det Sociologiske Værksted

Research Paper no. 3/00

Anders Mathiesen
Nyliberalismen – og de 'stærke' ledere

Research Paper no. 4/00

Eva Sørensen & Jacob Torfing
Kompetenceudvikling i Danmark

Research Paper no. 5/00

Susana Borrás
Science, technology and innovation in European Politics

Research Paper no. 6/00

Lars A. Engberg
Social housing in Denmark

Research Paper no. 7/00

John Andersen
Køn, klasse og ligestilling

Research Paper no. 8/00

Anne Reff Pedersen, Svend Bayer og Nina Middelboe
En præsentation af KIT
- At arbejde med kvalitative interview via lyd

Research Paper no. 9/00

Povl A. Hansen och Göran Serin
Industrins teknologistruktur i
Öresundsregionen

Research Paper no 10/00

Jesper Jespersen
ØMUéns politiske økonomi

Research Paper no 11/00

Jesper Jespersen
Makroøkonomisk teori og ØMUén

Research Paper no 12/00

Lars Fuglsang
Three perspectives in science,
technology and society studies (STS)
in the policy context

Research Paper no 13/00

Jacob Torfing
Velfærdsstatens diskursivitet

Research Paper no 14/00

Christel Stormhøj
Feminist politics after
poststructuralism

Research Paper no 15/00

Anders Chr. Hansen
Critical Assumptions in Estimation
of Non-Renewable Resource Capital
Consumption

Research Paper no 16/00

Anders Chr. Hansen
Environmental Kuznets Curves
and some Danish Experiences

Research Paper no 17/00

Ada Scupola
Marketing In the Electronic
Marketplace: A Complementarity
Approach

Research Paper no 18/00

Povl A. Hansen & Göran Serin
Lavteknologiske produktioner,
materialer, innovationer og
konkurrenceevne.
- eksempler fra den danske
metalemballageindustri

Research Paper no 1/01

Karina Sehested
Investigating urban governance -
from the perspectives of policy
networks, democracy and planning

Research Paper no 2/01

Sven R. Larsson
Price stickiness and consumption
hedging

Research Paper no 3/01

Helle S. Andersen
What role does trust play in networks
steering?

Research Paper no 4/01

John Andersen
From Urban Movement to
negotiated
Entrepreneurialism.

Research Paper no 5/01

Hans Aage
Transition til Demokrati og velstand

Research Paper no 6/01

John Andersen & Lars Bohn
Kgs. Enghave - by, beboere og trafik

Research Paper no 7/01

Bent Greve
Labour Market Issues in the
European Community

Research Paper no 8/01

Anders Chr. Hansen
Den grønne budgetreform i
Danmark

Research Paper no 9/01

Torben Bech Dyrberg
Foucault's overarching
Concept of power as governmentality

Research Paper no 10/01

Jesper Jespersen
John Maynard Keynes (1883-1946)
Århundredets makroøkonom

Research Paper no 11/01

Susana Borrás & Michael Kluth
Integration in times of instability:
Exchange rate and monetary co-
operation in Mercosur and the EU

Research Paper no 12/01

Ada Scupola
The Impact of Electronic Commerce
on Industry Structure-The Case of
Scientific, Technical and Medical
Publishing

Research Paper no 13/01

Udgået

Research Paper no 14/01

Jacob Alsted
Models of human motivation in
sociology

Research Paper no 15/01

Lars Bohn
Magt og demokrati

Research Paper no 16/01

Søren H. Jensen & John Andersen
The Orestadproject – urban
revitalisation?

Research Paper no 17/01

Anders Chr. Hansen
Den grønne budgetreform i Europa

Research Paper no 18/01

Birgit Jæger
Strengths and Weaknesses of
Constructivistic Studies of
Technology

Research Paper no 19/01

Torben Bech Dyrberg
Racist, nationalist and populist trends
in recent danish politics

Research Paper no 01/02

Anders Chr. Hansen
Overforbrug og bæredygtig udvikling

Research Paper no 2/02

Eva Sørensen
Netværksdemokratiet i byen

Research Paper no 3/02

John Andersen & Trine Nordgaard
Kampen om rummet
- om trafikpolitik og kvarterløft i
Kgs. Enghave

Research Paper no 4/02

Lars Bohn & John Andersen
Levevilkår og trafik i Kgs. Enghave
- resultater af en spørgeskema-
undersøgelse

Research Paper no 5/02

Sven R. Larson
Consumption Hedging as a
Means of Uncertainty Management

Research Paper no 6/02

Prof. Bent Greve
Is a supranational strategy
for social inclusion possible?

Research Paper no 7/02

Trine Nordgaard
Rum, magt og mobilitet

Research Paper no 8/02

Anders Mathiesen
Sociologiske feltanalyser

Research Paper no 9/02

Anders Mathiesen
Rapport fra Feltanalyse speciale-
workshopén på Socialvidenslab

Research Paper no 10/02

Lektor Peter Høilund & Lektor
Søren Juul
Udkast til en kritisk normativ teori
for socialt arbejde

Research Paper no 11/02

Gunnar Gjelstrup
Beslutningsprocesser og netværk i en
lille landkommune

Research Paper no 12/02

Bodil Bjerg Nielsen
Et diskursanalytisk perspektiv på en
policy proces eksemplificeret med
sagen om Marstal Nav

Research Paper no 13/02

John Andersen
Between community empowerment
and elitist corporatism
- the struggles about urban policy in
Copenhagen

Research Paper no 14/02

Gunnar Gjelstrup
Forandringsprocesser i tre nordiske
bydele

Research Paper no 15/02

Marianne Antonsen
Sociologisk ny-institutionalisme,
konflikt og forandring: Domstols-
styrelsen som illustration

Research Paper no 1/03

Lars Bohn & John Andersen
Det er de andre, der kører.
Beboernes holdninger til trafik og
levevilkår i Kgs. Enghave

Research Paper no 2/03

Jesper Jespersen
Ny-keynesiansk og post-keynesiansk
teori – hvorfor to adskilte verdener?

Research Paper no 3/03

John Andersen & Anne-Marie Tyroll
Beck
Lokalsamfundesempowerment – et
Københavns casestudie

Research Paper no 4/03

David Etherington
WELFARE REFORMS LOCAL
GOVERNMENT AND THE
POLITICS OF SOCIAL
INCLUSION:
LESSONS FROM DENMARK'S
LABOUR MARKET AND AREA
REGENERATION
PROGRAMMES