

## **Beyond mountains**

The impact of Pakistani territorialisation on Balti livelihoods and migration practices

Jensen, Ole

*Publication date:*  
2007

*Citation for published version (APA):*

Jensen, O. (2007). *Beyond mountains: The impact of Pakistani territorialisation on Balti livelihoods and migration practices*. Roskilde Universitet. <http://hdl.handle.net/1800/2900>

### **General rights**

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain.
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal.

### **Take down policy**

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact [rucforsk@kb.dk](mailto:rucforsk@kb.dk) providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

# **Beyond mountains: The impact of Pakistani territorialisation on Balti livelihoods and migration practices**



**PhD dissertation**

**by**

**Ole Jensen**

**Institute for Geography and International Development Studies,  
Roskilde University Centre, January 2007.**

# Table of contents

## **Chapter one: Introduction**

1.0	Introduction	1
1.1	Understanding migration	3
1.2	Objectives and research questions	5
1.3	Structure of the dissertation	7

## **Chapter two: Theoretical framework**

2.0	Introduction	9
2.1	The habitat school	10
	2.1.1 Outgrowing the habitat	12
	2.1.2 New approaches to mountain environments	13
2.2	Territorialisation: states, space and control	14
	2.2.1 From concept to context: Territorialisation in the greater Himalayan Region.	17
	2.2.2 Towards a model of mountain livelihoods	19
2.3	Migration theories	21
	2.3.1 The functionalist approach	22
	2.3.2 The structuralist approach	24
	Pakistani migration to the Gulf	26
	2.3.3 New approaches to migration	27
	2.3.4 Transnationalism	27
2.4	Giddens' conceptualisation of social interaction and time-space distanciation	30
	2.4.1 Resources	32
2.5	Territorialisation and migration	33
	2.5.1 Migration as the 'problem of order'	34

## **Chapter three: Analytical and methodological framework**

3.0	Introduction	36
3.1	Analytical approach	37
	3.1.1 The livelihood	37
	The livelihood framework	38
	3.1.2 Units of analysis – the household and the migrant	40
	3.1.3 The bi-local approach	42
	The problem of context	43
3.2	Fieldwork design	44
	3.2.1 Selection of fieldwork sites	45
	Thalay	45
	Karachi	46
	3.2.2 Seasonality	46
3.3	Fieldwork methodologies	48
	3.3.1 Fieldwork in Thalay	48
	The intermediary	49
	The survey	50

	Individual interviews	51
	Observations	51
3.3.2	Fieldwork in Karachi	52
	Fieldwork approach	53
3.4	Data analysis	54
3.4.1	Reliability	55
3.4.2	The small issue of half the population	56

#### **Chapter four: Background**

4	Introduction	58
4.1	Territorialising Pakistan	59
4.1.1	Islam	60
4.1.2	Regionalism	61
4.2	Infrastructural techniques of the Pakistani territorialisation process	64
4.2.1	Government service and the armed forces	64
4.2.2	The quota system of regional representation	67
4.2.3	Urdu as the <i>lingua franca</i>	69
4.3	The territorialisation process in the ‘Northern Areas’	71
4.3.1	Baltistan	71
4.3.2	The Dogra regime	72
4.3.3	Partition	73
4.3.4	Road construction and warfare	76
4.3.5	Regional development	77
4.3.6	The nature and role of Islam	79
4.3.7	Urdu and the local languages	81
4.4	Revisiting the territorialisation process	82

#### **Chapter five: Livelihoods in Thalay**

5.0	Introduction	85
5.1	Situating Thalay	87
5.1.1	Thalaypa	87
5.1.2	Residential pattern	89
5.2	Vertical section	91
5.2.1	Natural resource base	91
	Irrigation water	91
	Pastures	92
	Tree resources	93
	Farmland	93
5.2.2	Agro-pastoral strategies	95
	Seasonality	96
	Crop selection	96
	Agricultural zonation	98
5.2.3	Livestock practices	98
5.2.4	Exchange and trade	99
5.2.5	Subsistence and economy	101
5.3	Horizontal section	104
5.3.2	Schooling in Thalay	104
5.3.3	Government service	107



Positioning for positions	110
5.3.4 Army service	111
Retired servicemen	114
5.4 Livelihoods in transformation	116

### **Chapter six: Migration practices in Thalay**

6.0 Introduction	120
6.1 Migration and exchange practices before 1947	121
6.1.1 Exchange routes	121
6.1.2 Migration within Baltistan	122
6.1.3 Migration from Baltistan	123
6.2 History of migration in Thalay	124
6.3 Seasonal migration	126
6.3.1 Gilgit	126
6.3.2 Mining	127
6.3.3 Portering	128
6.3.4 Patterns of seasonal migration and local employment at village level	128
6.4 Long-term migration	130
6.4.1 Residential moves within Baltistan	130
Shigar	131
Skardu	132
6.4.2 Down country	134
6.4.3 International migration	135
6.5 The spatial orientation of livelihoods in Thalay	136

### **Chapter 7: Balti migrants in Karachi**

7.0 Introduction	138
7.1 Karachi – historical development	139
7.1.1 ‘Mother of the poor’	141
7.2 Balti migrants in Karachi	142
7.2.1 Balti <i>mohallahs</i>	143
7.2.2 The <i>chapar</i>	145
7.2.3 Baltistan Student Federation	147
7.3 A Balti community?	147

### **Chapter 8: Thalaypa in Karachi**

8.0 Introduction	149
8.1 Residential pattern	150
8.1.2 Welfare organisation and <i>chapar</i>	151
8.2 The migrant trajectory	152
8.2.1 Motivational factors	154
8.2.2 Educational trajectories	156
8.2.3 Employment pattern	158
8.3 From migrants to residents?	159
8.3.1 Marriages	159
8.3.2 Family	161

8.3.3	Property	162
8.4	Links between Thalay and Karachi	163
8.4.1	Visits	164
8.4.2	Remittance behaviour	165
8.4.3	The returnees	165
8.4.4	The Karachi Balti	167
8.5	Revisiting the migrant trajectory	169

## **Chapter nine: Conclusion**

9.0	Introduction	172
9.1	Territorialising the Northern Areas	172
9.2	Livelihoods in Thalay	175
9.2.1	The vertical dimension	176
9.2.2	The horizontal dimension	177
9.3	Migration activities	178
9.4	Migration to Karachi	180
9.4.1	Revisiting the 'problem of order'	182
9.4.2	The Pakistani?	183

## **Tables:**

3.1	Organisation of fieldwork	47
3.2	Coverage of survey in Thalay	50
4.1	Pakistan's population by province, 1998	62
4.2	Total public sector employment	66
4.3	Quota system of regional representation	68
4.4	Pakistani population by mother tongue, 1998	70
4.5	Districts of the Northern Areas	74
4.6	Development in literacy ratios – Pakistan and Northern Areas	81
5.1	Population development 1951-98	88
5.2	Distribution of farmland in Thalay	94
5.3	Dependence on wheat supplies in Thalay	102
5.4	Village-wise income distribution	103
5.5	School attendance in Thalay 2001	106
5.6	Matriculates and beyond – by village and household	107
5.7	Government servants in Thalay	109
5.8	Army personnel in Thalay	112
5.9	Characteristics of ex-servicemen	114
6.1	Seasonal migration by type	126
6.2	Seasonal migration and local employment by village	129
6.3	Patterns of long-term migration	131
7.1	Population development in Karachi	141
8.1	Thalay migrants in Karachi 2001, by village	151
8.2	Routes to Karachi	154
8.3	Motivations for going to Karachi	154
8.4	Educational status of Thalay migrants in Karachi	156
8.5	Employment pattern of Thalay migrants	157
8.6	Period in present occupation	158
8.7	Characteristics of migrants from Thalay	159

8.8	Marriage patterns	160
8.9	Thalay migrants with family	161
8.10	Frequency of visits to Thalay	164
8.11	Remittances	165
9.1	Means of territorialisation	174

## **Figures**

2.1	Mountain livelihoods	19
2.2	Territorialisation and migration – conceptual framework	34
3.1	Livelihood framework	39
3.2	Components of fieldwork methodology	48
5.1	Growing season for barley in Thalay	96
5.2	Growing season for 1 <sup>st</sup> and 2 <sup>nd</sup> crops in Thalay	97
5.3	Relations of intra-valley exchange in Thalay	100
5.4	Nature of trade relations	101
8.1	Trajectories of Thalay migrants in Karachi	153
8.2	Trajectories of returnees from Karachi	166
8.3	Summarised migrant trajectory	169
9.1	Spatial organisation of livelihood activities	179

## **Maps**

1.1	Baltistan in the political landscape	2
4.1	Northern Areas	75
5.1	Map of Thalay	86
7.1	Karachi	139
7.2	Balti <i>mohallahs</i> in Karachi	143