

Beyond mountains

The impact of Pakistani territorialisation on Balti livelihoods and migration practices

Jensen, Ole

Publication date:
2007

Citation for published version (APA):
Jensen, O. (2007). *Beyond mountains: The impact of Pakistani territorialisation on Balti livelihoods and migration practices*. Roskilde Universitet. <http://hdl.handle.net/1800/2900>

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain.
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal.

Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact rucforsk@kb.dk providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

**Beyond mountains:
The impact of Pakistani territorialisation
on Balti livelihoods and migration practices**



PhD dissertation

by

Ole Jensen

**Institute for Geography and International Development Studies,
Roskilde University Centre, January 2007.**

Table of contents

Chapter one: Introduction

| | | |
|-----|-----------------------------------|---|
| 1.0 | Introduction | 1 |
| 1.1 | Understanding migration | 3 |
| 1.2 | Objectives and research questions | 5 |
| 1.3 | Structure of the dissertation | 7 |

Chapter two: Theoretical framework

| | | |
|-----|--|----|
| 2.0 | Introduction | 9 |
| 2.1 | The habitat school | 10 |
| | 2.1.1 Outgrowing the habitat | 12 |
| | 2.1.2 New approaches to mountain environments | 13 |
| 2.2 | Territorialisation: states, space and control | 14 |
| | 2.2.1 From concept to context: Territorialisation in the greater Himalayan Region. | 17 |
| | 2.2.2 Towards a model of mountain livelihoods | 19 |
| 2.3 | Migration theories | 21 |
| | 2.3.1 The functionalist approach | 22 |
| | 2.3.2 The structuralist approach | 24 |
| | Pakistani migration to the Gulf | 26 |
| | 2.3.3 New approaches to migration | 27 |
| | 2.3.4 Transnationalism | 27 |
| 2.4 | Giddens' conceptualisation of social interaction and time-space distanciation | 30 |
| | 2.4.1 Resources | 32 |
| 2.5 | Territorialisation and migration | 33 |
| | 2.5.1 Migration as the 'problem of order' | 34 |

Chapter three: Analytical and methodological framework

| | | |
|-----|---|----|
| 3.0 | Introduction | 36 |
| 3.1 | Analytical approach | 37 |
| | 3.1.1 The livelihood | 37 |
| | The livelihood framework | 38 |
| | 3.1.2 Units of analysis – the household and the migrant | 40 |
| | 3.1.3 The bi-local approach | 42 |
| | The problem of context | 43 |
| 3.2 | Fieldwork design | 44 |
| | 3.2.1 Selection of fieldwork sites | 45 |
| | Thalay | 45 |
| | Karachi | 46 |
| | 3.2.2 Seasonality | 46 |
| 3.3 | Fieldwork methodologies | 48 |
| | 3.3.1 Fieldwork in Thalay | 48 |
| | The intermediary | 49 |
| | The survey | 50 |

| | | |
|-------|--|----|
| | Individual interviews | 51 |
| | Observations | 51 |
| 3.3.2 | Fieldwork in Karachi | 52 |
| | Fieldwork approach | 53 |
| 3.4 | Data analysis | 54 |
| 3.4.1 | Reliability | 55 |
| 3.4.2 | The small issue of half the population | 56 |

Chapter four: Background

| | | |
|-------|--|----|
| 4 | Introduction | 58 |
| 4.1 | Territorialising Pakistan | 59 |
| 4.1.1 | Islam | 60 |
| 4.1.2 | Regionalism | 61 |
| 4.2 | Infrastructural techniques of the Pakistani territorialisation process | 64 |
| 4.2.1 | Government service and the armed forces | 64 |
| 4.2.2 | The quota system of regional representation | 67 |
| 4.2.3 | Urdu as the <i>lingua franca</i> | 69 |
| 4.3 | The territorialisation process in the ‘Northern Areas’ | 71 |
| 4.3.1 | Baltistan | 71 |
| 4.3.2 | The Dogra regime | 72 |
| 4.3.3 | Partition | 73 |
| 4.3.4 | Road construction and warfare | 76 |
| 4.3.5 | Regional development | 77 |
| 4.3.6 | The nature and role of Islam | 79 |
| 4.3.7 | Urdu and the local languages | 81 |
| 4.4 | Revisiting the territorialisation process | 82 |

Chapter five: Livelihoods in Thalay

| | | |
|-------|--------------------------|-----|
| 5.0 | Introduction | 85 |
| 5.1 | Situating Thalay | 87 |
| 5.1.1 | Thalaypa | 87 |
| 5.1.2 | Residential pattern | 89 |
| 5.2 | Vertical section | 91 |
| 5.2.1 | Natural resource base | 91 |
| | Irrigation water | 91 |
| | Pastures | 92 |
| | Tree resources | 93 |
| | Farmland | 93 |
| 5.2.2 | Agro-pastoral strategies | 95 |
| | Seasonality | 96 |
| | Crop selection | 96 |
| | Agricultural zonation | 98 |
| 5.2.3 | Livestock practices | 98 |
| 5.2.4 | Exchange and trade | 99 |
| 5.2.5 | Subsistence and economy | 101 |
| 5.3 | Horisontal section | 104 |
| 5.3.2 | Schooling in Thalay | 104 |
| 5.3.3 | Government service | 107 |

| | |
|-----------------------------------|-----|
| Positioning for positions | 110 |
| 5.3.4 Army service | 111 |
| Retired servicemen | 114 |
| 5.4 Livelihoods in transformation | 116 |

Chapter six: Migration practices in Thalay

| | |
|---|-----|
| 6.0 Introduction | 120 |
| 6.1 Migration and exchange practices before 1947 | 121 |
| 6.1.1 Exchange routes | 121 |
| 6.1.2 Migration within Baltistan | 122 |
| 6.1.3 Migration from Baltistan | 123 |
| 6.2 History of migration in Thalay | 124 |
| 6.3 Seasonal migration | 126 |
| 6.3.1 Gilgit | 126 |
| 6.3.2 Mining | 127 |
| 6.3.3 Portering | 128 |
| 6.3.4 Patterns of seasonal migration and local employment at village level | 128 |
| 6.4 Long-term migration | 130 |
| 6.4.1 Residential moves within Baltistan | 130 |
| Shigar | 131 |
| Skardu | 132 |
| 6.4.2 Down country | 134 |
| 6.4.3 International migration | 135 |
| 6.5 The spatial orientation of livelihoods in Thalay | 136 |

Chapter 7: Balti migrants in Karachi

| | |
|--------------------------------------|-----|
| 7.0 Introduction | 138 |
| 7.1 Karachi – historical development | 139 |
| 7.1.1 ‘Mother of the poor’ | 141 |
| 7.2 Balti migrants in Karachi | 142 |
| 7.2.1 Balti <i>mohallahs</i> | 143 |
| 7.2.2 The <i>chapar</i> | 145 |
| 7.2.3 Baltistan Student Federation | 147 |
| 7.3 A Balti community? | 147 |

Chapter 8: Thalaypa in Karachi

| | |
|--|-----|
| 8.0 Introduction | 149 |
| 8.1 Residential pattern | 150 |
| 8.1.2 Welfare organisation and <i>chapar</i> | 151 |
| 8.2 The migrant trajectory | 152 |
| 8.2.1 Motivational factors | 154 |
| 8.2.2 Educational trajectories | 156 |
| 8.2.3 Employment pattern | 158 |
| 8.3 From migrants to residents? | 159 |
| 8.3.1 Marriages | 159 |
| 8.3.2 Family | 161 |

| | | |
|-------|-----------------------------------|-----|
| 8.3.3 | Property | 162 |
| 8.4 | Links between Thalay and Karachi | 163 |
| 8.4.1 | Visits | 164 |
| 8.4.2 | Remittance behaviour | 165 |
| 8.4.3 | The returnees | 165 |
| 8.4.4 | The Karachi Balti | 167 |
| 8.5 | Revisiting the migrant trajectory | 169 |

Chapter nine: Conclusion

| | | |
|-------|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 9.0 | Introduction | 172 |
| 9.1 | Territorialising the Northern Areas | 172 |
| 9.2 | Livelihoods in Thalay | 175 |
| 9.2.1 | The vertical dimension | 176 |
| 9.2.2 | The horizontal dimension | 177 |
| 9.3 | Migration activities | 178 |
| 9.4 | Migration to Karachi | 180 |
| 9.4.1 | Revisiting the 'problem of order' | 182 |
| 9.4.2 | The Pakistani? | 183 |

Tables:

| | | |
|-----|--|-----|
| 3.1 | Organisation of fieldwork | 47 |
| 3.2 | Coverage of survey in Thalay | 50 |
| 4.1 | Pakistan's population by province, 1998 | 62 |
| 4.2 | Total public sector employment | 66 |
| 4.3 | Quota system of regional representation | 68 |
| 4.4 | Pakistani population by mother tongue, 1998 | 70 |
| 4.5 | Districts of the Northern Areas | 74 |
| 4.6 | Development in literacy ratios – Pakistan and Northern Areas | 81 |
| 5.1 | Population development 1951-98 | 88 |
| 5.2 | Distribution of farmland in Thalay | 94 |
| 5.3 | Dependence on wheat supplies in Thalay | 102 |
| 5.4 | Village-wise income distribution | 103 |
| 5.5 | School attendance in Thalay 2001 | 106 |
| 5.6 | Matriculates and beyond – by village and household | 107 |
| 5.7 | Government servants in Thalay | 109 |
| 5.8 | Army personnel in Thalay | 112 |
| 5.9 | Characteristics of ex-servicemen | 114 |
| 6.1 | Seasonal migration by type | 126 |
| 6.2 | Seasonal migration and local employment by village | 129 |
| 6.3 | Patterns of long-term migration | 131 |
| 7.1 | Population development in Karachi | 141 |
| 8.1 | Thalay migrants in Karachi 2001, by village | 151 |
| 8.2 | Routes to Karachi | 154 |
| 8.3 | Motivations for going to Karachi | 154 |
| 8.4 | Educational status of Thalay migrants in Karachi | 156 |
| 8.5 | Employment pattern of Thalay migrants | 157 |
| 8.6 | Period in present occupation | 158 |
| 8.7 | Characteristics of migrants from Thalay | 159 |

| | | |
|------|-------------------------------|-----|
| 8.8 | Marriage patterns | 160 |
| 8.9 | Thalay migrants with family | 161 |
| 8.10 | Frequency of visits to Thalay | 164 |
| 8.11 | Remittances | 165 |
| 9.1 | Means of territorialisation | 174 |

Figures

| | | |
|-----|--|-----|
| 2.1 | Mountain livelihoods | 19 |
| 2.2 | Territorialisation and migration – conceptual framework | 34 |
| 3.1 | Livelihood framework | 39 |
| 3.2 | Components of fieldwork methodology | 48 |
| 5.1 | Growing season for barley in Thalay | 96 |
| 5.2 | Growing season for 1 st and 2 nd crops in Thalay | 97 |
| 5.3 | Relations of intra-valley exchange in Thalay | 100 |
| 5.4 | Nature of trade relations | 101 |
| 8.1 | Trajectories of Thalay migrants in Karachi | 153 |
| 8.2 | Trajectories of returnees from Karachi | 166 |
| 8.3 | Summarised migrant trajectory | 169 |
| 9.1 | Spatial organisation of livelihood activities | 179 |

Maps

| | | |
|-----|--------------------------------------|-----|
| 1.1 | Baltistan in the political landscape | 2 |
| 4.1 | Northern Areas | 75 |
| 5.1 | Map of Thalay | 86 |
| 7.1 | Karachi | 139 |
| 7.2 | Balti <i>mohallahs</i> in Karachi | 143 |