Beyond mountains
The impact of Pakistani territorialisation on Balti livelihoods and migration practices

Jensen, Ole

Publication date:
2007

Citation for published version (APA):

General rights
Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

• Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
• You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain.
• You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal.

Take down policy
If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact rucforsk@ruc.dk providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.
Beyond mountains:
The impact of Pakistani territorialisation on Balti livelihoods and migration practices

PhD dissertation
by
Ole Jensen

Table of contents

**Chapter one: Introduction**

1.0 Introduction  
1.1 Understanding migration  
1.2 Objectives and research questions  
1.3 Structure of the dissertation

**Chapter two: Theoretical framework**

2.0 Introduction  
2.1 The habitat school  
  2.1.1 Outgrowing the habitat  
  2.1.2 New approaches to mountain environments  
2.2 Territorialisation: states, space and control  
  2.2.1 From concept to context: Territorialisation in the greater Himalayan Region.  
  2.2.2 Towards a model of mountain livelihoods  
2.3 Migration theories  
  2.3.1 The functionalist approach  
  2.3.2 The structuralist approach  
  Pakistani migration to the Gulf  
  2.3.3 New approaches to migration  
  2.3.4 Transnationalism  
2.4 Giddens’ conceptualisation of social interaction and time-space distanciation  
  2.4.1 Resources  
2.5 Territorialisation and migration  
  2.5.1 Migration as the ‘problem of order’

**Chapter three: Analytical and methodological framework**

3.0 Introduction  
3.1 Analytical approach  
  3.1.1 The livelihood  
  The livelihood framework  
  3.1.2 Units of analysis – the household and the migrant  
  3.1.3 The bi-local approach  
  The problem of context  
3.2 Fieldwork design  
  3.2.1 Selection of fieldwork sites  
  Thalay  
  Karachi  
  3.2.2 Seasonality  
3.3 Fieldwork methodologies  
  3.3.1 Fieldwork in Thalay  
  The intermediary  
  The survey
Chapter four: Background

4 Introduction

4.1 Territorialising Pakistan
   4.1.1 Islam
   4.1.2 Regionalism

4.2 Infrastructural techniques of the Pakistani territorialisation process
   4.2.1 Government service and the armed forces
   4.2.2 The quota system of regional representation
   4.2.3 Urdu as the lingua franca

4.3 The territorialisation process in the ‘Northern Areas’
   4.3.1 Baltistan
   4.3.2 The Dogra regime
   4.3.3 Partition
   4.3.4 Road construction and warfare
   4.3.5 Regional development
   4.3.6 The nature and role of Islam
   4.3.7 Urdu and the local languages

4.4 Revisiting the territorialisation process

Chapter five: Livelihoods in Thalay

5.0 Introduction

5.1 Situating Thalay
   5.1.1 Thalaypa
   5.1.2 Residential pattern

5.2 Vertical section
   5.2.1 Natural resource base
      Irrigation water
      Pastures
      Tree resources
      Farmland
   5.2.2 Agro-pastoral strategies
      Seasonality
      Crop selection
      Agricultural zonation
   5.2.3 Livestock practices
   5.2.4 Exchange and trade
   5.2.5 Subsistence and economy

5.3 Horizontal section
   5.3.2 Schooling in Thalay
   5.3.3 Government service
Positioning for positions

5.3.4 Army service
Retired servicemen

5.4 Livelihoods in transformation

Chapter six: Migration practices in Thalay
6.0 Introduction
6.1 Migration and exchange practices before 1947
   6.1.1 Exchange routes
   6.1.2 Migration within Baltistan
   6.1.3 Migration from Baltistan
6.2 History of migration in Thalay
6.3 Seasonal migration
   6.3.1 Gilgit
   6.3.2 Mining
   6.3.3 Portering
   6.3.4 Patterns of seasonal migration and local employment
      at village level
6.4 Long-term migration
   6.4.1 Residential moves within Baltistan
      Shigar
      Skardu
   6.4.2 Down country
   6.4.3 International migration
6.5 The spatial orientation of livelihoods in Thalay

Chapter 7: Balti migrants in Karachi
7.0 Introduction
7.1 Karachi – historical development
   7.1.1 ‘Mother of the poor’
7.2 Balti migrants in Karachi
   7.2.1 Balti mohallahs
   7.2.2 The chapar
   7.2.3 Baltistan Student Federation
7.3 A Balti community?

Chapter 8: Thalaypa in Karachi
8.0 Introduction
8.1 Residential pattern
   8.1.2 Welfare organisation and chapar
8.2 The migrant trajectory
   8.2.1 Motivational factors
   8.2.2 Educational trajectories
   8.2.3 Employment pattern
8.3 From migrants to residents?
   8.3.1 Marriages
   8.3.2 Family
8.3.3 Property 162

8.4 Links between Thalay and Karachi 163
8.4.1 Visits 164
8.4.2 Remittance behaviour 165
8.4.3 The returnees 165
8.4.4 The Karachi Balti 167

8.5 Revisiting the migrant trajectory 169

Chapter nine: Conclusion

9.0 Introduction 172
9.1 Territorialising the Northern Areas 172
9.2 Livelihoods in Thalay 175
9.2.1 The vertical dimension 176
9.2.2 The horizontal dimension 177
9.3 Migration activities 178
9.4 Migration to Karachi 180
9.4.1 Revisiting the ‘problem of order’ 182
9.4.2 The Pakistani? 183

Tables:
3.1 Organisation of fieldwork 47
3.2 Coverage of survey in Thalay 50
4.1 Pakistan’s population by province, 1998 62
4.2 Total public sector employment 66
4.3 Quota system of regional representation 68
4.4 Pakistani population by mother tongue, 1998 70
4.5 Districts of the Northern Areas 74
4.6 Development in literacy ratios – Pakistan and Northern Areas 81
5.1 Population development 1951-98 88
5.2 Distribution of farmland in Thalay 94
5.3 Dependence on wheat supplies in Thalay 102
5.4 Village-wise income distribution 103
5.5 School attendance in Thalay 2001 106
5.6 Matriculates and beyond – by village and household 107
5.7 Government servants in Thalay 109
5.8 Army personnel in Thalay 112
5.9 Characteristics of ex-servicemen 114
6.1 Seasonal migration by type 126
6.2 Seasonal migration and local employment by village 129
6.3 Patterns of long-term migration 131
7.1 Population development in Karachi 141
8.1 Thalay migrants in Karachi 2001, by village 151
8.2 Routes to Karachi 154
8.3 Motivations for going to Karachi 154
8.4 Educational status of Thalay migrants in Karachi 156
8.5 Employment pattern of Thalay migrants 157
8.6 Period in present occupation 158
8.7 Characteristics of migrants from Thalay 159
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>Marriage patterns</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.9</td>
<td>Thalay migrants with family</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.10</td>
<td>Frequency of visits to Thalay</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.11</td>
<td>Remittances</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>Means of territorialisation</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figures**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Mountain livelihoods</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Territorialisation and migration – conceptual framework</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Livelihood framework</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Components of fieldwork methodology</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Growing season for barley in Thalay</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Growing season for 1st and 2nd crops in Thalay</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>Relations of intra-valley exchange in Thalay</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>Nature of trade relations</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>Trajectories of Thalay migrants in Karachi</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>Trajectories of returnees from Karachi</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>Summarised migrant trajectory</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>Spatial organisation of livelihood activities</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Maps**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Map</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Baltistan in the political landscape</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Northern Areas</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Map of Thalay</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>Karachi</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>Balti <em>mohallahs</em> in Karachi</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>