Beyond mountains
The impact of Pakistani territorialisation on Balti livelihoods and migration practices
Jensen, Ole

Publication date:
2007

Citation for published version (APA):

General rights
Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

• Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
• You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain.
• You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal.

Take down policy
If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact rucforsk@ruc.dk providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.
Beyond mountains: The impact of Pakistani territorialisation on Balti livelihoods and migration practices

PhD dissertation
by
Ole Jensen

# Table of contents

## Chapter one: Introduction

1.0 Introduction 1  
1.1 Understanding migration 3  
1.2 Objectives and research questions 5  
1.3 Structure of the dissertation 7

## Chapter two: Theoretical framework

2.0 Introduction 9  
2.1 The habitat school 10  
2.1.1 Outgrowing the habitat 12  
2.1.2 New approaches to mountain environments 13  
2.2 Territorialisation: states, space and control 14  
2.2.1 From concept to context: Territorialisation in the greater Himalayan Region. 17  
2.2.2 Towards a model of mountain livelihoods 19  
2.3 Migration theories 21  
2.3.1 The functionalist approach 22  
2.3.2 The structuralist approach 24  
2.3.3 New approaches to migration 27  
2.3.4 Transnationalism 27  
2.4 Giddens’ conceptualisation of social interaction and time-space distanciation 30  
2.4.1 Resources 32  
2.5 Territorialisation and migration 33  
2.5.1 Migration as the ‘problem of order’ 34

## Chapter three: Analytical and methodological framework

3.0 Introduction 36  
3.1 Analytical approach 37  
3.1.1 The livelihood 37  
3.1.2 Units of analysis – the household and the migrant 40  
3.1.3 The bi-local approach 42  
3.2 Fieldwork design 44  
3.2.1 Selection of fieldwork sites 45  
3.2.2 Seasonality 46  
3.3 Fieldwork methodologies 48  
3.3.1 Fieldwork in Thalay 48  
3.3.2 The intermediary 49  
3.3.3 The survey 50
Chapter four: Background

4 Introduction

4.1 Territorialising Pakistan
   4.1.1 Islam
   4.1.2 Regionalism

4.2 Infrastructural techniques of the Pakistani territorialisation process
   4.2.1 Government service and the armed forces
   4.2.2 The quota system of regional representation
   4.2.3 Urdu as the lingua franca

4.3 The territorialisation process in the ‘Northern Areas’
   4.3.1 Baltistan
   4.3.2 The Dogra regime
   4.3.3 Partition
   4.3.4 Road construction and warfare
   4.3.5 Regional development
   4.3.6 The nature and role of Islam
   4.3.7 Urdu and the local languages

4.4 Revisiting the territorialisation process

Chapter five: Livelihoods in Thalay

5.0 Introduction

5.1 Situating Thalay
   5.1.1 Thalaypa
   5.1.2 Residential pattern

5.2 Vertical section
   5.2.1 Natural resource base
   Irrigation water
   Pastures
   Tree resources
   Farmland

   5.2.2 Agro-pastoral strategies
   Seasonality
   Crop selection
   Agricultural zonation

   5.2.3 Livestock practices
   5.2.4 Exchange and trade

   5.2.5 Subsistence and economy

5.3 Horizontal section
   5.3.2 Schooling in Thalay

5.3.3 Government service
Positioning for positions 110
5.3.4 Army service 111
Retired servicemen 114
5.4 Livelihoods in transformation 116

Chapter six: Migration practices in Thalay
6.0 Introduction 120
6.1 Migration and exchange practices before 1947 121
6.1.1 Exchange routes 121
6.1.2 Migration within Baltistan 122
6.1.3 Migration from Baltistan 123
6.2 History of migration in Thalay 124
6.3 Seasonal migration 126
6.3.1 Gilgit 126
6.3.2 Mining 127
6.3.3 Portering 128
6.3.4 Patterns of seasonal migration and local employment at village level 128
6.4 Long-term migration 130
6.4.1 Residential moves within Baltistan 130
Shigar 131
Skardu 132
6.4.2 Down country 134
6.4.3 International migration 135
6.5 The spatial orientation of livelihoods in Thalay 136

Chapter 7: Balti migrants in Karachi
7.0 Introduction 138
7.1 Karachi – historical development 139
7.1.1 ‘Mother of the poor’ 141
7.2 Balti migrants in Karachi 142
7.2.1 Balti mohallahs 143
7.2.2 The chapar 145
7.2.3 Baltistan Student Federation 147
7.3 A Balti community? 147

Chapter 8: Thalaypa in Karachi
8.0 Introduction 149
8.1 Residential pattern 150
8.1.2 Welfare organisation and chapar 151
8.2 The migrant trajectory 152
8.2.1 Motivational factors 154
8.2.2 Educational trajectories 156
8.2.3 Employment pattern 158
8.3 From migrants to residents? 159
8.3.1 Marriages 159
8.3.2 Family 161
8.3.3 Property 162
8.4 Links between Thalay and Karachi 163
8.4.1 Visits 164
8.4.2 Remittance behaviour 165
8.4.3 The returnees 165
8.4.4 The Karachi Balti 167
8.5 Revisiting the migrant trajectory 169

Chapter nine: Conclusion
9.0 Introduction 172
9.1 Territorialising the Northern Areas 172
9.2 Livelihoods in Thalay 175
9.2.1 The vertical dimension 176
9.2.2 The horizontal dimension 177
9.3 Migration activities 178
9.4 Migration to Karachi 180
9.4.1 Revisiting the ‘problem of order’ 182
9.4.2 The Pakistani? 183

Tables:
3.1 Organisation of fieldwork 47
3.2 Coverage of survey in Thalay 50
4.1 Pakistan’s population by province, 1998 62
4.2 Total public sector employment 66
4.3 Quota system of regional representation 68
4.4 Pakistani population by mother tongue, 1998 70
4.5 Districts of the Northern Areas 74
4.6 Development in literacy ratios – Pakistan and Northern Areas 81
5.1 Population development 1951-98 88
5.2 Distribution of farmland in Thalay 94
5.3 Dependence on wheat supplies in Thalay 102
5.4 Village-wise income distribution 103
5.5 School attendance in Thalay 2001 106
5.6 Matriculates and beyond – by village and household 107
5.7 Government servants in Thalay 109
5.8 Army personnel in Thalay 112
5.9 Characteristics of ex-servicemen 114
6.1 Seasonal migration by type 126
6.2 Seasonal migration and local employment by village 129
6.3 Patterns of long-term migration 131
7.1 Population development in Karachi 141
8.1 Thalay migrants in Karachi 2001, by village 151
8.2 Routes to Karachi 154
8.3 Motivations for going to Karachi 154
8.4 Educational status of Thalay migrants in Karachi 156
8.5 Employment pattern of Thalay migrants 157
8.6 Period in present occupation 158
8.7 Characteristics of migrants from Thalay 159
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8.8   Marriage patterns</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.9   Thalay migrants with family</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.10  Frequency of visits to Thalay</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.11  Remittances</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1   Means of territorialisation</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figures**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1  Mountain livelihoods</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2  Territorialisation and migration – conceptual framework</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1  Livelihood framework</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2  Components of fieldwork methodology</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1  Growing season for barley in Thalay</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2  Growing season for 1st and 2nd crops in Thalay</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3  Relations of intra-valley exchange in Thalay</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4  Nature of trade relations</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1  Trajectories of Thalay migrants in Karachi</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2  Trajectories of returnees from Karachi</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3  Summarised migrant trajectory</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1  Spatial organisation of livelihood activities</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Maps**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Map</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1  Baltistan in the political landscape</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1  Northern Areas</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1  Map of Thalay</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1  Karachi</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2  Balti <em>mohallahs</em> in Karachi</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>